Risk and protective factors of SARS-CoV-2 infection – Meta-regression of data from worldwide nations

Hisato Takagi, MD, PhD, Toshiki Kuno, MD, PhD, Yujiro Yokoyama, MD, Hiroki Ueyama, MD, Takuya Matsushiro, MD, Yosuke Hari, MD, Tomo Ando, MD

Author Affiliations: Shizuoka Medical Center, Shizuoka, Japan; Kitasato University School of Medicine, Sagamihara, Japan (HT, TM, YH); Mount Sinai Beth Israel Medical Center, New York, NY (TK, HU); Easton Hospital, Easton, PA (YY), and New York Presbyterian Hospital/Columbia University Medical Center, New York, NY (TA).

Corresponding Authors: Hisato Takagi, MD, PhD, Department of Cardiovascular Surgery, Shizuoka Medical Center, 762-1 Nagasawa, Shimizu-cho, Sunto-gun, Shizuoka 411-8611, Japan (kfgth973@ybb.ne.jp).

Author Contributions: HT had full access to all of the data in the study and takes responsibility for the integrity of the data and the accuracy of the data analysis.

Concept and design: HT; *Acquisition, analysis, or interpretation of data:* HT, TK, YH, TA; *Drafting of the manuscript:* HT; *Critical revision of the manuscript for important intellectual content:* TK, YH, TA; *Statistical analysis:* HT, TK, TA; *Administrative, technical, or material support:* YY, HU, TM; *Supervision:* TA.

Conflict of Interest Disclosures: None reported.

Abstract

Although it has been reported that coexistent chronic diseases are strongly associated with COVID-19 severity, investigations of predictors for SARS-CoV-2 infection itself have been seldom performed. To screen potential risk and protective factors for SARS-CoV-2 infection, meta-regression of data from worldwide nations were herein conducted. We extracted total confirmed COVID-19 cases in worldwide 180 nations (May 31, 2020), nation total population, population ages 0-14/ ≥ 65 , GDP/GNI per capita, PPP, life expectancy at birth, medical-doctor and nursing/midwifery-personnel density, hypertension/obesity/diabetes prevalence, annual PM2.5 concentrations, daily ultraviolet radiation, population using safely-managed drinking-water/sanitation services and hand-washing facility with soap/water, inbound tourism, and bachelor's or equivalent (ISCED 6). Restricted maximum-likelihood meta-regression in the random-effects model was performed using Comprehensive Meta-Analysis version 3. To adjust for other covariates, we conducted the hierarchical multivariate models. A slope (coefficient) of the meta-regression line for the COVID-19 prevalence was significantly negative for population ages 0-14 (-0.0636 ; $P = .0021$) and positive for obesity prevalence (0.0411 ; $P = .0099$) and annual PM2.5 concentrations in urban areas (0.0158 ; $P = .0454$), which would indicate that the COVID-19 prevalence decreases significantly as children increase and that the COVID-19 prevalence increases significantly as the obese and PM2.5 increase. In conclusion, children (negatively) and obesity/PM2.5 (positively) may be independently associated with SARS-CoV-2 infection.

Introduction

It has been reported that coexistent chronic diseases are strongly associated with coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) severity.¹ Investigations of predictors for severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) infection itself, however, have been seldom performed. Although meta-regression has been traditionally utilized to investigate heterogeneity in meta-analysis,² that considering a nation as a study in meta-analysis may be of use to screen potential risk and protective factors for SARS-CoV-2 infection. To screen the factors, meta-regression of data from worldwide nations were herein conducted.

Methods

We extracted 1) total confirmed COVID-19 cases in worldwide 180 nations on May 31, 2020 from the "COVID-2019 situation reports" (<https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019/situation-reports/>) of the World Health Organization (WHO); 2) national total population (thousands) in 2018, life expectancy at birth (years) in 2016, medical-doctor and nursing/midwifery-personnel density (/10,000 population) in 2010–2018, hypertension prevalence (%) in 2015, obesity prevalence (%) in 2016, annual particulate matter 2.5 (PM2.5) concentrations in urban areas ($\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$) in 2016, population using safely-managed drinking-water/sanitation services and hand-washing facility with soap/water (%) in 2017, and daily ambient ultraviolet radiation (J/m^2) in 1997–2003 from the "World Health Statistics 2020: Monitoring health for the Sustainable Development Goals" (https://www.who.int/gho/publications/world_health_statistics/2020/en/) and "Public health and environment" (<https://apps.who.int/gho/data/node.main.122?lang=en>) of the

WHO; 3) population ages 0-14 and ≥ 65 (%) in 2018, GDP [Gross Domestic Product] and GNI [Gross National Income] per capita, PPP [Purchasing Power Parity] (current international \$) in 2016–2018 (mostly 2018), and diabetes prevalence (%) in 2019 from the World Bank (<https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/>); 4) inbound tourism (thousands) in 2014–2018 from the UNWTO [World Tourism Organization of the United Nations] (<https://www.e-unwto.org/doi/abs/10.5555/unwtotfb0000270020142018202001>); and 5) bachelor's or equivalent (ISCED [International Standard Classification of Education] 6) (%) in 2016–2018 from the UNESCO [United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization] (<http://uis.unesco.org/en/topic/educational-attainment>) (**Table 1**). Restricted maximum-likelihood meta-regression in the random-effects model was performed using Comprehensive Meta-Analysis version 3 (Biostat, Englewood, NJ, USA). A meta-regression graph depicted the COVID-19 prevalence (%) (plotted as the logarithm-transformed prevalence on the y-axis) as a function of a given covariate (plotted on the x-axis). To adjust for other covariates, we conducted the hierarchical multivariate models in addition to the univariate model.

Results

Results of the meta-regression were summarized in **Table 2**. A slope (coefficient) of the meta-regression line for the COVID-19 prevalence in the multivariable models was significantly negative for population ages 0-14 (coefficient, -0.0636 ; $P = .0021$; **Figure 1A**) and positive for obesity prevalence (coefficient, 0.0411 ; $P = .0099$; **Figure 1B**) and annual PM2.5 concentrations in urban areas (coefficient, 0.0158 ; $P = .0454$; **Figure 1C**), which would indicate that the COVID-19 prevalence decreases significantly as children

increase and that the COVID-19 prevalence increases significantly as the obese and PM2.5 increase.

Discussion

The present meta-regression to screen potential risk and protective factors suggests that children may be negatively and independently, and obesity/PM2.5 may be positively and independently associated with SARS-CoV-2 infection. Our findings could be strengthened by low case fatality in children with COVID-19 (only one death in a total of 1124 cases)³ and obesity predicting poor prognosis of COVID-19⁴ demonstrated in recent systematic reviews. The present results, however, never denote directly that, for instance, the obese are at high risk for SARS-CoV-2 infection, which should be noted. Our findings demonstrate simply that the COVID-19 prevalence is higher in the nation where the obese are more. To determine whether, for instance, the obese are at high risk for SARS-CoV-2 infection, two approaches are considered. First, potential risk and protective factors could be investigated in both COVID-19 patients and non-COVID-19 subjects in a community. It is never facile, however, to investigate the factors in the non-COVID-19 (healthy) subjects in the community. Second, the factors could be examined in both COVID-19 patients and control subjects. In this occasion, however, the control subjects, who should be well comparable to the COVID-19 patients, must be strictly selected. Meta-regression using "weighted" data from multiple clinical trials differs from simple regression using individual-patient data from a single study and accordingly can generate an equation of a "best-fit" regression line to express the relation between an outcome and a covariate.⁵ Meta-regression applied in the present study may

be alternative to the above-mentioned approaches and could be of use at least to screen the factors.

Conclusion

Children (negatively) and obesity/PM2.5 (positively) may be independently associated with SARS-CoV-2 infection.

References

1. Liu H, Chen S, Liu M, Nie H, Lu H. Comorbid Chronic Diseases are Strongly Correlated with Disease Severity among COVID-19 Patients: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Aging Dis.* 2020 May 9;11(3):668-678. doi: 10.14336/AD.2020.0502
2. Deeks JJ, Higgins JPT, Altman DG, eds. Chapter 10: Analysing data and undertaking meta-analyses. In: Higgins JPT, Thomas J, Chandler J, et al, eds. *Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions* version 6.0 (updated July 2019). Cochrane, 2019. <https://training.cochrane.org/handbook>. Accessed June 1, 2020.
3. de Souza TH, Nadal JA, Nogueira RJN, Pereira RM, Brandão MB. Clinical Manifestations of Children with COVID-19: a Systematic Review. *Pediatr Pulmonol.* Published online Jun 3, 2020. doi: 10.1002/ppul.24885
4. Tamara A, Tahapary DL. Obesity as a predictor for a poor prognosis of COVID-19: A systematic review. *Diabetes Metab Syndr.* 2020;14(4):655-659. doi: 10.1016/j.dsx.2020.05.020
5. Baker WL, White CM, Cappelleri JC, Kluger J, Coleman CI; Health Outcomes, Policy, and Economics (HOPE) Collaborative Group. Understanding heterogeneity in meta-analysis: the role of meta-regression. *Int J Clin Pract.* 2009;63(10):1426-1434. doi: 10.1111/j.1742-1241.2009.02168.x

Figure legends

Figure 1. Meta-Regression Lines with their 95% Confidence-Interval Curves Depicting the COVID-19 Prevalence (Plotted as the Logarithm-Transformed Prevalence on the Y-Axis) as a Function of a Given Covariate (Plotted on the X-Axis)

Table 1. Data from Worldwide Nations

Nation	Total confirmed cases	Total population (thousands)	Cases per 100,000 population	Population ages 0-14 (%)	Population ages ≥65 (%)	GDP per capita, PPP (current international \$)	GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	Life expectancy at birth (years)	Medical-doctor density (/10,000 population)	Nursing/midwifery-personnel density (/10,000 population)
Afghanistan	15094	37172	40.61	43	3	2225.8	2240	62.6	2.8	1.8
Albania	1136	2883	39.40	18	14	13835.5	13820	76.4	12.2	36.5
Algeria	9267	42228	21.95	30	6	11759.2	11370	76.4	17.2	15.5
Andorra	764	77	992.21	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	33.3	40.1
Angola	84	30810	0.27	47	2	7093.0	6780	62.6	2.1	4.1
Antigua and Barbuda	25	96	26.04	22	9	21630.2	20520	75.0	29.6	45.2
Argentina	14702	44361	33.14	25	11	23300.0	22470	76.9	39.9	26.0
Armenia	9282	2952	314.43	21	11	13024.7	13190	74.8	44.0	61.1
Australia	7185	24898	28.86	19	16	51036.4	49440	82.9	36.8	125.5
Austria	16638	8891	187.13	14	19	56871.2	56720	81.8	51.7	2.6
Azerbaijan	5246	9950	52.72	23	6	14543.2	13780	73.1	34.5	64.3
Bahamas	101	386	26.17	22	7	36365.3	34370	75.7	20.1	45.7
Bahrain	10793	1569	687.89	19	2	47297.0	44700	79.1	9.3	24.9
Bangladesh	44608	161377	27.64	28	5	4549.6	4760	72.7	5.8	4.1
Barbados	92	287	32.06	17	16	16107.0	14140	75.6	24.8	30.6
Belarus	41658	9453	440.69	17	15	19345.3	18650	74.2	51.9	110.0
Belgium	58186	11482	506.76	17	19	52254.0	52590	81.1	30.7	194.6
Belize	18	383	4.70	30	5	7360.0	6650	70.5	11.2	23.4
Benin	232	11485	2.02	42	3	3237.8	3200	61.1	0.8	3.9
Bhutan	33	754	4.38	26	6	11621.8	10580	70.6	4.2	18.5
Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	8731	11353	76.90	31	7	8866.4	8640	71.5	15.9	15.6
Bosnia and Herzegovina	2493	3324	75.00	15	16	14962.0	14920	77.3	21.6	57.3
Botswana	35	2254	1.55	34	4	18059.3	17460	66.1	5.3	54.0
Brazil	465166	209469	222.07	21	9	14951.8	14530	75.1	21.6	101.2
Brunei Darussalam	141	429	32.87	23	5	61859.9	62820	76.4	16.1	59.0
Bulgaria	2513	7052	35.64	15	21	22304.9	22650	74.9	40.3	48.2
Burkina Faso	853	19751	4.32	45	2	1904.9	1890	60.3	0.8	8.8
Burundi	42	11175	0.38	46	2	780.1	780	60.1	1.0	8.5
Cabo Verde	421	544	77.39	29	5	7068.1	6900	73.2	7.8	13.0

Cambodia	125	16250	0.77	31	5	4261.8	3970	69.4	1.9	6.9
Cameroon	5659	25216	22.44	43	3	3691.3	3610	58.1	0.9	0.1
Canada	89741	37075	242.05	16	17	49994.1	49430	82.8	23.1	99.4
Central African Republic	874	4666	18.73	44	3	955.8	1030	53.0	0.7	2.1
Chad	759	15478	4.90	47	2	1618.9	1590	54.3	0.4	2.3
Chile	94858	18729	506.48	20	12	24763.0	23750	79.5	25.9	133.2
China	84570	1435651	5.89	18	11	15376.2	15320	76.4	19.8	26.6
Colombia	26688	49661	53.74	23	8	14834.4	15320	75.1	21.8	13.3
Comoros	43	832	5.17	40	3	3141.5	3160	63.9	2.7	6.3
Congo	587	5244	11.19	42	3	3357.6	3000	64.3	1.6	6.3
Costa Rica	1022	4999	20.44	21	10	19762.5	18670	79.6	28.9	34.1
Côte d'Ivoire	2799	25069	11.17	42	3	3832.1	3660	N/A	2.3	6.0
Croatia	2246	4156	54.04	15	20	28115.5	27700	78.2	30.0	81.2
Cuba	2025	11338	17.86	16	15	N/A	N/A	79.0	84.2	75.6
Cyprus	943	1189	79.31	17	14	38513.3	39880	80.7	19.5	52.5
Czechia	9230	10666	86.54	16	19	40428.7	38180	79.1	41.2	84.0
Democratic Republic of the Congo	2965	84068	3.53	46	3	1111.7	1070	60.5	0.7	11.1
Denmark	11633	5752	202.24	16	20	57218.4	57980	81.2	40.1	103.2
Djibouti	3194	959	333.06	30	5	5225.0	5400	63.8	2.2	7.3
Dominica	16	72	22.22	N/A	N/A	11814.3	10900	N/A	11.2	64.4
Dominican Republic	16908	10627	159.10	28	7	18143.2	17330	73.5	15.3	13.8
Ecuador	38571	17084	225.77	28	7	11853.7	11530	76.5	20.4	25.1
Egypt	23449	98424	23.82	34	5	11643.2	11350	70.5	4.5	19.3
El Salvador	2395	6421	37.30	27	8	8816.6	8320	73.7	15.7	18.3
Equatorial Guinea	1043	1309	79.68	37	2	20855.8	15750	59.5	4.0	5.0
Eritrea	39	3453	1.13	N/A	4	N/A	N/A	65.0	0.6	14.4
Estonia	1865	1323	140.97	16	20	36358.0	35340	77.8	44.8	111.6
Eswatini	283	1136	24.91	38	4	8815.7	8820	N/A	3.3	41.4
Ethiopia	1063	109224	0.97	41	4	2154.4	2140	65.5	0.8	7.1
Fiji	18	883	2.04	30	5	14144.4	13180	69.9	8.6	33.8
Finland	6826	5523	123.59	16	22	49549.4	49720	81.4	38.1	147.4
France	148436	64991	228.39	18	20	46447.4	47490	82.9	32.7	114.7
Gabon	2613	2119	123.31	37	4	15102.5	14110	66.4	6.8	29.5
Gambia	25	2280	1.10	44	3	2196.5	2160	61.9	1.0	15.4

Georgia	783	4003	19.56	20	15	14594.7	13980	72.6	71.2	47.3
Germany	181482	83124	218.33	14	21	54456.9	55980	80.9	42.5	132.4
Ghana	7768	29767	26.10	38	3	5321.0	5220	63.4	1.4	42.0
Greece	2915	10522	27.70	14	22	30357.6	30430	81.1	54.8	36.3
Grenada	23	111	20.72	24	10	17234.7	15620	73.4	14.1	62.8
Guatemala	4607	17248	26.71	34	5	8655.4	8500	73.2	3.5	0.7
Guinea	3706	12414	29.85	44	3	2555.9	2510	59.8	0.8	1.2
Guinea-Bissau	1256	1874	67.02	42	3	1996.7	1990	59.8	1.3	6.9
Guyana	150	779	19.26	28	6	9539.0	9300	66.2	8.0	10.4
Haiti	1584	11123	14.24	33	5	1810.2	1820	63.5	2.3	6.8
Honduras	4886	9588	50.96	32	5	5810.4	5350	75.2	3.1	7.4
Hungary	3867	9708	39.83	14	19	31578.8	30310	76.0	34.1	69.2
Iceland	1806	337	535.91	20	15	58058.2	55920	82.4	40.8	162.1
India	182143	1352642	13.47	27	6	6697.2	6630	68.8	8.6	17.3
Indonesia	25773	267671	9.63	27	6	11646.5	11290	69.3	4.3	24.1
Iran (Islamic Republic of)	148950	81800	182.09	24	6	14535.9	14560	75.7	15.8	4.4
Iraq	6179	38434	16.08	38	3	10919.9	10780	69.9	7.1	20.4
Ireland	24929	4819	517.31	21	14	84459.8	68060	81.5	33.1	161.0
Israel	17012	8382	202.96	28	12	40261.3	40280	82.3	46.2	3.3
Italy	232664	60627	383.76	13	23	42798.1	43260	82.7	39.8	57.4
Jamaica	575	2935	19.59	24	9	9975.2	9520	76.0	13.1	8.1
Japan	16851	127202	13.25	13	28	41473.3	43010	84.2	24.1	121.5
Jordan	734	9965	7.37	34	4	10094.0	10050	74.3	23.2	28.2
Kazakhstan	10858	18320	59.27	28	7	26172.4	22950	71.1	39.8	72.9
Kenya	1888	51393	3.67	40	2	4294.9	4260	66.7	1.6	11.7
Kuwait	26192	4137	633.12	22	3	51708.3	59760	74.8	26.5	74.1
Kyrgyzstan	1748	6304	27.73	32	4	5245.1	5110	71.4	22.1	59.4
Lao People's Democratic Republic	19	7061	0.27	33	4	7777.8	7410	65.8	3.7	9.5
Latvia	1065	1928	55.24	16	20	30744.8	30220	75.1	31.9	47.5
Lebanon	1191	6859	17.36	26	7	16416.9	16330	76.3	21.0	16.7
Lesotho	2	2108	0.09	33	5	3068.2	3500	52.9	0.7	32.6
Liberia	280	4819	5.81	41	3	1533.5	1330	62.9	0.4	5.3
Libya	130	6679	1.95	28	4	14423.3	14820	71.9	20.9	65.3
Lithuania	1670	2801	59.62	15	20	35831.9	34680	75.0	63.5	98.5
Luxembourg	4016	604	664.90	16	14	116786.5	74400	82.5	30.1	121.7
Madagascar	758	26262	2.89	41	3	1652.4	1600	66.1	1.8	1.5

Malawi	279	18143	1.54	44	3	1071.3	1070	64.2	0.4	4.4
Malaysia	7762	31528	24.62	24	7	28207.7	27200	75.3	15.4	34.7
Maldives	1672	516	324.03	20	4	18959.4	17480	78.4	45.6	64.3
Mali	1250	19078	6.55	48	3	2344.3	2280	58.0	1.3	3.6
Malta	616	439	140.32	14	20	43538.5	40120	81.4	28.6	94.8
Mauritania	483	4403	10.97	40	3	3802.9	3770	63.9	1.9	9.3
Mauritius	335	1267	26.44	18	11	22752.2	24980	74.8	25.3	35.2
Mexico	84627	126191	67.06	27	7	20396.5	19870	76.6	23.8	24.0
Monaco	98	39	251.28	N/A	N/A	12564.9	N/A	N/A	75.1	201.6
Mongolia	179	3170	5.65	30	4	12203.5	11050	69.8	28.6	38.9
Montenegro	324	628	51.59	18	15	21301.5	21550	76.8	27.6	52.3
Morocco	7780	36029	21.59	27	7	8611.7	8430	76.0	7.3	13.9
Mozambique	244	29496	0.83	45	3	1321.0	1290	60.1	0.8	6.8
Myanmar	224	53708	0.42	26	6	4996.0	4860	66.8	6.8	10.0
Namibia	23	2448	0.94	37	4	10704.7	10490	63.7	4.2	19.5
Nepal	1401	28096	4.99	30	6	3330.6	3360	70.2	7.5	31.1
Netherlands	46257	17060	271.14	16	19	57565.2	58140	81.6	36.1	111.8
New Zealand	1154	4743	24.33	20	16	42193.8	40550	82.2	35.9	124.5
Nicaragua	885	6466	13.69	30	5	5833.6	5700	75.5	9.8	15.3
Niger	956	22443	4.26	50	3	888.8	870	59.8	0.4	2.7
Nigeria	9855	195875	5.03	44	3	5281.4	5040	55.2	3.8	11.8
North Macedonia	2164	2083	103.89	17	14	16624.9	15930	N/A	28.7	37.9
Norway	8411	5338	157.57	18	17	67640.2	70530	82.5	29.2	182.2
Oman	10423	4829	215.84	22	2	29289.7	29160	77.0	20.0	42.0
Pakistan	69496	212228	32.75	35	4	4854.9	29160	66.5	9.8	6.7
Panama	12531	4177	300.00	27	8	31834.0	29340	78.0	15.7	30.7
Papua New Guinea	8	8606	0.09	36	3	4336.2	4220	65.9	0.7	4.5
Paraguay	964	6956	13.86	29	6	13204.3	12830	74.2	13.5	16.6
Peru	148285	31989	463.55	26	8	13093.7	12450	75.9	13.0	24.4
Philippines	17224	106651	16.15	31	5	8321.2	9980	69.3	6.0	49.4
Poland	23571	37922	62.16	15	18	31755.8	30410	77.7	23.8	68.9
Portugal	32203	10256	313.99	13	22	34272.0	33520	81.4	51.2	69.7
Qatar	55262	2782	1986.41	14	1	96804.7	94910	78.1	24.9	72.6
Republic of Korea	11468	51172	22.41	13	14	39660.9	39630	82.7	23.6	73.0
Republic of Moldova	8098	4052	199.85	16	11	12564.9	13170	71.5	32.1	49.2
Romania	19133	19506	98.09	16	18	29061.3	28350	75.2	29.8	73.9

Russian Federation	405843	145734	278.48	18	15	28556.3	27840	72.0	37.5	85.4
Rwanda	359	12302	2.92	40	3	2114.1	2070	68.0	1.3	12.0
Saint Kitts and Nevis	15	52	28.85	N/A	N/A	26530.9	25060	N/A	26.8	42.2
Saint Lucia	18	182	9.89	19	10	13960.4	13060	75.6	6.4	31.5
Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	25	110	22.73	23	10	12770.1	12640	72.0	6.6	70.1
San Marino	687	34	2020.59	N/A	N/A	63037.1	N/A	N/A	61.1	82.1
São Tomé and Príncipe	295	211	139.81	43	3	4,040.90	4060	68.7	0.5	19.2
Saudi Arabia	83384	33703	247.41	25	3	48756.2	49200	74.8	26.1	54.8
Senegal	3535	15854	22.30	43	3	3430.2	3330	66.8	0.7	3.1
Serbia	11381	8803	129.29	16	18	17617.0	16710	76.3	31.1	60.9
Seychelles	11	97	11.34	24	8	28243.3	26920	73.3	21.2	80.8
Sierra Leone	852	7650	11.14	41	3	1703.8	1580	53.1	0.3	2.2
Singapore	34366	5758	596.84	12	11	98827.4	92150	82.9	22.9	62.4
Slovakia	1521	5453	27.89	15	16	32616.6	31960	77.4	34.2	3.2
Slovenia	1473	2078	70.89	15	20	38749.3	31960	80.9	30.9	99.7
Somalia	1916	15008	12.77	47	3	N/A	860	55.4	0.2	1.1
South Africa	30967	57793	53.58	29	5	12938.4	12530	63.6	9.1	13.1
South Sudan	994	10976	9.06	42	3	N/A	N/A	58.6	N/A	N/A
Spain	239600	46693	513.14	15	19	40483.6	40570	83.0	38.7	57.3
Sri Lanka	1620	21229	7.63	24	10	13254.7	12900	75.3	10.0	21.8
Sudan	4800	41802	11.48	41	4	4767.7	4430	65.1	2.6	7.0
Suriname	12	576	2.08	27	7	16151.2	14390	71.8	12.1	27.6
Sweden	37113	9972	372.17	18	20	53807.9	54640	82.3	39.8	118.2
Switzerland	30762	8526	360.80	15	19	69366.4	70140	83.3	43.0	175.4
Syrian Arab Republic	122	16945	0.72	31	5	N/A	N/A	63.8	12.9	15.4
Tajikistan	3807	9101	41.83	37	3	3313.5	3890	70.8	21.0	47.5
Thailand	3081	69428	4.44	17	12	18481.9	17650	75.5	8.1	27.6
The United Kingdom	272830	67142	406.35	18	18	46867.9	46240	81.4	28.1	81.7
Timor-Leste	24	1268	1.89	38	4	3154.9	4520	68.6	7.2	16.7
Togo	428	7889	5.43	41	3	1590.4	1600	60.6	0.8	4.1
Trinidad and Tobago	116	1390	8.35	20	11	26912.9	26050	71.8	41.7	40.9
Tunisia	1076	11565	9.30	24	8	11009.5	10630	76.0	13.0	25.1

Turkey	163103	82340	198.08	25	8	28139.1	27710	76.4	18.5	27.1
Uganda	446	42729	1.04	47	2	1837.2	1780	62.5	1.7	12.4
Ukraine	23672	44246	53.50	16	16	9249.5	9030	72.5	29.9	66.6
United Arab Emirates	33896	9631	351.95	15	1	67549.6	67870	77.2	25.3	57.3
United Republic of Tanzania	509	56313	0.90	44	3	3240.3	3140	63.9	0.1	5.8
United States of America	1716078	327096	524.64	19	16	62886.8	63780	78.6	26.1	145.5
Uruguay	816	3449	23.66	21	15	22116.8	20590	77.4	50.8	19.4
Uzbekistan	3554	32476	10.94	29	4	6898.9	7110	72.3	23.7	112.8
Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	1370	28887	4.74	28	7	N/A	N/A	74.1	N/A	9.4
Viet Nam	328	95546	0.34	23	7	7771.2	7230	76.3	8.3	14.5
Yemen	314	28499	1.10	40	3	N/A	N/A	65.3	5.3	7.9
Zambia	1057	17352	6.09	45	2	3599.0	3500	62.3	11.9	13.4
Zimbabwe	174	14439	1.21	42	3	3360.7	3350	61.4	2.1	19.3

(continued)

Table 1. Data from Worldwide Nations (continued)

Nation	Hypertension prevalence (%)	Obesity prevalence (%)	Diabetes prevalence (%)	Annual PM2.5 concentrations in urban areas (µg/m ³)	Daily ambient ultraviolet radiation (J/m ²)	Population using safely-managed drinking-water services (%)	Population using safely-managed sanitation services (%)	Population using hand-washing facility with soap/water (%)	Inbound tourism (thousands)	Bachelor's or equivalent (ISCED 6) (%)
Afghanistan	30.6	5.5	9.2	59.900	4132	N/A	N/A	38	N/A	N/A
Albania	29.0	21.7	9.0	18.200	2542	70	40	N/A	5927	N/A
Algeria	25.1	27.4	6.7	34.500	3253	N/A	18	84	2657	N/A
Andorra	18.7	25.6	7.7	11.500	2469	91	100	N/A	8328	10.2
Angola	29.7	8.2	4.5	28.400	5287	N/A	N/A	27	N/A	N/A
Antigua and Barbuda	23.4	18.9	13.1	18.000	5148	N/A	N/A	N/A	1062	N/A
Argentina	22.6	28.3	5.9	11.700	3476	N/A	N/A	N/A	10394	20.0
Armenia	25.5	20.2	6.1	32.900	2899	86	48	94	N/A	24.1
Australia	15.2	29.0	5.6	7.300	3206	N/A	76	N/A	9246	23.3
Austria	21.0	20.1	6.6	13.100	1888	99	97	N/A	N/A	2.8
Azerbaijan	24.5	19.9	6.1	18.500	2702	74	N/A	83	2850	15.7
Bahamas	20.9	31.6	8.8	19.000	4119	N/A	N/A	N/A	6622	N/A
Bahrain	21.4	29.8	15.6	69.000	4419	99	96	N/A	12045	20.2
Bangladesh	24.7	3.6	9.2	58.600	4029	55	N/A	35	N/A	5.3
Barbados	24.4	23.1	13.4	22.400	5787	N/A	N/A	N/A	1356	N/A
Belarus	27.1	24.5	5.0	19.300	1795	95	81	N/A	11502	N/A
Belgium	17.5	22.1	4.6	13.000	1645	100	97	N/A	N/A	19.8
Belize	22.7	24.1	17.1	20.900	4639	N/A	N/A	90	1697	N/A
Benin	27.7	9.6	1.0	30.400	5168	N/A	N/A	11	322	N/A
Bhutan	28.1	6.4	10.3	35.400	4180	36	N/A	N/A	N/A	7.9
Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	17.9	20.2	6.8	23.300	5344	N/A	23	25	N/A	N/A
Bosnia and Herzegovina	30.8	17.9	9.0	29.700	2205	89	22	N/A	N/A	6.6
Botswana	29.6	18.9	5.8	20.900	4868	N/A	N/A	N/A	1775	N/A
Brazil	23.3	22.1	10.4	11.800	4552	N/A	49	N/A	N/A	15.6
Brunei Darussalam	18.9	14.1	13.3	5.800	5148	N/A	N/A	N/A	4521	N/A
Bulgaria	28.4	25.0	6.0	20.800	2331	97	64	N/A	12368	24.7
Burkina Faso	32.6	5.6	7.3	36.300	5567	N/A	N/A	12	N/A	N/A
Burundi	29.2	5.4	5.1	35.600	5111	N/A	N/A	6	N/A	0.9
Cabo Verde	29.5	11.8	2.4	31.600	5372	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

Cambodia	26.1	3.9	6.4	24.900	5152	26	N/A	66	N/A	N/A
Cameroon	24.8	11.4	6.0	65.400	5185	N/A	N/A	9	N/A	N/A
Canada	13.2	29.4	7.6	6.700	1887	99	82	N/A	31274	18.7
Central African Republic	31.2	7.5	6.0	51.200	5498	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Chad	32.9	6.1	6.0	50.800	5669	N/A	N/A	6	N/A	N/A
Chile	20.9	28.0	8.6	23.100	3982	99	77	N/A	6603	13.1
China	19.2	6.2	9.2	51.000	2908	N/A	72	N/A	158606	N/A
Colombia	19.2	22.3	7.4	17.200	5385	73	17	65	4282	8.2
Comoros	27.9	7.8	12.3	18.600	5524	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Congo	26.2	9.6	6.0	36.400	4943	45	N/A	48	158	N/A
Costa Rica	18.7	25.7	9.1	16.700	4884	94	N/A	N/A	3300	18.4
Côte d'Ivoire	27.2	10.3	2.4	23.900	4931	37	N/A	19	1965	N/A
Croatia	32.4	24.4	5.4	17.600	1976	90	58	N/A	57668	N/A
Cuba	19.0	24.6	9.6	21.600	4401	N/A	44	85	4712	N/A
Cyprus	19.8	21.8	9.0	17.100	3439	100	75	N/A	4024	16.4
Czechia	27.9	26.0	7.0	15.600	1707	98	94	N/A	34701	4.6
Democratic Republic of the Congo	28.5	6.7	6.0	37.400	5100	N/A	N/A	4	N/A	3.3
Denmark	20.6	19.7	8.3	10.300	1691	97	95	N/A	30801	19.0
Djibouti	26.8	13.5	5.1	41.000	5461	N/A	36	N/A	N/A	N/A
Dominica	22.5	27.9	11.6	18.800	5464	N/A	N/A	N/A	198	N/A
Dominican Republic	21.5	27.6	8.6	13.300	4880	N/A	N/A	55	7576	16.9
Ecuador	17.9	19.9	5.5	15.500	4929	75	42	81	2535	10.9
Egypt	25.0	32.0	17.2	79.600	4202	N/A	61	90	11346	5.5
El Salvador	18.7	24.6	8.8	23.800	5364	N/A	N/A	91	2536	6.7
Equatorial Guinea	28.4	8.0	6.0	49.100	4635	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Eritrea	29.1	5.0	5.1	41.100	5914	N/A	N/A	N/A	142	N/A
Estonia	27.4	21.2	4.2	7.000	1781	93	97	N/A	6071	3.3
Eswatini	29.8	16.5	4.5	16.200	3900	N/A	N/A	24	1277	N/A
Ethiopia	30.3	4.5	4.3	34.000	5929	11	N/A	8	N/A	N/A
Fiji	21.7	30.2	14.7	10.500	4431	N/A	N/A	N/A	1058	3.7
Finland	19.4	22.2	5.6	6.500	1494	100	100	N/A	N/A	12.4
France	22.0	21.6	4.8	12.400	1907	98	88	N/A	211998	8.5
Gabon	25.5	15.0	6.0	37.800	4654	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Gambia	29.1	10.3	1.9	32.300	5358	N/A	N/A	8	N/A	N/A

Georgia	26.3	21.7	5.8	24.000	2489	80	27	N/A	7203	6.9
Germany	19.9	22.3	10.4	11.900	1812	100	97	N/A	N/A	13.9
Ghana	23.7	10.9	2.5	31.100	5166	36	N/A	41	N/A	N/A
Greece	19.1	24.9	4.7	16.400	2753	100	90	N/A	33072	17.7
Grenada	24.3	21.3	10.7	21.800	4875	87	N/A	N/A	528	N/A
Guatemala	21.2	21.2	10.0	24.200	5141	56	N/A	77	2406	N/A
Guinea	30.3	7.7	2.4	22.200	5391	N/A	N/A	17	N/A	N/A
Guinea-Bissau	30.3	9.5	2.4	26.500	5319	N/A	N/A	6	N/A	N/A
Guyana	23.1	20.2	11.6	21.600	5203	N/A	N/A	77	N/A	N/A
Haiti	24.5	22.7	6.7	14.700	5016	N/A	N/A	23	1333	N/A
Honduras	21.4	21.4	7.3	21.500	4924	N/A	N/A	N/A	2303	9.5
Hungary	30.0	26.4	6.9	16.300	1932	90	96	N/A	57667	11.8
Iceland	19.7	21.9	5.8	5.900	957	100	82	N/A	2488	N/A
India	25.8	3.9	10.4	68.000	4514	N/A	N/A	60	N/A	N/A
Indonesia	23.8	6.9	6.3	16.400	5220	N/A	N/A	64	15810	8.8
Iran (Islamic Republic of)	19.7	25.8	9.6	34.400	4038	92	N/A	N/A	7295	13.7
Iraq	25.2	30.4	8.8	60.100	3825	59	41	95	N/A	N/A
Ireland	19.7	25.3	3.2	8.700	1509	97	82	N/A	N/A	18.6
Israel	16.6	26.1	9.7	19.400	3682	100	94	N/A	4389	N/A
Italy	21.2	19.9	5.0	15.700	2444	95	96	N/A	93228.6	N/A
Jamaica	21.8	24.7	11.3	13.600	4942	N/A	N/A	N/A	4319	N/A
Japan	17.6	4.3	5.6	11.800	2521	98	99	N/A	31192	N/A
Jordan	21.0	35.5	12.7	31.700	4026	94	81	N/A	4922	N/A
Kazakhstan	27.1	21.0	6.1	14.500	2257	90	N/A	99	8789	34.0
Kenya	26.7	7.1	3.1	25.800	5803	N/A	N/A	25	1449	N/A
Kuwait	23.6	37.9	12.2	58.900	4214	100	100	N/A	8508	9.8
Kyrgyzstan	26.7	16.6	6.1	17.400	3094	68	N/A	89	6947	N/A
Lao People's Democratic Republic	24.8	5.3	6.4	25.500	4735	16	58	50	4186	N/A
Latvia	29.4	23.6	5.0	14.400	1671	95	86	N/A	7775	15.4
Lebanon	20.7	32.0	11.2	30.700	2953	48	22	N/A	N/A	N/A
Lesotho	29.0	16.6	4.5	28.100	4439	N/A	N/A	2	1173	N/A
Liberia	28.3	9.9	2.4	17.000	4926	N/A	N/A	1	N/A	N/A
Libya	23.7	32.5	10.2	41.700	3861	N/A	26	N/A	N/A	N/A
Lithuania	29.3	26.3	3.8	12.300	1801	92	91	N/A	6115	21.2
Luxembourg	21.9	22.6	5.0	10.400	1687	100	97	N/A	N/A	N/A
Madagascar	28.1	5.3	4.5	22.500	4771	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

Malawi	28.9	5.8	4.5	21.900	5019	N/A	N/A	9	N/A	N/A
Malaysia	22.9	15.6	16.7	17.300	5225	93	89	N/A	N/A	9.7
Maldives	24.4	8.6	9.2	7.700	10224	N/A	N/A	96	N/A	N/A
Mali	32.6	8.6	2.4	29.000	5617	N/A	N/A	52	N/A	2.1
Malta	19.4	28.9	8.3	14.000	3091	100	93	N/A	3232	11.8
Mauritania	31.7	12.7	7.1	41.700	5547	N/A	N/A	43	1002	N/A
Mauritius	25.0	10.8	22.0	13.500	5055	N/A	N/A	N/A	1431	7.6
Mexico	19.7	28.9	13.5	20.900	4974	43	50	88	96497	14.5
Monaco	N/A	N/A	2.9	12.200	1907	100	100	N/A	N/A	N/A
Mongolia	29.0	20.6	4.7	49.500	2226	24	N/A	71	598	N/A
Montenegro	29.1	23.3	9.0	19.300	N/A	94	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Morocco	26.1	26.1	7.0	31.100	3568	70	39	N/A	12489	N/A
Mozambique	29.1	7.2	3.3	18.400	4646	N/A	N/A	N/A	2870	1.6
Myanmar	24.6	5.8	3.9	34.600	4565	N/A	N/A	79	N/A	N/A
Namibia	28.5	17.2	4.5	21.000	5305	N/A	N/A	45	1581	N/A
Nepal	29.4	4.1	7.2	99.500	4130	27	N/A	48	N/A	N/A
Netherlands	18.7	20.4	5.4	12.100	1662	100	97	N/A	N/A	19.1
New Zealand	16.2	30.8	6.2	5.800	2487	100	89	N/A	3858	22.5
Nicaragua	20.8	23.7	11.4	19.000	5078	52	N/A	N/A	1412	N/A
Niger	33.4	5.5	2.4	73.000	5811	N/A	10	N/A	N/A	N/A
Nigeria	23.9	8.9	3.1	46.300	5251	20	27	42	5265	N/A
North Macedonia	28.5	22.4	9.3	33.000	N/A	81	17	N/A	N/A	N/A
Norway	19.7	23.1	5.3	7.800	1439	98	76	N/A	N/A	16.4
Oman	24.8	27.0	10.1	36.200	5102	90	N/A	97	3242	N/A
Pakistan	30.5	8.6	19.9	56.200	4227	35	N/A	60	N/A	6.8
Panama	19.9	22.7	7.7	12.000	4898	v	N/A	N/A	2487	N/A
Papua New Guinea	25.6	21.3	17.9	11.500	5377	N/A	N/A	N/A	195	N/A
Paraguay	24.6	20.3	9.6	11.700	4038	64	58	80	4183	6.1
Peru	13.7	19.7	6.6	29.000	5906	50	43	N/A	5384	10.0
Philippines	22.6	6.4	7.1	18.700	4928	47	52	78	N/A	15.6
Poland	28.7	23.1	6.1	21.500	1749	100	93	N/A	85946	5.7
Portugal	24.4	20.8	9.8	8.100	2585	95	85	N/A	N/A	5.0
Qatar	22.4	35.1	15.6	91.700	4905	96	96	N/A	N/A	17.6
Republic of Korea	11.0	4.7	6.9	24.700	2535	98	100	N/A	15347	N/A
Republic of Moldova	29.8	18.9	5.7	16.500	1910	73	N/A	N/A	N/A	19.0
Romania	30.0	22.5	6.9	15.400	2403	82	77	N/A	11720	N/A

Russian Federation	27.2	23.1	6.1	14.700	2071	76	61	N/A	24551	N/A
Rwanda	26.7	5.8	5.1	40.700	1795	N/A	N/A	5	1307	3.8
Saint Kitts and Nevis	25.3	22.9	13.3	12.300	5130	N/A	N/A	N/A	1278	N/A
Saint Lucia	27.1	19.7	11.6	21.200	5009	N/A	N/A	N/A	1165	N/A
Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	23.3	23.7	11.6	21.400	5164	N/A	N/A	N/A	356	N/A
San Marino	N/A	N/A	5.9	13.400	4966	100	77	N/A	1874	4.3
São Tomé and Príncipe	25.8	12.4	2.4	25.200	1932	N/A	N/A	41	N/A	N/A
Saudi Arabia	23.3	35.4	15.8	86.700	4422	N/A	78	N/A	17570	23.5
Senegal	30.2	8.8	2.4	39.700	5384	N/A	21	24	1376	1.2
Serbia	29.5	21.5	9.0	24.700	N/A	75	25	N/A	N/A	12.7
Seychelles	23.5	14.0	12.3	18.600	5356	N/A	N/A	N/A	405	N/A
Sierra Leone	30.3	8.7	2.4	20.600	5570	10	13	19	66	N/A
Singapore	14.6	6.1	2.4	18.300	5087	100	100	N/A	18508	31.6
Slovakia	28.5	20.5	6.5	18.000	3979	100	83	N/A	23092	2.1
Slovenia	30.5	20.2	5.9	16.400	1795	98	83	N/A	N/A	5.4
Somalia	32.9	8.3	5.1	28.000	4071	N/A	N/A	10	N/A	N/A
South Africa	26.9	28.3	12.7	24.300	5773	N/A	N/A	44	15004	6.8
South Sudan	N/A	N/A	10.2	40.900	4111	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Spain	19.2	23.8	6.9	9.800	2705	98	97	N/A	124060	9.0
Sri Lanka	22.4	5.2	10.7	15.100	5264	N/A	N/A	N/A	2521	3.6
Sudan	N/A	N/A	22.1	46.800	5783	N/A	N/A	23	3093	N/A
Suriname	22.4	26.4	12.5	25.800	4799	N/A	N/A	N/A	279	N/A
Sweden	19.3	20.6	4.8	6.100	1587	100	93	N/A	N/A	12.4
Switzerland	18.0	19.5	5.7	10.400	2158	95	100	N/A	N/A	18.8
Syrian Arab Republic	24.5	27.8	13.5	37.400	3501	N/A	N/A	71	N/A	N/A
Tajikistan	26.1	14.2	6.1	42.800	3538	48	N/A	73	1035	0.9
Thailand	22.3	10.0	7.0	26.600	4862	N/A	N/A	84	N/A	12.8
The United Kingdom	15.2	27.8	3.9	10.600	1576	100	98	N/A	37905	17.2
Timor-Leste	27.6	3.8	6.7	18.200	5637	N/A	N/A	28	N/A	N/A
Togo	28.9	8.4	2.4	31.200	5307	N/A	N/A	10	N/A	N/A
Trinidad and Tobago	25.8	18.6	11.0	22.400	5245	N/A	N/A	N/A	501	N/A
Tunisia	23.2	26.9	8.5	35.700	3262	93	78	79	N/A	15.2

Turkey	20.3	32.1	11.1	41.200	2924	N/A	65	N/A	46113	16.7
Uganda	27.3	5.3	2.5	48.700	5499	7	N/A	21	N/A	N/A
Ukraine	27.1	24.1	6.1	19.400	1843	92	68	N/A	14342	N/A
United Arab Emirates	21.1	31.7	16.3	37.200	4862	N/A	96	N/A	N/A	37.2
United Republic of Tanzania	27.3	8.4	5.7	25.100	5483	N/A	25	48	1506	N/A
United States of America	12.9	36.2	10.8	7.600	2736	100	90	N/A	169324.918	21.9
Uruguay	20.7	27.9	7.3	8.700	3235	N/A	N/A	N/A	3954	9.4
Uzbekistan	25.6	16.6	6.5	28.900	3172	59	N/A	N/A	5346	16.3
Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	18.6	25.6	7.0	16.800	5211	N/A	24	N/A	429	24.1
Viet Nam	23.4	2.1	6.0	30.100	4293	N/A	N/A	86	15498	N/A
Yemen	30.7	17.1	5.4	44.300	6089	N/A	N/A	50	N/A	N/A
Zambia	27.1	8.1	4.5	23.800	5265	N/A	N/A	14	N/A	N/A
Zimbabwe	28.2	15.5	1.8	19.100	4918	N/A	N/A	37	2580	2.6

Abbreviation: GDP, Gross Domestic Product; GNI, Gross National Income; ISCED, International Standard Classification of Education; PM2.5, particulate matter 2.5; PPP, Purchasing Power Parity.

Table 2. Meta-regression Summary

Model, covariate	Coefficient	Lower limit of 95 % CI	Upper limit of 95 % CI	P value	Figure
Univariable model I					
Age distribution					
[1] Population ages 0-14 (%)	−0.1136	−0.1360	−0.0913	<0.0001*	
[2] Population ages ≥65 (%)	0.1521	0.1114	0.1928	<0.0001*	
Economy					
[3] GDP per capita, PPP (current international \$)	0.0001	0.0000	0.0001	<0.0001*	
[4] GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	0.0001	0.0001	0.0001	<0.0001*	
Multivariable model I including all the above-mentioned covariates [1]–[4]					
[1] Population ages 0-14 (%)	−0.0636	−0.1038	−0.0234	0.0021*	Figure 1A
[2] Population ages ≥65 (%)	−0.0163	−0.0738	0.0411	0.5750	
[3] GDP per capita, PPP (current international \$)	0.0000	−0.0000	0.0001	0.8818	
[4] GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	0.0000	−0.0000	0.0001	0.1768	
Multivariable model II-1 adjusting for covariates [1]–[4]					
Public health					
[5] Life expectancy at birth (years)	0.0300	−0.0385	0.0984	0.3885	
[6] Medical-doctor density (/10,000 population)	0.0292	0.0056	0.0529	0.0156*	
[7] Nursing/midwifery-personnel density (/10,000 population)	0.0047	−0.0035	0.0130	0.2604	
Multivariable model II-2 adjusting for covariates [1]–[4] and [8]–[10]					
[5] Life expectancy at birth (years)	0.0133	−0.0654	0.0919	0.7396	
[6] Medical-doctor density (/10,000 population)	0.0158	−0.0085	0.0402	0.2015	
[7] Nursing/midwifery-personnel density (/10,000 population)	0.0022	−0.0058	0.0103	0.5844	
Multivariable model III adjusting for covariates [1]–[7]					
Disease					
[8] Hypertension prevalence (%)	−0.0086	−0.0790	0.0619	0.8107	
[9] Obesity prevalence (%)	0.0411	0.0100	0.0722	0.0099*	Figure 1B
[10] Diabetes prevalence (%)	−0.0261	−0.0935	0.0413	0.4454	
Multivariable model IV adjusting for covariates [1]–[10]					
Environment					
[11] Annual PM2.5 concentrations in urban areas (µg/m ³)	0.0158	0.0003	0.0313	0.0454*	Figure 1C
[12] Daily ambient ultraviolet radiation (J/m ²)	0.0001	−0.0002	0.0003	0.6534	
Multivariable model V adjusting for covariates [1]–[12]					
Health infrastructure					
[13] Population using safely-managed drinking-water services (%)	0.0171	−0.0044	0.0386	0.1180	
[14] Population using safely-managed sanitation services (%)	−0.0030	−0.0222	0.0161	0.7521	
[15] Population using hand-washing facility with soap/water (%)	−0.0170	−0.0406	0.0065	0.1525	
Miscellaneous					
[16] Inbound tourism (millions)	0.0027	−0.0056	0.0110	0.5243	
[17] Bachelor's or equivalent (ISCED 6) (%)	−0.0029	−0.0485	0.0427	0.9004	

Abbreviation: CI, confidence interval; GDP, Gross Domestic Product; GNI, Gross National Income; ISCED, International Standard Classification of Education; PM2.5, particulate matter 2.5; PPP, Purchasing Power Parity.

*Statistically significant.

A

medRxiv preprint doi: <https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.06.06.20124016>; this version posted June 7, 2020. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

B

C

medRxiv preprint doi: <https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.06.06.20124016>; this version posted June 7, 2020. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.