

1 **Cremation based estimates suggest significant under- and delayed reporting of COVID-19**  
2 **epidemic data in Wuhan and China**

3 Mai He, M.D., Ph.D.,<sup>1</sup> Li Li, M.A.<sup>2</sup>, Louis P. Dehner, M.D.,<sup>1</sup> Lucia F. Dunn, Ph.D.<sup>3</sup>

- 4
- 5 1. Department of Pathology and Immunology, Washington University School of Medicine
  - 6 in St. Louis, St. Louis, MO 63110, USA
  - 7 2. AT&T, Bedminster, NJ 07921, USA
  - 8 3. Department of Economics, The Ohio State University, Columbus, OH 43210, USA

9

10 **Corresponding author:**

11 Mai He, M.D., Ph.D.

12 Department of Pathology and Immunology,

13 Washington University School of Medicine in St. Louis,

14 St. Louis, MO 63110, USA

15 Phone: (314) 273-1328

16 Email: [Maihe@wustl.edu](mailto:Maihe@wustl.edu)

17

18 **Keywords:** COVID-19, cremation, cumulative infection, death, Wuhan, China

19

20 **Abstract**

21 **Background:**

22 China's COVID-19 statistics fall outside of recognized and accepted medical norms. Here we  
23 estimated the incidence, death and starting time of the COVID-19 outbreak in Wuhan and China  
24 based on cremation related information.

25 **Methods:**

26 Data sources included literature on COVID-19 in China, official Chinese government figures,  
27 state-run and non state-run media reports. Our estimates are based on investigative media  
28 reports of crematory operations in Wuhan, which is considered as a common data end point to  
29 life. A range of estimates is presented by an exponential growth rate model from lockdown (Jan  
30 23,2020) until the intervention started to show effects, which was estimated 14.5 days after  
31 lockdown.

32 **Results:**

33 For the cumulative infections and total deaths, under different assumptions of case fatality rates  
34 (from 2.5% to 10%) and doubling time 6.4 days, the estimates projected on February 7, 2020 in  
35 Wuhan range from 305,000 to 1,272,000 for infections and from 6,811 to 7,223 for deaths - on  
36 the order of at least 10 times the official figures (13,603 and 545). The implied starting time of  
37 the outbreak is October 2019. The estimates of cumulative deaths, based on both funeral urns  
38 distribution and continuous full capacity operation of cremation services up to March 23, 2020,  
39 give results around 36,000, more than 10 times of the official death toll of 2,524.

40 **Conclusions:**

41 Our study indicates a significant under-reporting in Chinese official data on the COVID-19  
42 epidemic in Wuhan in early February, the critical time for response to the COVID-19 pandemic.

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

## 57 **BACKGROUND**

58           The spread of the coronavirus (COVID-19) has evolved into a global public health crisis  
59 affecting all aspects of individual, societal and economic activity. On December 31, 2019, the  
60 Wuhan City Health Commission announced that recent cases of pneumonia of unknown etiology  
61 seen in some hospitals were related to the Wet Market and 27 cases were found by the time. This  
62 official announcement conflicted with at least two official numbers and one media report which  
63 were 45, 104 and 266 cases.<sup>1-3</sup> Reports from the official Chinese state-run media on February 2,  
64 2020 showing large numbers of possible coronavirus victims who were not treated within the  
65 medical establishment and hence may have fallen outside of government statistics, have led  
66 many to believe there may be serious gaps in our understanding of the outbreak based on what  
67 can be determined from this official government data.<sup>4</sup>

68           As the epicenter of the COVID-19 initial outbreak, the epidemiological information from  
69 Wuhan affects the response and preparation of other parts of China and rest of the world. It is  
70 therefore important to attempt to accurately assess the actual number of cases and gain some  
71 insights from this deduction to the time of the first cases.

72           The purpose of this report is to investigate the epidemiological information of the early  
73 phase of the COVID-19 outbreak in Wuhan, after lockdown on January 23, 2020, based on  
74 official Chinese government figures, published literature and media reports, focusing on  
75 cremation related data. The estimates of incidence and deaths are higher by a magnitude of at  
76 least 10 times the official figures. Our estimates are further supported by others who were also  
77 investigating the situation and recent updates of funeral urn distribution in Wuhan. The potential

78 impact of this discrepancy is critical for both the medical projection of needs and for policy  
79 decisions relating to public health.

## 80 **METHODS**

### 81 *Data Sources*

82 The official Chinese government figures include national and local Wuhan data<sup>5</sup> and  
83 state-run media reports. Since there is no medical literature on “COVID-19, cremation” in  
84 China, we searched on the internet for media reports in Chinese by “新型冠状病毒肺炎” (novel  
85 coronavirus pneumonia) and “Wuhan” on the operation of crematory facilities in Wuhan as  
86 widely reported by established news organizations both inside and outside of China.<sup>6-12</sup>

### 87 *Cremation Data*

88 Daily cremation due to the COVID-19 outbreak is defined and estimated by total number  
89 of estimated cremations in the time period of this study minus pre-outbreak average daily  
90 cremations.

91 Detailed information on crematory facility and operation is listed in Appendix 1, but also  
92 summarized in Table 1.<sup>6,7</sup> Briefly, there are eight crematories in Wuhan, which under normal  
93 circumstances would operate about 4 hours per day. Before the outbreak, cremation mainly  
94 happened in the morning, according to Chinese rituals. Starting on or before January 25, 2020,  
95 these were observed to be operating at or close to around-the-clock or 24 hours daily.<sup>6-12</sup> This  
96 would put the current operating rate at about six times normal. Normal deaths per day can be  
97 estimated as 136 based on an annual mortality rate of 0.00551 in a population of approximately 9  
98 million (Wuhan government data).<sup>13</sup> With the regular procedure, the additional 20 hours of daily

99 operation imply additional deaths of  $5 (20/4) \times 136 = 680$  per day above normal, if the services  
100 are utilized with full capacity. However, it was estimated that the maximal capacity of cremation  
101 could be up to 2,100 bodies per day (see appendix 1).

102 This estimate was supported by media reports of support of additional crematory staff  
103 from other cities and provinces being brought into Wuhan.<sup>14,15</sup> Since February 19, 40 mobile  
104 crematory stations were also sent to Wuhan for the increasing need of cremation capacity.<sup>16,17</sup>

#### 105 *Estimation*

106 We used an exponential model to estimate the cumulative infections and deaths in  
107 Wuhan.

#### 108 *Assumptions*

109 I. The median time of the incubation period for COVID-19 is 4.5 days from exposure to  
110 symptom onset.<sup>18</sup> The median time from the symptom onset to death is 14 days.<sup>19</sup> Assuming it  
111 takes half a day from death to cremation, this implies that most of the deaths which happened on  
112 and before February 11, 2020 were not impacted by any countermeasures in effect.

113 II. In this study, different assumptions of epidemic doubling time were applied. Wu et al.  
114 statistically inferred case counts in Wuhan by internationally exported cases as of January 25 and  
115 estimated doubling time as 6.4 days with 95% confidence interval (5.8, 7.1).<sup>20</sup> Rodriguez et al.  
116 analyzed Chinese official daily cumulative cases from January 20 to February 9, 2020, and  
117 derived the doubling time for each province ranging from 1.42 to 3.05 days, with Hubei (where  
118 Wuhan is located) as 2.54 with confidence interval (2.44, 2.64), based on an exponential model.

119 With no countermeasure in effect, we assumed doubling time was also 2.54 days before January  
120 20 in this scenario.<sup>21</sup>

121 III. Outcomes are either survival with probability  $(1 - d)$  where  $d$  is the case fatality rate; or  
122 death after 14 days with probability  $d$ .

123 IV. To extrapolate from the Wuhan cremation data to the total number of infected cases,  
124 alternative assumptions of 2.5%, 5%, and 10% were utilized for the case fatality rate.

125 V. Though media reported that Wuhan cremation service operated around the clock since  
126 January 25, 2020,<sup>6-12</sup> we assumed no full capacity was utilized until two weeks later, on February  
127 7, 2020. This assumption will be further discussed below.

### 128 *The Model*

129 Estimates of the total cases were calculated from an exponential growth model. At time  
130  $t$ , where  $t$  is the number of days since the occurrence of the initial case, the quantities of interest  
131 are  $N(t)$ , the cumulative number of cases,  $n(t)$ , the daily cases,  $D(t)$ , the cumulative number of  
132 deaths,  $d(t)$ , the daily deaths, and the case fatality rate  $d$ .  $N(t) = c(e^{\lambda t} - 1) + 1$ , so that  $N(0) =$   
133 1, where  $c$  is a constant and the parameter  $\lambda$  is set to match the reported doubling time.  $n(t) \cong$   
134  $(1 - e^{-\lambda}) N(t)$  and  $D(t) \cong d e^{-14.5 \lambda} N(t)$ . Matching the cumulative totals  $N(t)$  to the model  
135 where each existing case infects  $R_0$  (the basic reproductive number) new cases on average after  $s$   
136 days (the serial interval) gives  $c = R_0/(R_0 - 1)$ . Wu et al. estimates 2.7 for  $R_0$ .<sup>20</sup> Exponential  
137 growth model was not applied for projections of  $N(t)$  for Wuhan beyond the date February 7,  
138 2020, due to the declining number of susceptible individuals and plausible effectiveness of city  
139 lockdown.

140 The projections of  $N(t)$  for Wuhan using doubling time 2.54 days approach half million  
141 on 44<sup>th</sup> day, that the exponential growth model is unreliable. From the 45<sup>th</sup> day, we take into  
142 account the declining number of susceptible individuals, and the model was modified (as in the  
143 SIR simulation model) so that the relationship  $n(t) = e^{\lambda}n(t - 1)$  becomes  $n(t) =$   
144  $e^{\lambda} \left(1 - \frac{N(t-1)}{P}\right)^{\frac{1}{S}} n(t - 1)$  where  $P$  is the population size of Wuhan after lock down.

145 The 95% confidence intervals presented in Table 2 are based on the confidence interval  
146 for the doubling rate as presented. Confidence intervals for the estimated starting dates are not  
147 provided because they depend on estimates of both  $\lambda$  and  $R_0$  and also on the randomness in the  
148 transmission of the infection in its very early stages.

## 149 RESULTS

150 Wuhan lockdown started on January 23, 2020. This study chose February 7 (two weeks  
151 after the announcement of 24-hour-operation of cremation services), and February 12 (20 days  
152 after lockdown) as the projected evaluation days. Retrospectively, February 12 was the day when  
153 party leadership changes were undertaken in Wuhan and Hubei Province.<sup>22</sup>

### 154 I. Chinese official data for Wuhan and China

155 The Chinese government's official COVID-19 cumulative confirmed diagnoses and  
156 deaths data, from late January up to mid-February, and selected representative dates later, are  
157 recorded in Table 2 for Wuhan and the whole of China.<sup>23</sup> Daily ratios of confirmed diagnosis and  
158 death between Wuhan and China as whole were calculated and listed in Table 2. While the  
159 increase was relatively stable throughout the early period shown, there was a marked addition of  
160 confirmed cases on February 12, 2020, with 13,436 new cases reported in Wuhan and a total of



161 15,151 (including Wuhan's data) of new cases in all of China, amounting to cumulative  
162 confirmed diagnoses of 32,994 cases in Wuhan and 59,804 cases in China as a whole, and 1,036  
163 cases of cumulative deaths in Wuhan and 1,367 deaths in China. On February 12, 2020, Wuhan's  
164 cases represented 55.2% and 75.8% of China's cases of cumulative confirmed diagnoses and  
165 deaths, respectively. The case fatality rate due to COVID-19 ranged from 3 to 4% in Wuhan  
166 during this period, and ultimately 5% by April 11, 2020 (Table 1).

167 On April 17, Wuhan City announced an adjustment of its death toll by additional 1,290,  
168 and of confirmed diagnosis by 325 cases, making a total of confirmed diagnosis of 50,333 cases,  
169 deaths of 3,869 cases, and crude case fatality rate of 7.69%.<sup>24,25</sup>

## 170 II. Estimates of COVID-19 related deaths and cumulative infections in Wuhan

### 171 (a) *Simple linear calculation*

172 As a benchmark comparison, we have provided simple linear calculations with constant daily  
173 deaths. We assume that cremation service did not reached 100% utilization until February 7, and  
174 the utilization was 80% between January 25 to February 6, 2020. The results of these estimates  
175 are listed in Table 3. Cumulative deaths are 9,384, for the nineteen days (January 25 to February  
176 12, 2020) only. Based on the official crude case fatality rate of 3.14% (February 12, 2020, Table  
177 1), the estimated cumulative infection was 298,854 within nineteen days (Table 3).

### 178 (b) *Exponential growth model*

179 Based on the cremation data inference that COVID-19 related deaths reached 680 on  
180 February 7, 2020, estimation of infection on February 7 is calculated. With 6.4 day doubling  
181 rate,<sup>20</sup> and under assumption of the crude fatality rates of 2.5%, 5%, and 10%, cumulative  
182 infections in Wuhan are 1,272,400, 650,900 and 305,000 respectively. Cumulative deaths are

183 6,946, 7,223 and 6,811 respectively. The implied start dates for the outbreak are October 4,  
184 2019, October 11, 2019 and October 17, 2019, respectively.

185 Estimates based of a 2.54 day doubling rate are also presented with estimated confidence  
186 intervals in Table 3. Since this doubling time was derived using Chinese official data, we  
187 applied the official 3.14% fatality rate in the calculation. The total cases are projected to be 2.23  
188 million with 95% confidence interval (2.12 million, 2.38 million) on February 7, 2020.

189 (c) Estimates based on funeral urn distribution

190 No one was allowed to pick up urns during the lockdown. Beginning on March 23,  
191 Wuhan residents were allowed to collect crematory urns, with the target date as April 4 to  
192 complete the distribution of the backlog. Estimates based urn collection are listed in Table 4.

193 III. Estimate of COVID related deaths and cumulative infections in all of China

194 If we use the Wuhan/China ratio based on China's official data listed in Table 1  
195 (confirmed cases 39.4%), we can extrapolate estimates for China, with cumulative infections  
196 potentially reaching 5.67 million on February 7, 2020.

## 197 **DISCUSSION**

198 The escalating intervention leading to the unprecedented sudden lockdown of Wuhan and  
199 the published medical literature by Chinese researchers and scientists suggest a discrepancy from  
200 the officially announced figures of the outbreak. As the epicenter of the COVID-19 outbreak, the  
201 necessary epidemiological information about Wuhan was not made available n for the world to  
202 initiate plans for a response and to prepare for the potential crisis that is now upon us.

203 *Challenges for getting needed information in China*

204 A major challenge to an effective response existed in the lack of transparency in reporting  
205 by China. With media reports providing fragmented information with no well-defined focus,  
206 academic publications subject to selection bias, and possibly less than forthright government  
207 data, many challenges have arisen in formulating a data driven approach to this world-wide  
208 problem.<sup>26</sup> The current study used cremation-related information to estimate epidemiological  
209 information including cumulative infections and deaths.

210 The strength of this approach is that cremation is a common data end point. We applied  
211 an exponential growth model during a window period from lockdown until the intervention  
212 started to show effects. Note that the approach of the simple exponential growth model is valid  
213 under the assumption that countermeasures to slow the spread of the epidemic were ineffective  
214 up to the date included. While people claimed that the lockdown in Wuhan combined with the  
215 national emergency response have averted 96% of the cases by February 19, 2020,<sup>27</sup> it should be  
216 considered that in the initial period after Wuhan lock down, the effectiveness of countermeasures  
217 taken there could be impacted by many factors, including the lack of public awareness, the cross  
218 infection at hospitals, the limitation of the medical capacity, the inadequacy of the quarantine  
219 facility and space, and the family cluster chain-infections.. However, this is beyond the scope of  
220 this manuscript.

221 A potential weakness of this study is that there is no cremation information in medical  
222 literature. All cremation related information came from media reports. To reduce bias, we used  
223 media reports from both within China and outside China.<sup>6-12</sup>

224 *Cumulative infections and deaths from cremation-based analysis*

225           Based on data from the seven of eight Wuhan crematories, our conservative estimates of  
226 cumulative infections on February 7 are more than 10 times than those of the official data.

227           Chinese media raised concerns about infections and deaths beyond the official statistics;  
228 for example, when the director of a fever clinic complained that he could admit only five out of  
229 80 potentially infected patients, which suggested a potential 16-fold difference between possible  
230 infected patients and confirmed diagnoses in Wuhan.<sup>4</sup> The report mentioned the limited nucleic  
231 acid-based testing, which was available only after the sequencing data was announced on  
232 January 11, 2020. This information also pointed to the limited and exhausted medical facility  
233 capacity in Wuhan in late January and early February 2020. In Table 5, we list representative  
234 medical facilities in Wuhan and additional support from rest of China. Note that Wuhan was  
235 reported to have approximately 95,000 beds by the end of 2018.<sup>28</sup> Wuhan designated 100,000  
236 beds for COVID patients by February 20.<sup>29</sup> This ratio of bed numbers to official confirmed  
237 cumulative diagnoses 47,741 as of February 25, 2020 presents a discrepancy which cannot be  
238 explained by other causes. Similarly, as of Mar 8, Wuhan had 178,900 health care professionals,  
239 and 16,900 ventilators provided to Wuhan, to care for the officially recognized 50,000  
240 (cumulative) patients by that time, is also inexplicable, unless most of the infected were admitted  
241 to ICU around the same time.<sup>25</sup>

242           Some researchers have inferred the percentage of undocumented infections, concluding  
243 that approximately 86% of all infections were apparently undocumented and that these were the  
244 source of infection for 79% of documented cases.<sup>30</sup> Scissors, examining out-migrants, has also  
245 pointed out that China's COVID-19 figures are arithmetically impossible.<sup>31</sup> Tsang et. al.

246 estimated that by Feb 20, 2020, there would have been 232,000 (95% CrI (161,000-359,000))  
247 confirmed cases in China as opposed to only 55,508 reported cases.<sup>32</sup> By using high-resolution  
248 domestic travel and infection data, Sanche S et al projected the infected population would be  
249 around 233,400 (95% CI 38,757–778,278) by the end of January.<sup>33</sup> These studies raise similar  
250 concerns about the underreporting of Chinese COVID-19 cases.

### 251 *Correlation our estimates with funeral urn distribution*

252 Since a major data source is the number of cremations in Wuhan, our estimates have been  
253 further verified by the subsequent information of the funeral urn distribution. In late March,  
254 *Newsweek* reported that roughly 5,000 urns were shipped to one of the eight Wuhan cremation  
255 facilities. The number of urns that arrived in that one facility was already about twice of the  
256 city's official overall death from COVID-19 toll.<sup>34</sup> Potential COVID-19 related death counts  
257 from urn distribution for Wuhan could be 35,708 for seven funeral houses (Table 3). This is  
258 consistent with our linear estimate of 36,720, based on the cremation service operation. Both  
259 estimates are more than ten times of the official death toll (2,524 on March 23). Additionally,  
260 neither took into account those potentially processed in the 40 mobile crematories which were  
261 brought to Wuhan after February 19, 2020 for the newly constructed hospitals (Huoshen Shan  
262 and Leishen Shan) and “Fangchang” hospitals.<sup>16,17</sup> The mobile crematory stations can each  
263 process up to five tons of “medical waste” including “animal dead bodies” per day. Thus, the  
264 calculations here could be significant under-estimates.

265

266

267 *Potential starting time for COVID-19 outbreak in Wuhan*

268 As reported by Huang C et al., symptom onset of the first confirmed case was December  
269 1, 2019.<sup>35</sup> Under the assumption of 6.4 doubling time, the start dates implied by this study range  
270 from October 4, 2019 to October 17, 2019. The estimated “implied start dates” are consistent  
271 with other reports where Kristian Andersen suggested a possible “start date” of October 1, 2019  
272 based viral genome analysis.<sup>36</sup> Under the assumption of 2.54 doubling time, the implied start  
273 date is December 14, 2019. However, in this scenario the infection cases were projected to total  
274 2.23 million by February 7, 2020. If the doubling time 2.54 is close to the truth, then China’s  
275 official data under reported by millions. If the doubling time 6.4 is close to the truth, there was  
276 significant under- and delayed reporting of the COVID-19 epidemic information by China in late  
277 January and early February, the critical time for the world to respond and prepare for the  
278 pandemic. Given the serious implications of the COVID-19 pandemic, further investigations into  
279 this period in China needs to be carried out.

280

281 Readers are reminded of the assumptions that underlie our estimates, and they should  
282 therefore be taken as approximate. However, even if there were non-negligible reporting errors  
283 in these new data, the magnitude of the discrepancy between the results from their analysis and  
284 China’s official figures suggests that the potential impact on the global efforts to control the  
285 pandemic is obvious. Transparency in China is of critical importance for the world to learn from  
286 this infection and for those in the future.

287

## 288   **References**

- 289       1. Li Q, Guan X, Wu P, et al. Early Transmission Dynamics in Wuhan, China, of Novel  
290       Coronavirus-Infected Pneumonia. *N Engl J Med*. 2020;382(13):1199-1207.  
291       doi:10.1056/NEJMoa2001316.
- 292       2. Epidemiology Working Group for NCIP Epidemic Response, Chinese Center for Disease  
293       Control and Prevention. The Epidemiological Characteristics of an Outbreak of 2019  
294       Novel Coronavirus Diseases (COVID-19) in China. *Zhonghua Liu Xing Bing Xue Za*  
295       *Zhi*. 2020 Feb 10;41(2):145-151. [Article in Chinese]  
296       <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/32064853/>.
- 297       3. Ma J. Coronavirus: China’s first confirmed Covid-19 case traced back to November 17.  
298       [https://www.scmp.com/news/china/society/article/3074991/coronavirus-chinas-first-](https://www.scmp.com/news/china/society/article/3074991/coronavirus-chinas-first-confirmed-covid-19-case-traced-back)  
299       confirmed-covid-19-case-traced-back Last accessed on May 24, 2020.
- 300       4. 财经-统计数字之外的人：他们死于普通肺炎 [*People outside the statistics: Are they*  
301       *dying from common pneumonia?*]. <https://chinadigitaltimes.net/chinese/2020/02/> Last  
302       accessed February 12, 2020.
- 303       5. [www.gov.cn](http://www.gov.cn).
- 304       6. Yi Cao. “Epidemics in New York worse than Wuhan??” April 4, 2020.  
305       <http://blog.creaders.net/u/11405/202004/370363.html> Last accessed on May 25, 2020.
- 306       7. GM06. “Where do the bodies come from, that cannot be cremated even with all  
307       crematory staff and burners running 24 hours?” February 10, 2020. [https://gnews.org/zh-](https://gnews.org/zh-hans/110207/)  
308       [hans/110207/](https://gnews.org/zh-hans/110207/) Last accessed on May 25, 2020.

- 309 8. Jinxin Kandian. “I am at the first line of Wuhan funeral service, now needs some help”.
- 310 February 15, 2020.
- 311 [https://k.sina.cn/article\\_7280195342\\_1b1eef70e02000pydh.html?from=society](https://k.sina.cn/article_7280195342_1b1eef70e02000pydh.html?from=society) Last
- 312 accessed on May 25, 2020.
- 313 9. Hoonhout, T. Wuhan Residents Dismiss Official Coronavirus Death Toll: ‘The
- 314 Incinerators Have Been Working Around the Clock’ National Review.
- 315 [https://www.nationalreview.com/news/wuhan-residents-dismiss-official-coronavirus-](https://www.nationalreview.com/news/wuhan-residents-dismiss-official-coronavirus-death-toll-the-incinerators-have-been-working-around-the-clock/)
- 316 [death-toll-the-incinerators-have-been-working-around-the-clock/](https://www.nationalreview.com/news/wuhan-residents-dismiss-official-coronavirus-death-toll-the-incinerators-have-been-working-around-the-clock/) Last accessed April 6,
- 317 2020.
- 318 10. He C. Amid virus outbreak, funeral home officials in Wuhan reveal sharp increase in
- 319 cremations. [https://www.theepochtimes.com/exclusive-funeral-homes-in-coronavirus-](https://www.theepochtimes.com/exclusive-funeral-homes-in-coronavirus-ground-zero-cremating-dozens-of-bodies-a-day_3228938.html)
- 320 [ground-zero-cremating-dozens-of-bodies-a-day\\_3228938.html](https://www.theepochtimes.com/exclusive-funeral-homes-in-coronavirus-ground-zero-cremating-dozens-of-bodies-a-day_3228938.html) Last accessed February
- 321 12, 2020.
- 322 11. <https://www.chinatimes.com/cn/realtimenews/20200202001385-260409?chdtv> Last
- 323 accessed May 25, 2020.
- 324 12. “Wuhan funeral service under heavy pressure from the epidemic: Lockdown affects
- 325 processing time, body designated to crematory”. January 31, 2020.
- 326 <http://www.infzm.com/wap/#/content/175645> Last accessed on May 25, 2020.
- 327 13. Wuhan City Administration.
- 328 [http://www.wh.gov.cn/2019\\_web/whyw/201910/t20191021\\_280212.html](http://www.wh.gov.cn/2019_web/whyw/201910/t20191021_280212.html) Last accessed
- 329 February 12, 2020.



- 330 14. “Marked increase during one night! 242 Deaths in Hubei + Funeral staff from all over  
331 China hurried to go to support.” [http://news.migage.com/articles/一夜暴增！湖北242](http://news.migage.com/articles/一夜暴增！湖北242人亡+各地殡葬队急支援_3751982_yahootw.html)  
332 [人亡+各地殡葬队急支援\\_3751982\\_yahootw.html](http://news.migage.com/articles/一夜暴增！湖北242人亡+各地殡葬队急支援_3751982_yahootw.html) Last accessed on May 25, 2020
- 333 15. “Wuhan pneumonia: Henan and Chongqing funeral teams going straight to support  
334 Wuhan.” [https://www.chinapress.com.my/20200213/武汉肺炎-河南重庆-殡葬队-直](https://www.chinapress.com.my/20200213/武汉肺炎-河南重庆-殡葬队-直奔武汉施援手/)  
335 [奔武汉施援手/](https://www.chinapress.com.my/20200213/武汉肺炎-河南重庆-殡葬队-直奔武汉施援手/) Last accessed on May 25, 2020.
- 336 16. [http://www.moe.gov.cn/jyb\\_xwfb/xw\\_zt/moe\\_357/jyzt\\_2020n/2020\\_zt03/zydt/zydt\\_gxdt](http://www.moe.gov.cn/jyb_xwfb/xw_zt/moe_357/jyzt_2020n/2020_zt03/zydt/zydt_gxdt/zydt_gxkx_kjgg/202002/t20200219_422354.html)  
337 [/zydt\\_gxkx\\_kjgg/202002/t20200219\\_422354.html](http://www.moe.gov.cn/jyb_xwfb/xw_zt/moe_357/jyzt_2020n/2020_zt03/zydt/zydt_gxkx_kjgg/202002/t20200219_422354.html) Last accessed May 8, 2020
- 338 17. [http://www.xinhuanet.com/politics/2020-02/21/c\\_1125606332.htm](http://www.xinhuanet.com/politics/2020-02/21/c_1125606332.htm) Last accessed May 8,  
339 2020.
- 340 18. Interim Clinical Guidance for Management of Patients with Confirmed Coronavirus  
341 Disease (COVID-19). [https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/hcp/clinical-](https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/hcp/clinical-guidance-management-patients.html#:~:text=The%20incubation%20period%20for%20COVID,CoV%2D%20infection.)  
342 [guidance-management-](https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/hcp/clinical-guidance-management-patients.html#:~:text=The%20incubation%20period%20for%20COVID,CoV%2D%20infection.)  
343 [patients.html#:~:text=The%20incubation%20period%20for%20COVID,CoV%2D%20i](https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/hcp/clinical-guidance-management-patients.html#:~:text=The%20incubation%20period%20for%20COVID,CoV%2D%20infection.)  
344 [nfection.](https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/hcp/clinical-guidance-management-patients.html#:~:text=The%20incubation%20period%20for%20COVID,CoV%2D%20infection.) Last accessed on May 25, 2020.
- 345 19. Wang W, Tang J, Wei F. Updated understanding of the outbreak of 2019 novel  
346 coronavirus (2019-nCoV) in Wuhan, China. *J Med Virol.* 2020;92(4):441-447.  
347 doi:10.1002/jmv.25689.
- 348 20. Wu JT, Leung K, M Leung GM. Nowcasting and forecasting the potential domestic and  
349 international spread of the 2019-nCoV outbreak originating in Wuhan, China: a

- 350 modelling study. *Lancet* 2020 Jan 31. PII: S0140-6736(20)30260-9. DOI:  
351 10.1016/S0140-6736(20)30260-9.
- 352 21. Muniz-Rodriguez K, Chowell G, Cheung C-H, Jia D, Lai P-Y, Lee Y, et al. Doubling  
353 time of the COVID-19 epidemic by province, China. *Emerg Infect Dis.* 2020 August  
354 [Cited on May 25, 2020]. <http://dx.doi.org/10.3201/eid2608.200219>.
- 355 22. <https://time.com/5783401/covid19-hubei-cases-classification/> Last accessed May 8, 2020.
- 356 23. [www.gov.cn](http://www.gov.cn).
- 357 24. <http://www.nhc.gov.cn/xcs/yqtb/202004/9d15772389c64d478713e710a756b883.shtml>
- 358 25. <http://m.china.caixin.com/m/2020-04-18/101544179.html>.
- 359 26. <https://chinadigitaltimes.net/chinese/2020/04/> 【立此存照】关于加强新冠肺炎科研论  
360 文发表管理 Last accessed May 8, 2020.
- 361 27. Tian H, Liu Y, Li Y, et al. An investigation of transmission control measures during the  
362 first 50 days of the COVID-19 epidemic in China. *Science.* 2020;368(6491):638-642.  
363 doi:10.1126/science.abb6105.
- 364 28. <http://tongji.cnki.net/kns55/navi/YearBook.aspx?id=N2019010138&floor=1> Last  
365 accessed on May 8, 2020.
- 366 29. <https://6do.news/article/2212649-61> Last accessed on May 8, 2020.
- 367 30. Li, R., Pei, S., Chen, B., Song, Y., Zhang, T., Yang, W., & Shaman, J. (2020). Substantial  
368 undocumented infection facilitates the rapid dissemination of novel coronavirus (SARS-  
369 CoV2). *Science.* doi: 10.1126/science.abb3221.

- 370 31. Scissors D. Estimating the true number of China's COVID-19 cases. American  
371 Enterprise Institute. [https://www.aei.org/research-products/report/estimating-the-true-](https://www.aei.org/research-products/report/estimating-the-true-number-of-chinas-covid-19-cases/)  
372 [number-of-chinas-covid-19-cases/](https://www.aei.org/research-products/report/estimating-the-true-number-of-chinas-covid-19-cases/) Last accessed April 22, 2020.
- 373 32. Tsang TK, Wu P, Lin Y, et al. Effect of changing case definitions for COVID-19 on the  
374 epidemic curve and transmission parameters in mainland China: a modelling study.  
375 Lancet Public Health. 2020 Apr 21. pii: S2468-2667(20)30089-X. doi: 10.1016/S2468-  
376 2667(20)30089-X.
- 377 33. Sanche S, Lin YT, Xu C, Romero-Severson E, Hengartner N, Ke R. High contagiousness  
378 and rapid spread of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2. Emerg Infect Dis.  
379 2020 Jul [cited on June 3, 2020]. <https://doi.org/10.3201/eid2607.200282> DOI:  
380 10.3201/eid2607.200282
- 381 34. Newsweek. March 29, 2020. [https://www.newsweek.com/wuhan-covid-19-death-toll-](https://www.newsweek.com/wuhan-covid-19-death-toll-may-tens-thousands-data-cremations-shipments-urns-suggest-1494914)  
382 [may-tens-thousands-data-cremations-shipments-urns-suggest-1494914.](https://www.newsweek.com/wuhan-covid-19-death-toll-may-tens-thousands-data-cremations-shipments-urns-suggest-1494914)
- 383 35. Huang C, Wang Y, Li X, et al. Clinical features of patients infected with 2019 novel  
384 coronavirus in Wuhan, China. *Lancet* 2020 Jan 15.
- 385 36. Cohen J. Wuhan seafood market may not be source of novel virus spreading globally.  
386 [https://www.sciencemag.org/news/2020/01/wuhan-seafood-market-may-not-be-source-](https://www.sciencemag.org/news/2020/01/wuhan-seafood-market-may-not-be-source-novel-virus-spreading-globally)  
387 [novel-virus-spreading-globally](https://www.sciencemag.org/news/2020/01/wuhan-seafood-market-may-not-be-source-novel-virus-spreading-globally) Last accessed February 18, 2020.

388

389

390

**Table 1. Crematory Facilities and Operation in Wuhan, China**

	<b>Before lockdown on January 23, 2020</b>	<b>From January 25 to February 19, 2020</b>	<b>After February 19, 2020</b>
<b>Crematory facilities</b>	86 cremation furnaces*	86 cremation furnaces*	86 cremation furnaces* 40 mobile crematory stations
<b>Crematory operation</b>	Four hours per day	24 hours per day	24 hours per day
<b>Crematory capacity</b>	Approximately 136 per day	816 per day (full capacity) 2,064 (maximum capacity) **	2,064 and 200 tons per day (5 tons “medical waste” including “animal bodies” per mobile crematory station, total capacity 5x40 = 200 tons)

\* The furnace information is for seven funeral houses, Hankou, Wuchang, Qingshan, Caidian District, JiangXia Distric, Huangpi District, Xinzhou District. Muslim Funeral House is not included in the table above, since the information there is scarce.

\*\* The maximum capacity is calculated for the seven funeral houses, assuming non-stop cremation, and simplified procedure, since no farewell ceremony was allowed during lockdown period.

**Table 2. Official COVID-19 Epidemic Data in Wuhan and China from January 23 to April 17, 2020**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Cumulative confirmed infections in Wuhan</b>	<b>Cumulative deaths in Wuhan</b>	<b>Fatality rate in Wuhan</b>	<b>Cumulative confirmed infections in China</b>	<b>Cumulative deaths in China</b>	<b>Fatality rate in China</b>	<b>Confirmed cases W/C</b>	<b>Deaths W/C</b>
<b>23-Jan</b> (lockdown)	495							
25-Jan	618							
4-Feb	8351	362	4.33%	24324	490	2.01%	34.3%	73.9%
5-Feb	10117	417	4.12%	28018	563	2.01%	36.1%	74.1%
6-Feb	11618	478	4.11%	31161	636	2.04%	37.3%	75.2%
7-Feb	13603	545	4.01%	34546	722	2.09%	39.4%	75.5%
8-Feb	14982	608	4.00%	37198	811	2.18%	40.3%	75.0%
9-Feb	16902	681	4.03%	40171	908	2.26%	42.1%	75.0%
10-Feb	18454	748	4.05%	42638	1016	2.38%	43.3%	73.6%
11-Feb	19558	820	4.19%	44653	1113	2.49%	43.8%	73.7%
<b>12-Feb</b>	32994	1036	3.14%	59804	1367	2.29%	55.2%	75.8%
13-Feb	35991	1016	2.82%	63851	1380	2.16%	56.4%	73.6%
<b>23-March</b>	50006	2524	5.05%	81171	3277	4.04%	61.6%	77.0%
11-April	50008	2577	5.15%	82052	3339	4.07%	60.9%	77.2%
<b>17-April</b>	50,333	3,859	7.69%	82,692	4,632	5.60%	60.9%	83.3%

**Table 3. Estimates of COVID-19 Outbreak in Wuhan, China for Feb 7 and Feb 12, 2020**

Date	Methodology	Doubling Time	Daily Deaths	Cumulative Deaths	Fatality Rate	Daily Cases	Total Cases	Implied Starting Date
7-Feb	Exponential Model <i>95% confidence interval</i>	6.4 (5.8, 7.1)	680	6,946 (6,486, 7,529)	2.50% (assumed)	130,600 (111,900, 153,590)	1,272,400 (1,091,200, 1,363,500)	4-Oct-19
7-Feb	Exponential Model <i>95% confidence interval</i>	6.4 (5.8, 7.1)	680	7,223 (6,348, 7,596)	5.00% (assumed)	66,810 (55,650, 74,980)	650,900 (598,300, 665,700)	11-Oct-19
7-Feb	Exponential Model <i>95% confidence interval</i>	6.4 (5.8, 7.1)	680	6,811 (6,215, 7,663)	10.00% (assumed)	31,300 (28,100, 36,610)	305,000 (302,100, 325,000)	17-Oct-19
7-Feb	Exponential Model* <i>95% confidence interval</i>	2.54 (2.44, 2.64)	680	3,097 (2,812, 3,394)	3.14%	257,000 (241,000, 274,300)	2,230,500 (2,121,900, 2,375,000)	14-Dec-19
7-Feb	Chinese official	2.54**	67	545	3.14%	1,985	13,603	NA
12-Feb	Chinese official	NA	216	1,036	3.14%	13,436	32,994	NA
12-Feb	Linear Calculation**	NA	680	408 x 13 + 680 x 6 = 9,384	3.14%	21,656	298,854	NA

\* From the 45<sup>th</sup> day, the model was modified so that  $n(t) = e^{\lambda} \left(1 - \frac{N(t-1)}{P}\right)^{\frac{1}{S}} n(t-1)$ , where  $P$  is the population after lock down.

\*\* The doubling time was derived by Rodriguez et al. using Chinese official data.

\*\*\* In the linear calculation methodology, we assumed constant daily death from Jan 25-Feb 12, and the total confirmed cases were only calculated to reflect the accumulated cases within 19 days.

**Table 4. Estimate of COVID-19 Related Deaths in Wuhan, China up to March 23, 2020**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Methodology</b>	<b>Announced or Estimated Accumulated Death</b>	<b>Note</b>	<b>Announced or Implied Infections***</b>
23-Mar	Chinese official announcement	2,524		50,006
23-Mar	Funeral Urn distribution*	35,708 = 45,500 - 9,792	45,500 = 7 x 500 x 13 (3/23 – 4/4) 9,792= 136 x 72 (1/23 – 4/4)	707,089
23-Mar	Assumed constant daily** death	36,720	80% cremation utilization from Jan 23 to Feb 6; 100% cremation utilization from Feb 7 to Mar 22	727,128

\* This information only includes seven crematories. There are eight in Wuhan (see appendix 1).

\*\* This does not include potential cremations performed in the 40 mobile crematory stations set up in Wuhan after February 19, 2020.

\*\*\* Based on officially announced Wuhan fatality rate 5.05% on March 23, 2020

**Table 5. Medical Resources Available in Wuhan after Lockdown (January 23, 2020)**

<b>Item</b>	<b>Wuhan local existing<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Local addition or Support from other places in China</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Official cumulative cases</b>
<b>Hospital beds</b>	95,277 <sup>2</sup>	Local goal for “bed reserve” 50,000 by Feb-10, 2020 80,000 by Feb-15,2020 100,000 by Feb-20,2020	By Feb-25,2020 including 24,387 <sup>3</sup> from Designated Hospitals, additional 86,000 bed reserve from remodeling	47,741 on Feb 25, 2020
<b>Health care professional</b>	136,300 (including 39,600 licensed doctors and 54,400 registered nurses)	42,600 from January 24 to March 8, 2020	178,900	49,948 on Mar 8, 2020
<b>Ventilator</b>	Not found	By March 3, 2020 16,900 delivered to Wuhan <sup>4</sup>	Estimated as 20,000	49,540 on Mar 3, 2020

Note 1: Wuhan health resources has been increasing annually, the above statistics was based on the data at the end of 2018, from Wuhan Health Commission 2018 Annual Report, published on May 28, 2020. [http://wjw.wuhan.gov.cn/zwgk\\_28/tjsj/202005/P020200528783977258205.pdf](http://wjw.wuhan.gov.cn/zwgk_28/tjsj/202005/P020200528783977258205.pdf), last accessed on 6/12/2020.

Note 2: on Jan 22, 2020, seven hospitals were designated for COVID patients. By Feb 25, 2020, 55 hospitals became COVID designated.

Note 3: <http://www.bjnews.com.cn/inside/2020/03/09/701141.html> Last accessed on 6/11/2020

Note 4: [http://www.gov.cn/fuwu/2020-03/04/content\\_5486929.htm](http://www.gov.cn/fuwu/2020-03/04/content_5486929.htm). Last accessed on 6/11/2020, including 2,900 invasive ventilator and 140,000 non-invasive ventilators



### Appendix 1. Eight Crematories/Funeral Houses in Wuhan <sup>6,7</sup>

Name of crematory	Number of cremation furnaces	Annual processing (before lockdown)	Daily processing (before lockdown)
Hankou (汉口殡仪馆)	30	7,000	19
Wuchang (武昌殡仪馆)	18	7,000	19
Jiangxia (江夏殡仪馆)	7	3,800	10
Wuhan Huangpi District (武汉黄陂区殡仪馆)	7	7,000	19
Xinzhou District (新洲区殡仪馆)	5	6,000	16
Wuhan City Qingshan (武汉市青山殡仪馆)	7	3,700	10
Caidian District Yusun Mountain (蔡甸区玉笋山殡仪馆)	12	14,785	41
<b>Total (for seven)</b>	<b>86</b>	<b>49,285</b>	<b>135</b>
Muslim	Information not found	Information not found	Information not found

**Note:** During normal times, it takes about 2 hours to cremate one body. During lockdown, the process was simplified and it took about one hour to process each body. If seven crematories operate 24 hours nonstop, the maximal number would be  $86 \times 24 = 2,064$ .