Predicting the Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic for the Low- and Middle-Income Countries

Zhiwei Ding, MS (Co-first author)

Feng Sha, MS, PhD (Co-first author)

Jing Kong, PhD

Bingyu Li, M.Ed., PhD

Yi Zhang, PhD

Paul Yip, PhD

Zhouwang Yang, PhD

Author Affiliations: University of Science and Technology of China, Hefei, China (Ding, Kong, Yang); Shenzhen Institutes of Advanced Technology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Shenzhen, China (Sha); Law School, Shenzhen University, Shenzhen, China (Li); Beijing Institute of Big Data Research, Beijing, China (Zhang); Centre for Suicide Research and Prevention, The University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong, China (Yip).

Corresponding Author: Zhouwang Yang, PhD, School of Mathematical Sciences (yangzw@ustc.edu.cn), University of Science and Technology of China, Hefei, China.

Word count: 497

Conflict of Interest Disclosures: None reported.

Abstract

This study predicts the maximum hospital demand and number of infections for the LMICs in the first wave of COVID-19 pandemic. The epidemic is estimated to impose health care burden excessively exceeding the current capacity of hospitals in many LMICs, especially in Honduras, Central African Republic and Colombia.

Although most of the high-income countries have reached the peak of the first wave of COVID-19 epidemic in April and May, 2020¹, the epidemic has just started in most of the low- and middle- income countries (LMICs). Unlike the high-income countries, the LMICs are more likely to encounter serious shortage of health care resources. Researchers have found association between mortality and health care resources, emphasizing the importance of effective disease control in resource-limited regions². This study predicts the maximum hospital demand and number of infections for the LMICs in the first wave of COVID-19 pandemic, with the aim of providing specific disease control guidance for the LMICs.

The study used data on confirmed COVID-19 patients, recovered patients and deaths before July 31, 2020 from Johns Hopkins University³. Based on the time-varying SIR dynamic model⁴ and constrained weighted least squares method, a novel differential equation model was derived to predict the accumulated confirmed patients at the end of first wave COVID-19 pandemic and maximum hospital beds demand for each LMIC (Appendix). COVID-19 confirmed rate (per 100,000 population) was also calculated by dividing accumulated

confirmed patients by total population for each LMIC. Regression model was used to predict hospital beds supply in 2020 for each LMIC (Appendix). Maximum hospital bed utilization rate was calculated by dividing maximum hospital bed demand by total hospital bed. All analysis was performed in R (version 3.6.2).

42 LMICs were included in our analysis (figure 1). At the peak of the epidemic, Honduras (499.24%, 95% CI: 375.44%~671.14%), Central African Republic (214.17%, 72.55%~761.87%) and Colombia (203.29%, CI: 132.88%~318.09%) will have the highest hospital bed utilization rates. Of all the 42 LMICs, 40.48 % will have more than half of hospital beds occupied by COVID-19 patients. At the end of the first wave, it is estimated that South Africa (696119, 95% CI: 556958~873474), Colombia (584725, 95% CI: 428510~824511) and Indonesia (148029, 95% CI: 113416~ 194073) will have the highest accumulated confirmed patients among all the LMICs. Specifically, Armenia will finally report the highest COVID-19 confirmed rate (per 100,000 population) with 1572 (CI: 1022~2401). The confirmed rate will also be high in South Africa (1174, CI: 939~1473) and Colombia (1149, CI: 842~1620). 45.24% of the 42 LMICs are estimated to have confirmed rate of more than 100 per 100,000 population.

The epidemic is estimated to impose health care burden excessively exceeding the current capacity of hospitals in many LMICs. Effective non-pharmaceutical public health interventions, including cordons sanitaire, traffic restriction, social distancing, home confinement, centralized quarantine, and universal symptom survey, should be implemented

to control the spread the COVID-19⁶. In the case of uncontrollable outbreak, short-term strategies including reducing non-COVID-19 demand for health services and building mobile hospital to temporally mitigate the hospital system overload should also be recommended⁵. However, limited health care budgets in these regions may hinder the implementation of these strategies. Economic and medical assistance from more developed countries, WHO and other international NGOs will be much required for effective disease control in the LMICs.

Table 1. Estimated Infections, Infection Rate, Maximum Hospital Demand and Hospital Bed Utilization rate for LMICs

Country	Number of Infections	Infection Rate (per 100,000 in the country)	Maximum Hospital Demand	Maximum Hospital Bed Utilization rate
South Africa	696119 (556958~873474)	1174 (939~1473)	216560 (155870~299353)	161.53% (116.26%~223.29%)
Colombia	584725 (428510~824511)	1149 (842~1620)	143221 (93618~224103)	203.29% (132.88%~318.09%)
Indonesia	148029 (113416~194073)	54 (41~71)	31725 (21263~46897)	10.23% (6.86%~15.13%)
Honduras	65673 (51293~85352)	663 (518~862)	47832 (35971~64302)	499.24% (375.44%~671.14%)
Kyrgyzstan	58213 (49715~68406)	892 (762~1048)	28358 (22608~35518)	75.70% (60.35%~94.82%)
Uzbekistan	50398 (32025~82968)	151 (96~248)	24124 (13019~45508)	29.70% (16.03%~56.02%)
Armenia	46594 (30270~71136)	1572 (1022~2401)	13126 (6733~24509)	74.44% (38.18%~139.00%)
Azerbaijan	41209 (36865~46049)	406 (364~454)	11970 (10111~14133)	27.14% (22.92%~32.04%)
Bosnia and Herzegovina	24284 (15872~38763)	740 (484~1182)	12539 (7127~22494)	96.87% (55.06%~173.78%)
Cameroon	23383 (8602~67118)	88 (32~253)	5804 (1400~24593)	21.95% (5.29%~93.00%)
Cote d'Ivoire	21131 (14954~29936)	80 (57~113)	9090 (5433~14845)	121.17% (72.42%~197.88%)
Bulgaria	21070 (13343~34678)	303 (192~499)	8444 (4450~16244)	12.52% (6.60%~24.08%)
North Macedonia	18103 (10330~32930)	869 (496~1581)	7882 (3504~17441)	86.28% (38.36%~190.93%)
Madagascar	14995 (9036~25760)	54 (33~93)	4364 (2107~9186)	103.17% (49.81%~217.16%)
West Bank and Gaza	14167 (7166~32909)	-	8980 (3766~24733)	-
Central African Republic	11032 (4183~36212)	228 (87~750)	9464 (3206~33667)	214.17% (72.55%~761.87%)
Zambia	9399 (2679~89633)	51 (15~488)	3092 (677~45261)	11.36% (2.49%~166.33%)
Democratic Republic of the Congo	9337 (5719~16748)	10 (6~19)	4381 (2431~9438)	9.68% (5.37%~20.85%)
Paraguay	8513 (3979~19860)	119 (56~278)	3003 (979~9206)	36.47% (11.89%~111.80%)
Haiti	8249 (4716~31511)	72 (41~276)	3803 (3259~14147)	52.24% (44.77%~194.33%)
Gabon	8167 (3265~21108)	367 (147~948)	2250 (559~8343)	113.98% (28.32%~422.64%)
Mauritania	6282 (4647~8461)	135 (100~182)	2319 (1468~3597)	186.27% (117.91%~288.92%)
Malawi	6181 (2459~30297)	32 (13~158)	3069 (1095~20599)	15.78% (5.63%~105.90%)
Zimbabwe	5528 (1708~33146)	37 (11~223)	3665 (846~26678)	16.72% (3.86%~121.71%)

Nicaragua	5256 (3208~10041)	79 (48~152)	1351 (827~3010)	24.85% (15.21%~55.36%)
Montenegro	4479 (1695~17257)	713 (270~2748)	3352 (928~15545)	142.46% (39.44%~660.65%)
Cabo Verde	3157 (1777~5774)	568 (320~1039)	1435 (629~3224)	138.65% (60.77%~311.50%)
Mali	3111 (176~34991)	15 (1~173)	899 (37~21605)	59.73% (2.46%~1435.55%)
Yemen	2807 (789~10989)	9 (3~37)	1097 (168~6596)	4.98% (0.76%~29.95%)
Namibia	2775 (1420~7813)	109 (56~307)	2500 (1242~7344)	44.49% (22.10%~130.70%)
Benin	2504 (1355~6472)	21 (11~53)	1363 (640~4566)	29.63% (13.91%~99.26%)
Guinea-Bissau	2491 (1415~7534)	127 (72~383)	1729 (1044~5774)	116.51% (70.35%~389.08%)
South Sudan	2491 (1822~4270)	22 (16~38)	1676 (1352~2844)	-
Angola	1802 (712~12832)	5 (2~39)	1193 (415~11294)	7.67% (2.67%~72.64%)
Liberia	1720 (730~4363)	34 (14~86)	841 (241~2803)	27.02% (7.74%~90.04%)
Lesotho	1021 (671~1702)	48 (31~79)	610 (372~1095)	23.58% (14.38%~42.33%)
Burundi	592 (177~9404)	5 (1~79)	105 (39~3037)	1.33% (0.50%~38.57%)
Eritrea	480 (239~3860)	14 (7~109)	283 (159~3324)	12.58% (7.07%~147.73%)
Sao Tome and Principe	351 (231~7849)	160 (105~3581)	199 (199~1837)	37.20% (37.20%~343.36%)
Cambodia	327 (171~87905)	2 (1~526)	132 (38~87451)	1.06% (0.31%~704.28%)
Belize	60 (44~128)	15 (11~32)	26 (16~85)	6.97% (4.29%~22.79%)
Grenada	26 (22~42)	23 (20~37)	8 (8~13)	1.99% (1.99%~3.23%)

Note:

a. *Ultimate Confirmed cases (per 100,000 in the country) = 100,000 × (Ultimate Confirmed cases / total population of the country).*

b. *Peak Bed Utilization rate = Beds Used at Peak / National Hospital Bed capacity*

c. *The list of low- and middle-income countries was obtained from World Bank Open Data. The hospital bed density data by country came from World Health Organization. The Annual Total Population across countries came from United Nations.*

Acknowledgments

Feng Sha: Conceptualization, Validation, Resources, Writing - Original Draft. **Zhiwei Ding:** Methodology, Software, Formal analysis, Writing - Original Draft, Visualization. **Jing Kong:** Methodology, Writing - Review & Editing. **Bingyu Li:** Writing - Original Draft, Writing - Review & Editing. **Yi Zhang:** Methodology, Project administration. **Paul Yip:** Writing - Review & Editing. **Zhouwang Yang:** Conceptualization, Methodology, Resources, Writing - Review & Editing, Supervision, Funding acquisition.

This study is funded by Strategic Priority CAS Project (grant XDB38040200), National Natural Science Foundation of China (grant 71950011, 11871447, 71991464/71991460) and National Key Research and Development Program of China (grant 2018AAA0101001).

Reference:

1. IHME COVID-19 health service utilization forecasting team. Forecasting the impact of the first wave of the COVID-19 pandemic on hospital demand and deaths for the USA and European Economic Area countries. *medRxiv*.
<https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.04.21.20074732>
2. Ji Y, Ma Z, Peppelenbosch MP, Pan Q. Potential association between covid-19 mortality and health-care resource availability. *Lancet Glob Health*. 2020;8(4):e480.
[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S2214-109X\(20\)30068-1](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S2214-109X(20)30068-1).
3. Dong E , Du H , Gardner L . An interactive web-based dashboard to track COVID-19 in real time. *Lancet Infect Dis*, 2020;20(5):533-534.

-
- [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099\(20\)30120-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099(20)30120-1)
4. Sun H, Qiu Y, Yan H, Huang Y, Zhu Y, Chen SX. Tracking and Predicting COVID-19 Epidemic in China Mainland. *medRxiv*. [http://dx.doi: 10.1101/2020.02.17.20024257](http://dx.doi.org/10.1101/2020.02.17.20024257)
 5. Hopman J, Allegranzi B, Mehtar S. Managing COVID-19 in Low- and Middle-Income Countries. *JAMA*. 2020;323(16):1549–1550. [http://dx.doi:10.1001/jama.2020.4169](http://dx.doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.4169)
 6. Pan A, Liu L, Wang C, et al. Association of public health interventions with the epidemiology of the covid-19 outbreak in wuhan, china. *JAMA*. 2020;323(19):1915–1923. [http://dx.doi: 10.1001/jama.2020.6130](http://dx.doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.6130).

Figure. Flow chart of selecting low- and middle-income countries (LMICs) and model structure