

# Estimating number of global importations of COVID-19 from Wuhan, risk of transmission outside mainland China and COVID-19 introduction index between countries outside mainland China

Haoyang Sun (B.Sc.)<sup>1,§</sup>, Borame L Dickens (Ph.D.)<sup>1</sup>, Mark I. C. Chen (Ph.D.)<sup>1,2</sup>, Alex R Cook (Ph.D.)<sup>1,§</sup>, Hannah E Clapham (Ph.D.)<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Saw Swee Hock School of Public Health, National University of Singapore, 12 Science Drive 2, Singapore 117549, Republic of Singapore

<sup>2</sup>National Centre for Infectious Diseases, 16 Jln Tan Tock Seng, Singapore 308442, Republic of Singapore

<sup>§</sup>Correspondence to:

Haoyang Sun. Saw Swee Hock School of Public Health, National University of Singapore, 12 Science Drive 2, Singapore 117549, Republic of Singapore. Email: [ephsunh@nus.edu.sg](mailto:ephsunh@nus.edu.sg).

Alex R Cook. Saw Swee Hock School of Public Health, National University of Singapore, 12 Science Drive 2, Singapore 117549, Republic of Singapore. Email: [ephcar@nus.edu.sg](mailto:ephcar@nus.edu.sg).

## Supporting Information

## Justification of the Poisson model specification

For each country or territory outside of mainland China  $i$ , we denote the daily number of air passengers that travelled from Wuhan to country  $i$  by  $n_t^{(i)}$  ( $t = 1, \dots, T$ ), where  $t = 1$  refers to the first day of the COVID-19 outbreak in Wuhan and  $t = T$  refers to the date of Wuhan lockdown. Each day the probability that an air passenger travelling from Wuhan to country  $i$  was infected is denoted by  $p_t$ , which we assume to be time-varying but independent from the destination country  $i$ . Hence, the total number of COVID-19 cases imported from Wuhan to country  $i$  ( $M_i$ ) can be expressed as the sum of  $T$  independent Binomial random variables:

$$Bin(n_1^{(i)}, p_1) + Bin(n_2^{(i)}, p_2) + \dots + Bin(n_T^{(i)}, p_T)$$

Given that in most cases the number of travelers is reasonably large, the random variable  $M_i$  can be approximated using a Poisson distribution:

$$M_i \sim Po\left(\sum_{t=1}^T n_t^{(i)} p_t\right)$$

Since for any pair of countries  $i$  and  $j$ , the ratio between the daily number of air travelers from Wuhan ( $n_t^{(i)}/n_t^{(j)}$ ) is presumed to be relatively stable with respect to time  $t$ , we used the ratio between the January's air passenger volumes for the two countries ( $v_{WH \rightarrow i, Jan}$  and  $v_{WH \rightarrow j, Jan}$ ) to approximate the ratio between the two Poisson rate parameters ( $\sum_{t=1}^T n_t^{(i)} p_t$  and  $\sum_{t=1}^T n_t^{(j)} p_t$ ). Hence, the random variable  $M_i$  follows a Poisson distribution with rate parameter  $\lambda_0 \cdot v_{WH \rightarrow i, Jan}$ , with an unknown coefficient  $\lambda_0$  to be estimated from data:

$$M_i \sim Po(\lambda_0 \cdot v_{WH \rightarrow i, Jan})$$

**Table S1: Reported & estimated number of COVID-19 cases imported from Wuhan, and the left-tailed P-value for each country (or territory) outside of mainland China.** Countries with zero travelers from Wuhan during the study period (approximated using the 2017 January flight data) were excluded.

Countries or territories	Reported number of COVID-19 cases imported from Wuhan	Estimated number of COVID-19 cases imported from Wuhan	P-value
Algeria	0	0 (0-1)	0.8448
Argentina	0	0 (0-1)	0.9392
Armenia	0	0 (0-0)	0.9952
Australia	13	19 (10-30)	0.1483
Austria	0	0 (0-1)	0.8207
Azerbaijan	0	0 (0-1)	0.9668
Bahrain	0	0 (0-1)	0.9714
Bangladesh	0	1 (0-3)	0.4898
Belarus	0	0 (0-1)	0.9080
Belgium (*)	1	0 (0-1)	0.9800
Benin	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
Bolivia	0	0 (0-0)	0.9761
Botswana	0	0 (0-1)	0.9168
Brazil	0	0 (0-1)	0.9257
Brunei Darussalam	0	0 (0-1)	0.8695
Bulgaria	0	0 (0-1)	0.9575
Burundi	0	0 (0-0)	0.9856
Cambodia	1	9 (3-16)	0.0027
Cameroon	0	0 (0-0)	0.9856
Canada	2	6 (2-13)	0.0468
Canarias	0	0 (0-0)	0.9952
Chad	0	0 (0-1)	0.9714
Chile	0	0 (0-0)	0.9761
Colombia	0	0 (0-1)	0.9668
Costa Rica	0	0 (0-1)	0.9575
Croatia	0	0 (0-0)	0.9952
Czech Republic	0	0 (0-1)	0.8488
Denmark	0	0 (0-2)	0.7141
Djibouti	0	0 (0-0)	0.9952
Dominican Republic	0	0 (0-0)	0.9809
Ecuador	0	0 (0-1)	0.9529
Egypt	0	0 (0-1)	0.9668
Equatorial Guinea	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
Ethiopia	0	0 (0-1)	0.9392
Fiji	0	0 (0-1)	0.8779
Finland (*)	1	0 (0-1)	0.9877
France (*)	5	7 (2-13)	0.3502
Gabon	0	0 (0-1)	0.9575
Georgia	0	0 (0-1)	0.9575
Germany	2	4 (1-9)	0.1855
Greece	0	0 (0-1)	0.9212

Countries or territories	Reported number of COVID-19 cases imported from Wuhan	Estimated number of COVID-19 cases imported from Wuhan	P-value
Guam	0	0 (0-1)	0.8822
Hong Kong, China	12	38 (23-57)	<0.0001
Hungary	0	0 (0-1)	0.8448
Iceland	0	0 (0-1)	0.9080
India (*)	3	3 (0-7)	0.6006
Indonesia	0	19 (10-30)	<0.0001
Iran	0	0 (0-2)	0.5898
Iraq	0	0 (0-1)	0.9621
Ireland	0	0 (0-1)	0.9124
Israel	0	0 (0-2)	0.6646
Italy	2	3 (0-7)	0.4205
Japan	18	49 (31-72)	0.0001
Jordan	0	0 (0-1)	0.9347
Kazakhstan	0	0 (0-3)	0.5286
Kenya	0	0 (0-2)	0.7384
Kuwait	0	0 (0-1)	0.8737
Kyrgyzstan	0	0 (0-1)	0.9714
Laos	0	1 (0-3)	0.4852
Latvia	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
Lebanon	0	0 (0-1)	0.9392
Lesotho	0	0 (0-0)	0.9952
Luxembourg	0	0 (0-0)	0.9856
Macao, China	6	18 (9-29)	0.0035
Malawi	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
Malaysia	5	27 (15-41)	<0.0001
Maldives	0	1 (0-3)	0.4229
Mauritius	0	0 (0-1)	0.9668
Mexico	0	0 (0-2)	0.7860
Moldova	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
Mongolia	0	0 (0-1)	0.9347
Morocco	0	0 (0-1)	0.7974
Mozambique	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
Myanmar	0	1 (0-5)	0.2110
Namibia	0	0 (0-1)	0.9714
Nepal (*)	1	0 (0-3)	0.8499
Netherlands	0	1 (0-3)	0.3740
New Zealand	0	3 (0-7)	0.0505
North Korea	0	0 (0-0)	0.9952
Northern Mariana Islands	0	0 (0-1)	0.9668
Norway	0	0 (0-1)	0.9080
Oman	0	0 (0-0)	0.9856
Pakistan	0	2 (0-5)	0.1597
Palau	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
Panama	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
Papua New Guinea	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904

Countries or territories	Reported number of COVID-19 cases imported from Wuhan	Estimated number of COVID-19 cases imported from Wuhan	P-value
Peru	0	0 (0-0)	0.9761
Philippines	2	5 (1-11)	0.0989
Poland	0	0 (0-1)	0.8529
Portugal	0	0 (0-1)	0.8950
Puerto Rico	0	0 (0-0)	0.9856
Qatar	0	0 (0-1)	0.9437
Romania	0	0 (0-1)	0.8488
Russian Federation (*)	2	2 (0-6)	0.6285
Saudi Arabia	0	0 (0-2)	0.7637
Senegal	0	0 (0-0)	0.9856
Serbia	0	0 (0-1)	0.9483
Singapore (*)	22	22 (12-35)	0.5235
Sint Maarten	0	0 (0-0)	0.9856
Somalia	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
South Africa	0	1 (0-3)	0.4922
South Korea	12	35 (21-53)	0.0002
Spain	0	1 (0-3)	0.4091
Sri Lanka (*)	1	1 (0-4)	0.7113
Sweden (*)	1	0 (0-2)	0.8886
Switzerland	0	0 (0-2)	0.5596
Taiwan, China	10	41 (25-61)	<0.0001
Tajikistan	0	0 (0-1)	0.9212
Tanzania	0	0 (0-0)	0.9856
Thailand	20	97 (66-136)	<0.0001
Togo	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
Turkey	0	0 (0-1)	0.8247
Turkmenistan	0	0 (0-0)	0.9952
Ukraine	0	0 (0-0)	0.9904
United Arab Emirates (*)	5	5 (1-11)	0.5093
United Kingdom	2	7 (2-14)	0.0284
United States	9	29 (17-44)	0.0003
Uzbekistan	0	0 (0-1)	0.8993
Venezuela	0	0 (0-0)	0.9952
Vietnam	7	17 (9-28)	0.0110
Zambia	0	0 (0-1)	0.9347
Zimbabwe	0	0 (0-1)	0.8993

(\*) These 10 countries had the highest ratios between the reported number of cases imported from Wuhan and the volumes of passengers from Wuhan. We had assumed perfect COVID-19 case detection and reporting for these 10 countries, to generate a conservative (point and interval) estimate of the imported case count for the rest of the countries. However, for the purpose of assessing the local outbreak risk in the subsequent analyses, we still generated an uncertainty distribution of the imported case count for each of these 10 countries using the Poisson model, so that the local outbreak risk estimate in our main scenario remains non-zero. Given that in reality case detection and reporting rates can never achieve 100%, our approach is still conservative.

**Table S2: Estimated probability that local outbreak would occur and sustain for  $\geq 3$  generations following viral importation from Wuhan, under the main analysis (i.e. immediate isolation of all the *reported* cases imported from Wuhan) and the “95% isolation of all the imported cases from Wuhan” scenario separately. Countries with zero travelers from Wuhan during the study period (approximated using the 2017 January flight data) were excluded.**

Countries or territories	Local outbreak risk (Main analysis)	Local outbreak risk (95% isolation)
Algeria	0.0349	0.0018
Argentina	0.0131	0.0007
Armenia	0.0010	<0.0001
Australia	0.6864	0.1797
Austria	0.0408	0.0021
Azerbaijan	0.0071	0.0004
Bahrain	0.0061	0.0003
Bangladesh	0.1402	0.0075
Belarus	0.0201	0.0010
Belgium (*)	0.0233	0.0022
Benin	0.0020	0.0001
Bolivia	0.0051	0.0003
Botswana	0.0181	0.0009
Brazil	0.0161	0.0008
Brunei Darussalam	0.0290	0.0015
Bulgaria	0.0091	0.0005
Burundi	0.0030	0.0002
Cambodia	0.7941	0.0884
Cameroon	0.0030	0.0002
Canada	0.6130	0.0682
Canarias	0.0010	<0.0001
Chad	0.0061	0.0003
Chile	0.0051	0.0003
Colombia	0.0071	0.0004
Costa Rica	0.0091	0.0005
Croatia	0.0010	<0.0001
Czech Republic	0.0339	0.0017
Denmark	0.0686	0.0035
Djibouti	0.0010	<0.0001
Dominican Republic	0.0041	0.0002
Ecuador	0.0101	0.0005
Egypt	0.0071	0.0004
Equatorial Guinea	0.0020	0.0001
Ethiopia	0.0131	0.0007
Fiji	0.0270	0.0014
Finland (*)	0.0179	0.0017
France (*)	0.4073	0.0685
Gabon	0.0091	0.0005
Georgia	0.0091	0.0005
Germany	0.4263	0.0464
Greece	0.0171	0.0009

Countries or territories	Local outbreak risk (Main analysis)	Local outbreak risk (95% isolation)
Guam	0.0261	0.0013
Hong Kong, China	0.9904	0.3337
Hungary	0.0349	0.0018
Iceland	0.0201	0.0010
India (*)	0.2353	0.0332
Indonesia	0.9780	0.1804
Iran	0.1056	0.0056
Iraq	0.0081	0.0004
Ireland	0.0191	0.0010
Israel	0.0826	0.0043
Italy	0.2795	0.0315
Japan	0.9942	0.4060
Jordan	0.0141	0.0007
Kazakhstan	0.1262	0.0067
Kenya	0.0619	0.0032
Kuwait	0.0280	0.0014
Kyrgyzstan	0.0061	0.0003
Laos	0.1420	0.0076
Latvia	0.0020	0.0001
Lebanon	0.0131	0.0007
Lesotho	0.0010	<0.0001
Luxembourg	0.0030	0.0002
Macao, China	0.8972	0.1742
Malawi	0.0020	0.0001
Malaysia	0.9845	0.2471
Maldives	0.1668	0.0091
Mauritius	0.0071	0.0004
Mexico	0.0495	0.0025
Moldova	0.0020	0.0001
Mongolia	0.0141	0.0007
Morocco	0.0466	0.0024
Mozambique	0.0020	0.0001
Myanmar	0.2824	0.0165
Namibia	0.0061	0.0003
Nepal (*)	0.0772	0.0071
Netherlands	0.1884	0.0104
New Zealand	0.4755	0.0320
North Korea	0.0010	<0.0001
Northern Mariana Islands	0.0071	0.0004
Norway	0.0201	0.0010
Oman	0.0030	0.0002
Pakistan	0.3245	0.0195
Palau	0.0020	0.0001
Panama	0.0020	0.0001
Papua New Guinea	0.0020	0.0001
Peru	0.0051	0.0003

Countries or territories	Local outbreak risk (Main analysis)	Local outbreak risk (95% isolation)
Philippines	0.5200	0.0566
Poland	0.0330	0.0017
Portugal	0.0231	0.0012
Puerto Rico	0.0030	0.0002
Qatar	0.0121	0.0006
Romania	0.0339	0.0017
Russian Federation (*)	0.1922	0.0227
Saudi Arabia	0.0553	0.0028
Senegal	0.0030	0.0002
Serbia	0.0111	0.0006
Singapore (*)	0.5414	0.2102
Sint Maarten	0.0030	0.0002
Somalia	0.0020	0.0001
South Africa	0.1394	0.0075
South Korea	0.9837	0.3126
Spain	0.1727	0.0095
Sri Lanka (*)	0.1235	0.0112
Sweden (*)	0.0636	0.0059
Switzerland	0.1155	0.0061
Taiwan, China	0.9964	0.3541
Tajikistan	0.0171	0.0009
Tanzania	0.0030	0.0002
Thailand	1.0000	0.6392
Togo	0.0020	0.0001
Turkey	0.0398	0.0020
Turkmenistan	0.0010	<0.0001
Ukraine	0.0020	0.0001
United Arab Emirates (*)	0.3267	0.0577
United Kingdom	0.6653	0.0756
United States	0.9749	0.2662
Uzbekistan	0.0221	0.0011
Venezuela	0.0010	<0.0001
Vietnam	0.8542	0.1679
Zambia	0.0141	0.0007
Zimbabwe	0.0221	0.0011

(\*) These 10 countries had the highest ratios between the reported number of cases imported from Wuhan and the volumes of passengers from Wuhan. We had previously assumed perfect COVID-19 case detection and reporting for these 10 countries, to generate a conservative (point and interval) estimate of the imported case count for the rest of the countries. However, to assess the local outbreak risk, we still generated an uncertainty distribution of the imported case count for each of these 10 countries using the Poisson model, so that the local outbreak risk estimate in our main scenario remains non-zero. Given that in reality case detection and reporting rates can never achieve 100%, our local outbreak risk estimates are still conservative under both scenarios.



**Table S3: (A) COVID-19 introduction index estimates for all pairs of donor-recipient countries, together with (B) the sum of COVID-19 introduction index estimates over all the donor countries for each recipient country.** Donor countries refer to countries or territories with a local outbreak risk exceeding 50% in our main analysis. Probability of travel from donor to recipient was calculated by dividing the corresponding air passenger volume in February by the population size of the donor country.

(Refer to Table S3.xlsx in the attachment)