Dietary and other risk factors for cardiovascular disease analysed with Global Burden of Disease worldwide cohorts: lipid hypothesis versus fat-soluble vitamin hypothesis

David K Cundiff (0000-0002-3206-9665), independent researcher,^{1,3} Chunyi Wu (0000-0002-2186-3433), Research Epidemiologist/Statistician,^{2,3}

¹ Long Beach, California, USA

² Area Specialist Lead in Epidemiology and Statistics, Michigan Medicine, Ann Arbor, Michigan, USA

³ Volunteer collaborators with the Institute of Health Metrics and Evaluation, Seattle, Washington, USA

Correspondence to David K Cundiff davidkcundiff@gmail.com

Phone: 1-562-438-8805

Address: 333 Orizaba Ave. Long Beach, CA. 90814

Word count: abstract 311, Text: 4343

Research in context

Evidence before this study

Relating to dietary and other risk factors for early death from cardiovascular diseases worldwide, the EAT-Lancet Commission proposed the “Planetary Health Diet” to reduce non-communicable diseases and mitigate climate change. The Planetary Health Diet has been controversial and did not achieve the goal of leading a worldwide “Great Food Transformation” towards a more plant-based diet. The comparative risk assessment (CRA) systematic literature review-based methodology used in drafting the Planetary Health Diet has no significant competitors as published methodologies used to parse health effects of worldwide dietary and other risk factors. No consensus exists about an optimal range of diets for optimum human health, including cardiovascular disease prevention/treatment.

Added value of this study

Cardiovascular disease deaths/100k/year in 15-69-year-old males and females (CVD) worldwide correlated with dietary risk factors had two patterns based on the amounts of kilocalories/day (Kcal/day) of animal foods and added fats. We differentiated the two patterns by defining a “fat-soluble vitamin variable” Kcal/day (FSVV=processed meat + red meat + fish + milk + poultry + eggs + (added saturated fatty acids (SFA)+polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFA)+trans fatty acids (TFA)) * 0.46 (all in Kcal/day). Worldwide, all nine risk factors comprising FSVV correlated negatively with CVD, but in high FSVV cohorts (FSVV $\geq$ 567.27 Kcal/day), all nine risk factors in the FSVV correlated positively with CVD.

Implications of all the available evidence

Animal foods and added fats afforded significant protection from CVD worldwide. The data suggested that the fat-soluble vitamins in animal foods and added fat facilitating gut absorption

42 may have been partially or entirely responsible for the worldwide protection from CVD.
 43 However, in high FSVV intake cohorts, SFA in food and in extracted added fats facilitating
 44 atherosclerosis may have partially or entirely accounted for the positive correlation of FSVV and
 45 CVD. The findings suggest that a yet not precisely defined moderate amount of animal food and
 46 added fat intake contributed to lower cardiovascular risk relative to very high or very low
 47 intakes.

48

Abstract

Background: Debate about whether high intake of dietary saturated fatty acids (SFA) causes coronary heart disease (the lipid hypothesis) is ongoing.

Methods: Using worldwide Global Burden of Disease (GBD) data on cardiovascular disease deaths/100k/year, ages 15-69 years old in male and female cohorts (CVD) and dietary and other CVD risk factors, we formatted and population weighted data from 195 countries. The formatted rows of data (n=7846 cohorts) each represented about 1 million people, totaling about 7.8 billion people in 2020. We correlated CVD with dietary and other risk factors worldwide and in appropriate subsets. Outcome measures included CVD versus dietary and other risk factor correlations worldwide and in subsets.

Findings: After empirical data exploration, we defined a “fat-soluble vitamin variable” Kcal/day (FSVV) as, “FSVV=processed meat + red meat + fish + milk + poultry + eggs + (SFA + polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFA) + trans fatty acids (TFA)) * 0.46 (all in Kcal/day).” Low density lipoprotein cholesterol mmol/L correlated strongly positively with FSVV worldwide ($r=0.780$, 95% CI 0.771 to 0.788, $p<0.0001$, n=7846 cohorts), so we considered FSVV our marker variable to test both the lipid hypothesis and our fat-soluble vitamin hypothesis. LDL-C correlated negatively with CVD worldwide ($r= -0.279$, 95% CI -0.299 to -0.258, $p<0.0001$ as did FSVV versus CVD ($r= -0.329$, 95% CI -0.349 to -0.309, $p<0.0001$). However, FSVV correlated positively with CVD in the highest FSVV cohorts (mean male/female FSVV ≥ 567.27 Kcal/day: $r=0.523$, 95% CI 0.476 to 0.567, $p<0.0001$, n=974 cohorts).

Interpretation: Since FSVV correlated positively with CVD only in high FSVV cohorts, the data supported the lipid hypothesis only in GBD cohorts with high FSVV intake. Since both FSVV and LDL-C correlated negatively with CVD worldwide, only the fat-soluble vitamin

72 hypothesis was supported worldwide. This GBD cohort data analysis methodology could be used
73 to help develop food policy and education strategies for improving public health.

74 **Funding:** none

75

Introduction

The scientific validity of the Dietary Guidelines for Americans for 2015-2020, including guidelines based on the lipid hypothesis, was challenged by Journalist Nina Teicholz in the *BMJ*.¹ The Center for Science in the Public Interest called for the *BMJ* to retract the article. Peer reviewers the *BMJ* selected to adjudicate the far-reaching dispute concluded that, “Teicholz’s criticisms of the methods used by Dietary Guidelines for Americans Committee are within the realm of scientific debate.”² Currently, no methodology for relating cardiovascular disease events to food intake has been generally accepted as rigorous, replicable, and scientifically valid.

This paper will use population weighted, formatted, worldwide global burden of disease (GBD) data from the Institute of Health Metrics and Evaluation (IHME) to assess the impact of diet, metabolic risk factors, tobacco use, air pollution, and other risk factors on cardiovascular disease deaths/100k/year in male and female cohorts 15-69-years-old (CVD).

We were open to the possible support of the data for the lipid hypothesis but also for our newly defined, “fat-soluble vitamin hypothesis,” which an initial exploration of the GBD data prompted. We defined it as “insufficient dietary intake of fat-soluble vitamin containing animal foods and added fat for gut absorption increases cardiovascular disease risk.” We will elaborate in the results and the discussion.

.

Methods

As volunteer collaborators with the IHME, we acquired and utilised raw GBD worldwide ecological data (GBD: 195 countries and 365 subnational locations, n=1120 male and female cohorts). Data consisted of the rate of cardiovascular disease early deaths, metabolic risk factors, dietary risk factors and covariates, and other risk factors of male and female cohorts 15-49 years old and 50-69 years old from each year 1990-2017. GBD worldwide citations of over 12,000 surveys constituting ecological data inputs for this analysis are available online from IHME.³ The main characteristics of IHME GBD data sources, the protocol for the GBD study, and all risk factor values have been published by IHME GBD data researchers and discussed elsewhere.⁴⁻⁸ These include detailed descriptions of categories of input data, potentially important biases, and the methodologies of analysis. We did not clean or pre-process any of the GBD data. GBD cohort risk factor and health outcome data from the IHME had no missing records.

Food risk factors came from surveys that IHME utilised as gram/day (g/d) consumed on average. GBD dietary covariate data originally came from Food and Agriculture Organization surveys of animal and plant food commodities available per capita in countries worldwide (potatoes, corn, rice, sweet potatoes, poultry, and eggs)—as opposed to consumed on average.⁹

Supplementary Table 1 lists the relevant GBD dietary and other risk factors, covariates, and other available variables with definitions of those risk factor exposures.⁷ Once IHME staff time constraints due to COVID-19 data collection and modeling are over, the updated GBD 2020 data

with all the variables as the GBD 2017 data that we used for this analysis may be obtained by volunteer researchers collaborating with IHME.¹⁰

Study design and population

For cardiovascular disease early deaths and all risk factors, we averaged the values for ages 15-49 years old together with 50-69 years old for each male and female cohort for each year. Finally, for each male and female cohort, data from all 28 years (1990-2017) of the means of the rate of CVD and risk factor exposures were averaged using the computer software program R. To weigh the data according to population, internet searches (mostly Wikipedia) yielded the most recent population estimates for countries and subnational states, provinces, and regions. The 1120 GBD cohorts available were population weighted by a software program in R, resulting in an analysis dataset with 7846 population weighted cohorts representing about 7.8 billion people in 2020. Each male or female cohort in the population-weighted analysis dataset represented approximately 1 million people (range: < 100,000 to 1.5 million). World population data from the World Bank or the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development could not be used because they did not include all 195 countries or any subnational data.

Supplementary Table 2 details how omega-3 fatty acid g/d was converted to fish g/d using data on the omega-3 fatty acid content of frequently eaten fish from the National Institutes of Health Office of Dietary Supplements (USA).¹¹ As shown in Supplementary Table 3, we converted all of the animal and plant food data, including alcohol and sugary beverage consumption, from g/d

to kilocalories/day (Kcal/day). For the g/d to Kcal/day conversions, we used the Nutritionix track app,¹² which tracks types and quantities of foods consumed. Saturated fatty acids (SFA: 0-1 portion of the entire diet Kcal/day) was not available with GBD 2017 data, so GBD SFA risk factor data from GBD 2016 was used. Polyunsaturated fatty acid (PUFA) and trans fatty acid (TFA) GBD risk factor data from 2017 (0-1 portion of the entire diet Kcal/day) were also utilised, but monounsaturated fat data were not available. These fatty acid data expressed as 0-1 portion of the entire diet were converted to Kcal/day by multiplying by the total Kcal/day available (a covariate from the Food and Agriculture Organization⁹) per capita for each cohort.

Outcome variable and covariates

CVD, the principal outcome variable of this analysis, was a combination variable consisting of the deaths/100k/year of male and female cohorts from (1) ischemic heart disease, (2) stroke, (3) hypertensive heart disease, (4) rheumatic heart disease, (5) non-rheumatic valvular disease, (6) subarachnoid haematoma, (7) myocarditis, (8) alcoholic cardiomyopathy, (9) endocarditis, aortic aneurysm, and (10) atrial fibrillation. Given the multiple dietary and other influences on the causation of CVD, we did not attempt to differentiate between dietary risk factors and covariates.

Statistical methods

To determine the strengths of the risk factor correlations with CVD of population weighted worldwide cohorts (n=7846 cohorts) or subgroups of cohorts (e.g., highest and lowest CVD cohorts, etc.), we utilised Pearson correlation coefficients: r , 95% confidence intervals (CIs), and p values.

To identify confounding in the univariate correlations, we used partial correlations, holding constant the suspected confounder variables.

Sensitivity analyses

We performed subset analyses on the 1000 cohorts with the lowest and highest levels of CVD.

We used SAS and SAS OnDemand for Academics software 9.4 (SAS Institute, Cary, NC) for the data analysis.

Results

Table 1 shows the 44 dietary, metabolic, and other worldwide risk factors potentially contributing to CVD (n=7846 cohorts). See Supplementary Table 1 for definitions of the risk factor and covariate variables. In Table 1, low density lipoprotein cholesterol mmol/L (LDL-C) negatively correlated with CVD worldwide ($r=-0.279$, 95% CI -0.299 to -0.258, $p<0001$), meaning the higher the LDL-C the lower the CVD. Figure 1 gives the worldwide plot of LDL-C versus CVD, showing widely scattered data points with a negative slope of the least square regression line.

Table 1 shows that CVD negatively correlated with all the animal foods and all the fatty acids (processed meats, red meats, fish, milk, poultry, eggs, SFA, PUFA, and TFA). Based on these unexpected finding, we formulated our “fat-soluble vitamin hypothesis”—insufficient dietary intake of fat-soluble vitamin containing animal foods and added fat for gut absorption increases cardiovascular disease risk. To test this hypothesis, we summed the Kcal/day of animal foods and added fats to produce a fat-soluble vitamins variable (Kcal/day) ($FSVV = \text{processed meats Kcal/day} + \text{red meats Kcal/day} + \text{fish Kcal/day} + \text{milk Kcal/day} + \text{poultry Kcal/day} + \text{eggs Kcal/day} + \text{added SFA Kcal/day} + \text{added PUFA Kcal/day} + \text{added TFA Kcal/day}$). In determining the portion of SFA, PUFA, and TFA added in addition to the fatty acids in the animal and plant foods, an adjustment factor (fatty acids * 0.46), adapted from the website “Our World in Data,” differentiated the fatty acids in individual foods (54% of the total) from the added fatty acids in oils, butter, lard, etc. (46% of the total).¹³ This adjustment prevented double counting fatty acids (Kcal/day) and allowed a more accurate determination of FSVV.

FSVV (with abundant SFA in animal foods and added extracted fat) correlated strongly with LDL-C worldwide ($r=0.780$, 95% CI 0.771 to 0.788, $p<0001$, $n=7846$ cohorts). Consequently, we considered that FSVV could serve as our marker for the lipid hypothesis as well as the fat-soluble vitamin hypothesis.

Table 2 shows a subgroup of 500 pairs of male and female cohorts with the lowest CVD values, totaling 1000 total cohorts (an arbitrary number). Notably, the mean FSVV in this low CVD subset (FSVV=531.38 Kcal/day) was much higher than the mean FSVV worldwide (FSVV=285.36 Kcal/day, Table 1) or the highest CVD subset mean FSVV (FSVV=235.66 Kcal/day, $n=1000$ cohorts, Table 2).

To test the lipid hypothesis with FSVV as the marker variable, we calculated the median FSVV of the low CVD 1000 cohorts (median FSVV=567.27 Kcal/day) and formed a subset of the highest FSVV cohorts (FSVV $\geq$ 567.27 Kcal/day, $n=974$ cohorts, Table 3). In Table 3, we see a much higher mean FSVV (FSVV $\geq$ 692.58 Kcal/day) than in Table 2 and a strong positive correlation of FSVV with CVD ($r=0.523$, 95% CI 0.476 to 0.567, $p<0001$, $n=974$ cohorts). In contrast, LDL-C and CVD were negatively correlated in this high FSVV subset ($r=-0.254$, 95% CI -0.194 to -0.312, $p<0001$, $n=974$ cohorts). Figure 2 graphs the contrast between worldwide FSVV negatively correlating with CVD versus FSVV positively correlating with CVD in the highest FSVV cohorts (FSVV $\geq$ 567.27 Kcal/day).

Table 4 shows FSVV's component risk factors (processed meat, red meat, fish, milk, poultry, eggs, and added (SFA+PUFA+TFA)) for the 34 countries in Table 2 in descending order by CVD. Table 5 gives all the CVD risk factors for seven representative countries out of the 34 countries in Table 4 ($CVD \leq 293.97$, $n=1000$ cohorts).

The average alcohol intake was 81.0 Kcal/day worldwide. Alcohol Kcal/day correlated negatively with CVD worldwide ($r=-0.061$, 95% CI -0.083 to -0.039, $p<0001$, Table 1). However, in high FSVV cohorts ($FSVV \geq 567.27$ Kcal/day), mean alcohol=155.02 Kcal/day), alcohol positively correlated with CVD ($r=0.475$, 95% CI 0.425 to 0.522, $p<0001$, $n=974$ cohorts, Table 3).

Vitamin A deficiency incidence/100k in children ≤ 5 years old, the only fat-soluble vitamin in the GBD database, correlated positively with CVD worldwide ($r=0.210$, 95% CI 0.189 to 0.231, $p<0001$, Table 1).

Dietary fiber was not significantly correlated with CVD worldwide ($r=0.019$, 95% CI -0.003 to 0.041, $p=0.09$, Table 1). Once dietary fiber was adjusted for FSVV, alcohol, sugary beverages, and potatoes by partial correlation analysis; dietary fiber correlated negatively with CVD ($r=-0.052$, 95% CI -0.074 to -0.030, $p<0.0001$).

Physical activity positively correlated with CVD worldwide ($r=0.160$, 95% CI 0.139 to 0.182, $p<0.0001$, Table 1). However, confounding factors existed:

1. countries with higher FSVV levels also had less physical activity (FSVV versus physical activity worldwide: $r=-0.366$, 95% CI: -0.385 to -0.347, $p<0.0001$),
2. females had less physical activity than males (mean physical activity males=5061 METs/week, mean physical activity females=4356 METs/week), along with less CVD (mean CVD males=656.2, mean CVD females=428.6), and
3. males smoked tobacco more than females (mean smoking (0-1) males=0.339 or 33.9%, mean smoking (0-1) females=0.070 or 7%), and males had more physical activity (as #2 above).

Once physical activity was adjusted for FSVV, smoking, and sex by partial correlation analysis, it correlated negatively with CVD ($r=-0.127$, 95% CI -0.149 to -0.104, $p<0.0001$).

In cohorts mostly in developed countries, with FSVV ≥ 567.27 Kcal/day, discontinuing breast feeding correlated positively with CVD ($r=0.268$, 95% CI 0.208 to 0.325, $p<0.0001$, Table 3).

Secondhand smoking negatively correlated with CVD worldwide ($r=-0.225$, 95% CI -0.246 to -0.204, $p<0.0001$, Table 1). After adjusting secondhand smoking for (1) smoking, (2) sublingual tobacco use, (3) household smoke, (4) ambient air pollution, and (5) sex by partial correlation analysis; secondhand smoke correlated positively with CVD ($r=0.048$, 95% CI 0.025 to 0.070, $p<0.0001$).

The metabolic risk factors, BMI, FPG, and LDL-C, all correlated negatively with CVD worldwide (BMI $r=-0.240$, 95% CI -0.261 to -0.219, $p<0.0001$, FPG $r=-0.178$, 95% CI -0.200 to

266 -0.157, $p < 0.0001$, and LDL-C $r = -0.279$, 95% CI -0.299 to -0.258, $p < 0.0001$, respectively, Table
 267 1). Once they were adjusted for FSVV, alcohol, sugary beverages, and potatoes by partial
 268 correlation analysis; they all correlated positively with CVD (BMI $r = 0.028$, 95% CI 0.006 to
 269 0.050, $p = 0.0144$, FPG $r = 0.076$, 95% CI 0.054 to 0.098, $p < 0.0001$, LDL-C $r = 0.170$, 95% CI
 270 0.148 to 0.191, $p < 0.0001$, respectively). In the cohorts with $FSVV \geq 567.27$ Kcal/day, BMI and
 271 FPG positively correlated with CVD (BMI $r = 0.484$, 95% CI 0.434 to 0.530, $p < 0.0001$ and FPG
 272 $r = 0.091$, 95% CI 0.028 to 0.153, $p = 0.0046$, respectively).

273

Discussion

Since this GBD data-based worldwide risk factor—health outcome analysis methodology has no precedent, there is no medical literature of previous such studies. The best comparator for this CVD versus risk factor analysis with IHME GBD data would be the comparative risk assessment (CRA) systematic literature review-based methodology used in drafting the “Planetary Health Diet.” Proposed by the EAT-Lancet Commission, the Planetary Health Diet was meant to spark a global transformation in human diets to improve health and mitigate climate change. The EAT-Lancet Commission authors said, “Transformation to healthy diets by 2050 will require substantial dietary shifts, including a greater than 50% reduction in global consumption of unhealthy foods such as red meat and sugar, and a greater than 100% increase in the consumption of healthy foods such as nuts, fruits, vegetables and legumes.”¹⁴ Reducing diet-caused non-communicable diseases (e.g., obesity, type 2 diabetes, CVD, cancers, etc.) was a major goal. WHO data show that about 44% of worldwide non-communicable disease deaths were CVD related,¹⁵ so these CVD analysis findings from GBD data can be fairly contrasted with the Planetary Health Diet proposal from CRA systematic literature review and expert opinion methodology.

When introduced by the EAT-Lancet Commission, the Planetary Health Diet sparked controversy. Dr. Francisco Zagtutt and colleagues disputed the rigor of the analytics, “A truly effective global solution to the problem of human nutrition and environmental impact must be replicable, transparent, and supported with correct quantification of its impact. Unfortunately, the report did not meet these criteria.”¹⁶ The World Health Organization (WHO) withdrew

sponsorship over the exclusivity of one dietary approach for the entire planet and the negative impact of reducing cattle and pig ranching in developing countries.¹⁷

The methodologies and findings of this GBD data-based analysis of diet and other risk factors related to global CVD were markedly different than those of the EAT-Lancet Commission. Some of the consequential differences were as follows:

1. The Planetary Health Diet recommendations were based on systematic literature reviews primarily from researchers and participants in developed countries, largely missing at least 70% of the world's population. This IHME GBD data-based population weighted analysis proportionally included people in developing countries.
2. To Dr. Zagmutt's point about the lack of rigor of the Planetary Health Diet analytics, this IHME GBD data analysis used a single population weighted analysis dataset, spanning 28 years, making it replicable (with 2020 GBD data), transparent, and supported with reasonable quantification of the impact of global human nutrition on CVD.
3. The overall amounts of animal foods (Kcal/day) recommended by the Planetary Health Diet (mean animal foods: 304 Kcal/day)¹⁸ do not differ substantially from the overall animal foods (Kcal/day) in the GBD lowest CVD cohorts (338 Kcal/day, n=1000 cohorts, CVD < 292.97 deaths/year) in this analysis (Table 2). However, the Planetary Health Diet recommended 40 Kcal/day of fish¹⁸ while the GBD data show that the world fish consumption from 1990-2017 averaged 10.0 Kcal/day (Table 1). Levels of overfishing are unsustainable now, so quadrupling fish consumption worldwide is impossible. Likewise, the Planetary Health Diet recommended average milk consumption to be 153

Kcal/day¹⁸ while the GBD data show the world average milk consumption per person from 1990-2017 of 25.0 Kcal/day (Table 1). Increasing the world's dairy cows six-fold, most of whom would eventually be slaughtered for meat, would seem to contradict major goals of the EAT-Lancet Commission—reducing methane emissions from cows and reducing red meat consumption. Instead, increasing all livestock production in developing countries would be projected to improve CVD outcomes (Table 1) as would decreasing cattle, pig, and poultry raising, but not fish or eggs, in high FSVV cohorts (Table 3).

4. Whereas the Planetary Health Diet has a single set of recommended ranges of quantities of plant and animal foods for all humanity, the GBD data-based analysis methodology can apply to people in developing countries as well as developed countries.

Fat-soluble vitamins include vitamins A, D, E, and K (K1=phylloquinones and K2=menaquinones). Vitamin K2 (menaquinones from animal foods and fermented plant products) inhibits arterial calcification, a major factor in the pathogenesis of atherosclerosis and cardiovascular disease.¹⁹ Vitamin A and its beta-carotene precursor are important in preventing congenital heart disease.^{20,21} Vitamin E protects the vasculature against oxidative stress, including lipid peroxidation and the production of atherogenic forms of LDL-C—a part of the pathogenesis of cardiovascular disease.²² Regarding vitamin D, a meta-analysis of prospective studies showed an inverse correlation between cardiovascular disease and circulating 25(OH)-vitamin D ranging from 20 to 60 nmol/L.²³

The four fat-soluble vitamins come primarily from animal foods. Vitamin K2 levels are high in aged cheeses, other fermented dairy products,²⁴ organ meats (e.g., bovine and pork liver), chicken, and egg yolks.²⁵ The Japanese had the world's lowest CVD from 1990-2017 (mean CVD=169.2 deaths/100k/year). Paradoxically, crucial CVD risk factors were high in the Japanese (e.g., smoking: mean male/female smoking=26.8%, salt intake (mean sodium= 6.01 g/d, systolic blood pressure (mean SBP= 137.6 mm/Hg, Table 5). Relative to fermented cheeses, the content of vitamin K2 in fish was low to negligible (Japanese fish consumption mean=260.5 Kcal/day, Table 4).²⁵ Instead, Japanese consumed high quantities of vitamin K2 in the form of fermented soy products like natto and miso.^{26,27} People that also consumed high amounts of fermented legumes were the Taiwanese (soybean Douchi, soybean Meitauza, and soybean curd²⁸), South Koreans (Cheonggukjang, a fermented soybean stew²⁸), and Thais (soybean Thua nao²⁹). The Taiwanese, South Koreans, and Thais were also listed among the 34 low CVD countries (Table 4).

In high FSVV cohorts, (FSVV $\geq$ 567.27 Kcal/day), why LDL-C correlated negatively with FSVV ($r=-0.254$ 95% CI -0.312 to -0.194, $p<0.0001$, $n=974$ cohorts) is not clear. However, multiple studies have documented that LDL-C may be influenced by genetic, racial, or ethnic differences that do not necessarily correspond with risk of CVD.^{30,31} Additionally, LDL-C lowering medications in wide use especially in high FSVV intake developed countries may also confound the relationship of LDL-C with both LSVV and CVD risk in this subset cohort analysis.

Since there are high FSVV and low FSVV intake individual people widely distributed worldwide, prospective observational studies of individuals in high FSVV areas, rather than

GBD cohort studies like this one, could better demonstrate positive correlations between LDL-C (or total cholesterol) and CVD. This may explain why the Seven Countries Study³² of Ancel Keys and the Framingham Heart Study,³³ both in high FSVV regions, supported the lipid hypothesis. However, the Prospective Urban Rural Epidemiology (PURE) Study, with individual data on 135,335 patients from three high-income, 11 middle-income, and four low-income countries was clearly at variance with the lipid hypothesis.³⁴ The PURE Study found that higher saturated fat intake was associated with lower risk of stroke (quintile 5 vs quintile 1, HR 0.79, (95% CI 0.64 to 0.98), $p_{\text{trend}}=0.0498$).

Defining the optimal FSVV range that will reduce CVD risk while not increasing other diseases (e.g., cancers and obesity) will require more research. Supplements of fat-soluble vitamins to reduce the animal food and added fat intake required to minimise CVD should be studied, especially in developing countries with less access to animal foods.

Given the negative correlations of CVD with both fish and eggs in both tables 1 and 3, the reduction of FSVV in high FSVV countries might best come from meat, poultry, and added fats. Although milk (including other dairy products) correlated positively with CVD in Table 3 ($r=0.185$, 95% CI 0.123 to 0.245, $p<0.0001$), this probably related to Japan and Peru having the lowest and fifth lowest CVD (Japan: mean CVD=169.2, mean milk=29.0 Kcal/day, Peru: mean CVD=197.7, mean milk=15.3 Kcal/day). Without Japan and Peru in the analysis ($n=834$ cohorts), milk correlated negatively with CVD ($r=-0.071$, 95% CI -0.138 to -0.030, $p=0.0405$). Of the 34 low CVD countries in Table 4, 20 had high milk intakes (milk Kcal/day range: 68.8 Kcal/day-124.1Kcal/day versus mean milk worldwide=25.0 Kcal/day, Table 1) and these high

milk intake cohorts all had relatively high per capita intakes of cheese.^{35,36} Fermented, full-fat dairy products have high levels of fat-soluble vitamin K₂,^{24,25} which have been found to be important in preventing calcification of arteries and atherosclerosis.³⁷

Potatoes Kcal/day available positively correlated with CVD both worldwide ($r=0.050$, 95% CI 0.028 to 0.073, $p<0.0001$, Table 1) and in cohorts with $FSVV \geq 567.27$ Kcal/day ($r=0.109$, 95% CI 0.046 to 0.170, $p<0.0001$, Table 3). Notably, half, or more of the potatoes consumed worldwide are in the form of highly processed food products.³⁸ Recent large prospective observational studies have found higher consumption of ultra-processed foods associated with an increased risk of cardiovascular disease incidence and CVD mortality.^{39,40} Data from 79 high- and middle-income countries showed that ultra-processed products dominate the food supplies of high-income countries and that their consumption is now rapidly increasing in middle-income countries.⁴¹

Dietary sodium negatively correlated with CVD worldwide ($r=-0.213$, 95% CI -0.234 to -0.192, $p<0.0001$, Table 1) and was not significantly correlated with CVD in high FSVV cohorts ($FSVV \geq 567.27$ Kcal/day: $r=-0.040$, 95% CI 0.023 to 0.170, $p=0.21$, Table 3) This was contrary to an analysis of sodium intake versus cardiovascular deaths in 66 countries by Mozaffarian, et al who attributed 9.5% of cardiovascular deaths worldwide to high sodium intake.⁴² However, O'Donnell and colleagues found the relationship of sodium to cardiovascular disease to be J shaped curve and suggested that the lowest cardiovascular risk is with moderate sodium intake in the 3-5 g/d range.⁴³ This analysis is consistent with O'Donnell's study.

The moderately strong positive correlation of child ≤ 5 years old severe underweight (weight > 2 SD below the mean for height) with CVD worldwide ($r=0.306$, 95% CI 0.285 to 0.325, $p<0.0001$, Table 1) suggested a relationship of infant/child malnutrition with later CVD. Babies surviving the so called “Dutch famine” toward the end of the second world war (1944-45) have been shown to have higher subsequent heart disease incidence than earlier or later cohorts in Holland.⁴⁴ This suggested that in utero and early infancy severe malnutrition may subsequently contribute substantially to CVD, especially in developing countries.

Prematurely stopping breast feeding positively correlated with CVD in the countries with FSVV ≥ 567.27 Kcal/day ($r=0.268$ 95% CI: 0.208 to 0.325, $p=0.0027$, Table 3). A review of observational studies of breast feeding related to metabolic risk factors for CVD in developed countries suggested that breast feeding was associated with increased insulin sensitivity and decreased systolic blood pressure in later life. Breast feeding also had metabolic benefits for the mother.⁴⁵

According to the WHO, ambient air pollution (particulate matter ≤ 2.5 micrometers diameter (PM_{2.5})) causes cardiovascular and respiratory diseases and cancers.⁴⁶ The WHO considers $>10 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ of PM_{2.5} particles a health hazard. In this GBD data analysis, air pollution (PM_{2.5}) in countries with FSVV ≥ 567.27 Kcal/day and mean CVD=273.7 deaths/100k/year averaged $12.7 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$. Worldwide, comparable numbers for air pollution (PM_{2.5}) were mean=44.7 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ and mean CVD=543.7 (Table 1).

These IHME GBD data support the link of smoking tobacco to CVD ($r=0.298$, 95% CI 0.278 to 0.318, $p<0.0001$, Table 1). The mean incidence of smoking worldwide=20.5% (Table 1). In the 34 countries with the lowest CVD, the mean smoking incidence=23.3% ($n=974$ cohorts, Table 3). Smoking was clearly a major risk factor for CVD, but these data suggest that diet was more influential. Given the multiple dietary and other contributors to CVD, the CVD population attributable fraction (PAF) for smoking was probably far below the WHO estimate that tobacco accounts for 20% of coronary artery disease mortality.⁴⁷

The positive correlation of blood lead levels with CVD worldwide ($r=0.180$, 95% CI 0.159 to 0.201, $p<0.0001$, Table 1) was consistent with reports that lead toxicity leads to hypertension.⁴⁸ Also, environmental lead exposure has been linked with all-cause mortality, cardiovascular disease mortality, and ischaemic heart disease mortality in the US.⁴⁹

This analysis showed that kidney disease correlated positively with CVD ($r=0.194$, 95% CI 0.173 to 0.215, $p<0.0001$, Table 1). A systematic literature review of kidney disease revealed that chronic kidney disease resulted in an estimated 1.2 million deaths in 2017, of which a large portion were from CVD.⁵⁰ Other CVD risk factors may also lead to kidney disease (e.g., systolic hypertension, types 1 and 2 diabetes).

Limitations

Our study was subject to all the limitations discussed in previous GBD publications.^{51,52} These included gaps, biases, and inconsistencies in data sources as well as limitations in the methods of

data processing and estimation. Having comprehensive data on dietary inputs is key to more accurate and reliable analyses. These GBD data on animal foods, plant foods, alcohol, sugary beverages, and fatty acids were not comprehensive and comprised only 1191.4 Kcal/day per person on average worldwide. Subnational data on all risk factors were available on only four countries. Because the data formatting and statistical methodology were new, this was necessarily a post hoc analysis and no pre-analysis protocol was possible. This GBD data analysis should be repeated with the most recently released GBD 2019 data when those data become available to volunteer collaborators.

Generalisability

This new the GBD statistical analysis methodology for finding correlations between dietary and other risk factors and health outcomes (e.g., CVD) can be applied to any of the risk factors and health outcomes available with the new IHME GBD 2020 data. With further experience with the methodology, we can determine the generalisability.

Conclusion

The lipid hypothesis (e.g., dietary SFA from animal foods and added fats causes CVD) was consistent with the strong positive correlation of FSVV with CVD in high FSVV cohorts. However, the lipid hypothesis was not supported worldwide. Global data analysis supported the fat-soluble vitamin hypothesis because FSVV negatively correlated with CVD worldwide. This methodology of analysing IHME GBD data might well have advantages over the CRA systematic literature review and expert opinion method in developing policy recommendations, clinical practice guidelines, and public health recommendations. The EAT-Lancet Commission might consider using IHME GBD data to guide another version of a planetary health diet.

482 **Table 1. Dietary and other risks related to CVD worldwide (n=7846 cohorts)**

CVD and CVD risk factors	Mean	SD	Min	Max	r	95% CI	95% CI	p
Cardiovascular disease deaths/100k/year ages 15-69 (CVD)	543.66	288.01	73.47	1844				
CVD mean m/f	543.69	246.13	135.46	1727	0.855	0.849	0.860	<.0001
LDL cholesterol mmol/L	2.35	0.40	1.27	3.25	-0.279	-0.299	-0.258	<.0001
Fat-soluble vitamin variable Kcal/day (FSVV)	285.36	193.31	58.78	932.18	-0.329	-0.349	-0.309	<.0001
Processed meat Kcal/day	5.33	9.72	0.20	68.77	-0.204	-0.226	-0.183	<.0001
Red meat Kcal/day	50.27	45.13	3.21	235.95	-0.232	-0.253	-0.211	<.0001
Fish Kcal/day	9.99	36.52	0.40	370.36	-0.203	-0.224	-0.181	<.0001
Milk Kcal/day	25.04	27.05	1.06	146.82	-0.192	-0.214	-0.171	<.0001
Poultry Kcal/day available	44.32	50.08	1.06	411.87	-0.289	-0.309	-0.268	<.0001
Eggs Kcal/day available	19.36	14.71	0.79	69.64	-0.390	-0.408	-0.371	<.0001
Added Saturated fatty acids Kcal/day	87.67	29.41	32.56	221.29	-0.239	-0.260	-0.219	<.0001
Added PUFAs Kcal/day	37.30	33.78	1.35	175.40	-0.316	-0.336	-0.296	<.0001
Added Trans fatty acids Kcal/day	6.09	6.28	0.91	35.77	-0.104	-0.126	-0.082	<.0001
Alcohol Kcal/day	81.03	57.33	4.25	429.81	-0.061	-0.083	-0.039	<.0001
Sugary beverages Kcal/day	298.36	152.38	72.91	1472.00	0.113	0.091	0.135	<.0001
Potatoes Kcal/day available	84.04	74.60	3.07	533.88	0.050	0.028	0.073	<.0001
Corn Kcal/day available	34.72	48.28	0.16	305.17	-0.062	-0.084	-0.040	<.0001
Fruits Kcal/day	40.21	22.50	3.58	161.39	-0.355	-0.374	-0.336	<.0001
Vegetables Kcal/day	79.76	43.12	9.48	304.17	-0.107	-0.128	-0.085	<.0001
Nuts and seeds Kcal/day	8.41	8.36	0.05	102.99	-0.277	-0.297	-0.256	<.0001
Whole grains Kcal/day	55.65	30.93	1.14	235.10	-0.194	-0.216	-0.173	<.0001
Legumes Kcal/day	51.74	32.23	0.51	194.70	-0.024	-0.046	-0.002	0.0319
Rice Kcal/day available	141.86	116.34	1.42	461.80	0.007	-0.015	0.029	0.5417
Sweet potatoes Kcal/day available	22.76	35.95	0.02	364.74	-0.167	-0.189	-0.146	<.0001
Total Kcal/day available	2574	418	1579	3898	-0.203	-0.224	-0.181	<.0001
Vit A deficiency children/100k/year	23205	10939	1267	50969	0.210	0.189	0.231	<.0001
Sodium g/d	4.45	2.34	1.33	9.21	-0.214	-0.235	-0.193	<.0001
Calcium g/d	0.301	0.179	0.081	1.044	-0.169	-0.191	-0.148	<.0001
Dietary fiber g/d	9.21	3.15	2.72	22.68	0.019	-0.003	0.041	0.0932
Physical activity METs	4714	1368	1609	7669	0.160	0.139	0.182	<.0001
Child underweight >2SD	0.186	0.171	0.004	0.535	0.302	0.282	0.322	<.0001
Stop breast feeding <6 months	0.119	0.055	0.016	0.242	-0.302	-0.322	-0.282	<.0001
Ambient pollution PM _{0.25}	44.73	26.46	4.38	95.54	0.153	0.131	0.174	<.0001
Smoking rate (0-1)	0.205	0.176	0.003	0.640	0.297	0.277	0.317	<.0001
Secondhand smoking (0-1)	0.376	0.155	0.164	0.796	-0.225	-0.246	-0.204	<.0001
Sublingual tobacco rate (0-1)	0.068	0.095	0.001	0.419	0.284	0.264	0.304	<.0001
Blood lead level mcg/dl	5.01	1.01	1.22	8.37	0.180	0.159	0.201	<.0001
Household air pollution (0-1)	0.482	0.325	0.000	0.996	0.179	0.158	0.201	<.0001
Kidney disease stage III (0-1)	0.056	0.028	0.015	0.154	0.194	0.173	0.215	<.0001
Type 1 DM early deaths	10.37	9.39	0.55	112.49	0.340	0.320	0.359	<.0001
Type 2 DM early deaths	17.50	15.65	0.63	269.67	0.227	0.205	0.247	<.0001
BMI kg/M ²	21.77	2.29	17.95	29.39	-0.240	-0.261	-0.219	<.0001
Fasting plasma glucose mmol/L	4.30	0.35	3.32	5.58	-0.178	-0.200	-0.157	<.0001
Systolic BP mm Hg	133.91	4.32	123.41	147.89	0.195	0.174	0.216	<.0001
Socio-demographic index (0-1)	0.543	0.174	0.112	0.896	-0.337	-0.357	-0.317	<.0001
Sex male 1 and female 2	1.50	0.50	1.00	2.00	-0.395	-0.414	-0.376	<.0001

483

484

485 **Table 2. CVD lowest (≈ 1 billion people) and highest 1000 cohorts (≈ 1 billion people)**

	CVD lowest ≈ 1 billion people (n=1000 cohorts)				CVD highest ≈ 1 billion people (n=1000 cohorts)			
CVD and risk factors	Mean	SD	Min	Max	Mean	SD	Min	Max
Cardiovascular Disease deaths/100k/year	227.81	95.25	73.47	422.36	1045	356.90	430.20	1844
CVD male/female mean	227.81	42.52	135.46	292.97	1045	200.47	802.24	1727
LDL cholesterol mmol/L	2.808	0.256	1.598	3.247	2.376	0.380	1.35	3.20
Fat-soluble vitamin variable Kcal/day (FSVV)	531.4	180.20	143.63	912.69	235.66	99.68	80.53	503.98
Processed meat Kcal/day	15.30	12.20	0.61	61.09	3.70	4.95	0.22	18.12
Red meat Kcal/day	90.72	48.06	12.03	235.95	36.82	29.40	7.07	172.00
Fish Kcal/day	49.54	92.63	2.85	370.36	4.56	2.69	0.78	12.97
Milk Kcal/day	55.64	35.39	7.70	146.82	25.61	16.78	1.06	75.87
Poultry Kcal/day available	90.44	47.27	4.74	240.56	30.23	22.39	2.78	100.04
Eggs Kcal/day available	36.63	11.25	4.77	69.64	14.73	13.63	1.51	46.81
Added Saturated fatty acids Kcal/day	113.40	36.53	59.52	221.29	87.22	24.03	33.03	205.85
Added PUFAs Kcal/day	69.80	35.78	15.77	175.40	25.48	14.54	2.73	84.90
Added Trans fatty acids Kcal/day	9.91	9.25	1.65	34.90	7.31	8.62	1.21	35.77
Alcohol Kcal/day	119.72	66.67	4.25	296.70	45.83	46.24	5.77	340.37
Sugary beverages Kcal/day	320.29	251.94	72.91	1472	303.30	63.68	180.80	685.42
Potatoes Kcal/day available	81.34	51.14	9.50	177.30	98.34	96.77	3.94	533.88
Corn Kcal/day available	48.19	75.26	1.79	287.14	31.77	37.30	0.20	305.17
Fruits Kcal/day	64.84	16.49	23.05	128.61	31.23	13.93	3.58	70.11
Vegetables Kcal/day	108.02	44.60	9.48	214.26	83.83	56.67	14.43	198.51
Nuts and seeds Kcal/day	15.90	10.50	0.66	39.80	4.81	2.91	0.05	17.91
Whole grains Kcal/day	64.71	38.62	1.61	173.46	28.30	33.01	1.14	156.75
Legumes Kcal/day	47.88	25.99	2.95	133.26	31.55	18.93	0.51	103.17
Rice Kcal/day available	78.10	97.95	7.58	349.08	75.93	107.38	1.42	461.80
Sweet potatoes Kcal/day available	3.92	5.14	0.04	27.51	5.84	20.20	0.02	364.74
Total Kcal/day available	2972	409	1948	3572	2627	409	1579	3254
Vit A deficiency children/100k/year	14181	8723	1400	44100	20559	11395	1722	50969
Sodium g/d	3.92	1.22	1.33	6.70	3.30	0.76	1.33	5.96
Calcium g/d	0.506	0.189	0.183	1.044	0.321	0.150	0.089	0.792
Dietary fiber g/d	10.58	2.90	5.15	17.95	9.53	3.32	3.87	18.83
Physical activity METs	3802	1164	2162	7607	4273	1497	1838	7607
Child underweight >2SD	0.038	0.043	0.004	0.242	0.186	0.141	0.011	0.411
Stop breast feeding <6 months	0.176	0.032	0.071	0.218	0.116	0.044	0.036	0.208
Ambient pollution PM _{0.25}	17.60	8.27	4.38	38.42	40.81	22.19	7.90	77.69
Smoking rate (0-1)	0.217	0.121	0.012	0.448	0.212	0.190	0.005	0.627
Secondhand smoking (0-1)	0.328	0.097	0.164	0.569	0.397	0.158	0.164	0.780
Sublingual tobacco rate (0-1)	0.010	0.015	0.001	0.111	0.060	0.072	0.001	0.238
Blood lead level mcg/dl	4.08	1.00	1.22	6.85	4.74	1.28	1.92	8.37
Household air pollution (0-1)	0.103	0.182	0.001	0.839	0.404	0.353	0.002	0.993
Kidney disease stage III (0-1)	0.042	0.020	0.015	0.111	0.078	0.024	0.035	0.139
Type 1 DM early deaths	4.79	3.88	0.59	20.65	16.38	15.31	2.62	112.49
Type 2 DM early deaths	15.69	18.23	0.75	87.92	23.65	24.88	0.89	269.67
BMI kg/M ²	23.74	1.60	19.61	27.06	22.46	2.15	17.95	26.08
Fasting plasma glucose mmol/L	4.56	0.25	3.54	5.12	4.28	0.42	3.38	5.18
Systolic BP mm Hg	133.26	4.41	123.41	142.15	136.86	4.39	124.59	147.89
Socio-demographic index (0-1)	0.757	0.125	0.351	0.896	0.497	0.183	0.186	0.824
Sex male 1 and female 2	1.50	0.50	1.00	2.00	1.50	0.50	1.00	2.00

486

Table 3. CVD and risk factors for countries with FSVV ≥ 567.27 Kcal/day (n=974 cohorts)

CVD and CVD risk factors	Mean	SD	Min	Max	r	95% CI low	95% CI high	P
Cardiovascular deaths/100k/year ages 15-69	273.72	143.95	73.47	913.2				
LDL cholesterol mmol/L	2.91	0.14	2.36	3.20	-0.254	-0.312	-0.194	<.0001
Fat-soluble vitamin variable	692.6	111.9	527.7	932.2	0.523	0.476	0.567	<.0001
Processed meat Kcal/day	25.01	15.30	2.16	68.77	0.459	0.408	0.507	<.0001
Red meat Kcal/day	122.2	41.41	43.65	236.0	0.655	0.618	0.690	<.0001
Fish Kcal/day	49.08	89.24	7.60	370.4	-0.259	-0.317	-0.199	<.0001
Milk Kcal/day	78.58	26.14	14.60	146.8	0.185	0.123	0.245	<.0001
Poultry Kcal/day available	130.0	60.21	41.65	411.9	0.366	0.311	0.419	<.0001
Eggs Kcal/day available	40.80	7.25	14.59	69.64	-0.242	-0.301	-0.182	<.0001
Saturated fatty acids Kcal/day	299.9	66.83	129.4	481.0	0.193	0.132	0.253	<.0001
PUFAs Kcal/day	211.9	83.06	80.53	381.3	0.382	0.327	0.435	<.0001
Trans fatty acids Kcal/day	25.17	17.82	4.23	66.89	0.224	0.163	0.283	<.0001
Alcohol Kcal/day	155.0	65.23	11.92	429.8	0.475	0.425	0.522	<.0001
Sugary beverages Kcal/day	231.7	121.9	72.91	769.9	0.332	0.274	0.386	<.0001
Potatoes Kcal/day available	106.4	40.47	9.50	225.0	0.109	0.046	0.170	0.00
Corn Kcal/day available	19.45	9.41	1.79	47.39	0.086	0.024	0.148	0.01
Fruits Kcal/day	66.91	15.93	34.83	161.4	-0.014	-0.077	0.049	0.66
Vegetables Kcal/day	117.4	34.24	42.27	304.2	-0.127	-0.188	-0.064	<.0001
Nuts and seeds Kcal/day	21.98	8.91	0.85	103.0	0.177	0.115	0.237	<.0001
Whole grains Kcal/day	52.11	20.93	1.61	92.45	0.121	0.059	0.183	0.00
Legumes Kcal/day	40.76	25.29	2.95	133.3	0.040	-0.023	0.102	0.21
Rice Kcal/day available	38.82	46.75	6.50	179.6	-0.138	-0.199	-0.076	<.0001
Sweet potatoes Kcal/day available	3.63	3.99	0.04	17.63	-0.128	-0.189	-0.066	<.0001
Total Kcal/day available	3219	292	2516	3898	0.249	0.189	0.307	<.0001
Vit A deficiency children/100k/year	9316	6877	1400	28081	-0.105	-0.166	-0.042	0.00
Sodium g/d	3.98	0.96	2.22	6.70	-0.040	-0.102	0.023	0.21
Calcium g/d	0.645	0.129	0.353	1.044	0.396	0.342	0.448	<.0001
Dietary fiber g/d	10.62	1.75	6.30	18.15	0.241	0.181	0.299	<.0001
Physical activity METs	3523	765	1781	5494	0.578	0.535	0.618	<.0001
Child underweight >2SD	0.015	0.013	0.004	0.058	-0.197	-0.257	-0.136	<.0001
Stop breast feeding <6 months	0.196	0.017	0.129	0.219	0.268	0.208	0.325	<.0001
Ambient pollution PM_{0.25}	12.67	7.13	4.38	87.22	0.005	-0.058	0.068	0.87
Smoking rate (0-1)	0.233	0.084	0.021	0.444	0.233	0.172	0.291	<.0001
Secondhand smoking (0-1)	0.309	0.070	0.201	0.586	-0.306	-0.362	-0.248	<.0001
Sublingual tobacco rate (0-1)	0.013	0.020	0.001	0.125	0.579	0.536	0.620	<.0001
Blood lead level mcg/dl	3.93	0.77	1.22	5.72	0.451	0.400	0.500	<.0001
Household air pollution (0-1)	0.012	0.026	0.000	0.201	-0.011	-0.073	0.052	0.74
Kidney disease stage III (0-1)	0.036	0.012	0.016	0.109	-0.028	-0.090	0.035	0.39
Type 1 DM early deaths	3.93	2.67	0.55	15.97	0.573	0.529	0.613	<.0001
Type 2 DM early deaths	9.54	7.52	0.75	54.22	0.622	0.582	0.659	<.0001
BMI kg/M²	24.87	1.78	21.40	29.39	0.484	0.434	0.530	<.0001
Fasting plasma glucose mmol/L	4.73	0.23	3.84	5.58	0.091	0.028	0.153	0.00
Systolic BP mm Hg	133.6	4.362	126.9	142.1	-0.148	-0.209	-0.086	<.0001
Socio-demographic index (0-1)	0.838	0.053	0.592	0.896	-0.052	-0.114	0.011	0.11
Sex male 1 and female 2	1.50	0.50	1.00	2.00	-0.745	-0.772	-0.716	<.0001

Table 4. CVD related dietary risk factors (Kcal/day) in low CVD countries

CVD lowest Countries (n=1000 cohorts)	n co-horts	CVD ascending order	FSVV	Processed meat	Red meat	Fish	Milk	Poultry	Eggs	Added SFA +PUFA +TFA
Japan	158	169.19	618.69	19.19	58.72	260.54	29.04	63.93	52.23	135.04
France	64	174.00	644.78	13.59	135.07	11.17	95.75	99.86	43.30	246.04
Switzerland	8	175.04	558.41	11.50	129.01	6.75	110.90	55.57	31.20	213.47
Andorra	2	185.55	763.18	16.58	150.84	16.44	99.23	189.92	47.55	242.62
Peru	32	197.74	183.12	1.01	16.92	3.82	15.34	35.04	12.03	98.95
Spain	46	206.25	597.93	11.65	139.92	10.28	82.99	113.88	43.35	195.86
Italy	60	206.44	587.57	15.78	126.36	9.15	89.54	84.16	36.39	226.20
Iceland	2	206.51	609.62	11.97	112.73	11.67	85.37	63.57	29.51	294.81
Australia	24	208.03	698.26	9.79	164.14	14.15	97.05	153.33	24.92	234.89
Canada	36	222.11	624.98	25.31	126.28	18.48	76.13	147.46	34.94	196.39
Israel	8	228.32	662.00	5.95	59.50	15.35	68.79	240.56	40.54	231.30
South Korea	50	232.63	357.23	5.97	82.88	5.96	15.72	43.10	26.89	176.71
Belgium	12	235.98	636.39	12.28	122.36	11.19	93.44	85.00	33.28	278.86
Netherlands	18	236.61	629.56	15.72	133.06	8.66	114.16	72.70	41.67	243.59
Taiwan	24	237.37	587.36	3.01	106.58	9.15	15.95	132.38	34.87	285.41
Mexico	108	237.55	413.25	11.29	63.03	8.69	34.29	85.85	39.92	170.19
Panama	4	244.31	383.83	2.75	61.32	9.44	20.72	95.43	12.96	181.23
Sweden	10	247.21	563.83	29.31	119.77	11.80	124.13	45.42	35.04	198.37
New Zealand non Mauri	4	247.32	699.81	9.31	158.86	11.56	88.74	128.14	40.24	262.95
Norway	32	248.72	605.30	48.14	109.37	10.10	100.96	41.65	31.52	263.56
England	20	253.09	534.56	19.21	96.29	10.70	87.80	89.30	32.90	198.36
Costa Rica	4	260.73	408.42	2.63	51.74	8.12	46.55	78.05	28.17	193.14
Luxembourg	2	262.53	578.00	14.65	163.17	11.79	91.99	71.48	27.60	197.32
Chile	18	267.50	404.12	19.11	90.33	9.65	31.93	97.29	19.70	136.10
Guatemala	16	269.85	231.05	1.89	20.05	5.28	13.32	53.94	30.46	106.12
Kenya	12	270.04	150.04	1.41	25.83	3.09	18.89	4.74	4.77	91.31
Ecuador	16	270.64	375.35	6.87	56.88	7.34	35.51	59.92	14.66	194.16
USA	94	274.00	825.54	36.45	136.35	15.79	90.90	190.90	41.10	314.05
Denmark	6	275.10	600.48	14.46	137.75	13.38	98.01	74.42	45.96	216.51
Austria	8	277.67	621.00	8.95	194.65	9.26	98.68	70.00	39.96	199.50
Portugal	10	278.50	524.81	5.16	124.77	8.77	79.43	94.26	24.18	188.25
Nicaragua	6	282.04	214.24	1.52	14.93	4.07	20.66	41.76	17.41	113.90
Tehran (Iran)	16	283.29	299.65	1.23	22.63	5.36	19.23	65.90	18.89	166.41
Thailand	70	289.91	247.43	0.70	32.01	6.95	7.85	57.07	31.10	111.75
Total cohorts	1000									

493 **Table 5. Representative examples of low CVD countries including all risk factors**

Countries n cohorts	Japan ^a	France ^b	Peru ^c	Mexico ^d	Panama ^e	Guatemala ^f	Ecuador ^g
CVD/100k/year ages 15-69	169.19	174.00	197.74	237.55	244.31	269.85	270.64
Fat-soluble vitamin variable	618.69	644.78	183.12	413.25	383.83	231.05	375.35
LDL cholesterol mmol/L	2.81	3.08	2.37	2.59	2.61	2.20	2.46
Processed meat Kcal/day	19.19	13.59	1.01	11.29	2.75	1.89	6.87
Red meat Kcal/day	58.72	135.07	16.92	63.03	61.32	20.05	56.88
Fish Kcal/day	260.54	11.17	3.82	8.69	9.44	5.28	7.34
Milk Kcal/day	29.04	95.75	15.34	34.29	20.72	13.32	35.51
Poultry Kcal/day available	63.93	99.86	35.04	85.85	95.43	53.94	59.92
Eggs Kcal/day available	52.23	43.30	12.03	39.92	12.96	30.46	14.66
Added Saturated fatty acids Kcal/day	77.73	172.79	68.34	89.13	101.32	60.62	133.54
Added PUFAs Kcal/day	53.78	67.38	24.47	52.14	72.29	41.90	51.69
Added Trans fatty acids Kcal/day	3.54	5.88	6.13	28.92	7.62	3.60	8.93
Alcohol Kcal/day	183.16	118.64	55.79	58.39	27.44	28.79	59.77
Sugary beverages Kcal/day	94.78	323.88	284.76	847.81	921.54	964.08	283.57
Potatoes Kcal/day available	42.29	126.40	142.55	25.79	32.01	16.68	67.56
Corn Kcal/day available	27.58	23.85	33.54	242.41	50.86	206.19	11.76
Fruits Kcal/day	44.43	59.56	52.27	65.68	52.92	39.61	107.07
Vegetables Kcal/day	149.32	101.07	46.17	60.72	27.81	54.98	31.79
Nuts and seeds Kcal/day	9.26	16.94	1.02	6.27	1.92	12.72	0.68
Whole grains Kcal/day	76.05	16.16	58.94	142.06	83.46	68.32	43.78
Legumes Kcal/day	71.84	17.07	45.78	76.99	38.35	73.84	21.99
Rice Kcal/day available	124.52	12.09	93.09	14.07	141.66	13.46	118.02
Sweet potatoes Kcal/day available	12.09	0.04	7.94	0.69	8.67	1.71	0.49
Total Kcal/day available	2590	3406	1948	3015	2288	2330	2273
Vit A deficiency children/100k/year	8151	1643	19372	23939	11463	17947	20185
Sodium g/d	6.01	3.21	3.14	2.62	2.97	1.83	3.16
Calcium g/d	0.425	0.707	0.299	0.370	0.293	0.220	0.314
Dietary fiber g/d	13.43	8.68	9.44	15.51	5.90	12.54	6.25
Physical activity METs	3460	2795	3774	3833	4935	6142	3740
Child underweight >2SD	0.045	0.012	0.069	0.050	0.042	0.193	0.096
Stop breast feeding <6 months	0.171	0.208	0.108	0.171	0.140	0.087	0.130
Ambient pollution PM_{0.25}	13.10	13.87	28.99	24.28	13.24	28.61	17.86
Smoking rate (0-1)	0.268	0.289	0.075	0.149	0.073	0.077	0.080
Secondhand smoking (0-1)	0.353	0.320	0.238	0.344	0.178	0.224	0.206
Sublingual tobacco rate (0-1)	0.012	0.003	0.004	0.002	0.002	0.001	0.004
Blood lead level mcg/dl	2.65	3.86	5.17	5.34	4.80	5.89	4.51
Household air pollution (0-1)	0.002	0.010	0.454	0.213	0.193	0.627	0.080
Kidney disease stage III (0-1)	0.038	0.028	0.050	0.078	0.068	0.075	0.055
Type 1 DM early deaths	1.25	2.91	4.84	12.64	7.71	12.03	6.92
Type 2 DM early deaths	2.03	3.70	11.37	60.97	18.07	40.38	27.44
BMI kg/M²	21.89	23.47	23.29	24.82	22.98	21.97	25.04
Fasting plasma glucose mmol/L	4.77	4.46	4.01	4.53	4.31	4.12	4.26
Systolic BP mm Hg	137.56	135.11	125.19	130.31	133.66	131.15	126.85
Socio-demographic index	0.828	0.822	0.590	0.608	0.644	0.431	0.575
Likely mechanism of low CVD (see discussion for explanation)	FSVV, Plants	FSVV	Smoking, metabolic	FSVV, Plants	Physical activity, smoking	Physical activity, smoking	FSVV, smoking

^a Japan not only had high FSVV but also had relatively high intake of healthy plant foods (fruits, vegetables, nuts and seeds, whole grains, and legumes: 350.9 Kcal/day).

^b France was characteristic of 23 other low CVD countries in that intake of milk products was high (France milk=95.75 Kcal/day and in the other 23 countries' milk>68 Kcal/day, Table 3 compared with worldwide mean milk=25.04 Kcal/day, Table 1).

^c The low CVD of Peru might be attributed to a relatively low smoking rate (7.5%) and good metabolic statistics (mean BMI=23.3 Kg/M², mean FPG=4.01 mmol/L, mean LDL-C=2.37 mmol/L, mean SBP=125.2 mm/Hg).

^d While Mexico had a lower FSVV than most low CVD countries (Mexico FSVV=413.3 Kcal/day), like Japan it had relatively high intake of important plant foods (fruits, vegetables, nuts and seeds, whole grains, and legumes: totaling 351.7 Kcal/day).

^e Panama, with moderate FSVV=383.8 Kcal/day, had relatively high physical activity (Panama physical activity=4935 METs) and low smoking rate (male/female mean smoking=7.3%).

^f While Guatemala had relatively low FSVV (FSVV=231.1 Kcal/day) and low healthy plant food intake (fruits, vegetables, nuts and seeds, whole grains, and legumes: 249.5 Kcal/day), it had relatively high physical activity (physical activity=6142 METs) and a low smoking rate (male/female mean smoking=7.7%).

^g Ecuador had an intermediary FSVV (FSVV=375.4 Kcal/day) and relatively low intake of important plant foods (fruits, vegetables, nuts and seeds, whole grains, and legumes: totaling 205.3 Kcal/day). However, Ecuador had a low rate of smoking (male/female mean smoking=8.0%). and a low SBP (mean SBP=126.9 mm/Hg).

517 **Supplementary Table 1. Definitions of GBD risk factors and covariates related to CVD**

Variables	Definition
Alcohol	Any alcohol consumption (g/day)
Ambient particulate matter pollution	Annual average daily exposure to outdoor air concentrations of particulate matter with an aerodynamic diameter of $\leq 2.5 \mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ (PM _{2.5})
Body-mass index	Body mass index (BMI) (kg/m^2)—the dependent variable of interest
Chewing tobacco	Current use of any chewing tobacco product
Child underweight	Proportion of children – 3 SD to – 2 SD of the WHO 2006 standard weight-for-age curve (0-1)
Corn	Corn availability per capita (g/day), a covariate
Discontinued breast feeding	Proportion of children aged 6-23 months who do not receive any breast milk
Eggs	Eggs availability per capita (g/day) a covariate
Fasting plasma glucose	Fasting plasma glucose (mmol/L)
Fish	This variable expressed in g/day was derived by determining the weight of fish in g corresponding to 1 g of omega-3 fatty acids (eicosapentaenoic acid and docosahexaenoic acid) by averaging the fish g per 1 g of omega-3 fatty acids 20 species of fish= 117.04 g/day fish/1 g/day omega-3 fatty acids (Supplementary Table 3)
Fruits	Consumption of fruits (includes fresh, frozen, cooked, canned, or dried fruit but excludes fruit juices and salted or pickled fruits) (g/day)
Household air pollution from solid fuels	Individual exposure to PM _{2.5} due to use of solid cooking fuel
Kidney function impaired	Proportion of the population with ACR $>30 \text{ mg}/\text{g}$ or GFR $<60 \text{ mL}/\text{min}/1.73 \text{ m}^2$, excluding end-stage renal disease
Kilocalories available /day	The mean number of kilocalories per capita available per day to people in each location (kcal/day available), a covariate
LDL cholesterol	Serum low-density lipoprotein cholesterol (mmol/L)
Lead exposure	Blood lead levels in $\mu\text{g}/\text{dL}$ of blood, bone lead levels in $\mu\text{g}/\text{g}$ of bone
Legumes	Consumption of beans, lentils, pulses (g/day)
Milk	Consumption of milk including non-fat, low-fat, and full-fat milk but excluding soy milk and other plant derivatives (g/day)
Nuts and seeds	Consumption of nuts and seeds (g/day)
Physical activity	Average weekly physical activity at work, home, transport-related and recreational measured by MET min per week. Less than 3000 METs per week constitutes low physical activity.
Poultry	Poultry availability per capita (g/day), a covariate
Potatoes	Potatoes availability per capita (g/day), a covariate
Processed meat	Consumption of any processed meat (includes meat preserved by smoking, curing, salting, or addition of chemical preservatives, including bacon, salami, sausages, or deli or luncheon meats like ham, turkey, and pastrami) (g/day)
Red meat	Consumption of red meat (includes beef, pork, lamb, and goat but excludes poultry, fish, eggs, and all processed meats) (g/day)
Rice	Rice availability per capita (g/day), a covariate
Seafood omega-3 fatty acids	Seafood omega-3 fatty acids (eicosapentaenoic acid and docosahexaenoic acid) in tablet or fish form (g/day)
Second-hand smoke	Average daily exposure to air particulate matter from second-hand smoke with an aerodynamic diameter smaller than $2.5 \mu\text{g}$, measured in $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$, among non-smokers
Smoking	Prevalence of current use of any smoked tobacco product and prevalence of former use of any smoked tobacco product; among current smokers, cigarette equivalents smoked per smoker per day and cumulative pack-years of exposure; among former smokers, number of years since quitting
Socio-demographic index	SDI is a composite indicator of development status that was originally constructed for GBD 2015 and is derived from components that correlate strongly with health outcomes.

	It is the geometric mean for indices of the total fertility rate among women younger than 25 years, mean education for those aged 15 years or older, and lag-distributed income per capita. The resulting metric ranges from 0 to 1, with higher values corresponding to higher levels of development.
Sugar-sweetened beverages	Consumption of any beverage with ≥ 50 calories of sugar per one-cup serving, including carbonated beverages, sodas, energy drinks, fruit drinks but excluding 100% fruit and vegetable juices (g/day)
Sweet potatoes	Sweet potato availability per capita (g/day), a covariate
Systolic blood pressure	Systolic blood pressure (mm Hg)
Total sugar	Total sugar availability per capita (g/day), a covariate
Vegetables	Consumption of frozen, cooked, canned, or dried vegetables (including legumes but excluding salted or pickled, juices, nuts and seeds, and starchy vegetables such as potatoes or corn) (g/day)
Vitamin A deficiency	Proportion of children aged 0–5 years with serum retinol concentration $< 0.7 \mu\text{mol/L}$
Whole grains	Consumption of whole grains (bran, germ, and endosperm in their natural proportions) from breakfast cereals, bread, rice, pasta, biscuits, muffins, tortillas, pancakes, and others (g/day)

518
519
520

521 **Supplementary Table 2. Omega-3 Fatty Acid g to fish g calculation¶**

Fish	DHA g/3-ounce fish	EPA g/3- ounce fish	Omega-3 Fatty Acids (DHA _ EPA) g/3-ounce fish mean	Fish 3 ounces = 85.02 g	Fish (g) per omega-3 Fatty Acids (g)=85.02 / 0.7264
Salmon Atlantic farmed	1.24	0.59			
Salmon Atlantic wild	1.22	0.35			
Herring Atlantic	0.94	0.77			
Sardines canned in tomato sauce drained	0.74	0.45			
Mackerel Atlantic	0.59	0.43			
Salmon pink canned drained	0.63	0.28			
Trout rainbow wild	0.44	0.40			
Oysters eastern wild	0.23	0.30			
Sea bass	0.47	0.18			
Shrimp	0.12	0.12			
Lobster	0.07	0.10			
Tuna light canned in water drained	0.17	0.02			
Tilapia	0.11				
Scallops	0.09	0.06			
Cod Pacific	0.1	0.04			
Tuna yellowfin	0.09	0.01			
Mean DHA and EPA Omega-3 Fatty Acids g/3 ounce fish	0.4531	0.2733			
Calculations total Omega-3 FA g to fish g			0.7264	85.02	117.043

522 ¶ Data on omega-3 fatty acid content of varieties of fish came from the National Institutes of
523 Health Office of Dietary Supplements (USA)

524

525

526 **Supplementary Table 3. Calculations of KC/d from g/day of animal and plant foods¶**

Foods	Food sub-categories	Mean kcal/serving	Mean g/serving	Mean kcal/g
Milk (2% fat)		122	244	0.5
Fish		218	170	1.28
Eggs		72	50	1.44
Poultry		187	85	2.91
Red meat		247	85	2.91
Processed meat				
	Salami	222	59	3.76
	Pastrami	104	71	1.46
	Ring baloney	86	28	3.07
	Pepperoni	94	100	0.94
Average processed meat		126.5	64.5	1.96
Fruits		97	162	0.60
Vegetables		59	91	0.65
Legumes		249	179	1.39
Nuts		172	28	6.14
Seeds				
	Flax seeds	55	10	5.5
	Chia seeds	58	12	4.83
	Fennel seeds	34.5	10	3.45
	Hemp seeds	55.3	10	5.53
Average of seeds		50.7	10.5	4.83
Average of nuts and seeds		111.4	19.25	5.78
Corn		99	103	0.96
Potatoes		161	173	0.93
Sweet potatoes		115	151	0.76
Rice		205	158	1.3
Whole grains		120	52	2.31

¶ Source: NutritionIX app¹²

Article information

Corresponding author: David K. Cundiff, MD, Independent researcher

(davidkcundiff@gmail.com).

Contributors

DKC had full access to the GBD data in the study and takes responsibility for the integrity of the data and the accuracy of the data analysis. DKC conceived and designed the study, acquired and analysed the GBD data from IHME, interpreted the study findings, drafted the manuscript, critically reviewed and edited the manuscript and tables, and approved the final version for publication.

CW designed software programs in R to format and population weight the data, aided with the SAS statistical analysis, critically reviewed the manuscript, and approved the final version for publication.

Competing interest disclosures: None reported.

Competing interests' statement: Both authors have completed the ICMJE uniform disclosure form at www.icmje.org/coi_disclosure.pdf and declare: no support from any Organization for the submitted work; no financial relationships with any organizations that might have an interest in the submitted work in the previous three years; no other relationships or activities that could appear to have influenced the submitted work.

Funding/Support: This research received no grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sectors. The Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation funded the acquisition of the data by the IHME for this analysis.

Role of the Funder/Sponsor: The IHME provided the data for this analysis but neither the IHME nor Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation had any role in the analysis of the data.

Data Sharing Statement: The formatted analysis dataset for this analysis, SAS codes, and Excel files are posted on the Mendeley data repository <https://data.mendeley.com/datasets/g6b39zxck4/6>

Additional Contributions

We thank Scott Glenn and Brent Bell from IHME who supplied us with the GBD risk factor exposure data.

Checklist: This report followed the STrengthening the Reporting of OBservational studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) guidelines for reporting global health estimates.⁵³

References

1. Teicholz N. **The scientific report guiding the US dietary guidelines: is it scientific?** *BMJ*. 2015; **351**. <http://www.bmj.com/bmj/351/bmj.h4962.full.pdf>
2. Teicholz N. **The scientific report guiding the US dietary guidelines: is it scientific?** **Rapid responses.** *BMJ*. 2015; **351**: h4962. <https://www.bmj.com/content/351/bmj.h4962/rapid-responses>
3. Global Burden of Disease Study 2017 (GBD 2017) Data Resources. Seattle, Washington: Institute of Health Metrics and Evaluation 2018; Accessed. <http://ghdx.healthdata.org/gbd-2017>
4. Global Health Data Exchange. Seattle, WA: Institute of Health Metrics and Evaluation 2017; Accessed January 10, 2020. <http://ghdx.healthdata.org/>
5. Naghavi M, Abajobir AA, Abbafati C, et al. **Global, regional, and national age-sex specific mortality for 264 causes of death, 1980–2016: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2016.** *The Lancet*. 2017; **390** (10100): 1151-1210. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(17\)32152-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(17)32152-9)
6. Flaxman AD, Lee YY, Vos T, et al. **An Integrative Metaregression Framework for Descriptive Epidemiology.** Seattle, WA: University of Washington Press, 2015.
7. **GBD 2017 Risk Factor Collaborators. Global, regional, and national comparative risk assessment of 84 behavioural, environmental and occupational, and metabolic risks or clusters of risks for 195 countries and territories, 1990–2017: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2017: Table of risk factor definitions.** *The Lancet*. 2018; **392** (10159): 1923-94. <https://www.thelancet.com/action/showFullTableHTML?isHtml=true&tableId=tbl1&pii=S0140-6736%2818%2932225-6>
8. **PROTOCOL FOR THE GLOBAL BURDEN OF DISEASES, INJURIES, AND RISK FACTORS STUDY (GBD) Version 3.0; Issue 26.** Seattle, Washington: Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation Accessed August 2, 2019. http://www.healthdata.org/sites/default/files/files/Projects/GBD/GBD_Protocol.pdf
9. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. . United Nations Accessed August 26, 2021. <http://www.fao.org/faostat/en/#data>
10. **Call for Collaborators.** . Seattle, Washington: Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation at the University of Washington 2019; Accessed April 25, 2019. <http://www.healthdata.org/gbd/call-for-collaborators>
11. **Omega 3 Fatty Acids: Fact Sheet for Health Professionals.** The Office of Dietary Supplements 2018; Accessed September 1, 2018. <https://ods.od.nih.gov/factsheets/Omega3FattyAcids-HealthProfessional/>
12. **Nutritionix Track App.** Syndigo LLC Accessed April 25, 2019. <https://www.nutritionix.com/>
13. Ritchie H, Roser M. **Diet Compositions.** *Our World in Data*. 2017. <https://ourworldindata.org/diet-compositions>
14. Willett W, Rockström J, Loken B, et al. **Food in the Anthropocene: the EAT-Lancet Commission on healthy diets from sustainable food systems.** *The Lancet*. 2019; **393** (10170): 447-492. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(18\)31788-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(18)31788-4)

15. Noncommunicable diseases: Mortality Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization 2021; Accessed August 25, 2021. <https://www.who.int/data/gho/data/themes/topics/topic-details/GHO/ncd-mortality>
16. Zagmutt FJ, Pouzou JG, Costard S. **The EAT-Lancet Commission: a flawed approach?** *The Lancet*. 2019; **394** (10204): 1140-1141. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(19\)31903-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(19)31903-8)
17. Torjesen I. **WHO pulls support from initiative promoting global move to plant based foods.** *BMJ*. 2019; **365**: 11700. <https://www.bmj.com/content/bmj/365/bmj.11700.full.pdf>
18. Willett W, Rockström J, Lang T, et al. Healthy Diets From Sustainable Food Systems, Food Planet Health: Target 1 Healthy Diets pg 10. Stockholm, Sweden: EAT--Established by the Stordalen Foundation, Stockholm Resilience Centre and Wellcome Trust 2019; Accessed July 10, 2020. [https://eatforum.org/content/uploads/2019/01/EAT-Lancet Commission Summary Report.pdf](https://eatforum.org/content/uploads/2019/01/EAT-Lancet_Commission_Summary_Report.pdf)
19. Beulens JWJ, Booth SL, van den Heuvel EGHM, Stoecklin E, Baka A, Vermeer C. **The role of menaquinones (vitamin K2) in human health.** *British Journal of Nutrition*. 2013; **110**: 1357–1368. <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/british-journal-of-nutrition/article/the-role-of-menaquinones-vitamin-k2-in-human-health/5B9F317B526629D8BA77B6435F1E5509>
20. Zile MH. **Vitamin A-not for your eyes only: requirement for heart formation begins early in embryogenesis.** *Nutrients*. 2010; **2** (5): 532-50. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3257662/>
21. Xing X, Tao F. [Advance of study on vitamin A deficiency and excess associated with congenital heart disease]. *Wei Sheng Yan Jiu*. 2008; **37** (6): 754-6. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/19239019/>
22. Saremi A, Arora R. **Vitamin E and cardiovascular disease.** *Am J Ther*. 2010; **17** (3): e56-65.
23. Wang L, Song Y, Manson JE, et al. **Circulating 25-Hydroxy-Vitamin D and Risk of Cardiovascular Disease: A Meta-Analysis of Prospective Studies.** *Circulation: Cardiovascular Quality and Outcomes*. 2012; **5** (6): 819-829. <http://circoutcomes.ahajournals.org/content/5/6/819.abstract>
24. Fu X, Harshman SG, Shen X, et al. **Multiple Vitamin K Forms Exist in Dairy Foods.** *Current developments in nutrition*. 2017; **1** (6): e000638-e000638. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5998353/>
25. Walther B, Chollet M. Vitamin K2 - Vital for Health and Wellbeing. In: Gordeladze JO, ed. Menaquinones, Bacteria, and Foods: Vitamin K2 in the Diet: IntechOpen, 2017.
26. Kamao M, Suhara Y, Tsugawa N, et al. **Vitamin K content of foods and dietary vitamin K intake in Japanese young women.** *J Nutr Sci Vitaminol (Tokyo)*. 2007; **53** (6): 464-70. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/18202532/>
27. Kaneki M HS, Hosoi T, Fujiwara S, Lyons A, Crean SJ, Ishida N, Nakagawa M, Takechi M, Sano Y, Mizuno Y, Hoshino S, Miyao M, Inoue S, Horiki K, Shiraki M, Ouchi Y, Orimo H. **Japanese fermented soybean food as the major determinant of the large geographic difference in circulating levels of vitamin K2: possible implications for hip-fracture risk.** *Nutrition*. 2001; **17** (4): 315-21. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/11369171/>

28. Joseph M. Fermented Soy Products: A Guide To 12 Traditional Foods. Nutrition Advance 2020; Accessed April 11, 2021. <https://www.nutritionadvance.com/fermented-soy-products/>
29. Tamang JP, Cotter PD, Endo A, et al. **Fermented foods in a global age: East meets West.** *COMPREHENSIVE REVIEWS IN FOOD SCIENCE AND FOOD SAFETY*. 2020; **19** (1): 184-217. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.1111/1541-4337.12520>
30. Pu J, Romanelli R, Zhao B, et al. **Dyslipidemia in special ethnic populations.** *Cardiology clinics*. 2015; **33** (2): 325-333. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4421090/>
31. Frank ATH, Zhao B, Jose PO, Azar KMJ, Fortmann SP, Palaniappan LP. **Racial/ethnic differences in dyslipidemia patterns.** *Circulation*. 2014; **129** (5): 570-579. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4212818/>
32. Keys A, Menotti A, Karvonen MJ, et al. **The diet and 15-year death rate in the seven countries study.** *Am J Epidemiol*. 1986; **124** (6): 903-15. <https://academic.oup.com/aje/article-abstract/124/6/903/174332?redirectedFrom=fulltext>
33. Mahmood SS, Levy D, Vasan RS, Wang TJ. **The Framingham Heart Study and the epidemiology of cardiovascular disease: a historical perspective.** *Lancet (London, England)*. 2014; **383** (9921): 999-1008. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4159698/>
34. Dehghan M, Mente A, Zhang X, et al. **Associations of fats and carbohydrate intake with cardiovascular disease and mortality in 18 countries from five continents (PURE): a prospective cohort study.** *The Lancet*. 2017; **390** (10107): 2050-2062. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(17\)32252-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(17)32252-3)
35. Countries Who Eat The Most Cheese. World Atlas 2021; Accessed March 28, 2021. <https://www.worldatlas.com/articles/countries-who-consume-the-most-cheese.html#:~:text=The%20top%20cheese%20consumer%20is,kilograms%20of%20cheese%20per%20capita.>
36. Cheese Consumption Per Capita in New Zealand. Czech Republic: Helgi Library, Source: Faostat Accessed April 9, 2021. <https://www.helgilibrary.com/indicators/cheese-consumption-per-capita/new-zealand/>
37. Khalil Z, Alam B, Akbari AR, Sharma H. **The Medical Benefits of Vitamin K(2) on Calcium-Related Disorders.** *Nutrients*. 2021; **13** (2): 691. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC7926526/>
38. POTATO PROCESSING AND USES. Lima, Peru: International Potato Center Accessed May 28, 2020. <https://cipotato.org/potato/potato-processing-uses/>
39. Juul F, Vaidean G, Lin Y, Deierlein Andrea L, Parekh N. **Ultra-Processed Foods and Incident Cardiovascular Disease in the Framingham Offspring Study.** *Journal of the American College of Cardiology*. 2021; **77** (12): 1520-1531. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jacc.2021.01.047>
40. Srouf B, Fezeu LK, Kesse-Guyot E, et al. **Ultra-processed food intake and risk of cardiovascular disease: prospective cohort study (NutriNet-Santé).** *BMJ*. 2019; **365**: 11451. <https://www.bmj.com/content/bmj/365/bmj.11451.full.pdf>
41. Monteiro CA, Moubarac JC, Cannon G, Ng SW, Popkin B. **Ultra-processed products are becoming dominant in the global food system.** *Obes Rev*. 2013; **14** Suppl 2: 21-8. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/24102801/>

42. Mozaffarian D, Fahimi S, Singh GM, et al. **Global Sodium Consumption and Death from Cardiovascular Causes.** *New England Journal of Medicine*. 2014; **371** (7): 624-634. <https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMoa1304127>
43. O'Donnell M, Mente A, Yusuf S. **Sodium Intake and Cardiovascular Health.** *Circulation Research*. 2015; **116** (6): 1046-1057. <https://www.ahajournals.org/doi/abs/10.1161/CIRCRESAHA.116.303771>
44. Roseboom T, van der Meulen JHP, Osmond C, et al. **Coronary heart disease after prenatal exposure to the Dutch famine, 1944-45.** *Heart*. 2000; **84** (6): 595-598. <https://www.heart.bmj.com/content/84/6/595>
45. Dieterich CM, Felice JP, O'Sullivan E, Rasmussen KM. **Breastfeeding and health outcomes for the mother-infant dyad.** *Pediatric clinics of North America*. 2013; **60** (1): 31-48. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3508512/>
46. Ambient (outdoor) air pollution. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization 2018; Accessed March 24, 2021. [https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/ambient-\(outdoor\)-air-quality-and-health](https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/ambient-(outdoor)-air-quality-and-health)
47. Tobacco responsible for 20% of deaths from coronary heart disease Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization 2020; Accessed March 2, 2021. <https://www.who.int/news/item/22-09-2020-tobacco-responsible-for-20-of-deaths-from-coronary-heart-disease>
48. Vaziri ND. **Mechanisms of lead-induced hypertension and cardiovascular disease.** *American Journal of Physiology-Heart and Circulatory Physiology*. 2008; **295** (2): H454-H465. <https://journals.physiology.org/doi/abs/10.1152/ajpheart.00158.2008>
49. Lanphear BP, Rauch S, Auinger P, Allen RW, Hornung RW. **Low-level lead exposure and mortality in US adults: a population-based cohort study.** *The Lancet Public Health*. 2018; **3** (4): e177-e184. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2468-2667\(18\)30025-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2468-2667(18)30025-2)
50. Bikbov B, Purcell CA, Levey AS, et al. **Global, regional, and national burden of chronic kidney disease, 1990-2017: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2017.** *The Lancet*. 2020; **395** (10225): 709-733. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(20\)30045-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)30045-3)
51. **Global, regional, and national age-sex-specific mortality for 282 causes of death in 195 countries and territories, 1980-2017: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2017.** *Lancet*. 2018; **392** (10159): 1736-1788. [https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736\(18\)32203-7/fulltext](https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736(18)32203-7/fulltext)
52. Afshin A, Sur PJ, Fay KA, et al. **Health effects of dietary risks in 195 countries, 1990-2017: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2017.** *The Lancet*. 2019; **393** (10184): 1958-1972. [https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736\(19\)30041-8/fulltext](https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736(19)30041-8/fulltext)
53. Stevens GA, Alkema L, Black PRE, et al. **Guidelines for Accurate and Transparent Health Estimates Reporting: the GATHER statement.** *The Lancet*. 2016; **388** (10062): e19-e23. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(16\)30388-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(16)30388-9)

LDL-C, $r = -0.279$ (95% CI -0.299 to -0.258, $p < 0.0001$, $n = 7846$ cohorts)

FSVV=Processed meat+Red meat+Fish+Milk+Poultry+Eggs+SFA+PUFA+TFA (all in Kcal/day)

FSVV Worldwide: $r = -0.329$ (95% CI -0.299 to -0.258, $p < 0.0001$, $n = 7846$ cohorts)

FSVV ≥ 567.27 Kcal/day, $r = 0.523$ (95% CI 0.476 to 0.567, $p < 0.0001$, $n = 974$ cohorts)