The kinetic of SARS-CoV-2 antibody (Ab) decline determines the threshold for Ab persistence up to one year

Erika Garner-Spitzer¹, Angelika Wagner¹, Michael Kundi², Hannes Stockinger³, Anna Repic³, Anna-Margarita Schoetta³, Venugopal Gudipati³, Johannes B. Huppa³, Renate Kunert⁴, Patrick Mayrhofer⁴, Thomas R. Kreil⁵, Maria R. Faracet⁵, Eva Hoeltl⁶, Ursula Wiedermann^{1*}

¹ Institute of Specific Prophylaxis and Tropical Medicine, Center for Pathophysiology, Infectiology and Immunology, Medical University of Vienna, Vienna, Austria

² Center for Public Health, Medical University of Vienna, Vienna, Austria

³ Institute for Hygiene and Applied Immunology, Centre for Pathophysiology, Infectiology and Immunology, Medical University of Vienna, Vienna, Austria

⁴ Department of Biotechnology, University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences, Vienna

⁵ Global Pathogen Safety, Baxter AG, a Takeda company, Vienna, Austria

⁶ Health Center Erste Bank, Erste Bank, Vienna, Austria

*Correspondence:

Univ. Prof. Ursula Wiedermann, MD, PhD

Institute of Specific Prophylaxis and Tropical Medicine

Centre for Pathophysiology, Infectiology and Immunology

Medical University of Vienna

Kinderspitalgasse 15, Vienna A-1090, Austria

Email: ursula.wiedermann@meduniwien.ac.at

Abstract: Twelve subjects with positive SARS-CoV-2 neutralization test (NT) titers (>1:10) identified in a seroprevalence study with 1655 working adults were followed up for one year. Here we report that 7 of these 12 individuals (58%) still had NT titers $\geq 1:50$, S1-specific IgG concentrations ≥ 50 BAU/ml and $\geq 26\%$ ACE2 receptor binding inhibition, measured with surrogate virus NT one year after mild COVID infection. Furthermore, NT₅₀ titers >1:10 and S1-specific IgG levels >60 BAU/ml present at three months post-infection persisted at detectable levels for 1 year and correlated with circulating S1-specific memory B-cells. Vaccine-induced SARS-CoV2 immune responses decline at similar rates as those after infection; thus the describes threshold of 60 BAU/ml at three months post infection might also be relevant for assessment of Ab persistence after vaccination.

We recently reported in a longitudinal seroprevalence study conducted in a cohort of working adults (n=1655) that neutralizing SARS-CoV-2 RBD-specific antibodies (Abs) persist for at least six months independent of symptom severity (1). This study cohort was followed up to one year and twelve selected subjects with positive neutralization test (NT) titers (>1:10) after infection were analyzed in detail to assess their long-term Ab persistence, T cell reactivity and memory B cells over the course of one year. SARS-CoV-2-specific Abs were evaluated quantitatively with neutralization test (NT₅₀ 1:x) and S1 IgG ELISA (BAU/ml), and semi-quantitatively with surrogate-virus neutralization test (sVNT) (% inhibition), RBD Ab ELISA (ratio) and NCP IgG ELISA (ratio) in serum samples obtained after mild COVID infection and 3 months, 6 months and one year thereafter. On cellular level, S1-specific B memory cells were quantified by flow-cytometry and cytokines were measured in culture

supernatants of S1-protein re-stimulated PBMC (see Supporting Information). The ethics committee of the Medical University of Vienna approved this monocentric study (EK 1438/2020, EK 1746/2020).

Results:

Our results show that 7 of 12 subjects (58 %) still had NT titers $\geq 1:50$ (positive $>1:10$), S1-specific IgG concentrations ≥ 50 BAU/ml (seropositive >35.2 BAU/ml) and $\geq 26\%$ binding inhibition with sVNT (cut-off 20%) after one year (Fig.1 A-C). In all subjects RBD-specific Abs remained above the positive cut-off (ratio >1.1), while NCP-specific IgG declined below negative cut-off (ratio <0.8) between 6 months and one year (Fig.1 D, E).

Figure 1 A-F: Kinetics of SARS-CoV-2- specific Abs measured with different assays. A) NT₅₀ titers 1:x, B) S1-specific IgG in BAU/ml, C) % inhibition in sVNT, D) RBD-specific Ab ratios and E) NCP-specific IgG ratios post-infection and 3 months, 6 months and 1 year thereafter; red lines indicate positive cut-off values, negative cut-off for NCP IgG. F) GM & 95% CI of NT₅₀ titers, Mean & 95% CI of S1-specific IgG and % inhibition in sVNT. **Abbr.:** BAU, binding antibody units; CI, confidence interval; GM, Geometric Mean; NT₅₀, reciprocal sample dilution resulting in 50% virus neutralization; NCP, nucleocapsid protein; RBD, SARS-CoV-2 receptor binding domain; S1, SARS-CoV-2 Spike protein 1; sVNT, surrogate-virus neutralization test.

In order to define a threshold for the persistence of SARS-CoV-2-specific Abs, we correlated the results from three months and one year post-infection. Importantly, NT₅₀ titers >1:10 at three months after infection remained stable for one year ($r=0.861$, $p=0.0006$; Fig.2 A). Regarding S1-specific IgGs, levels >60 BAU/ml also showed robust maintenance up to one year ($r=0.846$, $p=0.0009$; Fig.2 B).

Figure 2 A, B: Relationship between log transformed Ab concentrations measured 3 months and 1 year post infection for A) NT₅₀ titers 1:x ($r_s = 0.861$, $p=0.0006$), and B) S1-specific IgG in BAU/ml ($r_s = 0.846$, $p=0.0009$). Grey lines indicate negative cut-off, red lines indicate potential thresholds for persistence after 3 months, and green lines indicate retained Ab concentrations after 1 year.

The decline kinetics of infection-induced Abs (as also known for vaccine-induced Abs) are best described by two-component models (2-5). The first component, starting after maximum Ab levels are reached a few weeks after completed vaccination or resolved symptoms, is an initial fast decline. The second component starts after a few months and is slowly declining (Fig. 1 F). We applied such a model for the Abs measured with different assays, and observed a strong correlation of NT₅₀ titers with S1-specific IgG and sVNT results for both the fast and slow decline component (NT₅₀, S1 IgG: fast component: $r=0.596$, $p=0.041$; slow component: $r=0.571$, $p=0.047$; NT₅₀, sVNT: fast component: $r=0.700$, $p=0.011$; slow component: $r=0.691$, $p=0.013$). Decline kinetics of NCP IgG ratios were similar, while RBD-specific Ab ratios showed a different pattern with further increase up to 3 months in most subjects and then slight decline within one year.

Investigating the persistence of SARS-CoV-2 immunity on cellular level, we observed a clear positive correlation of NT₅₀ titers, S1-specific IgG and circulating S1-specific memory B-cells one year after infection. In contrast, S1-specific IFN- γ and IL-2 levels upon PBMC re-stimulation were higher in

subjects with lower Ab levels und fewer B memory cells, which did not apply for the NCP-specific cytokines (Table 1).

Subject Nr.	age range /years	gender	BAU/ml (1y)	NT_50 1:x (1y)	B cells (% of lymphos)	B-memory cells (% of B cells)	% S1-specific B memory	S1- & NCP-specific IL-2 (pg/ml) vs. baseline			S1- & NCP-specific IFN-γ (pg/ml) vs. baseline		
5	45-50	m	54.9	66	7.1	25.2	0.30	34	31	2	17	15	7
8	50-55	m	59.1	66	6.7	18.5	0.41	27	10	1	13	10	6
10	30-35	m	103.0	85	11.8	14.1	0.79	8	12	0	12	12	6
12	50-55	f	55.4	55	8.1	12.9	0.36	56	18	1	43	13	3
naive	40-45	m	--	--	4.2	25.9	0.01						

Table 1: S1-specific IgG in BAU/ml, NT₅₀ titers and respective percentages of B-cells, B memory cells and S1-specific B memory cells quantified by flow-cytometry for four COVID convalescent subjects and one SARS-CoV-2 naïve control. S1- and NCP-specific IL-2 and IFN-γ concentrations (in pg/ml vs. baseline) measured by Luminex technology in supernatants of re-stimulated PBMC cultures (24h).

Discussion:

In order to determine for how long SARS-CoV-2-specific Abs are actually maintained, this study shows that measurement of Ab levels between 3 and 6 months after infection is crucial to assess Ab persistence, which is determined by both maximal initial Ab concentrations and decline kinetics. Also others report that SARS-CoV-2-specific immune parameters, e. g. RBD-specific Abs, their neutralizing activity and RBD-specific memory B-cells remain rather stable between 6 and 12 months after infection (6,7), but persistence has not been linked to NT₅₀ and S1-specific IgG decline kinetics and/or threshold.

We here propose S1-specific IgG concentrations of 60 BAU/ml three months post-infection as a potential threshold to predict maintenance of neutralizing Ab levels for one year. S1-specific IgG (in BAU) determined by ELISA are more accessible than NT assay results and might thus be more suitable for routine measurements (8). We further show that the frequency of persisting S1-specific B memory cells correlated with the level of maintained Abs in recovered subjects. A recent publication described a clear correlation between post infection memory B cells and subsequent vaccine induced antibody levels (9), indicating an immunological booster response originating from the previously established memory B cells.

Ab-mediated virus neutralization is not the only mechanism of protection against SARS-CoV-2 infection and T-cell immunity in convalescent COVID-19 patients has been shown to maintain for 180 days despite varying kinetics of the neutralizing Ab responses (e. g. slow/rapid waning or persistence) (10). Our data indicate that also one year after infection Abs are not necessarily accompanied by antigen-specific T cell recall responses, as more S1-specific T-cell proliferation (IL-2) was present in subjects retaining lower Ab levels.

Taken together, our data suggest that a threshold of Ab levels can be identified three months after (even) mild infection predicating persistence of SARS-CoV-2 specific Ab levels up to one year. Several mathematical models show that NT titers and S1 IgG binding Abs correlate with protective vaccine efficacy as well as that vaccine-induced Abs decline at similar rates as those following infection (11)

(12). Thus, our identified threshold might be helpful in assessing protection after vaccination, in particular as long as no valid correlate of protection has been identified in vaccine trials.

Materials & Methods:

Ab measurements:

SARS-CoV-2 neutralization test (NT) assay was performed as previously described (13). **Anti-SARS-CoV-2-QuantiVac-ELISA (IgG)**, **SARS-CoV-2-NeutralISA surrogate virus neutralization test (sVNT)** and **SARS-CoV-2 NCP-specific IgG ELISA**, all obtained from Euroimmune®, Euroimmun Medizinische Labordiagnostik AG (Lübeck, Germany) were carried out according to the manufacturer's instructions. **SARS-CoV-2 RBD-specific Abs** were determined with commercial ELISA for total Abs (Beijing Wantai Biological Pharmacy Enterprise, Beijing, China) according to manufacturer's instructions.

For detailed information on **SARS-CoV-2-specific Ab detection, quantification of S1-specific B memory cells, S1-specific re-stimulation of PBMC and cytokine measurements** see Supplementary Information.

Author contributions:

UW, HS, AW, EH, TRK, and EGS designed research; EGS, AR, AS and MRF performed research; VG, JBH, RK and PM contributed new analytic tools; EGS and MK analyzed data; and EGS, MK and UW wrote the paper.

Acknowledgements:

We would like to thank Sylvia Rudolf and Clemens Burtscher, MD (both Health Center Erste Bank, Erste Bank, Vienna, Austria), as well as Ines Zwazl (BSc), Maria Orola (MSc), Santino Posch, all associated with the Institute of Specific Prophylaxis and Tropical Medicine, Medical University of Vienna, and Vanessa Maurer (BSc), Tatjana Matschi (BSc), Karin Schoiswohl (BSc), Barbara Schaar (BSc) and Andrea Wendl (BSc), all associated with the Institute for Hygiene and Applied Immunology, Medical University of Vienna, for their excellent administrative and technical support.

SARS-CoV-2 was sourced via EVAg (supported by the European Community) and kindly provided by Christian Drosten and Victor Corman (Charité Universitätsmedizin, Institute of Virology, Berlin, Germany).

The study received funding from the Austrian Federal Ministry of Education, Science and Research within the research framework in relation to the coronavirus disease 2019 pandemic (GZ 20200225 104).

References:

1. Angelika Wagner AG, Johanna Ruff, Joanna Jasinska, Ute Scheikl, Ines Zwazl, Michael Kundi, Hannes Stockinger, Maria R. Farcet, Thomas R. Kreil, Eva Hoeltl & Ursula Wiedermann. Neutralising SARS-CoV-2 RBD-specific antibodies persist for at least six months independently of symptoms in adults. *Communications Medicine* 2021 doi <https://doi.org/10.1038/s43856-021-00012-4>.
2. Wiedermann G, Kundi M, Ambrosch F, Safary A, D'Hondt E, Delem A. Inactivated hepatitis A vaccine: long-term antibody persistence. *Vaccine* 1997;**15**(6-7):612-5 doi 10.1016/s0264-410x(96)00242-3.
3. Paulke-Korinek M, Kollaritsch H, Kundi M, Zwazl I, Seidl-Friedrich C, Jelinek T. Persistence of antibodies six years after booster vaccination with inactivated vaccine against Japanese encephalitis. *Vaccine* 2015;**33**(30):3600-4 doi 10.1016/j.vaccine.2015.05.037.
4. Van Damme P, Leroux-Roels G, Suryakiran P, Folschweiller N, Van Der Meeren O. Persistence of antibodies 20 y after vaccination with a combined hepatitis A and B vaccine. *Human vaccines & immunotherapeutics* 2017;**13**(5):972-80 doi 10.1080/21645515.2016.1274473.
5. Chappuis F, Farinelli T, Deckx H, Sarnecki M, Go O, Salzgeber Y, *et al.* Immunogenicity and estimation of antibody persistence following vaccination with an inactivated virosomal hepatitis A vaccine in adults: A 20-year follow-up study. *Vaccine* 2017;**35**(10):1448-54 doi 10.1016/j.vaccine.2017.01.031.
6. Wang Z, Muecksch F, Schaefer-Babajew D, Finkin S, Viant C, Gaebler C, *et al.* Naturally enhanced neutralizing breadth against SARS-CoV-2 one year after infection. *Nature* 2021 doi 10.1038/s41586-021-03696-9.
7. Gallais F, Gantner P, Bruel T, Velay A, Planas D, Wendling MJ, *et al.* Evolution of antibody responses up to 13 months after SARS-CoV-2 infection and risk of reinfection. *EBioMedicine* 2021;**71**:103561 doi 10.1016/j.ebiom.2021.103561.
8. Krammer F. A correlate of protection for SARS-CoV-2 vaccines is urgently needed. *Nature medicine* 2021 doi 10.1038/s41591-021-01432-4.
9. Goel RR, Apostolidis SA, Painter MM, Mathew D, Pattekar A, Kuthuru O, *et al.* Longitudinal Analysis Reveals Distinct Antibody and Memory B Cell Responses in SARS-CoV2 Naive and Recovered Individuals Following mRNA Vaccination. *medRxiv : the preprint server for health sciences* 2021 doi 10.1101/2021.03.03.21252872.
10. Chia WN, Zhu F, Ong SWX, Young BE, Fong SW, Le Bert N, *et al.* Dynamics of SARS-CoV-2 neutralising antibody responses and duration of immunity: a longitudinal study. *The Lancet Microbe* 2021;**2**(6):e240-e9 doi 10.1016/S2666-5247(21)00025-2.
11. Khoury DS, Cromer D, Reynaldi A, Schlub TE, Wheatley AK, Juno JA, *et al.* Neutralizing antibody levels are highly predictive of immune protection from symptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infection. *Nature medicine* 2021 doi 10.1038/s41591-021-01377-8.
12. Earle KA, Ambrosino DM, Fiore-Gartland A, Goldblatt D, Gilbert PB, Siber GR, *et al.* Evidence for antibody as a protective correlate for COVID-19 vaccines. *Vaccine* 2021;**39**(32):4423-8 doi 10.1016/j.vaccine.2021.05.063.
13. Schwaiger J, Karbiener M, Aberham C, Farcet MR, Kreil TR. No SARS-CoV-2 Neutralization by Intravenous Immunoglobulins Produced From Plasma Collected Before the 2020 Pandemic. *The Journal of infectious diseases* 2020;**222**(12):1960-4 doi 10.1093/infdis/jiaa593.