

1 **Public events and delayed flight restrictions**  
2 **were the turning point of the COVID-19**  
3 **mitigation policy of Israel**

4  
5 Klausner, Ziv PhD<sup>1 †</sup>; Fattal, Eyal PhD<sup>1\* †</sup>; Hirsch, Eitan PhD<sup>2</sup>;  
6 Shapira, Shmuel C., MD, MPH<sup>3</sup>  
7

8 <sup>1</sup> Department of Applied Mathematics, Israel Institute for Biological  
9 Research, Ness-Ziona, Israel

10 <sup>2</sup> Environmental Sciences Division, Israel Institute for Biological  
11 Research, Ness-Ziona, Israel

12 <sup>3</sup> Director general, Israel Institute for Biological Research, Ness-Ziona,  
13 Israel  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37

---

38 \* Correspondence to: Applied Math department, Israel Institute for Biological Research, P.O. Box 19,  
39 Ness-Ziona, 7410001, ISRAEL. Tel.: +972 8 9381794; fax: +972 8 9381432; e-mail: [eyalf@iibr.gov.il](mailto:eyalf@iibr.gov.il)

40 † These two authors contributed equally to the article

## 41 **Supplementary information**

42 The quarantine-isolation policy of Israel was analyzed using the SEQIJR  
43 model (Gumel, et al., 2004). This is a deterministic compartmental model, which was  
44 originally developed to analyze the transmission dynamics and control of the SARS  
45 epidemics in Toronto, Hong Kong, Singapore and Beijing. The model consists of the  
46 following system of equations:

47

$$\frac{dS}{dt} = \pi - \beta \frac{S(t)}{N} [I(t) + \varepsilon_E E(t) + \varepsilon_Q Q(t) + \varepsilon_J J(t)] - \mu S(t) \quad (1)$$

$$\frac{dE}{dt} = p + \beta \frac{S(t)}{N} [I(t) + \varepsilon_E E(t) + \varepsilon_Q Q(t) + \varepsilon_J J(t)] - (\gamma_1 + \kappa_1 + \mu) E(t) \quad (2)$$

$$\frac{dQ}{dt} = \gamma_1 E(t) - (\kappa_2 + \mu) Q(t) \quad (3)$$

$$\frac{dI}{dt} = \kappa_1 E(t) - (\gamma_2 + d_1 + \sigma_1 + \mu) I(t) \quad (4)$$

$$\frac{dJ}{dt} = \gamma_2 I(t) + \kappa_2 Q(t) - (\sigma_2 + d_2 + \mu) J(t) \quad (5)$$

$$\frac{dR}{dt} = \sigma_1 I(t) + \sigma_2 J(t) - \mu R(t) \quad (6)$$

$$\frac{dD}{dt} = d_1 I(t) + d_2 J(t) \quad (7)$$

48 Where, the model's parameters are as follows:

- 49 •  $\beta$  - Effective contact rate (S→E)
- 50 •  $\kappa_1$  - Rate of development of clinical symptoms for the exposed-not-  
51 quarantined class (E→I)
- 52 •  $\kappa_2$  - Rate of development of clinical symptoms for the quarantined-  
53 exposed class (Q→J)
- 54 •  $\gamma_1$  - Rate of entry into quarantine from the exposed class (E→Q)

- 55 •  $\gamma_2$  - Rate of entry into isolation from the symptomatic-not isolated class  
56 (I→J)  
57 •  $\sigma_1$  - Recovery rate from the infectious-not-isolated class (I→R)  
58 •  $\sigma_2$  - Recovery rate from the infectious-in-isolation class (J→R)  
59 •  $d_1$  - Mortality rate from the infectious-not-isolated class (I→D)  
60 •  $d_2$  - Mortality rate from the infectious-in- isolation class (J→R)  
61 •  $\mu$  – natural mortality daily ratio  
62 •  $\pi$  - daily net population growth  
63 •  $p$  – daily number of infected individuals entering undetected into the  
64 population  
65 •  $N$  – total size of the population  
66 •  $\varepsilon_E$  – modification factor for the infectivity of the exposed class  
67 •  $\varepsilon_Q$  – modification factor for the infectivity of the exposed class  
68 •  $\varepsilon_J$  – modification factor for the infectivity of the exposed class

69  
70  $R_0$ , the basic reproduction rate, which is the expected number of secondary  
71 infections produced by a single index case, is defined in the SEQIJR model (equations  
72 (1)-(8)) when no control measures are in place, i.e.,  $\gamma_1 = \gamma_2 = 0$ :

$$R_0 = \beta \left[ \frac{\varepsilon_E}{\kappa_1 + \mu} + \frac{\kappa_1}{(\kappa_1 + \mu)(d_1 + \sigma_1 + \mu)} \right] \quad (8)$$

73  $R_c$ , the control reproduction number, that represents the reproduction number  
74 when the quarantine-isolation policy is fully implemented, is calculated using the  
75 following equations:

$$R_c = \beta \left[ \frac{\varepsilon_E}{D_1} + \frac{\kappa_1}{D_1 D_2} + \frac{\varepsilon_Q \gamma_1}{D_1 D_4} + \frac{\varepsilon_J \kappa_1 \gamma_2}{D_1 D_2 D_3} + \frac{\varepsilon_J \gamma_1 \kappa_2}{D_1 D_3 D_4} \right] \quad (9)$$

76 where  $D_1 = \gamma_1 + \kappa_1 + \mu$ ,  $D_2 = \gamma_2 + d_1 + \sigma_1 + \mu$ ,  $D_3 = \sigma_2 + d_2 + \mu$ ,  $D_4 =$   
77  $\mu + \gamma_2$

78 The value of  $\beta$  was determined by using equation (8) with an  $R_0$  value of 3.28,  
79 which is the mean  $R_0$  of 12 studies that estimated the basic reproduction number of  
80 the COVID-19 pandemic (Liu, et al., 2020).

81 The values of mortality and recovery rates were determined using the  
82 following formulae:

$$\sigma^{-1} = (1 - \delta)\tau \quad (10)$$

$$d^{-1} = \delta\tau \quad (11)$$

83 Where  $\delta$  is the confirmed case fatality rate and  $\tau$  is the expected time until  
84 recovery or death. The COVID-19 case fatality rate is estimated between 5.3%-8.4%  
85 (Jung, et al., 2020). In this study,  $\delta$  was taken as the lower estimated value of 5.3%.  $\tau_1$   
86 and  $\tau_2$  were taken as 14.5 days and 8.6 days, according to the mean time from  
87 symptoms' onset to death and the mean time from hospital admission to death  
88 (Linton, et al., 2020).

89 It is plausible to assume that the length of the incubation period is similar,  
90 whether or not the exposed person is in quarantine. Therefore, it is possible to define  
91  $\gamma_1$  and  $\kappa_2$  as a function of  $\kappa_1$ :

$$(\kappa_1)^{-1} = (\gamma_1)^{-1} + (\kappa_2)^{-1} \quad (12)$$

$$(\gamma_1)^{-1} = \phi \cdot (\kappa_1)^{-1} \quad (13)$$

$$(\kappa_2)^{-1} = (1 - \phi) \cdot (\kappa_1)^{-1} \quad (14)$$

92 where  $\phi$  is the ratio dividing the incubation time to the period before and in  
93 quarantine. In this study,  $\phi$  was taken as 0.2 (scenario 1) and 0.8 (scenario 2-3).

94

95

The model parameters' values are as follows:

Parameter	Value	Reference	Notes
$\beta$	$0.2159 \text{ day}^{-1}$	Calculated via equation (9)	$R_0$ of 3.28 is the mean of 12 studies reviewed by Liu, et al (2020)
$\kappa_1$	$(5.6 \text{ days})^{-1}$	Linton, et al. (2020)	mean incubation time including Wuhan residents
$\kappa_2$	Scenario 1: $(4.48 \text{ days})^{-1}$ Scenario 2-3: $(1.12 \text{ days})^{-1}$	Equations (12)-(14)	See explanation in the text.
$\gamma_1$	Scenario 1: $(1.12 \text{ days})^{-1}$ Scenario 2-3: $(4.48 \text{ days})^{-1}$		
$\gamma_2$	$(4.3 \text{ days})^{-1}$	Linton, et al (2020)	pooled mean time from onset to hospital (for either hospitalization that ended with dead or recovery)
$\sigma_1$	$0.0653 \text{ day}^{-1}$		See explanation in the text.
$\sigma_2$	$0.1101 \text{ day}^{-1}$		See explanation in the text.
$d_1$	$0.0037 \text{ day}^{-1}$		See explanation in the text.
$d_2$	$0.0062 \text{ day}^{-1}$		See explanation in the text.
$\rho$	0		
$\pi$	465 people/day	Central Bureau of Statistics (2020)	
$\mu$	$1.425 \times 10^{-5}$	Central Bureau of Statistics (2020)	
$\epsilon_E$	0.62	Ganyani, et al (2020)	
$\epsilon_Q$	Scenario 1: $0.103 (\epsilon_E/6)$ Scenario 2: $0.207 (\epsilon_E/3)$ Scenario 3: $0.62 (\epsilon_E)$		
$\epsilon_J$	0.3		

97 TABLE. 1. Parameter values for the SEQIR model

98 The model was programmed in R (R Core Team) using the deSolve package  
 99 (Soeraert, et al., 2010).  $R_0$  was calculated using the package R0 (Boelle and Obadia,  
 100 2015).

## 101 **References**

- 102 1. Linton NM, Kobayashi T, Yang Y, Hayashi K, Akhmetzhanov AR, Jung SM,  
103 Yuan B, Kinoshita R, Nishiura H. Incubation Period and Other  
104 Epidemiological Characteristics of 2019 Novel Coronavirus Infections with  
105 Right Truncation: A Statistical Analysis of Publicly Available Case Data. *J*  
106 *Clin Med.* 2020; 17;9(2). pii: E538. doi: 10.3390/jcm9020538.
- 107 2. Liu Y, Gayle AA, Wilder-Smith A, Rocklöv J. The reproductive number of  
108 COVID-19 is higher compared to SARS coronavirus. *J Travel Med.* 2020;  
109 13;27(2). pii: taaa021. doi: 10.1093/jtm/taaa021.
- 110 3. Jung SM, Akhmetzhanov AR, Hayashi K, Linton NM, Yang Y, Yuan B,  
111 Kobayashi T, Kinoshita R, Nishiura H. Real-Time Estimation of the Risk of  
112 Death from Novel Coronavirus (COVID-19) Infection: Inference Using  
113 Exported Cases. *J Clin Med.* 2020 14;9(2). pii: E523. doi:  
114 10.3390/jcm9020523.
- 115 4. Ganyani T, Kremer C, Dongxuan C, Torneri A, Faes C, Wallinga J, Hens N.  
116 Estimating the generation interval for COVID-19 based on symptom onset  
117 data. medRxiv preprint doi:10.1101/2020.03.05.20031815
- 118 5. Israel Ministry of Health. Information on confirmed patients and COVID-19  
119 press releases. [https://govextra.gov.il/ministry-of-health/corona/corona-](https://govextra.gov.il/ministry-of-health/corona/corona-virus/spokesman-messages-corona/)  
120 [virus/spokesman-messages-corona/](https://govextra.gov.il/ministry-of-health/corona/corona-virus/spokesman-messages-corona/). Accessed Mar 20, 2020.
- 121 6. Central Bureau of Statistics. Statistical Abstract of Israel 2019 - No.70.  
122 [https://www.cbs.gov.il/en/publications/Pages/2019/Statistical-Abstract-of-](https://www.cbs.gov.il/en/publications/Pages/2019/Statistical-Abstract-of-Israel-2019-No-70.aspx)  
123 [Israel-2019-No-70.aspx](https://www.cbs.gov.il/en/publications/Pages/2019/Statistical-Abstract-of-Israel-2019-No-70.aspx). Accessed Mar 20, 2020.

- 124 7. R Core Team. 2019. R: A language and environment for statistical Computing.  
125 R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. [https://www.R-](https://www.R-project.org/)  
126 [project.org/](https://www.R-project.org/).
- 127 8. Pierre-Yves Boelle and Thomas Obadia. 2015.  $R_0$ : Estimation of  $R_0$  and  
128 Real-Time Reproduction Number from Epidemics. R package version 1.2-6.  
129 <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=R0>
- 130 9. Karline Soetaert, Thomas Petzoldt, R. Woodrow Setzer. 2010. Solving  
131 Differential Equations in R: Package deSolve. Journal of Statistical Software,  
132 33(9), 1--25. URL <http://www.jstatsoft.org/v33/i09/> doi:  
133 10.18637/jss.v033.i09  
134