Risk of COVID-19 and long-term exposure to air pollution: evidence from the first wave in China

Pai Zheng^{1†}, Yonghong Liu^{2†}, Hongbin Song^{3†}, Chieh-Hsi Wu^{4†}, Bingying Li², Moritz U.G. Kraemer^{5,6,7}, Huaiyu Tian², Xing Yan², Yuxin Zheng⁸, Nils Chr. Stenseth⁹, Christopher Dye^{5,10}, Guang Jia^{1*}

¹ Department of Occupational and Environmental Health Sciences, School of Public Health, Peking University, China.

² State Key Laboratory of Remote Sensing Science, College of Global Change and Earth System Science, Beijing Normal University, Beijing, China.

³ Center for Disease Control and Prevention of Chinese People's Liberation Army, Beijing, China.

⁴ School of Mathematical Sciences, University of Southampton, Southampton, UK.

⁵ Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK.

⁶ Harvard Medical School, Harvard University, Boston, MA, USA.

⁷ Boston Children's Hospital, Boston, MA, USA.

⁸ School of Public Health, Qingdao University, Qingdao, Shandong, China.

⁹ Centre for Ecological and Evolutionary Synthesis (CEES), Department of Biosciences, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway.

¹⁰ Oxford Martin School, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK.

†These authors contributed equally to this work.

*Corresponding author. Email: jiaguangjia@126.com (G.J.)

Author contributions: P.Z., H.T., G.J., N.C.S., and C.D. designed the study. H.S. collected and processed the LBS data. Y. L., X. Y., and B. L. collected the statistical data. Y.L. and C.-H.W. conducted the analyses. H.T., C.-H.W., M.U.G.K., Y.Z., and C.D. edited the manuscript. P.Z. wrote the manuscript. All authors read and approved the manuscript.

32

33 **Abstract**

34 People with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, cardiovascular disease or hypertension have a
 35 high risk of severe coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19). Long-term exposure to air pollution,
 36 especially PM_{2.5}, has also been associated with COVID-19 mortality. We collated individual-level
 37 data of confirmed COVID-19 cases during the first wave of the epidemic in mainland China. We
 38 fitted a generalized linear model using city-level COVID-19 cases and severe cases as the
 39 outcome, and long-term average levels of air pollutants as the exposure. Our analysis was adjusted
 40 using several variables, including a mobile phone dataset, covering human movement from Wuhan
 41 before the travel ban and movements within each city during the time of emergency response.
 42 Other variables included census, smoking prevalence, climate, and socio-economic data from 324
 43 cities in China. We adjusted for human mobility and socio-economic factors, and found that an
 44 increase in long-term NO₂ or PM_{2.5} may correspond to an increase in the number of COVID-19
 45 cases and severe infections. However, the linkage might also be affected by the confounding factor
 46 of population size because of the predefined correlation between population size and air pollution.
 47 The results are derived from a large, newly compiled and geocoded repository of population and
 48 epidemiological data relevant to COVID-19. The findings of this paper (and other previous studies
 49 that have given ambiguous results) indicate that a more definitive analysis is needed of the link
 50 between COVID-19 and air pollution.

51

52

53

54 **Introduction**

55 The novel coronavirus disease (COVID-19) has rapidly spread across the world ¹⁻⁴. As more
56 countries have passed the (first) peak of the COVID-19 epidemic, country-based strategies have
57 shifted from containment to delay and mitigation, aiming to prevent a second epidemic curve or
58 lower its peak ⁵. The virus (SARS-CoV-2) induces respiratory stress, so individuals with a
59 compromised respiratory system are expected to be more vulnerable to infection ⁶, and people
60 with pre-existing conditions are more vulnerable to severe infection. Meta-analysis has shown that
61 chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD), cardiovascular disease (CVD), and hypertension
62 are associated with severe COVID-19 infection and admission to intensive care units (ICUs) ⁷.

63
64 Long-term exposure to air pollution affects lung function and is associated with increased
65 prevalence of COPD, cardiovascular disease and hypertension ⁸⁻¹⁰. However, it is not known
66 whether vulnerability to lung diseases can affect COVID-19 risk ¹¹. We need to understand the
67 impact of air pollution exposure on COVID-19 infection and disease severity. This could help to
68 improve future modelling and disease burden calculations around the world.

69
70 During the first wave of COVID-19 in China, to prevent further dissemination of the illness,
71 Wuhan prohibited all transport in and out of the city on 23 January 2020. In the following days,
72 cities across mainland China activated the highest level of emergency response and contained
73 outbreaks outside Wuhan up until 6 March 2020. These measures substantially reduced air
74 pollution: a significant reduction in pollution level was observed across cities in China between
75 January and March 2020 ^{12,13}. Data on cities (excluding Wuhan) are ideal to assess the relationship
76 between long-term average exposure and COVID-19 risk (Figure 1) because the cities had widely
77 distributed COVID-19 cases, highly variable historical air quality, and have been surveyed
78 comprehensively under consistent criteria and data standards across the country. Air pollution has
79 both acute and long-term health effects, so air pollution reduction serves as a natural experiment to
80 offset the potential acute effects in particular.

81

82 **Methods**

83 **Epidemiological, demographic and geographical data**

84 We collected epidemiological data from the official reports of the health commissions of 324 cities,
85 excluding Wuhan. These included daily reports from 31 December 2019 to 6 March 2020, but
86 excluded newly-reported locally-acquired infections. Data on the percentage of severe COVID-19
87 cases were obtained from official reports of Provincial Health Committees. The age structure for
88 each city was obtained from the Sixth National Population Census of the People's Republic of
89 China. Socio-economic data, including the gross domestic product (GDP) per capita in 2016, were
90 obtained from China City Statistical Yearbook.

91

92 **Human mobility data**

93 Human movements were tracked using mobile phone data from Baidu location-based services
94 (LBS) and telecommunications operators. The number of recorded movements from Wuhan city to
95 other cities across China was calculated from 11 to 23 January 2020. On 23 January, movement
96 from Wuhan reached almost zero because of the travel ban. Travel movements within each city
97 were recorded until 6 March.

98

99 **Data for air pollution**

100 Original daily data for particulate matter concentrations, including $PM_{2.5}$, PM_{10} , SO_2 , CO , NO_2 ,
101 and O_3 for each city were obtained from air quality stations across China from January 2015 to
102 March 2020. For each city, the average concentration for each pollutant before the COVID-19
103 outbreak (January 2020) was calculated across the whole period available.

104

105 **Statistical methods**

106 To quantify the effect of air pollution on COVID-19 risk, we used the historical data for air quality
107 between 2015 and 2019 and COVID-19 case reports. Socio-demographic and behavioural
108 confounders were identified through the literature search. The association between long-term
109 exposure to air pollutants and COVID-19 risk was assessed by regression with a generalized linear
110 model (GLM):

111

$$112 \quad Y_i \sim \text{Poisson}(\mu_i, \theta) \quad (1)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \log(\mu_i) = & \alpha + \beta_1 \text{Flow}_i + \beta_2 \text{Peak time of flow}_i + \beta_3 \text{Within-city movements}_i + \beta_4 \text{GDP}_i + \\ & \beta_5 \text{Smoking prevalence}_i + \beta_6 \text{Second-hand smoking prevalence in non-smokers}_i + \\ & \beta_7 \text{percent of the population older than 65-year old}_i + \\ 113 \quad & \beta_8 \text{Population}_i + \beta_9 \text{Population density}_i + \\ & \beta_{10} \text{Temperature}_i + \beta_{11} \text{Rainfall}_i + \\ & \beta_{12} PM_{2.5,i} + \beta_{13} PM_{10,i} + \beta_{14} SO_{2,i} + \beta_{15} CO_i + \beta_{16} NO_{2,i} + \beta_{17} O_{3,i} \end{aligned}$$

114 (2)

115

116 where $Flow_i$ is the passenger volume from Wuhan to city i during the Spring Festival 2020, before
117 the Wuhan travel ban, and $Peak\ time\ of\ flow$ reflects the corresponding peak time. $Within-city$
118 $movements_i$ shows the effect of social distancing, such as suspending intra-city public transport,
119 closing entertainment venues and banning public gatherings, and was measured by daily human
120 mobility within a city between the travel ban and 6 March 2020 of city i . These data were obtained
121 from the Baidu location-based service. GDP is the gross domestic product per capita of city i .
122 $Smoking\ prevalence$ and $second-hand\ smoking\ prevalence\ in\ non-smokers$ were obtained from the
123 Chinese National Nutrition and Health Survey (NNHS)^{14,15}. The proportion of residents older
124 than 65, population and population density of city i were extracted from census data. Climate
125 conditions were shown by $temperature$ and $rainfall$ in summer and winter. $Latitude$ and $longitude$
126 show the spatial distribution of city i . $PM_{2.5}$, PM_{10} , SO_2 , CO , NO_2 , and O_3 show daily average
127 concentration data of air pollutants of city i between 1 January 2015 and 31 December 2019. Air
128 pollution variables were included in the model separately because of the high multicollinearity
129 among them. β s are regression coefficients. The analysis used the R software (R Foundation for
130 Statistical Computing, version 3.6.3), MASS package.

131

132 **Sensitivity analysis**

133 We conducted additional sensitivity analyses to assess the robustness of our results. First, we fit

models omitting adjusted variables, separately. We then treated NO₂ and PM_{2.5} as a categorical variable (categorized at empirical quintiles), then used air pollutant concentrations in winter and non-winter to replace the annual average. Finally, cities were categorized by population size into three separate groups, small (0–2.68 million population, n = 98), medium-sized (2.68–4.67 million, n = 97), and large (4.67–30.75 million, n = 98).

Results

Analysis of COVID-19 in China

We used a well-tested research data platform that gathers nationwide human mobility, census, air pollution and socio-economic data, and data on smoking from a nationwide survey¹⁶. The records we used consisted of reported COVID-19 cases for 324 cities (except Wuhan city) in mainland China between 31 December 2019 and 6 March 2020 (excluding newly-reported locally-acquired infections), mobile data of recorded movements (data provided by Baidu location-based services and telecommunications operators in China), census data (population, population density, and percentage of the population over 65 years old), smoking prevalence and second-hand smoking prevalence in non-smokers, gross domestic product (GDP) per capita, climate condition (temperature and rainfall), and six major air pollutant concentrations (PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀, SO₂, CO, NO₂, and O₃). We analysed and quantified the relationship between long-term exposure to air pollution and COVID-19 risk.

Between 31 December 2019 and 6 March 2020, 81,132 cases of COVID-19 were reported across China. Of these, 62.6% (50783/81132) of cases were clustered in Wuhan city, and the remaining 37.4% (30349/81132) cases were distributed across 324 other cities. After 6 March 2020, there were very few locally-acquired infections outside Wuhan city in the first wave. There was sustained local transmission of COVID-19 in Wuhan city, so data from there were not included in the subsequent analysis.

COPD, CVD and hypertension are associated with high risk of COVID-19 severity. We therefore suspected that long-term exposure to air pollutants, which increases lung damage, would be associated with increased vulnerability to COVID-19. To test this hypothesis, socio-demographic and behavioural confounders were identified through a literature search. We first investigated the effect of travel movements from Wuhan city, the location where COVID-19 was first recorded, and from where it spread across China. In 2020, during travel for the Spring Festival holiday, approximately 4.3 million people travelled out of Wuhan to other cities in China¹⁶. This travel is strongly associated with the total number of cases reported from each city ($\rho = 0.81$, $P < 0.01$), suggesting the outbreaks across China were mainly seeded from Wuhan city.

Air pollution reduction and travel restrictions

On 23 January 2020, in an attempt to contain the epidemic, non-essential travel was prohibited in and out of Wuhan city, a major transport hub and conurbation of 11 million people. Since then, the whole of China has implemented the highest level of emergency response to reinforce the containment of COVID-19. Interventions included the closure of entertainment venues, the suspension of within-city public transport, and prohibition of travel to and from other cities across China. Our results indicate that these measures have significantly reduced the movement within

178 cities compared with 2019 (Figure 2). The average air quality also significantly improved,
179 compared with the same period in 2019. The changes in average daily PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀, SO₂, CO, NO₂,
180 and O₃ were -7.02%, -19.25%, -15.06%, -5.46%, -20.17% and 5.01% from 31 December to 6
181 March (Figure 2).

182

183 **The effect of long-term exposure to NO₂ and PM_{2.5} on COVID-19 cases and severe infections**

184 We also collected data on a range of confounding variables such as gross domestic product per
185 capita, smoking prevalence, climate, and age composition (age > 65), together with travel
186 movements from Wuhan and within-city movements (as a measure of social distancing). These
187 were used as control variables in the statistical analysis. The population size of each city was not
188 included in the model because of high multicollinearity with travel movements from Wuhan ($\rho =$
189 0.71, $P < 0.01$). The three billion Spring Festival holiday trips also induced uncoordinated changes
190 in actual population size across cities¹⁷. As expected, the number of COVID-19 cases in each city
191 increased with passenger flow from Wuhan. More infections were reported in cities that had more
192 travellers from Wuhan. Overall, we observed positive and significant associations between both
193 reported and severe cases of COVID-19 with historical air pollutant concentration (Figure 3). In
194 324 cities (except Wuhan) that had data on air quality, an increase of 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ in NO₂ or PM_{2.5}
195 concentration was associated with 22.41% (95% CI: 7.28%–39.89%) or 15.35% (95% CI:
196 5.60%–25.98%) increase in COVID-19 cases. We also examined the relationship between the
197 number of severe COVID-19 cases and air pollutants. An increase of 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ in NO₂ or PM_{2.5}
198 concentration was associated with a 19.20% (95% CI: 4.03%–36.59%) or 9.61% (95% CI:
199 0.12%–20.01%) increase in severe COVID-19 cases. The results are statistically significant and
200 robust to sensitivity analyses (Tables 1–3). The analysis was also carried out for separate datasets.
201 Cities were categorized by population size into small, medium, and large. There was a positive but
202 not significant association between the number of confirmed cases and NO₂ or PM_{2.5}
203 concentration in each group (Figure 3). The results might still be affected by population size,
204 however, because air pollution is usually the result of population growth, so there is a predefined
205 correlation between air pollutant concentration and population size.

206

207 **Discussion**

208 Several studies have evaluated the association between air pollution exposure and COVID-19 risk.
209 Our finding is in line with studies based on large-scale nationwide data, including in the US¹⁸,
210 UK^{19,20}, Italy^{21,22}, The Netherlands²³, Spain, France and Germany²⁴, and provinces of China²⁵.
211 However, the size of the study and that the first wave has been contained in China, meant that we
212 were able to investigate the impact of historical air pollution on COVID-19 risk and severity. Our
213 results also highlighted the importance of air quality improvements to health in China.

214

215 Our findings are consistent with previous results that exposure to air pollutants is associated with
216 poorer lung function, often measured by forced vital capacity and forced expiratory volume in 1
217 second²⁶⁻²⁹. Particulate matter (PM) is associated with increased risk of cardiopulmonary diseases
218³⁰, aggravated case fatality of severe acute respiratory syndrome (caused by another type of
219 coronavirus)³¹ and could impair the immune response³². Oxidant pollutants could also damage
220 the immune function and affect the ability of the lungs to clear the virus⁶. Nitrogen oxides (NO_x)
221 can cause inflammatory responses and have a direct effect on the risk of respiratory diseases^{33,34}

(also shown in Comparative Toxicogenomics Database, <http://ctdbase.org>). Nitrogen oxide is primarily produced by traffic and factories, and less influenced by climate condition, so there were reductions in both the concentration of nitrogen oxides and within-city movements during the COVID-19 outbreak in cities of China. Increased ozone or sulphur dioxide concentrations were associated with lower COVID-19 risk, which is also consistent with previous studies^{19,25}. However, the mechanisms underlying the impact on COVID-19 risk remain unknown.

Several important caveats are worth mentioning. First, the data included here were all from mainland China. It is therefore not clear whether the findings can be generalized to other countries without data on historic air pollution exposure. Second, there are currently no high-quality records at city level of severe COVID-19 infections and ICU admissions, although we have attempted to fill the gap by using province-level reports. Finally, we do not know the exact number of cases because of the number of asymptomatic and mild-symptomatic cases that may not be recorded. These data will not be available until there has been a systematic survey of infection (e.g. by serological testing) across China. However, we have reported a national-level disease pattern covering 324 cities and its potential association with long-term exposure to air pollutants.

In conclusion, our results, combined with recent reports from elsewhere, suggest a potential association between air quality and population vulnerability to COVID-19. Interventions to contain the COVID-19 outbreak in China successfully reduced air pollution levels and potentially prevented acute respiratory disease. The findings of this paper (and other previous studies that have given ambiguous results) indicate that a more definitive analysis is needed of the link between COVID-19 and air pollution.

Acknowledgements

We thank the thousands of CDC staff and local health workers in China who collected data and continue to work to contain COVID-19 in China and elsewhere. Funding for this study was provided by the Research Council of Norway contributed to this work through the COVID-19 Seasonality Project (312740); Beijing Science and Technology Planning Project (Z201100005420010); National Natural Science Foundation of China (91643203, 81673234); Beijing Natural Science Foundation (JQ18025); Beijing Advanced Innovation Program for Land Surface Science; Young Elite Scientist Sponsorship Program by CAST (YESS) (2018QNRC001); H.T., M.U.G.K., and C.D. acknowledge support from the Oxford Martin School; HT acknowledges support from the Military Logistics Research Program. The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, the decision to publish, or in the preparation of the manuscript.

Competing interests: All other authors declare no competing interests.

References

- 1 Anderson, R. M., Heesterbeek, H., Klinkenberg, D. & Hollingsworth, T. D. How will country-based mitigation measures influence the course of the COVID-19 epidemic? *Lancet* **395**, 931-934 (2020).
- 2 Chinazzi, M. *et al.* The effect of travel restrictions on the spread of the 2019 novel coronavirus (COVID-19) outbreak. *Science*, DOI: 10.1126/science.aba9757 (2020).

- 266 3 Kraemer, M. U. G. *et al.* The effect of human mobility and control measures on the COVID-19
267 epidemic in China. *Science* **368**, 493-497 (2020).
- 268 4 Tian, H. & Bjornstad, O. N. Population serology for SARS-CoV-2 is essential to regional and
269 global preparedness. *Lancet Microbe* **1**, e94 (2020).
- 270 5 Hsiang, S. *et al.* The effect of large-scale anti-contagion policies on the COVID-19 pandemic.
271 *Nature*, doi:10.1038/s41586-020-2404-8 (2020).
- 272 6 Qu, G., Li, X., Hu, L. & Jiang, G. An imperative need for research on the role of environmental
273 factors in transmission of novel coronavirus (COVID-19). *Environ Sci Technol* **54**, 3730-3732,
274 doi:10.1021/acs.est.0c01102 (2020).
- 275 7 Jain, V. & Yuan, J.-M. Systematic review and meta-analysis of predictive symptoms and
276 comorbidities for severe COVID-19 infection. *medRxiv*, doi:
277 <https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.1103.1115.20035360> (2020).
- 278 8 Götschi, T., Heinrich, J., Sunyer, J. & Künzli, N. Long-term effects of ambient air pollution on
279 lung function: a review. *Epidemiology* **19**, 690-701 (2008).
- 280 9 Doiron, D. *et al.* Air pollution, lung function and COPD: results from the population-based UK
281 Biobank study. *Eur Respir J* **54**, 1802140 (2019).
- 282 10 Liu, C. *et al.* Ambient particulate air pollution and daily mortality in 652 cities. *New Eng J*
283 *Med* **381**, 705-715 (2019).
- 284 11 Contini, D. & Costabile, F. Does air pollution influence COVID-19 outbreaks? *Atmosphere* **11**,
285 377 (2020).
- 286 12 Le, T. *et al.* Unexpected air pollution with marked emission reductions during the COVID-19
287 outbreak in China. *Science*, eabb7431 (2020).
- 288 13 Chen, K., Wang, M., Huang, C., Kinney, P. L. & Anastas, P. T. Air pollution reduction and
289 mortality benefit during the COVID-19 outbreak in China. *Lancet Planet Health* **4**, e210-e212
290 (2020).
- 291 14 Xia, C. *et al.* Provincial-level cancer burden attributable to active and second-hand smoking in
292 China. *Tob Control* **28**, 669-675 (2019).
- 293 15 Wu, Y. *et al.* Prevalence, awareness, treatment, and control of hypertension in China: data
294 from the China National Nutrition and Health Survey 2002. *Circulation* **118**, 2679-2686
295 (2008).
- 296 16 Tian, H. *et al.* An investigation of transmission control measures during the first 50 days of the
297 COVID-19 epidemic in China. *Science* **368**, 638-642 (2020).
- 298 17 Simiao, C., Juntao, Y., Weizhong, Y., Chen, W. & Till, B. COVID-19 control in China during mass
299 population movements at New Year. *Lancet* **395**, 764-766 (2020).
- 300 18 Wu, X., Nethery, R. C., Sabath, B. M., Braun, D. & Dominici, F. Exposure to air pollution and
301 COVID-19 mortality in the United States. *medRxiv*, 2020.2004.2005.20054502,
302 doi:10.1101/2020.04.05.20054502 (2020).
- 303 19 Travaglio, M., Popovic, R., Yu, Y., Leal, N. & Martins, L. M. Links between air pollution and
304 COVID-19 in England. *medRxiv*, 2020.2004.2016.20067405,
305 doi:10.1101/2020.04.16.20067405 (2020).
- 306 20 Konstantinoudis, G. *et al.* Long-term exposure to air-pollution and COVID-19 mortality in
307 England: a hierarchical spatial analysis. *medRxiv*, 2020.2008.2010.20171421,
308 doi:10.1101/2020.08.10.20171421 (2020).
- 309 21 Fattorini, D. & Regoli, F. Role of the chronic air pollution levels in the Covid-19 outbreak risk in

Italy. *Environ Pollut* **264**, 114732 (2020).

22 Conticini, E., Frediani, B. & Caro, D. Can atmospheric pollution be considered a co-factor in extremely high level of SARS-CoV-2 lethality in Northern Italy? *Environ Pollut* **261**, 114465 (2020).

23 Andree, P. J. Incidence of COVID-19 and connections with air pollution exposure: evidence from the Netherlands. *Policy Research Working Paper*, 9221 (2020).

24 Ogen, Y. Assessing nitrogen dioxide (NO₂) levels as a contributing factor to coronavirus (COVID-19) fatality. *Sci Total Environ* **726**, 138605, doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138605> (2020).

25 Yongjian, Z., Jingu, X., Fengming, H. & Liqing, C. Association between short-term exposure to air pollution and COVID-19 infection: Evidence from China. *Sci Total Environ*, 138704, doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138704 (2020).

26 Urman R *et al.* Associations of children's lung function with ambient air pollution: joint effects of regional and near-roadway pollutants. *Thorax* **69**, 540-547 (2014).

27 Adam M *et al.* Adult lung function and long-term air pollution exposure. ESCAPE: a multicentre cohort study and meta-analysis. *Eur Respir J* **45**, 38-50 (2015).

28 Forbes LJ *et al.* Chronic exposure to outdoor air pollution and lung function in adults. *Thorax* **64**, 657-663 (2009).

29 Ackermann-Lieblich U *et al.* Lung function and long term exposure to air pollutants in Switzerland. Study on Air Pollution and Lung Diseases in Adults (SAPALDIA) Team. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* **155**, 122-129 (1997).

30 Chen, R. *et al.* Associations between coarse particulate matter air pollution and cause-specific mortality: A nationwide analysis in 272 Chinese cities. *Environ Health Perspect* **127**, 017008, doi:10.1289/EHP2711 (2019).

31 Cui, Y. *et al.* Air pollution and case fatality of SARS in the People's Republic of China: an ecologic study. *Environ Health* **2**, 15, doi:10.1186/1476-069X-2-15 (2003).

32 Wei, T. & Tang, M. Biological effects of airborne fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}) exposure on pulmonary immune system. *Environ Toxicol Pharmacol* **60**, 195-201, doi:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.etap.2018.04.004> (2018).

33 Conticini, E., Frediani, B. & Caro, D. Can atmospheric pollution be considered a co-factor in extremely high level of SARS-CoV-2 lethality in Northern Italy? *Environ Pollut* **4**, 114465, doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2020.114465 (2020).

34 Takahashi Y, Mochitate K & Miura T. Abstract. Subacute effects of nitrogen dioxide on membrane constituents of lung, liver, and kidney of rats. *Environ Res* **41**, 184-194 (1986).

347 **Table 1.** Impact of historic air pollution exposure on COVID-19 risk.

Covariates	Confirmed COVID-19 cases			Severe COVID-19 cases		
	Coefficient	std	P	Coefficient	std	P
Intercept	2.630	0.538	<0.001	0.769	0.509	0.132
Within-city movements	-1.065	0.139	<0.001	-0.778	0.137	<0.001
Percent of population older than 65	0.069	0.032	0.030	-0.054	0.035	0.129
Inflow from Wuhan	0.012	0.001	<0.001	0.030	0.009	<0.01
Peak of inflow from Wuhan	0.108	0.020	<0.001	0.074	0.023	<0.01
Mean Temperature of Coldest Quarter	0.026	0.009	<0.01	0.027	0.007	<0.001
NO₂*	0.020	0.007	<0.01	0.018	0.007	<0.01
PM_{2.5}*	0.014	0.004	<0.01	0.009	0.004	0.034
PM₁₀*	0.002	0.003	0.365	0.001	0.002	0.733
SO₂*	-0.016	0.008	0.050	-0.006	0.006	0.344
CO*	-0.013	0.246	0.958	-0.049	0.212	0.817
O₃*	-0.006	0.005	0.249	-0.010	0.005	0.049

348 *variables were included in the model separately because of the high multicollinearity among air
349 pollutants.
350

351

352

353 **Table 2.** NO₂-sensitivity analysis.

Covariates	Confirmed COVID-19 cases		Severe COVID-19 cases	
	Variation per 10 μ g/m ³ (95%CI)	P	Variation per 10 μ g/m ³ (95%CI)	P
Main analysis	22.41% (7.28%, 39.89%)	<0.01	19.20% (4.03%, 36.59%)	<0.01
Omit # Inflow	24.22% (3.69%, 49.29%)	0.020	20.22% (2.29%, 41.31%)	0.026
Omit # Minimum	55.63% (35.29%, 79.21%)	<0.001	45.43% (27.74%, 65.57%)	<0.001
Within-city movements				
Omit # Percent of	25.59% (10.21%, 43.33%)	<0.001	16.50% (1.98%, 33.09%)	0.025
population older than				
65				
Omit # Peak of inflow	15.04% (0.28%, 32.18%)	0.048	16.51% (1.46%, 33.79%)	0.030
from Wuhan				
Omit # Mean	20.45% (5.48%, 37.73%)	<0.01	17.31% (2.10%, 34.80%)	0.024
Temperature of Coldest				
Quarte				
Categorize NO₂ into				
quintiles				
Q1 (<20μg/m³)	-	-	-	-
Q2 (20-30μg/m³)	117.22% (31.23%, 284.65%)	<0.01	52.60% (6.65%, 118.36%)	0.021
Q3 (30-40μg/m³)	107.31% (24.36%, 269.36%)	<0.01	29.10% (-11.71%, 88.76%)	0.187
Q4 (40-50μg/m³)	215.77% (83.47%, 476.86%)	<0.001	109.41% (31.25%, 234.12%)	<0.01
Q5 (>50μg/m³)	163.42% (8.93%, 504.61%)	0.026	180.93% (16.74%, 575.01%)	0.021
Use NO₂ in winter	14.45% (2.79%, 27.68%)	0.015	12.94% (1.50%, 25.66%)	0.026
Use NO₂ in non-winter	24.95% (8.79%, 43.66%)	<0.01	21.50% (4.94%, 40.68%)	<0.01

354

355

356

357

358 **Table 3.** PM_{2.5}-sensitivity analysis.

Covariates	Confirmed COVID-19 cases		Severe COVID-19 cases	
	Variation per 10 μ g/m ³ (95%CI)	P	Variation per 10 μ g/m ³ (95%CI)	P
Main analysis	15.35% (5.60%, 25.98%)	<0.01	9.61% (0.12%, 20.01%)	0.034
Omit # Inflow	30.24% (15.91%, 46.70%)	<0.001	16.41% (4.73%, 29.39%)	<0.01
Omit # Minimum	21.67% (9.08%, 35.62%)	<0.001	19.94% (8.97%, 32.02%)	<0.001
Within-city movements				
Omit # Percent of	17.25% (7.67%, 27.74%)	<0.001	7.85% (-1.24%, 17.78%)	0.092
population older than				
65				
Omit # Peak of inflow	16.24% (5.79%, 27.73%)	<0.01	10.09% (0.415, 20.72%)	0.041
from Wuhan				
Omit # Mean	10.61% (1.66%, 20.21%)	0.019	7.01% (-2.38%, 17.31%)	0.147
Temperature of Coldest				
Quarte				
Categorize PM_{2.5} into				
quintiles				
Q1 (<25μg/m³)	-	-	-	-
Q2 (25-35μg/m³)	31.34% (-34.21%, 202.21%)	0.478	28.10% (-21.12%, 108.02%)	0.316
Q3 (35-45μg/m³)	137.68% (20.85%, 442.36%)	0.023	26.04% (-23.17%, 106.77%)	0.358
Q4 (45-55μg/m³)	278.37% (91.85%, 766.05%)	<0.001	74.19% (2.47%, 196.13%)	0.040
Q5 (>55μg/m³)	164.94% (32.41%, 508.69%)	0.012	51.79% (-9.90%, 155.72%)	0.116
Use PM_{2.5} in winter	6.06% (1.32%, 11.00%)	0.012	4.17% (-0.84%, 9.43%)	0.103
Use PM_{2.5} in non-winter	22.97% (9.32%, 38.30%)	<0.001	13.93% (1.20%, 28.27%)	0.031

359

360

361

362

363 **Figure 1.** Air pollution exposure, COVID-19, and travel movements in 324 cities of China during
364 Spring Festival 2020. (A) Distribution of cities with data on NO₂ and COVID-19. The shading
365 from light red to dark red represents the cumulative number of confirmed COVID-19 cases in
366 each city from low to high, from 31 December 2019 to 6 March 2020. Points coloured from blue
367 to red represent the historic mean annual NO₂ concentration (µg/m³) from low to high, during
368 January 2015 and December 2019, before the COVID epidemic. (B) Association between the
369 cumulative number of confirmed cases, the number of human movements from Wuhan to each
370 city, and historic mean annual NO₂ concentration. The area of circles represents the cumulative
371 number of cases reported by 6 March 2020.

372

373

374

375

376 **Figure 2.** (A) Average within-city movement intensity and (B) air pollutant concentration in 324
377 cities in China during the 2020 COVID-19 outbreak (orange line), compared with the same period
378 in 2019 (blue line).

379

Figure 3. Variation per unit and 95% confidence intervals, (A) NO₂ and (B) PM_{2.5}. The variation per unit (VPU) = $[\exp(\text{variable coefficient}) - 1] \times 100\%$. VPU can be interpreted as percentage increase in the number of COVID-19 cases associated with a 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ increase in long-term average NO₂ and PM_{2.5}. The VPU from the main analysis was adjusted by confounding factors (inward movement from Wuhan city before travel ban and peak time of movement, within-city movements, GDP, smoking prevalence, second-hand smoking prevalence in non-smokers, percent of the population > 65 years old, population, population density, climate, and spatial distribution). In the sensitivity analyses, we omitted each confounding factor separately, and used seasonal air pollutant concentrations.