Proinflammatory Cytokine Levels in Sepsis and in Health and TNF α Association with Sepsis Mortality and patient characteristics: a Systematic Review and Meta-analysis

Amal A. Gharamti¹, Omar Samara², Anthony Monzon², Gabrielle Montalbano², Sias Scherger²,
Kristen DeSanto³, Daniel B. Chastain⁴, Stefan Sillau⁵, Jose G. Montoya⁶, Carlos Franco-
Paredes^{2,7}, Andrés F. Henao-Martínez², Leland Shapiro^{2,8}

¹Department of Internal Medicine, Yale University, Waterbury Hospital, Waterbury Connecticut, USA

²School of Medicine, Division of Infectious Diseases, University of Colorado Anschutz Medical Campus,
Aurora, CO, USA

³Strauss Health Sciences Library, University of Colorado Anschutz Medical Campus, Aurora, CO, USA

⁴Department of Clinical and Administrative Pharmacy, University of Georgia College of Pharmacy,
Albany, GA, USA

⁵Department of Neurology, University of Colorado Anschutz Medical Campus, Aurora, CO, USA

⁶Co-director, Dr. Jack S. Remington Laboratory for Specialty Diagnostics, Palo Alto, California

⁷Hospital Infantil de México, Federico Gómez, México City, México

⁸Rocky Mountain Regional Veterans Affairs Medical Center, Aurora CO, USA

*Corresponding author: Andrés F. Henao-Martínez, MD, University of Colorado Anschutz
Medical Campus. 12700 E. 19th Avenue, Mail Stop B168. Aurora, CO 80045, USA; Email:
andres.henaomartinez@cuanschutz.edu. Tel.: +1 (720)-848-0820; fax: +1 (720)-848-0191.

ORCID number: 0000-0001-7363-8652

Abstract:

Background: Sepsis is a global health problem associated with significant morbidity and mortality. Detrimental sepsis effects are attributed to a "cytokine storm." However, anti-cytokine therapies have failed to lower sepsis mortality. We aim to characterize levels of key cytokines in sepsis patients and healthy controls and relate TNF α levels to patient characteristics and outcomes.

Methods: We performed a systematic review and meta-analysis. Medline, Embase, Cochrane Library, and Web of Science Core Collection databases were searched from 1985 to May 2020 for studies in English. We included randomized controlled trials (RCTs), controlled trials, cohort studies, case series, and cross-sectional studies that reported mean levels of cytokines in the circulation thought to be relevant for sepsis pathogenesis. We also evaluated concentrations of these cytokines in healthy persons. Quality in Prognosis Studies tool was used to assess the methodological quality of included studies. We extracted summary data from published reports. Data analyses were performed using a random-effects model to estimate pooled odds ratios (OR) with 95% confidence intervals for cytokine levels and mortality. This systematic review is registered in PROSPERO (CRD42020179800).

Findings: We identified 3654 records, and 104 studies were included with a total of 3250 participants. The pooled estimated mean TNF α concentration in sepsis patients was 58.4 pg/ml (95% Confidence Interval or CI 39.8-85.8 pg/ml) and 5.5 pg/ml (95% CI 3.8-8.0 pg/ml) in healthy controls. Pooled estimate means for IL-1 β and IFN γ in sepsis patients were 21.8 pg/ml and 63.3 pg/ml, respectively. Elevated TNF α concentrations associated with increased 28-day sepsis mortality (p=0.001). In subgroup analyses, TNF α levels did not relate to sepsis source, sepsis severity, or sequential organ failure assessment (SOFA) score.

Interpretation: TNF α concentration in sepsis is increased approximately 10-fold compared to healthy persons, and TNF α associated with sepsis mortality but not with sepsis severity. The concept that elevated cytokines cause sepsis should be revisited in the context of these data.

Funding: None.

Keywords: Sepsis, Healthy Volunteers, Cytokine, Tumor Necrosis Factor-alpha, Interleukin-1 beta, Interferon-gamma, cytokine storm.

Introduction:

No concept is more commonly invoked as a cause of disease than hyper inflammation. The prototype disease thought to be caused by excessive inflammation is sepsis. In 2016, the Surviving Sepsis Campaign defined sepsis as "life-threatening organ dysfunction due to a dysregulated host response to infection" [1]. Infections that cause sepsis can be severe enough to cause organ malfunction or death. Annual worldwide estimates include 31.5 million sepsis cases, 19.4 million severe sepsis cases, and 5.3 million deaths [2]. An analysis of hospital mortality in United States hospitals showed that one-third to one-half of inpatient deaths were attributable to sepsis [3]. Sepsis also represents the most costly disease treated in US hospitals [4]. At present, no laboratory test defines sepsis, but three principal clinical sepsis definitions that have been created select similar patient populations[5-7]. As the theoretical cause of sepsis, hyper inflammation is initiated and sustained by excess proinflammatory endogenous molecules (especially cytokines), resulting in a cytokine storm [8]. Substantial research and clinical efforts have been expended to block the bioactivity of cytokines to treat sepsis. However, anti-cytokine therapies to lower sepsis mortality have uniformly failed in clinical trials [9-13].

Tumor necrosis factor (TNF) α , interleukin (IL)-1 β , and interferon (IFN) γ are considered relevant mediators of the "cytokine storm" in sepsis [14]. Anti-cytokine therapy failure could be due to inadequate blockade of these cytokines or failure of concept where cytokines are not the cause of sepsis. As a starting point, it is crucial to quantify cytokine levels in sepsis, which will help characterize cytokine role in sepsis pathogenesis.

It is striking that despite decades of research, hundreds of clinical trials, and billions of dollars expended to reduce hyper inflammation in sepsis, no systematic review or meta-analysis has provided firm estimates of circulating levels of relevant cytokines in sepsis. Moreover, no

analysis has characterized these cytokine levels in the circulation in healthy volunteers. Without these kinds of studies, we cannot understand the quantitative features of cytokine storm in sepsis, and we lack perspective needed to determine if cytokine elevations in sepsis are, in fact, extraordinary. Understanding levels of proinflammatory cytokines in sepsis will permit meaningful comparisons to levels in other diseases. Regarding cytokine levels in sepsis, one goal is to answer the question, "is that a lot?"

This systematic review aims to quantify key cytokine levels in the circulation in sepsis patients and in healthy volunteers and assess associations between these levels and outcomes and clinical characteristics.

Methods

Search Strategy and Selection Criteria

We performed a systematic review and meta-analysis of studies reporting key cytokine levels in sepsis patients and healthy controls. The systematic review considered randomized controlled trials (RCTs), controlled trials, cohort studies, case series, and cross-sectional studies that reported relevant cytokine levels in patient cohorts. We excluded case reports and studies reporting cytokine levels in medians. Only studies published in English were included. Selected studies reported cytokine measurements in venous blood, serum, or plasma and expressed levels in mass units per volume. Quantified data depicted only in graphical form were excluded. We included studies using enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (ELISA) or bead-based immunoassay technologies. We excluded studies using radioimmunoassay (RIA) -based assays or bioassays. ELISA provides accurate measurement of TNF α in serum, and RIA tends to overestimate TNF α amounts [15].

Enzyme-linked immunosorbent assays and bead-based immunoassays have shown comparable results for circulating cytokine concentrations[16]. We verified that studies included defined sepsis according to the diagnostic criteria proposed by the American College of Chest Physicians and the Society of Critical Care Medicine in 1992 as the presence of systemic inflammatory response syndrome and infection [17]. The 1992 definition was used since most studies reporting cytokine levels used the 1992 definition. The detailed methods and Medline search strategy are available (Supplement. eMethods). Additional details in the systematic review protocol were published (PROSPERO CRD42020179800)[18]. This study followed the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-analyses (PRISMA) reporting guideline to register the protocol, data collection and integrity, assessment of bias, and sensitivity analyses. A systematic search in Medline (via Ovid), Embase (via Elsevier), Cochrane Library (via Wiley, including Cochrane Central Register of Controlled Trials), and Web of Science Core Collection (via Clarivate Analytics, including Science Citation Index Expanded and Social Sciences Citation Index) databases was conducted on 1 May 2020. Studies published since 1985 written in English were included. Search terms included sepsis, septic shock; purpura fulminans; healthy volunteers, and tumor necrosis factor-alpha.

Data Analysis and Quality Assessment

Study data were collected and managed using REDCap electronic data capture tools hosted at the University of Colorado Anschutz Medical Campus. We extracted summary data from published reports that included type of study, number of participants, study methods, the technology used to measure three proinflammatory cytokines (TNF α , IL-1 β , and IFN γ), and outcomes of interest. We also extracted clinical information in the patient cohorts examined.

Clinical variables included mean age, gender, race, the proportion of microbial etiology of sepsis (bacterial, viral, fungal), sepsis severity (sepsis, severe sepsis, or septic shock), and proportion of the site of origin of infection (blood, urine, skin, and soft tissue, respiratory, other). Sources of infection were recorded, allowing the source to overlap if multiple sources were present in a single study. Age was recorded as -1 for preterm infants. The magnitude of organ dysfunction in the cohorts was assessed by recording the mean Sequential Organ Failure Assessment (SOFA) score during the first 24 hours after admission. We compared proinflammatory cytokine concentrations to 28-day mortality. Additional cytokine assessments included association with SOFA score. Critical appraisals were conducted using the Quality in Prognosis Studies (QUIPS) tool [19].

Statistical Analysis

We extracted the mean and standard deviation for each cytokine concentration in studies and calculated the standard error and log-transformed mean values. We then entered the log-transformed mean and standard errors in a random-effect meta-analysis to combine the log mean values, which were back-transformed for interpretation. Between-study heterogeneity was estimated using the I^2 statistic, where larger I^2 indicates increased study heterogeneity. Subgroup and meta-regression analyses were conducted to examine factors associated with cytokine levels and which factors contributed to heterogeneity. Assessed factors included age, gender, the severity of sepsis, and type of sepsis. Continuous variables were dichotomized using the mean. When high heterogeneity was obtained ($I^2 \geq 60\%$), we performed a subgroup analysis or removed selected studies to assess the source of the high heterogeneity. Linearity between TNF α levels and continuous outcome variables was evaluated using a scatter plot. We also conducted a

sensitivity analysis to investigate the effect of individual studies on pooled outcomes. The pooled effect was calculated after excluding one study from the analysis and repeating this single-study exclusion for each study. Contour-enhanced funnel plots were constructed to assess publication bias using the egger test to check for a small-study effect. Statistical analyses were performed using Stata software, version 16.0 (StataCorp). Data were analyzed from December 2020 to January 2021.

Results

Literature Search for Sepsis Studies

A total of 3654 records were identified through database searches and were screened for eligibility based on titles and abstracts. Four hundred twenty-seven full-text articles were reviewed. We excluded 323 studies (reasons included cytokine levels not reported in a way that permitted numerical extraction, medians were reported as opposed to means, or cytokine measurement assay did not meet inclusion strategy). After exclusions, 104 studies were included in the meta-analysis with a total of 3250 participants. Sixty-nine studies reported sepsis studies with TNF α levels, 24 studies reported IL-1 β levels, and 5 studies disclosed IFN γ (Figure 1).

Literature Search for Healthy Persons Studies

Three hundred ninety-four records were identified through database searches and were screened for eligibility based on titles and abstracts. Seventy full-text articles were reviewed, and 46 were considered for inclusion in the quantitative synthesis. Twelve studies reporting TNF α levels satisfied inclusion criteria.

TNF α Levels in Sepsis

Sixty-nine studies reporting TNF α levels in sepsis patients were included (Table 1). The mean number of participants in each study was 47.1, ranging between 6 and 220 subjects. Included studies were prospective cohorts (49.3%), randomized clinical trials (37.7%), case-control studies (8.7%), cross-sectional reports (2.9%) and experimental comparative studies (1.5%). Cytokines were quantified using ELISA in 79.7% of studies and using bead-based immunoassay technologies in 20.3% of studies. Most studies were conducted in adults (69.6%), with 30.4% of studies conducted in pediatric patients. The mean age was 42.1 ± 26 years, and ages ranged from preterm infants to 70.3 years. Among adult studies, the mean age was 56.7 ± 9.7 years. The mean percent of female subjects in all included studies was 36.3 ± 11.8 . Approximately half of studies reported the microbiologic etiology of sepsis, with the majority originating from bacteria (30.4%), followed by combinations of pathogens (11.6%) and fungal origin (3%). Reported severities of sepsis included sepsis alone (43.5%), severe sepsis (18.8%), or septic shock (37.7%). In studies reporting the source of sepsis, we determined respiratory sources in 33.3%, intra-abdominal infections in 33.3%, and urinary site of origin in 26.1%. The mean SOFA score was 8.5 ± 2.1 in studies that reported SOFA. We could not determine the aggregate frequency of different ethnicities or underlying immunosuppressive conditions due to a lack of reporting. The pooled estimate mean TNF α level in sepsis patients was 58.4 pg/ml (95% CI 39.8-85.8 pg/ml; $I^2 = 99.4\%$ (Figure 2). In studies reporting mortality, the mean mortality at 28 days was $21.9 \pm 21.2\%$, ranging from 5% to 80%.

TNF α Levels in Sepsis Subgroups

Subgroup analyses indicated no difference in mean TNF α comparing types of studies (66.2 pg/ml for prospective studies, 57.7 pg/ml for case-control studies, 35.8 pg/ml for cross-sectional studies, and 51.5 pg/ml for RCTs; $p = 0.929$). No significant difference in mean TNF α

was noted in adult (45.9 pg/ml) compared to pediatric (101.3 pg/ml) sepsis populations ($p=0.086$). There were no differences in TNF α levels in sepsis patients with different sites of origin of infection (Figure 3A). Studies measuring TNF α levels using ELISA had significantly higher mean TNF α compared to mean TNF α in studies using bead-based immunoassays (73.5 pg/ml vs. 23.3 pg/ml, respectively; $p=0.011$) (Figure 3B).

In a meta-regression, lower mean TNF α was observed in studies containing an increased percent of female patients and in studies containing sepsis patients with older age.

Metaregression examining SOFA score showed SOFA did not associated with TNF α levels (Coef: -0.02, CI -0.4-0.3, p -value=0.931) (Figure 3D).

TNF α Levels in Patients with Different Sepsis Severities and in Patients with Different Microbial Causes of Sepsis

There was no significant difference in mean TNF α level in patients with sepsis (55 pg/ml; 95% CI 23.5-128.9 pg/ml), severe sepsis (35.7 pg/ml; 95% CI 8.5-150.2 pg/ml), or septic shock (63.7 pg/ml; 95% CI 29.8-135.9 pg/ml; $p=0.783$) (Figure 3C). The scatter plots showed no linear relationship between TNF α levels and SOFA score or year of study publication (supplement. eFigure 2, and eFigure 3, respectively). There was no significant difference in mean TNF α comparing reported participants with a SOFA score ≥ 9 (63.4 pg/ml; 95% CI 41.1-97.7 pg/ml) and participants with a SOFA score < 9 (39.7 pg/ml; 95% CI 17.7-89.2 pg/ml; $p=0.318$) (Figure 3D).

TNF α Levels and Sepsis Mortality

Elevated TNF α levels associated with increased 28-day mortality ($p=0.001$) (Figure 3E). The estimated 28-day percentage mortality increased as TNF α levels increased (Figure 3E. Supplement. Bubble plot, eFigure 1).

TNF α Sensitivity Analysis

In an analysis of the effect of outlier studies on TNF α levels, one study was omitted, and a repeat analysis was conducted using the remaining 68 studies. This was repeated until each study in the meta-analysis was tested by being excluded. This manipulation did not significantly change the pooled TNF α concentration level of the remaining studies. The recalculated pooled TNF α levels ranged between 53.4 and 61.8 pg/ml. Excluding the largest outlier, Prashant's (2013) study (unusually high TNF α level) decreased the pooled TNF α level the most to a calculated concentration of 53.4 pg/ml. There was also no significant change in heterogeneity after each study exclusion.

Furthermore, TNF α level effect sizes (pg/ml) did not change after decreasing the variance to 0.25. The levels decreased to 32.4 pg/ml, assuming an I^2 of 10%. A funnel plot for publication bias indicated missing studies in the bottom left- and right-hand sides of the plot, suggesting asymmetry (supplement eFigure 4). The Egger test showed an estimated slope, β_1 , is 1.26 with a standard error of 1.38 ($P=0.363$), indicating a lack of small-studies effect.

IL-1 β Levels in Sepsis

Twenty-four studies reporting IL-1 β levels in sepsis patients were included. The pooled estimated mean IL-1 β level in sepsis patients was 21.8 pg/ml (95% CI 12.6-37.8 pg/ml; $I^2=99.8\%$) (Figure 4). Among the different study types, prospective studies reported the highest

mean IL-1 β level in sepsis participants (35 pg/ml; 95% CI 13.4-91.6 pg/ml), while the mean IL-1 β level in cross-sectional studies was the lowest (8.5 pg/ml; 95% CI 8.1-8.8 pg/ml; $p=0.005$). There was no mean IL-1 β difference comparing studies using different measurement techniques (28.8 pg/ml for ELISA and 12.5 pg/ml for bead-based immunoassay studies; $p=0.107$). We also found no significant mean IL-1 β difference comparing adult sepsis patients (25.6 pg/ml) with pediatric patients (9.7 pg/ml, $p=0.165$). There were no statistically significant differences in IL-1 β levels based on sepsis severity (sepsis, severe sepsis, or septic shock), SOFA score, or microbial sepsis source. Metaregression revealed no overall mortality association with IL-1 β levels (Coef: -0.01, CI -0.05-0.03, $p\text{-value}=0.59$) and no association with 28-day mortality (Coef: -0.08, CI: -0.26-0.1, $p=0.39$).

IFN γ Levels in Sepsis

Five studies reporting IFN γ levels in sepsis patients satisfied inclusion criteria. The pooled estimate mean IFN γ level in sepsis patients was 63.3 pg/ml (95% CI 19.4-206.6 pg/ml; $I^2=99.7\%$) (supplement. eFigure 5). There were too few studies to perform subgroup or metaregression analysis for IFN γ .

TNF α Levels in Healthy Person

Among studies in healthy persons, 12 disclosed TNF α levels in 611 participants. The pooled estimate mean TNF α concentration in health was 5.5 pg/ml (95% CI 3.8-8.0 pg/ml; $I^2=99.5\%$) (Supplement. eFigure 6). There were too few IL-1 β studies or IFN γ studies to conduct meta-analyses.

Discussion

In this systematic review and meta-analysis, the pooled mean TNF α level in sepsis was 58.4 pg/ml compared to 5.5 pg/ml in healthy volunteers. TNF α concentration correlated with the 28-day mortality in sepsis. Our review also found a mean IL-1 β level of 21.8 pg/ml and a mean IFN γ concentration of 63.3 pg/ml in sepsis patients (Table 2). To our knowledge, this is the first systematic review and meta-analysis characterizing levels of key proinflammatory cytokines in the circulation in patients with sepsis.

Consistent with previously published studies, elevated TNF α levels are associated with increased mortality[20] [21]. Although we demonstrated association between increasing TNF α levels and 28-day mortality, numerous randomized placebo-controlled clinical trials failed to show a mortality benefit for TNF α -inhibiting therapies in patients with sepsis [12, 22, 23]. Most of these clinical trials did not quantify TNF α levels in sepsis patients. We believe two primary factors may account for the failure of anti-TNF α treatment. First, insufficient TNF α blockade is possible. However, this seems unlikely given the relatively low mean TNF α level obtained in sepsis patients in the present study. The mean TNF α level we determined does not appear to be excessive in magnitude and lowers the likelihood TNF α blocking power has been inadequate in TNF α -inhibition sepsis trials. Second, elevated TNF α could represent an epiphenomenon or non-causal associate of sepsis outcomes. In this case, TNF α elevations associate with disease severity but do not participate in harmful effects. We believe the latter is a more plausible explanation for the failure of TNF α -blocking agents to reduce sepsis mortality. If elevated TNF α levels caused mortality, TNF α likely exerts detrimental effects by causing end-organ damage. If so, we would expect higher TNF α to associate with elevated SOFA scores, a surrogate indicator of organ damage. However, we found no association between SOFA scores and TNF α levels.

There are large interstudy variations in sepsis patients' proinflammatory cytokine levels, partly due to the measurement assay technique[24]. To mitigate this limitation, minimize measurement bias, and more closely reflect *in vivo* cytokine levels in the circulation, we restricted our inclusion criteria to studies using ELISA or a bead-based immunoassay. Enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay is likely the best-validated measurement technique for cytokines[25]. In a detailed study conducted by the World Health Organization, ELISA assays outperformed radioimmunoassay (RIA) in measuring TNF α in human serum, whereas RIA tended to overestimate TNF α levels[15]. Compared to ELISA, bead-based immunoassays have shown similar sensitivity for cytokine quantification[16, 26]. An additional consideration motivated the restriction of our analysis to these two assay methods. It seems likely future clinical studies will employ these assay platforms. This enhances the relevance of our results to clinical investigations moving forward.

The decades-long failure of cytokine antagonism to confer mortality benefit in sepsis suggests re-assessment of the concepts and assumptions underlying our approach to sepsis research, clinical investigation, and treatment. We believe there are two areas in critical need of examination. First, an updated and clinically-applicable definition of inflammation is needed. The absence of an empirically consistent understanding (or definition) of inflammation has led to a lack of focus in this field. For example, which cytokines are relevant for causing inflammation and tissue damage that characterize cytokine storm? With over 100 genes likely to code for cytokines[10], we need criteria that characterize which ones are relevant as causes of inflammation. Such a definition of inflammation should also differentiate inflammation from immune responses and unify clinical, histopathological, and molecular descriptions of inflammation. The second area in need of study is a comparative analysis of proinflammatory

cytokines in sepsis and in non-sepsis diseases to gain much-needed perspective on the notion of an overabundant cytokine storm. Our results will permit us to answer a fundamental question regarding cytokine amounts in sepsis: "is that a lot?"

TNF α levels in seropositive rheumatoid arthritis can range between 47 pg/ml and 2,720 pg/ml [27, 28], and TNF α concentrations of 40 pg/ml have been measured in systemic lupus erythematosus [29]. TNF α has reached 862 pg/ml and 215 pg/ml in severe acute pancreatitis and salicylate-induced pseudosepsis, respectively [30, 31]. These markedly elevated levels suggest that TNF α levels in sepsis are not achieving "storming" levels as commonly thought. Moreover, it seems the term cytokine storm may be a misleading description of the cytokine response in any natural disease. Indeed, the belief that hypercytokinemia can directly induce lethality or organ malfunction seems dubious considering our data. Finally, this report is timely given the emphasis placed on cytokine storm in coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) pathogenesis. Since severe COVID-19 is a form of sepsis, we believe re-assessment of the role of proinflammatory cytokine in COVID-19 pathogenesis is urgent.

Limitations:

This study has several limitations. There was significant heterogeneity in the data between studies explained by different study designs, measurement techniques, the timing of cytokine level measurement, and the characteristics of included patients. Some subgroup analyses were done based on the proportion of outcomes presented in each study, limiting confidence in derived associations. Missing data in some studies also limited the ability to reach more substantial statistical power. A possible publication bias exists due to the restriction of the included studies to English and the exclusion of unpublished studies. A small sample size of

some studies reduces power to provide secure estimates of cytokine levels, especially for IL-1 β and IFN γ . Finally, studies usually report cytokine levels at a single time point during the course of sepsis. Future studies should analyze the time-course of proinflammatory cytokines in sepsis using modern assay methods. This will reveal notable fluctuations in cytokine levels that may alter the interpretation of our results.

Conclusions

In sepsis, circulating levels of TNF α are elevated approximately tenfold compared to levels in healthy persons. Concentrations of TNF α were linked to sepsis-related mortality but not to the severity of sepsis, organ dysfunction, or the microbiological cause of sepsis. Although cytokine levels are elevated in sepsis compared to healthy subjects, they appear to be similar to or lower than levels in non-lethal chronic inflammatory conditions. We need to revisit the paradigm of cytokine storm as the core mechanism of sepsis pathogenesis. We encourage follow-up studies that critically re-assess the causal role of elevated proinflammatory cytokines in sepsis.

Author Contributions: Dr. Henao-Martínez had full access to all of the data in the study and took responsibility for the data's integrity and the accuracy of the data analysis.

Concept and design: Shapiro, DeSanto, Franco-Paredes, Henao-Martínez.

Acquisition, analysis, or interpretation of data: Gharamti, Sillau, Samara, Monzon, DeSanto, Henao-Martínez, Shapiro

Drafting of the manuscript: Gharamti, Henao-Martínez, Shapiro

Critical revision of the manuscript for important intellectual content: Montalbano, Scherger, DeSanto, Chastain, Sillau, Montoya, Franco-Paredes, Henao-Martínez, Shapiro

Statistical analysis: Sillau, Henao-Martínez.

Administrative, technical, or material support: DeSanto, Henao-Martínez, Shapiro.

Supervision: Franco-Paredes, Henao-Martínez, Shapiro.

Conflict of Interest Disclosures:

Dr. Sillau reported receiving grants from the Alzheimer's Association, the Benign Essential Blepharospasm Research Foundation, the Colorado Department of Public Health, the Davis Phinney Foundation, the Hewitt Family Foundation, the Michael J. Fox Foundation, the National Institutes of Health, the National Institute of Nursing Research, the Patient-Centered Outcomes Research Institute, and the Rocky Mountain Alzheimer's Disease Center outside the submitted work. Dr. Shapiro reported receiving grants from the Emily Foundation during the conduct of the study. Dr. Henao-Martínez reported being the recipient of a K12-clinical trial award as a co-principal investigator for the Expanded Access IND Program (EAP) to provide the Yellow Fever vaccine (Stamaril) to Persons in the United States outside the submitted work. No other disclosures were reported.

Funding/Support:

This study was supported by grant UL1 RR025780 from the National Institutes of Health/National Center for Research Resources, Colorado Clinical Translational Science Institute. Leland Shapiro is supported by a grant from the Emily Foundation for Medical Research.

Role of the Funder/Sponsor:

Funders had no role in the design and conduct of the study; collection, management, analysis, and interpretation of the data; preparation, review, or approval of the manuscript; and decision to submit the manuscript for publication.

References:

- [1] M. Singer, C.S. Deutschman, C.W. Seymour, M. Shankar-Hari, D. Annane, M. Bauer, R. Bellomo, G.R. Bernard, J.-D. Chiche, C.M. Coopersmith, The third international consensus definitions for sepsis and septic shock (Sepsis-3), *Jama* 315(8) (2016) 801-810.
- [2] C. Fleischmann, A. Scherag, N.K. Adhikari, C.S. Hartog, T. Tsaganos, P. Schlattmann, D.C. Angus, K. Reinhart, Assessment of global incidence and mortality of hospital-treated sepsis. Current estimates and limitations, *American journal of respiratory and critical care medicine* 193(3) (2016) 259-272.
- [3] C. Rhee, T.M. Jones, Y. Hamad, A. Pande, J. Varon, C. O'Brien, D.J. Anderson, D.K. Warren, R.B. Dantes, L. Epstein, M. Klompas, Prevalence, Underlying Causes, and Preventability of Sepsis-Associated Mortality in US Acute Care Hospitals, *JAMA Netw Open* 2(2) (2019) e187571.
- [4] C. Torio, B. Moore, National inpatient hospital costs: the most expensive conditions by payer, 2013. HCUP statistical brief no. 204. Rockville, MD: Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality; May 2016, 2017.
- [5] F. Gül, M.K. Arslantaş, İ. Cinel, A. Kumar, Changing Definitions of Sepsis, *Turk J Anaesthesiol Reanim* 45(3) (2017) 129-138.
- [6] T. Abe, K. Yamakawa, H. Ogura, S. Kushimoto, D. Saitoh, S. Fujishima, Y. Otomo, J. Kotani, Y. Umemura, Y. Sakamoto, J. Sasaki, Y. Shiino, N. Takeyama, T. Tarui, S.I. Shiraishi, R. Tsuruta, T.A. Nakada, T. Hifumi, A. Hagiwara, M. Ueyama, N. Yamashita, T. Masuno, H. Ikeda, A. Komori, H. Iriyama, S. Gando, Epidemiology of sepsis and septic shock in intensive care units between sepsis-2 and sepsis-3 populations: sepsis prognostication in intensive care unit and emergency room (SPICE-ICU), *J Intensive Care* 8 (2020) 44.

- [7] M. Shankar-Hari, D.A. Harrison, G.D. Rubenfeld, K. Rowan, Epidemiology of sepsis and septic shock in critical care units: comparison between sepsis-2 and sepsis-3 populations using a national critical care database, *Br J Anaesth* 119(4) (2017) 626-636.
- [8] D.C. Fajgenbaum, C.H. June, Cytokine Storm, *N Engl J Med* 383(23) (2020) 2255-2273.
- [9] B.G. Chousterman, F.K. Swirski, G.F. Weber, Cytokine storm and sepsis disease pathogenesis, *Seminars in immunopathology*, Springer, 2017, pp. 517-528.
- [10] C.A. Dinarello, Historical insights into cytokines, *Eur J Immunol* 37 Suppl 1(Suppl 1) (2007) S34-45.
- [11] M.S. Rizvi, A. Gallo De Moraes, New Decade, Old Debate: Blocking the Cytokine Pathways in Infection-Induced Cytokine Cascade, *Crit Care Explor* 3(3) (2021) e0364.
- [12] J.C. Marshall, Why have clinical trials in sepsis failed?, *Trends Mol Med* 20(4) (2014) 195-203.
- [13] J.M. Cavaillon, M. Singer, T. Skirecki, Sepsis therapies: learning from 30 years of failure of translational research to propose new leads, *EMBO Mol Med* 12(4) (2020) e10128.
- [14] J.R. Tisoncik, M.J. Korth, C.P. Simmons, J. Farrar, T.R. Martin, M.G. Katze, Into the eye of the cytokine storm, *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.* 76(1) (2012) 16-32.
- [15] S. de Kossodo, V. Houba, G.E. Grau, Assaying tumor necrosis factor concentrations in human serum. A WHO International Collaborative study, *J Immunol Methods* 182(1) (1995) 107-14.
- [16] A. Çetin, A. Şen, I. Çetin, B. Çimen, L. Cimen, G. Savas, A. Öztürk, M.Y. Koker, Comparison of ELISA and flow cytometry for measurement of interleukin-1 beta, interleukin-6 and tumor necrosis factor- α , *Turkish Journal of Biochemistry* 43(5) (2018) 540-548.

- [17] R.C. Bone, W.J. Sibbald, C.L. Sprung, The ACCP-SCCM consensus conference on sepsis and organ failure, *Chest* 101(6) (1992) 1481-1483.
- [18] A. Gharamti, O. Samara, A. Monzon, S. Scherger, K. DeSanto, S. Sillau, C. Franco-Paredes, A. Henao-Martínez, L. Shapiro, Association between cytokine levels, sepsis severity and clinical outcomes in sepsis: a quantitative systematic review protocol, *BMJ Open* 11(8) (2021) e048476.
- [19] J.A. Hayden, D.A. van der Windt, J.L. Cartwright, P. Côté, C. Bombardier, Assessing bias in studies of prognostic factors, *Ann Intern Med* 158(4) (2013) 280-6.
- [20] A. Waage, A. Halstensen, T. Espevik, Association between tumour necrosis factor in serum and fatal outcome in patients with meningococcal disease, *The Lancet* 329(8529) (1987) 355-357.
- [21] E. Girardin, G.E. Grau, J.-M. Dayer, P. Roux-Lombard, J.S. Group*, P.-H. Lambert, Tumor necrosis factor and interleukin-1 in the serum of children with severe infectious purpura, *New England Journal of Medicine* 319(7) (1988) 397-400.
- [22] E. Abraham, Why immunomodulatory therapies have not worked in sepsis, *Intensive Care Med* 25(6) (1999) 556-66.
- [23] K. Reinhart, W. Karzai, Anti-tumor necrosis factor therapy in sepsis: update on clinical trials and lessons learned, *Crit Care Med* 29(7 Suppl) (2001) S121-5.
- [24] J.G. Cannon, J.L. Nerad, D.D. Poutsika, C.A. Dinarello, Measuring circulating cytokines, *J Appl Physiol* (1985) 75(4) (1993) 1897-902.
- [25] S.X. Leng, J.E. McElhaney, J.D. Walston, D. Xie, N.S. Fedarko, G.A. Kuchel, ELISA and multiplex technologies for cytokine measurement in inflammation and aging research, *The Journals of Gerontology Series A: Biological Sciences and Medical Sciences* 63(8) (2008) 879-884.

- [26] Good Correlation Between Measured Cytokine Levels Using Multiplexed Bead-based Detection and ELISA Platforms, 2012. https://www.abacusdx.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/1.-MilliPlex-Comparison-with-ELISA_Human-Cytokines-White-paper.pdf. 2021).
- [27] S. Thilagar, R. Theyagarajan, U. Sudhakar, S. Suresh, P. Saketharaman, N. Ahamed, Comparison of serum tumor necrosis factor- α levels in rheumatoid arthritis individuals with and without chronic periodontitis: A biochemical study, J Indian Soc Periodontol 22(2) (2018) 116-121.
- [28] Y.J. Ha, E.J. Kang, S.W. Lee, S.K. Lee, Y.B. Park, J.S. Song, S.T. Choi, Usefulness of serum leucine-rich alpha-2 glycoprotein as a disease activity biomarker in patients with rheumatoid arthritis, J Korean Med Sci 29(9) (2014) 1199-204.
- [29] V. Umare, V. Pradhan, M. Nadkar, A. Rajadhyaksha, M. Patwardhan, K.K. Ghosh, A.H. Nadkarni, Effect of proinflammatory cytokines (IL-6, TNF- α , and IL-1 β) on clinical manifestations in Indian SLE patients, Mediators of inflammation 2014 (2014) 385297-385297.
- [30] M. Surbatovic, S. Radakovic, Tumor necrosis factor- α levels early in severe acute pancreatitis: is there predictive value regarding severity and outcome?, J Clin Gastroenterol 47(7) (2013) 637-43.
- [31] J.W. Leatherman, P.G. Schmitz, Fever, hyperdynamic shock, and multiple-system organ failure. A pseudo-sepsis syndrome associated with chronic salicylate intoxication, Chest 100(5) (1991) 1391-6.
- [32] S.A. Lawang, I. Jayaganda, D. Daud, White blood cell, procalcitonin, C-reactive protein and TNF- α as prognostic factors in pediatric sepsis, Indian Journal of Public Health Research and Development 10(7) (2019) 692-697.

- [33] G.J. Slotman, J.V. Quinn, P.C. Wry, C.E. Brathwaite, B.M. Friedman, Unopposed interleukin-1 is necessary for increased plasma cytokine and eicosanoid levels to develop in severe sepsis, *Annals of Surgery* 226(1) (1997) 77-84.
- [34] L. Acar, N. Atalan, E.H. Karagedik, A. Ergen, Tumour Necrosis Factor-alpha and Nuclear Factor-kappa B Gene Variants in Sepsis, *Balkan Medical Journal* 35(1) (2018) 30-35.
- [35] G.J. Tang, S.L. Huang, H.W. Yien, W.S. Chen, C.W. Chi, C.W. Wu, W.Y. Lui, J.H. Chiu, T.Y. Lee, Tumor necrosis factor gene polymorphism and septic shock in surgical infection, *Critical Care Medicine* 28(8) (2000) 2733-6.
- [36] P. Makhija, S. Yadav, A. Thakur, Tumor necrosis factor alpha and interleukin 6 in infants with sepsis, *Indian Pediatrics* 42(10) (2005) 1024-8.
- [37] M.A. Martinez, J.M. Pena, A. Fernandez, M. Jimenez, S. Juarez, R. Madero, J.J. Vazquez, Time course and prognostic significance of hemostatic changes in sepsis: relation to tumor necrosis factor-alpha, *Critical Care Medicine* 27(7) (1999) 1303-8.
- [38] I. de Werra, C. Jaccard, S.B. Corradin, R. Chiolero, B. Yersin, H. Gallati, M. Assicot, C. Bohuon, J.D. Baumgartner, M.P. Glauser, D. Heumann, Cytokines, nitrite/nitrate, soluble tumor necrosis factor receptors, and procalcitonin concentrations: comparisons in patients with septic shock, cardiogenic shock, and bacterial pneumonia, *Critical Care Medicine* 25(4) (1997) 607-13.
- [39] S. Khurana, M. Kumari, N. Bhardwaj, S. Kumar, S. Sagar, R. Malhotra, P. Mathur, T-helper-17, Regulatory T-helper Cells Related Serum Markers and IL-13 in the Outcome of Polytraumatic Patients with Bacteremia, *Iranian Journal Of Immunology: IJI* 15(4) (2018) 302-308.
- [40] F. Tamion, V. Le Cam-Duchez, J.F. Menard, C. Girault, A. Coquerel, G. Bonmarchand, Serum erythropoietin levels in septic shock, *Anaesthesia & Intensive Care* 33(5) (2005) 578-84.

- [41] N.M. Fida, J.A. Al-Mughales, M.F. Fadelallah, Serum concentrations of interleukin-1 alpha, interleukin-6 and tumor necrosis factor-alpha in neonatal sepsis and meningitis, Saudi Medical Journal 27(10) (2006) 1508-14.
- [42] J. Reyna-Figueroa, A. Lagunas-Martinez, P. Galindo-Delgado, M.F. Fernandez-Bautista, P.G. Castro-Oteo, P. Martinez-Matsumoto, E.M. Perez, Y. Rosenstein, A.E. Limon-Rojas, F.J. Ortiz-Ibarra, V. Madrid-Marina, Serum concentrations of apoptosis-associated molecules in septic children with leukemia, neutropenia and fever, International Journal of Hematology 105(5) (2017) 668-675.
- [43] P.M. Myrianthefs, E.G. Karabatsos, S.P. Karatzas, E.G. Boutzouka, K.F. Venetsanou, P.L. Evagelopoulou, G.A. Fildissis, N.J. Legakis, G.J. Baltopoulos, Safety and efficacy of molgramostim as an adjunctive therapy in critically ill patients with severe sepsis, Scandinavian Journal of Infectious Diseases 35(3) (2003) 175-9.
- [44] A. Akdag, U. Dilmen, K. Haque, D. Dilli, O. Erdevi, T. Goekmen, Role of pentoxifylline and/or IgM-enriched intravenous immunoglobulin in the management of neonatal sepsis, American Journal of Perinatology 31(10) (2014) 905-12.
- [45] S. Kurtoglu, H. Caksen, I.K. Hallac, H.B. Ustunbas, K. Uzun, H. Kilic, Serum tumor necrosis factor-alpha and interleukin-6 levels in neonatal sepsis, Pediatric Emergency Care 19(3) (2003) 219-20.
- [46] W. Barthlen, J. Stadler, N.L. Lehn, T. Miethke, H. Bartels, J.R. Siewert, Serum levels of end products of nitric oxide synthesis correlate positively with tumor necrosis factor alpha and negatively with body temperature in patients with postoperative abdominal sepsis, Shock 2(6) (1994) 398-401.

- [47] A. Blanco, G. Solis, E. Arranz, G.D. Coto, A. Ramos, J. Telleria, Serum levels of CD14 in neonatal sepsis by Gram-positive and Gram-negative bacteria, *Acta Paediatrica* 85(6) (1996) 728-32.
- [48] H. Hamishehkar, M.T. Beigmohammadi, M. Abdollahi, S. Mousavi, S. Ziaie, R.A. Sharifian, S. Davoudi, M. Mojtahedzadeh, Pro-inflammatory cytokine profile of critically ill septic patients following therapeutic plasma exchange, *Transfusion & Apheresis Science* 48(1) (2013) 75-8.
- [49] E. Hotoura, V. Giapros, A. Kostoula, P. Spyrou, S. Andronikou, Pre-inflammatory mediators and lymphocyte subpopulations in preterm neonates with sepsis, *Inflammation* 35(3) (2012) 1094-1101.
- [50] J.D. Marks, C.B. Marks, J.M. Luce, A.B. Montgomery, J. Turner, C.A. Metz, J.F. Murray, Plasma tumor necrosis factor in patients with septic shock. Mortality rate, incidence of adult respiratory distress syndrome, and effects of methylprednisolone administration, *American Review of Respiratory Disease* 141(1) (1990) 94-7.
- [51] A. Oberholzer, S.M. Souza, S.K. Tschoeke, C. Oberholzer, A. Abouhamze, J.P. Pribble, L.L. Moldawer, Plasma cytokine measurements augment prognostic scores as indicators of outcome in patients with severe sepsis, *Shock* 23(6) (2005) 488-93.
- [52] J.L. Vincent, H. Spapen, J. Bakker, N.R. Webster, L. Curtis, Phase II multicenter clinical study of the platelet-activating factor receptor antagonist BB-882 in the treatment of sepsis, *Critical Care Medicine* 28(3) (2000) 638-42.
- [53] B. Shouman, R. Badr, Regulated on activation, normal T cell expressed and secreted and tumor necrosis factor-alpha in septic neonates, *Journal of Perinatology* 30(3) (2010) 192-6.

- [54] A.S. Dofferhoff, V.J. Bom, H.G. de Vries-Hospers, J. van Ingen, J. vd Meer, B.P. Hazenberg, P.O. Mulder, J. Weits, Patterns of cytokines, plasma endotoxin, plasminogen activator inhibitor, and acute-phase proteins during the treatment of severe sepsis in humans, *Critical Care Medicine* 20(2) (1992) 185-92.
- [55] N. Nasir, B. Jamil, S. Siddiqui, N. Talat, F.A. Khan, R. Hussain, Mortality in Sepsis and its relationship with Gender, *Pakistan Journal of Medical Sciences* 31(5) (2015) 1201-6.
- [56] T. Staudinger, E. Presterl, W. Graninger, G.J. Locker, S. Knapp, K. Laczika, G. Klappacher, B. Stoiser, A. Wagner, P. Tesinsky, H. Kordova, M. Frass, Influence of pentoxifylline on cytokine levels and inflammatory parameters in septic shock, *Intensive Care Medicine* 22(9) (1996) 888-93.
- [57] D. Memis, B. Karamanlioglu, M. Yuksel, I. Gemlik, Z. Pamukcu, The influence of methylene blue infusion on cytokine levels during severe sepsis, *Anaesthesia & Intensive Care* 30(6) (2002) 755-62.
- [58] H.E. Wang, N.I. Shapiro, R. Griffin, M.M. Safford, S. Judd, G. Howard, Inflammatory and endothelial activation biomarkers and risk of sepsis: a nested case-control study, *Journal of Critical Care* 28(5) (2013) 549-55.
- [59] G. Gultekin, H. Sahin, N. Inanc, F. Uyanik, E. Ok, Impact of Omega-3 and Omega-9 fatty acids enriched total parenteral nutrition on blood chemistry and inflammatory markers in septic patients, *Pakistan Journal of Medical Sciences* 30(2) (2014) 299-304.
- [60] H. Hamishehkar, M.T. Beigmohammadi, M. Abdollahi, A. Ahmadi, A. Mahmoodpour, M.R. Mirjalili, R. Abrishami, M.R. Khoshayand, K. Eslami, M. Kanani, M. Baeri, M. Mojtahedzadeh, Identification of enhanced cytokine generation following sepsis. *Dream of*

magic bullet for mortality prediction and therapeutic evaluation, DARU, Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences 18(3) (2010) 155-162.

[61] G. Aydemir, F. Cekmez, G. Kalkan, M.K. Fidanci, G. Kaya, A. Karaoglu, C. Meral, I. Arziman, F. Karademir, G. Ayar, R.C. Gunduz, S. Suleymanoglu, High serum 25-hydroxyvitamin D levels are associated with pediatric sepsis, Tohoku Journal of Experimental Medicine 234(4) (2014) 295-8.

[62] D.A. Vassiliadi, I. Dimopoulou, M. Tzanela, E. Douka, O. Livaditi, S.E. Orfanos, A. Kotanidou, S. Tsagarakis, Longitudinal assessment of adrenal function in the early and prolonged phases of critical illness in septic patients: Relations to cytokine levels and outcome, Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism 99(12) (2014) 4471-4480.

[63] D. Xufei, Y. Guogang, Z. Shiqiong, M. Hong, B. Hongqiang, Y. Jun, Y. Xueqiang, Laparoscopic versus open appendectomy on serum levels of cytokines in children with perforated appendices, peritonitis and sepsis, Biomedical Research (India) 28(15) (2017) 6693-6699.

[64] B. Bouhemad, A. Nicolas-Robin, C. Arbelot, M. Arthaud, F. Feger, J.J. Rouby, Isolated and reversible impairment of ventricular relaxation in patients with septic shock, Critical Care Medicine 36(3) (2008) 766-74.

[65] A. El-Nawawy, H. El-Kinany, M. Hamdy El-Sayed, N. Boshra, Intravenous polyclonal immunoglobulin administration to sepsis syndrome patients: a prospective study in a pediatric intensive care unit, Journal of Tropical Pediatrics 51(5) (2005) 271-8.

[66] I.J. Ganda, Y. Andriani, S.A. Lawang, D. Daud, Initial serum level of TNF- α as an outcome predictor in pediatric patient with sepsis, Current Pediatric Research 22(2) (2018) 146-151.

- [67] F. Tamion, V. Richard, F. Sauger, J.F. Menard, C. Girault, J.C. Richard, C. Thuillez, J. Leroy, G. Bonmarchand, Gastric mucosal acidosis and cytokine release in patients with septic shock, *Critical Care Medicine* 31(8) (2003) 2137-43.
- [68] S. Kumar, E. Gupta, S. Kaushik, V. Kumar Srivastava, S.K. Mehta, A. Jyoti, Evaluation of oxidative stress and antioxidant status: Correlation with the severity of sepsis, *Scandinavian Journal of Immunology* 87(4) (2018) e12653.
- [69] S.K. Angurana, A. Bansal, S. Singhi, R. Aggarwal, M. Jayashree, M. Salaria, N.K. Mangat, Evaluation of Effect of Probiotics on Cytokine Levels in Critically Ill Children With Severe Sepsis: A Double-Blind, Placebo-Controlled Trial, *Critical Care Medicine* 46(10) (2018) 1656-1664.
- [70] C.A. Terregino, B.L. Lopez, D.J. Karras, A.J. Killian, G.K. Arnold, Endogenous mediators in emergency department patients with presumed sepsis: are levels associated with progression to severe sepsis and death?, *Annals of Emergency Medicine* 35(1) (2000) 26-34.
- [71] S. Basu, P. Agarwal, S. Anupurba, R. Shukla, A. Kumar, Elevated plasma and cerebrospinal fluid interleukin-1 beta and tumor necrosis factor-alpha concentration and combined outcome of death or abnormal neuroimaging in preterm neonates with early-onset clinical sepsis, *Journal of Perinatology* 35(10) (2015) 855-61.
- [72] J.B. Meng, Y.N. Jiao, G. Zhang, X.J. Xu, C.L. Ji, M.H. Hu, Z.Z. Lai, M. Zhang, Electroacupuncture Improves Intestinal Dysfunction in Septic Patients: A Randomised Controlled Trial, *BioMed research international* 2018 (2018) 8293594.
- [73] J.B. Meng, Y.N. Jiao, X.J. Xu, Z.Z. Lai, G. Zhang, C.L. Ji, M.H. Hu, Electro-acupuncture attenuates inflammatory responses and intraabdominal pressure in septic patients: A randomized controlled trial, *Medicine* 97(17) (2018) e0555.

- [74] N. Banupriya, B. Vishnu Bhat, B.D. Benet, M.G. Sridhar, S.C. Parija, Efficacy of zinc supplementation on serum calprotectin, inflammatory cytokines and outcome in neonatal sepsis - a randomized controlled trial, *Journal of Maternal-Fetal & Neonatal Medicine* 30(13) (2017) 1627-1631.
- [75] H.B. Nguyen, M. Loomba, J.J. Yang, G. Jacobsen, K. Shah, R.M. Otero, A. Suarez, H. Parekh, A. Jaehne, E.P. Rivers, Early lactate clearance is associated with biomarkers of inflammation, coagulation, apoptosis, organ dysfunction and mortality in severe sepsis and septic shock, *Journal of Inflammation* 7 (2010) 6.
- [76] L. Li, Z. Zhu, J. Chen, B. Ouyang, M. Chen, X. Guan, Diagnostic value of soluble triggering receptor expressed on myeloid cells-1 in critically-ill, postoperative patients with suspected sepsis, *American Journal of the Medical Sciences* 345(3) (2013) 178-84.
- [77] W.F. Fang, I.S. Douglas, Y.M. Chen, C.Y. Lin, H.C. Kao, Y.T. Fang, C.H. Huang, Y.T. Chang, K.T. Huang, Y.H. Wang, C.C. Wang, M.C. Lin, Development and validation of immune dysfunction score to predict 28-day mortality of sepsis patients, *PLoS ONE [Electronic Resource]* 12(10) (2017).
- [78] Z. Hui, Z. Li, Continuous veno-venous hemofiltration for septic shock, *International journal of clinical and experimental medicine* 10(10) (2017) 14983-14988.
- [79] X.H. Guo, Y.F. Sun, S.Z. Han, J. Miao, M. Cui, J.B. Wang, Continuous blood purification in children with severe sepsis, *Journal of Biological Regulators & Homeostatic Agents* 31(2) (2017) 389-394.
- [80] G. Briassoulis, O. Filippou, M. Kanariou, T. Hatzis, Comparative effects of early randomized immune or non-immune-enhancing enteral nutrition on cytokine production in children with septic shock, *Intensive Care Medicine* 31(6) (2005) 851-8.

- [81] A. Prashant, P. Vishwanath, P. Kulkarni, P. Sathya Narayana, V. Gowdara, S.M. Nataraj, R. Nagaraj, Comparative assessment of cytokines and other inflammatory markers for the early diagnosis of neonatal sepsis-a case control study, PLoS ONE [Electronic Resource] 8(7) (2013) e68426.
- [82] F. Zeni, P. Pain, M. Vindimian, J.P. Gay, P. Gery, M. Bertrand, Y. Page, D. Page, R. Vermesch, J.C. Bertrand, Effects of pentoxifylline on circulating cytokine concentrations and hemodynamics in patients with septic shock: results from a double-blind, randomized, placebo-controlled study, Critical Care Medicine 24(2) (1996) 207-14.
- [83] A. Karimi, A. Mahmoodpoor, F. Kooshki, H.R. Niazkar, H. Shoorei, A. Tarighat-Esfanjani, Effects of nanocurcumin on inflammatory factors and clinical outcomes in critically ill patients with sepsis: A pilot randomized clinical trial, European Journal of Integrative Medicine 36 (2020).
- [84] D. Memis, B. Karamanlioglu, A. Turan, O. Koyuncu, Z. Pamukcu, Effects of lornoxicam on the physiology of severe sepsis, Critical Care (London, England) 8(6) (2004) R474-82.
- [85] L.L. Chen, Y. Lan, J.C. Zhu, Y. He, Effects of function dexmedetomidine on renal function patients with septic shock, European Journal of Inflammation 16 (2018).
- [86] D. Hu, S. Sun, B. Zhu, Z. Mei, L. Wang, S. Zhu, W. Zhao, Effects of coupled plasma filtration adsorption on septic patients with multiple organ dysfunction syndrome, Renal Failure 34(7) (2012) 834-9.
- [87] R. Lauterbach, D. Pawlik, D. Kowalczyk, W. Ksycinski, E. Helwich, M. Zembala, Effect of the immunomodulating agent, pentoxifylline, in the treatment of sepsis in prematurely delivered infants: a placebo-controlled, double-blind trial, Critical Care Medicine 27(4) (1999) 807-14.

- [88] K. Selim, C. Huseyin, K.H. Ibrahim, B.U. Hasan, U. Kazim, K. Huseyin, Effect of pentoxifylline on tumor necrosis factor-alpha and interleukin-6 levels in neonatal sepsis, *Medical Journal of Malaysia* 59(3) (2004) 391-4.
- [89] J.A. Avontuur, T.C. Stam, M. Jongen-Lavrencic, J.G. van Amsterdam, A.M. Eggermont, H.A. Bruining, Effect of L-NAME, an inhibitor of nitric oxide synthesis, on plasma levels of IL-6, IL-8, TNF alpha and nitrite/nitrate in human septic shock, *Intensive Care Medicine* 24(7) (1998) 673-9.
- [90] R. Soltani, B. Alikiaie, F. Shafiee, H. Amiri, S. Mousavi, Coenzyme Q10 improves the survival and reduces inflammatory markers in septic patients, *Bratislavske Lekarske Listy* 121(2) (2020) 154-158.
- [91] M.V. Eidt, F.B. Nunes, L. Pedrazza, G. Caeran, G. Pellegrin, D.A. Melo, L. Possuelo, R.T. Jost, H.B. Dias, M.V. Donadio, J.R. Oliveira, Biochemical and inflammatory aspects in patients with severe sepsis and septic shock: The predictive role of IL-18 in mortality, *Clinica Chimica Acta* 453 (2016) 100-6.
- [92] S. Kumar, E. Gupta, V.K. Srivastava, S. Kaushik, J. Saxena, L.K. Goyal, S. Mehta, A. Jyoti, Nitrosative stress and cytokines are linked with the severity of sepsis and organ dysfunction, *British Journal of Biomedical Science* 76(1) (2019) 29-34.
- [93] A.T. Skoutelis, V. Kaleridis, G.M. Athanassiou, K.I. Kokkinis, Y.F. Missirlis, H.P. Bassaris, Neutrophil deformability in patients with sepsis, septic shock, and adult respiratory distress syndrome, *Critical Care Medicine* 28(7) (2000) 2355-9.
- [94] Y. Lopez-Aguirre, J.A. Paramo, Endothelial cell and hemostatic activation in relation to cytokines in patients with sepsis, *Thrombosis Research* 94(2) (1999) 95-101.

- [95] Y. Wang, B. Wang, L. Ma, X. Zhao, Y. Qiao, X. Zhang, Effect of hydrocortisone in a low dosage on apoptosis of T lymphocyte subset in treatment of sepsis, *Acta Medica Mediterranea* 35(5) (2019) 2653-2657.
- [96] B.Y. Besecker, M.C. Exline, J. Hollyfield, G. Phillips, R.A. DiSilvestro, M.D. Wewers, D.L. Knoell, A comparison of zinc metabolism, inflammation, and disease severity in critically ill infected and noninfected adults early after intensive care unit admission, *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition* 93(6) (2011) 1356-1364.
- [97] G. Bernardin, A.D. Strosberg, A. Bernard, M. Mattei, S. Marullo, Beta-adrenergic receptor-dependent and -independent stimulation of adenylate cyclase is impaired during severe sepsis in humans, *Intensive Care Medicine* 24(12) (1998) 1315-22.
- [98] A. Soni, G.M. Pepper, P.M. Wyrwinski, N.E. Ramirez, R. Simon, T. Pina, H. Gruenspan, C.E. Vaca, Adrenal insufficiency occurring during septic shock: incidence, outcome, and relationship to peripheral cytokine levels, *American Journal of Medicine* 98(3) (1995) 266-71.
- [99] Y. Heper, E.H. Akalin, R. Mistik, S. Akgöz, O. Töre, G. Göral, B. Oral, F. Budak, S. Helvacı, Evaluation of serum C-reactive protein, procalcitonin, tumor necrosis factor alpha, and interleukin-10 levels as diagnostic and prognostic parameters in patients with community-acquired sepsis, severe sepsis, and septic shock, *European Journal of Clinical Microbiology & Infectious Diseases* 25(8) (2006) 481-91.
- [100] C.A. Gogos, E. Drosou, H.P. Bassaris, A. Skoutelis, Pro- versus anti-inflammatory cytokine profile in patients with severe sepsis: a marker for prognosis and future therapeutic options, *Journal of Infectious Diseases* 181(1) (2000) 176-80.

- [101] J. Garnacho-Montero, I. Palacios-García, A. Díaz-Martín, A. Gutiérrez-Pizarra, J.M. López-Sánchez, E.A. Gómez, M.D. Cordero, Sequential changes of NLRP3 inflammasome activation in sepsis and its relationship with death, *Shock* (Augusta, Ga.) (2020).
- [102] E.D. Kartal, E. Karkaç, Z. Gülbaş, S.N. Alpat, N. Erben, E. Çolak, Several cytokines and protein c levels with the apache II scoring system for evaluation of patients with sepsis, *Balkan Medical Journal* 29(2) (2012) 174-178.
- [103] C.J. Fisher, Jr., G.J. Slotman, S.M. Opal, J.P. Pribble, R.C. Bone, G. Emmanuel, D. Ng, D.C. Bloedow, M.A. Catalano, G. Il-Ra Sepsis Syndrome Study, Initial evaluation of human recombinant interleukin-1 receptor antagonist in the treatment of sepsis syndrome: a randomized, open-label, placebo-controlled multicenter trial, *Critical Care Medicine* 22(1) (1994) 12-21.
- [104] Y.C. Wang, G.P. Weng, J.P. Liu, L. Li, Q.H. Cheng, Elevated serum IL-37 concentrations in patients with sepsis, *Medicine* 98(10) (2019) e14756.
- [105] A. Oberholzer, L. Harter, A. Feilner, U. Steckholzer, O. Trentz, W. Ertel, Differential effect of caspase inhibition on proinflammatory cytokine release in septic patients, *Shock* 14(3) (2000) 253-7; discussion 257.

Figure 1: PRISMA Flowchart.

Table 1. Characteristics of Studies with TNF α levels in sepsis [32-100]

Figure 2. Forest plot for TNF α studies

Effect size (pg/ml) is log-transformed

Figure 3: A: TNF α levels grouped by sepsis source. B: TNF α levels obtained using different quantification assays ($p=0.011$). C: TNF α levels according to sepsis severity. D: TNF α levels stratified by Sequential Organ Failure Assessment (SOFA) SOFA score below 9 or greater than or equal to 9. E: TNF α levels and 28-day mortality. * p -value<0.05. SSTI= Skin and Soft Tissue Infections, CNS= Central Nervous System.

Figure 4: Forest plot for IL-1 β studies [33, 39, 49, 57, 60, 62, 64, 71, 73, 80, 84, 87, 91, 93, 95-97, 100-105]

Effect size (pg/ml) is log-transformed

Table 2. Summary of proinflammatory cytokine levels

Supplementary Online Content:

eMethods. Database search strategy

eFigure 1. Bubble plot TNF α levels and 28-day mortality

eFigure 2. TNF α levels and SOFA score scatter plot

eFigure 3. TNF α levels and year of study publication scatter plot

eFigure 4. TNF α levels publication bias funnel plot

eFigure 5. Forest Plot of studies with IFN γ levels

eFigure 6. Forest Plot of studies with TNF α levels in healthy persons

Figure 1. PRISMA figure

A TNF α levels grouped by sepsis source

medRxiv preprint doi: <https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.12.13.21267720>; this version posted December 14, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license.

B TNF α levels grouped by measurement method

C TNF α levels in different sepsis severities

D TNF α levels in sepsis according to SOFA score

E TNF α levels and sepsis mortality

Random-effects REML model

Table 1. Characteristics of Studies reporting TNF α levels in sepsis

Study (year)	Type of Study	Technique	Population	Number	TNF α Mean (pg/mL)	Age (median)	Women %	SOFA score (mean)	Mortality % (28d)
Lawang (2019)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	108	635.5	-	35.2	-	-
Slotman (1997)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	17	15.2	47.29	35.3	-	-
Acar (2018)	Case-Control	ELISA	Adults	72	49.5	64.6	29.2	-	-
Tang (2000)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	112	30.4	69.2	17.9	-	-
Makhija (2005)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	32	227.2	0.33	28.1	-	-
Martinez (1999)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	43	92	54	41.9	-	-
de Werra (1997)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	15	108	-	40.0	-	-
Khurana (2018)	Prospective Cohort	BBI	Adults	40	13	-	30.0	-	-
Tamion (2005)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	17	69.5	59	-	-	41.2
Fida (2006)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	6	33	-	-	-	-
Reyna-Figueroa (2017)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	18	35.2	10.2	-	-	-
Myrianthefs (2003)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	20	1.4	64.8	30.0	10.6	30
Akdag (2014)	Prospective Cohort	BBI	Pediatric	51	2.3	-	35.3	-	-
Kurtoglu (2003)	Case-Control	ELISA	Pediatric	20	159.7	0	35.0	-	-
Barthlen (1994)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	14	5.2	58.7	7.1	-	-
Blanco (1996)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	20	160	-1	-	-	-
Hamishehkar (2013)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	12	116.1	42.4	41.7	8.8	41.7
Hotoura (2012)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	17	76	0	-	-	-
Marks (1990)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	74	162	-	-	-	-
Oberholzer (2005)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	124	9.3	58.3	45.2	-	31.5
Vincent (2000)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	69	32.8	61	39.1	-	44.9
Shouman (2010)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	15	153	-1	-	-	-
Dofferhoff (1992)	Prospective Cohort	BBI	Adults	20	468.1	67	55.0	-	-
Nasir (2015)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	97	146	52	46.4	-	-
Staudinger (1996)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	24	13	51.5	33.3	-	-
Memis (2002)	RCT	BBI	Adults	15	22	53.1	40.0	7.06	-
Wang (2013)	Case-Control	BBI	Adults	162	6.9	70.3	49.4	-	-

Gultekin (2014)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	32	30.3	62.9	31.3	-	-
Hamishehkar (2010)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	51	86.2	49.39	33.3	8.27	49
Aydemir (2014)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	40	51	7	45.0	-	-
Vassiliadi (2014)	Prospective Cohort	BBI	Adults	51	3.3	55	23.5	10.56	37.3
Xufei (2017)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	67	81	-	40.3	-	-
Bouhemad (2008)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	54	73.8	57.43	24.1	-	-
El-Nawawy (2005)	RCT	ELISA	Pediatric	50	4.8	0	28.0	-	-
Ganda (2018)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	70	454	-	34.3	-	-
Tamion (2003)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	30	68.3	-	-	-	46.7
Kumar (2018)	Cross-Sectional	ELISA	Adults	100	152	57.5	39.0	8.5	-
Angurana (2018)	RCT	ELISA	Pediatric	50	310	-	-	6	-
Terregino (2000)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	135	11.3	-	51.1	-	-
Basu (2015)	Case-Control	ELISA	Pediatric	32	147.1	-1	50.0	-	-
Meng (2018)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	36	93.6	59.8	47.2	-	41.7
Meng (2018)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	41	91.2	61.32	46.3	11.53	39
Banupriya (2017)	RCT	ELISA	Pediatric	67	68.6	-	23.9	-	-
Nguyen (2010)	Prospective Cohort	BBI	Adults	220	45.8	65	45.9	6.5	36.4
Li (2013)	Prospective Cohort	BBI	Adults	38	21.3	59	13.2	8.66	-
Fang (2017)	Prospective Cohort	BBI	Adults	106	31.1	68	42.5	9.45	-
Hui (2017)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	35	758.6	56	28.6	-	-
Guo (2017)	RCT	ELISA	Pediatric	66	32.5	1	39.4	-	-
Briassoulis (2005)	RCT	BBI	Pediatric	15	25.3	5	-	-	-
Prashant (2013)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Pediatric	50	25110	0	34.0	-	-
Zeni (1996)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	8	58	65	12.5	-	-
Karimi (2020)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	20	1.7	49	35.0	7.3	-
Memis (2004)	RCT	BBI	Adults	20	24.6	-	55.0	6.2	-
Chen (2018)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	40	76.2	-	-	-	-
Hu (2012)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	14	203.9	62.8	-	13.58	-
Lauterbach (1999)	RCT	BBI	Pediatric	38	278.4	-1	47.4	-	-
Selim (2004)	RCT	ELISA	Pediatric	7	75	0	-	-	-
Avontuur (1998)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	11	514.9	-	9.1	-	54.5

Soltani (2020)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	20	59.6	55.6	30.0	8.5	-
Eidt (2016)	Cross-Sectional	BBi	Adults	48	8.4	63.36	50.0	7.68	-
Kumar (2019)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	110	160.7	45	44.5	-	-
Skoutelis (2000)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	12	1129	59.5	25.0	-	-
Lopez-Aguirre (1999)	Case-Control	ELISA	Adults	32	73.6	-	25.0	-	-
Wang (2019)	RCT	ELISA	Adults	42	31.6	43.7	47.6	-	-
Besecker (2011)	Case-Control	BBi	Adults	22	76.4	51	59.1	5.8	-
Bernardin (1998)	Experimental comparative	ELISA	Adults	11	67.3	55	27.3	-	-
Soni (1995)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	21	16.2	16.24	33.3	-	-
Heper (2006)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	39	219.3	54.85	38.5	-	-
Gogos (2000)	Prospective Cohort	ELISA	Adults	65	64.2	65.4	55.4	-	-

BBi: bead-based immunoassay, ELISA: enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay, RCT: Randomized clinical trial, SOFA: Sequential Organ Failure Assessment.

Age= -1: Pre-terms neonates

Table 2. Summary of pro-inflammatory cytokine levels

	Cytokine	Number of studies	Pooled estimate (mean pg/ml)	95% confidence interval (pg/ml)
Sepsis patients	TNF α	69	58.4	39.8 – 85.8
	IL-1 β	24	21.8	12.6 – 37.8
	IFN γ	5	63.3	19.4 – 206.6
Healthy persons	TNF α	12	5,5	3.8 – 8.0