Ultrametric diffusion model for spread of covid-19 in socially clustered population: Can herd immunity be approached in Sweden?

Andrei Khrennikov

Linnaeus University, International Center for Mathematical Modeling in Physics and Cognitive Sciences Växjö, SE-351 95, Sweden

July 15, 2020

Abstract

We present a new mathematical model of disease spread reflecting specialties of covid-19 epidemic by elevating the role social clustering of population. The model can be used to explain slower approaching herd immunity in Sweden, than it was predicted by a variety of other mathematical models; see graphs Fig. 2. The hierarchic structure of social clusters is mathematically modeled with ultrametric spaces having treelike geometry. To simplify mathematics, we consider homogeneous trees with p -branches leaving each vertex. Such trees are endowed with algebraic structure, the p -adic number fields. We apply theory of the p -adic diffusion equation to describe coronavirus' spread in hierarchically clustered population. This equation has applications to statistical physics and microbiology for modeling *dynamics on energy landscapes*. To move from one social cluster (valley) to another, the virus (its carrier) should cross a social barrier between them. The magnitude of a barrier depends on the number of social hierarchy's levels composing this barrier. As the most appropriate for the recent situation in Sweden, we consider *linearly increasing barriers*. This structure matches with mild regulations in Sweden. The virus spreads rather easily inside a social cluster (say working collective), but jumps to other clusters are constrained by social barriers. This behavior matches with the covid-19 epidemic, with its cluster spreading structure. Our model differs crucially from the standard mathematical models of spread of disease, such as the SIR-model. We present socio-medical specialties of the covid-19 epidemic supporting our purely diffusional model.

keywords: energy landscapes; ultrametric spaces; p -adic numbers; ultrametric diffusion equation; social barriers; linear growing barriers; covid-19; epidemic; disease spread; herd immunity; hierarchy of social clusters

1 Introduction

The covid-19 epidemic has many unusual features (see section 2). One of them plays the crucial role in disease spread. We formulate it as the basic assumption of this paper (see also [1]):

AS0 *Virus' spread in population is constrained by the hierarchic social cluster structure.*

How can one model mathematically social clustering of population? In a series of works [2]-[7], we constructed *ultrametric clustering* of population by using the system of hierarchically ordered social coordinates and this approach was applied in cognition, psychology, sociology, information theory (see also [8]-[12]). In this paper, we shall use ultrametric diffusion equation [13]-[21] to describe dynamics of coronavirus spread in socially clustered population. It is important to note that ultrametric spaces have treelike geometry, so we shall study dynamics of virus on social trees. To simplify mathematics, consideration is restricted to homogeneous trees with p -branches leaving each vertex. Such trees are endowed with algebraic structure, the p -adic number fields. We remark that p -adic numbers are widely used in number theory and algebraic geometry. Their applications to natural phenomena started with string theory and quantum physics [22]-[24].

The specialties of covid-19 epidemic¹ are not reflected in the standard mathematical models [25]-[27], such as, e.g., the canonical SIR model [28] and its diffusion-type generalizations, e.g., [29]. Consequently, in spite of the tremendous efforts [30]-[36], mathematical modeling of coronavirus spread cannot be considered as successful. Therefore, we have to search for new mathematical models reflecting better the covid-19 specialties. The recent paper [1] based on **AS0** can be considered as a step in this direction. In it, we studied the problem of *approaching herd immunity in countries like Sweden*, i.e., without lock-down. The coronavirus does not spread throughout population homogeneously as it is described by the standard models of disease spread. Its spread has the clear social cluster character (cf. with disease spread modeling in articles [37]-[40]). The coronavirus spreads

¹See section 2, "covid on surface", "covid in air", "asymptomatic individuals", "no mass-events", "superspreaders"; in this paper we are interested in mild restrictions, as in Sweden, i.e., without lock-down.

relatively easy in a social cluster that was infected by somebody, but approaching other clusters is constrained by social barriers.

Such virus' spread is described very well by *dynamics on energy landscapes*. The latter is well developed theory with numerous applications to statistical physics (e.g., spin glasses) and microbiology [41]-[47]. An energy landscape is a system of (energy) valleys separated by barriers of different heights having a hierarchic structure. A system (physical, biological) can move inside a valley or jump over a barrier to another valley, with some probability. Thus, the simplest mathematical model is given by *random walks on energy landscapes* (see, e.g., [48]). Behavior of random walking depends crucially of grows of barriers coupled to the hierarchic structure of an energy landscape.

Geometrically the hierarchy of valleys (clusters) of an energy landscape has the treelike structure. As is well known, trees also give the geometric representation for ultrametric spaces and vice verse. Thus, dynamics on energy landscapes, collection of clusters separated by hierarchically ordered barriers, can be represented as dynamics in ultrametric spaces.

In the first paper [1] on ultrametric approach to disease spread, we explored the random walk in ultrametric spaces [48]. Such random walk is the discrete version of *ultrametric diffusion*. Theory of diffusion equations in ultrametric space is well developed [13]-[21]. In the present paper, we apply its powerful mathematical apparatus for modeling covid-19 spread in hierarchically structured social clusters. The problem of approaching herd immunity is reformulated in terms of ultrametric diffusion equation. We consider a country without lockdown, but, nevertheless, imposing a bunch of social restrictions (barriers) during the covid-19 epidemic. As the basic example, we consider Sweden (see [1], appendix 2 for compact description of situation in Sweden, March-June 2020, from the viewpoint of imposing social barriers). This reformulation makes the model mathematically rigorous (studies [41]-[47], [48] were at the physical level of rigorousness) and opens the door for development of a variety of new mathematical models of coronavirus spread taking into account the social cluster structure of population.

For Sweden, this problem of approaching herd immunity is of the big value. The country did not impose the lock-down and the system of measures presented by the state epidemiologist Anders Tegnell and his team was aimed to approach herd immunity and, in this way, to make essentially weaker or escape at all the second wave of covid-19 epidemic and may be proceed without vaccination. However, the dynamics of population's immunity against coronavirus is very slow, essentially slower than it was predicted by Swedish epidemiologists

and by mathematical models of disease spread ² (see, e.g., [49]-[51] for reports from Public Health Institute of Sweden, [32]-[34] for attempts of mathematical modeling and [52]-[56] for reports from massmedia).

As we have seen [1], ultrametric random walk (with jumps over mild barriers linearly growing with levels of social hierarchy) generates dynamics with asymptotic behavior of the power type; herd immunity in a social cluster C grows as $p_{\text{Im}}(C, t) = 1 - t^{-q}$, $q > 0$. Generally (but, of course, depending on the parameter q) this function increases slowly. This asymptotic can explain unexpectedly slow approaching herd immunity by population of Sweden. The basic parameter of the model $q = T \log p / \Delta$. Here $T > 0$ is the social analog of temperature, the degree of activity in a society, Δ is the magnitude of the elementary barrier for hopping between nearest social levels. Higher social temperature T implies more rapid approaching of herd immunity; higher social barrier Δ implies slower growth of herd immunity.

In the present paper, by using results of work [17] on the relaxation dynamics for diffusion pseudo-differential equation on ultrametric spaces we reproduce the power law for dynamics of herd immunity from [1], for linearly growing barriers. The technique of ultrametric diffusion equations provides the possibility to study this problem for other types of barriers as well as for design of more general mathematical models of covid-19 spread, may be even matching quantitatively with medical data on this epidemic.

2 Specialties of covid-19 spread

As was emphasized in introduction, covid-19 epidemic has some specialties. To match these specialties, one has to develop new mathematical models. The fundamental specialty is the social cluster character of coronavirus spread, see **AS0**. Further, we shall discuss a few other virus' features. They justify the following assumption distinguishing our purely diffusional model of virus spread from the standard SIR-type models:

AS1 *Intensity of virus' spreading is relatively insensible to the number of those who have already been infected.*

Now we discuss a few biological and social factors behind this feature of the virus.

²In particular, by models Tom Britton [32, 33] that was used by Swedish State Health Authority predicted that herd immunity will be approached already in May; Anders Tegnell also announced, starting from the end of April 2020, that Sweden would soon approach herd immunity, but it did not happen, neither in May, nor June and July.

- 147 • **Covid on surface.** As was shown in study [58], the probability
148 to become infected through some surface (say in a buses, metro,
149 shop) is practically zero. It was found that even in houses with
150 many infected (symptomatic) people, the viruses on surfaces (of
151 say tables, chairs, mobile phones) were too weak to infect any-
152 body. (Their were present, but were not able to infect mouths.)³
- 153 • **Covid in air.** The virus is neither so much dangerous at the
154 open air, especially if people follow the recommendation to keep
155 1, 5 m distance between them. In in [58] was pointed out: “The
156 fact that COVID 19 is a droplet infection and cannot be trans-
157 mitted through the air had previously also been confirmed by
158 virologist Christian Drosten of Berlin’s Charité. He had pointed
159 out in an interview [59] that coronavirus is extremely sensitive
160 to drying out, so the only way of contracting it is if you were to
161 ‘inhale’ the droplets.”
- 162 • **Asymptomatic individuals.** As was recently announced [60],
163 WOH collected a lot of statistical data showing that asymp-
164 tomatic individuals transmit covid-19 virus to other people with
165 very low probability.⁴ At the same time, US Centers for Disease
166 Control and Prevention estimates that about a third of coro-
167 navirus infections (35%) are asymptomatic [61]. Hence, about
168 35% of infected people practically do not contribute in disease
169 spread.
- 170 • **No mass-events.** Another important restriction supporting
171 **AS1** is that even in Sweden, mass-events were forbidden, so no

³Mr Streeck, a professor for virology and the director of the Institute of virology and HIV Research at the University Bonn, clarified [58]: “There is no significant risk of catching the disease when you go shopping. Severe outbreaks of the infection were always a result of people being closer together over a longer period of time, for example the apré-ski parties in Ischgl, Austria.” During extended and careful study in Heidelberg (the German epicenter of the covid-19 epidemic) his team could also not find any evidence of living viruses on surfaces. “When we took samples from door handles, phones or toilets it has not been possible to cultivate the virus in the laboratory on the basis of these swabs. ... To actually ‘get’ the virus it would be necessary that someone coughs into their hand, immediately touches a door knob and then straight after that another person grasps the handle and goes on to touches their face.” Streeck therefore believes that there is little chance of transmission through contact with so-called contaminated surfaces.

⁴“We have a number of reports from countries who are doing very detailed contact tracing. They’re following asymptomatic cases, they’re following contacts and they’re not finding secondary transmission onward. It is very rare – and much of that is not published in the literature,” Van Kerkhove, WOH official said on June 6, 2020. “We are constantly looking at this data and we’re trying to get more information from countries to truly answer this question. It still appears to be rare that an asymptomatic individual actually transmits onward.” [60].

public concerts, neither football matches.⁵

- **Superspreaders.** As for many infections, spread of coronavirus has the following feature - the presence of superspreaders of infection. One person can infect really many people. Thus, single person's contribution in disease spread can be essentially higher than contribution of a few hundreds of usual asymptomatic individuals or many presymptomatic individuals (see more on superspreaders in Appendix).

AS2 *The number of susceptible people $S(t)$ is so large comparing with the number $I(t)$ of those who are infected or the number $R(t)$ of recovered that we can consider it as constant, $S(t) = \text{const}$, and exclude it from model's dynamical equations.*

This assumption implies that for an individual in population under consideration the probability to become infected practically does not depend on the number of recovered. The population is rather far from approaching herd immunity and a disease spreader is surrounded (with the high degree of approximation) by susceptible people. Thus the number of recovered people R also can be excluded from dynamics. Of course, this model provides only the rough picture of the real disease spread, but it reflects the basic features of the covid-19 spread in the states that imposed relatively soft restrictions in relation with epidemic (as, e.g., Sweden, Japan, Belarus).

Denote the probability, for a person from elementary social cluster x , to become infected at the instance of time t by the symbol $p_I(x, t)$.

To write the evolution equation for $p_I(x, t)$, we impose the additional assumption:

AS3 *The distribution of social clusters in the society is uniform: all clusters represented by balls of the same radius have the same measure that is equal to balls' radius.*

Mathematically **AS3** is formalized through the use of the Haar measure μ on $\mathbf{Q}_p$. We understand that this is a strong restriction on the social structure of society. But, the main reason for its imposing is just simplification of mathematics. We can consider other distributions on $\mathbf{Q}_p$ assigning different weights to social clusters represented by balls

⁵In Sweden, restaurants and night clubs were open, but such events were not of mass-character. The presence in a night club or in a restaurant of one infection spreader has practically the same impact as say 5 spreaders, the effect of closed space. Moreover, the distance between the tables in restaurants also diminished the effect of high number of infected in the population. During the intensive phase of the covid-19 epidemic (the end of March and April 2020) restaurants terminated self-serving during lunches (so typical in Sweden).

of the same radius. (We recall that any point of a ball can serve as its center.)

3 Hierarchic treelike geometry of social clusters

We represent the human society as a system of hierarchically coupled (as a treelike structure) disjoint clusters. There are many ways for mathematical modeling of such representations. Theory of *ultrametric spaces* is one of the basic mathematical tools for this purpose. Geometrically ultrametric spaces can be represented as trees with hierarchic levels. Ultrametricity means that this metric satisfies so-called strong triangle inequality:

$$\rho(x, y) \leq \max\{\rho(x, y), \rho(y, z)\}, \quad (1)$$

for any triple of points x, y, z . Here in each triangle the third side is less or equal not only the sum of two other sides (as usual), but even their maximum. Define balls as usual in metric spaces $B_R(a) = \{x : \rho_p(x, a) \leq R\}$, where a is a center of the ball and $R > 0$, is its radius. The balls have the following basic properties:

- Two balls are either disjoint or one of them is contained in another.
- Any point of a ball can be selected as its center, i.e., $B_R(a) = B_R(b)$ for any $b \in B_R(a)$.

Any ball can be represented as disjoint union of balls of smaller radius, each of the latter can be represented in the same way with even smaller radius and so on. We get hierarchy of balls corresponding to disjoint partitions. Geometrically a ball is a bunch of branches of a tree.

We use the ultrametric balls to represent mathematically social clusters, any cluster is slit into disjoint sub-cluster, each of the latter is split into its own (disjoint) sub-clusters and so on. Inclusion relation generates the hierarchy on the set of social clusters.

In a series of works of the author and his collaborators [2]-[6], ultrametric spaces (geometrically hierarchic trees) were applied for modeling of cognitive, psychological, and social phenomena. This modeling was based on invention of systems of discrete social (or mental in cognitive studies) coordinates $x = (x_m)$ characterizing (psycho-)social states of individuals. The treelike representation of *social states* is based on selection of hierarchically ordered social factors enumerated

by index $m \in \mathbf{Z} = \{0, \pm 1, \pm 2, \dots\}$. (It is convenient to work with coordinates enumerated by integer numbers.) The social importance of coordinates x_m decreases with increase of m and increases with decrease of m ; e.g., social coordinate x_0 is more important than any $x_j, j > 0$, but it less important than any $x_j, j < 0$. The coordinate x_0 can be considered as a reference point. Depending on context (say socio-economic or socio-epidemic) it can be shifted to the right or to the left. Therefore it is convenient to use positive and negative indexes determining two different directions of social importance of coordinates.

We consider discrete social coordinates, generally, for each m , there N_m possible values, $x_m = 0, 1, \dots, N_m - 1$, and N_m can vary essentially with m . In the treelike representation, numbers N_m determine the number of branches leaving vertexes. Such trees are complicated and we restrict modeling to homogeneous trees for that N_m does not depend on m . Moreover, by pure mathematical reasons it is convenient to select $N_m = p$, where $p > 1$ is the fixed prime number. We remark that the corresponding theory was developed even for arbitrary trees (ultrametric spaces), but it is essentially more complicated [18, 19].

Thus, a social state x is represented by a vector of the form:

$$x = (x_{-n}, \dots, x_{-1}, x_0, x_1, \dots, x_m), \quad x_j \in \{0, 1, \dots, p - 1\}. \quad (2)$$

The vector representation of psychical, mental, and social states is very common in psychology and sociology. The essence of our approach [2]-[6] is the hierarchic ordering of coordinates leading to introduction of ultrametric on the state space, see (5).

For our purpose, modeling of epidemic, we can consider, for example, the following hierarchic system of social coordinates; for simplicity, let index $m = 0, 1, 2, \dots$, so the coordinate x_0 is the most important. It is natural to use it to denote states (e.g., Sweden, Russia, USA,...); x_1 can be used for age; x_2 for chronic diseases, x_3 gender, x_4 for race, x_5 for the town of location, x_6 for the district, x_7 for profession, x_8 for the level of social activity, x_9 for the number of children living with this person, and so on. We understand that such ranking of the basic social factors related to the covid-19 epidemic may be naive and incomplete. The contribution of sociologists, psychologists, and epidemiologists can improve the present model essentially, see even the recent article [57] on mathematical model of evolutionary creation of social types and contribution of genetics and natural selection.

Since the majority of states selected the lock down policy that was not oriented towards approaching herd immunity, we restrict consideration to the Swedish population. So, in the above assigning of social meaning to coordinates they are shifted to the left. We also stress that

hierarchy of social factors involved in the covid-19 epidemic can be selected depending on the state, i.e., for each state we create its own system of social clustering coupled to this epidemic. Consider USA, here the population is not so homogeneous with respect to the level of income and the life style connected to income as it is in Sweden. The social factor of belonging to up or low income classes plays the crucial role in covid-19 infecting. It seems that this coordinate should be places as the next (to the right) to the age-coordinate, then the race-coordinate and so on. Thus, the above hierarchy, (age, chronic disease, gender, race, town, district, family,...), that is appropriate for Sweden, should be rearranged for USA, as say (age, income, race, chronic disease, gender, town, district, family,...).⁶

It is convenient to proceed with variable number of coordinates, i.e., not fix n and m . This gives the possibility to add new coordinates. The space of such vectors can be represented by rational numbers of the form

$$x = x_{-n}p^{-n} + \dots + x_{-1}p^{-1} + x_0 + x_1p + \dots + x_mp^m, \quad x_j \in \{0, 1, \dots, p-1\}. \quad (3)$$

This is the basis of the number-theoretic representation of the space of social states. We shall consider it later. Now we continue in the vector framework.

To use fruitfully ultrametric models, we have to construct a complete metric space. The standard way is approach completeness is to consider infinite sequences of the form:

$$x = (\dots, x_{-n}, \dots, x_{-1}, x_0, x_1, \dots, x_m, \dots), \quad x_j \in \{0, 1, \dots, p-1\}, \quad (4)$$

where, for each x , there exists n such that $x_{-j} = 0, j > n$. Denote the space of such sequences by the symbol $\mathbf{Q}_p$. On this space, a metric is introduced in the following way. Consider two sequences $x = (x_j)$ and $y = (y_j)$; let $x_j = y_j, j < n$, where n is some integer, but $x_n \neq y_n$. Then the distance between two vectors is defined as

$$\rho_p(x, y) = p^{-n}. \quad (5)$$

So, if n is negative, then distance is larger than 1, if n is nonnegative, then distance is less or equal to 1. The ρ_p is an ultrametric. We remark that each ball can be identified with a ball of radius $R = p^n, n \in \mathbf{Z}$. Ball $B_1(0)$ plays the important role and it is defined by special symbol $\mathbf{Z}_p$. As in any ultrametric space, each ball is represented as disjoint union of smaller balls, e.g.,

$$\mathbf{Z}_p = \cup_{j=0}^{p-1} B_{1/p}(a^j) = \cup_{j_0 \dots j_{n-1}=0}^{p-1} B_{1/p^n}(a^{j_0 \dots j_{n-1}}) \quad (6)$$

⁶Income did not play any role in Sweden during the covid-19 epidemic.

where $a^j \in \mathbf{Z}_p$ is constrained by condition $x_0 = j$ and $a^{j_0 \dots j_{n-1}}$ is constrained by conditions $x_0 = j_0, \dots, x_{n-1} = j_{n-1}$, and so on. We recall that in an *ultrametric space*, any point of a ball can be selected as its center.

In our model, p -adic balls represent social clusters corresponding to fixing a few social coordinates. For example $C_j = B_{1/p}(a^j) = \{x \in \mathbf{Z}_p : x_0 = j\}$, in above epidemic coding C_j corresponds to fixing age = j ; $C_{ji} = B_{1/p}(a^{ji}) = \{x \in \mathbf{Z}_p : x_0 = j, x_1 = i\}$, age = j , gender = i for Swedish society or age = j , income level = i for American society.

Social states, points of $\mathbf{Q}_p$, can be considered as balls of zero radius, we call them *elementary social clusters*. Partitions of a ball into disjoint balls of smaller radii corresponds to partition of a social cluster into disjoint subclusters of deeper level of social hierarchy.

Now we turn to the algebraic representation of social states by rational numbers, see (3). The space $\mathbf{Q}_p$ endowed with ultrametric ρ_p can be considered as completion of this set of rational numbers and algebraically the elements of $\mathbf{Q}_p$ can be represented by power series of the form

$$x = \sum_{k=n}^{\infty} x_k p^k \quad (7)$$

where $x_j \in \{0, 1, \dots, p-1\}$, $x_n \neq 0$, and $n \in \mathbf{Z}$; so only finite number of coordinates with negative index k can differ from zero. Such a series converges with respect to ultrametric ρ_p . Representation by the power series gives the possibility to endow $\mathbf{Q}_p$ with the algebraic operations, addition, subtraction, multiplication, and division (the latter operation is defined only for prime p). Hence, $\mathbf{Q}_p$ is a *number field*, the field of p -adic numbers. This algebraic representation leads to number-theoretic representation of ultrametric, $\rho_p(x, y) = |x - y|_p$, where $x \rightarrow |x|_p$ is the p -adic analog of the real absolute value; per definition, for x given by series (7),

$$|x|_p = \left| \sum_{k=n}^{\infty} x_k p^k \right|_p = p^{-n}. \quad (8)$$

It satisfies the strong triangle inequality playing the fundamental role in p -adic analysis:

$$|x + y|_p \leq \max\{|x|_p, |y|_p\}. \quad (9)$$

4 Modeling the virus spread with ultrametric diffusion equation

An elementary social cluster given by a point of $\mathbf{Q}_p$ is a mathematical abstraction. Real clusters are represented by balls of finite radii.

Therefore it is interesting to study the evolution of average probability for cluster $B_n \equiv B_{p^n}(0)$, $n = 0, \pm 1, \pm 2, \dots$. Under assumption **AS3**, this quantity is represented as the integral with respect to the Haar measure:

$$p_I(B_n, t) = \int_{B_n} p_I(x, t) \mu(dx). \quad (10)$$

Under the above assumptions on the social structure of population and its interaction with the virus (including restrictions imposed by authorities in connection with epidemic), we can write the following master equation for probability $p_I(x, t)$,

$$\frac{\partial p_I(x, t)}{\partial t} = \int_{Q_p} [p(x|y; t) p_I(y, t) - p(y|x; t) p_I(x, t)] \mu(dy), \quad (11)$$

where $p(x|y; t)$ is the transition probability: the probability that the virus being present in (elementary) cluster y would jump to cluster x . We suppose that this probability does not depend on time t and it is symmetric, i.e., $p(x|y) = p(y|x)$. Under these assumptions, the master equation has the form

$$\frac{\partial p_I(x, t)}{\partial t} = \int_{Q_p} p(x|y) [p_I(y, t) - p_I(x, t)] \mu(dy). \quad (12)$$

It is natural to assume that the transition probability decreases with increasing of the distance between two clusters, for example, that

$$p(x|y) = \frac{C_\alpha}{|x - y|_p^{1+\alpha}}, \quad \alpha > 0. \quad (13)$$

Here $C_\alpha > 0$ is a normalization constant, by mathematical reasons it is useful to select distance's power larger than one. Hence,

$$\frac{\partial p_I(x, t)}{\partial t} = C_\alpha \int_{Q_p} \frac{p_I(y, t) - p_I(x, t)}{|x - y|_p^{1+\alpha}} \mu(dy). \quad (14)$$

The integral operator in the right-hand side is the operator of fractional derivative D^α (the Vladimirov operator), see [13]. Thus, the dynamics of the probability to become infected for those belonging to an elementary social cluster is described by *the p -adic diffusion equation*:

$$\frac{\partial p_I(x, t)}{\partial t} = D^\alpha p_I(x, t). \quad (15)$$

To formulate the Cauchy problem, we have to add some initial probability distribution. We select the uniform probability distribution concentrated on a single ball, initially infected social cluster B_n ,

$$p_I(x, 0) = \frac{1}{\mu(B_n)} \begin{cases} 1, & x \in B_n \\ 0, & x \notin B_n \end{cases}$$

Figure 1: Asymptotic behavior of probability to become infected. (For fixed social temperature T , the upper graphs correspond to one-step barrier growth 10 and 100 times, respectively.

This equation and its various generalizations were studied by many authors, for applications to physics and biology and by pure mathematical reasons, see, e.g., [13]. We are interested in the relaxation regime, i.e., asymptotic of average probability $p_I(B_n, t)$ for large t . We use the mathematical result from [17] (see also [18, 19]) and obtain that the average probability has the power behavior:

$$p_I(B_n, t) \sim t^{-1/\alpha}, \quad t \rightarrow \infty. \quad (16)$$

Thus the average probability to become infected in a social cluster decreases rather slowly with time. If $\alpha \gg 1$, i.e., the virus transition probability decreases very quickly with increase of the distance between social clusters, then $p_I(B_n, t)$ decreases very slowly with time, it is practically constant. If $0 < \alpha \ll 1$, so the virus transition probability decreases relatively slowly with increase of the distance, then $p_I(B_n, t)$ decreases sufficiently quickly with time. We shall discuss these behaviors in section 5 by assigning bio-social meaning to the parameter α .

We present some graphs corresponding to different values of α at Fig. 1.

Consider now a kind of “integral immunity”, combination of innate and adaptive components, defined as the probability of not become

infected:

$$p_{\text{Im}}(x, t) = 1 - p_I(x, t) \quad (17)$$

and its average over social cluster represented by ball B_n ,

$$p_{\text{Im}}(B_n, t) = 1 - p_I(B_n, t) \quad (18)$$

This function increases relatively slowly with time, see Fig. 1. Its asymptotic behavior depends on the parameter α determining how rapidly the transition probability between social clusters decreases with increase of the distance between them.

Figure 2: Asymptotic behavior of probability to become immune; increasing of herd immunity (for fixed social temperature T , the upper graphs correspond to one-step barrier growth 10 and 100 times, respectively).

5 Virus' random walk on the hierarchic social tree

The mathematical result on the relaxation regime for the p -adic diffusion [17] is generalization of studies on random walks on ultrametric spaces describing dynamics on energy landscapes [48]-[47]. There are given energy barriers Δ_m separating valleys, movement from one valley to another valley is constrained by necessity to jump over a barrier between them. This random walk model gives a good heuristic picture of the virus spread, as jumping from one social cluster (valley)

407 to another, where clusters (valleys) are separated by social barriers
 408 (mountains) of different heights. Geometrically such random walk is
 409 represented as jumps on a tree between the levels of social hierarchy.
 410 Our model (selection of the transition probability in the form (13))
 411 corresponds to *barriers growing linearly with the number of elemen-*
 412 *tary jumps*. The relaxation regime of the power form is obtained for
 413 the number of hierarchy's levels approaching infinity, i.e., for ideal
 414 trees with infinitely long branches, as ultrametric spaces they are rep-
 415 resented by $\mathbf{Q}_p$.

Figure 3: Treelike configuration space

416 The virus plays the role of a system moving through barriers in
 417 models of dynamics on energy landscapes (see [48], [41]-[47] and ref-
 418 erences herein). In our case, these are social barriers between social
 419 clusters of population. The virus performs a complex random walk
 420 motion inside each social cluster moving in its sub-clusters, goes out
 421 of it and spreads through the whole population, sometimes the virus
 422 comes back to the original cluster from other social clusters that have

been infected from this initial source of infection, and so on. During this motion the virus should cross numerous social barriers.

Instead of virus walking through the social tree, we can consider a person. A person of the social type x can interact with persons of other social types. The temporal sequence of social contacts of some persons can have a very complicated trajectory, visiting numerous clusters (but the probability of approaching a cluster depends crucially on social barriers).

Let virus encounters a barrier of size Δ_m , in hopping a distance m (crossing m levels of hierarchy), where $\Delta_1 < \Delta_2 < \dots < \Delta_m < \dots$. It is supposed that barriers Δ_m are the same for all social clusters, i.e., they depend only on distance, but not on clusters. This assumption reflects a kind of epidemic *égalité* of all social groups, the barriers preventing spread of the virus that are imposed by state authorities are the same for all social groups.

Consider the tree at Fig. 3. We identify the lengths of branches between vertexes with magnitudes of barriers. Then the barriers on this tree depend on clusters, so from this viewpoint the social tree is not homogeneous.

Consider the energy landscape with a uniform barrier Δ , at every branch point; that is, a jump of distance 1 involves surmounting a barrier Δ , of distance 2, a barrier 2Δ , and so on. Hence, barriers linearly grow with distance m ,

$$\Delta_m = m\Delta, m = 1, 2, \dots \quad (19)$$

It seems that this type of behavior is the most natural from the viewpoint of social connections during the covid-19 epidemic in Sweden. Barriers are sufficiently high, but they still are not walls as during the rigid quarantine (as say in Italy, France, or Russia). For such linearly increasing barriers one can derive the following asymptotic behavior (17) of the relaxation probability [48], where in physics and biology the parameter

$$q \equiv 1/\alpha = \frac{T \log p}{\Delta}, \quad (20)$$

Here the new parameter T has the meaning of temperature. Thus behavior of distance between valleys of the energy landscape is determined by the size of the barrier for one-step jump Δ and temperature. We rewrite formula (13) for transition probability by using these parameters:

$$p(x|y) = \frac{C_{T,\Delta}}{|x - y|_p^{1+\Delta/T}}. \quad (21)$$

In our model, we introduce the notion of *social temperature* T . As in physics, this parameter calibrates energy, in our case social energy.

The latter represents the degree of social activity, the magnitude of social actions. Although the notions of social temperature and energy are not so well established as in physics, they can be useful in socio-physical modeling (see [63] and references herein, starting with the works of Freud and Jung). Probability that the virus jumps from the elementary social cluster y to another cluster x grows with growth of social temperature. For high T , virus (or its spreader) easily move between social clusters. If $T \ll 1$, the infection is practically confined in clusters. If barrier Δ increases for the fixed parameter T , then the transition probability decreases and vice versa.

Starting with expression (21), we obtain the relaxation asymptotic in the form:

$$p_I(B_n, t) \sim t^{-\frac{T \log p}{\Delta}}, \quad t \rightarrow \infty. \quad (22)$$

Thus, for large t , the average probability to become infected in social cluster B_n decreases quicker with increase of social temperature T . Decrease of the one-step jump barrier Δ implies the same behavior.

Immunity probability $p_{Im}(B_n, t)$ behaves in the opposite way. It increases quicker with increase of social temperature and decrease of the social barrier Δ .

6 Concluding remarks

In this paper, we continue development of a new mathematical model of disease spread reflecting specialties of covid-19 epidemic. We especially emphasize the social cluster character of the virus spread, **ASO**. Such clustered spread can be modeled with dynamical systems on ultrametric spaces. Social clusters are represented by ultrametric balls. The basic feature of ultrametric balls is that they are either disjoint or one is included in another. This is the root of a the hierarchic structure of an ultrametric space. Geometrically ultrametric spaces are represented by trees with balls given by bunches of branches with the common root.

In this paper, we model the dynamics of coronavirus with ultrametric diffusion equation⁷, its simplest version corresponding to p -adic trees and linearly increasing social barriers. Asymptotic of probability $p_{Im}(t)$ to become immune against the virus is presented at Fig. 2. Generally, it increases slowly, the speed of increasing depends on the basic parameter of the model $q = T \log p / \Delta$.

⁷The use of purely diffusional model is supported by specialties of covid-19 epidemic, presented in section 2. Of course, this model is only approximate. But, it seems that it gives the right asymptotic of probabilities, to become infected and immune, in socially clustered society.

In a society with low social temperature and high barriers between social clusters, $p_{Im}(t)$ increase so slowly that there is practically no hope to approach herd immunity.

Appendix

Superspreader is an unusually contagious individual who has been infected with disease; someone who infected the number of people far exceeding the two to three. As was pointed out in MIT Technology Review [62]: “For covid-19, this means 80% of new transmissions are caused by fewer than 20% of the carriers – the vast majority of people infect very few others or none at all, and it is a select minority of individuals who are aggressively spreading the virus. A recent preprint looking at transmission in Hong Kong supports those figures, while another looking at transmission in Shenzhen, China, pegs the numbers closer to 80/10. Lots of outbreaks around the world have been linked to single events where a superspreader likely infected dozens of people. For example, a choir practice in Washington State infected about 52 people; a megachurch in Seoul was linked to the majority of initial infections in South Korea; and a wedding in Jordan with about 350 guests led to 76 confirmed infections.” The bad news is that, for the moment, we cannot identify diagnostically superspreaders.

References

- [1] A. Khrennikov, Ultrametric model for covid-19 dynamics: an attempt to explain slow approaching herd immunity in Sweden. <https://www.preprints.org/manuscript/202007.0037/v1> ; <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.07.04.20146209v1> .
- [2] Khrennikov A., Human subconscious as a p-adic dynamical system. Journal of Theoretical Biology, 193(2), 179-96 (1998).
- [3] S. Alberverio, A. Khrennikov, P. E. Kloeden, Memory retrieval as a p-adic dynamical system. Biosystems 49, N 2, 105-115 (1999).
- [4] D. Dubischar, V. M. Gundlach, O. Steinkamp, A. Khrennikov, A p-Adic Model for the Process of Thinking Disturbed by Physiological and Information Noise. Journal of Theoretical Biology 197(4), 451-67 (1999).
- [5] A. Khrennikov, Information Dynamics in Cognitive, Psychological, Social, and Anomalous Phenomena. Kluwer, 2004

- 531 [6] A. Khrennikov, Probabilistic pathway representation of cogni-
532 tive information. *Journal of Theoretical Biology* 231, N 4, 597-
533 613 (2004).
- 534 [7] A. Khrennikov, Toward an adequate mathematical model of
535 mental space: Conscious/unconscious dynamics on m-adic trees.
536 *Biosystems* 90, N 3, 656-675 (2007).
- 537 [8] Murtagh, F. The Haar wavelet transform of a dendrogram. *J.*
538 *Classif.* 2007, 24, 3–32.
- 539 [9] Dragovich, B.; Dragovich, A. A p-Adic model of DNA sequence
540 and genetic code. *P-Adic Numbers Ultramet. Anal. Appl.* 2009,
541 1, 34–41.
- 542 [10] Dragovich, B.; Dragovich, A. *p*-adic modelling of the genome
543 and the genetic code. *Comput. J.* 2010, 53, 432–442.
- 544 [11] Murtagh, F.; Contreras, P. Fast, linear time, m-adic hierarchi-
545 cal clustering for search and retrieval using the Baire metric,
546 with linkages to generalized ultrametrics, hashing, formal con-
547 cept analysis, and precision of data measurement. *P-Adic Num-*
548 *bers Ultramet. Anal. Appl.* 2012, 4, 45–56.
- 549 [12] Contreras, P.; Murtagh, F. Fast, linear time hierarchical clus-
550 tering using the Baire metric. *J. Classif.* 2012, 29, 118–143.
- 551 [13] Vladimirov, V.S.; Volovich, I.V.; Zelenov, E.I. *P-Adic Analysis*
552 *and Mathematical Physics*; WSP: Singapore, 1994.
- 553 [14] Kochubei, A. N.: Parabolic Equations over the Field of p-Adic
554 Numbers, *Math. USSR Izvestiya* 39(1992), 1263-1280
- 555 [15] S. Albeverio and X. Zhao, Measure-valued branching processes
556 associated with random walks on p-adics. *Ann. Probab.* 28,
557 (2000), 1680-1710.
- 558 [16] Kochubei, A.N. *Pseudo-Differential Equations and Stochastics*
559 *over Non-Archimedean Field*; CRC Press: New York, NY, USA,
560 2001
- 561 [17] V. A. Avetisov, A. H. Bikulov, S. V. Kozyrev and V. A. Osipov,
562 p-adic models of ultrametric diffusion constrained by hierarchi-
563 cal energy landscapes. *J. Phys. A: Math. Gen.* 35, 2002, 177-190.
- 564 [18] Kozyrev, S.V. Ultrametric dynamics as a model of interbasin
565 kinetics. *J. Comput. Math. Anal.* 2006, 41, 38–48.
- 566 [19] Kozyrev, S.V. Ultrametric analysis and interbasin kinetics. *AIP*
567 *Conf. Proc.* 2006, 826, 121–128.
- 568 [20] S. Albeverio, A. Yu Khrennikov, V. M. Shelkovich, *Theory of*
569 *P-adic Distributions: Linear and Nonlinear Models.* Cambridge
570 *Univ. Press, Cambridge, 2010.*

- 571 [21] Casas-Sanchez, O.F.; Zuniga-Galindo, W.A. P-adic elliptic
572 quadratic forms, parabolic-type pseudodifferential equations
573 with variable coefficients and Markov processes. P-Adic Num-
574 bers Ultramet. Anal. Appl. 2014, 6, 120–139.
- 575 [22] Volovich, I.V. p-Adic string. Class. Quantum Gravity 1987, 4,
576 83–87.
- 577 [23] Dragovich, B.G. Adelic harmonic oscillator. Int. J. Mod. Phys.
578 A 1995, 10, 2349–2359. [CrossRef]
- 579 [24] Khrennikov, A.Y. P-Adic Valued Distributions in Mathematical
580 Physics; Kluwer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 1994.
- 581 [25] R. M. Anderson, R. M. May, Infectious Diseases of Humans:
582 Dynamics and Control (Oxford Univ. Press, 1991).
- 583 [26] H. Andersson, T. Britton, Stochastic Epidemic Models and
584 Their Statistical Analysis (Springer, 2000).
- 585 [27] O. Diekmann, H. Heesterbeek, T. Britton, Mathematical Tools
586 for Understanding Infectious Disease Dynamics (Princeton
587 Univ. Press, 2013).
- 588 [28] D. Smith and L. Moore, The SIR Model for Spread
589 of Disease - The Differential Equation Model.
590 [https://www.maa.org/press/periodicals/loci/joma/the-sir-](https://www.maa.org/press/periodicals/loci/joma/the-sir-model-for-spread-of-disease-the-differential-equation-model)
591 [model-for-spread-of-disease-the-differential-equation-model](https://www.maa.org/press/periodicals/loci/joma/the-sir-model-for-spread-of-disease-the-differential-equation-model).
- 592 [29] K. I. Kim, Zh. Lin, Q. Zhang, An SIR epidemic model with
593 free boundary. Nonlinear Analysis: Real World Appl., 14, 2013,
594 1992-2001.
- 595 [30] S. Flaxman, S. Mishra, A. Gandy, H. J. T. Unwin, H. Coup-
596 land, T. A. Mellan, H. Zhu, T. Berah, J. W. Eaton, P. N. P.
597 Guzman, N. Schmit, L. Cilloni, K. E. C. Ainslie, M. Baguelin,
598 I. Blake, A. Boonyasiri, O. Boyd, L. Cattarino, C. Ciavarella,
599 L. Cooper, Z. Cucunubá, G. Cuomo-Dannenburg, A. Dighe, B.
600 Djaafara, I. Dorigatti, S. van Elsland, R. FitzJohn, H. Fu, K.
601 Gaythorpe, L. Geidelberg, N. Grassly, W. Green, T. Hallett, A.
602 Hamlet, W. Hinsley, B. Jeffrey, D. Jorgensen, E. Knock, D. Lay-
603 don, G. Nedjati-Gilani, P. Nouvellet, K. Parag, I. Siveroni, H.
604 Thompson, R. Verity, E. Volz, C. Walters, H. Wang, Y. Wang,
605 O. Watson, P. Winskill, X. Xi, C. Whittaker, P. G. T. Walker, A.
606 Ghani, C. A. Donnelly, S. Riley, L. C. Okell, M. A. C. Vollmer,
607 N. M. Ferguson, S. Bhatt, Report 13: Estimating the number of
608 infections and the impact of non-pharmaceutical interventions
609 on COVID-19 in 11 European countries (Imperial College Lon-
610 don, 2020); .doi:10.25561/77731

- [31] N. M. Ferguson, D. Laydon, G. Nedjati-Gilani, N. Imai, K. Ainslie, M. Baguelin, S. Bhatia, A. Boonyasiri, Z. Cucunubá, G. Cuomo-Dannenburg, A. Dighe, I. Dorigatti, H. Fu, K. Gaythorpe, W. Green, A. Hamlet, W. Hinsley, L. C. Okell, S. van Elsland, H. Thompson, R. Verity, E. Volz, H. Wang, Y. Wang, P. G. T. Walker, C. Walters, P. Winskill, C. Whittaker, C. A. Donnelly, S. Riley, A. C. Ghani, Report 9: Impact of non-pharmaceutical interventions (NPIs) to reduce COVID-19 mortality and healthcare demand (Imperial College London, 2020); 10.25561/77482.doi
- [32] T. Britton, Basic estimation-prediction techniques for Covid-19, and a prediction for Stockholm. Preprint, April 2020 DOI: 10.1101/2020.04.15.20066050
- [33] T. Britton, Basic estimation-prediction techniques for Covid-19, and a prediction for Stockholm. <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.04.15.20066050v2>
- [34] T. Britton, P. Trapman, F.G. Ball, The disease-induced herd immunity level for Covid-19 is substantially lower than the classical herd immunity level. <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.05.06.20093336v2>
- [35] W. Bock, B. Adamik, M. Bawiec, V. Bezborodov, M. Bodych, J. P. Burgard, T. Goetz, T. Krueger, A. Migalska, B. Pabjan, T. Ozanski, E. Rafajlowicz, W. Rafajlowicz, E. Skubalska-Rafajlowicz, S. Ryfczynska, E. Szczurek, P. Szymanski, Mitigation and herd immunity strategy for COVID-19 is likely to fail. medRxiv 2020.03.25.20043109 [Preprint]. 5 May 2020; .doi:10.1101/2020.03.25.20043109 Abstract/FREE Full Text-Google Scholar
- [36] H. Salje, C. T. Kiem, N. Lefrancq, N. Courtejoie, P. Bosetti, J. Paireau, A. Andronico, N. Hozé, J. Richet, C.-L. Dubost, Y. Le Strat, J. Lessler, D. Levy-Bruhl, A. Fontanet, L. Opatowski, P.-Y. Boelle, S. Cauchemez, Estimating the burden of SARS-CoV-2 in France. Science 10.1126/science.abc3517 (2020). doi:10.1126/science.abc3517
- [37] J. Wallinga, P. Teunis, M. Kretzschmar, Using data on social contacts to estimate age-specific transmission parameters for respiratory-spread infectious agents. Am. J. Epidemiol. 164, 936–944 (2006).
- [38] R. Pastor-Satorras, A. Vespignani, Epidemic spreading in scale-free networks. Phys. Rev. Lett. 86, 3200–3203 (2001).

- [39] M. J. Ferrari, S. Bansal, L. A. Meyers, O. N. Bjørnstad, Network frailty and the geometry of herd immunity. *Proc. Biol. Sci.* 273, 2743–2748 (2006).
- [40] T. Britton, F. Ball, P. Trapman, A mathematical model reveals the influence of population heterogeneity on herd immunity to SARS-CoV-2. *Science* 23 Jun 2020: eabc6810
- [41] M. Mezard, G. Parisi, N. Sourlas, G. Toulouse, and M. Virasoro, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 52, 1156 (1984).
- [42] R. G. Palmer, *Adv. Phys.* 31, 66a (1982); G. Parisi, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 50, 1946 (1983).
- [43] A. Ansari, J. Berendzen, S. F. Bowne, H. Frauenfelder, I. E. T. Iben, T. B. Sauke, E. Shyamsunder, and R. D. Young, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 82, 5000 (1985).
- [44] R. G. Palmer, D. L. Stein, E. Abrahams, and P. W. Anderson, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 53, 958 (1984).
- [45] B. A. Huberman and M. Kerszberg, *J. Phys. A* 18, L331 (1985).
- [46] Parisi, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 43, 1754 (1979).
- [47] Parisi, G.; Sourlas, N. p -Adic numbers and replica symmetry breaking. *Eur. Phys. J. B* 2000, 14, 535–542.
- [48] A. T. Ogielski, Dynamics on Ultrametric Spaces. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 55, 1634-1637.
- [49] Public Health Institute of Sweden, Estimates of the peak-day and the number of infected individuals during the covid-19 outbreak in the Stockholm region, Sweden February–April 2020 [in Swedish] (2020); www.folkhalsomyndigheten.se/contentassets/2da059f90b90458d8454a04955d1697f/skattning-peakdag-antal-infekterade-covid-19-utbrottet-stockholms-lan-februari-april-2020.pdf.
- [50] Public Health Institute of Sweden: Antikroppstester avviker från prognoserna – matematikern “ser två förklaringar”. <https://www.svt.se/nyheter/inrikes/antikroppstester>
- [51] Public Health Institute of Sweden: Yngre personer har högre andel antikroppar. *Sverige Radion*, June 2, 2020; <https://sverigesradio.se/sida/artikel.aspx?programid=83artikel=7487102>
- [52] Tegnell: “Vi får oroande rapporter om utelivet”. *SVT, Nyheter*, 20-04-2020; <https://www.svt.se/nyheter/inrikes/tegnell-vi-far-oroande-rapporter-om-utelivet>
- [53] Se hur matematikprofessorn räknar ut när Stockholm uppnår flockimmunitet. *SVT Nyheter*, 20-04-2020.

- 690 [54] G. Holm, Hoppfulla teorin: Sa når vi flockim-
691 munitet redan i juni. Expressen, 10.05.2020.
692 [https://www.expressen.se/nyheter/coronaviruset/hoppfulla-](https://www.expressen.se/nyheter/coronaviruset/hoppfulla-teorin-sa-nar-vi-flockimmunitet-redan-i-juni/)
693 [teorin-sa-nar-vi-flockimmunitet-redan-i-juni/](https://www.expressen.se/nyheter/coronaviruset/hoppfulla-teorin-sa-nar-vi-flockimmunitet-redan-i-juni/)
- 694 [55] A. Obminska, Det här vet vi om coronaviruset. Ny
695 Teknik, 30-06-2020; [https://www.nyteknik.se/samhalle/det-](https://www.nyteknik.se/samhalle/det-har-vet-vi-om-coronaviruset-6985117)
696 [har-vet-vi-om-coronaviruset-6985117](https://www.nyteknik.se/samhalle/det-har-vet-vi-om-coronaviruset-6985117)
- 697 [56] Public Health Institute of Sweden, 18-06-2020;
698 [https://www.folkhalsomyndigheten.se/nyheter-och-](https://www.folkhalsomyndigheten.se/nyheter-och-press/nyhetsarkiv/2020/juni/forsta-resultaten-om-antikroppar-efter-genomgangen-covid-19-hos-blodgivare/)
699 [press/nyhetsarkiv/2020/juni/forsta-resultaten-om-antikroppar-](https://www.folkhalsomyndigheten.se/nyheter-och-press/nyhetsarkiv/2020/juni/forsta-resultaten-om-antikroppar-efter-genomgangen-covid-19-hos-blodgivare/)
700 [efter-genomgangen-covid-19-hos-blodgivare/](https://www.folkhalsomyndigheten.se/nyheter-och-press/nyhetsarkiv/2020/juni/forsta-resultaten-om-antikroppar-efter-genomgangen-covid-19-hos-blodgivare/)
- 701 [57] L. A. Demetrius, V. M. Gundlach, Directionality Theory and
702 the Entropic Principle of Natural Selection. Entropy 2014, 16,
703 5428-5522.
- 704 [58] H. Streeck, So far, no transmission of the virus
705 in supermarkets, restaurants or hairdressers has
706 been proved. [https://today.rtl.lu/news/science-and-](https://today.rtl.lu/news/science-and-environment/a/1498185.html)
707 [environment/a/1498185.html](https://today.rtl.lu/news/science-and-environment/a/1498185.html), 14.04.2020.
- 708 [59] Podcast “Coronavirus-Update” mit Christian Drosten.
709 [https://www.ndr.de/nachrichten/info/14-Coronavirus-Update-](https://www.ndr.de/nachrichten/info/14-Coronavirus-Update-Vorsicht-vor-Vereinfachungen,podcastcoronavirus132.html)
710 [Vorsicht-vor-Vereinfachungen,podcastcoronavirus132.html](https://www.ndr.de/nachrichten/info/14-Coronavirus-Update-Vorsicht-vor-Vereinfachungen,podcastcoronavirus132.html)
- 711 [60] J. Howard, Coronavirus spread by asymptomatic peo-
712 ple appears to be rare,” WHO official says. CNN,
713 [https://edition.cnn.com/2020/06/08/health/coronavirus-](https://edition.cnn.com/2020/06/08/health/coronavirus-asymptomatic-spread-who-bn/index.html)
714 [asymptomatic-spread-who-bn/index.html](https://edition.cnn.com/2020/06/08/health/coronavirus-asymptomatic-spread-who-bn/index.html)
- 715 [61] A. Azad, CDC estimates that 35% of coronavirus pa-
716 tients don’t have symptoms. CNN, May 22, 2020,
717 [https://edition.cnn.com/2020/05/22/health/cdc-coronavirus-](https://edition.cnn.com/2020/05/22/health/cdc-coronavirus-estimates-symptoms-deaths/index.html)
718 [estimates-symptoms-deaths/index.html](https://edition.cnn.com/2020/05/22/health/cdc-coronavirus-estimates-symptoms-deaths/index.html)
- 719 [62] Technology Review, What’s a coronavirus superspreader?
720 [https://www.technologyreview.com/2020/06/15/1003576/whats-](https://www.technologyreview.com/2020/06/15/1003576/whats-a-coronavirus-superspreader/)
721 [a-coronavirus-superspreader/](https://www.technologyreview.com/2020/06/15/1003576/whats-a-coronavirus-superspreader/) 15.06.2020.
- 722 [63] A. Khrennikov, Social Laser. Jenny Stanford Publ., Singapore,
723 2020.