

1 **Title:** Musculoskeletal Advertising Focuses on Whites and Overlooks Minority
2 Communities

3

4 **Authors:**

5 Kelsey A. Rankin, B.A.¹

6 Robert John Oris, B.S.¹

7 Adithi Wijesekera¹, High School Diploma Candidate

8 Daniel H. Wiznia, M.D.¹

9

10 **Affiliations:** ¹Yale School of Medicine, New Haven, CT USA 06510

11

12 **Conflict of interest:** The authors report no conflicts of interest.

13

14 **Corresponding author:**

15 Kelsey Rankin

16 Yale School of Medicine, New Haven, CT USA

17 kelsey.rankin@yale.edu

18 **Abstract**

19 *Introduction*

20 Demographic disparities in musculoskeletal (MSK) health exist in the US. Racial
21 representation in advertising has been shown to influence buying patterns. By focusing
22 advertising toward majority groups, direct-to-consumer advertising may exacerbate MSK
23 disparities by neglecting underrepresented minorities. To better understand how race is
24 represented across MSK advertisements and how this may influence patterns in MSK
25 health, we reviewed advertisements in popular magazines, using online databases for
26 collection.

27

28 *Methods*

29 8 magazine types were chosen. Racial distribution was analyzed using Pearson's chi-
30 squared and chi-squared goodness of fit tests. Fisher's exact test was used when >20%
31 of cells had $n < 5$. Significance was set at $p < 0.05$.

32

33 *Results*

34 Of advertisements that featured a model, white models were overrepresented ($p < 0.001$),
35 and Hispanic and Asian models were underrepresented ($p < 0.001$). Only 7.3% of
36 advertisements featured multiple models of different races or ethnicities, while 92.7% did
37 not. African American models were overrepresented as athletes ($p < 0.001$) and
38 underrepresented in pain relief ads ($p < 0.001$).

39

40 *Discussion*

41 There is poor representation of minorities in MSK advertisements. Even when controlling
42 for US population demographics, white models were overrepresented, and models of
43 minority races are underrepresented. African American models were typecast as athletes
44 and underrepresented in pain relief ads.

45

46 **Key words:** Racial disparities; direct-to-consumer advertising; musculoskeletal health.

47 **Introduction**

48 Racial and ethnic disparities in musculoskeletal (MSK) health exist in the U.S. The
49 prevalence of hip and knee osteoarthritis is highest among African Americans and
50 Hispanics [1-5]. African Americans have the highest burden of hip and knee osteoarthritis
51 [2-4], as well as disproportionately high losses of quality-adjusted life years (QALYs), due
52 to osteoarthritis [6].

53

54 Racial and ethnic differences in food insecurity [8], access to health-promoting foods [9],
55 and engagement in exercise and healthy eating [10] exist in the U.S., and are likely
56 contributory factors to these observed differences in MSK health.

57

58 Direct-to-consumer advertising represents an important means of exposure to health
59 promoting products. It has been shown that racial minorities, including African Americans
60 and Hispanics, have been historically underrepresented in advertising [11, 12].
61 Representation of African American models in magazine advertisements is increasing,
62 but is skewed toward depicting African American models as athletes or musicians [11].

63

64 In addition, it has been shown that the race of models used in advertisements influences
65 buying patterns: individuals are more likely to make a purchasing decision if they identify
66 with the race and/or ethnicity of the model [13-19]. Magazines aimed at African American
67 and Hispanic populations have been shown to display significantly fewer health-
68 promoting advertisements and more health diminishing advertisements [20].

69

70 Examining racial diversity in MSK magazine advertising has important implications for
71 product utilization and health disparities. The extent to which advertisements that promote
72 musculoskeletal health are aimed at minority populations is unknown. This study aims to
73 examine whether racial and ethnic disparities exist in MSK magazine advertising, to
74 support a better understanding of how more diverse advertisement content may improve
75 MSK disparities.

76 **Methods**

77 *Study design*

78 Advertisements relating to MSK health were collected from magazines, both digital and
79 print. The following definition was developed to identify an MSK health advertisement:
80 any advertisement whose product or service would benefit an individual's orthopedic
81 health (skeletal, cardiac, muscular, or nutritional). The following databases were used to
82 obtain magazine content: RBDigital, ZINIO magazine database, *Magzter*, and Amazon.

83

84 Data was obtained from the eight following magazine types: women's health, men's
85 health, food/dietary health, elderly health, sports health, general lifestyle, African
86 American health, and Hispanic health. Each magazine type was populated with three
87 magazines. The magazines chosen for each type were based on the highest number of
88 subscriptions and accessibility to one complete year's worth of issues from the above
89 databases. A June 2019 industry whitepaper from the Alliance of Audited Media was
90 utilized to determine magazines with the greatest subscription counts [23]. A complete list
91 of magazine titles for each magazine type is included in Supplemental Table 1.

92

93 One year's worth of magazines was examined, with the primary time frame being
94 January-December 2019. However, within the four magazine sources that were utilized,
95 not all magazines were available for the complete year 2019. When issues were not
96 available for 2019, magazines were supplemented with issues from the corresponding
97 month from the year 2020. The majority of the magazines had a monthly publishing
98 frequency. However, *Black EOE Journal* published triannually; *Runner's World* and *Taste*

99 *of Home* published bimonthly; *The New Yorker*, *Woman's World*, *Vanidades Mexico* and
100 *Sports' Illustrated* published weekly; *Saber Vivir Ar* published biweekly. For the
101 magazines with weekly, biweekly, and fortnightly issues, the first issue of the month was
102 chosen.

103

104 *Data collection*

105 For each issue, the following information was recorded: magazine title, magazine type,
106 issue, page number the advertisement was found on, advertisement category, product
107 name, size of the advertisement, description of the model(s) in the advertisement if
108 applicable (including number of models, gender, age, and race of model(s)), presence of
109 a celebrity, magazine frequency, and number of monthly subscriptions. The advertising
110 categories were recorded as exercise, fitness/exercise clothing, fitness/exercise
111 equipment, health food, pain relief, supplements, diet, health insurance, weight loss
112 programs, sports drink, medical establishment (diagnostic center), medical procedure,
113 and medical equipment. If a certain advertisement product overlapped between two of
114 the above advertisement categories, then the category that was primarily featured in the
115 advertisement was chosen.

116

117 The 24 magazines were each reviewed independently by two individuals (AW, RO).
118 Consensus was obtained by the examiners. If consensus was not reached, a third
119 examiner (DW) was utilized to reach a final determination.

120

121 *US demographics*

122 US racial demographics were used to control for racial variation in candidate analyses.
123 Racial breakdowns were as follows: non-Hispanic White: 60.1%; non-Hispanic African
124 American: 13.4%; Hispanic: 18.5%; Asian: 5.9%; Mixed race: 2.8% [24].

125

126 *Statistical analyses*

127 Categorical variables were analyzed using Pearson's chi-squared tests. When >20% of
128 cells had expected frequencies <5, Fisher's exact test was used. For intra-ad categories
129 and intra-magazine type analyses, unknown race was dropped, and chi-squared
130 Goodness of Fit tests were used. Goodness of fit analyses used distribution of current US
131 racial demographics (see above). Only analyses with $n \geq 10$ were reported on and
132 considered. Statistical analyses were performed using Stata v.16.1 and graphs were
133 created using GraphPad Prism 7.0. Statistical significance was defined as $p < 0.05$.

134 **Results**

135 *MSK advertisements display demographic differences*

136 A total of 1,617 MSK advertisements were identified. 832 (51.5%) advertisements did not
137 display an identifiable model. Of the 785 ads with models, 538 (68.5%) featured a white
138 model, 138 (17.6%) featured an African American model, 22 (2.8%) featured a Hispanic
139 model, 10 (1.3%) featured an Asian model, 53 (6.8%) featured a model of mixed race,
140 and 24 (3.1%) featured a model of unknown race or ethnicity (Table 1). This deviated
141 significantly from US demographics ($p < 0.001$). 57 (7.3%) featured multiple models of
142 different races or ethnicities, while 728 (92.7%) did not (Table 1). Overall, white models
143 were featured significantly more frequently than African American, Hispanic, and mixed
144 race/ethnicity models (all $p < 0.001$).

145

146

147 *Racial demographics of model by MSK advertisement category*

148 Significant differences in race/ethnicity were observed by MSK ad category ($p < 0.001$)
149 (Table 5). In all categories, white models were significantly overrepresented, apart from
150 sports drink and health insurance advertisements, where they were underrepresented (all
151 $p < 0.001$, medical equipment $p = 0.037$) (Table 6). African American models were
152 overrepresented in health food, sports drinks, and fitness/exercise clothing, and
153 underrepresented across pain relief and supplements (Table 6). Hispanic models were
154 underrepresented across all ad categories (Table 6). Asian models had little to no
155 representation, and were underrepresented across all categories (Table 6). Mixed race
156 models were overrepresented in exercise, exercise and fitness clothing, equipment, pain
157 relief, supplement, diet, and sport drink advertisements (Table 6).

158 **Discussion**

159 In the U.S., significant racial and ethnic disparities exist in MSK health, as evidenced by
160 differences in rates of obesity, hip and knee osteoarthritis, severe joint pain, and lost
161 QALYs [1-7, 25]. Direct-to-consumer advertising is highly influential in minority
162 communities [21, 22], and race portrayal in advertising has been shown to affect customer
163 perception, favorability, and buying patterns [13-19, 21, 22]. It has been demonstrated
164 that African Americans and Hispanics are underrepresented in health-promoting
165 magazine advertisements [11, 12, 20, 22, 26]. If this lack of diversity also exists in MSK
166 magazine advertising, a shift in representation could be an important mechanism to
167 reduce disparities in MSK health. To this end, we sought to examine racial and ethnic
168 representation in MSK advertisements. We collected data from 24 magazines across 8
169 magazine types.

170

171 Our study is limited by the difficulty and subjective nature of identifying models by
172 race/ethnicity. For example, differentiating between hair color, facial features and skin
173 color can sometimes be ambiguous. However, the impact of this ambiguity was mitigated
174 by utilizing 2 independent racially diverse reviewers and adjudicating disagreements by
175 a third reviewer. Additionally, this subjectivity in identifying models by race/ethnicity is also
176 present when a viewer is exposed to an advertisement.

177

178 Overall, we found unbalanced racial representation across all MSK advertisements. We
179 found that white models were represented significantly more than all other races, and that
180 this representation proportionately deviated from US demographics. Despite white

181 populations having lower rates of obesity [5], food insecurity [8], osteoarthritis [1-5], and
182 overall better general health, white individuals were the most targeted audience for MSK
183 products, even when adjusting for US racial demographics. We also found that white
184 models were overrepresented in all ad categories, apart from sports drink and health
185 insurance advertisements, where they were underrepresented.

186
187 In terms of African American models, they were overrepresented in sports drink
188 advertisements and in sports health magazines. This reinforces previous literature,
189 demonstrating the skewed presentation of African Americans as athletes [11]. This
190 narrow representation may serve to further reduce the target audience for MSK
191 advertisements in the African American community, perpetuating stereotypes and
192 disparities. In addition, we found African American models were underrepresented across
193 pain relief advertisements. Racial disparities in pain management advertising are
194 concerning, given healthcare's historical and current underdiagnoses of pain and
195 treatment biases in the African American community [28, 29].

196
197 In terms of a positive and encouraging findings, health food and health insurance were
198 two ad categories in which African Americans were over-represented, and these may
199 potentially have a positive impact in addressing African American healthcare disparities.
200 The increased inclusion of African American models in health food advertisements may
201 serve to address high levels of food insecurity in African American communities. In
202 addition, the increased representation in health insurance advertisements is also positive,
203 given the racial disparities that exist as it pertains to health insurance coverage. As African

204 American and Hispanic individuals have lower rates of health insurance coverage than
205 non-Hispanic White individuals [27], this overrepresentation in insurance advertisements
206 can be seen to be appropriately targeting a population in need, and a strategy that can
207 be emulated in other categories.

208

209 Potential avenues to increase diversity include encouraging advertisers who did not utilize
210 models to include a racially diverse model through hiring. For example, more than half of
211 MSK advertisements did not have any model featured or displayed. This represents a
212 straightforward actionable opportunity in which current ads without models could be
213 revised to include models. Another alternative is to increase diversity in hiring of models
214 in companies that utilized a disproportionate number of white models. Additionally,
215 magazine publishers could provide guidance in terms of which populations would best
216 benefit from learning about certain advertisement categories, encouraging advertisers to
217 feature more minority models and target minority audiences. This may be an important
218 step towards improving the observed racial and ethnic disparities in MSK health.

219

220 **Acknowledgements**

221 N/A

222 **References**

- 223 1. Allen, K.D., Racial and ethnic disparities in osteoarthritis phenotypes. *Curr Opin*
224 *Rheumatol*, 2010. 22(5): p. 528-32.
- 225 2. Dillon, C.F., et al., Prevalence of knee osteoarthritis in the United States: arthritis data
226 from the Third National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey 1991-94. *J Rheumatol*,
227 2006. 33(11): p. 2271-9.
- 228 3. Nelson, A.E., et al., Characterization of individual radiographic features of hip
229 osteoarthritis in African American and White women and men: the Johnston County
230 Osteoarthritis Project. *Arthritis Care Res (Hoboken)*, 2010. 62(2): p. 190-7.
- 231 4. Sowers, M., et al., Radiographically defined osteoarthritis of the hand and knee in
232 young and middle-aged African American and Caucasian women. *Osteoarthritis*
233 *Cartilage*, 2000. 8(2): p. 69-77.
- 234 5. Wright, N.C., et al., Self-reported osteoarthritis, ethnicity, body mass index, and other
235 associated risk factors in postmenopausal women-results from the Women's Health
236 Initiative. *J Am Geriatr Soc*, 2008. 56(9): p. 1736-43.
- 237 6. Losina, E., et al., Impact of obesity and knee osteoarthritis on morbidity and mortality
238 in older Americans. *Ann Intern Med*, 2011. 154(4): p. 217-26.
- 239 7. Vaccaro, J.A. and F.G. Huffman, Sex and Race/Ethnic Disparities in Food Security and
240 Chronic Diseases in U.S. Older Adults. *Gerontol Geriatr Med*, 2017. 3: p.
241 2333721417718344.
- 242 8. Larson, N.I., M.T. Story, and M.C. Nelson, Neighborhood environments: disparities in
243 access to healthy foods in the U.S. *Am J Prev Med*, 2009. 36(1): p. 74-81.

- 244 9. August, K.J. and D.H. Sorkin, Racial/ethnic disparities in exercise and dietary behaviors
245 of middle-aged and older adults. *J Gen Intern Med*, 2011. 26(3): p. 245-50.
- 246 10. Bowen L and S. J, Minority Presence and Portrayal in Mainstream Magazine
247 Advertising: An Update. *Journalism & Mass Communication*, 1997. 74(1): p. 134-146.
- 248 11. Plous, S. and D. Neptune, Racial and Gender Biases in Magazine Advertising: A
249 ContentAnalytic Study. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 1997. 21(4).
- 250 12. Appiah, O., Black, White, Hispanic, and Asian American Adolescents' Responses to
251 Culturally Embedded Ads. *Howard Journal of Communication*, 2001. 12(1): p. 29-48.
- 252 13. Bush, R.F., R.F. Gwinner, and P.J. Solomon, White Consumer Sales Response to
253 Black Models. *Journal of Marketing*, 1974. 38(2): p. 25-29.
- 254 14. Chaiken, S., Heuristic versus Systematic Information Processing and the Use of
255 Source versus Message Cues in Persuasion. *Journal of Personality and Social
256 Psychology*, 1980. 39(5): p. 752-766.
- 257 15. Cui, G., Marketing Strategies in a Multi-Ethnic Environement. *Journal of Marketing
258 Theory and Practice*, 1997. 5(1): p. 122-134.
- 259 16. Davis, J.L. and O.H. Gandy, Racial Identity and Media Orientation: Exploring the
260 Nature of Constraint. *Journal of Black Studies*, 1999. 29(3): p. 367-397.
- 261 17. Deshpande, R., W.D. Hoyer, and N. Donthu, The Intensity of Ethnic Affiliation: A Study
262 of the Sociology of Hispanic Consumption. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 1986. 13(2):
263 p. 214-220.
- 264 18. Grier, S.A., A.M. Brumbaugh, and C.G. Thornton, Crossover Dreams: Consumer
265 Responses to Ethnic-Oriented Products. *Journal of Marketing*, 2006. 70(2): p. 35-51.

- 266 19. Duerksen, S.C., et al., Health disparities and advertising content of women's
267 magazines: a cross-sectional study. *BMC Public Health*, 2005. 5: p. 85.
- 268 20. Media, A.o.A., Circulation Report. 2019.
- 269 21. Bureau, U.S.C., Quick Facts: United States. 2021.
- 270 22. Kulkarni, K., et al., Obesity and osteoarthritis. *Maturitas*, 2016. 89: p. 22-8.
- 271 23. Prevention, C.f.D.C.a., Racial/ethnic differences in the prevalence and impact of
272 doctor diagnosed arthritis. *MMWR*, 2005. 54(5): p. 119-123.
- 273 24. Aaker, J.L., A.M. Brumbaugh, and S.A. Grier, Nontarget Markets and Viewer
274 Distinctiveness: The Impact of Target Marketing on Advertising Attitudes. *Journal of*
275 *Consumer Psychology*, 2000. 9(3): p. 127-140.
- 276 25. Lee, D. and C.E. Begley, Racial and ethnic disparities in response to direct-to-
277 consumer advertising. *Am J Health Syst Pharm*, 2010. 67(14): p. 1185-90.
- 278 26. Wiznia, L.E., et al., Deficiency of sun protection advertising exists in consumer
279 magazines across demographic groups and varies by target demographic. *J Am Acad*
280 *Dermatol*, 2019. 80(4): p. 1139-1141.
- 281 27. Hoffman, K.M., et al., Racial bias in pain assessment and treatment
282 recommendations, and false beliefs about biological differences between blacks and
283 whites. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*, 2016. 113(16): p. 4296-301.
- 284 28. Maina, I.W., et al., A decade of studying implicit racial/ethnic bias in healthcare
285 providers using the implicit association test. *Soc Sci Med*, 2018. 199: p. 219-229.
- 286 29. Artiga, S., K. Orgera, and A. Damico, Changes in Health Coverage by Race and
287 Ethnicity since the ACA, 2010-2018, . Kaiser Family Foundation, 2020.

Tables

Table 1: Magazine and ad characteristics

Variable	Number MSK ads across 3 magazines/type; N (%)
Magazine type	
Senior Health	131 (8.11%)
Women's Health	352 (21.78%)
Sports Health	401 (24.81%)
Men's Health	355 (21.97%)
Food/Dietary Health	85 (5.26%)
General Lifestyle	211 (13.06%)
African American Health	12 (0.74%)
Hispanic Health	69 (4.27%)
Ad category	
Exercise	173 (10.71%)
Fitness/Exercise Clothing	250 (15.47%)
Fitness/Exercise Equipment	237 (14.67%)
Health Food	264 (16.34%)
Pain Relief	150 (9.28%)
Supplements	225 (13.92%)
Diet	199 (12.31%)
Health Insurance	19 (1.18%)
Weight Loss Program	13 (0.80%)
Sports Drink	62 (3.84%)
Medical Establishment	6 (0.37%)
Medical Procedure	2 (0.12%)
Medical Equipment	16 (0.99%)
Featured model	
Model	785 (48.55%)
No model	832 (51.45%)
Multiple races in ad	
Yes	57 (3.53%)
No	1,560 (96.47%)
Different genders in ad	
Yes	133 (8.23%)
No	1,483 (91.71%)
Unknown	1 (0.06%)
Race of model	
Black	138 (17.58%)
Hispanic	22 (2.80%)
Asian	10 (1.27%)
Mixed	53 (6.75%)
White	538 (68.54%)
Unknown or N/A	24 (3.06%)
Featured gender	
Female	434 (55.29%)
Male	287 (36.56%)
Unknown or N/A	1 (0.13%)
Both	63 (8.03%)

Featured gender and race	
White Men	196 (11.88%)
White Women	313 (18.97%)
Black Men	50 (3.03%)
Black Women	64 (3.88%)
Hispanic Men	12 (0.73%)
Hispanic Women	6 (0.36%)
Asian Men	4 (0.24%)
Asian Women	5 (0.30%)
Mixed Race Men	15 (0.91%)
Mixed Race Women	36 (2.18%)
Unknown or none	949 (57.52%)

Table 2: Differences in race of model by MSK ad category

Variable	N (%)						p-value
	White	Hispanic	Asian	Mixed	Black	Unknown	
Ad category							<0.001
Exercise	93 (67.9%)	10 (7.3%)	2 (1.5%)	11 (8.0%)	17 (12.4%)	4 (2.9%)	
Fitness/Exercise Clothing	97 (72.9%)	2 (2.3%)	3 (2.3%)	7 (5.3%)	21 (15.8%)	3 (2.3%)	
Fitness/Exercise Equipment	67 (75.3%)	2 (2.3%)	3 (3.4%)	8 (9.0%)	9 (10.1%)	0 (0.0%)	
Health Food	49 (69.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	1 (1.4%)	17 (23.9%)	4 (5.6%)	
Pain Relief	53 (85.5%)	0 (0.0%)	1 (1.6%)	3 (4.8%)	4 (6.5%)	1 (1.6%)	
Supplement	96 (81.4%)	2 (1.7%)	1 (0.9%)	11 (9.3%)	7 (5.9%)	1 (0.9%)	
Diet	61 (78.2%)	1 (1.3%)	0 (0.0%)	8 (10.3%)	8 (10.3%)	0 (0.0%)	
Health Insurance	7 (41.2%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	10 (58.8%)	0 (0.0%)	
Weight Loss Program	2 (25.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	6 (75.0%)	0 (0.0%)	
Sports Drink	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	4 (7.4%)	39 (72.2%)	11 (20.4%)	
Medical Establishment	0 (0.0%)	5 (100.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	
Procedure	2 (100.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	
Medical Equipment	10 (100.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	

Bold indicates statistical significance, set at p<0.05.

Table 3: Observed frequencies of racial distribution within MSK ad categories differ from US demographic distribution

Variable	Observed frequency; expected frequency					p-value
	White	Hispanic	Asian	Mixed	Black	
Ad category						
Exercise	93; 79.9	10; 24.6	2; 7.9	11; 3.7	17; 17.8	<0.001
Fitness/Exercise Clothing	97; 78.1	2; 24.1	3; 7.7	7; 3.6	21; 17.4	<0.001
Fitness/Exercise Equipment	67; 53.5	2; 16.5	3; 5.3	8; 2.5	9; 11.9	<0.001
Health Food	49; 40.3	0; 12.4	0; 4.0	1; 1.9	17; 9.0	<0.001
Pain Relief	53; 36.7	0; 11.3	1; 3.6	3; 1.8	4; 8.2	<0.001
Supplement	96; 70.3	2; 21.7	1; 6.9	11; 3.3	7; 15.7	<0.001
Diet	61; 46.9	1; 14.4	0; 4.6	8; 2.2	8; 10.5	<0.001
Health Insurance	7; 10.2	0; 3.2	0; 1.0	0; 0.5	10; 2.3	<0.001
Weight Loss Program*	2; 4.8	0; 1.5	0; 0.5	0; 0.2	6; 1.1	<0.001
Sports Drink	0; 25.8	0; 8.0	0; 2.5	4; 1.2	39; 5.8	<0.001
Medical Establishment*	0; 3.0	5; 0.9	0; 0.3	0; 0.1	0; 0.7	<0.001
Procedure*	2; 1.2	0; 0.4	0; 0.1	0; 0.1	0; 0.3	0.728
Medical Equipment	10; 6.0	0; 1.9	0; 0.6	0; 0.3	0; 1.3	0.037

*n<10 so no significant statistical conclusions could be drawn. Bold indicates statistical significance, set at p<0.05.