Optimal Allocation of COVID-19 Vaccines in the Philippines

Christian Alvin H. Buhat^{a,b,*}, Destiny SM. Lutero^{a,b}, Yancee H. Olave^{a,b}, Kemuel M. Quindala III^{a,b},
Mary Grace P. Recreo^{a,b}, Dylan Antonio SJ. Talabis^{a,b}, Monica C. Torres^{a,b},
Jerrold M. Tubay^{a,b}, Jomar F. Rabajante^{a,b}

^a*Institute of Mathematical Sciences and Physics, University of the Philippines Los Baños, Laguna 4031, Philippines*

^b*University of the Philippines Resilience Institute, University of the Philippines, Philippines*

Abstract

Vaccine allocation is a national concern especially for countries such as the Philippines that have limited resources in acquiring COVID-19 vaccines. As such, certain groups are suggested to be prioritized for vaccination to protect the most vulnerable before vaccinating others. Our model suggests an allocation of vaccines such that COVID-19 deaths are minimized while the prioritization framework is satisfied. Results of the model show that a vaccine coverage of at least 50 to 70% of the population can be enough for a community with limited supplies, and an increase in vaccine supply is beneficial if initial coverage is less than the specified target range. Also, among the vaccines considered in the study, the one with 89.9% effectiveness and has a 183 Philippine peso (Php) price per dose projected the least number of deaths. Compared to other model variations and common allocation approaches, the model has achieved both an optimal and equitable allocation. This will be helpful for policymakers in determining a vaccine distribution for a resource-constrained community.

Keywords: COVID-19, infectious disease, linear programming, optimal allocation, vaccines

1. Introduction

The coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) is a novel beta-coronavirus that was initially identified to cause respiratory problems among people from a province in China in late 2019 [1]. It is a viral infection transmitted through respiratory particles, fomites, and other biological matter [2]. Beta-coronaviruses have caused outbreaks in the recent decades, with COVID-19 being characterized as a pandemic by the World Health Organization on the first quarter of 2020 [3, 4].

The Philippines is one of the countries greatly affected by this pandemic [5]. Its government placed the country under community lockdown since March 2020 as a measure to control the spread of the virus [6]. The continuous lockdown contributed to the increase in unemployment rate (10.4 percent as of December 2020) [7], decrease in remittance inflow (14-20 percent) [8], and decrease in GDP (9.5 percent decline in 2020) [9]. Bringing back jobs is crucial for a sustainable recovery of the economy [10]. All these will be possible when the COVID-19 spread is controlled.

Vaccination is considered to be an effective tool in preventing the spread of and deaths due to infectious diseases [11, 12]. Vaccine development takes years to complete from clinical trials to manufacturing [13]. Vaccinating huge groups is another problem entirely. Vaccines have specific storage and shipment requirements to maintain its effectiveness [14]. Once vaccines are available for COVID-19, frontline workers should be vaccinated first followed by the elderly and people with preexisting conditions, according to various government protocols [15]. The Philippine government plans to follow the same prioritization of people for vaccination but with the addition of indigenous people and uniformed personnel in the list [16]. The plan is also to prioritize those from the cities to expedite the recovery of the local economy [17]. Distribution of vaccines will be done through local government units (LGU). Since the vaccines are limited, proper allocation of doses for each LGU is important. An optimal allocation can be found by looking at the problem as an optimization problem that minimizes the number of deaths and follows the prioritization approved by the government.

In this paper, a linear programming (LP) model is formulated to determine the optimal allocation of vaccines for every city or province in the country. The succeeding parts of the paper presents the model formulation where the parameters and assumptions of the model are discussed, followed by the results and discussion where the optimal allocation for different cases are presented together with the sensitivity analysis and parameter analysis.

2. Model Formulation

The LP for vaccine allocation model in this paper aims to minimize deaths while satisfying the prioritization of certain groups for vaccination as suggested by the government. The formulation of the objective function and constraints are presented. Throughout the paper, we denote the city or province where the individuals are residing as locality i .

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

*Corresponding author. Institute of Mathematical Sciences and Physics, University of the Philippines Los Baños, Laguna, Philippines. Email: chbuhat@up.edu.ph

2.1. Objective Function Formulation

The objective function value is interpreted as the projected additional COVID-19 deaths after the rollout of vaccines. It is formulated as a summation of multiplicative expressions involving the following parameters.

2.1.1. Estimation of number of individuals for vaccination

To estimate the number of individuals for vaccination in each locality i , the locality population size N_i , total current locality COVID-19 cases C_i , number of individuals for vaccination m_i , and the effectiveness rate of the vaccine eff are needed. The estimate is given by

$$N_i - C_i - eff \cdot m_i$$

In the model, N_i is based on the forecasted 2020 population of the Philippines from the 2015 Philippine Statistics Authority Census [18] while C_i is the total COVID-19 cases in the Philippines (as of 10 November 2020) from the DOH Data Drop [19]. For the decision variable m_i , individuals that have already been previously infected are assumed to either be expired cases or recovered cases. For the recovered cases, they obtain a certain degree of immunity to COVID-19 [20]. This suggests that infected individuals can be excluded from the individuals for vaccination, which should be less than $N_i - C_i$, to further stretch the distribution of vaccines in many localities [21].

2.1.2. Determination of maximum outbreak size

The maximum outbreak size [22] is computed by multiplying the number of individuals susceptible to the virus to

$$1 - \frac{1 + \log(R_{0i})}{R_{0i}}$$

where R_{0i} is the maximum reproduction number recorded per locality i .

In the model, the maximum reproduction number recorded per locality i as of 11 November 2020 from [23] are used. Note that some localities recorded very high maximum reproduction number despite its small number of cases due to its small population [24]. Thus, we set $\max\{R_{0i}\} = 4$ to be the maximum reproduction number to be considered in this study [25].

2.1.3. Inclusion of population density

A scaling contact coefficient described as

$$1 - \exp\left(-\frac{\delta_i}{\max\{\delta_i\}}\right)$$

is included to incorporate the contact rate with effect of interventions, and population density δ_i of each locality i [26]. The coefficient gives the probability of contact in the population, which is nonlinearly proportional to the population density in that locality. This coefficient characterizes the heterogeneous distribution of cases in spatial scale, which relaxes the well-mixing (homogeneity) assumption in the epidemiological model. [27, 28]. This heterogeneity in infected cases as well as deaths can be observed in Philippine setting as shown in our data dashboard (<https://datastudio.google.com/s/uCv8ZX2rI8w>).

2.2. Constraints Formulation

The following are parameters needed for the constraints of the LP model:

2.2.1. Prioritization of certain groups

Due to the initial limited amount of vaccines that the country can obtain, priority groups were set by the Philippine government. These include the frontline health workers and uniformed personnel, due to their higher risk of exposure while on duty, and the senior citizens and indigent population, due to their vulnerability and by the principle of equity [29, 21]. To cater the priority groups set by the government, G_i is set to be the number of individuals belonging to the priority group per locality i . This is set to be the minimum number of individuals for vaccination per locality.

2.2.2. Incorporation of vaccination cost

A crucial factor for resource-constrained countries is the vaccination expense [30]. Some countries are considering multiple vaccines. Total expenses should be less than or equal to the allotted budget B . In the Philippines, the approved national budget for vaccines is 72.5 billion Philippine pesos (PHP) [31] which will cover vaccine dosage costs as well as cost of training per vaccinator (1200 PHP) and cost of other peripherals such as masks, face shield, alcohol and cotton balls (1924 PHP for 2 doses), both of which are good for 350 people [32]. The total vaccination cost is defined as

$$\sum_i \left(P m_i + \frac{m_i}{350} \times (1200 + 1924) \right)$$

where P is the price per complete dose of the COVID-19 vaccine.

2.3. Linear Programming model

The linear programming (LP) model formulated to determine the optimal distribution of vaccines among localities in the Philippines is described below.

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Minimize} \quad & \sum_i \left((N_i - c_i - \text{eff} \cdot m_i) \left(1 - \frac{1 + \log(R_{0i})}{R_{0i}} \right) \left(1 - \exp \left(-\frac{\delta_i}{\max\{\delta_i\}} \right) \right) \right) d_i \\ \text{subject to} \quad & \sum_i m_i \leq V, \\ & m_i \leq N_i - C_i, \forall i \\ & m_i \geq G_i, \quad \forall i \\ & \sum_i \left(P m_i + \frac{m_i}{350} \times (1200 + 1924) \right) \leq B, \end{aligned}$$

where d_i is the COVID-19 fatality rate per locality i , and V is the total available complete doses of vaccine for allocation across the country. The aim of this model is to find an optimal allocation that minimizes the projected number of additional COVID-19 deaths in each locality i such that (i) the total number of vaccines for allocation in each locality i will not exceed the total number of available vaccines, (ii) the individuals for vaccination per locality i will not include the number of individuals that have already been infected, (iii) all members of the priority groups in each locality i will be vaccinated, and (iv) the total cost of vaccines that will be used will not exceed the budget allocation.

3. Results

The LP model was used to compute for the optimal allocation under different approaches that minimizes COVID-19 deaths while satisfying the prioritization set by the government. Sensitivity analysis, effects of changes in levels of vaccine supply, vaccine effectiveness, and costs of vaccine were also studied.

3.1. Optimal Vaccine Allocation and Sensitivity Analysis

Budget is a huge consideration in a vaccination program so it is only fitting to study the effects of budget in vaccine allocation. The approaches where budget is considered (limited supplies and budget) and when it is not (limited supplies only) are explored in this section, with the latter approach being the basis for Sections 3.2 and 3.3. For both approaches, it is assumed that the total number of vaccines for allocation is equal to 50% of the total population, and that the effectiveness rate of the vaccine is 90%, with 2379 PHP as its cost per complete dose (similar to a market-available vaccine of 90% efficacy).

Figure 1: Geographical heat maps of Vaccine Allocations and its corresponding Additional Deaths (with at most 50% of the national population are vaccinated, and with 90% vaccine effectiveness rate)

Results show that the total number of complete vaccinations to be distributed across the country is 30,361,078 when budget is considered and 54,973,950 when it is not, with corresponding deaths of 17,053 and 6,795, respectively. This translates to an average of 562 and 123 deaths per million vaccines, respectively. The more realistic scenario where budget and supplies are limited is shown in Figures 1.b, 1.d. This case has less vaccine allocation ergo more deaths, hence, supporting the need for greater budget to achieve less deaths. Furthermore, notice from Figure 1 that localities with the greater share of vaccines still resulted in large projected deaths. This can be explained by the population density and fatality risk in the locality which drives the increase in projected deaths.

Sensitivity analysis on the vaccine supply shows that, ceteris paribus, for every 1,000,000 units of increase in vaccine supply, deaths will only decrease by 112. If additional vaccines will be acquired, the best option for every unit of increase in supply should be to allocate it to Manila since for every 1000 additional vaccine allocations in Manila, projected deaths will decrease by around 5.

3.2. Parameter Analysis and Other Model Cases

Total vaccine supply, vaccine effectiveness, vaccine cost, and projected deaths are seen as important factors that influence vaccine allocation. Pairwise comparison of different levels of these factors are presented. Other approaches in allocating the vaccine are also studied and discussed below.

3.2.1. Vaccine effectiveness and total vaccine supply levels comparison

The total vaccines to be allocated are varied from 20-100% of the total population, and the effectiveness rate of vaccines from 50-100% in the LP model without budget consideration. Note that 20% is assumed in the model to be the minimum total vaccines for allocation to accommodate all priority groups [29], and 50% to satisfy the minimum efficacy rate for COVID-19 vaccines [33].

Figure 2: Heat map representations of the resulting objective function values (projected deaths) from the LP model without budget consideration as the percentage of population to be vaccinated is varied from 20 to 100% and the vaccine effectiveness is varied from 50 to 100%.

Figure 2 shows that the greater the number of people for vaccination coupled with a high vaccine effectiveness rate, the lesser the number of additional deaths that might occur. This is an expected result. The ideal setup in a nationwide vaccination program is to maximize both factors. Unfortunately, not all countries have the resources to provide 100% coverage using the vaccine with the highest effectiveness rate. However in the heat map, notice the blue and red regions. Assume that the blue squares represent the low projected deaths and the red squares represent the high projected deaths. With low coverage of vaccination, even if there is 100% effectiveness, it will result to a red square (high number of cases). But as the coverage increases, the less minimum effectiveness necessary to achieve a blue square (low number of cases). In fact, according to the results of [34], to stop an ongoing epidemic, it is recommended that the minimum efficacy of the vaccine should be 60% when coverage is 100%, and at least 80% when coverage falls to 75%, to reduce the peak of the epidemic. Both cases fall under the blue region, among other efficacy-coverage combinations, which are feasible in the Philippines since protection and interventions will still be implemented even after vaccination [35].

Figure 3: Projected additional death from the LP model as the percentage of population for vaccination and vaccine effectiveness are varied.

We further investigate the behavior of the percentage of vaccinated population and vaccine effectiveness as they increase.

From Figure 3.a, the projected deaths slowed down at around 20-40% and after 50-70%, the effect of increasing in percentage of population vaccinated is minimal. This explains the low decrease in deaths from Section 3.2, despite the huge increase in units of vaccine supply. A reason for this is since 50-70% is near the $1 - \frac{1}{R_0}$ threshold for immunization coverage of the country, assuming that R_0 is at a maximum [36]. This makes for a good target for countries with insufficient resources to vaccinate all of its constituents.

Meanwhile, in Figure 3.b, the vaccine effectiveness increases have been shown to have a linear relationship with the projected deaths. That is, a vaccine with a higher effectiveness rate always generate lower deaths. Vaccine effectiveness rates should be maximized as much as possible when deciding on what vaccine should be procured. Also, notice the change in slope as the objective function value decreases, which implies that the higher the objective function value (additional deaths), the less the effect of increasing the effectiveness of the vaccine, which is derivative from the result from Figure 2 where the blue region gets larger as the number of population to be vaccinated increases, and the number of deaths decreases.

3.2.2. Cost analysis in vaccine acquisition

Another key factor in determining what vaccine to use is the cost of the vaccine. Each vaccine has its own price per dose, required vaccine dose per person, and efficacy rate (as the effectiveness rate). These factors are used for comparative analysis of the vaccines.

Figure 4: Multiple vaccines and their effectiveness, cost in PHP (1 PHP = 0.021 USD), and projected number of additional deaths based from our LP model.

Among the vaccines, vaccines 1, 2 and 7 can provide 100% national coverage, i.e., vaccinate all 110 million+ residents of the country. All but vaccine 4 can fulfill the prioritization of certain groups identified by the government. Vaccine 2 generated the lowest projected number of additional deaths compared to the other vaccines. This is due to its high effectiveness rate and significantly low price per dose.

Vaccines 3 and 4 can only cover 28% and 16% of the population, respectively, and have high death projections despite having high vaccine effectiveness due to its high cost per dose. Thus, a significant increase in the total budget for vaccination will drastically decrease their additional death projections (see Figure 3).

3.2.3. Exploring other approaches in vaccine allocation

Multiple countries use different approaches in distributing vaccines in their community. The table below shows the other approaches for vaccine allocation that can also be adapted, including the one presented in Section 3.1.

Table 1: Different approaches to vaccine allocation under a projected number of deaths that rose without budget consideration.

Vaccine allocation approaches	Total number of complete vaccinations	Projected number of deaths
LP Model result WITH budget consideration	30,361,078	17,053
LP Model result WITHOUT budget consideration	54,973,950	6,795
LP Model result WITHOUT budget consideration and with $R_0 = 4$	54,973,950	8,482
LP Model result WITHOUT budget consideration and WITHOUT lower bound	54,973,950	5,900
Allocation proportional to population size	54,973,949	25,457
Allocation proportional to population density	19,952,176	12,588
Allocation proportional to number of infections	42,391,915	8,433
Equal allocation	54,973,950	25,955

The first approach that considers the allocated budget for vaccines presents the likely scenario in the Philippine setting, while the remaining approaches (without budget constraint), can be viewed as approaches that have equal budget allotment and are thus comparable sans budget constraint. The first two cases in Table 1 are those presented in Section 3.1. The third approach assumes that the R_0 in every locality i is 4 (maximum) to further estimate what to expect if R_0 gets bigger. As expected, there is greater projected deaths even with slight changes in the allocation per locality. If the lower bound is removed as in the fourth approach, it would result in even less deaths. However, this is unequitable since many localities will not receive vaccines.

The next three approaches follow allocations based on proportionality, say, if a country will allocate the vaccine based on the population size of the locality, then the vaccine allocation will be proportional to the population of that locality. Note that allocations per locality cannot exceed the $N_i - C_i$ susceptible population of that province. Allocating vaccines based on population size resulted to the most number of death projections, while allocating based on the number of infections generated the least. None among the three proportion allocations had better results compared to the LP model result without budget consideration.

The last approach assumes equal allocation among localities regardless of factors considered in the previous three approaches. This, in turn, results in the most number of additional deaths, and thus, is the least ideal way to allocate the vaccines since it does not consider the difference in fatality rates, infections, dynamics on each locality.

Comparing the budget-constrained approaches, the LP model result in the second approach is the best in terms of minimizing the number of deaths and equitable considerations.

4. Discussion

COVID-19 vaccine allocation is an immediate concern globally. An LP model is used to study vaccine allocation that aims to minimize deaths while satisfying group prioritization for immediate vaccination. Various approaches were studied, all of which assumed using a vaccine with 90% effectiveness rate to be used for at most 50% of the population.

Sensitivity analysis shows that if only vaccine supply is limited and budget is not a constraint, Deaths will decrease by 112 for every 1 million vaccines. This figure is less than the average deaths per million vaccines for the non-budget constrained approach. As seen in Section 3.3, when vaccine coverage is between 50 to 70% which is the case for the non-budget constrained approach, decrease in deaths will not be as apparent as when coverage is less than the specified range. Additional vaccines beyond the optimal allocation therefore will be beneficial in decreasing deaths only if the vaccine coverage is less than 50%.

Various vaccines were also studied in terms of their associated costs and effectiveness, and determined that the vaccine with 89.9 % effectiveness and 183 PHP price per dose results to the lowest projected deaths. We then compared our result to various model variations and common allocation approaches, upon which our model achieved both optimal and a more equitable allocation.

Among the approaches that countries can adapt, the approach using our vaccine allocation model projects the least amount of deaths while upholding equitable considerations. Although proportional allocation according to number of infections can

It is made available under a [CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license](#).
 be done more conveniently, allocation will not yield minimal deaths. Our model thus can be used by policymakers since minimization of casualties is a humane priority. Furthermore, our model provides insight on the localities that should be prioritized when additional vaccine doses become available.

Using our model can help policymakers in distributing COVID-19 vaccines, especially if their resources are limited. The model can be applied not just to countries but also to communities, assuming the situations and health systems are similar. By having an optimal and equitable distribution of vaccines, resources are well-utilized and not wasted. Having sufficient data, the model can also be adapted to other similar infectious diseases, and can be used as basis in future distributions. Note however, that the study is limited to the use of one vaccine type only, which is not the case in some countries, and should be explored in future extensions of the study. It is also good to incorporate other factors such as new COVID-19 strains, dynamic herd immunity, group-specific infection rates and other dynamics, clinical trial results of vaccines, differential vaccine transportation costs and storage facilities, among other factors.

5. Acknowledgment

JFR is supported by the Abdus Salam International Centre for Theoretical Physics Associateship Scheme. This research is funded by the UP System through the UP Resilience Institute.

References

- [1] World Health Organization. *Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) Situation Report 1 Philippines* 9 March 2020. 2020. URL: https://www.who.int/docs/default-source/wpro---documents/countries/philippines/emergencies/covid-19/who-phl-sitrep-1-covid-19-9mar2020.pdf?sfvrsn=2553985a_2 (visited on 12/17/2020).
- [2] World Health Organization. *Transmission of SARS-CoV-2: implications for infection prevention precautions*. 2020. URL: <https://www.who.int/news-room/commentaries/detail/transmission-of-sars-cov-2-implications-for-infection-prevention-precautions> (visited on 12/17/2020).
- [3] Simran Preet Kaur and Vandana Gupta. "COVID-19 Vaccine: A comprehensive status report". In: *Virus research* 288 (Aug. 2020). doi: [10.1016/j.virusres.2020.198114](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.virusres.2020.198114).
- [4] World Health Organization. *WHO Director-General's opening remarks at the media briefing on COVID-19 - 11 March 2020*. 2020. URL: <https://www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-the-media-briefing-on-covid-19---11-march-2020> (visited on 12/17/2020).
- [5] Anna Malindog-Uy. *COVID-19 Impacts In The Philippines*. 2020. URL: <https://theaseanpost.com/article/covid-19-impacts-philippines> (visited on 01/15/2021).
- [6] Christian Alvin Buhat and Steven Kyle Villanueva. "Determining the effectiveness of practicing non-pharmaceutical interventions in improving virus control in a pandemic using agent-based modelling". In: *Mathematics in Applied Sciences and Engineering* 1 (Dec. 2020), pp. 423–438. doi: [10.5206/mase/10876](https://doi.org/10.5206/mase/10876).
- [7] The Straits Times. *Philippines suffers worst job losses in 15 years due to Covid-19 and lockdown*. 2020. URL: <https://www.straitstimes.com/asia/se-asia/philippines-suffers-worst-job-losses-in-15-years-due-to-covid-19-and-lockdown> (visited on 01/15/2021).
- [8] E. Murakami, S. Shimizutani, and E. Yamada. "Projection of the Effects of the COVID-19 Pandemic on the Welfare of Remittance-Dependent Households in the Philippines". In: *EconDisCliCha* 288 (Sept. 2020). doi: [10.1007/s41885-020-00078-9](https://doi.org/10.1007/s41885-020-00078-9).
- [9] Philippine Statistics Authority. *Philippine GDP posts -8.3 percent in the fourth Quarter 2020; -9.5 percent for full-year 2020*. 2021. URL: <https://psa.gov.ph/content/philippine-gdp-posts-83-percent-fourth-quarter-2020-95-percent-full-year-2020> (visited on 02/08/2021).
- [10] Ben de Vera. *COVID-19 impact: IMF sees PH GDP dropping by record 8.3 percent in 2020*. 2020. URL: <https://business.inquirer.net/309494/covid-19-impact-imf-sees-ph-gdp-dropping-by-record-8-3-percent?fbclid=IwAR3mdzuouQZVNYwEMSwdSYA4eXn4TlTcade5cwJGFcAa> (visited on 01/15/2021).
- [11] World Health Organization. *International Travel and Health*. 2020. ISBN: 978 92 4 158 047 2.
- [12] Mondher Toumi and Walter Ricciardi. "The Economic Value of Vaccination: Why Prevention is Wealth". In: *Journal of market access health policy* 3 (2015). doi: [10.3402/jmahp.v3.29414](https://doi.org/10.3402/jmahp.v3.29414).
- [13] Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. *Vaccine Testing and the Approval Process*. 2014. URL: <https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/basics/test-approve.html> (visited on 01/15/2021).
- [14] World Health Organization. *Manufacturing, safety and quality control of vaccines*. 2020. URL: <https://www.who.int/news-room/feature-stories/detail/manufacturing-safety-and-quality-control> (visited on 01/15/2021).
- [15] World Health Organization. *Science in 5 on Covid-19 - Episode 5*. 2020. URL: <https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019/media-resources/science-in-5/episode-5> (visited on 01/15/2021).
- [16] CNN Philippines. *PH not yet ready to handle Pfizer COVID-19 vaccine doses by January – Romualdez*. 2020. URL: <https://cnnphilippines.com/news/2020/12/21/PH-not-yet-ready-to-handle-Pfizer-COVID-19-vaccine-doses-by-January---Romualdez.html> (visited on 01/15/2021).
- [17] Vivienne Gulla. *Philippines expects to roll out COVID-19 vaccines first half of 2021*. 2020. URL: https://news.abs-cbn.com/spotlight/12/10/20/philippines-expects-to-roll-out-covid-19-vaccines-first-half-of-2021?fbclid=IwAR36-JN09LR3ltspSdOnP8Wzw81PnEBsjvCz9i4k72-sh739_0 (visited on 01/15/2021).
- [18] Philippine Statistics Authority. *Philippine Population Density (Based on the 2015 Census of Population)*. 2020. URL: <https://psa.gov.ph/content/philippine-population-density-based-2015-census-population> (visited on 04/11/2020).
- [19] Department of Health. 2020. URL: <https://doh.gov.ph/covid19tracker> (visited on 11/25/2020).

It is made available under a [CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license](#).

- [20] World Health Organization. *COVID-19 - Immunity after recovery from COVID-19*. 2020. URL: <https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019/media-resources/science-in-5/episode-18---covid-19---immunity-after-recovery-from-covid-19> (visited on 02/11/2020).
- [21] Kate Bubar et al. "Model-informed COVID-19 vaccine prioritization strategies by age and serostatus". In: *Science* (Jan. 2021), eabe6959. doi: [10.1126/science.abe6959](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abe6959).
- [22] Matthew Hartfield and Samuel Alizon. "Introducing the Outbreak Threshold in Epidemiology". In: *PLoS pathogens* 9 (June 2013), e1003277. doi: [10.1371/journal.ppat.1003277](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.ppat.1003277).
- [23] University of the Philippines. 2020. URL: <https://endcov.ph/statistics/> (visited on 11/25/2020).
- [24] David Adam. *A guide to R — the pandemic's misunderstood metric*. 2020. URL: <https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-020-02009-w> (visited on 02/08/2021).
- [25] World Health Organization. *COVID-19 – a global pandemic What do we know about SARS-CoV-2 and COVID-19?* 2020. URL: https://www.who.int/docs/default-source/coronaviruse/risk-comms-updates/update-28-covid-19-what-we-know-may-2020.pdf?sfvrsn=ed6e286c_2 (visited on 02/08/2021).
- [26] Hao Hu, Karima Nigmatulina, and Philip Welkhoff. "The Scaling of Contact Rates with Population Density for the Infectious Disease Models". In: *Mathematical biosciences* 244 (May 2013). doi: [10.1016/j.mbs.2013.04.013](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mbs.2013.04.013).
- [27] Christian Alvin Buhat et al. "Optimal Allocation of COVID-19 Test Kits Among Accredited Testing Centers in the Philippines". In: *Journal of Healthcare Informatics Research* (Nov. 2020). doi: [10.1007/s41666-020-00081-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s41666-020-00081-5).
- [28] S Sanche et al. "High contagiousness and rapid spread of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2". In: *Emerg Infect Dis* 2 (2020).
- [29] Department of Health. *FAQS: Vaccines*. 2020. URL: <https://doh.gov.ph/faqs/vaccines#:~:text=Frontline%5C%20health%5C%20workers%5C%2C%5C%20senior%5C%20citizens,9>. (visited on 01/21/2020).
- [30] Sarocha Chootipongchaivat et al. "Vaccination program in a resource-limited setting: A case study in the Philippines". In: *Vaccine* 34 (Aug. 2016). doi: [10.1016/j.vaccine.2016.08.014](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2016.08.014).
- [31] Department of Budget and Management. *GAA 2021*. 2021. URL: <https://www.dbm.gov.ph/index.php/budget-documents/2021/general-appropriations-act-fy-2021> (visited on 02/11/2020).
- [32] Katrina Domingo. *Which COVID-19 vaccine is most cost-friendly for PH government?* 2020. URL: <https://news.abs-cbn.com/news/12/10/20/which-covid-19-vaccine-is-most-cost-friendly-for-ph-government> (visited on 12/10/2020).
- [33] Leila B. Salaverria Julie M. Aurelio. *DOH: 50 % vaccine efficacy is OK*. 2020. URL: <https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1376429/doh-50-vaccine-efficacy-is-ok> (visited on 12/27/2020).
- [34] Sarah Bartsch et al. "Vaccine Efficacy Needed for a COVID-19 Coronavirus Vaccine to Prevent or Stop an Epidemic as the Sole Intervention". In: *American Journal of Preventive Medicine* 59 (July 2020). doi: [10.1016/j.amepre.2020.06.011](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2020.06.011).
- [35] Apoorva Mandavilli. *Here's Why Vaccinated People Still Need to Wear a Mask*. 2020. URL: <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/12/08/health/covid-vaccine-mask.html> (visited on 02/03/2021).
- [36] Paul Fine, Ken Eames, and David Heymann. "'Herd Immunity': A Rough Guide". In: *Clinical infectious diseases : an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America* 52 (Apr. 2011), pp. 911–6. doi: [10.1093/cid/cir007](https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/cir007).

Appendix A

Table 2: Optimal allocation of vaccines per locality with maximum 50% national vaccine coverage and 90% vaccine effectiveness

Province/ Highly Urbanized City	N_i	C_i	m_i (w budget)	m_i (w/o budget)	Max R_i	Pop Density	Fatality Rate	OBJ FXN VALUE (w/ b)	OBJ FXN VALUE (w/o b)
City of Manila	1938254	24810	1913444	1913444	2.54	77592	2.07%	1118	1118
Quezon City	3196891	35950	1558026	3160941	2.54	18618	1.79%	2999	539
Caloocan City	1724661	13773	1710888	1710888	2.54	30908	1.96%	492	492
Pasay City	453516	9350	444166	444166	2.54	32464	1.53%	104	104
City of Las Piñas	641197	6490	48763	634707	2.54	19614	1.53%	900	97
City of Makati	634346	12728	621618	621618	2.54	29409	2.08%	182	182
City of Malabon	397990	6323	391667	391667	2.54	25334	2.34%	114	114
City of Mandaluyong	420584	7242	413342	413342	2.54	45273	1.95%	159	159
City of Marikina	490774	6315	484459	484459	2.54	22805	2.22%	122	122
City of Muntinlupa	549318	6218	38731	543100	2.54	13819	1.46%	542	58
City of Navotas	271619	5384	266235	266235	2.54	30382	1.67%	64	64
City of Parañaque	724958	9956	53512	715002	2.54	15567	1.26%	680	73
City of Pasig	822383	11299	811084	811084	2.54	16970	2.87%	204	204
City of San Juan	133032	3564	129468	129468	2.54	22358	2.02%	29	29
Taguig City	876404	12947	51490	863457	2.54	19385	1.25%	1010	107
City of Valenzuela	675526	9017	666509	666509	2.54	14367	2.50%	126	126
Municipality of Pateros	69510	1879	5871	67631	2.54	6684	1.22%	28	3
Abra	262579	121	54002	54002	4	63	1.65%	2	2
Apayao	129769	68	23689	23689	4	29	0.10%	0	0
Benguet (excluding Baguio City)	485856	1910	84241	483946	4	6714	0.73%	149	18
Baguio City	376040	2940	64515	373100	4	6539	1.26%	192	23
Ifugao	220814	115	39148	39148	4	84	0.10%	0	0
Kalinga	231569	287	43209	43209	4	71	0.35%	0	0
Mountain Province	168320	42	32702	32702	4	70	0.10%	0	0
Ilocos Norte	645756	297	98648	98648	4	189	0.67%	5	5
Ilocos Sur	750922	215	112114	112114	4	289	0.47%	7	7
La Union	856521	768	117773	117773	4	571	2.47%	82	82
Pangasinan	3219331	2675	424245	3216656	4	591	3.00%	387	44
Batanes	18778	3	3990	3990	1	92	0.10%	0	0
Cagayan	1,305,839	1088	232322	232322	4	139	1.01%	12	12
Isabela	1735100	2093	292225	292225	3.51	132	0.72%	10	10
Nueva Vizcaya	492457	688	82955	82955	4	102	2.91%	10	10
Quirino	205776	36	33863	33863	2.92	89	0.10%	0	0
Aurora	233373	94	30583	30583	2.02	74	0.10%	0	0
Bataan	828208	3380	106054	106054	4	603	1.42%	48	48
Bulacan	3584460	12016	463295	1663592	2.66	1288	1.63%	393	259
Nueva Ecija	2342546	1958	324870	324870	3.27	412	1.69%	98	98
Pampanga (excluding Angeles City)	2393338	4598	320772	2388740	3.37	1196	2.04%	359	41
Angeles City	448194	1532	60610	446662	3.37	7073	1.17%	219	25
Tarlac	1487352	1410	209111	209111	4	488	1.42%	69	69
Zambales (excluding Olongapo City)	643325	794	90603	90603	4	177	0.76%	6	6
Olongapo City	253738	1030	35521	252708	4	1372	1.36%	32	4
Batangas	2933636	11665	369434	369434	2.52	942	1.61%	223	223
Cavite	4004994	22526	445453	3982468	2.93	2624	0.93%	552	61
Laguna	3304645	21082	365638	365638	2.4	1714	0.80%	219	219
Quezon (excluding Lucena City)	2021477	4354	244294	244294	3.88	231	1.22%	38	38
Lucena City (Capital)	289895	1493	34965	288402	3.88	3614	2.01%	139	16
Rizal	3140393	17056	332565	3123337	2.3	2655	1.98%	768	85
Marinduque	255350	157	53165	53165	3.16	268	2.55%	10	10
Occidental Mindoro	530704	286	93123	93123	4	91	2.45%	8	8
Oriental Mindoro	919025	1136	166365	166365	4	217	1.67%	21	21
Palawan (excluding Puerto Princesa City)	924916	402	159765	159765	3.62	63	0.75%	3	3

Continued on next page

Table 2 continued from previous page

Province/ Highly Urbanized City	N_i	C_i	m_i (w budget)	m_i (w/o budget)	Max R_i	Pop Density	Fatality Rate	OBJ FXN VALUE (w/ b)	OBJ FXN VALUE (w/o b)
<i>Puerto Princesa City (Capital)</i>	277774	174	48772	48772	3.62	117	0.57%	1	1
Romblon	318785	92	65178	65178	4	208	1.09%	5	5
Albay	1431604	1060	371395	371395	3.68	556	3.00%	135	135
Camarines Norte	635121	243	160005	160005	3.97	279	2.06%	22	22
Camarines Sur	2125962	1710	541944	541944	4	386	2.63%	128	128
Catanduanes	284142	139	76534	76534	2.04	190	1.44%	3	3
Masbate	971652	371	243968	243968	4	235	0.27%	4	4
Sorsogon	863376	510	224840	224840	2.25	407	3.00%	41	41
Aklan	625877	337	115361	115361	4	356	2.67%	38	38
Antique	633704	185	116884	116884	4	232	0.54%	5	5
Capiz	829007	1181	149937	149937	2.19	320	3.00%	33	33
Guimaras	190121	234	34136	34136	2.59	311	1.28%	4	4
Iloilo (excluding Iloilo City)	2108409	2997	391810	391810	4	422	3.00%	171	171
<i>Iloilo City (Capital)</i>	487781	4372	90288	483409	4	6226	2.45%	455	55
Negros Occidental (excluding Bacolod City)	2719058	5708	463824	463824	4	318	1.91%	108	108
<i>Bacolod City (Capital)</i>	611779	5440	103971	606339	4	3496	2.90%	393	47
Bohol	1430225	853	320124	320124	2.5	300	1.52%	30	30
Cebu (excluding Cebu City, Lapu-Lapu City, and Mandaue City)	3200011	7356	635560	3192655	4	594	3.00%	360	44
<i>Cebu City (Capital)</i>	1004554	10885	199375	993669	4	2929	3.00%	542	66
<i>Lapu-lapu City</i>	444359	2664	88867	441695	4	7024	3.00%	563	69
<i>Mandaue City</i>	394864	2702	392162	392162	4	14402	3.00%	119	119
Negros Oriental	1475340	724	302824	302824	3.38	250	1.24%	26	26
Siquijor	104509	38	25821	25821	4	284	0.10%	0	0
Biliran	186854	144	58066	58066	4	320	1.39%	5	5
Eastern Samar	508651	500	159382	159382	4	101	1.00%	3	3
Leyte (excluding Tacloban City)	1877858	2767	573786	573786	2.63	272	0.72%	16	16
<i>Tacloban City (Capital)</i>	263590	1066	79790	79790	2.63	1200	1.59%	21	21
Northern Samar	688544	1115	203129	203129	4	171	1.26%	8	8
Samar (Western Samar)	849800	2614	253714	253714	4	129	0.80%	5	5
Southern Leyte	459208	545	148531	148531	2.63	234	0.37%	2	2
Zamboanga del Norte	1101221	407	393355	393355	2.89	139	3.00%	20	20
Zamboanga del Sur	1100438	949	386915	386915	3.56	225	1.05%	13	13
<i>Zamboanga City</i>	938341	3425	332158	934916	3.56	609	3.00%	84	12
Zamboanga Sibugay	689361	162	239375	239375	3.15	182	1.23%	7	7
<i>City of Isabela (Capital of Basilan)</i>	122805	195	42845	42845	4	504	2.05%	7	7
Bukidnon	1540921	940	347344	347344	2.12	135	1.06%	8	8
Camiguin	96336	60	26052	26052	4	366	0.10%	0	0
Lanao del Norte (excluding Iligan City)	736470	788	164796	164796	2.53	202	0.63%	4	4
<i>Iligan City</i>	373048	987	82273	82273	2.53	421	3.00%	22	22
Misamis Occidental	655605	773	165704	165704	4	300	1.03%	12	12
Misamis Oriental (excluding Cagayan de Oro City)	967423	1000	231837	231837	2.66	284	1.00%	13	13
<i>Cagayan de Oro City (Capital)</i>	735985	2451	175510	733534	2.66	1637	2.28%	128	16
Compostela Valley	801485	445	195810	195810	2.99	161	1.35%	9	9
Davao del Norte	1106599	980	268299	268299	2.77	297	1.33%	21	21
Davao del Sur (excluding Davao City)	688772	714	168078	168078	2.46	292	2.10%	18	18
<i>Davao City</i>	1778027	6256	433833	433833	2.46	668	2.91%	150	150
Davao Occidental	344438	126	84138	84138	4	146	2.38%	7	7
Davao Oriental	608603	423	152176	152176	2.66	98	0.71%	2	2
Cotabato (North Cotabato)	1502291	444	466982	466982	2.88	148	2.25%	23	23
Sarangani	592600	376	179740	179740	3.7	149	3.00%	14	14

Continued on next page

Table 2 continued from previous page

Province/ Highly Urbanized City	N_i	C_i	m_i (w budget)	m_i (w/o budget)	Max R_i	Pop Density	Fatality Rate	OBJ FXN VALUE (w/ b)	OBJ FXN VALUE (w/o b)
South Cotabato (excluding General Santos City)	996581	1079	310269	310269	2.12	241	1.39%	12	12
<i>General Santos City</i>	647242	1153	201299	646089	2.12	1206	3.00%	81	11
Sultan Kudarat	884222	260	273638	273638	2.72	151	3.00%	18	18
<i>Cotabato City</i>	326033	935	99380	325098	4	1701	2.78%	85	12
Agusan del Norte (excluding Butuan City)	385989	385	116498	116498	3.28	136	2.86%	8	8
<i>Butuan City (Capital)</i>	367000	1624	110284	110284	3.28	413	3.00%	23	23
Agusan del Sur	762882	515	220703	220703	3.81	70	2.72%	8	8
Dinagat Islands	138445	52	45734	45734	4	156	0.10%	0	0
Surigao del Norte	528172	611	164010	164010	4	248	3.00%	22	22
Surigao del Sur	644851	534	196263	196263	4	120	3.00%	13	13
Basilan (excluding the City of Isabela)	377361	239	202257	202257	4	100	1.26%	2	2
Lanao del Sur	1138280	1056	605162	605162	2.64	69	3.00%	7	7
Maguindanao (excluding Cotabato City)	1278197	808	679447	679447	4	118	1.24%	7	7
Sulu	897980	266	477445	477445	4	181	3.00%	20	20
Tawi-Tawi	425417	153	226393	226393	4	108	3.00%	6	6

Appendix B

Table 3: Sensitivity analysis for the constraints specifying the maximum number of vaccines allocated to each city/province

Constraint for the Lower Bound of the No. of Vaccines in [city/province]	Solution	Reduced Cost	Obj. Coefficient	Allowable Increase	Allowable Decrease
<i>City of Manila</i>	1913443.964	-0.005145063	-0.005257252	0.005145063	1E+30
<i>Quezon City</i>	3160940.638	-0.001422541	-0.00153473	0.001422541	1E+30
<i>Caloocan City</i>	1710887.892	-0.002478554	-0.002590743	0.002478554	1E+30
<i>Pasay City</i>	444165.8973	-0.001991018	-0.002103207	0.001991018	1E+30
<i>City of Las Piñas</i>	634707.3216	-0.001258315	-0.001370505	0.001258315	1E+30
<i>City of Makati</i>	621618.4901	-0.002529648	-0.002641838	0.002529648	1E+30
<i>City of Malabon</i>	391666.538	-0.0025103	-0.002622489	0.0025103	1E+30
<i>City of Mandaluyong</i>	413341.5628	-0.003349526	-0.003461716	0.003349526	1E+30
<i>City of Marikina</i>	484459.0985	-0.002158634	-0.002270824	0.002158634	1E+30
<i>City of Muntinlupa</i>	543099.5674	-0.000848154	-0.000960344	0.000848154	1E+30
<i>City of Navotas</i>	266235.3533	-0.002066294	-0.002178483	0.002066294	1E+30
<i>City of Parañaque</i>	715001.7735	-0.000805814	-0.000918003	0.000805814	1E+30
<i>City of Pasig</i>	811083.8686	-0.002153593	-0.002265783	0.002153593	1E+30
<i>City of San Juan</i>	129467.5621	-0.001922101	-0.00203429	0.001922101	1E+30
<i>Taguig City</i>	863457.4839	-0.001000423	-0.001112613	0.001000423	1E+30
<i>City of Valenzuela</i>	666508.5185	-0.00158427	-0.001696459	0.00158427	1E+30
Municipality of Pateros	67631.02559	-0.000294156	-0.000406345	0.000294156	1E+30
Abra	54002.08897	0.000105006	-7.18309E-06	1E+30	0.000105006
Apayao	23688.63231	0.000111989	-2.0038E-07	1E+30	0.000111989
Benguet (excluding Baguio City)	483945.9157	-0.000215629	-0.000327819	0.000215629	1E+30
<i>Baguio City</i>	373100.0924	-0.000436564	-0.000548753	0.000436564	1E+30
Ifugao	39147.96054	0.000111603	-5.86173E-07	1E+30	0.000111603
Kalinga	43209.26681	0.000110481	-1.70868E-06	1E+30	0.000110481
Mountain Province	32701.50396	0.0001117	-4.89606E-07	1E+30	0.0001117
Ilocos Norte	98648.33711	0.000103356	-8.83383E-06	1E+30	0.000103356
Ilocos Sur	112113.805	0.000102852	-9.3378E-06	1E+30	0.000102852
La Union	117772.5883	1.42737E-05	-9.79157E-05	1E+30	1.42737E-05
Pangasinan	3216656.139	-1.05529E-05	-0.000122742	1.05529E-05	1E+30
Batanes	3990.17346	0.000112189	0	1E+30	0.000112189
Cagayan	232322.0836	0.00010243	-9.75953E-06	1E+30	0.00010243
Isabela	292225.4496	0.000106033	-6.15671E-06	1E+30	0.000106033
Nueva Vizcaya	82955.18794	9.15245E-05	-2.06648E-05	1E+30	9.15245E-05
Quirino	33862.8029	0.000111677	-5.12286E-07	1E+30	0.000111677
Aurora	30583.30579	0.000111884	-3.05488E-07	1E+30	0.000111884
Bataan	106053.6867	5.28538E-05	-5.93356E-05	1E+30	5.28538E-05
Bulacan	1663592.185	0	-0.000112189	1.44038E-06	6.93926E-06
Nueva Ecija	324870.3127	6.90956E-05	-4.30938E-05	1E+30	6.90956E-05
Pampanga (excluding Angeles City)	2388739.756	-4.16604E-05	-0.00015385	4.16604E-05	1E+30
<i>Angeles City</i>	446661.7637	-0.000391455	-0.000503645	0.000391455	1E+30
Tarlac	209111.1998	6.41871E-05	-4.80023E-05	1E+30	6.41871E-05
Zambales (excluding Olongapo City)	90603.17704	0.000102889	-9.30078E-06	1E+30	0.000102889
<i>Olongapo City</i>	252707.725	-1.6302E-05	-0.000128491	1.6302E-05	1E+30
Batangas	369434.4603	3.45146E-05	-7.76747E-05	1E+30	3.45146E-05
Cavite	3982467.682	-2.64694E-05	-0.000138659	2.64694E-05	1E+30
Laguna	365638.2307	4.56162E-05	-6.65732E-05	1E+30	4.56162E-05
Quezon (excluding Lucena City)	244293.9666	9.29426E-05	-1.92467E-05	1E+30	9.29426E-05
<i>Lucena City (Capital)</i>	288402.1331	-0.000373824	-0.000486013	0.000373824	1E+30
Rizal	3123337.054	-0.000132594	-0.000244784	0.000132594	1E+30
Marinduque	53164.67299	7.06392E-05	-4.15501E-05	1E+30	7.06392E-05
Occidental Mindoro	93123.28137	9.67618E-05	-1.54275E-05	1E+30	9.67618E-05
Oriental Mindoro	166364.9017	8.70069E-05	-2.51825E-05	1E+30	8.70069E-05
Palawan (excluding Puerto Princesa City)	159765.11	0.000109079	-3.11062E-06	1E+30	0.000109079
<i>Puerto Princesa City (Capital)</i>	48771.93595	0.000107764	-4.42495E-06	1E+30	0.000107764
Romblon	65177.82678	9.6498E-05	-1.56914E-05	1E+30	9.6498E-05
Albay	371395.2791	1.44038E-06	-0.000110749	1E+30	1.44038E-06
Camarines Norte	160005.0127	7.25156E-05	-3.96737E-05	1E+30	7.25156E-05

Continued on next page

Constraint for the Lower Bound of the No. of Vaccines in [city/province]	Solution	Reduced Cost	Obj. Coefficient	Allowable Increase	Allowable Decrease
Camarines Sur	541943.6121	4.17859E-05	-7.04035E-05	1E+30	4.17859E-05
Catanduanes	76534.14304	0.000100825	-1.13642E-05	1E+30	0.000100825
Masbate	243968.2537	0.000107796	-4.39373E-06	1E+30	0.000107796
Sorsogon	224840.1962	5.57635E-05	-5.64259E-05	1E+30	5.57635E-05
Aklan	115361.0611	4.63141E-05	-6.58753E-05	1E+30	4.63141E-05
Antique	116884.0294	0.00010348	-8.70961E-06	1E+30	0.00010348
Capiz	149937.2129	6.91485E-05	-4.30408E-05	1E+30	6.91485E-05
Guimaras	34135.78793	9.12387E-05	-2.09507E-05	1E+30	9.12387E-05
Iloilo (excluding Iloilo City)	391810.1616	2.44219E-05	-8.77675E-05	1E+30	2.44219E-05
<i>Iloilo City (Capital)</i>	483408.9428	-0.000906024	-0.001018213	0.000906024	1E+30
Negros Occidental (excluding Bacolod City)	463824.3354	7.00028E-05	-4.21866E-05	1E+30	7.00028E-05
<i>Bacolod City (Capital)</i>	606338.597	-0.000578225	-0.000690415	0.000578225	1E+30
Bohol	320123.7168	8.88815E-05	-2.33078E-05	1E+30	8.88815E-05
Cebu (excluding Cebu City, Lapu-Lapu City, and Mandaue City)	3192655.185	-1.13497E-05	-0.000123539	1.13497E-05	1E+30
<i>Cebu City (Capital)</i>	993668.7942	-0.00048741	-0.000599599	0.00048741	1E+30
<i>Lapu-lapu City</i>	441694.9531	-0.001288744	-0.001400933	0.001288744	1E+30
<i>Mandaue City</i>	392161.5467	-0.002629875	-0.002742064	0.002629875	1E+30
Negros Oriental	302824.1482	9.24819E-05	-1.97075E-05	1E+30	9.24819E-05
Siquijor	25821.16835	0.000110215	-1.97399E-06	1E+30	0.000110215
Biliran	58065.81536	8.13327E-05	-3.08567E-05	1E+30	8.13327E-05
Eastern Samar	159382.0767	0.000105158	-7.03088E-06	1E+30	0.000105158
Leyte (excluding Tacloban City)	573786.265	0.000101707	-1.04824E-05	1E+30	0.000101707
<i>Tacloban City (Capital)</i>	79789.68948	1.08371E-05	-0.000101352	1E+30	1.08371E-05
Northern Samar	203128.9881	9.72633E-05	-1.4926E-05	1E+30	9.72633E-05
Samar (Western Samar)	253714.3145	0.000104987	-7.20283E-06	1E+30	0.000104987
Southern Leyte	148531.0295	0.000107611	-4.57803E-06	1E+30	0.000107611
Zamboanga del Norte	393355.1134	8.83709E-05	-2.38185E-05	1E+30	8.83709E-05
Zamboanga del Sur	386914.8738	9.66696E-05	-1.55198E-05	1E+30	9.66696E-05
<i>Zamboanga City</i>	934915.7041	-6.93926E-06	-0.000119129	6.93926E-06	1E+30
Zamboanga Sibugay	239374.7396	9.85498E-05	-1.36396E-05	1E+30	9.85498E-05
<i>City of Isabela (Capital of Basilan)</i>	42844.71763	4.05162E-05	-7.16732E-05	1E+30	4.05162E-05
Bukidnon	347344.0511	0.000105968	-6.22179E-06	1E+30	0.000105968
Camiguin	26051.83314	0.000109647	-2.54216E-06	1E+30	0.000109647
Lanao del Norte (excluding Iligan City)	164796.1321	0.000105587	-6.60203E-06	1E+30	0.000105587
<i>Iligan City</i>	82273.08047	4.70796E-05	-6.51098E-05	1E+30	4.70796E-05
Misamis Occidental	165704.0384	9.0637E-05	-2.15523E-05	1E+30	9.0637E-05
Misamis Oriental (excluding Cagayan de Oro City)	231837.3312	9.6936E-05	-1.52533E-05	1E+30	9.6936E-05
<i>Cagayan de Oro City (Capital)</i>	733534.3039	0	-0.000199387	8.71974E-05	1E+30
Compostela Valley	195810.4178	9.94167E-05	-1.27726E-05	1E+30	9.94167E-05
Davao del Norte	268298.6512	9.03344E-05	-2.1855E-05	1E+30	9.03344E-05
Davao del Sur (excluding Davao City)	168078.4792	8.12909E-05	-3.08984E-05	1E+30	8.12909E-05
<i>Davao City</i>	433833.4173	1.46116E-05	-9.75778E-05	1E+30	1.46116E-05
Davao Occidental	84137.93553	8.80039E-05	-2.41854E-05	1E+30	8.80039E-05
Davao Oriental	152176.4982	0.000108433	-3.75677E-06	1E+30	0.000108433
Cotabato (North Cotabato)	466982.1978	9.31252E-05	-1.90642E-05	1E+30	9.31252E-05
Sarangani	179739.8157	8.22584E-05	-2.99309E-05	1E+30	8.22584E-05
South Cotabato (excluding General Santos City)	310269.1562	9.76484E-05	-1.45409E-05	1E+30	9.76484E-05
<i>General Santos City</i>	646089.4291	0	-0.000155906	4.37171E-05	1E+30
Sultan Kudarat	273637.512	8.73162E-05	-2.48732E-05	1E+30	8.73162E-05
<i>Cotabato City</i>	325097.9424	0	-0.000325391	0.000213202	1E+30

Continued on next page

Table 3 Continued from previous page

Constraint for the Lower Bound of the No. of Vaccines in [city/province]	Solution	Reduced Cost	Obj. Coefficient	Allowable Increase	Allowable Decrease
Agusan del Norte (excluding Butuan City)	116497.9007	8.80158E-05	-2.41736E-05	1E+30	8.80158E-05
<i>Butuan City (Capital)</i>	110283.9896	3.51455E-05	-7.70438E-05	1E+30	3.51455E-05
Agusan del Sur	220702.6856	9.92561E-05	-1.29332E-05	1E+30	9.92561E-05
Dinagat Islands	45733.67962	0.000111109	-1.08049E-06	1E+30	0.000111109
Surigao del Norte	164009.7505	6.04487E-05	-5.17406E-05	1E+30	6.04487E-05
Surigao del Sur	196263.0044	8.71624E-05	-2.5027E-05	1E+30	8.71624E-05
Basilan (excluding the City of Isabela)	202256.9564	0.000103436	-8.75383E-06	1E+30	0.000103436
Lanao del Sur	605161.8551	0.000101043	-1.11464E-05	1E+30	0.000101043
Maguindanao (excluding Cotabato City)	679446.9039	0.000102062	-1.01271E-05	1E+30	0.000102062
Sulu	477445.1917	7.43983E-05	-3.7791E-05	1E+30	7.43983E-05
Tawi-Tawi	226393.4462	8.97304E-05	-2.24589E-05	1E+30	8.97304E-05

Table 4: Sensitivity analysis made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license

Constraint for the Lower Bound of the No. of Vaccines in [city/province]	Constraint Status	Shadow Price	Max Vaccine	Allowable Increase	Allowable Decrease
<i>City of Manila</i>	Binding	-0.005145063	1913444	1200297.312	1765248.205
<i>Quezon City</i>	Binding	-0.001422541	3160941	1200297.312	1908852.02
<i>Caloocan City</i>	Binding	-0.002478554	1710888	1200297.312	1597172.512
<i>Pasay City</i>	Binding	-0.001991018	444166	1200297.312	410312.6459
<i>City of Las Piñas</i>	Binding	-0.001258315	634707	1200297.312	585944.5765
<i>City of Makati</i>	Binding	-0.002529648	621618	1200297.312	566549.7929
<i>City of Malabon</i>	Binding	-0.0025103	391667	1200297.312	362335.7293
<i>City of Mandaluyong</i>	Binding	-0.003349526	413342	1200297.312	380046.1126
<i>City of Marikina</i>	Binding	-0.002158634	484459	1200297.312	442839.2383
<i>City of Muntinlupa</i>	Binding	-0.000848154	543100	1200297.312	504368.8103
<i>City of Navotas</i>	Binding	-0.002066294	266235	1200297.312	247817.4461
<i>City of Parañaque</i>	Binding	-0.000805814	715002	1200297.312	661490.0454
<i>City of Pasig</i>	Binding	-0.002153593	811084	1200297.312	751728.9659
<i>City of San Juan</i>	Binding	-0.001922101	129468	1200297.312	116553.518
<i>Taguig City</i>	Binding	-0.001000423	863457	1200297.312	811967.315
<i>City of Valenzuela</i>	Binding	-0.00158427	666509	1200297.312	623438.2509
Municipality of Pateros	Binding	-0.000294156	67631	1200297.312	61760.26697
Abra	Not Binding	0	262458	1E+30	208455.8235
Apayao	Not Binding	0	129701	1E+30	106012.8365
Benguet (excluding Baguio City)	Binding	-0.000215629	483946	1200297.312	399705.2373
<i>Baguio City</i>	Binding	-0.000436564	373100	1200297.312	308585.0417
Ifugao	Not Binding	0	220699	1E+30	181551.1405
Kalinga	Not Binding	0	231282	1E+30	188073.1606
Mountain Province	Not Binding	0	168278	1E+30	135576.5909
Ilocos Norte	Not Binding	0	645459	1E+30	546810.8579
Ilocos Sur	Not Binding	0	750707	1E+30	638592.8794
La Union	Not Binding	0	855753	1E+30	737979.9343
Pangasinan	Binding	-1.05529E-05	3216656	1200297.312	1908852.02
Batanes	Not Binding	0	18775	1E+30	14784.55056
Cagayan	Not Binding	0	1304751	1E+30	1072428.95
Isabela	Not Binding	0	1733007	1E+30	1440782.012
Nueva Vizcaya	Not Binding	0	491769	1E+30	408814.2204
Quirino	Not Binding	0	205740	1E+30	171877.6577
Aurora	Not Binding	0	233279	1E+30	202695.2012
Bataan	Not Binding	0	824828	1E+30	718774.3485
Bulacan	Not Binding	0	3572444	1E+30	1908852.02
Nueva Ecija	Not Binding	0	2340588	1E+30	2015717.257
Pampanga (excluding Angeles City)	Binding	-4.16604E-05	2388740	1200297.312	1908852.02
<i>Angeles City</i>	Binding	-0.000391455	446662	1200297.312	386051.7355
Tarlac	Not Binding	0	1485942	1E+30	1276831.114
Zambales (excluding Olongapo City)	Not Binding	0	642531	1E+30	551927.6914
<i>Olongapo City</i>	Binding	-1.6302E-05	252708	1200297.312	217186.6616
Batangas	Not Binding	0	2921971	1E+30	2552536.11
Cavite	Binding	-2.64694E-05	3982468	1200297.312	1908852.02
Laguna	Not Binding	0	3283563	1E+30	2917925.101
Quezon (excluding Lucena City)	Not Binding	0	2017123	1E+30	1772828.574
<i>Lucena City (Capital)</i>	Binding	-0.000373824	288402	1200297.312	253437.3683
Rizal	Binding	-0.000132594	3123337	1200297.312	1908852.02
Marinduque	Not Binding	0	255193	1E+30	202028.5888
Occidental Mindoro	Not Binding	0	530418	1E+30	437294.9732
Oriental Mindoro	Not Binding	0	917889	1E+30	751524.2031
Palawan (excluding Puerto Princesa City)	Not Binding	0	924514	1E+30	764748.4904
<i>Puerto Princesa City (Capital)</i>	Not Binding	0	277600	1E+30	228828.4953
Romblon	Not Binding	0	318693	1E+30	253514.8663
Albay	Not Binding	0	1430544	1E+30	1059148.557
Camarines Norte	Not Binding	0	634878	1E+30	474872.6258
Camarines Sur	Not Binding	0	2124252	1E+30	1582307.908
Catanduanes	Not Binding	0	284003	1E+30	207468.6853

Continued on next page

Constraint for the Lower Bound of the No. of Vaccines in [city/province]	Constraint Status	Shadow Price	Max Vaccine	Allowable Increase	Allowable Decrease
Masbate	Not Binding	0	971281	1E+30	727312.6929
Sorsogon	Not Binding	0	862866	1E+30	638025.5132
Aklan	Not Binding	0	625540	1E+30	510178.5279
Antique	Not Binding	0	633519	1E+30	516635.0592
Capiz	Not Binding	0	827826	1E+30	677889.0134
Guimaras	Not Binding	0	189887	1E+30	155751.6735
Iloilo (excluding Iloilo City)	Not Binding	0	2105412	1E+30	1713601.552
<i>Iloilo City (Capital)</i>	Binding	-0.000906024	483409	1200297.312	393120.5706
Negros Occidental (excluding Bacolod City)	Not Binding	0	2713350	1E+30	2249525.873
<i>Bacolod City (Capital)</i>	Binding	-0.000578225	606339	1200297.312	502367.7555
Bohol	Not Binding	0	1429372	1E+30	1109248.678
Cebu (excluding Cebu City, Lapu-Lapu City, and Mandaue City)	Binding	-1.13497E-05	3192655	1200297.312	1908852.02
<i>Cebu City (Capital)</i>	Binding	-0.00048741	993669	1200297.312	794294.2143
<i>Lapu-lapu City</i>	Binding	-0.001288744	441695	1200297.312	352828.4071
<i>Mandaue City</i>	Binding	-0.002629875	392162	1200297.312	313859.4929
Negros Oriental	Not Binding	0	1474616	1E+30	1171792.346
Siquijor	Not Binding	0	104471	1E+30	78649.76487
Biliran	Not Binding	0	186710	1E+30	128644.1087
Eastern Samar	Not Binding	0	508151	1E+30	348769.2948
Leyte (excluding Tacloban City)	Not Binding	0	1875091	1E+30	1301305.153
<i>Tacloban City (Capital)</i>	Not Binding	0	262524	1E+30	182734.7332
Northern Samar	Not Binding	0	687429	1E+30	484300.5055
Samar (Western Samar)	Not Binding	0	847186	1E+30	593472.0346
Southern Leyte	Not Binding	0	458663	1E+30	310132.1988
Zamboanga del Norte	Not Binding	0	1100814	1E+30	707458.9598
Zamboanga del Sur	Not Binding	0	1099489	1E+30	712574.3406
<i>Zamboanga City</i>	Binding	-6.93926E-06	934916	1200297.312	602757.6155
Zamboanga Sibugay	Not Binding	0	689199	1E+30	449824.3662
<i>City of Isabela (Capital of Basilan)</i>	Not Binding	0	122610	1E+30	79765.68285
Bukidnon	Not Binding	0	1539981	1E+30	1192636.931
Camiguin	Not Binding	0	96276	1E+30	70224.44575
Lanao del Norte (excluding Iligan City)	Not Binding	0	735682	1E+30	570885.695
<i>Iligan City</i>	Not Binding	0	372061	1E+30	289787.945
Misamis Occidental	Not Binding	0	654832	1E+30	489127.499
Misamis Oriental (excluding Cagayan de Oro City)	Not Binding	0	966423	1E+30	734585.6533
<i>Cagayan de Oro City (Capital)</i>	Binding	-8.71974E-05	733534	1200297.312	558024.2467
Compostela Valley	Not Binding	0	801040	1E+30	605229.8016
Davao del Norte	Not Binding	0	1105619	1E+30	837320.0852
Davao del Sur (excluding Davao City)	Not Binding	0	688058	1E+30	519979.577
<i>Davao City</i>	Not Binding	0	1771771	1E+30	1337937.622
Davao Occidental	Not Binding	0	344312	1E+30	260174.3558
Davao Oriental	Not Binding	0	608180	1E+30	456003.0219
Cotabato (North Cotabato)	Not Binding	0	1501847	1E+30	1034864.674
Sarangani	Not Binding	0	592224	1E+30	412484.3729
South Cotabato (excluding General Santos City)	Not Binding	0	995502	1E+30	685233.3259
<i>General Santos City</i>	Binding	-4.37171E-05	646089	1200297.312	444790.7283
Sultan Kudarat	Not Binding	0	883962	1E+30	610324.6722
<i>Cotabato City</i>	Binding	-0.000213202	325098	1200297.312	225718.0572
Agusan del Norte (excluding Butuan City)	Not Binding	0	385604	1E+30	269105.7053
<i>Butuan City (Capital)</i>	Not Binding	0	365376	1E+30	255091.662

Continued on next page

Constraint for the Lower Bound of the No. of Vaccines in [city/province]	Constraint Status	Shadow Price	Max Vaccine	Allowable Increase	Allowable Decrease
Agusan del Sur	Not Binding	0	762367	1E+30	541664.6447
Dinagat Islands	Not Binding	0	138393	1E+30	92659.47662
Surigao del Norte	Not Binding	0	527561	1E+30	363550.9177
Surigao del Sur	Not Binding	0	644317	1E+30	448054.3844
Basilan (excluding the City of Isabela)	Not Binding	0	377122	1E+30	174864.87
Lanao del Sur	Not Binding	0	1137224	1E+30	532062.1659
Maguindanao (excluding Cotabato City)	Not Binding	0	1277389	1E+30	597942.353
Sulu	Not Binding	0	897714	1E+30	420269.2738
Tawi-Tawi	Not Binding	0	425264	1E+30	198870.3717

Table 5: Sensitivity analysis made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license

Constraint for the Lower Bound of the No. of Vaccines in [city/province]	Constraint Status	Shadow Price	Min Vaccine	Allowable Increase	Allowable Decrease
<i>City of Manila</i>	Not Binding	0	148196	1765248.205	1E+30
<i>Quezon City</i>	Not Binding	0	223045	2937895.848	1E+30
<i>Caloocan City</i>	Not Binding	0	113715	1597172.512	1E+30
<i>Pasay City</i>	Not Binding	0	33853	410312.6459	1E+30
<i>City of Las Piñas</i>	Not Binding	0	48763	585944.5765	1E+30
<i>City of Makati</i>	Not Binding	0	55069	566549.7929	1E+30
<i>City of Malabon</i>	Not Binding	0	29331	362335.7293	1E+30
<i>City of Mandaluyong</i>	Not Binding	0	33295	380046.1126	1E+30
<i>City of Marikina</i>	Not Binding	0	41620	442839.2383	1E+30
<i>City of Muntinlupa</i>	Not Binding	0	38731	504368.8103	1E+30
<i>City of Navotas</i>	Not Binding	0	18418	247817.4461	1E+30
<i>City of Parañaque</i>	Not Binding	0	53512	661490.0454	1E+30
<i>City of Pasig</i>	Not Binding	0	59355	751728.9659	1E+30
<i>City of San Juan</i>	Not Binding	0	12914	116553.518	1E+30
<i>Taguig City</i>	Not Binding	0	51490	811967.315	1E+30
<i>City of Valenzuela</i>	Not Binding	0	43070	623438.2509	1E+30
Municipality of Pateros	Not Binding	0	5871	61760.26697	1E+30
Abra	Binding	0.000105006	54002	208455.8235	0
Apayao	Binding	0.000111989	23689	106012.8365	0
Benguet (excluding Baguio City)	Not Binding	0	84241	399705.2373	1E+30
<i>Baguio City</i>	Not Binding	0	64515	308585.0417	1E+30
Ifugao	Binding	0.000111603	39148	181551.1405	0
Kalinga	Binding	0.000110481	43209	188073.1606	0
Mountain Province	Binding	0.0001117	32702	135576.5909	0
Ilocos Norte	Binding	0.000103356	98648	546810.8579	0
Ilocos Sur	Binding	0.000102852	112114	638592.8794	0
La Union	Binding	1.42737E-05	117773	737979.9343	0
Pangasinan	Not Binding	0	424245	2792410.993	1E+30
Batanes	Binding	0.000112189	3990	14784.55056	0
Cagayan	Binding	0.00010243	232322	1072428.95	0
Isabela	Binding	0.000106033	292225	1200297.312	0
Nueva Vizcaya	Binding	9.15245E-05	82955	408814.2204	0
Quirino	Binding	0.000111677	33863	171877.6577	0
Aurora	Binding	0.000111884	30583	202695.2012	0
Bataan	Binding	5.28538E-05	106054	718774.3485	0
Bulacan	Not Binding	0	463295	1200297.312	1E+30
Nueva Ecija	Binding	6.90956E-05	324870	1200297.312	0
Pampanga (excluding Angeles City)	Not Binding	0	320772	2067968.123	1E+30
<i>Angeles City</i>	Not Binding	0	60610	386051.7355	1E+30
Tarlac	Binding	6.41871E-05	209111	1200297.312	0
Zambales (excluding Olongapo City)	Binding	0.000102889	90603	551927.6914	0
<i>Olongapo City</i>	Not Binding	0	35521	217186.6616	1E+30
Batangas	Binding	3.45146E-05	369434	1200297.312	5.82077E-11
Cavite	Not Binding	0	445453	3537014.392	1E+30
Laguna	Binding	0	365638	4.65661E-10	1E+30
Quezon (excluding Lucena City)	Binding	9.29426E-05	244294	1200297.312	0
<i>Lucena City (Capital)</i>	Not Binding	0	34965	253437.3683	1E+30
Rizal	Not Binding	0	332565	2790772.291	1E+30
Marinduque	Binding	7.06392E-05	53165	202028.5888	0
Occidental Mindoro	Binding	9.67618E-05	93123	437294.9732	0
Oriental Mindoro	Binding	8.70069E-05	166365	751524.2031	0
Palawan (excluding Puerto Princesa City)	Binding	0.000109079	159765	764748.4904	0
<i>Puerto Princesa City (Capital)</i>	Binding	0.000107764	48772	228828.4953	0
Romblon	Binding	9.6498E-05	65178	253514.8663	0
Albay	Binding	1.44038E-06	371395	1059148.557	0
Camarines Norte	Binding	7.25156E-05	160005	474872.6258	0
Camarines Sur	Binding	4.17859E-05	541944	1200297.312	0
Catanduanes	Binding	0.000100825	76534	207468.6853	0

Continued on next page

Constraint for the Lower Bound of the No. of Vaccines in [city/province]	Constraint Status	Shadow Price	Min Vaccine	Allowable Increase	Allowable Decrease
Masbate	Binding	0.000107796	243968	727312.6929	0
Sorsogon	Binding	5.57635E-05	224840	638025.5132	0
Aklan	Binding	4.63141E-05	115361	510178.5279	0
Antique	Binding	0.00010348	116884	516635.0592	0
Capiz	Binding	6.91485E-05	149937	677889.0134	0
Guimaras	Binding	9.12387E-05	34136	155751.6735	0
Iloilo (excluding Iloilo City)	Binding	2.44219E-05	391810	1200297.312	0
<i>Iloilo City (Capital)</i>	Not Binding	0	90288	393120.5706	1E+30
Negros Occidental (excluding Bacolod City)	Binding	7.00028E-05	463824	1200297.312	0
<i>Bacolod City (Capital)</i>	Not Binding	0	103971	502367.7555	1E+30
Bohol	Binding	8.88815E-05	320124	1109248.678	0
Cebu (excluding Cebu City, Lapu-Lapu City, and Mandaue City)	Not Binding	0	635560	2557095.082	1E+30
<i>Cebu City (Capital)</i>	Not Binding	0	199375	794294.2143	1E+30
<i>Lapu-lapu City</i>	Not Binding	0	88867	352828.4071	1E+30
<i>Mandaue City</i>	Not Binding	0	78302	313859.4929	1E+30
Negros Oriental	Binding	9.24819E-05	302824	1171792.346	0
Siquijor	Binding	0.000110215	25821	78649.76487	0
Biliran	Binding	8.13327E-05	58066	128644.1087	0
Eastern Samar	Binding	0.000105158	159382	348769.2948	0
Leyte (excluding Tacloban City)	Binding	0.000101707	573786	1200297.312	0
<i>Tacloban City (Capital)</i>	Binding	1.08371E-05	79790	182734.7332	0
Northern Samar	Binding	9.72633E-05	203129	484300.5055	0
Samar (Western Samar)	Binding	0.000104987	253714	593472.0346	0
Southern Leyte	Binding	0.000107611	148531	310132.1988	0
Zamboanga del Norte	Binding	8.83709E-05	393355	707458.9598	0
Zamboanga del Sur	Binding	9.66696E-05	386915	712574.3406	0
<i>Zamboanga City</i>	Not Binding	0	332158	602757.6155	1E+30
Zamboanga Sibugay	Binding	9.85498E-05	239375	449824.3662	0
<i>City of Isabela (Capital of Basilan)</i>	Binding	4.05162E-05	42845	79765.68285	7.27596E-12
Bukidnon	Binding	0.000105968	347344	1192636.931	0
Camiguin	Binding	0.000109647	26052	70224.44575	0
Lanao del Norte (excluding Iligan City)	Binding	0.000105587	164796	570885.695	0
<i>Iligan City</i>	Binding	4.70796E-05	82273	289787.945	0
Misamis Occidental	Binding	9.0637E-05	165704	489127.499	0
Misamis Oriental (excluding Cagayan de Oro City)	Binding	9.6936E-05	231837	734585.6533	0
<i>Cagayan de Oro City (Capital)</i>	Not Binding	0	175510	558024.2467	1E+30
Compostela Valley	Binding	9.94167E-05	195810	605229.8016	0
Davao del Norte	Binding	9.03344E-05	268299	837320.0852	0
Davao del Sur (excluding Davao City)	Binding	8.12909E-05	168078	519979.577	0
<i>Davao City</i>	Binding	1.46116E-05	433833	1200297.312	0
Davao Occidental	Binding	8.80039E-05	84138	260174.3558	0
Davao Oriental	Binding	0.000108433	152176	456003.0219	0
Cotabato (North Cotabato)	Binding	9.31252E-05	466982	1034864.674	0
Sarangani	Binding	8.22584E-05	179740	412484.3729	0
South Cotabato (excluding General Santos City)	Binding	9.76484E-05	310269	685233.3259	0
<i>General Santos City</i>	Not Binding	0	201299	444790.7283	1E+30
Sultan Kudarat	Binding	8.73162E-05	273638	610324.6722	0
<i>Cotabato City</i>	Not Binding	0	99380	225718.0572	1E+30
Agusan del Norte (excluding Butuan City)	Binding	8.80158E-05	116498	269105.7053	0
<i>Butuan City (Capital)</i>	Binding	3.51455E-05	110284	255091.662	0

Continued on next page

Table 5 continued from previous page

Constraint for the Lower Bound of the No. of Vaccines in [city/province]	Constraint Status	Shadow Price	Min Vaccine	Allowable Increase	Allowable Decrease
Agusan del Sur	Binding	9.92561E-05	220703	541664.6447	0
Dinagat Islands	Binding	0.000111109	45734	92659.47662	0
Surigao del Norte	Binding	6.04487E-05	164010	363550.9177	0
Surigao del Sur	Binding	8.71624E-05	196263	448054.3844	0
Basilan (excluding the City of Isabela)	Binding	0.000103436	202257	174864.87	0
Lanao del Sur	Binding	0.000101043	605162	532062.1659	0
Maguindanao (excluding Cotabato City)	Binding	0.000102062	679447	597942.353	0
Sulu	Binding	7.43983E-05	477445	420269.2738	0
Tawi-Tawi	Binding	8.97304E-05	226393	198870.3717	0

Table 6: Various approaches of allocating vaccines and its resulting objective function value per city/province

Province/ Highly Urbanized City	LP Model result without budget consideration		LP Model result with budget consideration		LP Model result without budget consideration and with MAX R_0		LP Model result without budget consideration and without lower bound		Allocation proportional to population		Allocation proportional to population density		Allocation proportional to number of infections		Equal allocation	
	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths
<i>City of Manila</i>	1913444	1118	1913444	1118	1913444	1499	1913444	1118	969127	6082	1913444	1118	1913444	1118	469863	8707
<i>Quezon City</i>	3160941	539	1558026	2999	3160941	723	3160941	539	1598445	2937	1907131	2463	3160941	539	469863	4669
<i>Calocan City</i>	1710888	492	1710888	492	1710888	661	1710888	492	862330	2691	1710888	492	1710888	492	469863	3708
<i>Pasay City</i>	444166	104	444166	104	444166	139	444166	104	226758	561	444166	104	444166	104	469863	50
<i>City of Las Piñas</i>	634707	97	48763	900	634707	130	634707	97	320599	527	634707	97	634707	97	469863	323
<i>City of Makati</i>	621618	182	621618	182	621618	245	621618	182	317173	987	621618	182	621618	182	469863	583
<i>City of Malabon</i>	391667	114	391667	114	391667	153	391667	114	198995	619	391667	114	391667	114	469863	0
<i>City of Mandaluyong</i>	413342	159	413342	159	413342	213	413342	159	210292	862	413342	159	413342	159	469863	0
<i>City of Marikina</i>	484459	122	484459	122	484459	164	484459	122	245387	665	484459	122	484459	122	469863	155
<i>City of Muntinlupa</i>	543100	58	38731	542	543100	78	543100	58	274659	316	543100	58	543100	58	469863	128
<i>City of Navotas</i>	266235	64	266235	64	266235	86	266235	64	135810	349	266235	64	266235	64	469863	0
<i>City of Parañaque</i>	715002	73	53512	680	715002	98	715002	73	362479	397	715002	73	715002	73	469863	298
<i>City of Pasig</i>	811084	204	811084	204	811084	274	811084	204	411191	1110	811084	204	811084	204	469863	977
<i>City of San Juan</i>	129468	29	129468	29	129468	39	129468	29	66516	157	129468	29	129468	29	469863	0
<i>Taguig City</i>	863457	107	51490	1010	863457	143	863457	107	438202	580	863457	107	863457	107	469863	545
<i>City of Valenzuela</i>	666509	126	666509	126	666509	169	666509	126	337763	683	666509	126	666509	126	469863	459
Municipality of Pateros	67631	3	5871	28	67631	4	67631	3	34755	16	67631	3	67631	3	469863	0
Abra	54002	2	54002	2	54002	2	54002	2	131289	1	6405	2	16889	2	469863	0
Apayao	23689	0	23689	0	23689	0	23689	0	64885	0	2952	0	9491	0	469863	0
Benguet (excluding Baguio City)	483946	18	84241	149	483946	18	483946	18	242928	97	483946	18	266595	89	469863	22
<i>Baguio City</i>	373100	23	64515	192	373100	23	373100	23	188020	124	373100	23	373100	23	469863	0
Ifugao	39148	0	39148	0	39148	0	39148	0	110407	0	8640	0	16052	0	469863	0
Kalinga	43209	0	43209	0	43209	0	43209	0	115785	0	7227	0	40059	0	469863	0
Mountain Province	32702	0	32702	0	32702	0	32702	0	84160	0	7216	0	5862	0	469863	0
Ilocos Norte	98648	5	98648	5	98648	5	98648	5	322878	3	19349	6	41455	6	469863	2
Ilocos Sur	112114	7	112114	7	112114	7	112114	7	375461	4	29630	8	30009	8	469863	3
La Union	117773	82	117773	82	117773	82	855753	9	428260	51	58520	87	107196	83	469863	47
Pangasinan	3216656	44	424245	387	424245	387	3216656	44	1609666	241	60502	431	373372	393	469863	381
Batanes	3990	0	3990	0	3990	0	3990	0	9389	0	9465	0	419	0	469863	0
Cagayan	232322	12	232322	12	232322	12	232322	12	652920	8	14233	14	151861	13	469863	10
Isabela	292225	10	292225	10	292225	11	292225	11	867550	7	13565	12	292138	10	469863	9
Nueva Vizcaya	82955	10	82955	10	82955	10	82955	10	246229	6	10479	11	96030	9	469863	2
Quirino	33863	0	33863	0	33863	0	33863	0	102888	0	9087	0	5025	0	469863	0
Aurora	30583	0	30583	0	30583	0	30583	0	116686	0	7629	0	13120	0	469863	0

Continued on next page

Table 6 continued from previous page

Province/ Highly Urbanized City	LP Model result without budget consideration		LP Model result with budget consideration		LP Model result without budget consideration and with MAX R ₀		LP Model result without budget consideration and without lower bound		Allocation proportional to population		Allocation proportional to population density		Allocation proportional to number of infections		Equal allocation	
	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths
Bataan	106054	48	106054	48	106054	48	0	54	414104	30	61791	51	471775	26	469863	27
Bulacan	1663592	259	463295	393	3572444	57	3572444	45	1792230	244	131902	431	1677175	257	469863	393
Nueva Ecija	324870	98	324870	98	324870	110	0	112	1171273	62	42174	110	273295	100	469863	92
Pampanga (excluding Angeles City)	2388740	41	320772	359	2388740	45	2388740	41	1196669	224	122506	389	641782	310	469863	336
Angeles City	446662	25	60610	219	446662	27	446662	25	224097	137	446662	25	213834	142	469863	13
Tarlac	209111	69	209111	69	209111	69	0	79	743676	44	50011	77	196806	70	469863	57
Zambales (excluding Olongapo City)	90603	6	90603	6	90603	6	0	7	321662	4	18152	6	110825	6	469863	2
Olongapo City	252708	4	35521	32	252708	4	252708	4	126869	20	140495	18	143766	18	469863	0
Batangas	369434	223	369434	223	369434	302	2921971	25	1466818	138	96469	245	1628183	126	469863	216
Cavite	3982468	61	445453	552	3982468	74	3982468	61	2002497	336	268792	576	3144144	178	469863	548
Laguna	365638	219	365638	219	365638	308	2297994	90	1652323	133	175555	231	2942593	47	469863	212
Quezon (excluding Lucena City)	244294	38	244294	38	244294	39	0	43	1010738	24	23682	43	607725	31	469863	34
Lucena City (Capital)	288402	16	34965	139	288402	16	288402	16	144948	85	288402	16	208391	54	469863	0
Rizal	3123337	85	332565	768	3123337	125	3123337	85	1570197	465	272005	783	2380650	267	469863	734
Marinduque	53165	10	53165	10	53165	11	0	12	127675	6	27459	11	21914	11	469863	0
Occidental Mindoro	93123	8	93123	8	93123	8	0	9	265352	5	9291	9	39919	8	469863	2
Oriental Mindoro	166365	21	166365	21	166365	21	0	26	459513	14	22211	25	158561	22	469863	14
Palawan (excluding Puerto Princesa City)	159765	3	159765	3	159765	3	0	3	462458	2	6467	3	56111	3	469863	2
Puerto Princesa City (Capital)	48772	1	48772	1	48772	1	0	1	138887	1	11950	1	24287	1	469863	0
Romblon	65178	5	65178	5	65178	5	0	6	159392	3	21295	5	12841	5	469863	0
Albay	371395	135	371395	135	371395	141	1430544	18	715802	97	56952	170	147953	160	469863	124
Camarines Norte	160005	22	160005	22	160005	22	0	28	317560	15	28560	27	33918	27	469863	9
Camarines Sur	541944	128	541944	128	541944	128	2124252	17	1062981	91	39510	163	238679	149	469863	133
Catanduanes	76534	3	76534	3	76534	5	0	4	142071	2	19506	3	19401	3	469863	0
Masbate	243968	4	243968	4	243968	4	0	5	485826	3	24050	5	51784	5	469863	3
Sorsogon	224840	41	224840	41	224840	62	0	54	431688	30	41736	52	71185	50	469863	28
Aklan	115361	38	115361	38	115361	38	0	46	312938	25	36421	43	47038	43	469863	15
Antique	116884	5	116884	5	116884	5	0	6	316852	3	23772	6	25822	6	469863	2
Capiz	149937	33	149937	33	149937	51	0	40	414504	22	32729	38	164842	32	469863	19
Guimaras	34136	4	34136	4	34136	5	0	4	95061	2	31829	4	32661	4	469863	0

Continued on next page

Table 6 continued from previous page

Province/ Highly Urbanized City	LP Model result without budget consideration		LP Model result with budget consideration		LP Model result without budget consideration and with MAX R ₀		LP Model result without budget consideration and without lower bound		Allocation proportional to population		Allocation proportional to population density		Allocation proportional to number of infections		Equal allocation	
	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths
Iloilo (excluding Iloilo City)	391810	171	391810	171	391810	171	2105412	21	1054204	113	43215	202	418317	169	469863	164
Iloilo City (Capital)	483409	55	483409	55	483409	55	483409	55	243890	299	483409	55	483409	55	469863	68
Negros Occidental (excluding Bacolod City)	463824	108	463824	108	463824	108	0	127	1359529	70	32611	126	796714	94	469863	107
Bacolod City (Capital)	606339	47	606339	47	606339	47	606339	47	305889	254	358134	218	606339	47	469863	141
Bohol	320124	30	320124	30	320124	40	0	37	715113	20	30698	36	119060	34	469863	26
Cebu (excluding Cebu City, Lapu-Lapu City, and Mandaue City)	3192655	44	635560	360	2555542	123	3192655	44	1600006	241	60896	431	1026739	311	469863	380
Cebu City (Capital)	993669	66	199375	542	993669	66	993669	66	502277	361	300024	482	993669	66	469863	380
Lapu-lapu City	441695	69	88867	563	441695	69	441695	69	222179	376	441695	69	371837	167	469863	29
Mandaue City	392162	119	392162	119	392162	119	392162	119	197432	653	392162	119	377141	161	469863	0
Negros Oriental	302824	26	302824	26	302824	29	0	32	737670	18	25606	32	101055	30	469863	23
Siquijor	25821	0	25821	0	25821	0	0	0	52254	0	29133	0	5304	0	469863	0
Biliran	58066	5	58066	5	58066	5	0	6	93427	4	32796	5	20099	6	469863	0
Eastern Samar	159382	3	159382	3	159382	3	0	4	254326	2	10364	4	69789	3	469863	1
Leyte (excluding Tacloban City)	573786	16	573786	16	573786	21	0	22	938929	12	27886	22	386214	18	469863	17
Tacloban City (Capital)	79790	21	79790	21	262524	4	262524	3	131795	16	122935	17	148791	14	469863	0
Northern Samar	203129	8	203129	8	203129	8	0	11	344272	6	17531	11	155630	9	469863	4
Samar (Western Samar)	253714	5	253714	5	253714	5	0	7	424900	4	13219	7	364858	4	469863	3
Southern Leyte	148531	2	148531	2	148531	2	0	2	229604	1	23982	2	76070	2	469863	0
Zamboanga del Norte	393355	20	393355	20	393355	24	0	29	550611	16	14192	29	56808	28	469863	18
Zamboanga del Sur	386915	13	386915	13	386915	14	0	19	550219	10	23087	19	132460	17	469863	12
Zamboanga City	934916	12	332158	84	934916	13	934916	12	469170	68	62401	116	478056	67	469863	68
Zamboanga Sibugay	239375	7	239375	7	239375	8	0	10	344681	6	18630	10	22612	10	469863	4
City of Isabela (Capital of Basilan)	42845	7	42845	7	42845	7	122610	1	61403	5	51640	6	27218	8	469863	0
Bukidnon	347344	8	347344	8	347344	14	0	11	770460	6	13808	11	131204	10	469863	8
Camiguin	26052	0	26052	0	26052	0	0	0	48168	0	37538	0	8375	0	469863	0
Lanao del Norte (excluding Iligan City)	164796	4	164796	4	164796	6	0	5	368235	3	20657	5	109988	5	469863	2
Iligan City	82273	22	82273	22	82273	29	0	27	186524	15	43149	24	137764	18	469863	0
Misamis Occidental	165704	12	165704	12	165704	12	0	16	327802	9	30737	15	107894	13	469863	6

Continued on next page

Table 6 continued from previous page

Province/ Highly Urbanized City	LP Model result without budget consideration		LP Model result with budget consideration		LP Model result without budget consideration and with MAX R ₀		LP Model result without budget consideration and without lower bound		Allocation proportional to population density		Allocation proportional to number of infections		Equal allocation	
	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths	Alloc.	Add. Deaths
Misamis Oriental (excluding Cagayan de Oro City)	231837	13	231837	13	231837	17	0	16	483711	9	139578	14	469863	9
Cagayan de Oro City (Capital)	733534	16	175510	128	733534	21	733534	16	367993	89	342107	94	469863	69
Compostela Valley	195810	9	195810	9	195810	10	0	11	400743	6	62112	11	469863	5
Davao del Norte	268299	21	268299	21	268299	26	0	27	553299	15	136787	24	469863	17
Davao del Sur (excluding Davao City)	168078	18	168078	18	168078	25	0	24	344386	13	99659	21	469863	9
Davao City	433833	150	433833	150	1771771	26	1771771	19	889014	105	873203	107	469863	146
Davao Occidental	84138	7	84138	7	84138	7	0	9	172219	5	17587	9	469863	0
Davao Oriental	152176	2	152176	2	152176	3	0	3	304301	1	59042	2	469863	1
Cotabato (North Cotabato)	466982	23	466982	23	466982	28	0	32	751145	17	61973	31	469863	23
Sarangani	179740	14	179740	14	179740	15	0	20	296300	11	52481	18	469863	6
South Cotabato (excluding General Santos City)	310269	12	310269	12	310269	19	0	16	498291	9	150605	14	469863	9
General Santos City	646089	11	201299	81	646089	18	646089	11	323621	61	123548	93	469863	39
Sultan Kudarat	273638	18	273638	18	273638	22	0	24	442111	13	36290	24	469863	13
Cotabato City	325098	12	99380	85	325098	12	325098	12	163016	64	130506	75	469863	0
Agusan del Norte (excluding Butuan City)	116498	8	116498	8	116498	8	0	10	192994	6	53738	9	469863	0
Butuan City (Capital)	110284	23	110284	23	110284	25	365376	3	183500	17	226675	14	469863	0
Agusan del Sur	220703	8	220703	8	220703	8	0	11	381441	6	71883	10	469863	5
Dinagat Islands	45734	0	45734	0	45734	0	0	0	69223	0	7258	0	469863	0
Surigao del Norte	164010	22	164010	22	164010	22	0	30	264086	17	85282	26	469863	6
Surigao del Sur	196263	13	196263	13	196263	13	0	18	322426	10	74535	16	469863	6
Basilan (excluding the City of Isabela)	202257	2	202257	2	202257	2	0	4	188680	2	33359	3	469863	0
Lanao del Sur	605162	7	605162	7	605162	10	0	14	569140	8	147395	12	469863	9
Maguindanao (excluding Cotabato City)	679447	7	679447	7	679447	7	0	14	639099	8	112779	13	469863	10
Sulu	477445	20	477445	20	477445	20	0	38	448990	21	37128	36	469863	20
Tawi-Tawi	226393	6	226393	6	226393	6	0	11	212708	6	21356	10	469863	0

Appendix D

Table 7: Table of Parameters

Parameter	Description
N_i	projected 2020 population size of locality i
C_i	number of recovered/ expired COVID-19 cases in locality i as of 11/10/2020
m_i	number of vaccinated individuals in locality i
eff	effectiveness rate of the vaccine
R_{0i}	maximum reproduction number recorded in locality i as of 11/11/2020
δ_i	population density of locality i
d_i	case fatality rate per locality i as of 11/10/2020
V	total available complete doses of vaccine for allocation across the country
G_i	number of individuals belonging to the priority group in locality i
P	price per complete dose of vaccine
B	total allotted budget for vaccination