Implicit, Intrinsic, Extrinsic (or Environmental), and Host Factors Attributing the Covid-19 Pandemic. Part 2- Implicit Factor Pesticide Use: A Systematic Analysis

Ananya Aggarwal, Ragini Rai, Gaurav Joshi and Prashant Gahtori^{*}, 0000-0002-2944-7856

School of Pharmacy, Graphic Era Hill University, Dehradun 248002, India

^{*}corresponding author: pgahtori@gehu.ac.in

Abstract

Advances in our understanding of complex COVID-19 pandemic would allow us to effectively eliminate and eradicate SARS-COV2 virus. Although tremendous amount of research devoted to the robustness across its biology, diagnostics, vaccines and treatment has exploded in the past two years. However, still science do not have robust answers for causes, for example (i) What are the reasons of non-uniform global distribution of COVID-19? (ii) Why the United States, India, and Brazil, are the first-three most affected nations?, (iii) How did Bhutan, a nation sharing a boundary with China manage nearly 0.34% infections and 3 deaths from COVID-19? Nonetheless, the biomass bistribution of biosphere report suggest more than 1550-fold larger microbial biomass involving bacteria, fungi, archaea, protists and viruses is exist in comparision to all global human population in the biosphere. The rich microbiota act a first line of defence to invade pathogens and affect us both through the environment and microbiome. Unfortunately, a role of pathogen-transmission factors *viz.* implicit factors (competitive microflora) is still under represented. This study is an attempt from a gold standard correlation methodology using a large pesticide use global data. The non-specific pesticides kill both pests as well as protective microbiota, resulting a loss in rich biodiversity and allow easy pathogen entry to human. Entire predictions were found consistent with the recently observed evidences. These insights enhanced scientific ability to interrogate viral epidemiology and recommended to limit pesticide use for future pandemic prevention.

Introduction

The origin of life on earth is a natural process ranging from non-living microorganisms (viruses and viroids) to living micro-/macro- organisms (bacteria, archaea, fungi, protists, plants, animals and humans). The microorganisms are found almost in every habitat present in nature and their coexistence with the environment determines the health of the entire ecological system of earth [1]. Soil is an important habitat for both bacteria and cyanobacteria due to an abundance of organic carbon on earth. The robustness of prokaryotic life in the deeper soil subsurface below 8 m, is also enormous (10^3 – 10^6 cells/cm³), and biomass of prokaryotes are detected even at higher altitudes 57–77 km. Airborne prokaryotes also represent a large fraction with 5×10^{19} cfu[2]. The average microbial density on earth is approximately 10^8 microbes/ml, which showed inseparable interactions between humans and microbes everywhere on the planet. Particularly, the human itself contains trillions microbiome in a surprising ratio of 10:1 with human cells. A huge number of a total of 10^{30} prokaryotes exist on earth, out of about 1400 (negligible $1.4 \times 10^{-25}\%$) microbial species are recognized as human pathogens[3]. Interestingly, a report of the biomass distribution of large Biosphere suggests though large, human population 0.06 gigatons of carbon (Gt C), is still negligible in comparison to bacteria 70 Gt C, fungi 12 Gt C, archaea 7 Gt C, protists 4 Gt C and viruses 0.2 Gt C [4]. Hence, a large number of ecological communities of microorganisms, so-called microbiota with a high level of adaptation and evolution, exist in the environment which protects humans from pathogenic microorganisms and toxins. Unfortunately, human activities over the years via antibiotics, agri-/industrial chemicals, and lifestyle have significantly altered biodiversity[5]. In fact, several times warnings to humanity from leading global scientists including Nobel laureates are well documented[6-9]. The scientific report also highlighted 58% of the earth's land coverage already falls below safe level[10] and merely ten months old UN report stipulates up to 1million species are at risk of annihilation[11]. Thus, a well-balanced ecosystem products/services usually reduce pathogen transmission, and several studies suggest new virus infections may be a result of loss in biodiversity[12-14].

The modelling of infectious disease dynamics remains the ideal research design and it is essential to identify the key factors responsible for any communicable disease transmission in population level. The epidemiological model usually improves the scientific ability by two-fold: (i) to interrogate viral epidemiology, and (ii) to run counter operations for moving forward all with more accuracy, precision, and reliability. Previous studies also suggest the importance of four crucial transmission factors for any microbial infections, such as (i) intrinsic factors (related to direct food supply to microorganism, for example, nutrient content); (ii) extrinsic or environment factors (external to the food, for example, temperature); (iii) implicit factors (competitive microflora); and (iv) host factors (for the spread of disease, for example, malnutrition)[15,16].

The rising population has significantly impacted the human activities, and we assume fertilizer consumption/nitrous oxide emissions- which itself supplies nutrients, and non-specific pesticides- itself inhibits microflora, could be a part of intrinsic-and implicit- factors respectively. The COVID-19 disease caused by novel corona (SARS-COV2) virus has posed serious health challenges with enormous morbidity and mortality across the world. Till date of writing this report COVID-19 has claimed a total of 185.29153 million confirmed cases and the mortality is again on constant surge with each passing day. With enough scientific evidences reported till date top ten COVID-19 affected countries with cumulative total cases, (i) United States of America (33451965), (ii) India (30752950), (iii) Brazil (18909037), (iv) Russian Federation (5733218), (v) France (5686066), (vi) Turkey (5465094), (vii) The United Kingdom (5022897), (viii) Argentina (4593763), (ix) Colombia (4426811) and (x) Italy (4267105) [17]. The knowledge gap insists us to explore role of key factors over COVID-19 progression as an ideal model system. Hence, a wider sampling and subsequent data analysis of current COVID-19 infectious cases with Pesticides including Fungicides and Bactericides, Insecticides, and Rodenticides use countrywise were envisaged in understanding the epidemiology of COVID-19 and create an unprecedented opportunity for COVID-19 prevention in restoring good quality of life.

Methods

All COVID-19 infectious cases were collected from five WHO situation reports- dated from 11-Jul-2021 to 28-Mar-2020[17]. The data pertaining to pesticide use countries/ territories- wise was free to use and supplied by the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) [18]. Here, the Countries/ Territories with missing entries were omitted, and 98 countries randomly fitted to top variable indices of correlation coefficient for unbiased cause-effect relationships.

Results and Discussion

There is considerable evidence that intrinsic, extrinsic (or environment), implicit, and host factors are key regulators for pathogen transmissions. In this study, we have observed a total pesticide use was optimally correlated with the number of COVID-19 infected cases, as appeared on March 13th ($r^2=0.93$), 19th ($r^2=0.86$), and 28th ($r^2=0.57$), 2020 (Table 1). Later on consistent correlation ($0.51 \leq r^2 \leq 0.54$) was seen in case of a total fungicides and bactericides from last one year i.e. March 28th, 2020 to July 09th, 2021 with a very weak standard error value 0.02. From December 22th, 2020 a high correlation was witnessed in case of a total insecticides use with r^2 value ranges from 0.80 to 0.83. The United States of America, Brazil, Thailand, and India are among top four insecticides consumer countries and currently United States of America, India, and Brazil are top three COVID-19 affected nations. Other hand, as per FAO report Bhutan do not utilize insecticides and Brunei Darussalam, consumed very limited insecticides, a total of 1 and 3 tonnes only. Both Bhutan, and Brunei Darussalam are among top two least COVID-19 affected nations. These real evidences are advised the direct role of pesticides use on increasing COVID-19 infected cases.

Table 1. Cumulative COVID-19 Infected Cases and Pesticides Consumption Worldwide

	Country/ Territory/Area	CUMULATIVE COVID-19 INFECTED CASES					Total Pesticides (Tonnes)	Total Fungicides and Bactericides (Tonnes)	Total Insecticides (Tonnes)	Total Rodenticides (Tonnes)
		09-Jul- 21	22-Dec- 20	13-Mar- 20	19-Mar- 20	28-Mar- 20				
1	Albania	132565	52542	23	59	197	442	199	119	36
2	Algeria	143652	94781	25	72	367	6067	1577	367	
3	Argentina	4593763	1531374	31	79	589	172928	3427	3747	0
4	Armenia	226135	153825	1	84	372	581	302	143	17
5	Australia	30905	28128	140	510	3635	63416	4544	14196	
6	Austria	647111	334629	361	1646	7697	5295	2272	1596	0
7	Azerbaijan	336788	199127	11	34	147	543	276	169	7
8	Bahrain	266797	90062	195	256	473	9	1	5	1
9	Bangladesh	1000543	499560	3	10	48	15144	11758	2184	7
10	Belarus	424554	171579	12	46	94	3786	954	91	
11	Belgium	1092477	625928	314	1486	7284	6637	2458	478	0
12	Bhutan	2258	446	1	1	3	4	3	0	0
13	Bolivia	449687	149149	3	12	61	14758	3364	2619	120
14	Brazil	18909037	7162978	77	291	2915	377176	59124	60607	
15	Brunei Darussalam	266	152	12	56	115	21	2	1	0
16	Bulgaria	422353	191029	7	92	293	5067	1817	601	0
17	Burkina Faso	13505	4954	2	26	146	843	0	186	0
18	Cameroon	80858	25849	2	10	75	1373	705	243	1
19	Canada	1418632	495346	138	569	4018	90839	9066	5116	
20	Chile	1579591	583354	33	238	1610	9831	4424	1436	0
21	China	119141	95716	80991	81174	82230	1773689			
22	Colombia	4426811	1482072	9	93	491	37773	7214	5188	0
23	Costa Rica	377091	157472	22	50	231	12811	5871	2101	0
24	Cote d Ivoire	48693	21772	1	9	92	93	8	75	0

25	Croatia	360680	194962	16	81	586	1676	752	127	0
26	Cyprus	81581	17476	6	58	162	1141	824	155	0
27	Czechia	1668891	624140	116	522	2279	4092	1319	236	4
28	Denmark	297543	131606	674	1044	2046	2629	438	46	0
29	Dominican Republic	331826	159064	5	21	581	7070	2525	972	80
30	Ecuador	465878	205920	17	155	1595	60733	21329	10346	0
31	Egypt	282582	124891	67	196	536	8044	3599	3199	0
32	Estonia	131396	21794	13	258	575	636	107	29	0
33	Finland	97651	32582	109	359	1025	1073	0	22	0
34	France	5686066	2418439	2860	9043	32542	85072	39112	6180	0
35	French Polynesia	19026	16182	1	3	30	27	3	6	0
36	Georgia	374836	208638	25	38	85	2237	1516	305	20
37	Germany	3734468	1494009	2369	8198	48582	44948	11687	16125	5
38	Greece	433021	130485	98	418	966	9932	2014	2258	1327
39	Guyana	20645	6076	1	4	8	359	13	52	0
40	Honduras	270689	116212	2	9	67	7195	758	102	0
41	Hungary	808437	302989	16	58	343	8539	3535	793	0
42	Iceland	6675	5621	61	250	890	2	0	0	0
43	India	30752950	10031223	74	151	724	58160	13055	20619	0
44	Indonesia	2455912	657948	34	227	1046	1597	224	929	53
45	Iran	3327526	1152072	10075	17361	32332	6841	1100	1756	5
46	Iraq	1406289	583118	70	164	458	215	12	85	3
47	Ireland	276104	78776	70	292	2121	2625	602	29	0
48	Israel	845123	371373	75	427	3460	6093	2843	525	0
49	Italy	4267105	1938083	15113	35713	86498	54153	31398	10464	454
50	Jamaica	50497	12135	1	13	26	621	177	204	15
51	Japan	813976	195880	675	873	1499	52332	21461	17125	3
52	Jordan	754927	272797	1	52	235	675	216	391	0
53	Kuwait	369227	147775	80	142	235	32	4	14	12
54	Latvia	137797	30297	16	71	280	1568	213	36	0
55	Lebanon	546366	156570	66	133	391	1816	988	255	39

56	Lithuania	279024	112359	3	26	358	2049	677	57	0
57	Luxembourg	71879	44067	17	210	1605	148	76	24	0
58	Malaysia	808658	91969	129	673	2161	44115	3021	3547	94
59	Maldives	74848	13474	8	13	13	363	51	279	30
60	Malta	30851	11621	9	48	139	89	83	3	0
61	Mexico	2558369	1301546	12	93	589	53144	28601	12991	7
62	Mongolia	131962	953	1	5	12	116	10	5	
63	Morocco	537253	415226	6	49	358	13697	3965	7775	295
64	Nepal	652859	253184	1	1	3	574	247	181	11
65	Netherlands	1701911	676589	614	2051	8603	9309	4288	254	0
66	New Zealand	2409	1760	5	20	416	5086	1296	303	0
67	North Macedonia	155760	77949	7	36	219	98	60	27	
68	Norway	132572	42775	489	1423	3581	614	83	13	22
69	Oman	281688	127019	18	33	152	204	29	112	0
70	Pakistan	967633	454673	20	241	1235	1	0	0	
71	Panama	411226	206310	14	86	674	2403	551	160	0
72	Paraguay	432801	98296	5	11	52	19662	4539	2834	0
73	Peru	2071637	993760	22	145	580	4800	1189	705	15
74	Philippines	1455585	458044	52	187	803	12595	4463	1100	14
75	Poland	2880670	1202700	49	287	1389	22742	7992	1770	0
76	Portugal	899295	370787	41	642	4268	8172	4183	2084	0
77	Qatar	222918	141858	262	442	562	68	8	60	
78	Republic of Korea	165344	49665	7979	8413	9478	18716	5576	5674	
79	Republic of Moldova	257272	134578	4	36	199	2853	1317	391	1
80	Réunion	31845	8704	3	12	135	5141	1760	641	
81	Russian Federation	5733218	2848377	34	147	1264	76369	26164	10198	253
82	Saudi Arabia	497773	360848	21	238	1104	5413	2011	3131	0
83	Senegal	44790	17670	10	36	119	479	20	85	2
84	Slovakia	391813	151336	21	105	295	1786	469	137	1
85	Slovenia	257619	105013	57	286	632	1172	849	55	0

[illegible]

Pests, pathogens, and weeds pose a major challenge to agricultural production, and pesticides are widely used to ensure food security across the world. However, the toxicological effects of pesticides on the human health is subjected to many reviews via multiple pathways involving food, drinking water, residential, occupational [19-21]. At this moment COVID-19 outbreak is resulting more than 250 plus global fatality every hour in human affairs and its counter response is weak in many countries. Outcome from our unbiased scientific data analysis reveal the use of pesticides has appeared as the third most contributor (10.80%) in case of COVID-19 incidences.

A report by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) suggests that China is the world's largest consumer of agricultural chemicals and country, which alone uses more than 30% of global fertilizers/ pesticides in 9% of global cropland to fulfill the high food demands. Second pesticides consumer United States, and third, Brazil, today as on 09-July-2021 are with first-three largest COVID-19 infected cases 33451965, and 18909037 respectively. Further 4th pesticide consumer country, Argentina supports for a high 4593763 cases, in our opinion country Argentina is at a high COVID-19 risk during the writing of this paper. Another leading pesticide consumers Canada(5th), Ukraine(6th), France (7th) etc. are currently with high outbreaks of COVID-19. On the other hand, wholly organic Bhutan reports just 2258 COVID-19 infected individuals and most of them are imported cases only. In India, the largest pesticide consumer state Maharashtra as of July 11th, 2021 is with the highest 117270 total active COVID-19 cases, whereas wholly organic Indian state Sikkim is with a low number of 2244 cases. Countries with high population density including Pakistan, Bangladesh, Nigeria, etc. are not that much affected as leading pesticide consumers, provides further evidence to redefine multifactorial approach in COVID-19. A handful of healthy soil comprised of millions of ecological communities of microbes (microbiota), also regarded as a protective shield against pathogen invasion.

Figure 1. Mechanism of Pesticide Use over COVID-19 progression

Pesticides are non-specific=> inevitably use kills both pests as well as protective microbiota in the surrounding soil, and water sources => a loss in biodiversity (Fig. 1). Thus, a lower amount of pesticide consumption-led drop in COVID-19 cases and vice-versa. Nonetheless, pesticides sold in Africa is less than 4% of global pesticide trade and African continent is noticeable with low COVID-19 infected cases all over. Overall, a scientific dose-response relationship is fitting well for pesticide consumption and active COVID-19 cases. Therefore, it could be easily postulated that the generous use of pesticides might be responsible to trigger the high transmissibility of the SARS-CoV-2 virus.

In fact, two researchers, Lusk and Chandra highlighted during the beginning of COVID-19 (from March 1, 2020, to March 31, 2021), a reduction in agricultural output by about \$309 million in the United States, all due to a reduction in labor availability[22]. The study also found that the average incidence and death incidence rate in farmers/farmworkers amounted to 9.32 % and 0.17% respectively. Both average incidence and death incidence rates were raised as high as about 3-fold in farmers/ farm workers in comparison to other normal individuals. Unfortunately, the cause of high COVID-19 outbreaks in farmers/farmworkers remains unpredictable. This evidence clearly suggests that farmers/ farm workers working near pesticide agricultural places are potentially at a very high risk for contracting COVID-19.

The use of household insecticides in form of spray-cans, oil-sprays, mosquito coils and vaporizing systems are widely used to kill cockroaches, mosquitoes, bedbugs, beetles, ants etc. With increased urbanization and awareness of home pest control methods all over, for instance, New York US, Bergamo Italy, Community of Madrid Spain, New Delhi India, Sao Paulo Brazil etc. have become favorable for insecticide consumption. These places have already become epicenter of COVID-19 outbreaks.

The SARS-COV2 virus is continually mutating and this natural evolution led increased transmissibility, virulence, and resistance to antibody neutralization poses. Recently as on 14-Jun-2021, eight variants of interest *viz.* α , β , γ , δ , η , ι , κ , and λ are listed by the WHO successfully [23]. SARS-CoV-2 virus contains the genetic element s2m and as reported by the Tengs and coworkers, recently xenologue of s2m was found in a large number of insect species [24]. As a result, the earlier record of a total pesticides is recently shifted to insecticide use in this report.

Undoubtedly, microbiota represents the first line of defense and protection against pathogens. For instance, presence of commensal microbiome in human skin offers temperature regulation, ultraviolet (UV) radiation protection, vitamin D production, and most importantly, keeping pathogenic microbes outside the body. The pesticides are non-specific and its indiscriminate use leads to the degradation of useful microbiota. Which may likely to increase the harmful pathogen entry in human. Recent finding with high correlation values are in full agreement that local insecticide consumer sites may likely to increase the high transmissibility of the SARS-CoV-2 virus.

Formal education and counseling of farmers and other stake-holders on pesticide use are urgently needed. Conscious monitoring of pesticide use worldwide (For harmonious coexistence of micro-/macro- organisms in nature). In line with modern science multi-factorial approach, this study is endorsing nature's role in direct pathogen invasion and to limit the transmission of SARS-COV-2 pathogen. Thus, similar approach help researchers think undoubtedly about the causation of COVID-19 disease. We hope these insights presented above along with disease reduction framework will be a game-changer in fighting against the COVID-19 pandemic.

Acknowledgements

The authors are thankful to the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) for keeping data free to use. The authors are also thankful to the GEHU India for providing necessary facilities and technical support.

Disclosure statement

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

Author contributions

AA and RR collected and verified data. PG designed and GJ analyzed the data. PG drafted the manuscript. All authors critically revised the manuscript and approved the final version for submission.

References

1. Malmstrom, C., 2010. Ecologists study the interactions of organisms and their environment. *Nature Education Knowledge*, 3(10), p.88.
2. Whitman, W.B., Coleman, D.C. and Wiebe, W.J., 1998. Prokaryotes: the unseen majority. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 95(12), pp.6578-6583.
3. Flandroy, L., Pouthaidis, T., Berg, G., Clarke, G., Dao, M.C., Decaestecker, E., Furman, E., Haahtela, T., Massart, S., Plovier, H. and Sanz, Y., 2018. The impact of human activities and lifestyles on the interlinked microbiota and health of humans and of ecosystems. *Science of the total environment*, 627, pp.1018-1038.
4. Bar-On, Y.M., Phillips, R. and Milo, R., 2018. The biomass distribution on Earth. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 115(25), pp.6506-6511.
5. Maier, L. and Hardt, W.D., 2013. 'Blooming' in the gut: how dysbiosis might contribute to pathogen evolution. *Nature Reviews Microbiology*, 11(4), pp.277-284.
6. UNION OC. World scientists' warning to humanity. Cambridge MA, November 1992:8.
7. Ripple, W.J., Wolf, C., Newsome, T.M., Galetti, M., Alamgir, M., Crist, E., Mahmoud, M.I., Laurance, W.F. and 15,364 Scientist Signatories from 184 Countries, 2017. World scientists' warning to humanity: a second notice. *BioScience*, 67(12), pp.1026-1028.
8. Cardoso, P., Barton, P.S., Birkhofer, K., Chichorro, F., Deacon, C., Fartmann, T., Fukushima, C.S., Gaigher, R., Habel, J.C., Hallmann, C.A. and Hill, M.J., 2020. Scientists' warning to humanity on insect extinctions. *Biological Conservation*, 242, p.108426.
9. Cavicchioli, R., Ripple, W.J., Timmis, K.N., Azam, F., Bakken, L.R., Baylis, M., Behrenfeld, M.J., Boetius, A., Boyd, P.W., Classen, A.T. and Crowther, T.W., 2019. Scientists' warning to humanity: microorganisms and climate change. *Nature Reviews Microbiology*, 17(9), pp.569-586.
10. Steffen, W., Richardson, K., Rockström, J., Cornell, S.E., Fetzer, I., Bennett, E.M., Biggs, R., Carpenter, S.R., De Vries, W., De Wit, C.A. and Folke, C., 2015. Planetary boundaries: Guiding human development on a changing planet. *Science*, 347(6223).
11. UN Report <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/blog/2019/05/nature-decline-unprecedented-report/> Retrieved on 10-Mar-2020.
12. Keesing, F., Belden, L.K., Daszak, P., Dobson, A., Harvell, C.D., Holt, R.D., Hudson, P., Jolles, A., Jones, K.E., Mitchell, C.E. and Myers, S.S., 2010. Impacts of biodiversity on the emergence and transmission of infectious diseases. *Nature*, 468(7324), pp.647-652.
13. Ostfeld, R.S., 2017. Biodiversity loss and the ecology of infectious disease. *The Lancet Planetary Health*, 1(1), pp.e2-e3.
14. Pongsiri, M.J., Roman, J., Ezenwa, V.O., Goldberg, T.L., Koren, H.S., Newbold, S.C., Ostfeld, R.S., Pattanayak, S.K. and Salkeld, D.J., 2009. Biodiversity loss affects global disease ecology. *Bioscience*, 59(11), pp.945-954.
15. Wareing, P., 2010. Factors affecting the growth of micro-organisms in foods. In *Micro-facts* (pp. 1-7).
16. Holmstrom, A.J., 2004. The effects of the media on body image: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 48(2), pp.196-217.
17. WHO Situation report - 148 Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) 16 Jun 2020 https://www.who.int/docs/default-source/coronaviruse/situation-reports/20200616-covid-19-sitrep-148-draft.pdf?sfvrsn=9b2015e9_2 Retrieved on 16-Jun-2020
18. Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) report <http://www.fao.org/faostat/en/#data/RP> Retrieved on 20-Jun-2020
19. Jeyaratnam, J., 1985. Health problems of pesticide usage in the Third World. *British journal of industrial medicine*, 42(8), p.505.
20. Hernández, A.F., Parrón, T., Tsatsakis, A.M., Requena, M., Alarcón, R. and López-Guarnido, O., 2013. Toxic effects of pesticide mixtures at a molecular level: their relevance to human health. *Toxicology*, 307, pp.136-145.
21. Whitworth, J., 2020. COVID-19: a fast evolving pandemic. *Transactions of The Royal Society of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene*, 114(4), p.241.
22. Lusk, J.L. and Chandra, R., 2021. Farmer and farm worker illnesses and deaths from COVID-19 and impacts on agricultural output. *Plos one*, 16(4), p.e0250621
23. Adapted from <https://www.who.int/en/activities/tracking-SARS-CoV-2-variants/> assessed on 11-July-2021
24. Tengs, T., Delwiche, C.F. and Monceyron Jonassen, C., 2021. A genetic element in the SARS-CoV-2 genome is shared with multiple insect species. *Journal of General Virology*, 102(3), p.001551.