Efficacy and safety of acupuncture for postpartum hypogalactia: Protocol for a systematic review and meta-analysis

Authors and Affiliations

Qiong-Nan Bao,[†1,2] Yuan-Fang Zhou,[†1] Zi-Han Yin[1], Qiu-Bi[2], Hong-Bin Zhao,[2] Zhen-Yong Zhang,[2] Fan-Rong Liang[*1]

1. Acupuncture and Tuina School, Chengdu University of Traditional Chinese Medicine, Chengdu, China.
2. Department of traditional Chinese medicine, The First People's Hospital of Yunnan Province, The Affiliated Hospital of Kunming University of Science and Technology, Kunming, China.

†Co-first authors: Qiong-nan Bao, Yuan-Fang Zhou

*Corresponding authors: Fan-Rong Liang

Correspondence to:

Professor Fan-Rong Liang

Acupuncture and Tuina School/The 3rd Teaching Hospital

Chengdu University of Traditional Chinese Medicine

37 Shierqiao Road, Chengdu 610075, Sichuan, China

Telephone: +86 13608058216

E-mail: acuresearch@126.com.

Efficacy and safety of acupuncture for postpartum hypogalactia: Protocol for a systematic review and meta-analysis

ABSTRACT

Breast milk is recognised as the best natural food for neonates; however, many women experience postpartum hypogalactia (PH). The available treatments for PH are limited in clinical settings, and acupuncture is a valid alternative treatment for PH, as proven by randomised trials. However, systematic reviews demonstrating the safety and efficacy of acupuncture for PH are still lacking; therefore, this systematic review aims to evaluate the efficacy and safety of acupuncture for PH.

Methods and analysis Eight English (PubMed, Cochrane Library, MEDLINE, EMBASE, EBSCO, Scopus, Ovid, Web of Science) and four Chinese databases (China National Knowledge Infrastructure, Wan-Fang, Chinese Biomedical Literature, Chinese Scientific Journal) will be systematically searched from their establishment to 1 September 2022. Randomised controlled trials (RCTs) of the efficacy of acupuncture for PH will be reviewed. The study selection, data extraction, and research quality evaluation will be conducted independently by two reviewers. The primary outcome is the change in serum prolactin (PRL) level from baseline to the end of treatment. Secondary results include milk secretion volume, total effectiveness rate, degree of mammary fullness, rate of exclusive breastfeeding, infant weight gain, and adverse events. A meta-analysis will be performed using RevMan V.5.4 statistical

software. Otherwise, a descriptive analysis will be conducted. The risk of bias will be assessed using the revised Cochrane risk-of-bias tool.

Ethics and dissemination This systematic review protocol does not require ethical approval because it does not include private information/data of the participants. This article will be published in peer-reviewed journals.

PROSPERO registration number: CRD42022351849

Strengths and limitations of this study

1. This study will be the first systematic review to evaluate the efficacy and safety of acupuncture for PH by including available clinical trials that have been published in the past.

2. The quality of the included trials will be assessed using the Revised Cochrane Risk of Bias Tool for Randomised Trials (ROB2).

3. This study will provide more reliable evidence for clinical management because most RCTs on acupuncture for PH have small sample sizes.

4. This study will include only English and Chinese trials, which may lead to missing studies in other languages.

BACKGROUND

Postpartum hypogalactia (PH) is a common condition that greatly affects healthy growth and development of babies. It is characterised by little or no breast milk during the lactation period, and the mother perceives that she has inadequate milk to satisfy her infant's needs. Many investigators have reported that PH is the most common cause of breastfeeding failure.[1-3] Only 38% of infants aged under 6 months are exclusively breastfed worldwide according to the recommendation of the World Health Organization (WHO),[4] which is lower than the target of 50% in 2025.[5] In China and Europe, the rate of exclusive breastfeeding within six months after birth is only 13-39% and 29%, respectively,.[6-7] PH has detrimental effects on both babies and mothers. For infants, it increases the risk of infectious diseases and may cause a higher rate of mortality.[8] For mothers, it may increase the risk of breast cancer, ovarian cancer, and type 2 diabetes.[9-11] Therefore, PH poses challenges not only to mothers who desire to provide milk for their babies but also to infants who need optimal nutrition; thus, PH has an adverse impact on public and global health.

Although there are no standardised guidelines for treating PH, several drugs have been used to treat this condition. Recent systematic reviews have shown that the primary medications currently used include metoclopramide, domperidone, and sulpiride.[12-14] Although these drugs have been proven to be moderately effective in the treatment of PH, they are associated with many adverse effects, including extrapyramidal reactions, increased risk of cardiac arrhythmias, sudden cardiac death,

and alterations in the development of the central nervous system of the infants.[15-18] The sustained effects of these drugs on breast milk provision are still unclear,[13] and the ideal medication has not yet been discovered. Other than drugs, PH can be treated by relaxation techniques, skin-to-skin holding, hand expression, etc.,[19-21] but the role of these methods in augmenting breast milk might be limited. Therefore, identification of safe and effective therapies for treating PH is important.

Acupuncture, a complementary and alternative medicine technique, has been used to treat PH in China for more than 2000 years. In Western countries, acupuncture is one of the most frequently recommended interventions to increase maternal milk production.[22] Acupuncture involves insertion of fine needles into certain acupoints on the surface of the body, with specific operational methods to restore the balance or harmony of the individual and thereby restore health. An increasing number of studies have verified the efficacy of acupuncture in the treatment of PH. A multi-center randomised, single-blind clinical trial reported that milk production, breast fullness, and prolactin levels were better treated by acupuncture.[23] Moreover, other studies have also demonstrated that acupuncture is an effective therapy for maintaining or increasing the amount of milk secretion, adding mammary fullness and infant weight gain, and improving exclusive breastfeeding rate.[24-25] Acupuncture has been suggested to delay the postpartum reduction in PRL levels and increase the plasma PRL and oxytocin levels.[26] The mechanisms underlying the effects of acupuncture may involve adjusting microbial and hormonal signals and regulating the activity of hypothalamic

dopamine system and noradrenaline system.[27] Thus, acupuncture may be a viable option for women with PH.

Many randomised controlled trials (RCTs) on acupuncture treatment for PH have been published recently.[24,28] However, no evidence-based consensus on the effect of acupuncture on PH has been reached to date. To our knowledge, this is the first systematic review published in English related to acupuncture in the treatment of PH. Thus, this review aims to evaluate the effectiveness and safety of acupuncture for PH and offers a reliable reference for its application to clinicians and patients.

METHODS

Study registration

This study has been registered on PROSPERO (CRD42022351849) and will be conducted according to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses Protocols (PRISMA-P) Statement.

Criteria for inclusion of studies in this review

Types of studies

All RCTs of acupuncture therapy for PH will be included in the review without any limitations on language and publication time. Non-RCTs, quasi-RCTs, case series,

comments, conference abstracts, guides, letters, notes, book sections, editorials, reviews, and animal experimental studies, as well as expert experiences will be excluded.

Types of participants

RCTs involving participants with PH, including primipara and multipara participants, will be included without restrictions on age and parity. Studies that included participants with other disorders, such as breast engorgement, mastitis, and breast abscess, will be excluded.

Types of interventions

Acupuncture is defined as needle insertion at acupuncture points, Ashi points, or meridian locations and includes manual acupuncture, electroacupuncture, auricular acupuncture, and scalp acupuncture. Studies with interventions that do not use needles to penetrate the skin, such as transcutaneous electrostimulation or acupressure, will be excluded.

Types of comparator (s)/control

The following comparative studies will be included:

1. Acupuncture versus placebo acupuncture.

2. Acupuncture versus conventional drugs.

3. Acupuncture with herbs versus herbs alone.

4. Acupuncture in addition to active treatment versus active treatment alone.

5. Acupuncture versus waiting list.

6. Acupuncture versus routine care.

Studies comparing the clinical efficacy between different acupoints, different acupuncture methods, or comparing acupuncture with other complementary and alternative therapies will be excluded.

Types of outcome measures

Primary outcome

Changes in serum prolactin levels from baseline to the end of treatment will be measured.

Secondary outcomes

1. Milk secretion volume

2. Total effectiveness rate

3. Degree of mammary fullness

4. Rate of exclusive breastfeeding

5. Infant weight gain

6. Adverse events

Search methods for identification of studies

Electronic search

The following 12 databases will be searched from database establishment to 1 September 2022: PubMed, Cochrane Library, MEDLINE, EMBASE, EBSCO, Scopus, Ovid, Web of Science, China National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI), Chinese Biomedical Literature Database (CBM), Chinese Scientific Journal Database (VIP Database), and Wan-Fang Database. The following medical search headings (MeSH) will be used: “acupuncture,” “acupuncture therapy,” “acupuncture points,” “electroacupuncture,” “lactation,” “lactation disorder,” “milk, human,” “milk ejection,” “breast feeding,” “postpartum period,” “randomized controlled trial,” “controlled clinical trial,” and “random allocation.” Chinese databases will be searched using the Chinese translations of these search terms. The search strategy for PubMed is shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Search strategy for PubMed

Table 1 Search strategy for the PubMed	
No.	**Search terms**
#1	Acupuncture. Mesh
#2	Acupuncture. ti, ab
#3	Acupuncture therapy. Mesh
#4	Acupuncture therapy. ti, ab
#5	Acupuncture points. Mesh
#6	Acupuncture points. ti, ab
#7	electroacupuncture. Mesh
#8	electroacupuncture. ti, ab
#9	(body acupuncture or manual acupuncture or auricular acupuncture) . ti, ab
#10	#1 or #2-9
#11	Lactation. Mesh
#12	Lactation disorder. Mesh
#13	Milk, human. Mesh
#14	Milk ejection. Mesh
#15	Breast feeding. Mesh
#16	Postpartum period. Mesh
#17	(lactation or milk or breast feeding or breastfeeding or hypogalactia or galactosis or colostrum or postpartum or postnatal or puerperal) . ti, ab
#18	#11 or #12-17
#19	randomized controlled trial. pt
#20	controlled clinical trial. pt
#21	random allocation. Mesh
#22	clinical trial. pt
#23	randomized. ti,ab
#24	randomly. ti,ab
#25	trial. ti
#26	#19 or #20-25
#27	#10 and #18 and #26

Searching other resources

Potential eligible studies will be searched for in conference papers and the reference lists of relevant published reviews.

Data collection and analysis

Selection of studies

After completing all the electronic search work, the title, author names, and abstract of the retrieved article will be imported into Endnote, and repeated articles will be eliminated. Two reviewers (Q-NB and Y-FZ) will independently screen the titles and abstracts of all the searched studies and filter out the articles that meet the inclusion criteria. The studies excluded after reading the full text will also be documented, and the reasons for exclusion will be recorded. The selection results will be crosschecked by two reviewers (Q-NB and Y-FZ). If there were any disagreements in the process, the results will be arbitrated by a third reviewer (Z-HY). The primary selection process is shown in the PRISMA flow chart (Figure 1).

Data extraction and management

Two reviewers (Q-NB and Y-FZ) will independently extract information using a predetermined data table designed by all reviewers, including the following information: publication year, demographic characteristics of the participants, sample size, randomisation, allocation concealment, blinding methods, funding, diagnostic

criteria, inclusion/exclusion criteria, details of the intervention and control, outcome measurement methods, follow-up duration, adverse events, and outcomes. Any disagreements will be resolved through discussion or judged by a third reviewer (Z-HY). If the reported data are unclear, the authors of the studies will be contacted for consultation and solutions. Cross-checking of all data will be performed before transferring the data to RevMan5.4 software.

Assessment for risk of bias

Two investigators (Q-NB and Y-FZ) will independently appraise the quality of the included trials using the Revised Cochrane Risk of Bias tool for randomised trials,[29] which includes the following seven categories: random sequence generation, allocation concealment, blinding of participants and personnel, blinding of outcome assessment, incomplete outcome data, selective reporting, and other biases if necessary. A third investigator (Z-HY) will intervene to reach a consensus if inconsistent results are obtained.

Measures for the treatment effect

This study will use RevMan5.4 software for all data analysis. Dichotomous data will be calculated by the relative risk (RR) with 95% confidence intervals (CIs), and continuous data will be analysed using the mean difference (MD) or standardised mean difference (SMD) with 95% CIs.

Assessment of heterogeneity

Heterogeneity will be tested using I^2 value and $\chi 2$ tests. I^2 values $\geq 50\%$ or $P < 0.10$ indicates significant heterogeneity,[32] and a random-effect model will be used with heterogeneous data. If there is considerable heterogeneity ($I^2 \geq 80\%$), a meta-analysis will not be performed, and subgroup analysis will be performed to determine the origin of the heterogeneity of studies.

Assessment of reporting bias

We will use a funnel plot to detect reporting bias if the number of articles exceeded ten. A symmetrical distribution of the funnel plot indicated no reporting bias.

Data synthesis

We will use Revman 5.4 software to analyse the data. Subgroup analysis will be performed with careful consideration of each subgroup if necessary. The use of a fixed-effects or random-effects model will be determined based on the heterogeneity level. The fixed-effects model will be used if little or no statistical heterogeneity is observed among trials. In contrast, the random-effects model will be used if significant heterogeneity is found.

Subgroup analysis and investigation of heterogeneity

Subgroup analysis will be performed for different types of control groups and

different outcomes if the necessary data are available. Heterogeneity across studies will be assessed using the $\chi 2$ test with a significance level of $P < 0.05$, which indicates a significant difference. When heterogeneity is statistically significant, subgroup analysis will be performed to explore the possible causes of heterogeneity.

Sensitivity analysis

To test the robustness of the results, we will conduct sensitivity analyses for the primary outcome according to the following criteria: sample size and the statistical model.

Grading the quality of evidence

Two reviewers (Q-NB and Y-FZ) will independently evaluate evidence quality using the Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development, and Evaluation (GRADE) system. The GRADE system evaluates five aspects: limitations in study design, inconsistency, indirectness, imprecision and publication bias. The quality of evidence will be graded as “high,” “moderate,” “low,” or “very low” in accordance with the GRADE rating standards.

ETHICS AND DISSEMINATION

This study does not require ethical approval, since no private information of participants will be involved. The results of the present study will be disseminated in

peer-reviewed journals or conference presentations. Important protocol amendments will be documented and updated in PROSPERO.

Patient and public involvement

Patient priorities, experiences, and preferences were not involved in the development of the research question, outcome measures, study design, or the conduct of this review. The results will not be disseminated to participants.

DISCUSSION

Treating PH can benefit the patient as well as public health in general. As a safe and environmentally friendly treatment, acupuncture has long been used to treat PH. Despite the many RCTs indicating the benefit of acupuncture in promoting breast milk production, most of them were of low quality and had small sample sizes. The current clinical evidence of acupuncture for the treatment of PH is inadequate. Consequently, we will use a systematic review and meta-analysis to further study the effectiveness of acupuncture in treating PH to provide clinicians with more admissible evidence in the process of PH treatment. However, this study had an inevitable risk, and different treatment courses, acupoints, and methods of milk measurement may run a high risk of heterogeneity. Additionally, only English and Chinese trials were selected, which may have resulted in the loss of potential studies. Finally, it is difficult

to implement single- or double-blind acupuncture experiments, which may have caused bias in the study.

Author Contributions Q-NB contributed to the concept of the study, and Y-FZ developed the protocol methodology. H-BZ is responsible for planning the statistical analysis. F-RL will monitor protocol implementation. The original manuscript was completed by Q-NB and was edited by QB. Q-NB and Y-FZ will independently screen potential studies and extract data from the included studies. Q-NB and Y-FZ will assess the risk of bias and perform the data synthesis. Z-HY will arbitrate any conflicts between reviewers and perform quality checks at all stages of review. All authors have read, provided feedback, and approved the final manuscript.

Funding: This study was financially supported by the Yunnan Province "Ten Thousand Plan" Industrial Technology Leading Talents Funding Project (NO.YNWR-CYJS-2019-036), Yunnan Medical Leading Talents Training Program (NO.L-201619), and State Administration of Traditional Chinese Medicine.

Competing interests None declared.

Patient consent for publication Not required.

Provenance and peer review Not commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

REFERENCES

1. Geddes D, Perrella S. Breastfeeding and Human Lactation. *Nutrients* 2019;11:E802.

2. Gatti L. Maternal perceptions of insufficient milk supply in breastfeeding. *J Nurs Scholarsh* 2008;40:355-63.

3. Camurdan AD, Ilhan MN, Beyazova U, *et al.* How to achieve long-term breast-feeding: factors associated with early discontinuation. *Public Health Nutr* 2008;11:1173-9.

4. World Health Organization. Global strategy for infant and young childfeeding. 2003. Geneva, Switzerland. https://2001.https://media.tghn.org/articles/WHO_UNICEF_2003.pdf. Accessed date: 6/8/2022.

5. Almohanna AA, Win KT, Meedya S. Effectiveness of Internet-Based Electronic Technology Interventions on Breastfeeding Outcomes: Systematic Review. *J Med Internet Res* 2020;22:e17361.

6. Theurich MA, Weikert C, Abraham K, *et al.* [Breastfeeding rate and promotion in selected European countries]. *Bundesgesundheitsblatt Gesundheitsforschung Gesundheitsschutz* 2018;61:926-36.

7. Wang Y, Zhou C. China should take more measures to raise its breastfeeding rate. *Biosci Trends* 2019;13:358-60.

8. Gartner LM, Morton J, Lawrence RA, *et al.* Breastfeeding and the use of human milk. *Pediatrics* 2005;115:496-506.

9. Migliavacca Zucchetti B, Peccatori FA, Codacci-Pisanelli G. Pregnancy and Lactation: Risk or Protective Factors for Breast Cancer. *Adv Exp Med Biol* 2020;1252:195-7.

10. Stuebe AM, Rich-Edwards JW, Willett WC, *et al.* Duration of lactation and incidence of type 2 diabetes. *JAMA* 2005;294:2601-10.

11. Babic A, Sasamoto N, Rosner BA, *et al.* Association Between Breastfeeding and Ovarian Cancer Risk. *JAMA Oncol* 2020;6:e200421.

12. Zuppa AA, Sindico P, Orchi C, *et al.* Safety and efficacy of galactogogues: substances that induce, maintain and increase breast milk production. *J Pharm Pharm Sci* 2010;13:162-74.

13. Forinash AB, Yancey AM, Barnes KN, *et al.* The use of galactogogues in the breastfeeding mother. *Ann Pharmacother* 2012;46:1392-404.

14. Asztalos EV. Supporting Mothers of Very Preterm Infants and Breast Milk Production: A Review of the Role of Galactogogues. *Nutrients* 2018;10:E600.

15. Gabay MP. Galactogogues: medications that induce lactation. *J Hum Lact* 2002;18:274-9.

16. Hondeghem LM, Logghe NH. Should Domperidone be Used as a Galactagogue? Possible Safety Implications for Mother and Child. *Drug Saf* 2017;40:109-13.

17. Osadchy A, Moretti ME, Koren G. Effect of domperidone on insufficient lactation in puerperal women: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Obstet Gynecol Int* 2012;2012:642893.

18. Transfer of drugs and other chemicals into human milk. *Pediatrics* 2001;108:776-89.

19. Mohd Shukri NH, Wells J, Eaton S, *et al.* Randomized controlled trial investigating the effects of a breastfeeding relaxation intervention on maternal psychological state, breast milk outcomes, and infant behavior and growth. *Am J Clin Nutr* 2019;110:121-30.

20. Vila-Candel R, Duke K, Soriano-Vidal FJ, *et al.* Affect of Early Skin-to-Skin Mother-Infant Contact in the Maintenance of Exclusive Breastfeeding: Experience in a Health Department in Spain. *J Hum Lact* 2018;34:304-12.

21. Becker GE, Smith HA, Cooney F. Methods of milk expression for lactating women. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2016;9:CD006170.

22. Winterfeld U, Meyer Y, Panchaud A, *et al.* Management of deficient lactation in Switzerland and Canada: a survey of midwives' current practices. *Breastfeed Med* 2012;7:317-8.

23. Wang HC, An JM, Han Y, *et al.* [Multicentral randomized controlled studies on acupuncture at Shaoze (SI 1) for treatment of postpartum hypolactation]. *Zhongguo Zhen Jiu* 2007;27:85-8.

24. Neri I, Allais G, Vaccaro V, *et al.* Acupuncture treatment as breastfeeding support: preliminary data. *J Altern Complement Med* 2011;17:133-7.

25. He JQ, Chen BY, Huang T, *et al.* [Randomized controlled multi-central study on acupuncture at Tanzhong (CV 17) for treatment of postpartum hypolactation]. *Zhongguo Zhen Jiu* 2008;28:317-20.

26. Wei L, Wang H, Han Y, *et al.* Clinical observation on the effects of electroacupuncture at Shaoze (SI 1) in 46 cases of postpartum insufficient lactation. *J Tradit Chin Med* 2008;28:168-72.

27. Sheng PL, Xie QW. Relationship between effect of acupuncture on prolactin secretion and central catecholamine and R-aminobutyric acid. *Zhen Ci Yan Jiu* 1989;14:446-51.

28. Maged AM, Hassanin ME, Kamal WM, *et al.* Effect of Low-Level Laser Therapy versus Electroacupuncture on Postnatal Scanty Milk Secretion: A Randomized Controlled Trial. *Am J Perinatol* 2020;37:1243-9.

29. Eldridge, S., Campbell, M., Campbell, M., et al. (2016). Revised Cochrane risk of bias tool for randomized trials (RoB 2.0): additional considerations for cluster-randomized trials. Available

at: https://sites.google.com/site/riskofbiastool/welcome/rob-2-0-tool. Accessed date: 13/6/2022.