medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Implementing the mhGAP-HIG: The process and evaluation of training primary health care workers in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

Asma Humayun* and Arooj Najmussaqib

*For correspondence

Dr. Asma Humayun
National Technical Advisor
Health Section
Ministry of Planning, Development & Special Initiatives, Islamabad, Pakistan
mhpsspk@gmail.com

Dr. Arooj Najmussaqib
Mental Health Consultant
Health Section
Ministry of Planning, Development & Special Initiatives, Islamabad, Pakistan
aroojnajm@gmail.com

Abstract

Background Building the capacity of primary care staff is crucial for integrating mental health care into primary healthcare to reduce the significant treatment gap for psychiatric disorders prevalent in low- and middle-income countries. This research investigates the effectiveness of adapted mhGAP-HIG guidelines in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP).

Methods A team of seven trained experts conducted six five-day training workshops in six districts of KP. A total of 105 primary care physicians and clinical psychologists were trained. Mix method analysis was performed. Paired sample t-tests were used to compare knowledge scores pre- and post-training and after 8 months. Thematic analysis was conducted to examine feedback of the participants regarding the training, whereas content analysis was performed on the reflections of the trainers on the adapted guide.

Results Findings demonstrated significant improvements in knowledge of the participants to identify and manage common mental health conditions. The percentage of correctly answered questions in the pre-test was 73.86%, which increased to 85.94% in the post-test, indicating a 12.08% increase in knowledge. Most noticeable improvements in knowledge were observed in harmful use of substances (22.56), General principles of care and other significant mental health complaints (15.15%), stress (13.80%), suicide, and epilepsy (13.13%). The thematic analyses highlighted the strengths and gaps of training and made recommendations to strengthen preservice training and provide regular refresher courses.

Conclusion The study underscores the feasibility of implementing an adapted mhGAP-HIG for training primary care physicians and clinical psychologists within existing healthcare resources of KP. The preliminary findings endorse the scalability across other provinces in the country.

Keywords: mhGAP-HIG, capacity building, mental health, training, primary care, Pakistan.

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Introduction

Pakistan has a devolved federal structure, where health is a provincial subject. Each province has struggled to develop mental health either because of their ongoing need to respond to other competing public health challenges and a dearth of mental health expertise and resources (1).

The province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), located in the north-western region of Pakistan, is divided into 37 districts. Over the last three decades, the province has borne the brunt of conflict and terrorism, natural disasters, internal displacements, and hosting a refugee population of 1.8 million. It is estimated that only 30% of KP's women and children have access to medical services due to cultural barriers and other socio-economic restrictions (2) Additionally, worrying suicide rates have been reported in some districts like Chitral, which lacks any psychiatric services (3,4).

In 2023, the Ministry of Planning Development & Special Initiative (MoPD&SI) provided technical support to the Directorate of Public Health in KP to conduct a pilot project for building the capacity of primary health care workers (PHCWs), which included primary care physicians (PCPs) and clinical psychologists (CPs). The project was supported by the International Medical Corps (IMC) to strengthen mental healthcare services for Afghan refugees and host communities in nine districts (Chitral, Haripur, Kohat, Lower Dir, Mansehra, Mardan, Nowshera, Peshawar, and Swabi).

Background context

The MoPD&SI developed an evidence-based and scalable model for a multi-layered mental healthcare system in 2021 (5). This model aims to strengthen the existing mental healthcare system by utilizing evidence-based resources to build the capacity of a mental health workforce outside tertiary care hospitals; supervise this workforce to provide mental health and psychosocial support services in primary care; establish a referral pathway and collect relevant data. As part of the digital tools for this model, the mhGAP Humanitarian Intervention Guidelines (mhGAP-HIG) (6) were adapted and developed into a mobile application (mhGAP-HIG-PK tools) for Pakistan (7).

In contrast to earlier mhGAP training initiatives, which either implemented the guide without modifications (8,9) or partially adapted it (10–12), the mhGAP-HIG-PK has been comprehensively adapted and contextualized for Pakistan. Furthermore, its clinical utility has been enhanced by integrating evidence-driven interview questions for assessment protocols and step-by-step techniques for delivering psychosocial interventions. The mobile application offers a complete reference to mhGAP-HIG-PK and facilitates the submission of clinical data by trained PHCWs, along with the provision to seek supervision when needed.

Similar to other LMICs, major challenges for implementing the mhGAP guidelines in Pakistan include a dearth of specialist resources, disease-centered practices, inadequate referral pathways, knowledge and skills gaps pertaining to pre-service training of PCP, and stigma towards people with mental disorders (7,13).

This paper discusses the training process and evaluation using the mhGAP-HIG-PK tools. A subsequent paper will discuss post-training supervision and the analysis of the clinical data collected during supervision.

Methods

This study used a mixed-methods approach, integrating quantitative and qualitative data collection and analysis. This study was conducted as part of the Mental Health and Psychosocial Support Project,

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

approved by Ministry of Planning, Development and Special Initiatives in compliance with ethical standards and consent protocols under letter no. 6(262) HPC/2020.

1. *Analysis of mental health services in KP*

This phase aimed to determine the current condition of mental health services, with a particular emphasis on understanding the challenges encountered by PHCWs while dealing with mental health issues. To accomplish this, we conducted two Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) and examined existing literature to gain a comprehensive understanding of the dynamics of mental health care in KP. The FGDs had 15 participants, including PCPs, CPs, IMC staff, and KP health directorate representatives. The purpose of the FGDs was to gather the perspectives of PHCWs on their experiences and the difficulties presented by local culture and regulatory frameworks. The insights reported here are the result of an in-depth review of the information gathered through these interactions.

There exists a critical shortage and uneven distribution of mental health services in KP. For a population of 40 million, there are approximately 50 psychiatrists (1 psychiatrist per 800,000 individuals), with nearly half located in Peshawar, the provincial capital. Only the urban clusters (nine districts) have any psychiatric services, whereas over 81% of the population lives in rural areas (14). The gap in mental healthcare in the province is not only limited to a dearth of services, but the quality of care is also a major concern. Psychiatric services are mainly bio-medical in approach.

The CPs are an important resource in the province, but there are only a few positions in tertiary care, public hospitals, and academic institutions. Over a hundred CPs are working in other settings, such as humanitarian (non-government) organizations, rehabilitation centers, or the private sector. Unfortunately, there is a severe dearth of opportunities either for seeking supervision or to strengthen their skills as most of them work in project-based, short-term positions (15).

The Health Information System in KP includes three mental disorders (Depression, Epilepsy, and Drug dependence). Despite existing mechanisms to report data, no information is ever reported. Furthermore, psychiatry education within the MBBS curriculum encounters several challenges, such as minimal implementation despite its mandatory status, the absence of a dedicated examination, a shortage of qualified faculty, and inadequate pre-service training, all of which contribute to reduced student motivation (16).

2. *Selection and training of trainers*

Selecting trainers posed challenges as most of the qualified and experienced mental health professionals had full-time academic positions and private practice. Through our professional networks, we identified potential trainers from or close to our target districts. The selection criteria also encompassed attributes such as integrity, motivation for community service, and proficiency in a biopsychosocial approach, extending beyond the traditional biomedical model. The selected trainers volunteered to participate in the training activity, as no financial incentive or official leave from work was provided.
A team of eight trainers (5 psychiatrists and 3 CPs) was selected and trained. One of them dropped out because of logistic concerns. Due to the trainers' diverse geographic locations spanning numerous districts and limited resources, it was not feasible to arrange an in-person training session. Consequently, the training was conducted online over three weeks under the supervision of a master trainer. Trainers were given a digital copy of the mhGAP-HIG-PK guide during the first week to familiarize themselves with the detailed modules. During the following week, they were required to focus on preparing just one module. In the third week, every participant facilitated a one-hour teaching

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

session. Two external reviewers were invited to provide objective feedback on both the content of the presentations and the instructional methods used to improve the evaluation process.

The second part of their training involved practical supervision during the training workshops. Every training workshop was led by a minimum of 2 trainers. To facilitate the learning process and foster interactive peer feedback, a WhatsApp group was formed. This platform was utilized for the daily exchange of updates, recorded videos of role-plays, and feedback from peers and trainees. Upon completion of training workshops, trainers were awarded digital certificates to recognize their contribution.

3. Selection and training of PHCWs

The Directorate of Public Health engaged with the relevant district health authorities to nominate PCPs for the training program. Similarly, IMC nominated CPs from within their teams or those affiliated with partner agencies for participation. No recruitment criteria were specified for PCP since they were nominated by the health department, but a criterion based on level of formal education was developed for CPs (either a MS degree or advanced diploma in clinical psychology).

4. Training workshops

Due to logistic constraints, instead of nine districts, these were merged to hold a total of six 5-day training workshops at Chitral; Haripur (for districts of Haripur and Mansehra); Lower Dir, Mardan 1 (Mardan and Swabi); Mardan 2 (Mardan and Nowshera); and Peshawar (Peshawar and Kohat) between August-December 2023. Following each training workshop, the trainees were supervised for three months.

To accommodate participants' lengthy commutes, daily sessions were reduced to 5.5 hours, with an added half-hour for home study. This structure resulted in a cumulative training duration of 30 hours over five days. All attendees were required to register on the Mental Health and Psychosocial Support (MHPSS) web portal, including the Learning Management System (LMS). The training sessions were conducted using interactive learning methodologies, incorporating role-plays, small group discussions, and reflection activities to enhance engagement and comprehension. The training resources included mhGAP-HIG-PK tools (hard copy and a mobile application).

Each day started with a 30-minute 'recap session' of the prior day's modules. The programme covered all eleven mhGAP-HIG modules, including General principles of care (GPC), Acute stress (ACU), Grief (GRI), Depression (DEP), PTSD, Psychosis (PSY), Epilepsy (EPI), Intellectual disability (ID), Harmful use of alcohol and drugs (SUB), Suicide (SUI), and Other Significant Mental Health Complaints (OTH). The average duration for each module was 90 minutes. Upon successful completion of the training, trainees were awarded digital certificates to recognize their achievement.

5. Refresher Trainings

Due to logistical and budgetary constraints, only three refresher training workshops were conducted covering six districts—Chitral, Kohat, Mardan, Nowshera, Peshawar, and Swabi - eight months following the initial training. A total of 48 participants attended these refresher trainings. The areas identified with participants with an aim to strengthen their skills included assessment of depression, suicide risk, and children with intellectual disability. Additionally, psychosocial interventions were practiced in role plays for common conditions, including acute stress (especially bed wetting, dissociation), grief, depression, intellectual disability, epilepsy, and others. Furthermore, discussions on the pharmacological interventions for depression, psychosis and epilepsy were addressed knowledge gaps.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

6. Pre and post training assessment

The pre- and post-test assessments were conducted using an adapted knowledge questionnaire (7) comprising 25 items. For analysis, these items were categorized into clusters corresponding to mhGAP-HIG modules: GPC (2 items), ACU (3), Grief (2), PTSD (1), DEP (3), PSY (3), ID (2), SUB (3), SUI (2), EPI (2), and Others (2). The assessment was repeated after 8 months to measure knowledge retention.

7. Feedback by the trainees

PHCWs submitted quantitative and qualitative feedback through an online questionnaire on the Learning Management System (LMS) upon completing the training.

8. Reflections by the participants on the process of training

Collective reflections by the participants (trainees and trainers) were summarized in written reports by the respective trainers at the end of each day. These reports drew on their observations and discussions from daily *'recap sessions'* with trainees.

Data Analysis

The data was cleaned and coded before conducting analysis using SPSS version 26 (17). The descriptive statistics were reported as percentages or as the mean with its corresponding standard deviation. 105 participants attended the training; however, six questionnaires were discarded due to missing information. For analysis purposes, data from 99 participants was organized by district. We also conducted knowledge comparisons between the pre- and post-assessment using clusters. Given the normal distribution of the data, a paired t-test was performed using the 'pre-,' 'post-', and '8 months after' mean scores to evaluate any changes in the knowledge scores following the training. Furthermore, qualitative feedback from the training participants and trainers' reflections were analyzed using thematic and content analysis respectively.

Results

This section presents the demographics, pre and post training analyses, feedback and reflections of the participants. The trainees comprised 64% men with nearly half having at least 5 years of work experience and 64% working in primary care settings, indicating varied qualification, diverse expertise and reflections brought to this training. The demographic details of all participants are shared in Table 1.

Table 1: Demographics of trainees (N=105)

	Doctors	**Psychologists**
Gender	**n (%)**	**n (%)**
Males	49 (47%)	18 (17%)
Females	25 (24%)	13 (12%)
Experience		
<5 years	17 (16%)	14 (13%)

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

5-10 years	37 (35%)	12 (11%)
>10 years	20 (19%)	5 (5%)
Healthcare level		
Primary (iNGO)	38 (36%)	29 (28%)
Secondary	35 (33%)	2 (2%)
Tertiary	1 (1%)	
Education level (Doctors)		
MBBS	66 (89%)	
MBBS + MPH	3 (4%)	
MBBS+MCPS (Medicine, ENT)	3 (4%)	
MBBS+FCPS/MD (Internal Medicine)	2 (2%)	
Education level (Psychologists)		
MS Clinical Psychology	13 (42%)	
Advanced Diploma in Clinical Psychology	15 (48%)	
BS Clinical Psychology	3 (10%)	

1. **Pre- and post-training outcomes**

The analysis of pre- and post-training outcomes suggested encouraging levels of baseline knowledge. The percentage of correctly answered questions in the pre-test was 73.86%, which increased to 85.94% in the post-test, indicating a 12.08% increase in knowledge.

Table 2 demonstrates meaningful improvements in knowledge levels across several regions following training. There was a significant increase in mean knowledge scores between the pre- and post-training for every district. However, Mardan1 shows an increase in knowledge score post-training, though with a marginally higher significance level. This implies a positive but less definitive impact of the training. Furthermore, Peshawar exhibited the most pronounced enhancement (p=<.001).
The decrease in standard deviations across districts post-intervention indicates a reduction in variability in participants' knowledge scores. This implies that disparities in knowledge have narrowed, leading to the attainment of a more uniform level of understanding or expertise among participants after the training, as has been previously reported (18).

Furthermore, in the districts of Chitral, Peshawar and Mardan2, mean knowledge scores significantly improved, reaching 20.3 (SD=2.75), 20.90 (SD=2.70), and 21.42 (SD=2.68) respectively [pre-training versus 8 months post-training (Table 2)]. This highlights the training's effectiveness in retention of knowledge over time, consistent with literature (11,19).

Table 2: Pre and Post Knowledge Comparisons by Districts (N=99)

	Pre		Post		Paired Test		After 8 months		
Area	M	SD	M	SD	t value	P	M	SD	P
Haripur	19.63	2.53	22.50	1.79	3.439	0.004			
Chitral	18.07	3.95	21.29	3.77	2.527	0.025	20.3	2.75	2.37 (.042)

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Lower Dir	17.69	3.34	21.25	2.65	3.578	0.003	-	-	-
Mardan1	19.30	2.83	21.10	2.53	1.911	0.071	-		
Mardan2	17.88	3.20	21.50	1.51	4.389	0.001	21.42	2.68	3.82 (.002)
Peshawar	18.00	2.32	21.35	2.29	4.968	<0.001	20.90	2.70	4.03 (.001)

Table 3 demonstrates the improvement in participants' knowledge comparisons by clusters. Overall, knowledge of the participants significantly improved from 18.46 to 21.48 (p<.001). Furthermore, each cluster also showed significant improvement in all modules except Grief and ID. The module with the most noticeable improvements in scores was SUB (22.56%). This is followed by GPC and Others (15.15%), Acute stress (13.80%), Suicide and Epilepsy (13.13%), PTSD, and Psychosis (9.09%). On the other hand, the ID and Grief modules observed insignificant improvements, with percentage increases of 7.07% and 2.53%, respectively.

Table 3: Knowledge Comparisons by Clusters (N=99)

	Pre		**Post**		**Paired t-Test**	
Cluster	**M**	**SD**	**M**	**SD**	**t value**	**P**
GPC	1.10	0.65	1.40	0.60	3.545	0.001
Stress	2.12	0.75	2.54	0.61	4.252	<.001
Grief	1.90	0.30	1.95	0.22	1.393	0.167
PTSD	0.80	0.40	0.89	0.32	26.21	<.001
Depression	2.28	0.78	2.53	0.61	2.362	0.02
Psychosis	2.46	0.61	2.74	0.53	3.089	0.003
ID	1.51	0.61	1.65	0.50	1.861	0.066
SUD	2.09	0.72	2.77	0.49	7.767	<.001
Epilepsy	1.36	0.68	1.63	0.51	3.483	0.001
Suicide	1.28	0.54	1.55	0.56	3.766	<.001
Others	1.56	0.67	1.86	0.38	4.268	<.001

2. Feedback

Trainee's feedback was analyzed through rating forms and qualitative responses. Their feedback provides insights into the program's overall success and areas for enhancement (see Supplementary file). Notably, 75% rated their experience as excellent and 23% as good, indicating that the program was highly effective and well-received.

Qualitative feedback

The thematic analysis from the feedback indicates that the participants were highly satisfied with the educational experience and appreciated the content as well as the interactive pedagogy. The training appeared effective in strengthening knowledge and clinical skills, particularly to identify and manage mental health conditions.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Overall, the trainees expressed satisfaction with the training, deeming it both beneficial and informative. They particularly valued the interactive methodologies used, such as role-plays and engaging group discussions. One participant highlighted the effectiveness of these methods, stating, "The interactive method of training made the learning multifold." In addition to the instructional approach, participants were appreciative of the provision of hard copies of the guide, which enhanced their learning experience.

Concerning the impact on knowledge and clinical skills, the participants reported significant enhancements in their understanding and abilities related to the identification, diagnosis, and treatment of mental disorders, incorporating holistic, psychosocial, and pharmacological approaches. The training also improved their capabilities in making management plans, with one participant noting, "It became clearer whom to refer and whom to treat, who needs no treatment, who needs counseling, and who needs pharmacological intervention."

The trainees recognized and appreciated the expertise of senior trainers. They advocated for the broader dissemination of mhGAP trainings for all healthcare and community workers. They also recommended organizing refresher courses to refine their skills. Furthermore, the integration of the mhGAP guide into the medical curriculum was suggested.

3. Reflections by the trainers and feedback by the trainees

The outcome of the analysis of the reflections by the trainers and feedback by the trainees on individual modules is presented under three categories in Table 4:

1) Most beneficial aspect of training for enhancing knowledge identified by trainees.
2) Most valuable component of the training for strengthening skills reported by trainees.
3) Reflections by the trainers.

Table 4: Content analysis of the feedback and reflections on individual modules

	General principles of care
1	- Discussion on examples of violation of the rights of people with mental disorders in our context - Assessment of people with mental health conditions - Reduce stress and strengthen social support (in Urdu)
2	- Role play: Do's and Don'ts of communication skills during a consultation - Demonstration of breathing exercise (in Urdu)
3	- This module was extremely important to make a shift from a disease-centered to person-centred approach - Very detailed section, difficult to cover in 2 hours
	Acute stress
1	- Discussion on benzodiazepines – large group discussion on prevalent practice of benzodiazepine prescriptions and lack of knowledge about its harmful consequences. - Discussion on psychosocial interventions - Management of dissociative states
2	- Role play on management of a child who presents with bed wetting (Psychosocial intervention)
3	- PCP did not know much about stress and showed a keen interest. Psychologists had an average baseline knowledge, but gaps existed even in their skills to offer psychosocial interventions - The module discussed presentation within a month of a stressful event, but trainees had many questions for the effects of stress that lasts for more than a month
	Grief
1	- Everyone had some experience of working with grief in their lives and a large group discussion about

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

	how people respond to a loss was very helpful. - Discussion on providing support for culturally appropriate adjustment/mourning processes
2	- Role plays on educating a person about common reactions to losses
3	- In their existing practices, PCPs neither considered grief to be a condition nor recognized their role in supporting or guiding people in the community. At best, they would prescribe benzodiazepines to help grieving people overcome their distress. - PCP seemed most interested in discussing the treatment of 'insomnia' after a loss
	PTSD
1	- Discussion on the nature of the 'traumatic event' and cases from clinical experience were very helpful.
2	- Interview questions (skills) to assess PTSD
3	- PCP had a tendency to label all people with PTSD who presented to them (with any symptoms) following a traumatic event.
	Depression
1	- High prevalence of depression is reported in primary care - Depression may present primarily with somatic symptoms in Pakistan - Pharmacological management - Special groups such as adolescents, pregnant women, and older adults.
2	- Role play on assessment of depression. Initially demonstrated by the facilitator, later practiced in small groups. - Psychoeducation
3	- Differentiating depression and bipolar disorder was difficult and needed more time - At least 2.5 hours are needed
	Psychosis
1	- Treatment of acute disturbance and challenges of restraining. - Discussion on balancing options for a rights-based approach whilst preventing harm to the person and others. - Anti-psychotic medicines, doses, and side effects
2	- Role play on assessment of psychosis (eliciting hallucinations, delusions) - Role play on psychoeducation of carers
3	- PCPs suspect cases of psychosis in their practice but lack the skills to assess systematically. - PCPs were familiar with names of antipsychotic medications but lacked knowledge about doses, side effects, contraindications, etc. - Psychologists knew very little about psychosis - Assessment needs more practice, and at least 2 hours are needed to teach the module. - PCP expressed their reluctance to interview or perform a physical examination in cases of acute psychosis, including mania.
	Intellectual disability
1	- Risk of human rights violations - Reversible causes of intellectual disability - Effects on parents and carers - Role of PCP/psychologists to work with school systems
2	- Assessment of intellectual disability - Behavioral training techniques (using simple instructions, breaking down tasks into smaller steps, and discouraging punishment). - Psychoeducation of parents (providing information, inculcating hope, and managing expectations).
3	- Highly neglected aspect of the current training of doctors in KP - Discussion on behavioral modification, especially the concept of rewards (such as affection, attention,

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

	play time, and not gifts was new for PCP) - Psychologists were inclined to discuss differential diagnosis of specific developmental disorders such as autism spectrum disorder. - Psychologists were inclined to discuss the use of standardized assessment tools. - The module needs at least 1.5 hours
	Harmful use of alcohol and drugs
1	- Large group discussion on stigma associated with use of substances and how person using substances is blamed and dismissed by the healthcare providers. - Symptomatic management of opioid withdrawal. - Discussion on the rights of people with forced admissions and unregulated practices at the 'Detox centers.'
2	- Roleplay on motivational interview (particularly the challenge to remain non-judgmental) Initially demonstrated by the facilitator, later practiced in small groups.
3	- All participants were unclear about their role in caring for people using substances of abuse (before the training).
	Suicide
1	- Large group discussions of rates of suicide and common methods in their districts, stigma, socio-religious-cultural factors, role of mental health professionals in suicide prevention. - Effects on families
2	- Role play on assessment of suicide risk (Sensitive and non-judgmental interview) - Initially demonstrated by the facilitator, later practiced in small groups.
3	- Stories shared by the participants were very helpful in highlighting issues related to suicide prevention. - There were many questions about impulsive acts of self-harm (without suicide intent) - Discussion about confidentiality when someone discloses suicide intent was difficult.
	Epilepsy
1	- Management of status epilepticus - Demonstration of recovery position (in one group, a video was shared by a participant) - Differentiating between epileptic and non-epileptic seizures (included in acute stress in mhGAP-HIG-PK) - Role of PCP/psychologists in ensuring treatment adherence
2	- Role play on Psychoeducation
3	- Psychologists had no experience of working with people who had epilepsy. They believed that they have no role in these cases (before the training)
	Other
1	- Personal experiences of PCP sharing their difficulty in dealing with people when all investigations are clear, but there are constant demands for further investigations and medicines, including multivitamins. - Discussion on psychosocial interventions was very helpful.
2	- Demonstration of psychosocial interventions (particularly linking the symptoms with their distress)
3	- Most PCP believed that a placebo helps in OTH symptoms (before the training). - The participants reported that cases of mild depression, somatization, and anxiety frequently present in the primary care and are often prescribed unnecessary medication and referred for excessive investigations. - This module needs to be emphasized in training and supervision as a priority for KP. - The module needs at least 2 hours.
	Additional challenges reported by the trainers
	- To follow the content of the guide and not digress and give additional information from own experiences. - Needed to be reminded that they are teaching PCPs and not postgraduate students of psychiatry.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

	- It would have been a much bigger challenge if the Urdu translations of the questions were not included. - Some were concerned that inadequate knowledge and skills might lead to mismanagement of cases. - Balancing the responsibility to cover the content of the module and responding to the queries and discussions raised by the participants during a limited time.

Discussion

Although efforts to implement mhGAP-HIG in KP have been made in the last few years, these were isolated initiatives that lacked long-term planning and impact (20,21). The model of collaboration between the MoPD&SI (technical support), IMC (logistic and financial support), and the provincial health department (nominations of PCPs) is likely to help scale up the initiative effectively across the province.

Faregh et al. (2019) highlighted the challenge of identifying suitable trainers. Our experience suggests that incentivizing motivated mid-career specialists into a tailored career path could address this issue. Greater attention is also needed to select PCPs, as some primarily work as hospital administrators, others may lack interest in mental healthcare, and some close to retirement may not be interested in additional training. Furthermore, Pakistan's under-resourced and challenging healthcare system has led many doctors to immigrate for better job opportunities. One study reported that a third of medical students aspire to move overseas after graduation owing to a lack of resources and ineffective management, impacting Pakistan's socio-medical landscape (22,23). There is an imminent need to invest in younger, tech-savvy doctors who choose to work in their districts, interested in expanding their skills and more likely to have overcome stigmas associated with mental disorders.

The printed guide and mobile application proved to be valuable training tools, ensuring standardization across facilitators. The hard copies minimized reliance on technology and the internet, helped in better retention with personalized annotations, and enabled continuous learning outside formal training sessions. The guide's Urdu interview questions and psychosocial techniques were particularly useful during role plays to build their confidence, improving skills to elicit symptoms, and offer psychosocial interventions. The trainers refrained from didactic teaching, and the trainees refrained from taking notes. The workshops became more interactive and hands-on as the trainees engaged proactively in clinical discussions and skills demonstrations. Participants recommended extending training duration to allow more case practice (9).

This was the first initiative in Pakistan involving both PCPs and CPs as trainers and trainees. Given growing number of trainings programs for CPs in Pakistan, they represent an underutilized mental health resource whose existing training gaps can be overcome through mhGAP training (24). The mixed group of participants facilitated a shift from a biomedical to a biopsychosocial approach as well.

During supervision, it became evident that referral pathways were influenced by the uneven distribution of specialist services across districts. The referral process was most effective when trainers worked in the tertiary hospitals, facilitating personal links between the PCPs and specialists. The absence of child and adolescent mental health specialists emerged as a critical gap in the referral system.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

The training evaluation was also encouraging, where a substantial increase in knowledge was shown across all districts. The pre-test scores revealed notable knowledge gaps of common mental disorders, particularly in GPC, PTSD, SUI, SUB, and EPI. Significant Knowledge gaps in SUB and SUI were also found in Tunisia (25). There were three questions (T/F type) that were incorrectly attempted by two-thirds of the trainees in the pre-test, indicating widespread prevailing misconceptions. These included:

a. People with mental disorders cannot make decisions about their treatment/health.
b. People with drug dependence should be immediately admitted for detoxification.
c. Asking about thoughts of self-harm increases the risk of suicide.

Existing gaps in knowledge related to harmful use of substances have been documented in other humanitarian emergencies (26) According to United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (2013), 10.7% of the population of KP "abused harder narcotics," which was nearly double the national average at that time. Since then, there has been an alarming rise in the use of illicit substances, but health professionals are not equipped to respond with basic psychosocial interventions (27,28). Worryingly, this gap is steadily being filled by commercial and sometimes unscientific detoxification services.

The evaluation of our training is based on significant improvement in knowledge shown in the post-training testing, a trend that has been confirmed by other trainings (8,10,11,19). Logistic and budgetary constraints restricted our ability to explore knowledge retention across all districts at the 8 months. However, based on our analyses of six districts, we believe that knowledge retention at 8 months is likely to be consistent in the other districts, considering the demographic similarities, as well as immediate post-training results.

Our study demonstrates several strengths, including a collaborative approach, a diverse trainees' group comprising PCPs and CPs, a highly interactive training experience, with a follow-up refresher training. Furthermore, the detailed daily reports prepared by trainers and summarized as 'reflections' proved valuable in identifying crucial areas within each module and highlighting the most effective methodologies. However, certain limitations were noted. Firstly, selection criteria for PCPs (based on clinical experience and interest) should have been specified. Secondly, trainers should have been formally engaged, preferably through financial or career incentives. Thirdly, our training pre- and post-evaluations could have been robust by using additional measures to assess skills, attitudes, and confidence. Lastly, the duration of training could have been extended as there was limited time for completing extensive content.

Future Directions

Mental health must be identified as a priority at the provincial level. A coordinating mechanism is needed between the health department, humanitarian agencies, and development partners. Currently, many projects are undertaken in silos with blurred and short-term outcomes. A clear direction needs to be set with focused objectives to optimize resource utilization.

An average district in KP has at least a hundred doctors working at the primary care level who are a huge potential resource for providing MHPSS services (29). Our work demonstrates a way forward to scale up capacity building initiative across the province. All efforts are needed to develop a multidisciplinary PHCWs workforce. For this reason, regular posts for CPs should be created at primary healthcare facilities.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Additionally, we recommend incorporating the guide into pre-service medical training, as its successful implementation in undergraduate and postgraduate programs for medical and allied specialties is well-documented (12,30).

List of abbreviations

mhGAP-IG: Mental Health Gap Action Program, Intervention Guide; mhGAP-HIG: Mental Health Gap Action Program, Humanitarian Intervention Guide; mhGAP-HIG-PK; Mental Health Gap Action Program, Humanitarian Intervention Guide Pakistan; MHPSS: Mental Health and Psychosocial Support; MoPD&SI: Ministry of Planning, Development & Special Initiatives; PHCWs: Primary health care workers; PCPs: Primary care physicians; CPs: Clinical Psychologists; IMC: International Medical Corps; UNICEF: United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund; UNHCR: United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees; LMS: Learning Management System; PTSD: Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder; FGDs: Focus Group Discussions; ToT: Training of Trainers; GBD: Global Burden of Disease; YLDs: Years of healthy Life lost due to Disability; ACU: Acute stress; GRI: Grief; ID: Intellectual Disability; SUB: Harmful use of substances; PSY: Psychosis; ADHD: Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder; GPC: General Principles of Care; COVID-19: Corona Virus Disease; LMICs; Low and Middle Income Countries; OTH: Other significant mental health complaints; MCQs: Multiple Choice Questions.

Acknowledgments

We would like to thank Dr. Irshad Roghani, Director Public Health, Department of Health, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and International Medical Corps, Pakistan for their support and collaboration.

We would also like to thank our team of trainers who contributed to the pilot testing without any incentives: Ibrahim Khan, Dr Izaz Jamal, Maria Ayaz, Dr M Muslim Khan, Shahzad Anwar, Dr Syed Tahir Hussain Shah.

Ethics approval and consent to participate

Informed consent was obtained from members of focus group discussions. Participants were debriefed about the study. All participants voluntarily participated in the study. This study was conducted as part of the Mental Health and Psychosocial Support Project, approved by Ministry of Planning, Development and Special Initiatives, Government of Pakistan.

Consent for publication

All authors consented to publication.

Availability of data and materials

The data used in the current study will be available on request from the corresponding author.

Competing interests

None.

Funding

This work was supported by UNICEF as part of their emergency response to the COVID-19 pandemic in Pakistan. However, the research and publication process of this paper has not been funded.

Author's contributions

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint **(which was not certified by peer review)** is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

This study was conceptualized by AH, with AH also responsible for data curation and project administration. AN conducted the analysis, whereas AH and AN jointly devised the method and composed the original draft. The manuscript was edited and reviewed by AH.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

References

1. Khan SA, Ahmed Khan S. Situation Analysis of Health Care System of Pakistan: Post 18 Amendments Health Care: Current Reviews Situation Analysis of Health Care System of Pakistan: Post 18 Amendments. 2019; Available from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/362127117
2. Asian Development Bank. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Health Systems Strengthening Program: Report and Recommendation of the President [Internet]. 2022. Available from: https://www.adb.org/projects/documents/pak-54297-001-rrp
3. Yousafzai AW, Khan SA, Bano S, Khan MM. Exploring the phenomenon of suicidal behaviour (SB): An explanatory, mixed-method study in rural Pakistan. Int J Soc Psychiatry. 2022 Dec 13;68(8):1629–35.
4. Ahmed Z, Nisa Q, Wahab A, Y, Khoja S, Chaudhry J. Trends and patterns of suicide of people in Chitral, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. KMUJ 2016. 2016;8(2):72–7.
5. Humayun A. https://www.pc.gov.pk/web/blog/getblog/14. 2021. A rights-based digital solution for public mental healthcare in Pakistan.
6. World Health Organisation & UNHCR. mhGAP Humanitarian Intervention Guide (mhGAP-HIG) [Internet]. Geneva; 2015. Available from: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789241548922
7. Humayun et al. Developing capacity building tools to implement mhGAP-HIG in Pakistan. Under review. 2024
8. Al-Uzri M, Al-Taiar H, Abdulghani EA, Abbas YA, Suleman M. Impact of mhGAP-IG training on primary care physicians' knowledge of mental, neurological and substance use disorders in Iraq. BJPsych Int. 2024 Feb 4;21(1):14–6.
9. Engelhard C, Haack S, Alik T. Implementation of the Mental Health Gap Action Programme (mhGAP) in Kosrae State in the Federated States of Micronesia. Asia-Pacific J public Heal. 2021 Sep;33(6–7):784–5.
10. Karaoğlan Kahiloğulları A, Alataş E, Ertuğrul F, Malaj A. Responding to mental health needs of Syrian refugees in Turkey: mhGAP training impact assessment. Int J Ment Health Syst. 2020 Dec 11;14(1):84.
11. Kokota D, Lund C, Ahrens J, Breuer E, Gilfillan S. Evaluation of mhGAP training for primary healthcare workers in Mulanje, Malawi: a quasi-experimental and time series study. Int J Ment Health Syst. 2020 Dec 20;14(1):3.
12. Pinchuk I, Yachnik Y, Kopchak O, Avetisyan K, Gasparyan K, Ghazaryan G, et al. The implementation of the who mental health gap intervention guide (Mhgap-ig) in ukraine, armenia, georgia and kyrgyz republic. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2021 May 1;18(9).
13. Keynejad R, Spagnolo J, Thornicroft G. WHO mental health gap action programme (mhGAP) intervention guide: updated systematic review on evidence and impact. Evid Based Ment Heal. 2021 Aug;24(3):124–30.
14. Pakistan Bureau of Statistics. Provincial Census Report, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa [Internet]. Islamabad; 2017. Available from: https://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/population/census_reports/pcr_kp.pdf
15. Humayun A. Closing the mental health gap. DAWN Newspaper. 2023 Aug 31. Available from: https://www.dawn.com/news/1773217
16. Javed A, Khan MS, Nasar A, Rasheed A. Mental healthcare in Pakistan. Taiwan J Psychiatry. 2020;34(1):6.
17. IBM. IBM SPSS Statistics for Windows. Armonk, NY: IBM Corp; 2019.
18. Griffiths KM, Carron-Arthur B, Parsons A, Reid R. Effectiveness of programs for reducing the

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.11.21.24317704; this version posted November 29, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint **(which was not certified by peer review)** is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

stigma associated with mental disorders. A meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. World Psychiatry. 2014 Jun;13(2):161–75.

19. Ahrens J, Kokota D, Mafuta C, Konyani M, Chasweka D, Mwale O, et al. Implementing an mhGAP-based training and supervision package to improve healthcare workers' competencies and access to mental health care in Malawi. Int J Ment Health Syst. 2020 Dec 27;14(1):11.
20. Humayun A, Haq I, Khan FR, Azad N, Khan MM, Weissbecker I. Implementing mhGAP training to strengthen existing services for an internally displaced population in Pakistan. Glob Ment Heal. 2017;4.
21. International Medical Corps. Rapid Mental Health and Psychosocial Support Needs Assessment in Haripur, Mansehra and Lower Dir Afghan Refugee Villages of Pakistan. [Internet]. Pakistan; 2021. Available from: https://cdn1.internationalmedicalcorps.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/2021-Pakistan-MHPSS-Assessment.pdf
22. Faregh N, Lencucha R, Ventevogel P, Dubale BW, Kirmayer LJ. Considering culture, context and community in mhGAP implementation and training: Challenges and recommendations from the field. Vol. 13, International Journal of Mental Health Systems. BioMed Central Ltd.; 2019.
23. Nadir F, Sardar H, Ahmad H. Perceptions of medical students regarding brain drain and its effects on Pakistan's socio-medical conditions: A cross-sectional study. Pakistan J Med Sci. 2023 Jan 27;39(2).
24. World Health Organization. Stories of change in four countries: building capacity for integrating mental health care within health services across humanitarian settings. 2021;ISBN 978-92-4-003722.
25. Spagnolo J, Champagne F, Leduc N, Melki W, Guesmi I, Bram N, et al. Tailoring a training based on the *Mental Health Gap Action Programme (mhGAP) Intervention Guide (IG)* to Tunisia: process and relevant adaptations. Glob Ment Heal. 2018 May 9;5:e17.
26. Greene MC, Haddad S, Busse A, Ezard N, Ventevogel P, Demis L, et al. Priorities for addressing substance use disorder in humanitarian settings. Confl Health. 2021 Sep 23;15(1):71.
27. United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. Drug use in Pakistan. 2013. Available from: https://www.unodc.org/documents/pakistan/Survey_Report_Final_2013.pdf
28. Anti-Narcotics Force, Government of Pakistan. Anf hospitals - Addicts treatment & rehabilitation centres (matrcs). 2024. Available from: https://anfkpk.gov.pk/rehabilitation/
29. Raviola G, Naslund JA, Smith SL, Patel V. Innovative Models in Mental Health Delivery Systems: Task Sharing Care with Non-specialist Providers to Close the Mental Health Treatment Gap. Curr Psychiatry Rep. 2019 Jun 30;21(6):44.
30. Chaulagain A, Pacione L, Abdulmalik J, Hughes P, Oksana K, Chumak S, et al. WHO Mental Health Gap Action Programme Intervention Guide (mhGAP-IG): the first pre-service training study. Int J Ment Health Syst. 2020 Dec 29;14(1):47.