How To Enhance Empathy Nursing Students In Education: Literature Review

Bhakti Permana1,2, Moses Glorino Rumambo Pandin3
1 Doctoral Program of Nursing, Faculty of Nursing, Airlangga University
2 STIKep PPNI Jawa Barat
3 Department of English Literature, Faculty of Humanity, Airlangga University

Corresponding author: Bhakti Permana
Email: bhakti.permana-2021@fkp.unair.ac.id

Abstract

Introduction. The tendency of reducing student empathy requires efforts to improve it through education or training. The purpose of this review is to identify education, learning, or teaching that is used to increase student empathy.

Method. The design used a Literature Systematic Review. Articles were conducted in three electronic databases guided by The PRISMA. Articles published in English and in 2019 to 2021.

Results. The result obtained 20 articles and will be reviewed. Eighteen articles show an effect or relationship between intervention and empathy. Training materials that can increase student empathy are the concept of empathy, communication, mindfulness, and transcultural nursing education. Education and training using patients/patient simulations to help improve student empathy, namely: expert patients, ECARE Program, polypharmacy effects; clinical Simulation of Inpatients, Lectures in class, Virtual Dementia Tour, living in poverty, and games for team interaction. Another method is through the KSS module, mannequin simulator experience, and peers.

Conclusion. Education and training on the concepts of empathy, communication, meditation, and cultural competence using Simulation and immersion methods with patients, being like patients, using mannequins, or interacting with vulnerable groups can increase student empathy. Faculty and lecturers can apply experiential learning methods with Simulation and immersion in learning or training courses.

Keywords: empathy, student, nursing, learning, education

1. Introduction

Nursing students are often involved in nursing services for patients when conducting the clinical nursing practice in hospital. Students may not be ready to care and have negative behaviors from patients like being afraid, incapable, helpless, anxious, sad, low self-esteem, unable to manage their emotions, and maintaining patient space (Kapucu & Bulut, 2018; Lin et al., 2017). Feeling under pressure, failing to use therapeutic communication skills, a lack of courage, eastern
cultural influences, and emotional management experience are all aspects that affect nursing students' views (Lin et al., 2017). Empathy problems, together with negative attitudes and stigma, are an issue for health care improvement (McKenna et al., 2012).

Empathy is the process of placing oneself in another person's shoes, viewing events from a different perspective, understanding and feeling that others' emotions and ideas, and explaining this condition to him (Cunico et al., 2012; Paola Ferri et al., 2017). The dimensions of empathy are cognitive, emotional, and behavioral. The emotional dimension shows potential for empathy. The cognitive and behavioural dimensions are the ability to empathize.

Empathy in health services is an essential component of a quality therapeutic and nursing relationship (Hojat, 2016). Empathy for a health professional will reduce depression, anxiety, distress; and increase emotional well-being, satisfaction, and adherence to treatment regimens (Hojat & Hojat, 2016) and can be used to carry out patient-centered care and interactions (Omid et al., 2018). Therefore, high empathy is essential for the professional development of students in preparing for the medical profession (Sapiro et al., 2004).

Several studies have shown that students' empathy levels can decrease during nursing education (Ward et al., 2012), the average medical profession student is lower than non-medical students, and 18.2% of all medical program students (n = 412) showed the lowest level of empathy (Sobczak et al., 2021). It requires programs to implement educational interventions to increase students' empathy levels.

The importance of empathic skills and the tendency to decrease empathy for students requires a nursing education process to develop empathy skills. Training in communication skills, experiential learning, and medical interprofessional education interventions, and simulation-based education, are all effective techniques for increasing students' empathy levels (Batt-Rawden et al., 2013; Bearman et al., 2015). For this reason, it is necessary to explore the latest developments in empathy education interventions to increase nursing students' empathy.

2. Review Methods
2.1 Study Objectives

The goal of this review is to identify the education, learning, or teaching that is used to increase the empathy of nursing students.

2.2 Eligibility Criteria

The type of research used is experimental design, quasi-experimental and mixed methods with quasi-experiments published in English between January 2019 to 2021. The type of the participant is nursing students regardless of gender, age, or country. The type of intervention chosen is an educational intervention designed to increase the level of empathy of nursing students. The type of outcome measure is quantitative data that is objectively measured or self-reported about empathy.

2.3 Search Strategy
Search articles or journals using keywords. The keywords used are "Nursing student" OR "Nurse student" AND Education OR Training OR Learning AND Empathy. The literature search used three databases, namely Scopus, Scien Direct, and Sage journals. In addition to searching for articles using keywords, the characteristics of the journal are also determined, namely publications in 2019 and above, full text, and English.

2.4 Study Selection

The identified articles are entered into the Mendeley database, and then duplicate titles are identified and deleted. Potential articles will be screened by title and abstract based on inclusion criteria.

2.5 Critical Appraisal

Articles that have met the criteria will then be assessed for quality using the standard assessment format from the JBI Critical Appraisal checklist and MMAT. The selection of the assessment format is based on the design of each quasi-experiment article using the JBI Critical Appraisal Checklist for Quasi-Experimental Studies and Mixmethod using the Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool (MMAT). Critical appraisal assesses eligible studies if the research score is at least 60% of the cut-off point value. Screening results showed that 20 articles achieved a score higher than 60%.

2.6 Data Collection Process

Articles that meet the criteria and study quality will be tabulated using a table of researchers and year of publication, objectives, design, sample, variables, instruments, analysis, intervention, and results (Table 1).

3. Results

3.1 Study Selection

Searching for articles through the database found 739 articles. After going through the selection process, 20 articles were obtained that would be reviewed (figure 1).
3.2 Characteristics of Included Studies

The selected articles were published in 2019-2021, as many as four in 2019, 11 in 2020, and 5 in 2021. The research was carried out in 12 countries, namely four articles in the USA, three articles each in China, and Turkey, two articles in Spain, and one each from Malaysia, Ghana, Palestine, UK, Italy, Brazil, Singapore, and South Korea. The designs used in the research articles were a quasi-experiment with 13 articles, randomized control trial with six articles, and a mixed-method (with quasi-experiment) with 1 article. Based on the distribution of respondents, they were divided into one group of 5 articles and two groups of 15 articles. The measurement of respondents has measured post-test as many as two articles and pre-post test as many as 18 articles.

3.3 Participant Characteristics

The sampling method used convenience sampling of as many as 13 articles and random sampling as five and RCT 2 articles. The smallest sample size is 34 respondents, and the most significant sample is 250 respondents.
3.4 Types of Outcome Measures

The instruments to measure the empathy of nursing students used were: Jefferson's Scale of Empathy with five articles, JSE HPS version with six articles, Kiersmae Chen Empathy Scale with two articles, Empathic Tendency Scale (ETS) with 1 article, Empathy Inventory with 1 article, Empathic skill scale-B form (ESS-B) with 1 article, Interpersonal Reactivity Index (IRI) with two articles, The Comprehensive State Empathy Scale (CSES) with 1 article, and Toronto Empathy Questionnaire (TEQ) with 1 article.

3.5 Empathy Outcomes

Research shows that education and training can increase student empathy in several ways.

Subject

Training materials that can increase student empathy are:
1. The concept of empathy through training for 8 hours where every week for 2 hours (Ahmad et al., 2020)
2. Interpersonal Communication Skills, given for 14 hours where every week for 2 hours (Bas-Sarmiento et al., 2019)
3. Mindfulness-based empathy training (MBET) teaches about Aging, communication, empathy, mindfulness, body screening meditation, acceptance and allow, awareness of the judiciary, and Effective/empathic/active listening. Training given for 16 sessions, every week carried out for two sessions (Can Gür & Yılmaz, 2020)
4. Empathy Educational Model (EEM) contains primary material of empathy, emotion and language skills, nonlinguistic skills, and practicing empathy, given for 12 hours every week 2-3 times (Yang et al., 2020)
5. Transcultural nursing education held with subject health, nursing, culture, transcultural nursing, cultural sensitivity, and nursing research, for seven weeks (Kaçan & Örsal, 2020)
6. A re-unification educational program containing a model of cultural competence, given for 1 hour 6 weeks (Kim et al., 2020)

Patient

Education and training using patients/patient simulations to help increase student empathy, namely:
1. Expert patients shared stories when illness, the experience of nursing care. This program was held for one day (7 hours) (P Ferri et al., 2019)
2. The Empathetic CAre and Response program (ECARE) use restrained like patients in the healthcare setting, 1-hour lecture (Goh et al., 2020)
3. Polypharmacy effects used seven medications with jelly beans, managed multidrug and multidose regime for seven days (Kaulback et al., 2021)
4. Clinical Simulation like Hospitalized Patient used disposable diapers in the elimination needs (Filho et al., 2020)
5. Dementia LiveVR is a simulation experience to immerse life with dementia for seven minutes (Kimzey et al., 2020)
6. Virtual Dementia Tour, participants wore three small balls, a pair of blurred goggles, and large gloves, with the thumb and forefinger of the dominant hand taped together, as well as the last three fingers of the non-dominant hand, and the VDT room was poorly light and decorated (Peng et al., 2020).

7. Games to promote team interactions in the clinical setting for 6-8 weeks every 2.5 hours (Zelenski et al., 2020).

8. The KSS module is done for nursing students who practice in the pediatric room. The components of KSS module are Knowledge, Simulation and Sharing. The internship includes lectures, simulation scenarios and a self-reflection. The module was delivered over five days during the nine-month internship (Ding et al., 2020).

   Education and training exercises using 1) mannequins through simulators' nave, integrating simulator experience with traditional didactic approach. The intervention is done in the laboratory for four weeks (Ayed et al., 2021); 2) Peer Tutoring, after the tutor describes the incident, the tutee must describe the issue (Gisbert & Rivas, 2021); and 3) Community; Participants are assigned to a poor family and must live in their order for a simulated month separated into four consecutive weeks (Phillips et al., 2020).

4. Discussion

   The results of this review illustrate that education and training are carried out to increase nursing students' empathy. Of the 20 articles, 18 articles showed that education or training could increase or there was a positive relationship with the level of empathy. The education and training are about the concept of empathy, Interpersonal Communication Skills, Mindfulness-based empathy training (MBET), transcultural nursing education, and cultural competence. The method uses patients/patient simulations, peers, and the community.

   Simulation methods with actual patients or like patients by humans or mannequins are proven and long-standing methods that effectively increase student empathy. The results of another review show that the most effective method is immersion and experiential Simulation in vulnerable groups and providing opportunities for reflection (T Levet-Jones et al., 2019). Simulation may be an appropriate educational methodology for developing empathy and empathy behavior (Bearman et al., 2015). A hospital simulation can provide an experience of dealing with illness and hospital life, feeling dependent and the need for contact, and dealing with being a patient. Other research shows that can increase empathetic behavior by listening to the patient’s voice as a consumer of health services (Heidke et al., 2018).

   Simulation of vulnerable groups in the community can increase student empathy. Social simulations with the poverty conditions of (Menzel et al., 2014) and persons with disabilities (Tracy Levet-Jones et al., 2017) can be helpful and used in learning. Simulations with mannequins can increase student empathy following the thesis and goals that NLN has made (Haley et al., 2017).

   Educational materials and lectures given to students to increase empathy are also reviewed, namely communication skills, interprofessional skills, and the concept of empathy (Batt-Rawden
et al., 2013), and cultural and linguistic differences through three-dimensional simulations (Everson et al., 2015).

Based on the material provided, the length of education or training carried out varied from 6 hours (Kim et al., 2020), 8 hours (Ahmad et al., 2020), 12 hours (Yang et al., 2020), and 14 hours (Bas-Sarmiento et al., 2019). Education and training time is carried out starting from 1 day (P Ferri et al., 2019), four weeks (Ayed et al., 2021), six weeks (Kim et al., 2020), seven weeks (Kaçan & Örsal, 2020), and eight weeks (Can Gür & Yılmaz, 2020; Zelenski et al., 2020). On average, each week face-to-face for 2 hours. The time determination is adjusted to the material discussed and according to the stages of the learning. It guides lecturers and faculties in planning education and training for nursing students.

Implications for education

The experiential learning method with patient simulation becomes like a patient, mannequin, and immersion in the community and helps increase student empathy. The experiential learning method with Simulation and immersion can be used as a learning method in nursing lectures or training.

5. Conclusion

Nursing students' empathy can be increased by improving cognitive, affective, and psychomotor aspects. Education and training can improve cognitive aspects by providing knowledge about empathy, communication, meditation, and cultural competence. Simulation and immersion with patients, being like patients, using mannequins, or interacting with vulnerable groups improve students' affective and psychomotor aspects.
References


## Table 1: Review the article

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Methods</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Wahab &amp; Seman</td>
<td>Design: quasi-experimental</td>
<td>Training educational intervention for eight hours didactic (2 h per week) about concept of empathy, and then presentation of short video and discussion.</td>
<td>The empathy increased during post-intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alhassan</td>
<td>Design: design in a randomised controlled trial (RCT)</td>
<td>Training in communication skills was conceived and developed utilizing the 'Four Habits Model' and PCNF. Small group discussions, brainstorming, participant experience, group reports, roleplaying, questions and answers, videos, and summaries were all used as methods.</td>
<td>The scores of empathy were no difference between the group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ayed et al.</td>
<td>Design: pretest-posttest design</td>
<td>For four weeks, the intervention included simulation scenarios and debriefing. Three simulation scenarios were downloaded from the National Library of Medicine's ACES website (<a href="http://www.nln.org/ACE">www.nln.org/ACE</a>). For twenty minutes, participants used a simulator in combination with a traditional didactic method. Based on students' verbal reflections in a separate room, a systematic debriefing procedure was applied.</td>
<td>The empathy difference between pre and post high fidelity simulation intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bas-Sarmiento et al.</td>
<td>Design: Multicentre randomised controlled trial.</td>
<td>Specific training in communication The university teaching personnel accomplished the training with specific communication training. The intervention included two 2-hour weekly meetings for a total of seven sessions (14 h).</td>
<td>The empathy were improved after the intervention.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can Gür &amp; Yilmaz</td>
<td>Design: randomized controlled trial (RCT)</td>
<td>Eight weeks of mindfulness-based empathy training (MBET) are held twice a week. The training program included a total of sixteen sessions. Pedagogical expression, role-playing, model learning, and homework were all incorporated in the training. Mindfulness breathing, body screening, meditation, cognitive awareness, and dried grape meditation were all formal practices taught in class and at home.</td>
<td>The empathy level reported increase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yang et al.</td>
<td>Design: quasi-experimental, with Nine dimensions composed an</td>
<td>The empathy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>Intervention</td>
<td>Result</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>two-group comparison</td>
<td>Sample: 118 nursing students</td>
<td>Empathy Educational Model (EEM). Classroom-based instruction was provided during a two-week, 12-hour structured empathy education program (two 3-hour sessions per week). Didactics, video demonstrations, situational teaching, problem-based learning (PBL), and task-based learning were used as instructional methodologies.</td>
<td>Empathy competence was higher after intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dincer &amp; Inangil</td>
<td>Design: randomized controlled trial study</td>
<td>The intervention group used a technique referred to as transformative learning. The transformative process is designed to help an individual transform his or her beliefs, assumptions, and experiences into new and more relevant perspectives. In education, transformative learning approaches should include four separate activities: investigative, collaborative, higher-order thinking, and interactive.</td>
<td>The empathy were no significant difference after the intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ferri et.al.</td>
<td>Design: randomized controlled trial study</td>
<td>The educational intervention began with a 1.5-hour theoretical session on empathy, followed by a presentation by another teacher (1.5 hrs). Following that, the two expert patients served as trainers, sharing their disease stories, as well as their positive and negative experiences with nursing care. Finally, the nursing instructor led a debriefing session to allow students to reflect on their educational experience (1 hour).</td>
<td>The empathy were significant difference in the experimental group. Male students showed increased in empathy after training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filho et.al.</td>
<td>Design: quasi-experimental study</td>
<td>Clinical of patient simulation made use of the scenario's hospital structure, and the mediators' learning objectives contributed to the defined level of fidelity. Five assessing nurses evaluated the design both visually and conceptually.</td>
<td>The cognitive components of empathy will promote after intervention of the simulated clinical activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gisbert &amp; Rivas</td>
<td>Design: a mixed methods sequential explanatory design</td>
<td>The program consists of six one-hour peer tutoring sessions held twice a week. Two distinct dossiers are distributed to the students (one for student A and one for student B). While the tutor describes the event, the tutee listens and, if necessary, asks</td>
<td>The empathy revealed improvements in intervention group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>Intervention</td>
<td>Result</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goh et al.</td>
<td>quasi-experimental design</td>
<td>Design: The Empathetic CAre and REsponse program (ECARE) emphasized the importance of an empathic response to restraint use. A classroom-based session utilizing video-assisted learning and restrained patients is followed by a facilitator-led debriefing session to address any concerns and potential psychological impact on the students.</td>
<td>The level of empathy increases after attending ECARE.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaçan &amp; Örsal</td>
<td>Design: quasi-experimental</td>
<td>Design: The TN course was held for seven weeks with the theoretical basis namely: “health and culture”, “nursing and culture”, “transcultural nursing and historical development”, “basic concepts in transcultural nursing”, “transcultural nursing models”, “ethics in transcultural nursing” and “culturally adequate and cultural sensitivity approach to nursing research”, “the transcultural approach to reproductive health, the transcultural approach in the prenatal and postnatal period, in child care and diseases, in chronic diseases and care, in psychiatric diseases and care and the cultural approach in pain”.</td>
<td>The experiment group demonstrated greater empathy than the control group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaulback, Barker &amp; Yocom</td>
<td>Design: a quasi-experimental, pretest-posttest design</td>
<td>The intervention was given a prescription that included seven medications with jelly beans and was instructed to take the medications exactly as prescribed.</td>
<td>The empathy demonstrated a higher post intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kim, Noh, &amp; Park</td>
<td>Design: an experimental study</td>
<td>The intervention was a re-unification educational program based on a model of cultural competence. The subject session focused on the backgrounds other cultures, health, inequality, and education for North Koreans and defectors, cultural sensitivity, re-unification based on empathy and multicultural competence. There was one 60-minute session per week.</td>
<td>The Empathy increased in the experimental group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kimzey</td>
<td>Design: one group quasi-</td>
<td>The intervention was led by a the empathy indicated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Instrumen: Jefferson Scale of Empathy

Sample: 249 nursing and 50 medical students

Variable: empathy and confidence

Instrumen: JSE

The intervention is required to explain the scenario as though it were their own.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Methods</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Patterson &amp; Mastel-Smith</td>
<td>experimental, Mixed methods research</td>
<td>qualified facilitator and focused on Dementia LiveVR, a seven-minute dementia simulation experience. The students wore glasses with customized lenses and wore headphones that covered their plastic gloves. Other pupils were instructed verbally to complete five straightforward tasks. The facilitator then led a systematic debriefing at the conclusion of the session.</td>
<td>in quantitative findings and qualitative findings showed six components of empathy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peng et al.</td>
<td>Design: quasi-experiment</td>
<td>Modified VDT used a pair of dried corn kernels and a needle to simulate foot pain in shoes. The participant wore a pair of blurred goggles and large gloves, thumb and forefinger were taped. Five tasks were assigned to the participants: putting yellow socks, folding towels, brushing teeth, writing a three-sentence memo or sketching a basic picture, and picking up three little balls.</td>
<td>Their empathy levels demonstrated improvements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phillips et al.</td>
<td>Design: quasy experiment</td>
<td>The simulation was six hours, including an orientation session and a three-hour simulation. Every session used a 15-minute debriefing weekly. The participant was assigned a role in the community that lives in poverty. Participants live in real time for 15 minutes and then participate in a community debriefing session for 30 minutes. The entire simulated event lasted approximately three and a half hours.</td>
<td>The empathy increased after the intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yu et al.</td>
<td>Design: A randomized trial with three phases.</td>
<td>The WITS intervention is an immersive digital story told by a real-life colon cancer patient. The story was captured in audio format and is comprised of nine digital segments (some still images). To avoid congestion in the suite, students began the intervention in small groups of 5–6 at 10-minute intervals.</td>
<td>The empathy were higher in the intervention group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zelenski et al.</td>
<td>Design: a convergent mixed-methods design</td>
<td>Each 2.5-hour class session opened with a discussion of prescribed readings on relationship-centered care, spontaneity, curiosity, and explain, help, and plan.</td>
<td>Empathy was greatly enhanced on five CARE items: ease, care, explain, help, and plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>Intervention</td>
<td>Result</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Variable: interprofessional empathy</td>
<td>nonverbal communication. The instructor urged students to incorporate improv rules into their daily lives and led multiple improv games. At the conclusion of each lesson, students engaged in five minutes of freewriting about their recent experiences.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Instrument: Interpersonal Reactivity Index [IRI], Consultative and Relational Empathy [CARE] measure and a facial expression recognition task</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Design: quasi-experimental design</td>
<td>The KSS module is intended for nursing students pursuing clinical experience in paediatrics. The components of KSS module are Knowledge, Simulation, and Sharing. Lectures, simulation scenarios, and self-reflection are all included in the internship. The module was presented over a five-day period over the internship's nine months.</td>
<td>the empathy had significantly higher scores after the internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ding et al.</td>
<td>Sample: 250 nursing students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Variable: empathy skills, communication skills and professional identity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Instrument: Jefferson Scale of Empathy -Health Profession - Student, the Clinical Communication Competence Scale and the Professional Identity scale</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>