

Appendix

This appendix includes more details on study sample search criteria, inclusions and exclusions of symptom checker providers, the standardised clinical vignettes that were used, diagnosis and triage accuracy for each symptom checker.

Supplementary Table 1 – Contain the search terms to generate the list of symptom checker inclusions and exclusions lists

Supplementary Table 2 – Contain further details of the symptom checkers that were included in the study; including system description, registered country and founding year, as well as estimated monthly visits

Supplementary Table 3 – Contain the symptom checkers that were assessed but that met the exclusion criteria with a description of the reason for exclusion

Supplementary Table 4 – Contain the clinical vignettes used to test each of the symptom checkers. Each vignette provided the age, gender, symptoms, and correct diagnosis for a given condition. This table also notes where we added additional symptoms if the symptom checkers asked for them. The “simplified” symptoms were those inputted into each symptom checker and the recommended triage advice was the decisions the clinical team supporting the study agreed upon from NICE Clinical Knowledge Summaries.

Supplementary Data Table 1 – 5 – Contain the additional data generated from the study split into each of the four groupings including an overall view of the data.

Supplementary Table 1 | Search Terms

Search Provider	Search Type	Search Terms
Google web search	Online Tools	"Symptom Checker" "Symptom Assessment" "AI Symptom Assessment" "AI Symptom Checker"
Google Play on a Samsung Device	Apps	"Symptom Checker App" "Symptom Assessment App"
App Store on an Apple Device	Apps	"Symptom Checker App" "Symptom Assessment App"

Supplementary Table 2 | Symptom checkers included in the study

Provider	Overview ¹	Founded ²	Funding ²	Registered ²	Monthly Visits ²	Medical Device Registration ³	Disclaimer ¹
Ada Health	Ada is a global health company founded by doctors, scientists, and industry pioneers to create new possibilities for personal health. Ada's core system connects medical knowledge with intelligent technology to help all people actively manage their health and medical professionals to deliver effective care. Ada is proud to collaborate with leading health systems and global non-profit organizations to carry out this vision. The #1 medical app for 130 countries, 10 million assessments have been completed since its global launch in 2016.	2011	\$69.3m	Germany	375,630	Class 1 Medical device	Yes
Ask NHS – Sensely	Sensely's avatar and chatbot-based platforms assist insurance plan members and patients with the insurance services and healthcare resources they need, when they need it. With offices in London and San Francisco, Sensely's global teams provide virtual assistant solutions to insurance companies, pharmaceutical clients, and hospital systems worldwide	2013	\$26.8m	USA	2,838		Yes
Babylon Health	Babylon is a digital health service provider that combines AI technology with the medical expertise of humans. Babylon delivers full access to healthcare, including personalised health assessments, treatment advice and face-to-face appointments with a doctor 24/7. Babylon's mission is to put an accessible and affordable health service in the hands of every person on earth. With the Babylon app, you can talk to a GP within minutes via phone or video call, ask simple medical questions via their text service and monitor your health with their comprehensive tracking system. The Babylon app is everything you need to proactively manage your healthcare. Babylon has partnerships with Tencent, TELUS and Samsung. They have AI licensing deals with Prudential Asia and BUPA. They also offer end-to-end clinical services in the UK, Rwanda and Canada.	2013	\$635.3m	UK	93,332	Class 1	Yes
Buoy Health	Buoy provides a personalized all-in-one platform to help guide consumers back to health. Whether it's chatting about symptoms with Buoy Assistant to get help in the moment of sickness or researching benefits through Buoy Dashboard, Buoy is available 24/7 to help make self-diagnosis and navigating the healthcare system simple and easy. For employers, Buoy can be custom configured to surface benefits information and wellness programs, guide employees to in-network providers, and fully integrate with other health portals — providing a single, simple destination for employee wellbeing.	2014	\$29m	USA	461,310		Yes
CAIRDR - Clinova	Clinova is a UK based, global, consumer healthcare company, with the aim of identifying, developing and marketing innovative and cost-effective healthcare products and digital healthcare solutions. The company's HQ is close to Old Street in London. Clinova's products can be found in the UK at Boots, Tesco, Holland and Barrett, Lloyds Pharmacy, Wiggle, Ocado, and Amazon Prime. Furthermore, you can purchase the products in 20	2006		UK			Yes

	international markets including the UAE, Singapore, Honk Kong, Japan, Chile, USA, Canada, Ireland, Italy, Portugal, Lebanon, and Oman.						
Doctorlink	<p>Doctorlink is the UK's leading health and symptom assessment platform, providing 24/7 access to healthcare for over 10 million NHS patients. Through its clinical decision algorithm, Doctorlink is transforming the industry, enabling payers and providers to save cost, improve efficiencies, and increase the accessibility of healthcare. The platform helps people engage in their health and wellbeing, guiding them to the right care, leading to better outcomes and driving prevention.</p> <p>Founded by Eight Roads, a global proprietary investment firm backed by Fidelity, and headquartered in the UK with offices in the US, Doctorlink has over 125 employees globally. It provides fully customisable and scalable SaaS products for the world's largest healthcare organisations including AXA, BUPA, Kaiser Permanente and Web MD, and has provided 60 million health assessments to date. Doctorlink is proud to be the leading provider of online Symptom Assessment to the NHS, covering 1,350 GP practices and available to 10 million patients in England. Doctorlink has recently been selected for the GP IT Futures Framework.</p> <p>Doctorlink's algorithms are medico-legal compliant and indemnified with rigorous clinical governance and licensed independent peer review. Built by a team of healthcare experts and technology visionaries, the algorithms combine Bayesian logic to ensure robust clinical safety and AI learning to drive continuous improvement methodology.</p>	2016	£20m	UK	57,826	Class 1 Medical device	Yes
Infermedica	<p>Infermedica tackles the problem of unnecessary medical care and waste, providing insurance companies, hospitals, and health systems with a set of advanced preliminary diagnosis and triage tools.</p> <p>Founded in 2012 by a team of engineers, data scientists, and physicians, Infermedica develops its own AI technology to collect intake, check symptoms, and guide patients to the right care. The technology can also detect emergencies and support healthcare professionals by giving them early access to health information and recommendations.</p> <p>Today, over 30 companies worldwide use Infermedica to increase their efficiency, improve patient flow, and reduce costs. Customers include, among others, European-based insurance giant Allianz, Taipei Medical University Hospital, and Everyday Health.</p>	2012	\$3.7m	Poland	9,921	Class 1	Yes
Isabel Healthcare	Isabel Healthcare provides a diagnosis decision support tool that doctors rely on for their own second opinion on patient care. They have developed various apps related to medical for Android and iOS users like Isabel.	1999		USA	58,253		Yes
Mediktor	<p>Mediktor is the most advanced and accurate expert system for pre-diagnoses, triage and decision-making support.</p> <p>The first artificial intelligent system clinically validated that is transforming healthcare for everyone.</p> <p>A technology that finally makes it possible to reduce access barriers to healthcare:</p>	2011	€3m	Spain	10,405	Class 1	Yes

	<p>- Patients can make better decisions from the first symptoms</p> <p>- And the healthcare system can organize its demand and optimize resources to offer a better medical coverage.</p>						
NHS 111	<p>111 online is a fast and convenient alternative to the 111 phone service and provides an option for people who want to access 111 digitally to;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • find out how to get the right healthcare in their area, including whether they need to see a GP or seek urgent care • get advice on self-care • in most areas, get a call back from a nurse, doctor or other trained health professional if they need it <p>It is one of several digital NHS services that are empowering people to manage their own health and care. It has been tested and made increasingly available across England since March 2017.</p> <p>In 2019 we will continue to work with local services, to make sure that the whole country can use the online 111 service to find the right care. This will include exploring how 111 online can be linked to primary care services.</p>	2013		UK			Yes
WebMD	<p>WebMD Health is an online platform that provides health information services for patients, physicians, and health care professionals.</p> <p>The WebMD content staff specializes in journalism, content creation, community services, expert commentary, and medical review to give its users a variety of ways to find what they are looking for. It is dictated to helping people find the health and medical information, support, and services they need.</p>	1996		USA			Yes
Your.MD	<p>Your.MD is a digital health platform committed to helping everyone in the world find their health through self-care. Built by doctors, data scientists and digital experts, Your.MD's aim is to help anyone, anywhere find safe and personalised information, guidance and support for their health for free. Your.MD is used by millions of people all over the world, it has the highest standards of clinical governance and backed by leading investors and health organisations.</p>	2012	\$17.3m	UK	493,048	Class 1	Yes

Data Sources:

¹ Provider websites

² Crunchbase (<https://www.crunchbase.com/home>) Accessed: 27/01/2020

³ MHRA (<https://aic.mhra.gov.uk/era/pdr.nsf/name?openpage&start=1&count=200>)

Supplementary Table 3 | Excluded Symptom Checkers

Exclusion Criteria

The symptom checker;

- was not available for individuals to access either via the web or a dedicated application within the UK
- used another chatbot or algorithm provider as the main source
- focused on single conditions i.e. diabetes
- only focussed on paediatrics
- had narrow patient interactions where the focus was solely on condition information from an alphabetical list.

Provider	Web / App	Reason for removal
Patient.Info	Web/App	Uses Isabel as a base algorithm
FamilyDoctor.org	Web	Narrow patient interactions
Mayo Clinic	Web/ App	Narrow patient interactions
Healthline	Web	Narrow patient interactions
Everyday Health	Web	Uses Informatica as a base algorithm
Medicine.net	Web	Uses Web.MD as a base algorithm
Sutter Health	Web	Uses Ada Health as a base algorithm
RxList	Web	Uses Web.MD as a base algorithm
Healthychildren	Web	Paediatrics Only
Childmind	Web	Paediatrics Only
Find the right Care	Web	Uses Buoy Health as a base algorithm
epain assist	App	Narrow patient interactions
Doctor Diagnose	App	Narrow patient interactions
Tibot	App	Skin conditions only
Doctor31	App	Does not provide advice on disposition
Healthdirect	Web/App	Cannot access in the UK
Mercy.net	Web	Use Health Navigator
Healthy.WA	Web	Use Healthdirect
HopkinsAllChildren	Web	Paediatrics Only
MDAnderson	Web	Cancer Only
Diagnosis Medical App	App	Narrow patient interactions
Prognosis: Your Diagnosis	App	Medic diagnosis training tool
Doctor on demand	App	Video consultation app
e-consult	Web	Not freely accessible
K-Health	Web/App	Cannot access in the UK
Cedars Sinai	Web	Use Health Navigator

Supplementary Data Table 1 | All Vignettes

Provider	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	Avg. Time to Complete Traversal (in seconds)		Avg. # of questions to get to a disposition		Accuracy of First Diagnosis		Diagnosis within the top 5		Diagnosis found		Accuracy of disposition		Safety of disposition (Appropriate / Higher)		Additional Resource Utilisation (NICE CKS)	
			Avg	(CI)	Avg	(CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)
Ada	50 / 50	100% (92.9 - 100%)	217.4	(201.9 - 232.9)	45.8	(43.2 - 48.5)	36 / 50	72.0% (52.8 - 88.0%)	42 / 50	84.0% (64.7 - 98.5%)	42 / 50	84.0% (65.2 - 97.9%)	32 / 50	64.0% (49.1 - 76.9%)	48 / 50	96.0% (81.6 - 100%)	24 / 50	48.0% (35.2 - 61.1%)
Ask NHS	39 / 50	78% (64.8 - 87.2%)	152.9	(137.7 - 168.1)	21.2	(19.6 - 22.8)	-	-	-	-	0 / 39	-	26 / 39	66.7% (49.3 - 81.0%)	34 / 39	87.2% (71.9 - 95.8%)	23 / 39	59.0% (42.2 - 74.2%)
Babylon	49 / 50	98% (89.5 - 99.6%)	111.1	(102.2 - 119.9)	17.8	(16.2 - 19.4)	-	-	-	-	0 / 49	-	28 / 49	57.1% (43.3 - 69.9%)	44 / 49	89.8% (76.0 - 97.8%)	30 / 49	61.2% (45.7 - 75.1%)
Bouy Health	47 / 50	94% (83.8 - 97.9%)	208.7	(190.8 - 226.6)	35.0	(33.0 - 37.0)	24 / 47	51.1% (35.6 - 66.4%)	30 / 47	63.8% (47.5 - 78.0%)	30 / 47	63.8% (48.0 - 77.6%)	25 / 47	53.2% (39.9 - 66.0%)	34 / 47	72.3% (60.6 - 80.8%)	24 / 47	51.1% (37.2 - 64.7%)
Caidr	45 / 50	90% (78.6 - 95.7%)	37.7	(32.9 - 42.4)	9.5	(8.0 - 11.0)	10 / 45	22.2% (13.6 - 35.2%)	10 / 45	22.2% (14.7 - 34.1%)	10 / 45	22.2% (15.0 - 33.9%)	16 / 45	35.6% (25.5 - 47.8%)	20 / 45	44.4% (36.4 - 53.3%)	21 / 45	46.7% (33.5 - 60.4%)
Doctorlink	50 / 50	100% (92.9 - 100%)	156.3	(139.6 - 173.1)	32.2	(28.7 - 35.7)	34 / 50	68.0% (49.6 - 83.9%)	43 / 50	86.0% (66.3 - 100%)	43 / 50	86.0% (66.9 - 100%)	45 / 50	90.0% (26.4 - 51.6%)	50 / 50	100% (85.1 - 100%)	9 / 50	18.0% (11.8 - 28.7%)
Informatica	37 / 50	74% (60.4 - 84.1%)	138.5	(121.5 - 155.6)	30.6	(29.0 - 32.2)	22 / 37	59.5% (40.2 - 77.0%)	28 / 37	75.7% (54.9 - 91.6%)	30 / 37	81.1% (59.7 - 96.6%)	14 / 37	37.8% (26.4 - 51.6%)	27 / 37	73.0% (59.4 - 82.2%)	26 / 37	70.3% (50.6 - 86.1)
Isabel	50 / 50	100% (92.9 - 100%)	52.5	(45.6 - 59.4)	8.2	(7.8 - 8.7)	18 / 50	36.0% (24.3 - 49.7%)	36 / 50	72.0% (54.7 - 86.1%)	42 / 50	84.0% (65.2 - 97.9%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Mediktor	49 / 50	98% (89.5 - 99.6%)	109.3	(101.2 - 117.5)	16.9	(15.8 - 18.0)	23 / 49	46.9% (32.7 - 61.7)	32 / 49	65.3% (49.1 - 79.3%)	32 / 49	65.3% (49.5 - 78.9%)	26 / 49	53.1% (40.0 - 65.7%)	45 / 49	91.8% (77.8 - 99.8%)	27 / 49	55.1% (40.8 - 68.7%)
NHS 111	46 / 50	92% (81.2 - 96.8%)	129.7	(114.8 - 144.6)	20.4	(19.0 - 21.8)	-	-	-	-	0 / 46	-	24 / 46	52.2% (38.9 - 65.1%)	38 / 46	82.6% (69.3 - 90.9%)	27 / 46	58.7% (43.2 - 72.8%)
Web.MD	49 / 50	98% (89.5 - 99.6%)	90.7	(80.0 - 101.5)	10.9	(10.2 - 11.5)	17 / 49	34.7% (23.2 - 48.4)	35 / 49	71.4% (54.1 - 85.7%)	45 / 49	91.8% (71.6 - 100%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Your.MD	37 / 50	74% (60.4 - 84.1%)	147.2	(132.3 - 162.1)	17.9	(16.4 - 19.3)	22 / 37	59.5% (40.2 - 77.0%)	23 / 37	62.2% (44.2 - 77.8%)	23 / 37	62.2% (44.7 - 77.3%)	23 / 37	62.2% (45.3 - 62.2%)	31 / 37	83.8% (68.5 - 92.7%)	18 / 37	48.6% (33.8 - 63.8)
All Vignettes	548 / 600	91.2% (88.8 - 93.4%)	128.8	(124.2 - 133.3)	22.2	(21.3 - 23.2)	206 / 548	37.7% (33.6 - 41.7%)	279 / 548	51.0% (46.7 - 55.1%)	297 / 548	54.2% (50.0 - 58.3%)	259 / 449	57.7% (53.1 - 62.2%)	371 / 449	82.6% (78.9 - 85.9%)	229 / 449	51.0% (46.4 - 55.6)
P Value	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	<0.001	-	<0.001	-	<0.001	-	<0.001	-	<0.001	-	0.0002

Supplementary Table 4 | Clinical Vignettes

Emergent Care - Defined as A&E now, Ambulance, appointment or advice within 1 hour

Vignette ID	Defined Diagnosis	Vignette Description	Simplified Symptoms	Recommended Triage Advice
1	Acute liver failure ¹	A 48-year-old woman with a history of migraine headaches presents to the emergency room with altered mental status over the last several hours. She was found by her husband, earlier in the day, to be acutely disoriented and increasingly somnolent. On physical examination, she has scleral icterus, mild right upper quadrant tenderness, and asterixis. Preliminary laboratory studies are notable for a serum ALT of 6498 units/L, total bilirubin of 5.6 mg/dL, and INR of 6.8. Her husband reports that she has consistently been taking pain medications and started taking additional 500 mg acetaminophen pills several days ago for lower back pain. Further history reveals a medication list with multiple acetaminophen-containing preparations.	48 y/o f, confusion, several hours disorientation, history of migraines, increasingly drowsy, mild right upper quadrant tenderness, recently took paracetamol	An Ambulance should be called
2	Appendicitis ¹	A 12-year-old girl presents with sudden-onset severe generalized abdominal pain associated with nausea, vomiting, and diarrhoea. On exam she appears ill and has a temperature of 104°F	12 y/o f, sudden onset severe abdominal pain, nausea, vomiting, diarrhoea, T=104	The patient should attend an accident

		(40°C). Her abdomen is tense with generalized tenderness and guarding. No bowel sounds are present.		and emergency department
3	Asthma ¹	A 27-year-old woman with a history of moderate persistent asthma presents to the emergency room with progressive worsening of shortness of breath, wheezing, and cough over 3 days. She reports prior exposure to a person who had a runny nose and a hacking cough. She did not receive significant relief from her rescue inhaler with worsening symptoms, despite increased use. She has been compliant with her maintenance asthma regimen, which consists of an inhaled corticosteroid and a leukotriene receptor antagonist for maintenance therapy and albuterol as rescue therapy. Her cough is disrupting her sleep pattern and as a consequence she is experiencing daytime somnolence, which is affecting her job performance.	27 y/o f, Hx of asthma, mild shortness of breath, wheezing, 3 days cough, symptoms not responsive to inhalers, recent cold	An Ambulance should be called
4	Cellulitis ¹	A 45-year-old man presents with acute onset of pain and redness of the skin of his lower extremity. Low-grade fever is present and the pretibial area is erythematous, edematous, and tender.	45 y/o m, pain and redness of skin, low grade fever, redness, swelling, and tenderness lower leg	Emergency 1-hour appointment required
5	COPD flare (more severe) ¹	A 67-year-old woman with a history of COPD presents with 3 days of worsening dyspnoea and increased frequency of coughing. Her cough is now productive of green, purulent sputum. The patient has a 100-pack-year history of smoking. She has had intermittent, low-grade fever of 100°F (37.7°C) for the past 3 days and her appetite is poor. She has required increased use of rescue bronchodilator therapy in addition to her maintenance medications to control symptoms.	67 y/o f, Hx of COPD, 3 days worsening shortness of breath, increase coughing, green sputum, low grade fever, increase use of rescue bronchodilator therapy	Seeking advice from a medical professional
6	Headache due to CO poisoning	30 yo female with mild to moderate headache. Lives with her husband who also has a mild to moderate headache that started after they got home from work. They do not have a carbon monoxide meter in the home. It is winter and they just started the wood burning stove due to cold weather.	30 y/o f, mild / moderate headache. Partner the same, no CO2 monitors	Seeking advice from a medical professional
7	Haemolytic uremic syndrome ¹	A 4-year-old boy presents with a 7-day history of abdominal pain and watery diarrhoea that became bloody after the first day. Three days before the onset of symptoms, he had visited the county fair with his family and had eaten a hamburger. Physical examination reveals a mild anaemia	4 y/o m, 7-day Hx of abdominal pain, bloody diarrhoea, ate hamburger at fair 3 days ago	Seeking advice from a medical professional
8	Kidney stones ¹	A 45-year-old white man presents to the emergency department with a 1-hour history of sudden onset of left-sided flank pain radiating down toward his groin. The patient is writhing in pain, which is unrelieved by position. He also complains of nausea and vomiting.	45 y/o m, 1-hour severe left sided flank pain radiating into groin, nausea, vomiting, pain unrelieved by position	Seeking advice from a medical professional
9	Malaria ¹	A 28-year-old man presents to his physician with a 5-day history of fever, chills, and rigors, not improving with acetaminophen (paracetamol), along with diarrhoea. He had been traveling in Central America for 3 months, returning 8 weeks ago. He had been bitten by mosquitoes on multiple occasions, and although he initially took malaria prophylaxis, he discontinued it due to mild nausea. He does not know the specifics of his prophylactic therapy. On examination he has a temperature of 100.4°F (38°C) and is mildly tachycardic with a BP of 126/82 mmHg. The remainder of the examination is normal.	28 y/o m, 5-day Hx of fever, chills, rigors, diarrhoea, recent travel abroad to area with malaria, bitten by mosquitoes, did not take malaria prophylaxis consistently	Seeking advice from a medical professional
10	Meningitis ¹	An 18-year-old male student presents with severe headache and fever that he has had for 3 days. Examination reveals fever, photophobia, and neck stiffness.	18 y/o m, 3 days severe headache, fever, photophobia (light), neck stiffness	The patient should attend an accident and emergency department

11	Pneumonia ¹	A 6-year-old boy with a medical history significant for mild persistent asthma is brought to the clinic by his mother with a history of a 5-day cough. His mother reports that the child's fever continues to be elevated despite acetaminophen therapy. He has missed school for the past 3 days and he has a classmate sick with pneumonia. The mother reports that the appetite is good for the child. His cough produced yellowish sputum at home. His vitals at the clinic are respiratory rate 19 breaths/min, heart rate 80 beats/min, and temperature 101.6°F (38.7°C). He appears in no respiratory distress. His lung examination reveals bilateral rales and occasional wheeze. CXR reveals lobar infiltrates without pleural effusions.	6 y/o m, Hx of asthma, 5 days cough, fever, appetite good, yellow sputum, t 101.6	Seeking advice from a medical professional
12	Pulmonary embolism ¹	A 65-year-old man presents to the emergency department with acute onset of SOB of 30 minutes' duration. Initially, he felt faint but did not lose consciousness. He is complaining of left-sided chest pain that worsens on deep inspiration. He has no history of cardiopulmonary disease. A week ago he underwent a total left hip replacement and, following discharge, was on bed rest for 3 days due to poorly controlled pain. He subsequently noticed swelling in his left calf, which is tender on examination. His current vital signs reveal a fever of 100.4°F (38.0°C), heart rate 112 bpm, BP 95/65, and an O2 saturation on room air of 91%.	65 y/o m, shortness of breath for 30 min, chest pain that worsens with inspiration, recent surgery, recent bed rest, swelling in left calf, which is tender, fever	The patient should attend an accident and emergency department
13	Tetanus ¹	A 63-year-old man sustained a cut on his hand while gardening. His immunization history is significant for not having received a complete tetanus immunization schedule. He presents with signs of generalized tetanus with trismus ("lock jaw"), which results in a grimace described as "risus sardonicus" (sardonic smile). Intermittent tonic contraction of his skeletal muscles causes intensely painful spasms, which last for minutes, during which he retains consciousness. The spasms are triggered by external (noise, light, drafts, physical contact) or internal stimuli, and as a result he is at the risk of sustaining fractures or developing rhabdomyolysis. The tetanic spasms also produce opisthotonus, board-like abdominal wall rigidity, dysphagia, and apneic periods due to contraction of the thoracic muscles and/or glottal or pharyngeal muscles. During a generalized spasm the patient arches his back, extends his legs, flexes his arms in abduction, and clenches his fists. Apnea results during some of the spasms. Autonomic overactivity initially manifests as irritability, restlessness, sweating, and tachycardia. Several days later this may present as hyperpyrexia, cardiac arrhythmias, labile hypertension, or hypotension.	65 y/o m, cannot open mouth, contraction of muscles causing painful spasms for minutes, sweating, tachycardia (fast heart rate), cut hand while gardening, did not get tetanus shot	An Ambulance should be called
14	Coronavirus	25 yo male has fever and cough. Just returned from a work trip to China 3 days ago.	Fever, cough, abroad specifically China	Seeking advice from a medical professional
15	Heart Attack ²	Mr. Y is a 64-year-old Chinese male who presents with chest pain for 24 hours. One day prior to presentation, the patient began to experience 8/10, non-radiating substernal chest pressure associated with diaphoresis and shortness of breath. The pain initially improved with Tylenol, however over the following 24 hours, his symptoms worsened. The patient went to his primary physician, where an EKG was performed which showed ST elevation in leads V2-V6.	64 y/o m, 1-day chest pain (8/10), non-radiating substernal chest pressure, sweating, shortness of breath, (chest tightness)	An Ambulance should be called
16	Stroke ¹	A 70-year-old man with a history of chronic HTN and atrial fibrillation is witnessed by a family member to have nausea, vomiting, and right-sided weakness, as well as difficulty speaking and comprehending language. The symptoms started with only mild slurred speech before progressing over several minutes to severe aphasia and right arm paralysis. The patient is taking warfarin.	70 y/o m, nausea, vomiting, right-sided weakness, rt arm paralysis, difficulty speaking and comprehension	An Ambulance should be called

Urgent - Defined as appointment or seek advice >1hr up to and including 24hrs

Vignette ID	Defined Diagnosis	Vignette Description	Simplified Symptoms	Recommended Triage Advice
17	Acute pharyngitis ¹	A 7-year-old girl presents with abrupt onset of fever, nausea, vomiting, and sore throat. The child denies cough, rhinorrhoea, or nasal congestion. On physical exam, oral temperature is 101°F (38.5°C) and there is an exudative pharyngitis, with enlarged cervical lymph nodes. A rapid antigen test is positive for group A Streptococcus (GAS).	7 y/o f, fever (101), nausea, vomiting, sore throat, swollen lymph nodes, tonsillar exudate; no cough, rhinorrhoea, or nasal congestion, breathe sounds not commented on	Same day appointment to see a medical professional
18	Acute pharyngitis ⁵	Mr. A is a 24-year-old man who presents to your office for complaints of sore throat, fever, and headache. His symptoms started 2 days ago with acute onset of sore throat and fever to 102.2. He has had no cough. His physical examination is normal, except for the presence of tonsillar exudates and some tender anterior cervical lymphadenopathy. He is otherwise in good health and is on no medications except for ibuprofen for fever. He has no drug allergies. (, Centor score = 4 – treat, or test and treat)	24 y/o m, sore throat, fever (102.2), headache, no cough, tonsillar exudates	Same day appointment to see a medical professional
19	COPD flare (milder) ¹	A 56-year-old woman with a history of smoking presents to her primary care physician with shortness of breath and cough for several days. Her symptoms began 3 days ago with rhinorrhoea. She reports a chronic morning cough productive of white sputum, which has increased over the past 2 days. She has had similar episodes each winter for the past 4 years. She has smoked 1 to 2 packs of cigarettes per day for 40 years and continues to smoke. She denies haemoptysis, chills, or weight loss and has not received any relief from over-the-counter cough preparations.	56 y/o f, Hx of smoking, shortness of breath and cough for several days, rhinorrhoea 3 days ago, white sputum, no chills	Same day appointment to see a medical professional
20	Deep vein thrombosis ¹	A 65-year-old woman presents with unilateral leg pain and swelling of 5 days' duration. There is a history of hypertension, mild CHF, and recent hospitalization for pneumonia. She had been recuperating at home but on beginning to mobilize and walk, the right leg became painful, tender, and swollen. On examination, the right calf is 4cm greater in circumference than the left when measured 10 cm below the tibial tuberosity. Superficial veins in the leg are more dilated on the right foot and the right leg is slightly redder than the left. There is some tenderness on palpation in the popliteal fossa behind the knee.	65 y/o f, 5 days swelling, pain in one leg, recent hospitalization, leg painful, tender, swollen, red	Seeking advice from a medical professional
21	Pneumonia ³	A 65-year-old man with hypertension and degenerative joint disease presents to the emergency department with a three-day history of a productive cough and fever. He has a temperature of 38.3°C (101°F), a blood pressure of 144/92 mm Hg, a respiratory rate of 22 breaths per minute, a heart rate of 90 beats per minute, and oxygen saturation of 92 percent while breathing room air. Physical examination reveals only crackles and egophony in the right lower lung field. The white-cell count is 14,000 per cubic millimetre, and the results of routine chemical tests are normal. A chest radiograph shows an infiltrate in the right lower lobe.	65 y/o m, Hx of hypertension and degenerative joint disease, 3-day Hx of productive cough and fever (101)	Seeking advice from a medical professional
22	Hypertensive headache	50 yo male with severe headache especially after waking. Has a history of high blood pressure but ran out of medication last week and stopped taking it. Has not checked his blood pressure.	Moderate / Severe headache, history high BP, medication ran out, not checked BP	Same day appointment to see a medical professional

23	Acute otitis media ¹	An 18-month-old toddler presents with 1 week of rhinorrhoea, cough, and congestion. Her parents report she is irritable, sleeping restlessly, and not eating well. Overnight she developed a fever. She attends day care and both parents smoke. On examination signs are found consistent with a viral respiratory infection including rhinorrhoea and congestion. The toddler appears irritable and apprehensive and has a fever. Otoscopy reveals a bulging, erythematous tympanic membrane and absent landmarks.	18 mo f, 1-week rhinorrhoea (blocked nose), cough, congestion, irritable, lack of appetite, fever, in day-care	Seeking advice from a medical professional
24	Mononucleosis ¹	A 16-year-old female high school student presents with complaints of fever, sore throat, and fatigue. She started feeling sick 1 week ago. Her symptoms are gradually getting worse, and she has difficulty swallowing. She has had a fever every day, and she could hardly get out of bed this morning. She does not remember being exposed to anybody with a similar illness recently. On physical examination she is febrile and looks sick. Enlarged cervical lymph nodes, exudative pharyngitis with soft palate petechiae and faint erythematous macular rash on the trunk and arms are found.	16 y/o f, 1-week Hx of fever, sore throat, fatigue, difficulty swallowing, fever, enlarged lymph nodes, exudates, macular rash on trunk/arms	Same day appointment to see a medical professional
25	Shingles ¹	A 77-year-old man reports a 5-day history of burning and aching pain on the right side of his chest. This is followed by the development of erythema and a maculopapular rash in this painful area, accompanied by headache and malaise. The rash progressed to develop clusters of clear vesicles for 3 to 5 days, evolving through stages of pustulation, ulceration, and crusting.	77 y/o m, 5 day burning and aching on right side of chest, erythema (red skin), maculopapular rash (flat small bumps), headache, malaise, rash progressed to clear vesicles after 3-5 days	Seeking advice from a medical professional
26	Urinary tract infection ¹	A 26-year-old female newlywed presents complaining of painful urination, feeling of urgent need to urinate, and more frequent urination for 2 days. She denies any fever, chills, nausea, vomiting, back pain, vaginal discharge, or vaginal pruritus.	26 y/o f, painful urination, urgent need to urinate, more frequent urination for 2 days, sexually active; no fever, chills, nausea, vomiting, back pain, vaginal discharge, vaginal pruritus	Same day appointment to see a medical professional
27	Vomiting ⁷	Elizabeth's 2-year-old son has a fever and vomited twice. Elizabeth worries about dehydration, so she gives Jack a sippy cup of apple juice. He immediately vomits up the juice. Elizabeth debates what to do next. Should she try to reach Jack's paediatrician or should she take Jack to the ED? Instead, she calls her triage nurse line. Temperature = 100.5	2 y/o m, low grade fever (T = 100.5), vomited twice, vomits up juice, parents concern	Seeking advice from a medical professional

Non-Urgent - Defined as wait or seek advice more than 24 hours

Vignette ID	Defined Diagnosis	Vignette Description	Simplified Symptoms	Recommended Triage Advice
28	Acute sinusitis ⁵	Mrs. S is a 35-year-old woman who presents with 15 days of nasal congestion. She has had facial pain and green nasal discharge for the last 12 days. She has had no fever. On physical examination, she has no fever and the only abnormal finding is maxillary tenderness on palpation. She is otherwise healthy, except for mild obesity. She is on no medications, except for an over-the-counter decongestant. She has no drug allergies	35 y/o f, sx for 15 days, nasal congestion, facial pain, green nasal discharge, no fever	Routine appointment with a medical professional
29	Arthritis	60 yo female has pain in her knee has been getting progressively worse over the past year. Difficulty kneeling, getting up from a chair and walking up stairs. Has not had any injury to the knee	60 y/o, knee pain, getting worse, difficulty with mobility, no injury	Routine appointment with a medical professional

30	Constipation ¹	A 5-month-old baby boy presents with difficulty and delay in passing hard stools. His mother reports that he strains for several hours and may even miss a day, before passing stool with screaming and occasional spots of fresh blood on the stool or diaper. He has recently been weaned from breastfeeding to cows' milk formula, which he had been reluctant to drink initially. The child is thriving and now feeding normally. There was no neonatal delay in defecation and no history of excessive vomiting or abdominal distension.	5 mo m, difficulty/delay in passing hard stools, strains for hours, may miss a day, screams when passes stool and occasional spots of blood, weaned from breastmilk to cows' milk, now feeding normally	Seeking advice from a medical professional
31	Back pain ⁶	Consider a 35-year-old man who developed low back pain after shovelling snow 3 weeks ago. He presents to the office for an evaluation. On examination there is a new left foot drop. In study 82% physicians recommend MRI (sciatica/sprain)	35 y/o m, back pain following shovelling, left foot drop, symptoms 3 weeks of duration (loss of sensation in foot)	Routine appointment with a medical professional
32	Depression	25 yo male recently married now has feelings of sadness nearly every day. No thoughts of suicide. Difficulty concentrating at work more than half the days in the past 2 weeks. Wants to just stay in bed all day. Not feeling ill. Has had some trouble sleeping several days in the past 2 weeks.	25 yo m, feeling of sadness nearly every day, no suicide thoughts, no illness symptoms	Routine appointment with a medical professional
33	Peptic Ulcer Disease ¹	A 40-year-old man presents to his primary care physician with a 2-month history of intermittent upper abdominal pain. He describes the pain as a dull, gnawing ache. The pain sometimes wakes him at night, is relieved by food and drinking milk, and is helped partially by ranitidine. He had a similar but milder episode about 5 years ago, which was treated with omeprazole. Physical examination reveals a fit, apparently healthy man in no distress. The only abnormal finding is mild epigastric tenderness on palpation of the abdomen.	40 y/o m, 2-month Hx of intermittent upper abdominal pain, dulling and gnawing ache, wakes at night and is relieved by food/drinking milk/ranitidine, prior episode 5 yrs ago	Routine appointment with a medical professional
34	Vertigo ¹	A 65-year-old woman presents with a chief complaint of dizziness. She describes it as a sudden and severe spinning sensation precipitated by rolling over in bed onto her right side. Symptoms typically last <30 seconds. They have occurred nightly over the last month and occasionally during the day when she tilts her head back to look upward. She describes no precipitating event prior to onset and no associated hearing loss, tinnitus, or other neurologic symptoms. Otologic and neurologic examinations are normal except for the Dix-Hallpike manoeuvre, which is negative on the left but strongly positive on the right side	65 y/o f, dizziness, sudden onset, recurrent, lasts <30 sec, consistent positional trigger, no hearing loss, ringing in ears, muscle weakness, loss of sensation	Routine appointment with a medical professional

Self-Care

Vignette ID	Defined Diagnosis	Vignette Description	Simplified Symptoms	Recommended Triage Advice
35	Acute bronchitis ¹	A 34-year-old woman with no known underlying lung disease 12-day history of cough. She initially had nasal congestion and a mild sore throat, but now her symptoms are all related to a productive cough without paroxysms. She denies any sick contacts. On physical examination she is not in respiratory distress and is afebrile with normal vital signs. No signs of URI are noted. Scattered wheezes are present diffusely on lung auscultation.	34 y/o f, 12-day cough, initial nasal congestion and sore throat, cough, no fever	Care can be self-managed at home
36	Acute bronchitis ⁵	Mrs. L is a 61-year-old woman who presents with 4 days of a cough productive of yellow sputum. Her symptoms started 4 days ago with rhinorrhoea and productive cough. She initially had fevers as high as 101 for 2 days, but those have now resolved. In the office, she has normal vital signs and a normal physical examination. She is otherwise healthy except for high cholesterol for which she is being treated with atorvastatin. She has no drug allergies.	61 y/o f, 4-day cough, yellow sputum, rhinorrhoea (stuffy nose) , fever (resolved)	Care can be self-managed at home
37	Acute conjunctivitis ¹	A 14-year-old boy with no significant past medical history presents 3 days after developing a red, irritated right eye that spread to the left eye today. He has watery discharge from both eyes and they are stuck shut in the morning. He reports recent upper respiratory symptoms and that several children at his day camp recently had pink eye. He denies significant pain or light sensitivity and does not wear contact lenses. On examination, his pupils are equal and reactive and he has a right-sided, tender preauricular lymph node. Penlight examination does not reveal any corneal opacity.	14 y/o m, 3 days red, irritated eye (spread from right to left), discharge, URI symptoms, no pain or light sensitivity	Care can be self-managed at home
38	Acute pharyngitis ⁵	Mr. E is a 26-year-old man who presents to your office for complaints of sore throat, headache, and non-productive cough. His symptoms started 2 days ago with acute onset of sore throat. He has been afebrile. His physical examination is normal, except for some pharyngeal erythema. He is otherwise in good health and is on no medications except for acetaminophen for his sore throat and fever. He has no drug allergies.	26 y/o m, 2-day sore throat, headache, cough, no fever	Care can be self-managed at home
39	Allergic rhinitis ¹	A 22-year-old student presents with a 5-year history of worsening nasal congestion, sneezing, and nasal itching. Symptoms are year-round but worse during the spring season. On further questioning it is revealed that he has significant eye itching, redness, and tearing as well as palate and throat itching during the spring season. He remembers that his mother told him at some point that he used to have eczema in infancy.	22 y/o m, 5-year Hx of nasal congestion, sneezing, nasal itching worse during spring season, eye itching, redness, tearing, palate and throat itching, Hx of eczema in infancy	Care can be self-managed at home
40	Back pain ¹	A 38-year-old man with no significant history of back pain developed acute LBP when lifting boxes 2 weeks ago. The pain is aching in nature, located in the left lumbar area, and associated with spasms. He describes previous similar episodes several years ago, which resolved without seeing a doctor. He denies any leg pain or weakness. He also denies fevers, chills, weight loss, and recent infections. Over-the-counter ibuprofen has helped somewhat, but he has taken it only twice a day for the past 3 days because he does not want to become dependent on painkillers. On examination, there is decreased lumbar flexion and extension secondary to pain, but a neurologic exam is unremarkable.	38 y/o m, acute low back pain after lifting, no leg pain or weakness, no fevers, chills, weight loss, or recent infections	Care can be self-managed at home

41	Bee sting without anaphylaxis ¹	A 9-year-old boy is brought to the ER after being stung by a bee at a picnic. He is crying hysterically. After 15 minutes of calming him down, exam reveals a swollen tender upper lip but no tongue swelling, no drooling, no stridor, no rash, and no other complaints.	9 y/o m, bee sting, swollen and tender upper lip; no tongue swelling, drooling, stridor, rash, or other complaints	Care can be self-managed at home
42	Canker sore ¹	A 17-year-old male student presents with recurrent mouth ulceration since his early schooldays. He has no respiratory, anogenital, gastrointestinal, eye, or skin lesions. His mother had a similar history as a teenager. The social history includes no tobacco use and virtually no alcohol consumption. He has no history of recent drug or medication ingestion. Extraoral exam reveals no significant abnormalities and specifically no pyrexia; no cervical lymph node enlargement; nor cranial nerve, salivary, or temporomandibular joint abnormalities. Oral exam reveals a well-restored dentition and there is no clinical evidence of periodontal-attachment loss or pocketing. He has five 4mm round ulcers with inflammatory haloes in his buccal mucosae.	17 y/o m with recurrent mouth ulceration for year, no respiratory, anogenital, gastrointestinal, eye, or skin lesions, mother has similar Hx, no Hx of recent drugs or medication	Care can be self-managed at home
43	Candidal yeast infection ⁶	Consider a 40-year-old, monogamous, married woman who calls to report a 2-day history of vaginal itching and thick white discharge. She has no abdominal pain or fever. (in study 50% recommended physician visit)	40 y/o f, 2-day vaginal itching, thick white discharge, no abdominal pain or fever	Care can be self-managed at home
44	Eczema ¹	A 12-year-old female presents with dry, itchy skin that involves the flexures in front of her elbows, behind her knees, and in front of her ankles. Her cheeks also have patches of dry, scaly skin. She has symptoms of hay fever and has recently been diagnosed with egg and milk allergy. She has a brother with asthma and an uncle and several cousins who have been diagnosed with eczema.	12 y/o f, dry, itchy skin in front of elbows, behind knees, in front of ankles,	Care can be self-managed at home
45	Fever only	18 yo female with fever started last night. No other symptoms. Temp is 99.6 currently and has been as high as 100.6. drinking ok, no vomiting or diarrhoea	18 y/o f, fever T=100.6, no other symptoms	Care can be self-managed at home
46	Influenza ¹	A 30-year-old woman presents in January with 2-day history of fever, cough, headache, and generalized weakness. She was in her usual state of health before an abrupt onset of these symptoms. A few viral illnesses have affected her during the current winter, but not to this severity. She reports sick contacts at work and did not receive the seasonal influenza vaccine this season.	30 y/o f, 2-day fever, cough, headache, weakness, did not get flu shot	Care can be self-managed at home
47	Salmonella ¹	A 14-year-old boy presents with nausea, vomiting, and diarrhoea. Eighteen hours earlier, he had been at a picnic where he ingested undercooked chicken along with a variety of other foods. He reports moderate volume, nonbloody stools occurring 6 times a day. He has mild abdominal cramps and a low-grade fever. He is evaluated at an acute care clinic and found to be mildly tachycardic (heart rate 105 bpm) with a normal BP and a low-grade temperature of 100.1°F (37.8°C). His physical exam is unremarkable except for mild diffuse abdominal tenderness and mild increased bowel sounds. He is able to take oral fluids and is instructed on the appropriate oral fluid and electrolyte rehydration.	14 y/o m, nausea, vomiting, non-bloody diarrhoea, mild abdominal cramps (T=100.1), mild abdominal tenderness, diarrhoea after attending a picnic and eating undercooked chicken,	Care can be self-managed at home
48	Stye ¹	A 30-year-old man presents with a painful, swollen right eye for the past day. He reports minor pain on palpation of the eyelid and denies any history of trauma, crusting, or change in vision. He has no history of allergies or any eye conditions and denies the use of any new soaps, lotions, or creams. On exam, he has localized tenderness to palpation and erythema on the midline of the lower eyelid near the lid margin. The remainder of the physical exam, including the globe, is normal.	30 y/o m, painful, swollen right eye for past day, no Hx of trauma, crusting, change in vision, allergies, or eye conditions, localized tenderness, erythema (redness)	Care can be self-managed at home

49	Viral upper respiratory illness	Mr. R. is a 56-year-old man who presents to you with 6 days of non-productive cough, nasal congestion, and green nasal discharge. He has had intermittent fevers as high as 100.8. His physical examination is normal except for rhinorrhoea. He is otherwise healthy, except for chronic osteoarthritis of the right knee. He has no drug allergies.	56 y/o m, 6-day cough, nasal congestion, green nasal discharge, fever (100.8), rhinorrhoea	Care can be self-managed at home
50	Viral upper respiratory illness	A 30-year-old man presents with a 2-day history of runny nose and sore throat. He feels hot and sweaty, has a mild headache, is coughing up clear sputum and complains of muscle aches. He would like antibiotics as he was prescribed them last year when he had a similar condition. On examination, he is afebrile, has a normal pulse, a slightly inflamed pharynx and nontender cervical lymphadenopathy. There is no neck stiffness and his chest is clear. He has tried over-the-counter cough medications but has not found these helpful. He smokes 10 cigarettes per day.	30 y/o m, 2-day HX of runny nose, sore throat, hot, sweaty, mild headache, cough with clear sputum, muscle aches, no fever or neck stiffness	Care can be self-managed at home

Table References

1. Epocrates. <https://online.epocrates.com/noFrame/>. 2014.
2. Lue J. NYU Medical Grand Rounds Clinical Vignette. 2012; <http://www.medicine.med.nyu.edu/education/im-residency-homepage/research-opportunities/clinical-vignettes>. Accessed September 8, 2014.
3. Halm EA, Teirstein AS. Clinical practice. Management of community-acquired pneumonia. N Engl J Med. Dec 19 2002;347(25):2039-2045.
4. Plantz SH, Adler JN, eds. NMS Emergency Medicine. Baltimore: Williams & Wilkins; 1998. National Medical Series for Independent Study.
5. Gidengil CA, Linder J, Beach S, Setodjian C, Hunter G, Mehrotra A. Using clinical vignettes to predict antibiotic prescribing for acute respiratory infections. In review.
6. Sirovich BE, Gottlieb DJ, Welch HG, Fisher ES. Variation in the tendency of primary care physicians to intervene. Arch Intern Med. Oct 24 2005;165(19):2252-2256.
7. Boroughs DS, Dougherty JA, Goldsmith C. Telephone Triage: Help Is Just a Call Away. <http://ce.nurse.com/RVignette.aspx?TopicId=718>. Accessed September 10, 2014.

Supplementary Data Table 2 | Emergent Care Vignettes

Provider	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	Avg. Time to Complete Traversal (in seconds)		Avg. # of questions to get to a disposition		Accuracy of First Diagnosis		Diagnosis within the top 5		Diagnosis found		Accuracy of disposition		Safety of disposition (Appropriate / Higher)		Additional Resource Utilisation (NICE CKS)	
			Avg	(CI)	Avg	(CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)
Ada	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	247.3	(224.4 - 270.2)	50.2	(46.1 - 54.3)	9 / 16	56.3% (28.6 - 81.5%)	12 / 16	75.0% (42.6 - 97.7%)	12 / 16	75.0% (43.3 - 97.0%)	14 / 16	87.5% (58.2 - 100%)	14 / 16	87.5% (58.4 - 100%)	8 / 16	50.0% (27.8 - 72.2%)
Ask NHS	13 / 16	81.3% (57.0 - 93.4%)	163.4	(122.2 - 204.5)	19.3	(14.9 - 23.7)	-	-	-	-	-	-	12 / 13	92.3% (58.2 - 100%)	12 / 13	92.3% (58.4 - 100%)	5 / 13	38.5% (19.3 - 62.9%)
Babylon	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	107.8	(95.9 - 119.8)	16.8	(13.9 - 19.7)	-	-	-	-	-	-	15 / 16	93.8% (62.6 - 100%)	15 / 16	93.8% (62.8 - 100%)	8 / 16	50.0% (27.8 - 72.2%)
Bouy Health	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	241.6	(199.4 - 283.7)	32.6	(27.2 - 37.9)	6 / 16	37.5% (17.6 - 62.2%)	9 / 16	56.3% (30.7 - 79.4%)	9 / 16	56.3% (31.3 - 78.8%)	10 / 16	62.5% (40.7 - 79.5%)	11 / 16	68.8% (45.2 - 85.0%)	8 / 16	50.0% (27.8 - 72.2%)
Caidr	15 / 16	93.8% (71.7 - 98.9%)	43.5	(35.5 - 51.4)	8.7	(6.0 - 11.3)	0 / 15	0% (0.0 - 20.4%)	0 / 15	0% (0.0 - 20.4%)	0 / 15	0% (0.0 - 20.4%)	0 / 15	0% (0.0 - 20.4%)	0 / 15	0% (0.0 - 20.4%)	11 / 15	73.3% (41.9 - 95.2%)
Doctorlink	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	171.9	(143.2 - 200.7)	30.4	(24.8 - 36.0)	9 / 16	56.3% (28.6 - 81.5%)	13 / 16	81.3% (46.6 - 100%)	13 / 16	81.3% (47.4 - 100%)	16 / 16	100% (67.0 - 100%)	16 / 16	100% (67.2 - 100%)	3 / 16	18.8% (9.2 - 40.4%)
Informatica	13 / 16	81.3% (57.0 - 93.4%)	182.4	(149.8 - 215.0)	33.1	(30.6 - 35.6)	3 / 13	23.1% (9.0 - 49.5%)	7 / 13	53.8% (27.1 - 78.8%)	8 / 13	61.5% (32.2 - 85.6%)	5 / 13	38.5% (23.1 - 59.1%)	5 / 13	38.5% (23.2 - 59.0%)	9 / 13	69.2% (37.4 - 92.3%)
Isabel	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	68.2	(56.8 - 79.5)	8.9	(8.3 - 9.5)	7 / 16	43.8% (21.2 - 68.7%)	11 / 16	68.8% (38.6 - 91.7%)	12 / 16	75.0% (43.3 - 97.0%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Mediktör	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	118.4	(99.2 - 137.6)	18.4	(15.7 - 21.0)	7 / 16	43.8% (21.2 - 68.7%)	9 / 16	56.3% (30.7 - 79.4%)	9 / 16	56.3% (31.3 - 78.8%)	12 / 16	75.0% (49.4 - 90.9%)	12 / 16	75.0% (49.6 - 90.7%)	8 / 16	50.0% (27.8 - 72.2%)
NHS 111	15 / 16	93.8% (71.7 - 98.9%)	149.5	(109.8 - 189.3)	17.2	(15.1 - 19.3)	-	-	-	-	-	-	11 / 16	73.3% (47.4 - 89.7%)	11 / 16	73.3% (47.6 - 89.5%)	8 / 16	53.3% (29.3 - 76.0%)
Web.MD	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	114.1	(100.2 - 128.1)	11.7	(10.8 - 12.5)	6 / 16	37.5% (17.6 - 62.2%)	8 / 16	50.0% (26.8 - 73.2%)	12 / 16	75.0% (43.3 - 97.0%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Your.MD	13 / 16	81.3% (57.0 - 93.4%)	146.7	(118.1 - 175.3)	16.8	(13.5 - 20.2)	9 / 13	69.2% (33.7 - 96.0)	9 / 13	69.2% (36.1 - 93.5%)	9 / 13	69.2% (36.9 - 92.8%)	11 / 13	84.6% (53.1 - 100%)	11 / 13	84.6% (53.3 - 100%)	5 / 13	38.5% (19.3 - 62.9%)
All Emergent	181 / 192	94.3% (90.0 - 96.8%)	145.5	(136.6 - 154.5)	22.0	(20.2 - 23.8)	56 / 181	30.9% (24.7 - 38.0%)	78 / 181	43.1% (36.1 - 50.4%)	84 / 181	46.4% (39.3 - 53.7%)	106 / 149	71.1% (63.4 - 77.8%)	107 / 149	71.8% (64.1 - 78.4%)	73 / 149	49.0% (41.1 - 56.9%)

Supplementary Data Table 3 | Urgent Care Vignettes

Provider	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	Avg. Time to Complete Traversal (in seconds)		Avg. # of questions to get to a disposition		Accuracy of First Diagnosis		Diagnosis within the top 5		Diagnosis found		Accuracy of disposition		Safety of disposition (Appropriate / Higher)		Additional Resource Utilisation (NICE CKS)	
			Avg	(CI)	Avg	(CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)
Ada	11 / 11	100% (74.1 - 100%)	245.9	(204.4 - 287.4)	49.7	(43.9 - 55.9)	7 / 11	63.6% (28.9 - 91.3%)	9 / 11	81.8% (42.7 - 100%)	9 / 11	81.8% (43.6 - 100%)	6 / 11	54.5% (27.5 - 79.2%)	11 / 11	100% (60.4 - 100%)	5 / 11	45.5% (23.0 - 70.3%)
Ask NHS	8 / 11	72.7% (43.4 - 90.3%)	176.3	(164.9 - 187.6)	23.6	(22.9 - 24.4)	-	-	-	-	-	-	7 / 8	87.5% (41.0 - 100%)	7 / 8	87.5% (46.7 - 100%)	5 / 8	62.5% (28.8 - 88.1%)
Babylon	11 / 11	100% (74.1 - 100%)	125.5	(107.6 - 143.5)	21.0	(17.9 - 24.1)	-	-	-	-	-	-	7 / 11	63.6% (32.7 - 87.5%)	8 / 11	72.7% (42.9 - 90.8%)	6 / 11	54.5% (28.1 - 78.6%)
Bouy Health	10 / 11	90.9% (62.3 - 98.4%)	221.7	(200.6 - 242.8)	37.7	(35.8 - 39.6)	3 / 10	30.0% (11.3 - 59.8%)	5 / 10	50.0% (23.7 - 76.3%)	5 / 10	50.0% (24.3 - 75.7%)	2 / 10	20.0% (8.7 - 47.9%)	3 / 10	30.0% (16.4 - 54.7%)	8 / 10	80.0% (41.5 - 100%)
Caidr	11 / 11	100% (74.1 - 100%)	37.2	(27.2 - 47.2)	9.5	(6.4 - 12.7)	1 / 11	9.1% (2.9 - 36.5%)	1 / 11	9.1% (3.7 - 35.6%)	1 / 11	9.1% (3.9 - 35.5%)	2 / 11	18.2% (8.1 - 44.7%)	2 / 11	18.2% (10.0 - 42.8%)	5 / 11	45.5% (23.0 - 70.3%)
Doctorlink	11 / 11	100% (74.1 - 100%)	197.3	(170.3 - 224.2)	42.5	(34.8 - 50.1)	7 / 11	63.6% (28.9 - 91.3%)	9 / 11	81.8% (42.7 - 100%)	9 / 11	81.8% (43.6 - 100%)	11 / 11	100% (54.1 - 100%)	11 / 11	100% (60.1 - 100%)	1 / 11	9.1% (4.0 - 35.4%)
Informedica	7 / 11	63.6% (35.4 - 84.8%)	130.3	(110.5 - 150.1)	31.1	(26.7 - 35.6)	7 / 7	100% (39.5 - 100%)	7 / 7	100% (44.1 - 100%)	7 / 7	100% (45.1 - 100%)	5 / 7	71.4% (30.7 - 97.0%)	6 / 7	85.7% (43.3 - 100%)	4 / 7	57.1% (24.6 - 84.6%)
Isabel	11 / 11	100% (74.1 - 100%)	57.4	(42.7 - 72.1)	9.3	(8.3 - 10.2)	5 / 11	45.5% (19.4 - 73.9%)	9 / 11	81.8% (42.7 - 100%)	11 / 11	100% (54.5 - 100%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Mediktor	11 / 11	100% (74.1 - 100%)	105.7	(90.9 - 120.6)	16.2	(14.6 - 17.8)	3 / 11	27.3% (10.5 - 55.8%)	6 / 11	54.4% (27.1 - 79.6%)	6 / 11	54.5% (27.8 - 79.0%)	8 / 11	72.7% (37.9 - 95.8%)	11 / 11	100% (60.1 - 100%)	4 / 11	36.4% (18.0 - 61.8%)
NHS 111	9 / 11	81.8% (52.3 - 94.9%)	121.6	(102.1 - 141.0)	19.9	(17.5 - 22.3)	-	-	-	-	-	-	2 / 11	22.2%(9.4 - 51.7%)	6 / 11	66.7% (36.6 - 86.8%)	8 / 11	88.9% (44.7 - 100%)
Web.MD	11 / 11	100% (74.1 - 100%)	93.1	(65.5 - 120.7)	12.2	(10.9 - 13.4)	3 / 11	27.3% (10.5 - 55.8%)	9 / 11	81.8% (42.7 - 100%)	11 / 11	100% (54.5 - 100%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Your.MD	7 / 11	63.6% (35.4 - 84.8%)	145.3	(97.0 - 193.6)	17.9	(15.8 - 19.9)	4 / 7	57.1% (20.3 - 88.9%)	4 / 7	57.1% (23.5 - 85.7%)	4 / 7	57.1% (24.2 - 85.0%)	0 / 7	0% (0.0 - 35.4%)	3 / 7	42.9% (20.9 - 69.9%)	7 / 7	100% (45.7 - 100%)
All Urgent	118 / 132	89.4% (83.0 - 93.6%)	136.7	(125.3 - 148.1)	24.2	(21.8 - 26.6)	40 / 118	33.9% (26.0 - 42.8%)	59 / 118	50.0% (41.1 - 58.9%)	63 / 118	53.4% (44.4 - 62.1%)	50 / 96	52.1% (42.2 - 61.8%)	68 / 96	70.8% (61.1 - 79.0%)	53 / 96	55.2% (45.3 - 64.8%)

Supplementary Data Table 4 | Non-Urgent Care Vignettes

Provider	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	Avg. Time to Complete Traversal (in seconds)		Avg. # of questions to get to a disposition		Accuracy of First Diagnosis		Diagnosis within the top 5		Diagnosis found		Accuracy of disposition		Safety of disposition (Appropriate / Higher)		Additional Resource Utilisation (NICE CKS)	
			Avg	(CI)	Avg	(CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)
Ada	7 / 7	100% (64.6 - 100%)	191.0	(168.7 - 213.3)	40.4	(34.0 - 46.8)	6 / 7	85.7% (34.0 - 100%)	7 / 7	100% (44.9 - 100%)	7 / 7	100% (45.7 - 100%)	2 / 7	28.6% (11.4 - 61.0%)	7 / 7	100% (57.7 - 100%)	5 / 7	71.4% (29.6 - 98.0%)
Ask NHS	6 / 7	85.7% (48.7 - 97.4%)	143.0	(113.7 - 172.3)	21.2	(20.1 - 22.2)	-	-	-	-	-	-	3 / 6	50.0% (19.5 - 80.5%)	3 / 6	50.0% (26.9 - 73.1%)	5 / 6	83.3% (32.6 - 100%)
Babylon	7 / 7	100% (64.6 - 100%)	107.6	(68.3 - 146.8)	15.6	(10.8 - 20.4)	-	-	-	-	-	-	2 / 7	28.6% (11.4 - 61.0%)	6 / 7	85.7% (49.3 - 96.8%)	5 / 7	71.4% (29.6 - 98.0%)
Bouy Health	6 / 7	85.7% (48.7 - 97.4%)	207.0	(183.1 - 230.9)	34.0	(32.8 - 35.2)	5 / 6	83.3% (30.2 - 100%)	5 / 6	83.3% (34.0 - 100%)	5 / 6	83.3% (34.7 - 100%)	5 / 6	83.3% (34.4 - 100%)	5 / 6	83.3% (45.2 - 95.5%)	1 / 6	16.7% (5.4 - 53.9%)
Caidr	6 / 7	85.7% (48.7 - 97.4%)	31.3	(17.1 - 45.6)	8.3	(5.2 - 11.5)	0 / 6	0% (0.0 - 39.0%)	0 / 6	0% (0.0 - 39.0%)	0 / 6	0% (0.0 - 39.0%)	4 / 6	66.7% (26.5 - 93.5%)	5 / 6	83.3% (45.2 - 95.5%)	2 / 6	33.3% (11.6 - 68.1%)
Doctorlink	7 / 7	100% (64.6 - 100%)	170.9	(128.0 - 213.7)	34.4	(24.2 - 33.0)	5 / 7	71.4% (27.4 - 100%)	6 / 7	85.7% (37.8 - 100%)	6 / 7	85.7% (38.5 - 100%)	4 / 7	57.1% (24.4 - 84.9%)	7 / 7	100% (57.7 - 100%)	3 / 7	42.9% (16.6 - 74.2%)
Informatica	6 / 7	85.7% (48.7 - 97.4%)	108.8	(82.8 - 134.8)	28.7	(24.4 - 33.0)	4 / 6	66.7% (23.3 - 97.1%)	4 / 6	66.7% (26.5 - 93.8%)	5 / 6	83.3% (34.7 - 100%)	2 / 6	33.3% (12.5 - 67.2%)	5 / 6	83.3% (45.2 - 95.5%)	4 / 6	66.7% (25.3 - 95.0%)
Isabel	7 / 7	100% (64.6 - 100%)	48.7	(31.7 - 65.7)	6.4	(5.8 - 7.0)	2 / 7	28.6% (9.4 - 63.0%)	5 / 7	71.4% (30.9 - 96.8%)	6 / 7	85.7% (38.5 - 100%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Mediktor	6 / 7	85.7% (48.7 - 97.4%)	115.3	(94.8 - 135.9)	16.5	(13.8 - 19.2)	2 / 6	33.3% (10.3 - 69.4%)	3 / 6	50.0% (19.3 - 80.7%)	3 / 6	50.0% (19.8 - 80.2%)	4 / 6	66.7% (26.5 - 93.5%)	6 / 6	100% (54.3 - 100%)	1 / 6	16.7% (5.4 - 53.9%)
NHS 111	6 / 7	85.7% (48.7 - 97.4%)	146.7	(117.6 - 175.7)	23.7	(18.6 - 28.7)	-	-	-	-	-	-	2 / 6	33.3% (12.5 - 67.2%)	5 / 6	83.3% (45.2 - 95.5%)	4 / 6	66.7% (25.3 - 95.0%)
Web.MD	6 / 7	85.7% (48.7 - 97.4%)	97.0	(71.4 - 122.6)	9.2	(8.2 - 10.1)	1 / 6	16.7% (4.7 - 54.7%)	6 / 6	100% (41.6 - 100%)	6 / 6	100% (42.5 - 100%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Your.MD	6 / 7	85.7% (48.7 - 97.4%)	143.8	(119.4 - 168.2)	19.3	(14.9 - 23.8)	4 / 6	66.7% (23.3 - 97.1%)	4 / 6	66.7% (26.5 - 93.8%)	4 / 6	66.7% (27.1 - 93.2%)	6 / 6	100% (42.1 - 100%)	6 / 6	100% (54.3 - 100%)	0 / 6	0% (0.0 - 39.0%)
All Non Urgent	76 / 84	90.5% (82.3 - 95.1%)	126.1	(114.3 - 137.9)	21.6	(19.1 - 23.8)	29 / 76	38.2% (28.1 - 49.4%)	40 / 76	52.6% (41.6 - 63.5%)	42 / 76	55.3% (44.1 - 65.9%)	34 / 63	54.0% (41.8 - 65.7%)	55 / 63	87.3% (54.3 - 93.4%)	30 / 63	47.6% (35.8 - 59.7%)

Supplementary Data Table 5 | Self- Care Vignettes

Provider	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	Avg. Time to Complete Traversal (in seconds)		Avg. # of questions to get to a disposition		Accuracy of First Diagnosis		Diagnosis within the top 5		Diagnosis found		Accuracy of disposition		Safety of disposition (Appropriate/ Higher)		Additional Resource Utilisation (NICE CKS)	
			Avg	(CI)	Avg	(CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)	# of Vignettes	% Coverage (CI)
Ada	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	179.5	(164.1 - 194.9)	41.1	(37.3 - 44.9)	14 / 16	87.5% (51.7 - 100%)	14 / 16	87.5% (54.8 - 100%)	14 / 16	87.5% (55.7 - 100%)	10 / 16	62.5% (35.7 - 84.4%)	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	6 / 16	37.5% (20.5 - 59.3%)
Ask NHS	12 / 16	75.0% (50.5 - 89.8%)	136.3	(126.7 - 145.9)	22.1	(21.3 - 22.9)	-	-	-	-	-	-	4 / 12	33.3% (15.9 - 58.8%)	12 / 12	100% (75.8 - 100%)	8 / 12	66.7% (35.5 - 89.8%)
Babylon	15 / 16	93.8% (71.7 - 98.9%)	105.5	(91.9 - 119.20)	18.5	(15.8 - 21.1)	-	-	-	-	-	-	4 / 15	26.7% (13.4 - 49.5%)	15 / 15	100% (79.6 - 100%)	11 / 15	73.3% (42.5 - 94.6%)
Bouy Health	15 / 16	93.8% (71.7 - 98.9%)	165.7	(153.9 - 177.4)	36.1	(34.4 - 37.7)	10 / 15	66.7% (37.3 - 89.3%)	11 / 15	73.3% (44.3 - 92.8%)	11 / 15	73.3% (45.2 - 92.0%)	8 / 15	53.3% (29.3 - 76.0%)	15 / 15	100% (79.6 - 100%)	7 / 15	46.7% (25.7 - 69.0%)
Caidr	13 / 16	81.3% (57.0 - 93.4%)	34.4	(26.1 - 42.7)	10.9	(7.7 - 14.1)	9 / 13	69.2% (37.0 - 92.7%)	9 / 13	69.2% (39.8 - 89.9%)	9 / 13	69.2% (40.7 - 89.0%)	10 / 13	76.9% (42.1 - 99.4%)	13 / 13	100% (77.2 - 100%)	3 / 13	23.1% (11.2 - 47.3%)
Doctorlink	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	106.3	(87.2 - 125.3)	26.0	(21.5 - 30.5)	13 / 16	81.3% (47.5 - 100%)	15 / 16	93.8% (59.0 - 100%)	15 / 16	93.8% (60.0 - 100%)	14 / 16	87.5% (52.2 - 100%)	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	2 / 16	12.5% (6.1 - 33.5%)
Informatica	11 / 16	68.8% (44.4 - 85.8%)	108.2	(92.5 - 123.8)	28.3	(26.3 - 30.2)	8 / 11	72.7% (36.8 - 96.9%)	10 / 11	90.9% (50.7 - 100%)	10 / 11	90.9% (51.7 - 100%)	2 / 11	18.2% (7.8 - 45.0%)	11 / 11	100% (74.1 - 100%)	9 / 11	81.8% (43.2 - 100%)
Isabel	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	35.1	(27.3 - 42.9)	7.7	(7.0 - 8.4)	4 / 16	25.0% (12.5 - 47.2%)	11 / 16	68.8% (42.1 - 88.2%)	13 / 16	81.3% (51.4 - 99.0%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Mediktor	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	100.5	(91.7 - 109.3)	16.1	(14.9 - 17.4)	11 / 16	68.8% (39.4 - 90.8%)	14 / 16	87.5% (54.8 - 100%)	14 / 16	87.5% (55.7 - 100%)	2 / 16	12.5% (5.9 - 33.7%)	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	14 / 16	87.5% (52.8 - 100%)
NHS 111	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	109.4	(101.0 - 117.7)	22.4	(20.3 - 24.6)	-	-	-	-	-	-	9 / 16	56.3% (31.8 - 78.3%)	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	7 / 16	43.8% (24.4 - 65.5%)
Web.MD	16 / 16	100% (80.6 - 100%)	63.4	(50.1 - 76.7)	9.8	(8.5 - 19.8)	7 / 16	43.8% (23.6 - 66.3%)	12 / 16	75.0% (46.3 - 94.0%)	16 / 16	100% (64.3 - 100%)	-	-	-	-	-	-
Your.MD	11 / 16	68.8% (44.4 - 85.8%)	150.8	(129.4 - 172.3)	18.4	(17.0 - 19.8)	5 / 11	45.5% (21.6 - 71.7%)	6 / 11	54.5% (29.0 - 77.7%)	6 / 11	54.5% (29.8 - 77.0%)	6 / 11	54.5% (26.9 - 79.9%)	11 / 11	100% (74.1 - 100%)	6 / 11	54.5% (27.4 - 79.3%)
All Self Care	173 / 192	89.6% (85.0 - 93.7%)	107.0	(100.0 - 113.9)	21.5	(19.9 - 23.0)	81 / 173	47.1% (39.6 - 54.2%)	102 / 173	59.3% (51.5 - 66.0%)	108 / 173	62.8% (55.0 - 69.3%)	69 / 141	48.9% (40.8 - 57.1%)	141 / 141	100% (97.3 - 100%)	73 / 141	51.8% (43.6 - 59.9%)