

A Moving Target: Impacts of Lowering Viral Load Suppression Cutpoints on Progress Towards HIV Epidemic Control Goals

Joseph G. ROSEN^{1*}, Steven J. REYNOLDS^{2,3,4}, Ronald M. GALIWANGO², Godfrey KIGOZI², Thomas C. QUINN^{2,3,4}, Oliver RATMANN⁵, Anthony NDYANABO², Lisa J. NELSON⁶, Gertrude NAKIGOZI², Margaret NALUGEMWA², Katherine B. RUCINSKI¹, Caitlin E. KENNEDY^{1,2}, Larry W. CHANG^{1,2,3}, Joseph KAGAAI², David SERWADDA², M. Kate GRABOWSKI^{2,7,8}

¹ Department of International Health, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MD, USA

² Rakai Health Sciences Program, Entebbe, Uganda

³ Division of Infectious Diseases, Johns Hopkins School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD, USA

⁴ Division of Intramural Research, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, MD, USA

⁵ Department of Mathematics, Imperial College, London, United Kingdom

⁶ Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Kampala, Uganda

⁷ Division of Pathology, Johns Hopkins School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD, USA

⁸ Department of Epidemiology, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MD, USA

Running Head: Lowering VLS Cutpoints in Rakai, Uganda

***Corresponding author:** Joseph G. Rosen, 615 N. Wolfe Street, E5031, Baltimore, MD 21202
T: +1 (305) 331-5568 | F: +1 (410) 614-7553 | E: jrosen72@jhu.edu

Conflicts of Interest

The authors have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Funding

This study was supported by the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases (NIAID) (U01AI100031, U01AI075115, R01AI110324, R01AI128779, R01AI123002, R01AI143333, R01AI55080, T32AI102623); the National Institute of Mental Health (R01MH105313); the Division of Intramural Research of the NIAID; and the U.S. President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR) through the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) under the terms of NU2GGH000817. JGR and KBR were supported by the National Institute of Mental Health (F31MH126796, K01MH129226). The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily reflect the official views of the funding agencies.

Ethical Statement

The study was approved by the Uganda Virus Research Institute Research and Ethics Committee and the Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine Institutional Review Board. This project was reviewed in accordance with CDC human research protection procedures and was determined to be research, but CDC investigators did not interact with human subjects or have access to identifiable data or specimens for research purposes.

Word Count: 989/1,000

1 **Summary**

2 Redefining viral load suppression (VLS) using lower cutpoints could impact progress towards
3 the UNAIDS 95-95-95 targets. We assessed impacts of lowering the VLS cutpoint on achieving
4 the 95-95-95 VLS target in the Rakai Community Cohort Study. Population VLS fell from 86%
5 to 84% and 76%, respectively, after lowering VLS cutpoints from <1,000 to <200 and <50
6 copies/mL. The fraction of viremic persons increased by 17% after lowering the VLS cutpoint
7 from <1,000 to <200 copies/mL.

8 **Key Words:** viral load suppression, viral load cutpoint, Fast-Track targets, population-based
9 study, Uganda

10 The 95-95-95 Fast-Track targets proposed by the Joint United Nations Programme on
11 HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS) are ambitious goals for HIV elimination by 2030.¹ To reach the “third
12 95”, 86% of people living with HIV (95% of whom are receiving antiretroviral therapy (ART))
13 must achieve viral load suppression (VLS). The World Health Organization (WHO) defines VLS
14 as <1,000 RNA copies/mL,² a threshold associated with reduced HIV transmission risk.^{3,4} This
15 definition is also used by national surveys in Africa, including the population-based HIV impact
16 assessments.⁵

17 A VLS cutpoint of <1,000 copies/mL, however, potentially underestimates the proportion
18 of individuals on ART experiencing negative consequences of viremia. A study in Lesotho
19 estimated that 94% of treatment-experienced persons with viral loads 80-999 copies/mL
20 harbored drug-resistant mutations.⁶ Likewise, persistent low-level viremia (50-999 copies/mL
21 over ≥ 6 months) has been linked to subsequent virologic failure and drug resistance.⁷ These
22 findings, coupled with rising levels of HIV drug resistance across Africa, have prompted calls to
23 redefine VLS using lower cutpoints.^{8,9}

24 In addition to identifying persistent low-level viremia of potential clinical significance,
25 lowering VLS cutpoints will also result in the detection and escalated management of people
26 experiencing clinically insignificant transient viremia, or viral “blips”. Emerging evidence also
27 suggests viremic blips of low magnitude (<500 copies/mL) unassociated with subsequent
28 virologic failure are common in persons with prolonged ART use.¹⁰ Implementing more
29 conservative VLS cutpoints could, therefore, prompt unwarranted switching of suppressed
30 persons to second- or third-line ART regimens, which remain scarce in many higher-burden
31 countries.¹¹ Lowering existing VLS cutpoints could also increase the proportion of people on

32 ART requiring enhanced clinical monitoring and intensive adherence support, which could
33 further strain already under-resourced health systems in hyperendemic settings.

34 To assess the impact of using different VLS cutpoints in estimating progress towards the
35 95-95-95 targets, we used data from the Rakai Community Cohort Study (RCCS), an open,
36 population-based prospective study of 40 communities in south-central Uganda.¹² After
37 providing written informed consent, RCCS participants undergo rapid HIV testing using a
38 validated three-test algorithm followed by confirmatory enzyme immunoassays,¹³ and viral load
39 testing is performed on stored plasma using the Abbott RealTime HIV-1 assay (Abbott
40 Molecular, Inc., Des Plaines, IL). We estimated VLS by calculating the proportion of persons
41 with undetectable viral loads or exhibiting viremia below specific cutpoints over three survey
42 intervals: February 2015 to September 2016 (midpoint: November 2015), October 2016 to May
43 2018 (midpoint: July 2017), and June 2018 to October 2020 (midpoint: August 2019).

44 First, we estimated population viral load among persons with detectable viremia (≥ 50
45 copies/mL) and ART coverage (prevalence of self-reported ART use), respectively. We used
46 Wilcoxon rank-sum tests to evaluate whether observed changes in population viral load over
47 time were statistically significant ($p < 0.05$). Next, to evaluate the impact of VLS cutpoints on
48 Fast-Track target achievement, we ascertained the sensitivity of population VLS estimates
49 against four different VLS cutpoints: $< 1,000$, < 400 , < 200 , and < 50 copies/mL (the latter
50 approaching the lower limit of detection for many viral load assays). Lastly, among persons with
51 detectable viremia, we examined the distribution of viral copy counts to estimate the relative
52 increase in the fraction of unsuppressed persons if VLS cutpoints were lowered.

53 Overall, 5,814 individuals (median age: 33 years, 63% women) contributed 10,418
54 observations over three survey intervals (2015: $n=3,606$, 2017: $n=3,590$, 2019: $n=3,222$). Across

55 cutpoints (**Figure 1A**), population VLS increased significantly over time, with detectable
56 viremia declining from a median of 9,136 copies/mL (interquartile range [IQR] 2,467-34,434) in
57 2015 to 2,516 copies/mL (IQR 150-22,101) in 2019 ($p<0.001$). These reductions in population
58 viremia coincided with substantial increases in ART coverage, from 67% (95% confidence
59 interval [CI] 65-68%) in 2015 to 85% (CI 83-86%) in 2019.

60 By 2019, population VLS met the 95-95-95 target using a cutpoint of <1,000 copies/mL
61 (86%, CI 85-87%). However, when using the most conservative cutpoint of <50 copies/mL,
62 population VLS declined to 76% (CI 74-77%). When restricted to persons reporting ART use
63 ($n=2,725$), population VLS remained below the 95% target (83%, CI 82-85%) when using a
64 cutpoint of <50 copies/mL. Among persons with detectable viremia in 2019 ($n=788$), lowering
65 the VLS cutpoint from <1,000 to <200 copies/mL would increase the proportion of unsuppressed
66 persons by 17% (**Figure 1B**).

67 Our study provides evidence that estimates of the “third 95” at a population level are
68 highly sensitive to VLS cutpoints. Relative to a more conservative clinical VLS cutpoint of <50
69 copies/mL, a cutpoint of <1,000 copies/mL, per WHO recommendations, overestimated 95-95-
70 95 Fast-Track target achievement in our sample by ~10% on an absolute scale. This relationship
71 persisted even after restricting population VLS measures to persons reporting ART use.
72 Lowering VLS cutpoints would, therefore, require reassessment of countries and subnational
73 units meeting the “third 95” using a <1,000 copies/mL cutpoint. Multilateral agencies and donors
74 must be prepared to articulate justifications for lowering VLS cutpoints and manage expectations
75 surrounding revisions to Fast-Track target achievement, ensuring investments in HIV treatment
76 programs are sustained, rather than abandoned, if progress towards the “third 95” is revisited.

77 Furthermore, we found that by lowering the VLS cutpoint from <1,000 to <200
78 copies/mL, the fraction of persons classified as unsuppressed increased by 17%. This would
79 represent a substantial population-level increase in the number of individuals requiring enhanced
80 clinical monitoring (e.g., intensive ART adherence support, increased care appointment
81 frequency). While vigilance around lower-level viremia may be clinically indicated, the abrupt
82 growth in persons requiring enhanced clinical support may be challenging for health systems to
83 manage without additional resources and investments. Updated clinical guidelines with
84 algorithms for switching individuals to second- or third-line ART in the context of persistent
85 lower-level viremia are also warranted.

86 Irrespective of VLS cutpoints, our findings highlight remarkable achievements in HIV
87 epidemic control, largely attributable to the scale-up of combination HIV interventions and
88 universal ART provision in south-central Uganda.¹⁴ Continued transitioning of persons stable on
89 ART to differentiated service delivery models, coupled with promising testing and treatment
90 technologies in the development pipeline (i.e., long-acting ART, point-of-care viral load assays),
91 may accelerate momentum towards HIV elimination in this setting.

92 **Acknowledgements**

93 We extend our gratitude to the Rakai Community Cohort Study participants, mobilizers,
94 enumerators, data management staff, and community leaders—without whom this study would
95 not be possible. JGR, SJR, GK, TCQ, OR, GN, MN, KBR, CEK, LWC, JK, DS, and MKG
96 conceptualized and designed the study. SJR, RMG, GK, TCQ, GN, MN, LWC, JK, DS, and
97 MKG oversaw data collection and laboratory testing. AN oversaw data management. JGR
98 conducted data analysis, with input from KBR, CEK, LWC, and MKG. JGR prepared the first
99 draft of the manuscript. All authors reviewed, contributed to, and approved the final manuscript
100 submitted for publication.

101 **References**

- 102 1. Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS). *Fast-Track: Ending the AIDS*
103 *Epidemic by 2030*. UNAIDS; 2014.
104 https://www.unaids.org/sites/default/files/media_asset/JC2686_WAD2014report_en.pdf
- 105 2. World Health Organization. *Consolidated Guidelines on HIV Prevention, Testing,*
106 *Treatment, Service Delivery and Monitoring: Recommendations for a Public Health*
107 *Approach*. WHO; 2021. <https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240031593>
- 108 3. Quinn TC, Wawer MJ, Sewankambo N, et al. Viral Load and Heterosexual Transmission of
109 Human Immunodeficiency Virus Type 1. *New England Journal of Medicine*.
110 2000;342(13):921-929. doi:10.1056/NEJM200003303421303
- 111 4. Gray RH, Wawer MJ, Brookmeyer R, et al. Probability of HIV-1 transmission per coital act
112 in monogamous, heterosexual, HIV-1-discordant couples in Rakai, Uganda. *Lancet*.
113 2001;357(9263):1149-1153. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(00)04331-2
- 114 5. Justman JE, Mugurungi O, El-Sadr WM. HIV Population Surveys - Bringing Precision to
115 the Global Response. *N Engl J Med*. 2018;378(20):1859-1861.
116 doi:10.1056/NEJMp1801934
- 117 6. Labhardt ND, Bader J, Lejone TI, et al. Should viral load thresholds be lowered?:
118 Revisiting the WHO definition for virologic failure in patients on antiretroviral therapy in
119 resource-limited settings. *Medicine*. 2016;95(28):e3985.
120 doi:10.1097/MD.0000000000003985
- 121 7. Taiwo B, Gallien S, Aga E, et al. Antiretroviral Drug Resistance in HIV-1–Infected Patients
122 Experiencing Persistent Low-Level Viremia During First-Line Therapy. *J Infect Dis*.
123 2011;204(4):515-520. doi:10.1093/infdis/jir353

- 124 8. Beyrer C, Pozniak A. HIV Drug Resistance — An Emerging Threat to Epidemic Control.
125 *New England Journal of Medicine*. 2017;377(17):1605-1607. doi:10.1056/NEJMp1710608
- 126 9. de Waal R, Lessells R, Hauser A, et al. HIV drug resistance in sub-Saharan Africa: public
127 health questions and the potential role of real-world data and mathematical modelling. *J*
128 *Virus Erad*. 2018;4(Suppl 2):55-58.
- 129 10. Grennan JT, Loutfy MR, Su D, et al. Magnitude of virologic blips is associated with a
130 higher risk for virologic rebound in HIV-infected individuals: a recurrent events analysis. *J*
131 *Infect Dis*. 2012;205(8):1230-1238. doi:10.1093/infdis/jis104
- 132 11. Madec Y, Leroy S, Rey-Cuille MA, Huber F, Calmy A. Persistent difficulties in switching
133 to second-line ART in sub-saharan Africa--a systematic review and meta-analysis. *PLoS*
134 *One*. 2013;8(12):e82724. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0082724
- 135 12. Chang LW, Grabowski MK, Ssekubugu R, et al. Heterogeneity of the HIV epidemic in
136 agrarian, trading, and fishing communities in Rakai, Uganda: an observational
137 epidemiological study. *Lancet HIV*. 2016;3(8):e388-e396. doi:10.1016/S2352-
138 3018(16)30034-0
- 139 13. Galiwango RM, Musoke R, Lubyayi L, et al. Evaluation of current rapid HIV test
140 algorithms in Rakai, Uganda. *J Virol Methods*. 2013;192(1-2):25-27.
141 doi:10.1016/j.jviromet.2013.04.003
- 142 14. Grabowski MK, Serwadda DM, Gray RH, et al. Combination HIV Prevention and HIV
143 Incidence in Uganda. *N Engl J Med*. 2017;377(22):2154-2166.
144 doi:10.1056/NEJMoa1702150

Figure 1. Viral load suppression prevalence (Panel A) and the distribution of viral copy counts among viremic (≥ 50 copies/mL) persons living with HIV (Panel B), by calendar period.

