

1 **Analysis of the current state of acupuncture** 2 **clinical trial registration and reporting: for the** 3 **past 9 years**

4 Quanai Zhang^{1¶}, Huijuan Lv^{2¶}, Yun Fu³, Benlu Chen³, Yingying Cai³, Qiwen Zhang^{1*}

6 ¹ Department of Acupuncture and Moxibustion, The Third Affiliated Hospital of
7 Zhejiang Chinese Medical University, Hangzhou, Zhejiang, China

8 ² Department of Acupuncture and Rehabilitation, Wenling Hospital of Traditional
9 Chinese Medicine , Wenling, Zhejiang, China

10 ³ The Third School of Clinical Medicine, Zhejiang Chinese Medical University,
11 Hangzhou, Zhejiang, China

13 * Corresponding author

14 E-mail: 626938768@qq.com

16 ¶These authors contributed equally to this work.

18 **Abstract**

19 **Background:** An increasing number of acupuncture clinical trials are being
20 registered, but the reports of results and data transparency are unclear. This paper aims

21 to analyze and evaluate the current state of registration and reports of acupuncture
22 clinical studies and seek feasible solutions to improve the quality of acupuncture
23 clinical studies, leading to minimizing waste of public resources and effectively
24 providing a reliable evidence-based basis for clinical practice.

25 **Methods:** This paper will focus on the acupuncture clinical trials that met the
26 criteria in relevant studies registered and published during the period between 1 Jan
27 2013 to 31 Dec 2021. The search and registration platforms were the Clinicaltrials.gov
28 and the Chinese Clinical Trial Registry (ChiCTR). The literature search platforms
29 were Web of Science, PubMed, CNKI, WanFang, VIP, and China Biomedical
30 Literature Database (SinoMed).

31 **Results:** A total of 403 trials were included in ChiCTR and 519 trials were included
32 in Clinicaltrials.gov. The overall reporting rate of acupuncture clinical trial results
33 from the two registration centres was 25%. Clinicaltrials.gov reporting rate was
34 12% and that from ChiCTR was 41%.

35 **Conclusion:** The number of acupuncture clinical trial registrations is steadily
36 increasing, but the reporting rate of trial results is relatively low and the transparency
37 of data is not ideal. Due to the fact that the unavailability of the registered trial results
38 caused a waste of research resources and funds, there is a shortage of research in the
39 relevant area. Therefore, first of all, researchers should put more attention on clinical
40 trial reports in acupuncture and respect science; secondly, it is recommended to set up

41 a research progress tracker on registration platforms accessible to the public users,
42 which contributes to the supervision of research projects; at the same time, the journal
43 is suggested that also adjust the evaluation criteria for reporting the negative results to
44 reduce the probability of results bias; most importantly, the government is
45 recommended to optimize the closing review, strengthen the monitoring of core
46 outcome indicators, standardize clinical reports to reduce the waste of public
47 resources.

48 **Introduction**

49 Clinical trial registration means that specific information about a trial needs to be
50 prospectively registered in a web-based publicly accessible database [1]. Since the
51 International Committee of Medical Journal Editors (ICMJE) announced in 2004 that
52 clinical trials must be registered to be considered for publication [2], there has been an
53 increasing emphasis on the regulation of acupuncture clinical trial registration to
54 reduce the duplication of research [3] and to help prevent bias in reporting of results
55 [4,5,6]. The Final Rule [7,8], which came into effect on 18 January 2017, provides
56 further clarity on clinical trial registration and reporting requirements. The timely
57 publication of trial data will facilitate academic communication, provide guidance on
58 clinical practice and promote the development of evidence-based medicine [9].

59 After searching and collecting registered clinical trial literature, it is noticed that
60 some of the clinical trial literature is marked with registration numbers, and some

61 registered trials have not been published or data is unaccessible. A study has
62 evaluated the registration and reporting of clinical trials from the start of the registry
63 to 2013 and the results were not optimistic [10]. To further explore the current state of
64 the number of registered clinical trials on acupuncture and their reporting in recent
65 years, this study intends to dig deeper into the clinical trials related to acupuncture
66 registered from 2013 to 2021, in order to discover the problems and seek possible
67 solutions to improve the quality of clinical research.

68 **Methods**

69 **Search strategies** Key terms, such as "needle" and "acupuncture" are
70 searched in Chinese Clinical Trial Registry platform[11]. We select "Advanced
71 Search" with the search term "acupuncture" in Clinicaltrials.gov[12]. The search
72 period was set from January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2021, and the results of the
73 search were summarized for clinical trials related to acupuncture that met the criteria.
74 The publications were also searched on the Web of Science, PubMed, CNKI,
75 WanFang, VIP, and China Biomedical Literature Database, in English and Chinese
76 only.

77 **Inclusion criteria** All clinical trials related to acupuncture (including
78 electroacupuncture) registered between 1 January 2013 and 31 December 2021.

79 **Exclusion criteria** Duplicate registered clinical trials.

80 **Statistical analysis** After training three researchers responsible for the

81 literature search (Benlu Chen, Yun Fu and Yingying Cai), data from the registered
82 trials were extracted and summarised through an EXCEL sheet. Reporting was based
83 on the above databases for subject terms, publication date, author, author affiliation,
84 registration number, subject number, etc., and articles with published trial results were
85 considered as results publication. If the publication is in the type of protocol or review,
86 it is considered as other publication. For the extraction and searching process, if there
87 is disagreement among three researchers, firstly, three parties should negotiate to
88 solve the problem. If the agreement is not reached after the negotiation, then we need
89 to seek help from experienced people or relevant experts.

90 **Results**

91 The results of the search are shown in Fig 1. The initial ChiCTR search of 1637
92 registered studies ultimately included 403 relevant clinical trials, of which 166 trials
93 whose results have now been published. Clinicaltrials.gov's initial search of 698
94 registered trials ultimately included 519 trials, of which 62 trials whose results have
95 now been published. The results of the two centres are listed separately as there are
96 differences in reporting and implementation of results and focuses on different issues.
97 The state of trial registration and reporting is shown in Table 1.

98 **Fig 1. Flow chart of search**

99 **Table 1 Trial registration and reporting state**

NC(items)		PA(items)			ND(items)			Status of trial with no published results and transparent							
E	T	C	E	T	C	E	T	ActiveComp , not leted recruiti ng	Not yet recrui ting	Unkn own	Termi nated	With draw n	Enrolling by invitation	Suspe nded	
4	15	3	1	4	0	0	0	4	0	0	6	1	0	0	0
13	23	3	0	3	0	2	2	14	0	1	10	2	3	0	0
11	33	2	1	3	0	1	1	17	0	0	16	1	2	0	0
6	22	9	0	9	0	4	4	11	0	7	14	2	0	0	0
7	37	4	1	5	0	3	3	10	0	7	17	2	0	0	0
7	32	2	3	5	0	1	1	18	1	7	7	1	0	0	0
4	24	4	2	6	0	15	15	10	8	34	4	2	1	3	1
0	3	1	1	2	0	24	24	7	11	20	0	0	0	3	1
0	0	0	1	1	0	45	45	11	16	32	0	1	1	0	0
52	189	28	10	38	0	95	95	102	36	108	74	12	7	6	2
84	83	8	16	17	0	18	18	20	7	21	14	2	1	1	0.39

NP(items)			MRN (items)			OP(items)			NA			DD(items)			PNDA			
C	E	T	C	E	T	C	E	T	C	E	T	C	E	T	C	E	T	
14	5	19	6	5	11	3	8	11	25	20	45	0	6	6	14	4	18	11
13	13	26	3	13	16	1	8	9	18	24	42	0	7	7	13	12	25	10
24	12	36	17	12	29	3	11	14	49	25	74	3	10	13	21	9	30	22
25	6	31	7	6	13	3	13	16	38	22	60	3	7	10	22	5	27	16
34	8	42	20	8	28	2	11	13	54	29	83	1	0	1	33	8	41	30
27	10	37	18	10	28	11	7	18	51	18	69	2	5	7	25	9	34	25
24	6	30	12	6	18	5	4	9	37	11	48	4	4	8	20	5	25	20
4	1	5	1	1	2	0	6	6	6	7	13	2	1	3	2	1	3	3
1	1	2	0	1	1	1	1	2	1	4	5	0	1	1	1	1	2	0
166	62	228	84	62	146	29	69	98	279	160	439	15	41	56	151	54	205	137
41	12	25	21	12	16	7	13	11	/	/	/	4	8	6	91	87	90	83

Year	NR(items)		
	C	E	T
2013	22	29	51
2014	24	59	83
2015	42	67	109
2016	41	58	99
2017	70	55	125
2018	77	57	134
2019	68	79	147
2020	31	51	82
2021	28	64	92
T	403	519	922
P (%)	44	56	/

100 Provided are abbreviations: Number of Registrations(NR), ChiCTR (C),
 101 Clinicaltrials.gov(E), Total(T), Number of Publications(NP), Mark the Registration
 102 Number(MRN), Other Publications(OP), Number of Articles(NA), Data
 103 Downloadable(DD), Published No Data Available(PNDA), Normal Completion(NC),
 104 Published in Advance(PA), Not yet Due(ND), Percentage(P).

105 **1. Number of acupuncture clinical trial registrations**

106 2014 witnessed the most significant increase in registrations of Clinicaltrials.gov.
 107 2017 witnessed the most significant increase in registrations of ChiCTR and 2020
 108 witnessed the felling.

109 **2. Results publication rate**

110 The total results reporting rate for acupuncture clinical trial articles in both
 111 registries was 25%. Clinicaltrials.gov reporting rate was 12% for results, same as
 112 those reports with registration numbers marked. Other types of publication accounted
 113 for 13%. ChiCTR reporting rate was 41% for results, with 21% for reporting with
 114 registration numbers clearly marked, and 7% for other types of publication.

115 **3. Publication timeline**

116 The majority of trials with published results were published after completion of the
117 trial, accounting for 83%. Clinicaltrials.gov accounted for 84% of the trials registered;
118 ChiCTR accounted for 83%.

119 Only 17% of the trials were published early. Of the unpublished trials, only 18%
120 are in progress before the due date, while the rest were unpublished on due date.

121 **4. Results data availability**

122 Only a small proportion of trials were available on the registry website. A total of 6%
123 is available from both registries; 8% is available from Clinicaltrials.gov; and 4% is
124 available from ChiCTR. Data were not publicly available for 90% of the published
125 trials. Clinicaltrials.gov was not publicly available for 87% and ChiCTR was available
126 for 91%.

127 **5. Study status of unpublished trials**

128 Only the NIH clinical registry platform has records on the status of studies, of
129 which the largest number are recruiting, completed and unknown details, respectively
130 108, 102 as well as 74. A small number of trials were discontinued and suspended, 12
131 and 2, respectively.

132 **Discussion**

133 **1.Registration trends**

134 The number of acupuncture clinical trial registrations in both registries has steadily

135 increased year by year. At the beginning of 2017, The fact that the number of ChiCTR
136 registrations are significantly higher than the previous number, and even higher than
137 Clinicaltrials.gov, is probably related to the application to WHO ICTR made by
138 Clinicaltrials.gov in the US in 2017 and which is approved- local applications for
139 registration when there is a WHO ICTR-accredited Level 1 registry where the trial is
140 conducted [13]. There is a significant drop in ChiCTR registrations in 2020, likely due
141 to the impact of the COVID-19 and the large amount of medical resources invested in
142 China, but this does not affect the future trend of steady growth in acupuncture
143 clinical trial registrations. Currently, acupuncture trials are in a period of modest
144 growth, with no peak growth performance. Therefore, emphasis should be placed on
145 clinical innovation and talent development in acupuncture, and researchers need to
146 broaden the disease spectrum of acupuncture to better promote the development of
147 acupuncture.

148 **2. Reporting situation**

149 Concerning the reporting of trials, it is clear that the reporting rates of results from
150 acupuncture trials registered at both centres are low, and ChiCTR has a significantly
151 higher rate of reporting results than Clinicaltrials.gov does. This may be related to the
152 Chengdu Declaration published in April 2006, which announced the implementation
153 of priority publication by ChiCTRPC member journals on a case-by-case basis [14].
154 There is no pattern in the number of trials published in terms of year due to a small

155 number of publications. The low reporting rate is not only due to non-reporting by
156 investigators, but also to the following possibilities: for example, Clinicaltrials.gov
157 has multi-national investigator registrations, and there is a possibility that having
158 papers published on local journals or platforms may lead to restricted access; for trials
159 registered at ChiCTR, during the search process, some articles were found to be
160 similar to the registered content but without the registration number or ethics number
161 to confirm. In addition, it is possible that the low reporting rate is related to outcome
162 reporting bias [15,16,17], and studies demonstrated that publication bias is a problem
163 that still needs to be addressed [18].

164 **3. Data availability**

165 The level of data availability in both centres is not satisfactory. The data availability
166 rate at Clinicaltrials.gov is significantly higher than that at ChiCTR, indicating that
167 Clinicaltrials.gov is more concerned with the implementation of data disclosure.
168 However, there is still much room for improvement in this area at both centres, far
169 from the trial reporting rate. The centres need to play their roles as supervisors and
170 ask trials that have published results to upload their data and take appropriate action if
171 necessary.

172 **4. Study Status**

173 Clinicaltrials.gov clearly identifies trial study status and requires investigators to
174 record any changes to trial status in the relevant section of the website. The main

175 status can be divided by a few groups are Completed, Not yet recruiting, Recruiting,
176 Enrolling by invitation, Active, not recruiting, Suspended, Terminated, Withdrawn and
177 Unknown. The trials with the status of Terminated and Withdrawn could be conducted
178 to improve the limitations of study. In addition, it was found that most of the trials
179 with the status of Completed had not been queried for publication, therefore, measures
180 need to be taken by the registry to urge and facilitate trials with the status of
181 Completed to report their results and make their data publicly available. This shows
182 that the research status of trials is of critical importance. Therefore, ChiCTR should be
183 called upon to create a new research status item, and to set the number of years of
184 research, and to urge investigators according to their research status. Funding
185 institutions could also refer to the NIHR to request that registration information needs
186 to be updated during the study period [19].

187 **5. Proposed solutions**

188 We need to face the problem the problem of low reporting rates of registered trial
189 results. Firstly, to avoid limited access, researchers are advised to update the published
190 article information on the registration site after article publication; Secondly, in
191 response to the lack of registration numbers, trial centres and major journals should
192 call for clinical trials to be registered before publication and require registration
193 numbers to be indicated. This will facilitate the registration of clinical trials and
194 increase transparency, and also reduce the illusion of unpublished findings due to

195 partial changes of trials, which can be updated on the registration website in relation
196 to changes. Furthermore, the potential for biased reporting of results needs to be
197 called out to journals and academics to pay more attention to the results of studies,
198 rather than focusing on positive results. They could accept the publication of negative
199 results or seek new ways or platforms for non-positive results. Then, funding
200 institutions could take a model from the NIHR [16] in requiring that the date of
201 publication of trial results be disclosed and that past registrations and publications be
202 taken into account when reviewing funding applications for new clinical trials. More
203 importantly, researchers are expected to pay more attention to the reporting of results
204 and data disclosure of registered acupuncture clinical trials; and that registries will
205 monitor the publication of reported results and timely updates in the registries. The
206 registries shall, as far as possible, request investigators to update the progress of their
207 trials, and shall take appropriate measures to promote the completion and reporting
208 rate of trials that are not reported by the due date, so that research resources can be
209 fully utilised.

210 **6. Limitations**

211 Limitations of this study: This paper mainly focuses on the acupuncture trials
212 registered with Clinicaltrials.gov and ChiCTR, which may not reflect registrations and
213 reporting from other registries, regions or countries. International studies can be
214 carries out with global cooperation. Relevant information regarding WHO is not

215 available which set a limit to our data. The study is based on trials registered from 1
216 January 2013 to 31 December 2021. Subject classification is not shown on the
217 Clinicaltrials.gov website, hence, it is not possible to analyze the relationship between
218 registration, reporting and subject classification.

219 **Conclusion**

220 The number of acupuncture clinical trial registries is increasing steadily, but the
221 reporting rate of trial results is very low and the transparency of data is not ideal. At
222 the same time, the unavailability of registered trial results greatly weakens the
223 advantages of clinical trial registries, causing a waste of research resources and funds
224 and a possible shortage of research in the corresponding fields. Therefore, firstly, it is
225 recommended that researchers need to put more focus on acupuncture clinical trial
226 reports with respect. Secondly, study progress can be recorded and monitored on the
227 registration platforms which allow the public to access data. At the same time, the
228 journal could update the evaluation criteria for evaluating negative-result reports to
229 minimize the bias that may occur. Last but not least, funding institutions are expected
230 to optimise the end-of-trial review, strengthen the reporting monitoring of core
231 outcome indicators, regulate clinical research and reduce the waste of public
232 resources.

233 **Acknowledgments**

This work was supported by the Zhejiang Provincial Administration of Traditional

Chinese Medicine (grant no. 2020ZQ026) <https://wsjkw.zj.gov.cn/>, and the State Administration of Traditional Chinese Medicine of the People's Republic of China (grant no. zyycx201901) <http://www.satcm.gov.cn/>.

234 **Author Contributions**

235 Conceived and designed the experiments: QAZ and HJL conceived the ideas and
236 drafted the manuscript. YF, YYC and BLC contributed to the acquisition and the
237 analysis of data. QWZ revised the manuscript. All authors approved the final version
238 of the manuscript accepted for publication.

239 **References**

- 240 [1] International Committee of Medical Journal Editors. Clinical trials registration
241 [Internet]. *ICMJE*. 2020 [cited 21 May 2020]. Available from:
242 <http://www.icmje.org/about-icmje/faqs/clinical-trials-registration/>.
- 243 [2] De Angelis CD, Drazen JM, Frizelle FA, Haug C, Hoey J, Horton R, et al. Is this
244 clinical trial fully registered? A statement from the International Committee of
245 Medical Journal Editors. *JAMA*. 2005;293(23):2927–9. doi: 10.1056/NEJMe058127
246 PMID: 15911780.
- 247 [3] Laine C, Horton R, DeAngelis CD, Drazen JM, Frizelle FA, et al. Clinical trial
248 registration[J]. *BMJ*. 2007 Jun 9;334(7605):1177-8. doi:
249 10.1136/bmj.39233.510810.80 PMID: 17548363.
- 250 [4] Song F, Parekh S, Hooper L, Loke YK, Ryder J, Sutton AJ, et al. Dissemination

- 251 and publication of research findings: an updated review of related biases. *Health*
252 *Technol Assess.* 2010 Feb;14(8):iii, ix-xi, 1-193. doi: 10.3310/hta14080 PMID:
253 20181324.
- 254 [5] Boutron I, Ravaud P. Misrepresentation and distortion of research in biomedical
255 literature. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A.* 2018 Mar 13;115(11):2613-2619. doi:
256 10.1073/pnas.1711075115 PMID: 29531025.
- 257 [6] Laine C, Horton R, DeAngelis CD, Drazen JM, Frizelle FA, Godlee F, et al.
258 Clinical trial registration--looking back and moving ahead. *N Engl J Med.* 2007 Jun
259 28;356(26):2734-6. doi: 10.1056/NEJMe078110 PMID: 17548427.
- 260 [7] 42 CFR 11. Clinical trials registration and results information submission; *Final*
261 *rule.* Federal Register.
- 262 [8] Viergever RF, Li K. Trends in global clinical trial registration: an analysis of
263 numbers of registered clinical trials in different parts of the world from 2004 to 2013.
264 *BMJ Open.* 2015 Sep 25;5(9):e008932. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2015-008932 PMID:
265 26408831.
- 266 [9]Ying Xu, Bo Chen, Yi Guo. Analysis and discussion on the current state of
267 acupuncture clinical research registration[J]. *Chinese Acupuncture.*
268 2015,35(06):605-607. China.
- 269 [10]Jia Yan, Jian Pei. Application of clinical trial registration in acupuncture clinics[J].
270 *Chinese Journal of Acupuncture and Moxibustion (Electronic Edition).*

271 2014,3(01):8-12. China.

272 [11]Chinese Clinical Trial Registry. [Internet]. ChiCTR. 2022 [cited 20 April 2022].

273 Available from: <http://www.chictr.org.cn/index.aspx>.

274 [12]Clinicaltrials.gov. [Internet]. 2022 [cited 20 April 2022]. Available from:

275 <http://www.clinicaltrials.gov/>.

276 [13]Taixiang Wu, Minawal Abdu, Yuan Hao, Xiangyu Kong, Shuo Chen, Youping Li.

277 10 years of clinical trial registration in China: current states and issues[J]. *Chinese*

278 *Journal of Evidence-Based Medicine*. 2018,18(06): 522-525. China.

279 [14] Joint Declaration Working Group, Youping Li, Taixiang Wu, Jing Li,

280 Zihong Zhong, Wannian Jia. A joint declaration on the creation of a clinical

281 trial registration and publication mechanism in China[J]. *Journal of Nanjing*

282 *Medical University (Social Science Edition)*. 2006(03): 265-266. China.

283 [15] Chan A, Hróbjartsson A, Haahr MT, Gøtzsche PC, Altman DG. Empirical

284 evidence for selective reporting of outcomes in randomized trials: comparison of

285 protocols to published articles. *JAMA*. 2004 May 26;291(20):2457-65. doi:

286 10.1001/jama.291.20.2457 PMID: 15161896.

287 [16] Dwan K, Altman DG, Arnaiz JA, Bloom J, Chan A, Cronin E, et al. Systematic

288 review of the empirical evidence of study publication bias and outcome reporting bias.

289 *PLoS One*. 2008 Aug 28;3(8):e3081. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0003081 PMID:

290 18769481.

- 291 [17] Dwan K, Gamble C, Williamson PR, Kirkham JJ; Reporting Bias Group.
292 Systematic review of the empirical evidence of study publication bias and outcome
293 reporting bias - an updated review. *PLoS One*. 2013 Jul 5;8(7):e66844. doi:
294 10.1371/journal.pone.0066844 PMID: 23861749.
- 295 [18] Edem B, Onwuchekwa C, Wariri O, Nkereuwem E, Nkereuwem OO, Williams V.
296 Trends in clinical trial registration in sub-Saharan Africa between 2010 and 2020: a
297 cross-sectional review of three clinical trial registries. *Trials*. 2021 Jul 21;22(1):472.
298 doi: 10.1186/s13063-021-05423-1 PMID: 34289892.
- 299 [19] National Institute for Health Research. NIHR policy on clinical trial registration
300 and disclosure of results [Internet]. NIHR. 2022 [cited 20 April 2022]. Available from:
301 [https://www.nihr.ac.uk/documents/nihr-policy-on-clinical-trial-registration-and-disclo-](https://www.nihr.ac.uk/documents/nihr-policy-on-clinical-trial-registration-and-disclosure-of-results/12252)
302 [sure-of-results/12252](https://www.nihr.ac.uk/documents/nihr-policy-on-clinical-trial-registration-and-disclosure-of-results/12252).

303 **Supporting Information**

- 304 S1 File. Raw extraction table.
- 305 (XLS)

