Short-stay admissions and lower staffing associated with larger COVID-19 outbreaks in
Maryland nursing homes

T. Joseph Mattingly II, PharmD, MBA, PhD,^a Alison Trinkoff, RN, MPH, ScD,^b Alison D
Lydecker, MPH,^c Justin J. Kim, MD,^c Jung Min Yoon, MSN, RN,^d Mary-Claire Roghmann,
MD, MS^{c,e}

^aUniversity of Maryland School of Pharmacy, Baltimore, Maryland 21201, USA

^bDepartment of Family and Community Health, University of Maryland School of Nursing,
Baltimore, Maryland 21201, USA

^cDepartment of Epidemiology and Public Health, University of Maryland School of Medicine,
Baltimore, Maryland 21201, USA

^dUniversity of Maryland School of Nursing, Baltimore, Maryland 21201, USA

^eGeriatrics Research Education and Clinical Center, VA Maryland Health Care System,
Baltimore, Maryland 21201, USA

Corresponding author:

Mary-Claire Roghmann, MD, MS
University of Maryland School of Medicine

10 South Pine Street, MTSF Room 336

Baltimore, MD 21201

Telephone: 410-706-0062

Email: mroghman@som.umaryland.edu

25 Running title: Characteristics of COVID-19 outbreaks in MD NHs

26 Key words: COVID-19, nursing homes, outbreaks

27

28 Funding sources: This work was supported by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention

29 (Epicenter Grant 1U01CK000556-02-02)

30

31 Word count: 1882

32 Reference count: 20

33

34 Brief summary: Maryland nursing homes in counties with a high COVID-19 incidence, more

35 licensed beds, a higher proportion of short-stay residents, or lower CNA staffing hours were

36 more likely to have a larger outbreak early in the pandemic.

37

38 Acknowledgements: The sponsor had no role in the design, methods, analysis, or preparation of

39 the manuscript.

40

Abstract

Objectives: Identify facility factors associated with a larger COVID-19 outbreak among residents in Maryland nursing homes (NHs).

Design: Observational

Setting and Participants: All Maryland NHs.

Methods: Resident COVID-19 cases were collected for each Maryland NH from January 1, 2020 through July 1, 2020. Cumulative COVID-19 incidence through July 1, 2020 was collected for each county and Baltimore City. Facility characteristics for each Maryland NH were collected from time periods prior to January 1, 2020. NH outbreaks were defined as larger when total resident COVID-19 cases exceeded 10% of licensed beds. Descriptive and multivariable analyses were conducted to assess the strongest predictors for the primary outcome of larger COVID-19 outbreak.

Results: NHs located in counties with high cumulative incidence of COVID-19 were more likely to have larger outbreaks (OR 4.5, 95% CI 2.3-8.7, $p < 0.01$). NHs with at least 100 beds were more likely to have larger outbreaks, especially among facilities with >140 licensed beds (100-140 beds vs <100 beds: OR 1.9, 95% CI 0.9-4.1, $p = 0.09$; >140 beds vs <100 beds: OR 2.9, 95% CI 1.3-6.1, $p < 0.01$). NHs with more short-stay residents (OR 2.2, 95% CI 1.1-4.8, $p = 0.04$) or fewer Certified Nursing Assistant hours daily (OR 2.6, 95% CI 1.3-5.3, $p < 0.01$) also were more likely to have larger outbreaks. Resident race and gender were not significant predictors of larger outbreaks after adjustment for other factors.

Conclusions: Large NHs with lower staffing levels and many short-stay residents in counties with high COVID-19 incidence were at increased risk for COVID-19 outbreaks. Understanding

the characteristics of nursing homes associated with larger outbreaks can help us prepare for the next pandemic.

Introduction

Nursing home residents represent a disproportionately high percentage of deaths from coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) for two major reasons. First, they are at high risk for acquiring this infection because of the congregate setting, with proximity to other residents and the staff who care for them. Second, most residents are older adults with multiple comorbidities such as heart disease and diabetes, all associated with higher risks of hospitalization and death from COVID-19.

COVID-19 outbreaks typically occur in nursing homes (NHs) after introduction of the virus from asymptomatic and infectious NH staff, with subsequent spread to other staff, to residents and from resident-to-resident. Infection prevention has focused on a bundled approach for reducing introduction and spread through: visitor restrictions, pre-admission testing and quarantine for residents, routine staff testing, symptomatic resident testing, universal medical masks with eye protection for staff, and cloth face masks for residents when outside of their rooms.¹ Vaccination of staff and residents will reduce risks even further.²

Despite their vulnerabilities, some NHs have had larger outbreaks than others. Studies to date have shown that various organizational and facility factors such as facility size and occupancy, ratings and quality metrics, staffing, and resident ethnicity are related to the presence of COVID-

19 in NHs.^{3–12} The purpose of this study was to assess NH factors that determine the trajectory of COVID-19 outbreaks.

We seek to add to the existing literature by focusing on the state of Maryland during its initial wave of infections in the first half of 2020. During this time, the state imposed health directives to restrict visitation, implement infection prevention protocols, expedite testing of symptomatic residents, quarantine new admissions and test all residents and staff in all Maryland nursing homes. Our analysis is unique in that we compare a set of nursing homes under the same health directives by outbreak size and have unique facility data on family satisfaction with nursing home care. This allows us to assess factors associated with outbreak size while controlling for introduction from the local community.

Methods

Design overview: This is a secondary data analysis relating facility factors to size of COVID-19 outbreak in Maryland NHs. To evaluate management of the COVID-19 outbreaks, NHs were divided into two comparison groups: those with cumulative resident cases totaling up to 10% of bed capacity, vs those with cumulative resident cases totaling more than 10% of beds from January 1 to July 1, 2020. This was chosen over a binary outbreak definition (yes/no), given that introduction of COVID-19 was likely dependent on community incidence, whereas outbreak size could also reflect facility factors. NHs that contained the outbreak ($\leq 10\%$ of beds) represented facilities that prevented or managed the outbreak effectively.

The sample included all Maryland NHs with Medicare and/or Medicaid Certification that had complete data for all covariates (n=216). Weekly COVID-19 case counts for NH residents were obtained from the Maryland Department of Health coronavirus website¹³ for weeks ending April 29, 2020 (the first week cumulative data from January forward were reported) through July 1, 2020. County-level cumulative incidence of COVID-19 through July 1, 2020 was calculated by subtracting the total number of COVID-19 cases in the county NHs from the total number of COVID-19 cases in the county and then dividing by the total county population. Population and COVID-19 cases by county were obtained from the Johns Hopkins University Coronavirus Resource Center.¹⁴ Counties were then divided into tertiles by cumulative incidence per thousand population (low: 0-4.00 per 1000, moderate: 4.01-7.86, high: >7.86). Each NH was assigned to the cumulative incidence tertile for its county of location.

NH-level resident and facility characteristics were obtained as a flat file for 2019-20 from the Center for Medicaid and Medicare Services (CMS) CASPER and from the Maryland Health Care Commission (MHCC). These included facility size: small-<100 beds, medium: 101-140, large: >140 beds, ownership: for-profit vs. not for profit (government, other), and CMS quality star ratings, ranging from 1-5. The MHCC defines residents as short stay when facility length of stay is <100 days. Family satisfaction was examined in relation to outbreak size, comparing NHs on the question: “family would recommend facility to others” (<80% would recommend, vs. ≥80% recommend) using the most recent (2017) MHCC family survey data.

Staffing data were calculated as hours per resident day (HPRD) using Payroll Based Journal (PBJ) data from CMS. PBJ data provides daily information on the total working hours of NH

staff and the number of residents within a 24-hour period at each NH.¹⁵ HPRD were calculated by dividing total nursing staff work hours for a 24-hour period by the number of NH residents for the same period during quarter 4, 2019 (October-December).¹⁶ Then a quarterly average HPRD was calculated for certified nurse assistants (CNAs): nurse aides and certified medication aides. CNA HPRD were dichotomized as <75 percentile vs. ≥75 percentile.

Analysis: Descriptive statistics were reported for all variables, beginning with the unadjusted association between all independent variables and the primary outcome, outbreak size, using student t-test for continuous variables and Chi Square or Fisher's Exact test for categorical variables, as appropriate. In addition, NHs were compared by COVID-19 outbreak size in relation to the facility factors using multivariable regression techniques. Independent variable selection used forward forced entry, beginning with county-level cumulative incidence, to control for the likelihood of introduction into the facility.¹⁷ The Hosmer and Lemeshow goodness of fit test¹⁸ was used to assess model fit. All analyses were performed with Stata 15.1 (Stata Corp., College Station, TX) and SAS 9.4 (SAS Institute, Inc. Cary, NC).

Results

Of the 227 NHs in Maryland, 216 (95%) NHs were included in our analysis with 6 NHs excluded for missing nursing staffing hours, 4 for missing family experience survey data, and 1 for missing data on age and gender of residents. Table 1 shows the baseline characteristics for residents and facilities as well as the proportion of NHs with total resident COVID-19 cases >10% of licensed beds.

Descriptive analyses found associations between several resident and facility characteristics and a larger COVID-19 outbreak (Table 2). Facilities with a higher proportion of residents that were male ($p=0.03$), black ($p=0.0005$), and short stay ($p=0.004$) were associated with having a larger outbreak ($>10\%$ of licensed beds). Facility size was associated with COVID-19 outbreak size ($p=0.0002$) with larger NHs (>140 beds) almost twice as likely to have a larger outbreak as small NHs (<100 beds). Higher CMS quality star ratings were associated ($p=0.04$) with having a larger outbreak.

Table 3 shows the results of six different logistic regression models, beginning with our base model that included county incidence, facility size, proportion of short-stay residents, and proportion of families surveyed who would recommend the facility. Across all models, higher county incidence ($p<0.0001$), larger facilities ($p=0.007$), higher proportion of short stay residents ($p=0.035$), and CNA HPRD below 75th percentile ($p=0.009$) were consistently associated with having a COVID-19 outbreak $>10\%$; race and gender were not significant after adjustment for other factors. A high CMS star quality rating remained associated with a larger outbreak though not significantly so (OR 1.68, 95% CI 0.84-3.35). Family recommendation was somewhat associated with larger outbreaks, though this was attenuated by CNA HPRD. All six models passed the Hosmer and Lemeshow goodness of fit test with p-values above 0.6.

Discussion

In summary, our analysis found that nursing homes 1) in counties with a high COVID-19 cumulative incidence, 2) with more licensed beds, 3) with a higher proportion of short-stay residents, and 4) lower CNA staffing hours were more likely to have a larger outbreak early in

the pandemic. After adjusting for these factors, neither race nor gender were associated with a larger outbreak. The highest CMS star quality rating remained associated with a larger outbreak.

The geographic location of the nursing home had the strongest association with larger outbreaks. This is not surprising, as staff tend to live in the same county where they work and staff introduce COVID-19 into the facility; therefore, adjusting for local prevalence is a proxy for the number of introductions into the nursing home. Community spread is increasingly recognized as a driver for COVID-19 introductions into nursing homes, as county infection rate, population density, and the movement of staff between nursing homes have been described as risk factors for outbreaks.^{3,19,20}

Larger nursing homes had a higher risk of larger outbreaks (i.e., cumulative resident cases >10% of licensed beds) perhaps because they employ more staff, thereby increasing the chance of COVID-19 introduction. This is consistent with existing literature suggesting that larger and more fully occupied facilities were more likely to have COVID-19 cases³⁻⁶. We also found that facilities with a greater proportion of residents who were short-stay had larger outbreaks. Facilities with more short-stay residents have more admissions and, at least early in the pandemic, short-stay admissions from hospitals also may have introduced COVID-19 into nursing homes.

Nursing home metrics reflecting poorer quality, including infection control deficiencies and complaints, have been associated with higher COVID-19 case rates,^{3,7,8} while higher star ratings have been associated with lower rates.^{9,10} Surprisingly, higher CMS Quality ratings were

associated with larger outbreaks in our study (see Table 2), perhaps because larger facilities tended to have higher CMS ratings. The highest CMS star quality rating was associated although not significantly with a larger outbreak in our final models.

We did find that facilities with lower family satisfaction scores and fewer CNA staffing hours, two other measures of quality, had larger outbreaks, consistent with existing work.^{4,9,11,12} Higher staffing ratios may lead to better adherence to state-mandated infection guidelines, thus preventing spread, for example, allowing for more rapid adoption of infection prevention practices. Finally, after adjusting for other NH characteristics, gender and race of NH residents was no longer associated with larger COVID-19 outbreaks. This is in contrast to multiple studies suggesting an association between race and COVID-19 cases in NHs, supporting the idea that the NH characteristics (e.g. county location, staffing) are more important than the NHs' resident demographic characteristics.^{3,4,9,10}

Our study is unique as our outcome variable measures the ability to prevent spread of COVID-19 and we account for community prevalence by county in a single state with a coordinated response to COVID-19 in NHs. Most previous studies have used a binary outcome with any case defined as positive,^{3-5,7-9,12} while only a minority have distinguished between small and large outbreaks.^{10,11} We also had a unique measure of quality in the Maryland Health Care Commission's family satisfaction survey.

In conclusion, our results highlight the importance of local epidemiology in the risk of outbreaks and suggest infection control precautions can be adjusted based on local incidence. Large

facilities with a higher proportion of short stay residents are at increased risk for COVID-19 outbreaks despite community infection rates. This highlights the potential importance of separating long- and short-stay residents and the potential advantages of smaller nursing homes for infection prevention through fewer staff members and visitors to introduce infections. Finally, we demonstrate that a high CMS Quality star rating may not be a good measure of a nursing home's ability to prevent spread in Maryland unlike another quality measure, staffing hours per resident, that was associated with outbreak size. Understanding the characteristics of nursing homes associated with larger outbreaks can help us to better prepare for the next pandemic.

Conflicts of Interest: None to report.

Funding sources: This work was supported by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (Epicenter Grant 1U01CK000556-02-02)

239 **Table 1** – Nursing home characteristics in Maryland as a baseline in December 2019.

	Maryland (N = 216)	% or SD
<i>Resident Characteristics at the Facility-level</i>		
Average resident age at facility (Mean/SD)	76.2	7.8
Proportion of male residents (Mean/SD)	40.1	11
Proportion of black residents (Mean/SD)	35.6	28.2
Proportion of residents on Medicaid (Mean/SD)	27.8	17.5
Proportion of short stay residents (Mean/SD)	61.5	18.0
Proportion of dementia patients (Mean/SD)	33.8	13.7
Proportion of patients who are ambulatory (Mean/SD)	30.8	10.7
<i>Facility Characteristics</i>		
Total licensed beds		
Small (<100)	67	31.0
Medium (100-140)	73	33.8
Large (≥140)	76	35.2
Ownership		
Non-profit & government	53	24.5
For-profit	163	75.5
Chain		
Yes	116	53.7
No	100	46.3
Alzheimer's unit		
Yes	71	32.9
No	145	67.1
CMS star ratings – quality		
1-Star	0	0.0
2-Star	17	7.9
3-Star	39	18.2
4-Star	77	36.0
5-Star	81	37.9
Proportion of families who would recommend facility (Mean/SD)	79.5	15.9
Certified nursing assistant hours per resident day (HPRD) (Mean/SD)	2.1	0.4
Nursing home county-level cumulative incidence of COVID-19		
Low	28	13.0
Moderate	38	17.6
High	150	69.4
<i>Outcome Variable: Outbreak size</i>		
Total resident COVID-19 cases greater than 10% of licensed beds		
Yes	127	58.8
No	89	41.2

240

Table 2 – Nursing homes with larger outbreaks: total resident COVID-19 cases greater than 10% of licensed beds through July 1, 2020 as compared to those without.

	Total resident COVID-19 cases greater than 10% of licensed Beds				
	No (N = 89)	% or SD	Yes (N = 127)	% or SD	p-value*
<i>Resident Characteristics at Facility level</i>					
Age in Years (Mean/SD)	77.4	8.1	75.4	7.5	0.07
Proportion of residents with dementia (Mean/SD)	35.5	13.4	32.5	13.9	0.12
Proportion of residents who are ambulatory (Mean/SD)	31.2	11.2	30.5	10.5	0.61
Proportion of male residents					
Less than 40%	52	58.4	55	44.3	0.03*
Greater than or equal to 40%	37	41.6	72	56.7	
Proportion of Black residents					
Less than 28%	60	67.4	55	43.3	0.0005*
Greater than or equal to 28%	29	32.6	72	56.7	
Proportion of short-stay residents					
Less than 50%	27	30.3	18	14.2	0.004*
Greater than or equal to 50%	62	69.7	109	85.8	
<i>Facility Characteristics</i>					
Total licensed beds					
Small (<100)	41	46.1	26	20.5	0.0002*
Medium (100-140)	27	30.3	46	36.2	
Large (>140)	21	23.6	55	43.3	
Ownership					
Non-profit & government	26	29.2	27	21.3	0.18
For-profit	63	70.8	100	78.7	
Chain					
Yes	41	46.1	75	59.1	0.06
No	48	53.9	52	40.9	
Alzheimer's unit					
Yes	28	31.5	43	33.9	0.71
No	61	68.5	84	66.1	
CMS star ratings – quality					
1-Star	0	0.0	0	0.0	0.04*
2-Star	11	12.5	6	4.8	
3-Star	16	18.2	23	18.3	
4-Star	36	40.9	41	32.5	
5-Star	25	28.4	56	44.4	
Certified nursing assistants HPRD					
HPRD above 75 th percentile	32	36.0	23	18.1	0.003*
HPRD below 75 th percentile	57	64.0	104	81.9	
More than 80% of families would recommend NH					
Yes	58	65.2	59	46.5	0.007*
No	31	34.8	68	53.5	
Nursing home county-level cumulative incidence of COVID-19					
Low	22	24.7	6	4.7	<0.0001*
Moderate	21	23.6	17	13.4	
High	46	51.7	104	81.9	

244 **Table 3:** Logistic regression models to predict Maryland nursing homes with cumulative resident COVID-19 cases totaling >10% of
245 licensed beds, (n=216 facilities).

	Model 1		Model 2		Model 3		Model 4		Model 5		Model 6	
Variable	OR	95% CI	OR	95% CI	OR	95% CI	OR	95% CI	OR	95% CI	OR	95% CI
County-level Incidence (High vs Moderate/Low)	3.9	2.04-7.48	4.38	2.24-8.56	4.47	2.30-8.71	4.42	2.24-8.70	3.67	1.76-7.66	3.93	1.98-7.79
NH size: Medium NH 100-140 bed vs small <100 beds	2.01	0.95-4.26	1.84	0.86-3.93	1.93	0.91-4.09	1.91	0.89-4.08	1.8	0.84-3.85	2.01	0.95-4.27
Large NH >140 vs small <100 beds	2.85	1.33-6.08	2.72	1.26-5.89	2.86	1.33-6.13	2.82	1.30-6.12	2.63	1.21-5.68	3.08	1.42-6.69
Proportion of short-stay residents (50% or greater vs. <50%)	2.4	1.14-5.04	2.27	1.07-4.84	2.24	1.06-4.75	2.27	1.06-4.86	2.50	1.14-5.45	2.00	0.93-4.32
Less than 80% of families would recommend facility	1.67	0.9-3.11	1.3	0.67-2.54								
Certified nursing assistants HPRD below 75 th percentile			2.33	1.10-4.95	2.58	1.27-5.26	2.52	1.20-5.32	2.49	1.22-5.09	2.77	1.35-5.70
Proportion of male residents below median (40%)							1.07	0.55-2.08				
Proportion of Black residents below median (28%)									1.55	0.76-3.15		
CMS star rating: quality = 5 Stars											1.68	0.84-3.35
Bold if significant at p < 0.05; Abbreviations: OR= odds ratio, CI=confidence interval, NH=nursing home, HPRD=hours per resident day, CMS=Center for Medicare and Medicaid Services												

246

References

1. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Interim Infection Prevention and Control Recommendations for Healthcare Personnel During the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Pandemic. Published February 23, 2021. <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/hcp/infection-control-recommendations.html>
2. Chidambaram P, Garfield R, Neuman T, Levitt L. Is the End of the Long-Term Care Crisis Within Sight? New COVID-19 Cases and Deaths in Long-Term Care Facilities Are Dropping. KFF. Published February 24, 2021. <https://www.kff.org/policy-watch/is-the-end-of-the-long-term-care-crisis-within-sight-new-covid-19-cases-and-deaths-in-long-term-care-facilities-are-dropping/>
3. Sun CLF, Zuccarelli E, Zerhouni EGA, et al. Predicting Coronavirus Disease 2019 Infection Risk and Related Risk Drivers in Nursing Homes: A Machine Learning Approach. *J Am Med Dir Assoc*. 2020;21(11):1533-1538.e6.
4. Unruh MA, Yun H, Zhang Y, Braun RT, Jung H-Y. Nursing Home Characteristics Associated With COVID-19 Deaths in Connecticut, New Jersey, and New York. *J Am Med Dir Assoc*. 2020;21(7):1001-1003.
5. Abrams HR, Loomer L, Gandhi A, Grabowski DC. Characteristics of U.S. Nursing Homes with COVID-19 Cases. *J Am Geriatr Soc*. 2020;68(8):1653-1656.
6. Brown KA, Jones A, Daneman N, et al. Association Between Nursing Home Crowding and COVID-19 Infection and Mortality in Ontario, Canada. *JAMA Intern Med*. Published online November 9, 2020.
7. Chatterjee P, Kelly S, Qi M, Werner RM. Characteristics and Quality of US Nursing Homes Reporting Cases of Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19). *JAMA Netw Open*. 2020;3(7):e2016930.

8. Bui DP, See I, Hesse EM, et al. Association Between CMS Quality Ratings and COVID-19 Outbreaks in Nursing Homes - West Virginia, March 17-June 11, 2020. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep.* 2020;69(37):1300-1304.
9. Li Y, Temkin-Greener H, Shan G, Cai X. COVID-19 Infections and Deaths among Connecticut Nursing Home Residents: Facility Correlates. *J Am Geriatr Soc.* Published online June 18, 2020.
10. He M, Li Y, Fang F. Is There a Link between Nursing Home Reported Quality and COVID-19 Cases? Evidence from California Skilled Nursing Facilities. *J Am Med Dir Assoc.* 2020;21(7):905-908.
11. Figueroa JF, Wadhera RK, Papanicolas I, et al. Association of Nursing Home Ratings on Health Inspections, Quality of Care, and Nurse Staffing With COVID-19 Cases. *JAMA.* 2020;324(11):1103-1105.
12. Harrington C, Ross L, Chapman S, Halifax E, Spurlock B, Bakerjian D. Nurse Staffing and Coronavirus Infections in California Nursing Homes. *Policy Polit Nurs Pract.* 2020;21(3):174-186.
13. Maryland Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. Maryland COVID-19 in Congregate Facility Settings. <https://coronavirus.maryland.gov/pages/hcf-resources>
14. Johns Hopkins Coronavirus Resource Center. COVID-19 United States Cases by County. <https://coronavirus.jhu.edu/>
15. Center for Medicare & Medicaid Services. Staffing Data Submission Payroll Based Journal (PBJ). Published 2020. <https://www.cms.gov/Medicare/Quality-Initiatives-Patient-Assessment-Instruments/NursingHomeQualityInits/Staffing-Data-Submission-PBJ>
16. National Quality Forum. *Patient Safety: Final Technical Report.*; 2016. https://www.qualityforum.org/Publications/2016/02/Patient_Safety_2015_Final_Report.aspx
17. Zhang Z. Model building strategy for logistic regression: purposeful selection. *Ann Transl Med.* 2016;4(6):111.

- 297 18. Hosmer DW, Lemeshow S, Sturdivant RX. *Applied Logistic Regression*. Vol 398. John Wiley
298 & Sons; 2013.
- 299 19. Chen MK, Chevalier JA, Long EF. Nursing home staff networks and COVID-19. *Proc Natl*
300 *Acad Sci*. 2021;118(1).
- 301 20. Bagchi S, Mak J, Li Q, et al. Rates of COVID-19 Among Residents and Staff Members in
302 Nursing Homes - United States, May 25-November 22, 2020. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly*
303 *Rep*. 2021;70(2):52-55.
- 304