Challenges in the implementation of preventive treatment for tuberculosis in people living with HIV/AIDS: A qualitative study

Vânia Silva dos Reis¹,², Dêbora Dupas Gonçalves do Nascimento³, Terezinha Alcântara da Silva¹,⁴, Anamaria Mello Miranda Paniago²,⁴, Adriana Carla Garcia Negri¹,⁴, Gabriela Ferreira⁴, Rafaela Ferreira⁵, Everton Ferreira Lemos⁶, Anete Trajman⁷, Sandra Maria do Valle Leone de Oliveira²,³

¹Infectious and Parasitic Diseases Unit, Maria Aparecida Pedrossian University Hospital, Brazilian Company of Hospital Services, Federal University of Mato Grosso do Sul, Campo Grande, Brazil
²Graduate Program in Infectious and Parasitic Diseases, Faculty of Medicine, Federal University of Mato Grosso do Sul, Campo Grande, Brazil
³Fiocruz, Mato Grosso do Sul, Brazil
⁴Federal University of Mato Grosso do Sul, Campo Grande, Brazil
⁵Charity Association Santa Casa de Campo Grande, Mato Grosso do Sul, Brazil
⁶State University of Mato Grosso do Sul, Brazil
⁷Federal University of Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

¶These authors contributed equally to this work.

*Corresponding author:
E-mail: sandra.leone@fiocruz.br

Abstract

Treatment of tuberculosis infection (TBI) in people living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA) reduces the risk of tuberculosis disease (TBD), the main cause of death in this population. Recognizing the barriers related to the scale up of tuberculosis preventive treatment (TPT) can contribute to reorganization of health services for achieving TB elimination. This qualitative study aimed to understand the perception of specialized care health professionals of a capital city in Brazil about TPT for PLWHA. Between October 2020 and August 2022 ten physicians and four nurses working for more than six months in reference HIV/AIDS services were interviewed. Interviews were guided by a script of previously validated, semi-structured questions. The audios were recorded, transcribed, and categorized based on Grounded Theory, and its analysis was anchored in the theoretical
framework of Symbolic Interactionism. Sampling was performed using theoretical saturation. The emerged central phenomenon “Facing challenges in the implementation of TPT in the light of scientific evidence” was supported by four categories:1) Demonstrating theoretical knowledge regarding TBI and its treatment guidelines; 2) Dealing with the complexities of guidelines adherence in the routine service; 3) Building bonds to overcome different challenges in the care of PLWHA; 4) Seeking strategies to facilitate adherence to the TPT guidelines service. Professionals faced challenges in implementing TPT due to structural obstacles in service, hesitation in establishing therapy, and the risk of adverse events when dealing with patients' vulnerabilities, despite available scientific evidence, theoretical knowledge, and guidelines recommendations. They envisaged ideal conditions to adhere to the TPT guidelines in service, and sought to mediate confrontations by strengthening their bond with patients through multidisciplinary interaction, teaching, and research.

**Introduction**

Tuberculosis preventive treatment (TPT) is a crucial component of the strategy devised to end the global tuberculosis (TB) epidemic [1-4]. Although preventable and curable, TB is still the leading cause of death among people living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA), accounting for one-third of the deaths [1].

TPT in PLWHA was one of the top priorities at the high-level meeting of the United Nations (UN) on TB in 2018 [4] and globally, the target of offering 6 million TPT for PLWHA was attained and surpassed in 2021 [5]. This was achieved based on the World Health Organization (WHO) recommendation to offer TPT to PLWHA regardless of TBI tests and chest radiography (CXR) to exclude disease tuberculosis (TBD) when these tests were unavailable [1].

However, TPT uptake in PLWHA and other high-risk populations is low in Brazil, one of the 30 countries with high burden of TB and TB/HIV co-infection [1]. Diagnosis and treatment of tuberculosis infection (TBI) are offered free of charge by the Public Unified Health System (SUS) in the country [6], but several
challenges lie in the implementation of TPT guidelines, with resulting low rates of
TPT initiation and completion [3,7].

Previous studies have shown that educational activities for health care providers
in the country can increase TPT prescription among household contacts in SUS,
despite the need for testing [7]. This intervention was affordable [8] and
sustainable [9]. However, among PLWHA, recent studies have shown low
adherence by health professionals in prescribing TPT [10,11].

Understanding the subjectivity of individuals involved in TPT scale up can
contribute to adherence to the national guidelines, with adoption of strategies to
reduce barriers in health services. The objective of the current study was to
understand the perception of specialized care health professionals regarding TPT
for PLWHA in a capital city of the Midwest region of Brazil.

Study design

Type of study

In this qualitative study [12,13], we used the Grounded Theory (GT) as a
methodological resource to guide data collection, analysis, and identification of
the phenomenon [13]. Results were analyzed based on Brazilian TBI treatment
guidelines, which recommended, at the time of data collection, TST or IGRA for
PLWHA with CD4 count >350 cells/mm³, those with lower levels TPT is
recommended without TBI testing, CXR for all before prescription, and isoniazid
as the preferred regimen [6,14]. It was anchored in the theoretical conceptions of
Symbolic Interactionism (SI), where perspectives are socially created and
changed according to groups and/or roles. SI facilitates the understanding that
the process of interaction with others enables an individual to acquire new perspectives, and these guide their way of acting [15]. We used the Standards for Reporting Qualitative Research (SRQR) guidelines to report this study [16,17].

**Participant selection**

Inclusion criteria was being a medical or nurse professional working for more than six months in HIV/Aids reference services and agreeing to participate by signing the informed consent. There were no exclusion criteria.

**Data collection**

Data collection was carried out in two public institutions of reference in HIV/Aids in the capital of Mato Grosso do Sul, located in the Midwest region of Brazil, between October 2020 and August 2022.

For data collection, a semi-structured interview [18] was used, guided by questions related to the knowledge and perception of professionals about TBI and TPT guidelines for PLWHA, and the bond between patient and service professionals. This script was originally validated by a medical professional and a nurse and, as there was no need for changes, they were included in the study sample. The interviews were recorded in audio by a psychologist and lasted an average of 15 minutes each. The interruption in data collection occurred due to the saturation of theoretical data when the emerged data became repetitive [19,20].

**Data analysis**
The collected data were transcribed in full and analyzed according to GT through coding in three stages: open, axial, and selective. In open coding, data were separated, compared, and analyzed line-by-line in detail, generating 568 conceptual codes, which were later grouped by similarities and differences. In axial coding, the data were regrouped, clarifying explanations regarding the phenomena under investigation and allowing the emergence of categories. This regrouping followed the conditional/consequential paradigm composed of three components: condition, action-interaction and consequence. In selective coding, comparison and constant analysis were performed, refining the relationships between the four categories and ten subcategories, integrating them, and seeking to identify one central phenomenon [13,19].

Results

Fourteen participants were included, 10 were physicians and four were nurses. Of these, 10 were women, nine were married, and 14 lived in urban areas. Their mean age was 45 years. They had an average of 13 years of experience in HIV/AIDS reference services, and an average of 22 years of training. Seven of the study participants had a doctorate, nine had a master degree, and 13 were specialized professionals.

The health professional (HCW) demonstrated a reasonable understanding of the concept of TBI and the TPT guidelines for PLWHA. They viewed the guidelines as an essential strategy for reducing deaths and transmission within the community. This perception is evident in the statements made by the participants in Table 1.
However, the HCW also acknowledged the challenges associated with adhering to in-service guidelines. They specifically expressed concerns regarding patient vulnerability, which further complicates the issue of TPT adherence for medical professionals.

In this context, they build bonds to overcome different challenges in care for PLWHA (Table 1):

"It's about saving lives. Therefore, providing assistance to HIV patients is not just a matter of providing support in the technical part, it also involves resolving the social issues, which I think is very important [...]" (P10)

"[...] The bond is very important, the better the patient gets, the more they adhere to guidelines and treatment [...]" (P7)

And seeking strategies to facilitate adherence to the treatment guidelines in service:

"[...] There would have to be an outpatient clinic for follow-up [...] perhaps the nursing clinic could be alternated with the medical clinic [...] there is a requirement of at least one or two more outpatient clinics, since the demand is very high [...]" (P6)

Interacting with the multidisciplinary team and teaching:

"[...] I think that care cannot be centered on the doctor's role [...] we need to further improve the multidisciplinary team" (P13)

Embracing the patient with a focus on adherence and treatment:
“[...] I always believe in information. The patients should be made aware of what TB is, what effects it may have on their lives, what TPT is, and the benefit that the patient has if he/she undergoes this treatment [...] about risks and side effects of the medication [...] inform in the best way the patient can understand. It is not only enough for me to speak, it is also important that the patient understands and grasps the message [...] I try to listen to the patient so that the process of reflection of his own life plays a role in decision making, since the patient has to have autonomy in that choice, but for him to have that autonomy in choosing, he needs be well-informed [...]’ (P9)

This study sheds light on the perception of HCW regarding their knowledge and meaning of TPT in PLWHA, challenges faced due to weaknesses of the services, and the strategies that can be used to overcome these limitations.

Discussion

Knowledge of HCW contrasted with hesitations and uncertainties due to structural limitations of health facilities, but empathy, embracement and multidisciplinary interaction were perceived as enablers for quality care of PLWHA. Professionals perceive and value the bond strengthened in the service and use it as an instrument to overcome structural limitations in the care of PLWHA. Feelings, such as satisfaction, humanization, and empathy, were found to be facilitators of patient's attachment to the service. These findings were in accordance with SI conceptions, where people modulate their behavior based on the meaning they attribute to things and the social interaction established with others. People modify this meaning through interpretive process they use when faced with things and situations throughout their lives [15].
Knowledge of HCW regarding TBI and its management, along with the strategic importance of preventing TB and unfavorable outcomes in PLWHA have been previously reported [21-24].

Weaknesses in structural and organizational conditions of the services emerged as factors hindering the scale up of TBI treatment. This included other care demands in face of understaffed teams. Lack of training, irregularities in screening and during TPT, ill-defined responsibilities in prescription and record keeping, clinical misperception [25], lack of medication, fear of creating bacterial resistance, low acceptance of medication by patients, side effects, and lack of commitment from health managers have been identified as barriers to implementation of TPT [2]. A recent study in Brazil showed that educational interventions for HCW about TPT and its benefits were fundamental for the increase in treatment prescriptions [9]. Continuous efforts are necessary to improve TPT care among PLWHA [3].

Concerns regarding adverse reactions have emerged as a hindrance in the to TPT and in HCW team adherence. This can be minimized with regular monthly clinical follow-up and clear guidelines for patients [26]. Expansion of human resources and operational research [7], along with adequate economic perspectives for monitoring adverse events [27], have been indicated as strategies to overcome this issue. Still, the fear of prescribing TPT can be resolved with the use of short regimens which have shown greater safety and rare adverse events [28].

Patient vulnerability is also a concern for medical professionals regarding adherence to TPT. The relationship between vulnerabilities and Aids is
bidirectional and is strongly influenced by poverty and other markers of social
exclusion. Different aspects linked to PLWHA reinforce and produce new
vulnerabilities arising from the stigma of the disease, which impacts people's
health even after four decades since the discovery of the disease [29]. Patients'
specific needs must be addressed considering the local context, specific settings
and conditions in which the TPT program would be implemented [30].

Combining communication skills and empathy is important for the establishment
of satisfactory interpersonal relationships [31]. Strengthening this bond is
necessary to empower the patient to face the stigma of the disease, and to favor
adherence to treatment [6,32,33]. Facilitation of access and bonding, promptness
of care, health professional and patient relationship, duration of appointments,
language used, and availability of references for necessary referrals are
fundamental requirements of services to promote adherence to treatment [6].
Intensification of strategies for adherence to HIV/TB co-infection prevention
treatment is a priority [34].

This study has a few limitations. It was conducted in a single city, in a country
with over 5000 municipalities’, and the perspective of HCW may be different
according to the multiple existing scenarios. In addition, it is restricted to the HCW
perspective. The users’ perspective is equally important to understand the
dropouts in the TPT cascade of care. However, there is a paucity of qualitative
studies on TPT in PLWHA, and this study clearly identified the central
phenomenon “Facing challenges in the implementation of TPT in the light of
scientific evidence”, and the strategies to overcome barriers.

Ethics statement
This study was conducted in accordance with the tenets of Declaration of Helsinki. It was approved by the Ethics Committee for Research with Human Beings of the Federal University of Mato Grosso do Sul on November 2, 2020 (#4.375.024). Written informed consent was obtained from all the study participants. To maintain secrecy and anonymity, the participants were represented by the letter “P” followed by the number corresponding to the order of the interviews (P1, P2, P3 ...).

**Conflict of Interest**

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

**Author Contributions**

VSR, DPGN and SMVLO were responsible for the design and conduct of the study, data analysis, writing and review of the article. VSR contributed with the transcription of the interviews. TAS carried out the interviews, initial analysis and review of the article. GF, RF contributed with the transcription of interviews, initial categorization of data, writing and formatting of the article. ACGN, AMMP, EFL assisted in data analysis and article review. AT contributed to the data analysis and review of the article. All authors approved the submitted version.

**Funding**

This study was supported by the (Oswaldo Cruz Foundation) Fiocruz and Federal University of Mato Grosso do Sul and the Coordination for the Improvement of Higher Education Personnel (CAPES) – Brazil. Financial code 001.
Data Availability Statement

The raw data supporting the conclusions of this article will be made available by the authors, without undue reservation.

Acknowledgments

To all the nurses and physicians, from the reference services in HIV/Aids, who contributed as participants in this study.

Reference


Corbin J, Strauss A. Basics of qualitative research: techniques and procedures for developing Grounded Theory. California: SAGE; 2015.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PHENOMENON</th>
<th>CATEGORIES</th>
<th>SUBCATEGORIES</th>
<th>OPEN CODES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Facing challenges in</td>
<td>CONTEXTUAL CONDITIONS</td>
<td>Conceptualizing TBI and conditioning factors for</td>
<td>“[...] TBI is when the person had contact with the bacillus, but did not develop the disease [...]” (P3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>implementing TPT in</td>
<td>Demonstrating theoretical knowledge regarding</td>
<td>outcomes in PLWHA.</td>
<td>“[...] And specifically in HIV patients, since they have a compromised immunity, and reactivation of granulomas can occur in the immunosuppression phase, thereby resulting in an active infection [...]” (P13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>light of scientific</td>
<td>TBI and its treatment guidelines.</td>
<td></td>
<td>“[...] About twenty-five to thirty percent of the general population has TBI [...] In general, ten percent of those infected will get sick one day in their lives. However, some people have a higher risk of getting sick from the infection [...]” (P7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>evidence.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“There is a guidelines that recommends that every HIV patient with less than three hundred and fifty CD4 cells should undergo TPT, even if a diagnosis cannot be made [...] any individual with more than three hundred and fifty CD4 cells should first undergo an examination to find out if the person has TBI [...]” (P7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Considering the cascade of care guidelines from</td>
<td>“[...] For example, in our patients with HIV who usually undergo treatment, we ask for an annual examination to check for their carrier status, as long as they are not symptomatic, do not show any altered X-ray findings. The treatment for such patients is commenced with isoniazid, which is the preferred regimen at the moment [...]” (P11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>diagnosis of TBI to TPT.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“I think an important guidelines in the face of TB [...] is high mortality rate from TB in PLWHA. Early identification of the infection [...] will contribute to better survival condition of these patients [...]” (P2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERVENING CONDITIONS</td>
<td>Describing structural and organizational obstacles in service.</td>
<td>“[...] The difficulty of instituting therapy for everyone under three hundred and fifty CD4 count is due to logistics [...] precisely because of the difficulty of monitoring and not having a specific outpatient clinic for TBI. There would be many people requiring follow up, and in today’s scenario, there are no fully operating outpatient clinics, even for the general population [...]” (P6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dealing with the complexities of guidelines adherence in service.</td>
<td>Revealing patients’ vulnerabilities and insecurities with diagnosis and therapeutic regimen.</td>
<td>“[...] a very big concern with the adverse effects of TPT is [...] you have to monitor these patients more frequently, not only checking for their adherence to the guidelines, but also to see if they have hepatitis, or any adverse reaction to the treatment [...]” (P7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERACTION IN CARE</td>
<td>Having positive experiences with the calls.</td>
<td>“[...] social issues are an important factor. Not all patients are able to follow up and seek treatment due to social issues, lack of money, lack of transportation [...]” (P2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building bonds</td>
<td>“[...] Many people do not understand why they are using the medication, while there are few who completely understand the need and intention of treatment [...]” (P8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“If I could describe it in one word, it would be humanity [...] when these patients come in here, just the fact that you tell them 'look, you are not here to be judged', they open up their hearts [...]” (P11)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“It’s about saving lives. Therefore, providing assistance to HIV patients is not just a matter of providing support in the technical part, it also involves resolving the social issues, which I think is very important [...]” (P10)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“[...] The bond is very important, the better the patient gets, the more they adhere to guidelines and treatment [...]” (P7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STRATEGIES FOR ADHERENCE</td>
<td>Noticing the strengthening of bond in service.</td>
<td>“[..] the professionals who deal with HIV already have a characteristic ease of embracing. This embrace generates an empathy that greatly facilitates the bond [...]. The empathy of professionals who have been working with HIV/AIDS patients for some time is more natural [...]” (P2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Glimpsing ideal conditions for adherence to the guidelines in service.</td>
<td>“[..] One way to strengthen the bond would be to have a social service professional with us [...].” (P3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“[..] There would have to be an outpatient clinic for follow-up [...]. Perhaps the nursing clinic could be alternated with the medical clinic [...]. There is a requirement of at least one or two more outpatient clinics, since the demand is very high [...].” (P6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“[..] I would like it to be in an ideal world [...]. With more number of medical professionals, receptionists, and more space [...]. Because the access barrier still persists [...]. In terms of adherence to the guidelines, we are concerned about the adverse effects of TPT [...]. These patients require more frequent monitoring, not only for them to adhere to the guidelines but also to check if they have hepatitis, or any adverse reaction to the treatment [...].” (P7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interacting with the multidisciplinary team and teaching.</td>
<td>“[..] I think that care cannot be centered on the doctor’s role [...]. We need to further improve the multidisciplinary team.” (P13)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“[..] Research is very important, students actively search for dropouts in TPT project, another class with HIV patient [...]. So with the help of nurses and nursing students, the outpatient care of PLHIV could be improved.” (P3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Embracing the patient with a focus on adherence and treatment.</td>
<td>“[..] Treating these patients with affection, sometimes that’s what’s missing, and not being judgmental helps[...]. You have to try to enter their world [...].” (P11)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“[..] I always believe in information. The patients should be made aware of what TB is, what effects it may have on their lives, what TPT is, and the benefit that the patient has if he/she undergoes this treatment [...]. About risks and side effects of the medication [...]. Inform in the best way the patient can understand. It is not only enough for me to speak, it is also important [...].” (P3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
that the patient understands and grasps the message [...] I try to listen to the patient so that the process of reflection of his own life plays a role in decision making, since the patient has to have autonomy in that choice, but for him to have that autonomy in choosing, he needs be well-informed [...]” (P9)