medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Nurses' and doctors' perspectives on emergency and critical care at primary health care facilities in Kilimanjaro, Tanzania

Manji N Isack[1,2*], Dickson A. Mkoka[2], Beatrice E. Mwilike[3]

*__Correspondence:__ Manji N Isack, Department of Nursing, Kilimanjaro Christian Medical Centre, P.O Box 3010, Moshi, Tanzania, Tel: +255-768-254-800. E-mail: nyaganya2018@gmail.com

Authors' affiliation

[1]Department of Nursing, Kilimanjaro Christian Medical Centre, Moshi, Tanzania, [2]Department of Clinical Nursing, Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, Dares Salaam, Tanzania, [3]Department of Community Health Nursing, Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Co-authors' contacts

Name	E-mail
Dickson A. Mkoka	mkokamalinga@yahoo.co.uk
Beatrice E. Mwilike	beatricemwilike@yahoo.com

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Abstract

Background: In Tanzania, primary health care faces the worst challenges in delivering emergency and critical care with purposeful improvement strategies alarming from multiple stakeholders. This study described nurses' and doctors' perspectives on emergency and critical care at primary healthcare facilities in Kilimanjaro, Tanzania.

Methods: A descriptive qualitative design was used. Twelve participants; 6 nurses and 6 doctors from three primary healthcare facilities in Moshi Municipal were purposively recruited for the audio-recorded, face-to-face individualized, in-depth interviews. Themes were generated through thematic analysis of the data.

Results: The analysis resulted in five (5) major themes: unconducive environment, disparity and disconnection of the continuum of care along the health care system, routines for emergency and critical care, raised needs for emergency and critical care, and strategies for improvement.

Conclusion: Nurses and doctors in primary healthcare severely face many challenges that limit their ability to manage critical illnesses adequately associated with the absence of favorable infrastructures, guidelines, trained personnel, on-job training, and expert support from higher-level hospitals, and the shortage of staff, lack of essential drugs and equipment, and lack of staff and managerial prioritization thereby tilting the balance of survival in these settings to the worst side.

Keywords: Critical Care, Doctors, Emergency Care, Nurses, Perspective, Primary Health Care, Tanzania

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Introduction

The immediate resuscitation of a critically ill patient (CIP) on arrival is "emergency care" while the care of inpatients when in a critical state is "critical care" [1]. Globally, emergency and critical care (EaCC) are recognized as essential components of any health care system (HCS) in counteracting the burden of severe diseases [2,3]. Currently in high-income countries (HICs), services are highly developed, provided under advanced infrastructures, sophisticated equipment, and a higher staff-to-patient ratio than in low-income countries (LICs) like that of Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) [2,4].

While SSA contributes 25 percent of the global burden of severe diseases [5] with intensive care unit (ICU) mortality extending over 50% in some countries [6,7] its capacity to provide EaCC is unknown [8]. In most SSA countries including Tanzania, economic challenges limit government prioritization and dissemination of the technologically advanced EaCC in all levels of HCS; primary, secondary, and tertiary [1,6] resulting in the widely observed concentration of major services in large tertiary hospitals in cities and less developed in lower-level hospitals; regional (secondary) and primary health care (PHC) facilities in this context [1,6,9,10].

Tanzania like other SSA countries, its exact EaCC capacity is unknown despite previous studies describing a substantial burden for managing critical illness at all levels of HCS with PHC cited as the weakest part of services provision in terms of infrastructures and resources [10,11,12]. To determine the positive outcomes from critical illness, PHC facilities that serve most of the general population and form the initial entry to the HCS [13] should be equipped with the means to provide essential care to all CIPs [1,3]. Although, previous studies in Tanzania had less focus on EaCC capacity in PHC, to our understanding, none of them had explored what health professionals are going through when caring for CIPs in these resource-limited settings and what they perceive to be the improvement needs. Therefore, this study described nurses' and doctors' perspectives on emergency and critical care at primary healthcare facilities in Kilimanjaro, Tanzania.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Methods

Study design

Between 12 May 2021 and 30 June 2021, we conducted a phenomenological qualitative study exploring nurses' and doctors' perspectives on EaCC among PHC facilities in Moshi Municipal, Kilimanjaro region of northern Tanzania.

Setting

By 2022, the Kilimanjaro region sheltered 1,861,934 people [14]. The Municipality of Moshi constitutes one of the seven districts in the area within which the regional hospital called "Mawenzi" and a tertiary-zonal consultant hospital called "Kilimanjaro Christian Medical Centre (KCMC)" are found. The HCS in Moshi Municipal consists mainly of government-owned facilities, with very few health facilities owned by the private sector and non-government organizations (NGOs). The PHC facilities include 3 hospitals, 10 health centers (HCs), and 45 dispensaries [15]. This study was conducted in St. Joseph Hospital; a council-designated hospital (CDH), and two HCs "Pasua and Majengo". All these facilities provide both outpatient and inpatient care with EaCC depending on the severity of illness while complex cases or those labeled as critically ill follow the pyramidal referral system of a primary care system in the country and are referred to regional and tertiary hospitals. The perspectives of health professionals on EaCC in the region have never been explored in previous studies, making it a valid site for exploration in this study.

Recruitment of participants

Physicians and nurses in charge assisted in the purposeful selection of informants from different units in the general wards, observation room, theatre, labor ward, and administration to ensure that the data extracted were contextually representative. Nurses and doctors who are more likely to encounter and be actively involved with CIPs in their daily practices and their high chance of availability in PHC facilities were considered reasonable study population selection criteria for this

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

study. Participant's inclusion involved working exclusively at the specific facilities for at least 1 year and having taken care of a CIP within six months before this study.

Data collection

A semi-structured interview guide constructed based on existing literature related to the provision of EaCC in low-resource settings and the prolonged experience of the first author (MNI) in the study setting guided the interviews. All interviews were conducted privately within the hospital premises in the doctors' rooms and offices to avoid overhearing from third parties. Two excluded interviews, in the final analysis, were conducted in one of the study facilities to test the quality of the research tool in fulfilling the study objectives and for the researcher to gain confidence and modify the interviewing style based on identified errors. (MNI) conducted all the face-to-face in-depth interviews in Kiswahili, audio-recorded, and lasted 25-40 minutes. In the field, the researcher reviewed some documents and records, physically observed and experienced the environments, and took notes on relevant hospital care-delivering systems and insights for future referencing, familiarization, and triangulation of interview findings. Interviews stopped at 12th participants after realizing no new information was extracted from continued interviews, as described by [16]. Later, the interviewer validated the transcripts with individual participants before exiting the research field.

Data analysis

Inductive thematic analysis framework [17] guided the data analysis. (MNI) transcribed all interviews verbatim into written accounts then translated into English. The three authors thereafter sat to familiarize themselves with the data with identified gaps in transcription and translation corrected, accordingly. For consistency interpretation [18] the three authors separately manually coded four interviews each re-reading and identifying relevant meaningful units and their patterns between lines of the dataset then condensing them into codes, continuously re-evaluating them, and merging them into themes. The three authors then re-sat together to contemplate the preliminary themes by understanding their meaning, coherence, and distinction until the final set

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

of themes with their sub-themes was agreed upon by correcting the coding process, merging similar or separating different ones, and modifying their names based on diversity of the data.

Results

Participants characteristics

Of the 12 participants; 6 were nurses and 6 doctors. Of the nurses; equal numbers of (3) were Enrolled Nurses (EN) and Registered Nurses (RN), respectively. Among the doctors; the majority (4) were Clinical Officers (CO) and 2 Medical Doctors (MD). 7 were female and 5 were males. Their age ranged between 24-45 years old with the majority (5) being in their 20s, 3 in their 30s, and 4 in their 40s. Their work experience ranged between 1-23 years with the majority (8) being below their 10s, and an equal number (2) in their 10s and 20s, respectively. St. Joseph Hospital contributed 5 participants, Majengo 4 and Pasua 3. And none of the participants had prior training on EaCC.

Findings from interviews

Five (5) themes emerged from in-depth interviews of nurses' and doctors' perspectives on EaCC in PHC. Key findings in each theme are presented below with the best participant's direct quotation in italics. Table 1 summarizes the final thematic map of the data analysis.

Table 1 Themes and sub-themes describing nurses' and doctors' perspectives on EaCC

Perspectives on	Themes	Sub-themes
Delivery of EaCC in PHC	Raised needs for EaCC	− Expanded services
		− Training to build competency
	Routines for EaCC	− Identifying and managing CIPs
		− Referring to complex cases
		− Unfavorable infrastructures

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Challenges in delivering EaCC in PHC	Unconducive environment	− Unavailable guidelines
		− Lack of ambulance
		− Shortage of staff and skilled personnel
		− Delays in medical and equipment supplies
		− Lack of blood bank and products
		− Lacking essential drugs and equipment
		− Lacking staff and managerial prioritization
		− Absence of training and expert support from higher-level hospitals
	Disparity and disconnection of the continuum of care along the HCS	
Improving EaCC services in PHC	Strategies for improvement	− Leadership and managerial vision and commitment to strengthening services
		− Policy and research direction
		− Curriculum review
		− Universal guideline

Unconducive environment

The difficult working environment associated with resource scarcity is greatly reflected in the burden for and quality of EaCC delivered in these PHC facilities. For example, none of the facilities had an emergency department (ED) or ICU. The absence of these crucial infrastructures limited the number of patients attended at once and how early they could receive care in case of emergencies.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

"We do not have an ED or ICU only a small observation room with three beds, congested and less-equipped which does not permit adequate care to many patients in case of emergencies. It is stressful and mostly you find yourself powerless because what you desired is not what you delivered and many times if yes, is very late and inadequate" (P04-CDH).

Like their desire to care for some patients, the unfavorable infrastructures forced them to conduct many referrals that they perceived as "preventable" if only services were available.

"…many cases that could have ended here are referred because infrastructures are not supportive…" (01-CDH).

Delayment and lack of quality care as a result of the unfavorable infrastructures caused the worsening and development of multi-organ failure and deaths before they reached and received appropriate treatment at higher-level hospitals.

"Even when you plan an early referral, the challenge is, what are you doing to them before they reach there? Because infrastructures cannot permit adequate resuscitation care, you find some changes abruptly and die. Even those that manage to reach there, their conditions already deteriorated to complicate the management and cure" (P12-HC).

None of the facilities had expert or trained personnel in EaCC or triaging and the protocols for managing emergencies. Instead, the so-called "experience-based care" and individual-based capability remained the best weapons in prompt identification, prioritization, and care in PHC.

"Sometimes your mind is exhausted then you need someone with specialization to add over or guideline but are not available; instead you dwell in your experience and capability which does not always work" (P10-HC).

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Despite the skills, availability of an adequate number of staff is key to successful EaCC delivery. When scarce, prioritization, adequacy of care, and outcomes are at a crossroads as observed in this study.

"I am in a shift alone, 32 patients, how can I concentrate with only one patient while the others are waiting for medication, investigations, feeding, etc.? Even in an emergency, how can I resuscitate a patient alone? Until I call for help, a clock will not be standing by and waiting for me" (P04-CDH).

The inadequate EaCC at PHC was attributed to the absence of on-the-job training, lack of expert support from higher-level hospitals, and lack of commitment from hospital management. The manifesting effect is the conduction of many unnecessary referrals.

"In my 20 years here, I have never witnessed any training on EaCC…KCMC has many specialists but they never visited here to teach us. In another way I cannot blame them, it is a problem of our management not prioritizing bringing them here" (P08-HC).

A combination of the absence of training, trained personnel, and expert support limits staff from acquiring knowledge of urgency and prioritization in managing critical illnesses manifesting in poor care and outcomes.

"Most staff have never been trained and severely lack knowledge on identifying and prioritizing care for the ones critically ill. For example, your order, let the drip run fast but you come it is slow; you can think it is negligence but in reality, people do not know" (P02-CDH).

Lack of essential drugs and equipment associated with unprioritized ordering or delayment from the suppliers is one way that successful resuscitation, management, and recovery in PHC was a difficult examination to undertake.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

"I had a patient with asthmatic attack. I ran to the pharmacy for salbutamol but sadly found it out of stock. when asked why, their answer was ooh! There is delayment from the suppliers…You wander in all wards until you get it. You come again, no cardiac monitor, the pulse-oximetry is not working, you cannot determine the patient's status…by jokes, you can lose the patient" (P09-HC).

Oxygen and delivery equipment which are essential for breathing are not always available and adequate to assist management and referrals which determined some deaths.

"Many patients die just by the lack of oxygen…The electric-driven oxygen concentrators cannot work in cases of a power outage and many patients considering we lack backup oxygen cylinders…you conduct a referral and you find an empty cylinder in the ambulance, you tell the driver to rush, and when you are asked, why the patient is not on oxygen you pretend ooh! it was finished on the road…you delivered twins with birth asphyxia you find a single cylinder in the ambulance and no connector so you get confused instead you rush alternating the nasal cannula once you see the other becomes blue until you reach there…" (P06-HC).

Much as they wished to save lives in emergencies and conduct early referrals of complicated cases, their efforts were sometimes hindered by the absence of blood products, theatre, and a single ambulance saving all the HCs and dispensaries in the municipality.

"…you encountered postpartum hemorrhage but no blood bank here or theatre then you call an ambulance and you find is in use in the other facility so you will have to wait for an unknown period in the meanwhile the patient's condition is endangering…" (P08 & 10-HC).

Routines for emergency and critical care

As far as emergencies are concerned, participants put forward saving patients' lives even before registration and payment.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

"We usually give immediate care if the patient comes very ill even before registration or payment…" (P05-CDH).

Recommendably, participants understood their PHC capabilities in providing EaCC and took it as a tool in planning early referrals of complex cases.

"We know our scope of resources so we cannot stay here with the patient we cannot manage instead we usually conduct early referrals…" P05-CDH, P11 & 12-HC).

None of the facilities bore a trained staff in triaging nor a formal triaging system for attended patients. A triage area was only present at the CDH and absent in both the HCs. The lack of these key determinants of successful EaCC created "routine-based care" instead of immediate "evidence-based care" manifesting in delayed care and poor outcomes.

"…such triaging protocol and trained staff are not available…" (P01-CDH).

"All patients await outside at the bench to see the doctor where some who are critically ill may fail to be detected early in the clouds due to the absence of a triage area and a dedicated triage nurse" (P06, 07 & 10-HC).

Disparity and disconnection of the continuum of care along the healthcare system

Routinely many referrals from PHC for example, HCs were conducted directly to a tertiary hospital bypassing several levels of health care services provision in between. An experienced nurse in referrals from one of the HCs described the advancement of EaCC in tertiary hospitals than what was seen in regional and primary hospitals as the gap of services existing in these levels of health services provision; staging as the root cause for the by-passing nature of referrals and a limiting factor to early continuity of care.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

"…you send a patient with birth asphyxia to Mawenzi; you reach there; they tell you, send to KCMC we are also sending our patients there. You catch another road to KCMC; you reach there; although you can see that their ED is big much time has been lost and the patient's condition may have already deteriorated without receiving appropriate treatment…since we understand the capability of each hospital, we usually avoid roaming at the district or regional hospital and go directly to KCMC" (P06-HC).

The bypassing nature of referrals increases the high patient inflation rate disproportionate to available resources creating overload and burden of care in tertiary hospitals.

"It is an overload to them; imagine all patients in need of oxygen are sent there…" (P09-HC).

Ideally, the PHC serves most of the general population therefore, the absence of quality services in these settings induces distress, economic drainage, poverty, and deaths through long lead-to-follow services in large hospitals and the associated cost of managing complications.

"Patients travel far for services that could've ended here where some who are seriously ill or lack the money may die before reaching there and if managed can be too late to require long-term aggressive management; that is all cost" (P03-CDH).

Raised needs for emergency and critical care

Expanding services by improving the availability of infrastructures and resources for providing quality EaCC is the main cry for nurses and doctors in PHC to boost morale and care satisfaction.

"We wish to work in a well-equipped ED and ICU that allows our patients to get the care they want and we staff will be happy that we are saving lives" (P03-CDH).

Adding essential resources like oxygen cylinders and blood could ensure survival by aiding prompt treatment, preventing some referrals and deaths, and overall quality of care.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

"Adding oxygen and devices to back up our oxygen concentrators in situations of power outages and enough in the ambulance for referrals, and blood will enable many patients to get appropriate-satisfactory care early, saved, and not unnecessarily referred" (P04-HC).

Obtaining satisfactory care at PHC can relieve the overload and burden of care in higher-level hospitals and scale down the service gap in the HCS.

"…improving services in PHC facilities is a relief for tertiary hospitals like we have reduced the number of cesarean section referrals just by training" (P02-CDH & P12-HC).

Much as training concerns, participants perceived the need to equip all hospital workers with the knowledge to facilitate clinical decision-making and prioritization in the care of CIPs.

"… training should be non-discriminatory and should start with watchmen in the gates and health attendants to all other staff in the wards, pharmacy, and laboratory to have a common understanding on why CIPs require urgent care than the others…" (P07-HC).

Strategies for improvement

For effective delivery of good quality, EaCC services in PHC, leaders' and managers' vision and commitment are two paramount things that cannot be evaded. Visionary leadership can evaluate the burden in care and stage to improve by using available resources or cooperating with stakeholders to add the necessary infrastructures and resources, free-course-trainings, and staff development by providing scholarships for higher education or inter-hospital exchange programs.

"The management should realize how many lives are lost just by the absence of oxygen and staff lacking knowledge. Bad enough, many EaCC courses are paid which prevents many staff from undertaking. I believe if the hospital is committed can cooperate with the government and experts to teach people about trauma and other emergencies for free. They can even sponsor some of us

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

to school or send some to those advanced hospitals to learn the skills and *improve care upon return. You see! It is only a matter of readiness and prioritization" (P02-CDH).*

Concurrently, participants cited some of the previously successful services under universal health coverage (UHC) as their evidence for possible wide dissemination of EaCC in PHC only once recognized as essential components of health services provision by the health policy.

"If the government succeeded in bringing Anti-Retroviral Therapy, essential drugs, vaccines, and family planning services in PHC I think can also see the need for EaCC incorporation into the UHC policy and facilitate their wide coverage" (P02-CDH & P11-HC).

To ensure essential recognition by health policy, more studies to evaluate the ability of PHC to provide EaCC, researchers to ensure their findings return to the relevant authorities for action, and the respective institutional management to send the clear burden and needs for care to the central government should be prioritized.

"…the government needs a clear picture of how much the PHC can provide EaCC…In another way, it is the duty of you who are collecting data to return the clear gap to the management and also for them to inform the government because sometimes you may be blaming the government but it might not be receiving the correct information from down" (P03-CDH, P06 & 11-HC).

Having a common understanding and direction in managing critical illnesses is essential in achieving universal-quality care. Besides training, participants cried for the prioritized need for a universal guideline to direct what essential services should be provided to a particular critical condition in PHC regardless of location, and before or during referring for the possible best outcomes.

"…It is because we lack a clear guideline that everyone provides dissimilar depth of treatment in similar cases…if there could be some sort of a guideline like care given to an asthmatic patient at

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Majengo is similar to that of Pasua could greatly improve care and for those referred at least could receive all the necessary resuscitations to keep their health alive" (P11-HC).

Lastly, incorporating EaCC as an essential course in the curriculum for basic programs across all cadres can significantly reduce the care gap by supplementing the larger group of health professionals operating in the HCS without acquiring the basics of EaCC from their graduations.

"Badly, EaCC is not part of many curriculums. Most workers here are certificate and diploma holders who likely never taught nor rotated to tertiary hospitals to cover the skills. So, I believe all graduates regardless of the level of professional certificate should have already been taught about this to reduce the gap of waiting for the very few who succeed in higher education" (PO2-CDH).

Discussion

The discussion described the perspectives of nurses and doctors regarding the provision of EaCC services at PHC in Tanzania stemming from the difficulties they face during the caring process to referring to the complex cases manifesting in care inadequacy and questionable outcomes. The main challenges were the absence of unfavorable infrastructures (ED and ICU) in all the facilities, with a triage area and a small observation found only in the CDH similar to previous studies [10,12]. Underdeveloped services in primary hospitals explain why EaCC are observed unprioritized part of health services provision, especially in LICs [1] leaving most patients cared for in facilities that severely lack the necessary structures and resources for EaCC, leading to unnecessary referrals and overburdening in higher-level hospitals, and even preventable deaths [9,19,20].

Like in other previous studies in Tanzania and Malawi [9,10,12,15,20,21] in this study also, essential drugs, monitoring and life-saving equipment, blood, and oxygen which are essentials for patients with severe disease and organ failures were not always available in emergencies and linked to the lack of hospital and government commitment and prioritization, poor self-assessment needs, and delayed supply from authorized dealers. The effect is that health professionals fail to

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

deliver optimal care to CIPs [19,22] by limiting early diagnosis and responding [23] manifesting in an increased number of unnecessary referrals and deaths [20,21]. Therefore, efforts to equip the PHCs with the means to provide essential care to all CIPs should be prioritized [1,3] to counteract the burden of critical illnesses [19], improve staff morale, create a conducive working environment, caring abilities, job, and care satisfaction [22], and reduce mortalities [24].

The participants in this study reported a shortage of staff, and the absence of experts in EaCC, on-the-job training, expert support, and exchange programs similar to what was extracted in previous studies in Tanzania [6,10,12,21] which limited them from acquiring new competencies in caring for CIPs and shifting their base on individual experience and capabilities that do not always work in difficult situations requiring critical decision-making [22] thereby resulting in poor quality of care [19], lower readiness of PHCs in providing EaCC, unstructured referral system, increased unnecessary referrals and overload in higher-level hospitals [20,21]. Further, the exclusion of EaCC in most of the curriculum stems as one of the most limiting factors for health professionals graduating with a lack of awareness of the principles of EaCC in their basic programs [19,22]. Therefore, recognizing EaCC as an essential course for all cadres and incorporating their basics even from certificate, diploma, and university health programs should be prioritized to rescue the situation in PHC that constitutes most staff with lower-education level and most likely uninformed in care for the CIPs.

None of the primary facilities had a formal triaging system or protocols, and a treatment guideline for specific emergencies and critical conditions, also reported in similar settings in Tanzania [10, 12,21]. A protocol for triaging patients based on the state of illness enables those who are very sick and with the best chance of survival offered immediate care first [25] is an essential part of any successful EaCC [26] and when absent patients are always under-triaged to impact on the failure of proper allocation of resources, early recognized and treatment of severe cases, delayed

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

referrals, deterioration, and unnecessary deaths [27]. As well, equipping the PHC with guidelines is key to achieving essential quality care [1,3,6].

Referrals to higher-level hospitals were also challenging due to a single ambulance serving all the HCs and dispensaries in the municipality. This disrupted the continuity of care and resulted in the late presentation of patients to definitive management and occurrence of preventable deaths, similar to [28]. Concurrently, the bypassing nature of referrals from PHCs is a clear indication of disparity and gap of services existing in the HCS [10,15,21] alarming for emergency attention in the lower-level hospitals [1,3] to reduce long lead-to-follow services and enabling the many treated at low cost [1]. In this study, and currently [1,3], recognizing EaCC as an essential component of health services provision is a global agenda for health policy modification and a savior for LICs in achieving UHC. Also, government and stakeholders investing in research evaluating their EaCC capacity [8] should be prioritized for effective planning.

Limitations

We want to acknowledge the following: being a qualitative study may limit generalization to similar PHC settings, however, this new study provides valuable insights that stand as background knowledge for the perspectives of nurses and doctors on EaCC in PHC of a LIC. This study included only nurses and doctors who directly spend most of their time with CIPs and have more experience and knowledge regarding EaCC. We believe other staff like pharmacists, laboratory scientists, health attendants, and radiologists also be involved in the care of the CIP whether directly or indirectly based on circumstances and may have some experiences, so their exclusion may have reduced some valuable insights to our study, and we want to acknowledge this as our failure.

Conclusion

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

The study describes the multi-dimensional challenges of delivering EaCC from the perspectives of nurses and doctors in PHCs in Tanzania. Achieving timely, appropriate, adequate, and continuity-quality care was severely hindered by the absence of ED and ICUs, shortage of staff and skilled personnel, absence of treatment guidelines and triaging protocols, unstructured referral system, absence of training and expert support, lack of prioritization from the institutional management, lack of essential drugs and equipment, and lack of blood and ambulance. Therefore, strategies to equip the PHCs with the means to provide an essential-quality EaCC, curriculum recognizing EaCC as essential subjects in all basic programs, creating visionary and committed leaders, quantifying the EaCC capacity of PHCs, inter-hospital relations to aid exchange programs and expert support from higher-level hospitals should be prioritized.

Abbreviations

CIP: Critically Ill Patient; EaCC: Emergency and Critical Care; ED: Emergency Department; HCS: Health Care System; HC: Health Centre; ICU: Intensive Care Unit; KCMC: Kilimanjaro Christian Medical Centre; LIC: Low-Income Country; PHC: Primary Health Care; SSA: Sub-Saharan Africa.

Ethical Considerations

Ethical clearance (Ref. No. DA.282/298/01.C/) was obtained from the Senate Research and Publications Committee of Muhimbili University of Health and Allied Sciences (MUHAS). First permission to conduct the study (No. MMC/A.40/13/1/VOL.VI/152) was obtained from the Director of Moshi Municipal Council and second by signing and stamping the researcher's request letter by the physician in charge of each hospital. Each participant signed the informed consent form before choosing to enter interviews after the researcher fed them adequate information on the aim of the study and the importance of involvement. Participants in direct quotes were anonymized with numbers from P01-P12 and place of work (CDH/HC) to keep their confidentiality.

Consent for publication

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Not applicable

Availability of data and materials

In complying with ethical restrictions by the National Institute for Medical Research in Tanzania (NIMR), the data cannot be shared publicly to keep participant's privacy but are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests exist.

Funding

The authors received no specific funding for this research.

Authors' contributions

Conceptualization: All authors. Investigation: MNI. Data curation: All authors. Analysis and interpretation: All authors. Writing-original draft: MNI. Revision of draft: BEM. Critical revision of draft: DAM. Approval of final manuscript: All authors.

Acknowledgments

We thank the participants for sparing their precious time to share their insights through interviews.

Additional file 1 Interview guide

1	**Experience in providing EaCC in PHC**
	− How can you describe your experience of caring for CIPs in your setting?
	− What is the practice of identifying, prioritizing, managing, and referring CIPs in your setting?
	− How can you comment on the availability of EaCC services in your setting?
2	**Challenges when delivering EaCC**
	− What obstacles do you face when caring for CIPs? Why do you think they exist?

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

	– How can you link these obstacles with the availability of services and quality of care?
3	**Strategies for improvement**
	– What best can improve the availability of EaCC services at PHC in Tanzania?

Additional file 2 Relevant key EaCC characteristics of the three hospitals reported, observed or reviewed from hospital records in May 2021.

		Hospital		
		St. Joseph (CDH)	**Pasua HC**	**Majengo HC**
Services	Inpatient	✓	✓	✓ Limited to maternity
	Outpatient	✓	✓	✓
Inpatient bed capacity		150	58	13
Average daily outpatient attendance		150-250	70-130	50-100
Nurses		53	18	11
Doctors		18	9	5
ICU/High Dependency Unit (HDU)		–	–	–
ED		–	–	–
Triage area		✓	–	–
Theatre		✓	✓ Limited to cesarean section	–
Observation room		✓	–	–
Trained personnel in emergency and/or critical care or triaging		–	–	–
Ambulance		✓	Shared	Shared

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Blood bank	✓	✓	–
Anesthetists	4	1	–

References

1. Schell et al. The global need for essential emergency and critical care. Critical Care (2018) 22:284. http://doi.org/10.1186/s13054-018-2219-2.
2. Turner HC, Hao NV, Yacoub S, Hoang VMT, Clifton DA, Thwaites GE, Dondorp AM, Thwaites CL, Chau NVV. Achieving affordable critical care in low-income and middle-income countries. BMJ Glob Health. 2019 Jun 19;4(3): e001675. doi: 10.1136/bmjgh-2019-001675. PMID: 31297248; PMCID: PMC6590958.
3. Schell CO, Khalid K, Wharton-Smith A, Oliwa J, Sawe HR, Roy N, Sanga A, Marshall JC, Rylance J, Hanson C, Kayambankadzanja RK, Wallis LA, Jirwe M, Baker T; EECC Collaborators; EECC Collaborators*. Essential Emergency and Critical Care: a consensus among global clinical experts. BMJ Glob Health. 2021 Sep;6(9): e006585. doi: 10.1136/bmjgh-2021-006585. PMID: 34548380; PMCID: PMC8458367.
4. Williams G, Aliga CA, Daniel N, Adipa F. Critical care in Africa: a new chapter begins. Connect The World of Critical Care Nursing. March 2018 12(1):12-15. DOI: 10.1891/1748-6254.12.1.12
5. Adhikari NK, Fowler RA, Bhagwanjee S, Rubenfeld GD. Critical care and the global burden of critical illness in adults. Lancet. 2010 Oct 16;376(9749):1339-46. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(10)60446-1. Epub 2010 Oct 11. PMID: 20934212; PMCID: PMC7136988.
6. Baker T. Critical care in low resource settings. Stockholm: Karolinska Institute; 2015.
7. Lalani HS, Waweru-Siika W, Mwogi T et al. Intensive Care Outcomes and Mortality Prediction at a National Referral Hospital in Western Kenya. Annals of the American Thoracic Society > List of Issues > Volume 15, Issue 11, November 2018. http://doi.org/10.1513/AnnalsATS.201801-051OC.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

8. Murthy S, Adhikari NK. Global health care of the critically ill in low-resource settings. Ann Am Thorac Soc. 2013 Oct;10(5):509-13. doi: 10.1513/AnnalsATS.201307-246OT. PMID: 24161054.
9. Kayambankadzanja RK, Likaka A, Mndolo SK, Chatsika GM, Umar E, Baker T. Emergency and critical care services in Malawi: Findings from a nationwide survey of health facilities. Malawi Med J. 2020;32(1):19-23. doi:10.4314/mmj. v32i1.5.
10. Baker, T., Lugazia, E., Eriksen, J. et al. Emergency and critical care services in Tanzania: a survey of ten hospitals. BMC Health Serv Res 13, 140 (2013). http://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6963-13-140.
11. Sawe1, H., Mfinanga, J., Lidenge, S. et al. Disease patterns and clinical outcomes of patients admitted in intensive care units of tertiary referral hospitals of Tanzania. BMC International Health and Human Rights2014,14:26. http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-698X/14/26.
12. Stafford, R.E., Morrison, C.A., Godfrey, G., Mahalu, W. Challenges to the Provision of Emergency Services and Critical Care in Resource-Constrained Settings. GLOBAL HEART, VOL. 9, NO. 3, 2014: 319-323. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.gheart.2014.08.005.
13. Kapologwe, N.A., Meara, J.G., Kengia, J.T. et al. Development and upgrading of public primary healthcare facilities with essential surgical services infrastructure: a strategy towards achieving universal health coverage in Tanzania. BMC Health Serv Res 20, 218 (2020). http://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-020-5057-2.
14. The United Republic of Tanzania, Ministry of Finance and Planning, Tanzania National Bureau of Statistics and President's Office - Finance and Planning, Office of the Chief Government Statistician, Zanzibar. The 2022 Population and Housing Census: Administrative Units Population Distribution Report; Tanzania, December 2022.
15. Tanzania Medicines & Medical Devices Authority. MOSHI MUNICIPAL COUNCIL. http://www.tmda.go.tz/pages/moshi-mc. Accessed 5 May 2024.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

16. Saunders B, Sim J, Kingstone T, Baker S, Waterfield J, Bartlam B, Burroughs H, Jinks C. Saturation in qualitative research: exploring its conceptualization and operationalization. Qual Quant. 2018;52(4):1893-1907. doi: 10.1007/s11135-017-0574-8. Epub 2017 Sep 14. PMID: 29937585; PMCID: PMC5993836.
17. Braun, V., & Clarke, V. Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qualitative Research in Psychology, 2006; 3(2), 77–101. http://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa.
18. Nowell, L. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. Thematic Analysis: Striving to Meet the Trustworthiness Criteria. International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 2017; 16(1), 1609406917733847. http://doi.org/10.1177/1609406917733847.
19. Baker T. Critical care in low-income countries. Trop Med Int Health. 2009 Feb;14(2):143-8. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-3156.2008.02202. x. Epub 2009 Jan 21. PMID: 19207174.
20. Khalid K, Schell CO, Oliwa J, English M, Onyango O, Mcknight J, Mkumbo E, Awadh K, Maiba J, Baker T. Hospital readiness for the provision of care to critically ill patients in Tanzania- an in-depth cross-sectional study. BMC Health Serv Res. 2024 Feb 8;24(1):182. doi: 10.1186/s12913-024-10616-w. PMID: 38331742; PMCID: PMC10854052.
21. Jumbam, D.T., Menon, G., Lama, T.N. et al. Surgical referrals in Northern Tanzania: a prospective assessment of rates, preventability, reasons, and patterns. BMC Health Serv Res 20, 725 (2020). http://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-020-05559-x.
22. Mselle LT, Msengi H (2018) Caring Critically Ill Patients in the General Wards in Tanzania: Experience of Nurses and Physicians. Int J Crit Care Emerg Med 4:047. doi.org/10.23937.
23. Murthy, Srinivas et al. “Intensive care unit capacity in low-income countries: a systematic review.” PloS one vol. 10,1 e0116949. 24 Jan. 2015, doi 10.1371/journal.pone.0116949.
24. Duke T, Wandi F, Jonathan M, et al. Improved oxygen systems for childhood pneumonia: a multihospital effectiveness study in Papua New Guinea. Lancet 2008;372(9646):1328-1333.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.10.09.24315178; this version posted October 10, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

25. Baker A, Frolic A, Downar J. Triage in critical care: A protocol to protect lives and principles. PUBLISHED ON JANUARY 28, 2021. http://hospitalnews.com/triage-in-critical-care-a-protocol-to-protect-lives-and-principles/.
26. Talmor D, Jones AE, Rubinson L, Howell MD, Shapiro NI. Simple triage scoring system predicting death and the need for critical care resources for use during epidemics. Crit Care Med. 2007 May;35(5):1251-6. doi: 10.1097/01.CCM.0000262385.95721.CC. PMID: 17417099.
27. Lacorossi L, Fauci AJ, Napoletano A, D'Angelo D, Salomone K, Latina R, Coclite D, Iannone P. Triage protocol for allocation of critical health resources during Covid-19 pandemic and public health emergencies. A narrative review. Acta Biomed. 2020 Nov 10;91(4): e2020162. doi: 10.23750/abm. v91i4.10393. PMID: 33525236; PMCID: PMC7927504.
28. Ugare GU, Ndifon W, Bassey IA, Oyo-Ita AE, Egba RN, Asuquo M, Udosen AM. Epidemiology of death in the emergency department of a tertiary health center south-south of Nigeria. Afr Health Sci. 2012 Dec;12(4):530-7. doi: 10.4314/ahs. v12i4.21. PMID: 23515365; PMCID: PMC3598296.