Performance of Heart Failure Clinical Prediction Models: A Systematic External Validation Study

Jenica N. Upshaw MD MS1,2, Jason Nelson MPH1, Benjamin Koethe MPH1, Jinny G. Park MPH1, Hannah McGinnes MPH1, Benjamin S. Wessler MD MS1,2, Marvin A. Konstam MD2, James E. Udelson MD2, Ben Van Calster PhD3, David van Klaveren PhD1,4, Ewout Steyerberg PhD4, David M. Kent MD MS1

1Predictive Analytics and Comparative Effectiveness (PACE) Center, Institute for Clinical Research and Health Policy Studies (ICRHPS), Tufts Medical Center, Boston, MA

2Division of Cardiology, Tufts Medical Center, 800 Washington St, Boston, MA

3Department of Development and Regeneration, KU Leuven, Leuven, Belgium

4Department of Public Health, Erasmus University Medical Center, Rotterdam, Netherlands

Short title: HF prediction model external validation

Keywords: Clinical prediction model, heart failure, mortality

Acknowledgement: Research reported in this work was funded through a Patient-Centered Outcomes Research Institute® (PCORI®) Award (ME-1606-35555).

Disclaimer: The views, statements, opinions presented in this work are solely the responsibility of the author(s) and do not necessarily represent the views of  the Patient-Centered Outcomes Research Institute® (PCORI®), its Board of Governors or Methodology Committee.

Supplemental Table 2: Chronic HF CPMs with at least one validation dataset match:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CPM Citation | Sample Size, Enrollment Years | Population | Baseline characteristics: Age, % male, mean LVEF, NYHA Class I/II | Baseline Medications | Variable Selection | Variables final model (N) | Events per variable (EPV) in Derivation Cohort | Outcome definition, N(%) in derivation cohort | Derivation c-statistic | RCT validation(s) | Number of prior validations reported in literature (through 2015) |
| Kraaier et al34 | N=861, 2002-2008 | Single-center, LVEF ≤35% receiving ICD | * 63±10 yrs
* 79% male
* LVEF 24% ±9%
* 68% NYHA I/II
 | * BB: 76%
* ACEi/ARB: 76%
* MRA: NR
* Diuretics: 74%
* Statin:67%
* ICD 100%
* CRT 28%
 | Logistic regression. Backward stepwise selection with P>0.10 excluded | * Age,
* LVEF
* GFR,
* Afib
 | 16 | All cause mortality at 1 yearN=63 (4.8%);  | NR | HF Action, SCD HeFT, BEST, SOLVD, HEAAL | 1 |
| Bilchick et al | N=17,991, 2005-2006 | Medicare beneficiaries receiving primary prevention ICDs, Registry | * Median 73 years
* 77% male
* 32% LVEF ≤20%
* 60% NYHA I/II
 | * BB: 80%
* ACEi/ARB:74%
* MRA: NR
* Diuretic: 65%
* Statin: NR
* ICD: 100%
* CRT: NR
 | Cox PH model. Final model selected based on Wald chi-square test statistic, frequency of occurrence and clinical relevance | * Age
* LVEF
* CKD
* COPD
* Diabetes
* NYHA class III
* AFib
 | 963 | All cause mortality, median f/u 4 years N=6,741 (38%). For external validation, 1 year mortality used | c-statistic 0.75 | SOLVD | 1 |
| Van Rees et al | N=900, 1996-2009 | Ischemic heart disease with primary prevention ICD, single center | * 64±10 yrs;
* 87% male
* LVEF 29%±11%
* 51% NYHA I/II
 | * BB: 63%
* ACEi/ARB: 85%
* MRA: NR
* Diuretic: NR
* Statin: NR
* ICD: 100%
* CRT: NR
 | Logistic regression with backward stepwise selection p<0.05 | * Age
* LVEF
* NYHA III-IV
* Diabetes

Smoking | 23 | Death without prior ICD therapy, N=114 (13%) | c-statistic0.73 | SCD HeFT,  | 0 |
| Kramer et al | N=2717; 2001-2008 | Patients receiving ICDs at 2 centers | * 65±15 yrs
* 77% male
* LVEF 31%±15
* 74% NYHA I/II
 | NR | Logistic regression with stepwise selection p <0.1  | * Age
* LVEF
* Cr

Peripheral arterial disease | 31 | All cause mortality, mean follow up 3.1 years. N=125 (14%)  | c-statistic: 0.80 | HEAAL, BEST | 0 |
| Subramanian et al | N=963, 1995-1996 | Multicenter clinical trial cohort (VEST trial) | * 62±12 yrs
* 78% male
* LVEF 20% ±6%
* 100% NYHA III/IV
 | NR | Logistic regression, variable selection procedure not reported | * LVEF
* BUN
* Lymphocytes
* Cardiothoracic ratio
 | 43 | 1 year mortalityN=172  | c-statistic: 0.73 | SOLVD | 0 |
| Borleffs et al(Ischemic Model) | N=704, 1996-2007 | Single-center, Patients receiving primary prevention ICD | * 64±11 yrs;
* 87% male
* LVEF 29%±11
* NYHA: NR
 | * BB: 62%
* ACEi/ARB: 85%
* MRA: NR
* Diuretics: 72%
* Statins: 82%;
* ICD: 100%
* CRT: 49%
 | Backward stepwise selection until all variables p<0.25 | * Age
* LVEF
* Renal function,
* Diabetes
* Smoking

QRS duration  | NR | All cause mortalityNumber of events is not reported | c-statistic: 0.81 | HF Action, HEAAL, SCD HeFT, BEST | 0 |
| Borleffs et al(Nonischemic Model) | N=332, 1996-2007 | Single-center, Patients receiving primary prevention ICD | * 61±12 yrs
* 66% male
* LVEF 29%±14%
* NYHA: NR
 | * BB: 64%
* ACEi/ARB: 86%
* MRA: NR
* Diuretics: 82%
* Statins: 32%
* ICD: 100%
* CRT: 70%
 | Backward stepwise selection until all variables p<0.25 | * Age
* LVEF
* Renal function

Atrial fibrillation  | NR | All cause mortalityNumber of events is not reported | c-statistic: 0.76 | HF Action, HEAAL, SCD HeFT, BEST | 0 |
| Goldenberg et al | N=1172, 1997-2002 | Ischemic cardiomyopathy, LVEF ≤35%, MADIT-II trial cohort | * Median age 65 yrs
* 84% male
* Median LVEF 25%
* 76% NYHA I/II
 | * Diuretics: 74%
* ICD: 50%
 | Best-subset proportional-hazards regression  | * Age
* BUN
* NYHA Class
* Atrial fibrillation
* QRS duration
 | 36 | All cause mortalityN=183 (16%) | NR | BEST, SCD-HeFT, SOLVD | 0 |
| Alehagen et al | N=510,1996 | Swedish primary care population with symptoms possibly consistent with HF | * 73±6 yrs
* 52% male
* 14% LVEF <40%
* 87% NYHA Class I/II
 | * BB: 40%
* ACEi/ARB: 33%
* MRA: NR
* Diuretics: 45%
* Statins: NR
* ICD: NR
* CRT: 0
 | Cox PH regression. Variable selection not reported | * Age
* Gender
* NYHA Class
* Diabetes
 | 18 | CV Mortality N= 71 (14%) | c-statistic: 0.75 | BEST, DIG, HEAAL, TOPCAT | 0 |
| Bouvy et al  | N=152, enrollment years not reported  | Both acute and chronic HF, multicenter study Netherlands | * Mean age 70 yrs
* 35% male
* LVEF not reported
* 45% NYHA Class I/II
 | * BB: 39%
* ACEi/ARB: 82%
* MRA: 35%
* Diuretics: 100%
* Statins: 25%
* ICD: NR
* CRT: NR
 | All variables with p<0.10 were included in the model | * Age
* Gender
* DM
* Renal dysfunction
* Edema
* Weight
* SBP
* Beta-blockers
 | 6 | Mortality at 18 monthsN=51 (34%) | c-statistic= 0.80 | BEST, SCD-HeFT, SOLVD, TOPCAT | 1 |