

# Universality of Universal Health Coverage: a Scoping Review

Aklilu Endalamaw<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Charles F Gilks<sup>2</sup>, Fentie Ambaw<sup>3</sup>, Yibeltal Assefa<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>The University of Queensland, School of Public Health, Brisbane, Australia

<sup>2</sup>School of Health Sciences, College of Medicine and Health Sciences, Bahir Dar University, Bahir Dar, Ethiopia

<sup>3</sup>School of Public Health, College of Medicine and Health Sciences, Bahir Dar University, Bahir Dar, Ethiopia

\*Corresponding author: Aklilu Endalamaw; Gmail-yaklilu12@gmail.com

## Abstract

**Background:** Universal health coverage (UHC) is achieved in the primary healthcare pathways. UHC is about population coverage, services coverage and financial protection. Tracer indicators are used to measure the progress towards UHC. There is inadequate evidence that assess the extent of the universality of UHC. Evidence is, therefore, needed to map the existing literature and summarize the issues covered in the dimensions of UHC.

**Methods:** A systematic search was carried out in the Web of Science and PubMed databases. Hand searches were also conducted to find articles from Google Scholar, the World Bank Library, the World Health Organization Library, the United Nations Digital Library Collections, and Google. Articles on UHC coverage, financial risk protection, quality of care, and inequity were included. A stepwise approach was used to identify and select relevant studies, conduct data charting, collation and summarization, as well as report results. Simple descriptive statistics and narrative synthesis were used to present the findings.

**Results:** Forty-seven papers were included in the final review. One-fourth of the articles (25.5%) were from the African region and 29.8% were from lower-middle-income countries. More than half of the articles (54.1%) used a quantitative research approach. Of included articles, coverage was assessed by 53.2% of articles; financial risk protection by 27.7%, inequity by 25.5% and quality by 6.4% of the articles as their main research objectives or mentioned in result section. Most (42.5%) of articles investigated health promotion and 2.1% palliation and rehabilitation services. Policy and health care level and cross-cutting barriers were identified in the progress of UHC.

**Conclusions:** The results of the study showed that majorities of evidence were from Africa's region. Methodologically, the quantitative approach was a more frequently used research design to investigate UHC. Palliation and rehabilitation

health care services need attention in the analysis of the progress towards UHC. The finding of the current evidence is noteworthy to focus on quality and inequity of health services in the future UHC research. Comprehensive evidence is needed to fully understand and progressively realize UHC.

**Keywords:** Coverage; Financial protection; Equity; Quality; scoping review; Universal Health Coverage

## Introduction

Universal health coverage (UHC) is a multi-dimensional concept that includes population coverage, services coverage and financial protection as its building blocks, as well as all individuals and communities (equity), quality, and types of health services in its integrated definition (1). UHC is thought to have the ability to improve the population's health, economic progress, and social justice (2, 3). UHC work is essential to minimize disparities, promote effective and comprehensive health governance, and build resilient health systems (4). Many components of primary health care, such as proper nutrition, clean water and sanitation, maternal and child health care, immunisation, local disease control, accessible treatment, and drug provision, are intertwined with UHC (5).

The United Nation's (UN) post-2015 goals described UHC as the predominant design for achieving sustainable health goals of 2030 (6). Furthermore, at the UHC 2020 high-level meeting, UHC was declared an urgent priority for addressing global health crises, including the pandemic COVID-19 (7). This could be accomplished by carrying out activities aimed at providing the desired percentage of the population with essential quality healthcare services while keeping healthcare costs to an acceptable minimum. The UN General Assembly declared at its 73rd session that one billion more people would have access to health care by 2023 (8). The UN also agreed to make essential health services available to 80 percent of the population by 2030, with no catastrophic health expenditures (6).

Tracking the progress of UHC at the global and national levels is essential to identify successes and challenges as well as put forward recommendations. The World Health Organization (WHO) launched its recommendation on research for UHC in 2010 and 2013 (9, 10). The World Bank (WB) also did the same in 2013 (11). Following that, WHO and the WB established core tracers of health service coverage, based on the target of sustainable development goal (SDG) 3.8.1, to quantify UHC using a single measurable value, which integrates the majority of its tracers (12). under the main theme of (1) reproductive, maternal, neonatal, and child health (RMNC), (2) infectious diseases (IDs), (3) non-communicable diseases (NCDs), and (4) service capacity and access (SCA), category one indicators include family planning (FP), antenatal care (ANC) and delivery, immunisation coverage, child-care seeking behaviour for pneumonia; category two indicators include tuberculosis (TB) treatment success, antiretroviral therapy (ART) for HIV, bed net for malaria prevention, and water and adequate sanitation; category three indicators include prevention and treatment of high blood pressure, prevention and treatment of high blood glucose, cervical cancer screening, and tobacco (non-) smoking; and category four indicators include basic hospital access, health worker density, access to essential medicines, and health security. SDG 3.8.2 is about financial risk protection, which is typically measured by catastrophic health expenditure (CHE) and the level of the impoverishment caused by health costs (12).

In addition to these internationally agreed tracer indicators to monitor UHC, other global organisations and countries created additional or new effective service coverage tracer indicators. Notably, the Global Burden Disease Collaborators-2019 (GBD-2019) developed twenty-three indicators of UHC effective service coverage (13). Researchers from China developed Chinese indices of accessibility and affordability indicators to assess the overall state of UHC (14).

Several studies have been conducted on UHC all over the world. These studies have utilized varying methods, measurement metrics, and indicators that require mapping and characterization. A scoping review of the studies on UHC and its dimensions is crucial to map and characterize the existing studies and identify the gaps in evidence towards UHC.

This will also help to identify key concepts, gaps in the research, and types and sources of evidence to inform practice, policymaking, and research (15). While no prior studies have been conducted to identify and map the available evidence on UHC, other related studies such as “a synthesis of conceptual literature and global debates” (1) and a scoping review of “implementation research approaches of UHC” (16) are available; however, both did not map and synthesize existing UHC researches. In addition to these literatures, another study assessed the hegemonic nature of UHC in health policy and described historical background how UHC emerged, and frequency of UHC mentioned in all fields of articles available in PubMed database (17). Taking in account UHC as the main research topic, none of the previous studies addressed the universality of UHC in terms of its building blocks (population coverage, service coverage, and financial coverage). Furthermore, those studies did not aim to map existing research on UHC and summarize the findings of each study included in the review. The types of health services (health promotion, disease prevention, treatment, rehabilitation, and palliative care) as an integrated definition of UHC, and how much each is covered in UHC studies, also were not taken into account in those studies.

The goals of this scoping review are to first determine the characteristics of UHC studies, their approaches, and the distribution of articles across WHO regions; second, to synthesize UHC research findings; and third, to inform priority research questions for future studies. To the best of our knowledge, this will be the first scoping review describing available research outputs with their findings on UHC, universality of UHC studies in terms of incorporating UHC dimensions, and types of health services covered in its research.

## **Methods**

### ***Identifying a research question***

93 The protocol of this scoping review is available elsewhere <https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-1082468/v1>. The overall activities  
94 adhered to the Arksey and O'Malley's (2005) scoping review framework (18), which was expanded with a methodological  
95 enhancement for scoping review projects (19), and the Joanna Briggs Institution framework (20). The review followed five  
96 steps: (1) identifying research questions, (2) identifying relevant studies, (3) study selection, (4) data charting, and (5)  
97 collation, summarization and reporting of results. The checklist Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and  
98 Meta-analysis extension for Scoping Reviews were used (Supplementary file-1) (21).

99 The research questions were developed by AE in collaboration with YA. The Population, Concept, and Context framework  
100 was used to determine the eligibility of research questions. According to the framework, the population consisted of  
101 people of any gender at any age, as well as health institutions and the concept was UHC and interrelated objectives in the  
102 global context.

### 103 ***Identifying relevant studies***

104 Web of Science, PubMed and Google Scholar were used to find literature in the field. Hand searches were also used to  
105 find articles from Google Scholar, WB Library, WHO Library, UN Digital Library Collections, and Google. Using the  
106 relevant keywords and/or phrases, a comprehensive search strategy was established. Universal, health, "health care",  
107 healthcare, "health service", quality, access, coverage, equity, disparity, inequity, equality, inequality, expenditure, and  
108 cost were search words and/or phrases. "AND" or "OR" Boolean operators were used to broaden and narrow the specific  
109 search results. Search strings were formed in accordance with the need for databases (supplementary file-2). The articles  
110 were imported into EndNote desktop version x7, which was used to perform an automatic duplication check. Manual  
111 duplication removal was also performed. The database search strategies are shown in the supplementary file.

112 Studies conducted using the English language were included. Articles on overall UHC (UHC effective service coverage  
113 and FRP), UHC effective service coverage, UHC without specification with service coverage and FRP, and that reported  
114 quantitatively coverage, quality, inequity, FRP in the outcome of the study or qualitatively explored UHC research  
115 objectives were included. Types of study design included were quantitative, qualitative, mixed-research, and review types.  
116 The search was narrowed to include only literature published after 2015 in order to find studies that addressed the SDG  
117 target of 3.8 in 2015 and subsequent years. Articles were searched between October 20, 2021 and November 12, 2021,  
118 with the most recent update on March 03, 2022. Non-English language literature, abstracts only, comments or letters to  
119 the editor, erratum, corrections, and brief communications were all excluded.

## 120 ***Study selection***

121 In consultation with YA, AE developed and tested study selection forms on a random sample of references derived from  
122 search results. A second meeting was held to approve the study screening form and process. The inclusion and exclusion  
123 criteria were followed during the article screening process. Articles' titles, abstracts, and full texts were reviewed in stages.  
124 After duplicates were removed using EndNote desktop x7 software and manual duplication removal, titles were screened.  
125 After that, abstracts were used to screen the literature. Those who passed abstract review were eligible for full-text review.  
126 Full-text articles were also screened for data charting purposes. For articles with only an abstract, contact was made with  
127 the study's corresponding authors.

## 128 ***Data charting***

129 A piloted and refined data extraction tool was initially developed to chart the results of the review from full-text literature.  
130 Data was examined, charted, and sorted according to key issues and themes. Author(s), publication year, WHO

131 geographic category, WB group, study approach, studied domain or topic, UHC themes, and health care service types  
132 were all extracted.

### 133 ***Collation, summarization, and report of results***

134 Based on years of publication, studied dimensions (interrelated objectives), WHO region, WB group, study approach, and  
135 health care service types, available articles were compiled and summarized with frequency and percentage.

136 A simple descriptive analysis was performed, and the results were presented in the form of tables and figures. The data  
137 reporting scheme was adjusted as needed based on the findings.

## 138 **Results**

### 139 **Search results**

140 PubMed (n = 6,230) and Web of Science (n = 832) databases were searched. Google Scholar (n=21), WB Library (n=5),  
141 WHO Library (n=7), UN Digital Library Collections (n=13), and Google (n=63) were also manually searched. A total of  
142 7,171 records were discovered. Titles and abstracts were screened after duplicate records were removed both  
143 automatically and manually. Following that, 65 articles were chosen for full-text review. Finally, 47 articles were selected  
144 for scoping review. Figure depicts the PRISMA flow diagram of the study screening and selection process.

### 145 **Articles characteristics**

146 Almost one-fourth of articles are from Africa and another 25.5% are across two or more WHO regions. According to  
147 income category, 42.6% are from lower-middle-income countries followed by 29.8% across two or more WB economy  
148 groups. More than half of the articles (54.1%) followed a quantitative research approach (Table).

149 Table: Articles distributions by World Health Organization region and World Bank category, study approach, interrelated  
 150 objectives, health service type and year of study/publication (n=47)

Variables	Specific details	Frequency	Percentage %)
World Health Organization regions	Across WHO regions	12	25.5
	Africa	12	25.5
	Americas	5	10.6
	Eastern Mediterranean	4	8.5
	South-East Asia	9	19.1
	Western-Pacific	5	10.6
World Bank Categories	Across World Bank groups	14	29.8
	Lower-Middle-income	20	42.6
	Low-income	3	6.4
	Upper-middle-income	10	21.3
Study approach	Quantitative	25	53.2
	Qualitative	13	27.6
	Review	2	4.3
	Mixed approach	7	14.9
Publication year	2015	1	2.1
	2016	7	14.9
	2017	4	8.5
	2018	7	14.9
	2019	12	25.5

2020	9	19.1
2021	7	14.9

FRP-Financial risk protection; HIV/AIDS- Human immunodeficiency virus/acquired immunodeficiency syndrome; UHC- universal health coverage; WHO-World Health Organization

## Health Service types

Twenty articles (22-41) are categorized under health promotion, focusing on pathways, efforts, program evaluation and change, opportunities and challenges, barriers/factors/enablers, community-based health planning and service initiative, perceived effect of health reform on UHC, health-seeking behaviour and knowledge, health security and health promotion activities, the impact of insurance on coverage, and SCA dimensions of UHC. Health promotion encompasses funding and infrastructure, health literacy, the development of healthy public policies, the creation of supportive environments, and the strengthening of community actions and skills, as well as any activities that assist governments, communities, and individuals in dealing with and addressing health challenges.

Six articles discussed treatment aspects of health services, which were access to care for illness, access to treatment for rheumatic heart diseases, neglected tropical diseases (NTDs), mental disorders and hypertension (42-47).

According to GBD-2019, WHO and WB tracers, FP and/or SCA components for promotion, immunisation for prevention and other diseases in RMNC, IDs, NCDs for treatment aspects, nineteen articles were a combination of promotion, prevention, and treatment aspects (13, 48-65).

One study looked at the promotion and treatment of health services together (66).

167 One study on the quality of health care for disabled people (67) was classified as a palliative and rehabilitative care article,  
168 despite the fact that it did not adhere to palliative care assessment guidelines.

## 169 **Components and dimensions of UHC**

170 The main four components of UHC are RMNC, IDs, NCDs and SCA. Distribution RMNC were reported in 40.4% of  
171 articles; NCDs in 36.2%, CDs in 25.5%, and SCA in 25.5%. Regarding dimensions, coverage was assessed by 53.2% of  
172 articles; FRP by 27.7%, inequity by 25.5% and quality by 6.4% of the articles (Supplementary file 3).

## 173 **Tracer indicators for summary measure of UHC**

174 Of 25 quantitative articles, 19 articles used various tracer indicators to assess UHC quantitatively; the remaining six  
175 quantitative articles assessed each empirical analysis of the potential impact of importing health services, access and  
176 financial protection of emergency cares, perceived availability and quality of care, the performance of district health  
177 systems, crude coverage and financial protection, health-seeking behaviour and OOP health expenditures, the  
178 performance of health system.

179 The distribution of tracers in UHC effective service coverage estimation is described in the text below, based on WHO and  
180 WB, GBD-2019, and newly developed tracers. As indicator of RMNC, fourteen articles in the summary index of UHC  
181 effective service coverage included immunisations (13, 48, 51-53, 55-57, 59-65, 68); fifteen articles ANC and delivery (48,  
182 49, 51-53, 55-57, 59-61, 63-65, 68), FP (13, 48, 51, 53, 55, 57, 59-64, 68) and child care seeking for pneumonia (13, 51,  
183 52, 55-57, 59-61, 63-65, 68) each in thirteen articles. Other tracers used were under-5 diarrhoea treatment (13, 49, 52,  
184 53, 55-57, 65, 68) and skilled birth attendance (48, 49, 51, 52, 55-57, 65, 68) each in nine articles, perinatal care for  
185 newborn babies and mothers (13, 49, 53, 68) in four articles, exclusive breastfeeding three articles (51, 57, 68), iron and  
186 folic Acid ( $\geq 100$ ) in one article (53), and tetanus toxoid (53).

187 From the IDs, water and adequate sanitation were used in nine articles (48, 55, 57, 59-64, 68); tuberculosis effective  
188 treatment (13, 48, 59-64) and HIV ART (13, 48, 59-64) each in eight articles, insecticide-treated bed nets in five articles  
189 (51, 57, 59, 63, 64), perinatal care for newborn babies and mothers in two articles (13, 68) and tuberculosis case  
190 detection in one article (48).

191 NCDs tracer indicators were mean fasting blood glucose/ diabetes treatment (13, 48, 49, 59-64) and non-use of tobacco  
192 (48, 57, 59-64, 68) each in nine articles, non-raised blood pressure/hypertension treatment in eight articles (48, 49, 59-  
193 64), cervical cancer screening/treatment in seven articles (13, 49, 56, 59, 63-65), breast cancer screening/ treatment in  
194 four articles (13, 49, 56, 65), and uterine cancer treatment (13), colon and rectum cancer treatment (13), non-overweight  
195 (68), acute lymphoid leukaemia treatment (13), asthma treatment (13), epilepsy treatment (13), appendicitis treatment  
196 (13), paralytic ileus and intestinal obstruction treatment (13), ischemic heart disease treatment (13), stroke treatment (13),  
197 chronic kidney disease treatment (13), chronic obstructive pulmonary disease treatment (13), provision of treatment or  
198 advice on physical activity or diet (42) each in one article.

199 Regarding SCA, health worker density was included in seven articles (14, 59-64); hospital bed density (59-64) and health  
200 security (59-64) each in six articles, access to essential medicine in four articles (14, 59, 63, 64), inpatient admission (52,  
201 65) and utilization of outpatient services (14, 42) each in two articles and maintenance of a stable health state after the  
202 last outpatient visit in one article (42).

203 As to FRP, catastrophic healthcare spending is used in eleven articles (14, 42, 48, 52, 53, 55-57, 62, 65, 68),  
204 impoverishment by out of pocket (OOP) healthcare spending is considered in five articles (48, 55, 57, 62, 68) and poverty  
205 gap due to OOP health spending used in one article (62).

206 Accessibility and affordability (14), as well as curative care and quality of care components (53), were developed as new  
207 tracers each in one article.

## 208 **Barriers/challenges of UHC**

### 209 **Policy level barrier**

210 It is related to financing system (23, 26, 27, 29, 32-34), governance and leadership (22, 23, 29, 33, 36, 37), regulation and  
211 supervision mechanism (33, 34, 36), poverty (27, 34, 40), inequity (27, 32), insurance-related problems (27, 32),  
212 accreditation of facilities (26), narrowness of the benefit package (26), inadequate multi-sector collaborations (29), limited  
213 capacity to UHC policy implementation donor driven vertical programs (29), service preparedness (32), social  
214 infrastructure and social sustainability (23), failures in the expansion/shortage of services, technology and equipment and  
215 poor infrastructure (36, 47).

### 216 **Health sector's level barriers**

217 Human resources shortage (33), deficient training (26, 33), low motivation (33), retention issues (33), skill-mix imbalance  
218 (33), health care quality problem (26, 33, 37), lack of guideline (33), political interference (33), ineffective or inadequate  
219 monitoring and supervision (27, 33), professional recruitment mechanisms (33), lack of attention to marginalized  
220 population (33), health infrastructure (26), inadequate number of health workers (26, 29, 36), service delivery (23),  
221 absence of diagnosis of the priority demands or conflict in setting priority (36, 38), behaviour(34), disease pattern (34),  
222 inadequate health system to early diagnose (47), and delayed reimbursement using prepaid health insurance (47) are  
223 barriers solved at health sector level.

### 224 **Demand-side/ Cross cutting barrier**

225 Sociocultural issues, historical mistrust to insurance prepayment, people perception that health care should be free of  
226 cost, lack of empowerment and information (33), health profile disparities between districts (37), unhealth life style (47),

227 poor health seeking behaviour (47) and poor adherence to medication (47) can be demand sided barriers. Lack of  
228 common understanding on UHC and initiative (22, 33, 38), global movements (23), population health status (23),  
229 coverage (23), social determinants of health (37), emerging of non-communicable diseases (40) and inequities in access  
230 to health services or income (29, 37, 40) are cross-cutting barriers.

## 231 **Discussion**

232 The purpose of this scoping review was to map existing research, identify gaps, and the most researched UHC  
233 dimensions, components and summarized main findings. Many articles were found in the African region and in countries  
234 with middle-income (lower and upper). The majority of the studies employed a quantitative research approach. Palliative  
235 and rehabilitative health care types did not well addressed in UHC research. The dimensions of service and financial  
236 coverage were most frequently studied, followed by inequity and quality of health care services

237 The current evidence found a greater number of articles than a scoping review of African implementation research of UHC  
238 (69). This is because the former was conducted on a single continent and concentrated on UHC research approaches. A  
239 bibliometric analysis, on the other hand, discovered a greater number of available evidence than the current scoping  
240 review (70). This is due to the fact that it includes all available evidence as terminology, title, phrases, or words in policy  
241 documents, commentaries, editorials, and all frequency counts found in databases by the first search without the  
242 conditions of pre-established exclusion criteria. Aside from that, the bibliometric analysis included articles dating back to  
243 1990. UHC is a global agenda that has improved the health of the global population through political support, funding, and  
244 active national and international collaborations (71, 72). As a result, the number of research output is likely to increase  
245 over time, though current evidence shows that comparable numbers of articles are available each year. An earlier  
246 bibliometric analysis discovered an increasing trend in UHC research outputs (70).

247 Many of the studies in this review used a quantitative approach. A prior scoping review conducted in Africa discovered  
248 that qualitative and mixed-methods studies were the commonest method to investigate UHC (16). The former study did  
249 not take into account research on financial protection, UHC effective service and crude coverage, service capacity and  
250 access and HIV/AIDS treatment-related studies. UHC is intended to be quantified numerically as a summary index to  
251 track the progress of health care performance. Given the nature of UHC, appropriate articles used qualitative methods to  
252 investigate its challenges, opportunities, and success of UHC. Different health systems and policies in low, middle, and  
253 high-income countries may present different barriers and facilitators to attaining UHC (73-75).

254 The current study has revealed that the African region plays a leading role. The number of countries in the European  
255 region and the high-income category is large (76, 77). On the contrary, a substantial amount of research evidence was  
256 produced in middle-income countries. Trend analysis in health policy and systems research discovered an increasing  
257 trend of publications in low-and middle-income countries between 2003 and 2009 (78). This variation could be attributed  
258 to the nature of the health problems and the health policy in place regarding health research. Furthermore, even when  
259 contradictory findings are available, health research budgets and clinical trial infrastructures may determine health  
260 research activities in each continent. Evidence from a review finding of health science research in Africa indicated that  
261 nations with significant donor investment in health research may not necessarily produce a large number of health  
262 researchers (79). Articles were available across WHO regions that were comparable to African studies. UHC is a global  
263 strategy with agreed-upon tracers that aid in monitoring the global process towards universal access to health care. The  
264 available global reference framework for monitoring UHC is appropriate for conducting research at the multicounty level  
265 within a global context.

266 In 2019, the burden of NCDs was 63.8 percent worldwide, followed by CDs, RMNC, and nutritional disease (26.4  
267 percent) (80). In the summary measure of the UHC index, RMNC was the most frequently studied component, followed by

268 NCDs. This could be because many of the articles in the current review came from Africa and lower-and middle-income  
269 countries. In these countries, maternal and child morbidity and mortality are extremely high (81), making RMNC more  
270 likely to be investigated in UHC contexts. Similarly, a scoping review study on maternal, neonatal, and child health  
271 realized a high rate of publication in the most recent period (82). IDs and SCA had a lower frequency in the overall  
272 estimation of the UHC index based on the current review.

273 This review provides an answer to the question of how much UHC is universal and how much UHC is covered in the  
274 current health systems and policy research. UHC tracer indicators are focused on health promotion, disease prevention,  
275 treatment, palliative, and rehabilitative health care services at the individual and population level. Promotion aspects of  
276 health services were more frequently investigated in the current review. This could be due to the fact that those articles on  
277 the overall UHC that were non-specific to either component of UHC were more likely to be classified as belonging to  
278 health promotion. A single study was conducted on disabled population that was more likely to be close to palliative care  
279 health care services, though it was not in accordance with palliative care assessment protocol. Palliative care focuses on  
280 the physical, social, psychological, spiritual, and other issues confronting adults and children living with and dying from  
281 life-limiting conditions, as well as their families (83). Assessment of pain and symptom management, functional status,  
282 psychosocial care, caregiver assessment, and quality of life are all part of a palliative care measurement and evaluation  
283 tool (84). The Worldwide Hospice Palliative Care Alliance recommended conducting research to improve palliative care  
284 coverage (85) in order to ensure equitable health care access for the more than 40 million people worldwide who require  
285 palliative care each year (86). However, UHC effective service coverage measurement indicators are appropriate only for  
286 assessing the promotion, prevention and treatment aspects of health care, even though all health care services are  
287 theoretically expected to be covered globally (13).

288 In terms of dimensions, coverage was more commonly studied. The framework for monitoring and tracking was initially  
289 established for effective service coverage and FRP. UHC's service coverage is a collection of many individual disease  
290 indicators that are used to assess the performance of the health care system as a whole. Therefore, it is not surprising  
291 that many articles have been written about the coverage dimension. Aside from the usual trend of calculating the service  
292 coverage summary index, a few articles calculated UHC by combining effective service coverage and FRP indicators.  
293 Although the effective coverage dimension expresses quality, intervention need and use together, there is clear  
294 assurance that it would address and measured comprehensively. In the current review, a few studies assessed the quality  
295 of care as a dimension of UHC; a single study developed a distinct quality of care measurement that was integrated into  
296 the UHC matrix because these services are theoretically integrated. Effective service coverage is predicated on the  
297 assumption that those in need receive high-quality health care services. However, having a high UHC index value does  
298 not imply that high-quality care is provided for each specific disease. For example in countries with high UHC index value  
299 (87), quality medical care services were found to be inadequate for patients with chronic diseases (88). Quality of health  
300 care can also be assessed using structure, process, and outcome indicators in the healthcare system (89). Therefore,  
301 generally, measuring the quality of care for specific diseases is helpful for stakeholders, clinicians, and health  
302 policymakers working on specific health problems (90).

303 The UHC summary index is useful for comparing the national and subnational progress of UHC. Inequity in UHC service  
304 coverage was reported in articles, with disparity across countries and geographical demarcation within a country. One of  
305 UHC's primary functions is to promote health equity (91), and equity has been identified as a measurable component of  
306 UHC (92). It is linked to social determinants that should be monitored over time, across or within different settings and  
307 populations (93). Nonetheless, none of the UHC articles examined health disparities based on age, gender, race or  
308 ethnicity, residence, education level, or socioeconomic status. Similarly, range, absolute or relative difference,  
309 concentration index, and Gini coefficient were not used as equity measurement techniques in the current review.

## 310 **Strength and Limitation**

311 This is the first scoping review of UHC, and it is accompanied by the most recent articles. Our review identified UHC  
312 literature in each category of health service type.

313 In terms of limitations, this review included only articles conducted in English; articles conducted in other languages may  
314 have been missed, and geographical representation of UHC articles may have been over or underestimated for regions.  
315 When considering UHC dimensions, they may have a different level of research articles discovered if another mapping  
316 review is done for specific disease types.

## 317 **Conclusions**

318 More research is needed in settings where UHC has not been thoroughly investigated qualitatively and using a mixed-  
319 method approach, in addition to continuing quantitative monitoring and tracking of UHC status. According to the current  
320 review, future research should focus on the quality and equity of UHC health care services. Given that the distinct nature  
321 of UHC tracers may limit UHC's articles on health promotion, prevention, and treatment aspects, palliative and  
322 rehabilitative care services require attention in the future research environment. For specific health problems, a scoping  
323 review may be required to identify research gaps in the dimension of UHC for that specific disease.

## 324 **Abbreviations**

325 ANC-Antenatal Care; AR-Antiretroviral Therapy; CHI-Catastrophic Health Expenditure; FP-Family Planning; GBD2019-  
326 Global Burden Disease 2019; HIV/AIDS-Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome; IDs-  
327 Infectious diseases; NCDs-Non-communicable diseases; RMNC-Reproductive, Maternal, Neonatal and Child; SCA-  
328 Service Capacity and Access; SDGs-Sustainable Development Goals; UN-United Nations; UHC-Universal Health  
329 Coverage; WB-World Bank; WHO-World Health Organization

330 **Acknowledgements:** Not applicable

331 **Authors' contributions:** AE: conceptualization, identify research questions, built search strategy, literature searching,  
332 write manuscript draft and final report; YA: conceptualization, identify research questions, built search strategy,  
333 supervision and approve final manuscript; CFG: conceptualization, supervision approve final manuscript; FA: supervision  
334 and approve final manuscript.

335 **Competing interest:** Authors declared no conflict of interest

336 **Funding:** No fund receive to conduct this review

## 337 **References**

- 338 1. Abihiro GA, De Allegri M. Universal health coverage from multiple perspectives: a synthesis of conceptual literature  
339 and global debates. *Bmc International Health and Human Rights*. 2015;15.
- 340 2. Thomson S, Cylus J, Evetovits T, editors. How you measure matters: monitoring financial protection to generate  
341 policy-relevant evidence for universal health coverage—lessons from Europe. Organized session 9 July 2017. IHEA 12th  
342 World Congress in Health Economics; 2017.
- 343 3. Tangcharoensathien V, Mills A, Palu T. Accelerating health equity: the key role of universal health coverage in the  
344 Sustainable Development Goals. *Bmc Medicine*. 2015;13.
- 345 4. UNDP. Universal health coverage for sustainable development - issue brief 2019 [cited 2021 October 2]. Available  
346 from: <https://www.undp.org/publications/universal-health-coverage-sustainable-development-issue-brief>.
- 347 5. World Health Organization. Declaration of alma-ata. World Health Organization. Regional Office for Europe, 1978.
- 348 6. United Nations. Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 25 September 2015 2015 [cited 2021 23  
349 October]. Available from: <https://undocs.org/A/RES/70/1>.
- 350 7. uhc 2030. State of commitment to universal health coverage: synthesis, 2020 2020 [cited 2021 October 2].  
351 Available from: <https://www.uhc2030.org/blog-news-events/uhc2030-news/state-of-commitment-to-universal-health-coverage-synthesis-2020-555434/>.
- 352 8. United Nations. Universal Health Coverage: Moving Together to Build a Healthier World New York 2019 [cited 2021  
353 24 October]. Available from: <https://www.un.org/pga/73/event/universal-health-coverage/>.

9. World Health Organization. The world health report: health systems financing: the path to universal coverage: executive summary. World Health Organization, 2010.
10. World Health Organization. Research for universal health coverage: World health report 2013 2013 [cited 2021 15 August]. Available from: <https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240690837>.
11. Kim JY. Speech by World Bank Group President Jim Yong Kim at the Government of Japan-World Bank Conference on universal health coverage. The World Bank, 2013.
12. World Health Organization. Universal health coverage (UHC) 2021, April 1. Available from: [https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/universal-health-coverage-\(uhc\)](https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/universal-health-coverage-(uhc)).
13. Lozano R, Fullman N, Mumford JE, Knight M, Barthelemy CM, Abbafati C, et al. Measuring universal health coverage based on an index of effective coverage of health services in 204 countries and territories, 1990–2019: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2019. *The Lancet*. 2020;396(10258):1250-84.
14. Liu X, Wang Z, Zhang H, Meng Q. Measuring and evaluating progress towards Universal Health Coverage in China. *Journal of global health*. 2021;11.
15. Daudt HM, van Mossel C, Scott SJ. Enhancing the scoping study methodology: a large, inter-professional team's experience with Arksey and O'Malley's framework. *BMC medical research methodology*. 2013;13(1):1-9.
16. Nnaji CA. Implementation research approaches to promoting universal health coverage in Africa: a scoping review. *The International journal of health planning and management*. 2021;21(1):414.
17. Moreno-Betancur M, Latouche A, Menvielle G, Kunst AE, Rey G. Relative index of inequality and slope index of inequality: a structured regression framework for estimation. *Epidemiology*. 2015;26(4):518-27.
18. Arksey H, O'Malley L. Scoping studies: towards a methodological framework. *International journal of social research methodology*. 2005;8(1):19-32.
19. Levac D, Colquhoun H, O'Brien KK. Scoping studies: advancing the methodology. *Implementation science*. 2010;5(1):1-9.
20. Peters MDJ, Marnie C, Tricco AC, Pollock D, Munn Z, Alexander L, et al. Updated methodological guidance for the conduct of scoping reviews. *JBIM evidence implementation*. 2021;19(1):3-10.
21. Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, O'Brien KK, Colquhoun H, Levac D, et al. PRISMA Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and Explanation. *Ann Intern Med*. 2018;169(7):467-73.
22. Assan A, Takian A, Aikins M, Akbarisari A. Challenges to achieving universal health coverage through community-based health planning and services delivery approach: a qualitative study in Ghana. *BMJ open*. 2019;9(2):e024845.
23. Derakhshani N, Doshmangir L, Ahmadi A, Fakhri A, Sadeghi-Bazargani H, Gordeev VS. Monitoring process barriers and enablers towards universal health coverage within the sustainable development goals: a systematic review and content analysis. *ClinicoEconomics and Outcomes Research: CEOR*. 2020;12:459.

- 387 24. Eckhardt M, Carljford S, Faresjo T, Crespo-Burgos A, Forsberg BC, Falk M. Universal Health Coverage in  
388 Marginalized Populations: A Qualitative Evaluation of a Health Reform Implementation in Rural Ecuador. *Inquiry-the*  
389 *Journal of Health Care Organization Provision and Financing*. 2019;56.
- 390 25. Mao W, Tang Y, Tran T, Pender M, Khanh PN, Tang S. Advancing universal health coverage in China and  
391 Vietnam: lessons for other countries. *BMC Public Health*. 2020;20(1):1-9.
- 392 26. Okech TC, Lelegwe SL. Analysis of universal health coverage and equity on health care in Kenya. *Global journal of*  
393 *health science*. 2016;8(7):218.
- 394 27. Shan L, Wu Q, Liu C, Li Y, Cui Y, Liang Z, et al. Perceived challenges to achieving universal health coverage: a  
395 cross-sectional survey of social health insurance managers/administrators in China. *BMJ open*. 2017;7(5):e014425.
- 396 28. Singh T, Roy P, Jamir L, Gupta S, Kaur N, Jain D, et al. Assessment of universal healthcare coverage in a district  
397 of North India: a rapid cross-sectional survey using tablet computers. *PLoS One*. 2016;11(6):e0157831.
- 398 29. Tadesse AW, Gurmu KK, Kebede ST, Habtemariam MK. Analyzing efforts to synergize the global health agenda of  
399 universal health coverage, health security and health promotion: a case-study from Ethiopia. *Globalization and Health*.  
400 2021;17(1):1-13.
- 401 30. Umeh CA. Challenges toward achieving universal health coverage in Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, and Tanzania. *The*  
402 *International journal of health planning and management*. 2018;33(4):794-805.
- 403 31. Wu R, Li N, Ercia A. The effects of private health insurance on universal health coverage objectives in China: a  
404 systematic literature review. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*. 2020;17(6):2049.
- 405 32. Agustina R, Dartanto T, Sitompul R, Susiloretni KA, Achadi EL, Taher A, et al. Universal health coverage in  
406 Indonesia: concept, progress, and challenges. *The Lancet*. 2019;393(10166):75-102.
- 407 33. Ayub A, Khan RS, Khan SA, Hussain H, Tabassum A, Shehzad JA, et al. Progress of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa  
408 (Pakistan) towards universal health coverage. *Journal of Ayub Medical College Abbottabad*. 2018;30(3):481-4.
- 409 34. Derakhshani N, Maleki M, Poursaghari H, Azami-Aghdash S. The influential factors for achieving universal health  
410 coverage in Iran: a multimethod study. *BMC health services research*. 2021;21(1):1-13.
- 411 35. Fitriana EN, Probandari AN, Pamungkasari EP, Ardyanto TD, Puspitaningrum RA. The importance of socialization  
412 in achieving universal health coverage: Case study of Jaminan Kesehatan Nasional (JKN) implementation in two different  
413 region in Central Java province. *JKKI: Jurnal Kedokteran dan Kesehatan Indonesia*. 2019;10(2):110-20.
- 414 36. França VHd, Modena CM, Confalonieri UEC. A multiprofessional perspective on the principal barriers to universal  
415 health coverage and universal access to health in extremely poor territories: the contributions of nursing. *Revista Latino-*  
416 *Americana de Enfermagem*. 2016;24.
- 417 37. Fusheini A, Eyles J. Achieving universal health coverage in South Africa through a district health system approach:  
418 conflicting ideologies of health care provision. *BMC Health Services Research*. 2016;16(1):1-11.

- 419 38. Oraro-Lawrence T, Wyss K. Policy levers and priority-setting in universal health coverage: a qualitative analysis of  
420 healthcare financing agenda setting in Kenya. *BMC health services research*. 2020;20(1):1-11.
- 421 39. Suzana M, Walls H, Smith R, Hanefeld J. Achieving universal health coverage in small island states: could  
422 importing health services provide a solution? *BMJ global health*. 2018;3(1):e000612.
- 423 40. Aantjes C, Quinlan T, Bunders J. Towards universal health coverage in Zambia: impediments and opportunities.  
424 *Development in Practice*. 2016;26(3):298-307.
- 425 41. Joarder T, Chaudhury TZ, Mannan I. Universal health coverage in Bangladesh: activities, challenges, and  
426 suggestions. *Advances in Public Health*. 2019;2019.
- 427 42. Goeppel C, Frenz P, Grabenhenrich L, Keil T, Tinnemann P. Assessment of universal health coverage for adults  
428 aged 50 years or older with chronic illness in six middle-income countries. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*.  
429 2016;94(4):276.
- 430 43. Ranjan A, Thiagarajan S, Garg S, Danda D. Progress towards universal health coverage in the context of  
431 rheumatic diseases in India. *International Journal of Rheumatic Diseases*. 2019;22(5):880-9.
- 432 44. Fitzpatrick C, Bangert M, Mbabazi PS, Mikhailov A, Zouré H, Rebollo MP, et al. Monitoring equity in universal  
433 health coverage with essential services for neglected tropical diseases: an analysis of data reported for five diseases in  
434 123 countries over 9 years. *The Lancet Global Health*. 2018;6(9):e980-e8.
- 435 45. Eckhardt M, Santillán D, Faresjö T, Forsberg BC, Falk M. Universal health coverage in rural Ecuador: a cross-  
436 sectional study of perceived emergencies. *Western Journal of Emergency Medicine*. 2018;19(5):889.
- 437 46. Hanlon C, Alem A, Lund C, Hailemariam D, Assefa E, Giorgis TW, et al. Moving towards universal health coverage  
438 for mental disorders in Ethiopia. *International journal of mental health systems*. 2019;13(1):1-16.
- 439 47. Koduah A, Nonvignon J, Colson A, Kurdi A. Health systems, population and patient challenges for achieving  
440 universal health coverage for hypertension in Ghana. 2021;36(9):1451-8.
- 441 48. Barasa E, Nguhiu P, McIntyre D. Measuring progress towards sustainable development goal 3.8 on universal  
442 health coverage in Kenya. *BMJ global health*. 2018;3(3):e000904.
- 443 49. Leslie HH, Doubova SV, Pérez-Cuevas R. Assessing health system performance: effective coverage at the  
444 Mexican Institute of social security. *Health Policy and Planning*. 2019;34(Supplement\_2):ii67-ii76.
- 445 50. Scammell K, Noble DJ, Rasanathan K, O'Connell T, Ahmed AS, Begkoyian G, et al. A landscape analysis of  
446 universal health coverage for mothers and children in South Asia. *BMJ global health*. 2016;1(1):e000017.
- 447 51. Nguhiu PK, Barasa EW, Chuma J. Determining the effective coverage of maternal and child health services in  
448 Kenya, using demographic and health survey data sets: tracking progress towards universal health coverage. *Tropical*  
449 *Medicine & International Health*. 2017;22(4):442-53.
- 450 52. Nikoloski Z, McGuire A, Mossialos E. Evaluation of progress toward universal health coverage in Myanmar: A  
451 national and subnational analysis. *PLoS medicine*. 2021;18(10):e1003811.

452 53. Prinja S, Gupta R, Bahuguna P, Sharma A, Kumar Aggarwal A, Phogat A, et al. A composite indicator to measure  
453 universal health care coverage in India: way forward for post-2015 health system performance monitoring framework.  
454 Health policy and planning. 2017;32(1):43-56.

455 54. Rahman MS, Rahman MM, Gilmour S, Swe KT, Abe SK, Shibuya K. Trends in, and projections of, indicators of  
456 universal health coverage in Bangladesh, 1995-2030: a Bayesian analysis of population-based household data. Lancet  
457 Global Health. 2018;6(1):E84-E94.

458 55. Taniguchi H, Rahman MM, Swe KT, Islam MR, Rahman MS, Parsell N, et al. Equity and determinants in universal  
459 health coverage indicators in Iraq, 2000–2030: a national and subnational study. International journal for equity in health.  
460 2021;20(1):1-10.

461 56. Wagstaff A, Dmytraczenko T, Almeida G, Buisman L, Hoang-Vu Eozenou P, Bredenkamp C, et al. Assessing Latin  
462 America's progress toward achieving universal health coverage. Health Affairs. 2015;34(10):1704-12.

463 57. Zhang C, Rahman MS, Rahman MM, Yawson AE, Shibuya K. Trends and projections of universal health coverage  
464 indicators in Ghana, 1995-2030: A national and subnational study. PloS one. 2019;14(5):e0209126.

465 58. Ranabhat CL, Kim CB, Singh A, Acharya D, Pathak K, Sharma B, et al. Challenges and opportunities towards the  
466 road of universal health coverage (UHC) in Nepal: a systematic review. Arch Public Health. 2019;77:5.

467 59. Ranabhat CL, Jakovljevic M, Dhimal M, Kim C-B. Structural factors responsible for universal health coverage in  
468 low-and middle-income countries: results from 118 countries. Frontiers in public health. 2020:414.

469 60. Reid M, Gupta R, Roberts G, Goosby E, Wesson P. Achieving Universal Health Coverage (UHC): Dominance  
470 analysis across 183 countries highlights importance of strengthening health workforce. PloS one. 2020;15(3):e0229666.

471 61. Reid M, Roberts G, Goosby E, Wesson P. Monitoring Universal Health Coverage (UHC) in high Tuberculosis  
472 burden countries: Tuberculosis mortality an important tracer of UHC service coverage. PLoS One. 2019;14(10):e0223559.

473 62. Tao W, Zeng Z, Dang H, Li P, Chuong L, Yue D, et al. Towards universal health coverage: achievements and  
474 challenges of 10 years of healthcare reform in China. BMJ global health. 2020;5(3):e002087.

475 63. Hogan DR, Stevens GA, Hosseinpoor AR, Boerma T. Monitoring universal health coverage within the Sustainable  
476 Development Goals: development and baseline data for an index of essential health services. The Lancet Global Health.  
477 2018;6(2):e152-e68.

478 64. Folayan MO, Tantawi ME, Virtanen JI, Feldens CA, Rashwan M, Kemoli AM, et al. An ecological study on the  
479 association between universal health service coverage index, health expenditures, and early childhood caries. BMC oral  
480 health. 2021;21(1):1-7.

481 65. Wagstaff A, Neelsen S. A comprehensive assessment of universal health coverage in 111 countries: a  
482 retrospective observational study. The Lancet Global Health. 2020;8(1):e39-e49.

483 66. Liu XY, Wang ZY, Zhang H, Meng QY. Measuring and evaluating progress towards Universal Health Coverage in  
484 China. Journal of global health. 2021;11.

485 67. Trani JF, Kumar P, Ballard E, Chandola T. Assessment of progress towards universal health coverage for people  
 486 with disabilities in Afghanistan: a multilevel analysis of repeated cross-sectional surveys. *Lancet Global Health*.  
 487 2017;5(8):E828-E37.

488 68. Rahman MS, Rahman MM, Gilmour S, Swe KT, Abe SK, Shibuya K. Trends in, and projections of, indicators of  
 489 universal health coverage in Bangladesh, 1995–2030: a Bayesian analysis of population-based household data. *The*  
 490 *Lancet Global Health*. 2018;6(1):e84-e94.

491 69. Makadzange K, Radebe Z, Maseko N, Lukhele V, Masuku S, Fakudze G, et al. Implementation of Urban Health  
 492 Equity Assessment and Response Tool: a Case of Matsapha, Swaziland. *Journal of urban health : bulletin of the New*  
 493 *York Academy of Medicine*. 2018;95(5):672-81.

494 70. Ghanbari MK, Behzadifar M, Doshmangir L, Martini M, Bakhtiari A, Alikhani M, et al. Mapping research trends of  
 495 universal health coverage from 1990 to 2019: Bibliometric analysis. *JMIR Public Health and Surveillance*.  
 496 2021;7(1):e24569.

497 71. Hammonds R, Ooms G, Mulumba M, Maleche A. UHC2030's Contributions to Global Health Governance that  
 498 Advance the Right to Health Care: A Preliminary Assessment. *Health and Human Rights*. 2019;21(2):235.

499 72. Ssengooba F, Ssenyonjo A, Rutebemberwa E, Musila T, Namusoke Kiwanuka S, Kemari E, et al. Research for  
 500 universal health coverage: setting priorities for policy and systems research in Uganda. *Global health action*.  
 501 2021;14(1):1956752.

502 73. Saif-Ur-Rahman K, Mamun R, Nowrin I, Hossain S, Islam K, Rumman T, et al. Primary healthcare policy and  
 503 governance in low-income and middle-income countries: an evidence gap map. *BMJ global health*. 2019;4(Suppl  
 504 8):e001453.

505 74. Mills A. Health care systems in low-and middle-income countries. *New England Journal of Medicine*.  
 506 2014;370(6):552-7.

507 75. Polin K, Hjortland M, Maresso A, van Ginneken E, Busse R, Quentin W. “Top-Three” health reforms in 31 high-  
 508 income countries in 2018 and 2019: an expert informed overview. *Health Policy*. 2021;125(7):815-32.

509 76. Ajayi AI, Akpan W. Determinants of condom use among parous women in North Central and South Western  
 510 Nigeria: a cross-sectional survey. *BMC research notes*. 2018;11(1):1-6.

511 77. World Health Organization. Countries 2022 [cited 2022 03]. Available from: <https://www.who.int/countries>.

512 78. Adam T, Ahmad S, Bigdeli M, Ghaffar A, Røttingen J-A. Trends in health policy and systems research over the  
 513 past decade: still too little capacity in low-income countries. *PloS one*. 2011;6(11):e27263.

514 79. Wenham C, Wouters O, Jones C, Juma PA, Mijumbi-Deve RM, Sobngwi-Tambekou JL, et al. Measuring health  
 515 science research and development in Africa: mapping the available data. *Health Research Policy and Systems*.  
 516 2021;19(1):1-13.

517 80. Furuoka F, Hoque MZ. Determinants of antiretroviral therapy coverage in Sub-Saharan Africa. *PeerJ*.  
518 2015;3:e1496.

519 81. Paulson KR, Kamath AM, Alam T, Bienhoff K, Abady GG, Abbas J, et al. Global, regional, and national progress  
520 towards Sustainable Development Goal 3.2 for neonatal and child health: all-cause and cause-specific mortality findings  
521 from the Global Burden of Disease Study 2019. *The Lancet*. 2021;398(10303):870-905.

522 82. Chan GJ, Daniel J, Getnet M, Kennedy M, Olowojesiku R, Hunegnaw BM, et al. Gaps in maternal, newborn, and  
523 child health research: a scoping review of 72 years in Ethiopia. *Newborn, and Child Health Research: A Scoping Review*  
524 of. 2021;72.

525 83. World Health Organization. WHO launches global effort to halve medication-related errors in 5 years. Geneva/Bonn  
526 Available online: <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/news/releases/2017/medication-related-errors/en/> (accessed on 08  
527 August 2019). 2017.

528 84. National Palliative Care Research Center. Measurement and Evaluation Tools 2013 [cited 2022 March 03].  
529 Available from: <http://www.npcrc.org/content/25/Measurement-and-Evaluation-Tools.aspx>.

530 85. Morris C. Universal health coverage and palliative care. Do not Leave Those Suffering Behind London: World  
531 Hospice and Palliative Care Alliance. 2014.

532 86. World Health Organization. Palliative care Geneva 5 August 2020 [cited 2021 25 January]. Available from:  
533 <https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/palliative-care>.

534 87. Lozano R, Fullman N, Mumford JE, Knight M, Barthelémy CM, Abbafati C, et al. Measuring universal health  
535 coverage based on an index of effective coverage of health services in 204 countries and territories, 1990–2019: a  
536 systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2019. *The Lancet*. 2020;396(10258):1250-84.

537 88. Adé A, Debroucker F, Delporte L, De Monclin C, Fayet E, Legendre P, et al. Chronic patients' satisfaction and  
538 priorities regarding medical care, information and services and quality of life: a French online patient community survey.  
539 *BMC health services research*. 2020;20(1):1-10.

540 89. Titi-Ofei R, Osei-Afriyie D, Karamagi H. Monitoring Quality of Care in the WHO Africa Region-A study design for  
541 measurement and tracking, towards UHC attainment. *Global health action*. 2021;14(1):1939493.

542 90. Gimeno-García A, Gimeno-García A, Franco-Moreno A, Montero-Hernández C, Montero-Hernández C, Arponen S,  
543 et al. Analysis of adherence to HIV-positive quality of care indicators and their impact on service quality perceptions in  
544 patients: A Spanish cross-sectional study. *Health and Quality of Life Outcomes*. 2020;18(1).

545 91. Tangcharoensathien V, Mills A, Palu T. Accelerating health equity: the key role of universal health coverage in the  
546 Sustainable Development Goals. *BMC medicine*. 2015;13(1):1-5.

547 92. Rodney AM, Hill PS. Achieving equity within universal health coverage: A narrative review of progress and  
548 resources for measuring success. *International Journal for Equity in Health*. 2014;13(1).

549 93. Dover DC, Belon AP. The health equity measurement framework: a comprehensive model to measure social  
 550 inequities in health. International Journal for Equity in Health. 2019;18(1):1-12.

551

552 Figure: PRISMA-ScR flow diagram for articles selection process

553 Supplementary file 1: Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses extension for scoping reviews (PRISMA-ScR) checklist

SECTION TITLE	ITEM	PRISMA-ScR CHECKLIST ITEM	PAGE #
Title	1	Identify the report as a scoping review.	1
<b>ABSTRACT</b>			
Structured summary	2	Provide a structured summary that includes (as applicable): background, objectives, eligibility criteria, sources of evidence, charting methods, results, and conclusions that relate to the review questions and objectives.	2
<b>INTRODUCTION</b>			
Rationale	3	Describe the rationale for the review in the context of what is already known. Explain why the review questions/objectives lend themselves to a scoping review approach.	4 and 5
Objectives	4	Provide an explicit statement of the questions and objectives being addressed with reference to their key elements (e.g., population or participants, concepts, and context) or other relevant key elements used to conceptualize the review questions and/or objectives.	5
<b>METHODS</b>			
Protocol and registration	5	Indicate whether a review protocol exists; state if and where it can be accessed and if available, provide registration information, including the registration number.	6
Eligibility criteria	6	Specify characteristics of the sources of evidence used as eligibility criteria (e.g., years considered, language, and publication status), and provide a rationale.	6
Information sources	7	Describe all information sources in the search (e.g., databases with dates of coverage and contact with authors to identify additional sources), as well as the date the most recent search was executed.	6
Search	8	Present the full electronic search strategy for at least one database, including any limits used, such that it could be repeated.	6
Selection of sources of evidence	9	State the process for selecting sources of evidence (i.e., screening and eligibility) included in the scoping review.	7
Data charting process	10	Describe the methods of charting data from the included sources of evidence (e.g., calibrated forms or forms that have been tested by the team before their use, and whether data charting was done independently or in duplicate) and any processes for obtaining and confirming data	7 and 8

SECTION	ITEM	PRISMA-ScR CHECKLIST ITEM	PAGE #
		from investigators.	
Data items	11	List and define all variables for which data were sought and any assumptions and simplifications made.	7
Critical appraisal of individual sources of evidence	12	If done, provide a rationale for conducting a critical appraisal of included sources of evidence; describe the methods used and how this information was used in any data synthesis (if appropriate).	Not applicable
Synthesis of results	13	Describe the methods of handling and summarizing the data that were charted.	8
<b>RESULTS</b>			
Selection of sources of evidence	14	Give numbers of sources of evidence screened, assessed for eligibility, and included in the review, with reasons for exclusions at each stage, ideally using a flow diagram.	8 (Figure)
Characteristics of sources of evidence	15	For each source of evidence, present characteristics for which data were charted and provide the citations.	8 & 9 (Table)
Critical appraisal within sources of evidence	16	If done, present data on critical appraisal of included sources of evidence (see item 12).	Not applicable
Results of individual sources of evidence	17	For each included source of evidence, present the relevant data that were charted that relate to the review questions and objectives.	10-11
Synthesis of results	18	Summarize and/or present the charting results as they relate to the review questions and objectives.	12-13
<b>DISCUSSION</b>			
Summary of evidence	19	Summarize the main results (including an overview of concepts, themes, and types of evidence available), link to the review questions and objectives, and consider the relevance to key groups.	14-17
Limitations	20	Discuss the limitations of the scoping review process.	18
Conclusions	21	Provide a general interpretation of the results with respect to the review questions and objectives, as well as potential implications and/or next steps.	18
<b>FUNDING</b>			
Funding	22	Describe sources of funding for the included sources of evidence, as well as sources of funding for the scoping review. Describe the role of the funders of the scoping review.	19

554 Source: Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, O'Brien KK, Colquhoun H, Levac D, et al. PRISMA Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and Explanation. Ann Intern Med.  
555 2018;169:467–473. doi: [10.7326/M18-0850](https://doi.org/10.7326/M18-0850).

## 556 Supplementary file 2: Search strategy

Database	Search strategy	Result	Filters applied:
PubMed	(Universal[Title/Abstract] AND (health[Title/Abstract] OR	6,230	From 2015/1/1 -

	"health care"[Title/Abstract] OR healthcare[Title/Abstract] OR "health service"[Title/Abstract])) AND (access[Title/Abstract] OR coverage[Title/Abstract] OR Equity[Title/Abstract] OR disparity[Title/Abstract] OR inequity[Title/Abstract] OR equality[Title/Abstract] OR inequality[Title/Abstract] OR quality[Title/Abstract] OR expenditure [Title/Abstract] OR cost [Title/Abstract]) <i>Filters applied:</i> English, Humans, from 2015/1/1 - 2022/3/3.		2022/3/3
Web of Science	(TI=("Universal" ) AND TI=("health" OR "health care" OR "healthcare" OR "health service") AND TI=(access OR coverage OR equity OR disparity OR inequity OR equality OR inequality OR quality OR expenditure OR cost)) AND (PY==("2021" OR "2020" OR "2019" OR "2018" OR "2016" OR "2015" OR "2017")) AND English (Languages) Not Document type: Letters or Meeting Abstracts or Editorial Materials or Corrections or Book chapters or Books Or Book reviews or Biographical-Items	832	From 2015/1/1 - 2022/3/3

557

558 Supplementary file 3: Articles' main findings

Author	Country	UHC components	Dimensions	Objective	Main findings
--------	---------	----------------	------------	-----------	---------------

Assan A et al 2019	Ghana	Not specific	Non specific	Explore the challenges of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inadequate understanding of concept, political and policy change</li> </ul>
Barasa E et al 2018	Kenya	RMNC, HIV, FRP	Coverage	Develop a summary measure of UHC and track the country's progress	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>UHC weighted using Service (SC) and FRP</li> <li>Increased service SC and reduced percentage of FRP</li> <li>Increased weighted summary measure of UHC</li> </ul>
Derakhshani N et al 2021	Iran	Not specific	Non specific	Identify the influential factors of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Financing, payment system, organization, regulation and supervision , behavior, and Others</li> </ul>
Eckhardt M et al 2019	Ecuador	Not specific	Non specific	Explore the perceived effects of health reform on UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The effects of the reform were perceived as positive and the reform has improved rural primary health care services</li> </ul>
Hogan DR et al 2017	183 countries	RMNC, CD, NCD, SCA	Coverage and equity	Presents methods and baseline results for UHC index	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Service coverage varies widely between countries, highest in East Asia and Northern America and Europe, lowest in Sub-Saharan Africa followed by Southern Asia.</li> <li>Coverage of essential services has increased.</li> </ul>
Hanlon C et al 2019	Ethiopia	NCDs	Financial protection	Propose strategies to achieve UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Expansion of public health insurance, leveraging resources from high-priority SDG-related programmes and implementing task-shared care</li> </ul>
Koduah A et al 2021	Ghana	NCDs	Non specific	Explore challenges of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Population, patient, and health system-related factors</li> </ul>
Leslie HH et al 2019	Mexico	RMNC and NCDs	Coverage and equity	Estimate effective coverage and its regional inequalities and to identify the challenges in generating estimates of health system performance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Effective coverage level varied between disease; low for childhood diarrhoea to a high for newborn care.</li> <li>Inequality in effective coverage existed between states.</li> <li>Effective SC of these six conditions was moderate (49%)</li> </ul>
Liu X et al 2021	China	UHC new version	Coverage and financial protection	Develop a Chinese version of UHC and progress	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Indices of accessibility and affordability developed as new version</li> <li>Absolute accessibility had the most significant improvement, and the index of relative accessibility decreased.</li> </ul>

					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The index of absolute affordability fluctuated and relative affordability increased.</li> </ul>
Mao W et al 2020	China & Veitnam	Not specific	Coverage and equity	Different pathways to achieve UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>China by strong political and financial subsidies, UHC varied across regions and schemes.</li> <li>Vietnam by prioritizing the poor and the near-poor, approaching more equitable manner</li> </ul>
GBD 2019 Universal Health Coverage Collaborators 2020	204 countries	RMNC, CDs and NCDs	Coverage and equity	Assess UHC effective coverage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Globally, performance on the UHC effective coverage index improved, yet disparity between countries, higher in Japan and Iceland to lower Somalia and the Central African Republic.</li> </ul>
Okech TC et al 2016	Kenya	Not specific	Non specific	Review initiatives of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Initiatives: commitment towards UHC</li> <li>Challenges: minimal solidarity in health care financing, cases of dysfunctionality of health care system, minimal opportunities for continuous medical training, quality concerns in terms of stock-outs of drugs and other medical supplies, dilapidated health infrastructure and inadequate number of health workers.</li> </ul>
Ranabhat CL et al 2020	118 countries	RMNC, CDs, NCDs and SCA	Coverage	Explore basic structural factors of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Government health expenditure, governance index, stability index, the SDI index, and GNI per capita have positive impact on UHC</li> <li>Populations below poverty line negatively affect UHC index</li> </ul>
Ranabhat CL et al 2019	Nepal	RMNC, CDs and NCDs	Non-specific	Explore challenges and opportunities of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Opportunities: institutional provision, global support, progress on the health insurance act, decentralization of health service, increasing service coverage, political commitment, a sense of national priority and international support</li> <li>Challenges: existing volunteer types of health insurance, misleading role of trade unions and high proportion of population</li> </ul>
Reid M et al 2020	183 countries	RMNC, CDs, NCDs and SCA	Coverage	Determine useful tracers of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Health work force density ranked first, provision of basic sanitation and access to clean water ranked second, and provision of basic antenatal</li> </ul>

					<p>services ranked third.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>World Bank income criteria, health work force density ranked first in Lower Middle Income countries and third in Upper Middle Income-Countries</li> </ul>
Reid M et al 2019	183 countries	RMNC, CDs, NCDs and SCA	Coverage	Evaluate the extent to which TB incidence and mortality explain the variability in UHC service coverage scores	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TB incidence rate and TB mortality rate were negatively correlated, with UHC SCI score</li> <li>TB incidence rates explained 45% and TB mortality rate explained 55% of variability</li> <li>TB coverage ranked ninth overall, third in low income countries and less important in high income countries</li> </ul>
Scammell K et al 2016	8 countries	RMNC	Quality and financial protection	A landscape analysis of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Government expenditure does not align with political aspirations.</li> <li>Quality of care is often low and the poorest fare worst</li> </ul>
Shan L et al 2017	China	Not specific	Non specific	Determine the performance of the health insurance system and identify challenges of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>About 45% of the respondents believed that there is a long way achieve UHC</li> <li>Challenges: financial protection, healthcare inequity, poor portability and ineffective supervision and administration of funds</li> </ul>
Singh T et al 2016	India	Not specific	Financial protection	Ascertain health seeking behavior and out-of-pocket health expenditures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Nearly 14.2% of the household expenditure</li> <li>Out-of-pocket expenditure was mostly due to medicines followed by diagnostic and laboratory tests.</li> <li>Catastrophic expenditures higher in the poorest</li> </ul>
Tadesse AW et al 2021	Ethiopia	Not specific	Non specific	Document Ethiopia's efforts to align UHC, health security (HS) and health promotion and their implementation within its health system	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Challenges: fragmentation of health system primarily manifested as inequities in access to health services, low health workforce and limited capacity to implementation guidelines.</li> <li>Donor driven vertical programs, multiple modalities of health financing, and inadequate multisectoral collaborations were key features of fragmentation</li> </ul>

Tao W et al 2020	China	RMNC, CDs, NCDs and SPA	Quality and financial protection	Analyzing the overview of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Gaps in service quality and a requirement for ongoing strengthening of financial protections.</li> <li>Challenges: fragmented and inequitable health delivery system, and the increasing demand for high- quality and value- based service delivery</li> </ul>
Umeh CA 2018	Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria and Tanzania	Not specific	Non specific	Review the challenges of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Challenges: large percentage of people under poverty and unable to pay premiums, large informal sector whose members are mostly uninsured, high dropout rate from insurance schemes, poorly funded primary health care system, and fragmented health insurance fund pool</li> </ul>
Wu R et al 2020	China	Not specific	Coverage and financial protection	Impacts of private health insurance on expanding coverage, increasing access to healthcare, and financial protection	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Private insurance users lesser in utilization of healthcare services</li> <li>No evidence that being member of private insurance ensured financial protection</li> </ul>
Agustina 2019	Indonesia	Not specific	Non specific	Describes the innovative UHC initiative	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Meeting national health system requirements and decentralized at district level</li> <li>Challenges: high stunted growth in children and high maternal and neonatal deaths</li> </ul>
Ayub A et al 2018	Pakistan	Not specific	Coverage	Analyze “Sehat Sahulat Program towards UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Considers half of poor population</li> <li>Covers all secondary and limited tertiary services</li> <li>Services delivered through a mix of public-private providers</li> </ul>
Derakhshani N et al 2020	low- and middle-income counties	Not specific	Non specific	Identify potential process barriers and enablers of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Factors: social infrastructure and social sustainability, financial and economic infrastructures, population health status, service delivery, coverage, stewardship/governance, and global movements</li> </ul>
Fitriana EN et al 2019	Indonesia	Not specific	Non specific	Describe the importance of “Jaminan Kesehatan Nasional Policy Socialization” towards UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Perception about the programme differ between community and the government</li> <li>The government said that they had conducted effective socialization</li> </ul>

					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The community said that the information provided has not been effective and have no adequate information about the programme</li> </ul>
Folayan MO et al 2021	83 countries	RMNC, CDs, NCDs and SCA	Coverage	Determine the association between UHC, health expenditure and the global prevalence of early childhood caries (ECC)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No association between UHC service coverage index and ECC</li> </ul>
França VH et al 2016	Brazil	Not specific	Non specific	Investigate the knowledge of managers and health professionals, social workers and education professionals regarding the principal barriers of UHC	Barriers: failures in the expansion and strengthening of the services, absence of diagnosis of the priority demands, shortage of technology, equipment, and material and human resources, poor local infrastructure, and actions with low resolute power and absence of interdepartmental policies
Fusheini A 2016	South Africa	Not specific	Non specific	Explore the opportunities and challenges of UHC	<p>Opportunity: Progress on toward UHC reform, emphasis on districts and positive discrimination to narrow health inequities</p> <p>Challenges: disparities across districts in relation to health profiles, health delivery performance, district management capacity, income levels, non-compliance with quality standards</p>
Goepple C et al 2016	China, Ghana, India, Mexico, the Russian Federation and South Africa	NCDs and FRP	Coverage, equity and financial protection	Assess universal health coverage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The weighted proportion access to basic chronic care varied between countries</li> <li>Disadvantaged poor people, except in South Africa where primary health care is free to all.</li> <li>Catastrophic out-of-pocket expenditure varied between countries lowest in China and highest in in Ghana, common in the poorest individuals</li> <li>Health insurance increased access to care, but unable to prevent financial hardship</li> </ul>
Joarder T et al 2019	Bangladesh	Not specific	Non specific	Explores the existing health policy environment, current activities and challenges of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Policy: comprehensive set of policies for UHC</li> <li>Activities: Roll out of the essential package of health services for all, expansion of access to primary health care services, and the piloting of health insurance</li> </ul>

					<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Barriers: rigid public financing structure dating from the colonial era, human resources, political interference, monitoring, and supervision, sociocultural disinclination, historical mistrust, and lack of empowerment</li> </ul>
Nguhiu PK et al 2017	Kenya	RMNC and CDs	Coverage and equity	Assess the extent to which the health system provides effective and equitable health services towards universal health coverage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>SC has increased, but difference between diseases</li> <li>SC disparity between income status reduced except maternal health services</li> </ul>
Nikoloski Z et al 2021	Myanmar	RMNC and SPA	Coverage, equity and financial protection	Evaluation of progress toward universal health coverage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Negative correlation between the UHC index and poverty levels.</li> <li>Service accessibility pro-rich</li> <li>Poor are at a greater risk of suffering financial catastrophe</li> </ul>
Oraro-Lawrence T 2020	Kenya	Not specific	Non specific	Identify similarities and differences of opinion amongst stakeholders on the challenges of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of agreement on stakeholders' interpretation of UHC, contextual values and priorities</li> <li>Most interviewees prioritising an equity-based approach</li> <li>Conflicting between key stakeholders in setting priority</li> </ul>
Prinja S et al 2020	India	RMNC	Coverage, equity and financial protection	Develop a composite indicator to measure UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Preventive and curative services indices is presented; summary index (CUHCI) for UHC varied between regions</li> <li>There was low unmet need for curative care</li> <li>High incurred catastrophic health expenditures, most among the poorest</li> </ul>
Rahman MS et al 2018	Bangladesh	RMNC, CDs and NCDs	Coverage, equity and financial protection	Understand the progress of UHC by 2030	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Part of disease' tracers will reach 80% coverage by 2030, and others could not be achieved.</li> <li>Disparity based on income will continue</li> <li>Financial risk will decrease by 2030, but the wealthiest households would disproportionately face more financial catastrophe</li> </ul>

Taniguchi H et al 2021	Iraq	RMNC	Coverage, equity and financial protection	Examine inequality by 2030 and determinants of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Inequality indices will decrease by 2030</li> <li>• The wide inequalities are projected to remain in DTP3, measles, full immunisations, and antenatal care in 2030.</li> <li>• The pro-rich inequality gap in catastrophic health expenditure will increase</li> <li>• Factors: mothers' higher education and more antenatal care visits increase SC, while higher number of children and elderly population in the households increase risk of catastrophic and impoverishment</li> </ul>
Trani J et al 2017	Afghanistan	NCDs	Coverage and quality	Investigate whether a decade of international investment in the Afghan health system has brought quality health care to this group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Formal education, higher asset level, being employed associated with improved availability of health care</li> <li>• Mean time to reach health-care facility negatively affect perception of health-care availability</li> </ul>
Wagstaff A 2019	111 countries	RMNC, NCDs and SPA	Coverage and financial protection	Assessment of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• UHC index varies (low in low-income countries and high in high-income countries)</li> <li>• Financial protection varied among countries</li> </ul>
Wagstaff A 2015	Latin America countries	RMNC and NCDs	Coverage	Assessing progress towards UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No country has achieved UHC score</li> </ul>
Zhang C et al 2019	Ghana	RMNC, NCDs and CDs	Coverage and equity	Investigates the progress of UHC and its prediction up to 2030	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Improvement in SC and FRP</li> <li>• Inequality will continue by 2030</li> </ul>
Ranjan A et al 2019	India	CDs	Coverage	Measure current situation of UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Unmet health care needs and lack of continuity of care</li> </ul>
Fitzpatrick C et al 2018	123 countries	NTDs	Coverage and equity	Develop neglected tropical diseases (NTD) service coverage index	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NTD index can be used to measure equity in progress towards UHC</li> </ul>
Eckhardt M et al 2018	Ecuador	Emergency care	Financial protection	Healthcare-seeking behavior, determinants and health expenditure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provision of free health services may not sufficient to reach UHC</li> </ul>

Suzana M et al 2018	39 small island developing states	SCA	Coverage	Empirical analysis of the potential impact of importing health services on UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Importing health services helps to achieve UHC</li> </ul>
Aantjes C et al 2016	Zambia	Not specific	Non specific	Assesses successive Zambian governments' efforts to achieve UHC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Restructuring policies emphasised on social determinants of health and health equity</li> <li>Policy and practice need to be extended to include ministries which focus on economic development</li> </ul>

559

Identification

Records identified from:  
Web of Science (n=6,230),  
PubMed (n=832), Google  
scholar (n=21),  
WB Library (n=5),  
WHO Library (n=7), UN  
Digital Library Collections  
(n=13), Google (n=63)  
Total=7,171

Duplicate records  
removed (n = 715)

Screening

Records screened  
(n=6,456)

Records excluded due  
to unrelated topics  
(n =5427)

Articles screened for  
abstract (n =1,029)

Excluded because of  
abstract (n =964)

Articles assessed for  
full-text (n = 65)

Excluded due to full text  
without having reported  
inclusion criteria (n=18)

Included

Studies included in  
review (n =47)