

1 **Sex differences in the change in cardiorespiratory fitness and additional physical and**
2 **mental health outcomes after exercise training in adults with atrial fibrillation: a**
3 **systematic review protocol**

4 Sol Vidal-Almela,^{a,b} Isabela R. Marçal,^{a,b} Tasuku Terada,^a Carley D. O'Neill,^a Jennifer L.
5 Reed^{a,b,c}

6 ^aExercise Physiology and Cardiovascular Health Lab, Division of Cardiac Prevention and
7 Rehabilitation, University of Ottawa Heart Institute, Ottawa

8 ^bSchool of Human Kinetics, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Ottawa

9 ^cSchool of Epidemiology and Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of Ottawa

10 Sol Vidal-Almela, MSc, Exercise Physiology and Cardiovascular Health Lab, Division of
11 Cardiac Prevention and Rehabilitation, University of Ottawa Heart Institute, 40 Ruskin
12 Street, Ottawa, Ontario, K1Y 4W7, Canada, e-mail: SVidalalmela@ottawaheart.ca

13 Isabela R. Marçal, MSc, Exercise Physiology and Cardiovascular Health Lab, Division of
14 Cardiac Prevention and Rehabilitation, University of Ottawa Heart Institute, 40 Ruskin
15 Street, Ottawa, Ontario, K1Y 4W7, Canada, e-mail: IRoque@ottawaheart.ca

16 Tasuku Terada, PhD, Exercise Physiology and Cardiovascular Health Lab, Division of
17 Cardiac Prevention and Rehabilitation, University of Ottawa Heart Institute, 40 Ruskin
18 Street, Ottawa, Ontario, K1Y 4W7, Canada, e-mail: TTerada@ottawaheart.ca

19 Carley D. O'Neill, PhD, Exercise Physiology and Cardiovascular Health Lab, Division of
20 Cardiac Prevention and Rehabilitation, University of Ottawa Heart Institute, 40 Ruskin
21 Street, Ottawa, Ontario, K1Y 4W7, Canada, e-mail: CONeill@ottawaheart.ca

22 Jennifer L. Reed, PhD (corresponding author), Exercise Physiology and Cardiovascular
23 Health Lab, Division of Cardiac Prevention and Rehabilitation, University of Ottawa Heart

- 1 Institute, 40 Ruskin Street, Ottawa, Ontario, K1Y 4W7, Canada, e-mail:
- 2 JReed@ottawaheart.ca

1 **ABSTRACT**

2 **Background:** Patients with atrial fibrillation (AF), the most common sustained cardiac
3 arrhythmia, often have a low cardiorespiratory fitness (CRF) and poor physical and mental
4 health due to disabling AF symptoms. This is more pronounced in females, who also report
5 worse AF symptoms and quality of life (QoL) than males. Improving CRF through exercise
6 training is an important AF management target associated with lower hospitalization and
7 mortality rates. Emerging research suggests smaller CRF improvements in females than
8 males following the same exercise training program. Yet, this has not been systematically
9 reviewed in the AF population. The primary purpose of this systematic review is to compare
10 changes in CRF following exercise training between females and males with AF. Secondary
11 aims will compare changes in AF symptoms, QoL and additional physical and mental health
12 outcomes between sexes. **Methods:** We will adhere to the reporting guidelines of the
13 Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Review and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) statement.
14 Five electronic bibliographic databases are being searched to identify studies with
15 prospective cohort and experimental designs, implementing exercise training of any form
16 (e.g. aerobic, strength) for at least 4 weeks, in adults (≥ 18 years old) with an AF diagnosis.
17 Eligible studies must report a baseline and follow-up measure of at least one primary or
18 secondary outcome. CRF (primary outcome) can be estimated or directly measured as peak
19 oxygen consumption (VO_{2peak}). When eligible results are not segregated by sex, authors will
20 be contacted to obtain sex-specific data. Study quality and risk of bias will be assessed using
21 the Tool for the assessment of Study quality and reporting in EXercise (TESTEX) scale and
22 the Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development and Evaluation (GRADE)
23 approach. Meta-analyses will be conducted to synthesize the measures of effect in studies
24 with sufficient homogeneity. **Discussion:** This review will address the lack of sex-based
25 analyses in exercise studies in the AF population. By using a sex lens, we will provide

1 evidence on the physical and mental health effects of exercise training in females and males
2 with AF. Our findings will be of value to patients with AF, researchers and healthcare
3 providers involved in AF management.

4 **Systematic review registration:** PROSPERO #CRD42022302310

5 **Keywords:** aerobic capacity, atrial fibrillation, cardiac arrhythmias, cardiac rehabilitation,
6 exercise training, meta-analysis, physical activity, sex characteristics, sex-specific

7

1 BACKGROUND

2 Atrial Fibrillation (AF) is characterized by an irregular cardiac rhythm and rapid heart rate.

3 There are currently more than 37 million patients with AF globally (1,2), and a 60% increase
4 in AF prevalence is expected by 2050 (2). AF is typically a progressive disorder (paroxysmal
5 to persistent and finally permanent) due to the accumulation of modifiable AF substrates (e.g.
6 hypertension, obesity) (3,4), yet participation in exercise-based cardiovascular rehabilitation
7 has been shown to lower the likelihood of AF progression (5).

8 Several research trials implementing exercise training have reported improvements in
9 cardiorespiratory fitness (CRF) in patients with AF (6–16). CRF independently predicts AF
10 recurrence (17) and prognosis (18,19); every 1 metabolic equivalent (MET; i.e. 3.5 mL
11 $\text{O}_2 \cdot \text{min}^{-1} \cdot \text{kg}^{-1}$) increase in CRF reduces AF recurrence by 9% (17). Patients with AF have a
12 3.3 to 5.0 mL $\text{O}_2 \cdot \text{min}^{-1} \cdot \text{kg}^{-1}$ lower CRF than other cardiovascular disease populations (11,16)
13 and are bothered by a low exercise tolerance (20). An elevated left ventricular filling pressure
14 and diminished chronotropic response contribute to the reduced CRF in AF (21). In these
15 patients, improving CRF with exercise-based cardiovascular rehabilitation is associated with
16 a lower risk for cardiovascular disease hospitalization or all-cause mortality (hazards ratio
17 0.83, 95% confidence interval [CI] 0.69 to 0.98, $p=0.04$) (22).

18 Females with AF have a substantially lower CRF than males (23). Females' lower CRF and
19 physical activity levels (24) may be associated with their reporting of more frequent and
20 severe AF symptoms (e.g. dyspnea, fatigue, palpitations, dizziness, anxiety) (25–27); poorer
21 quality of life (QoL) (28,29); and greater risk of mortality when compared to males (2).

22 Improving CRF through exercise training represents, thus, an important AF management
23 target which may be particularly beneficial for females.

1 Some studies in healthy and cardiovascular disease populations suggest that females may
2 improve CRF to a lesser extent than males following the same exercise program (30–34). In
3 the CopenHeartRFA trial (n=59 females, 151 males), females with paroxysmal or persistent
4 AF experienced a smaller increase in CRF than males (+1.7 vs. +2.9 mL·min⁻¹·kg⁻¹)
5 following 12-weeks of combined aerobic and strength training (23). Similarly, a 12-month
6 walking intervention in patients with permanent AF (n=7 females, 13 males) led to an
7 increase in CRF of 7% in females and 18% in males (11). Since only two studies in the AF
8 population have reported CRF segregated by sex, additional comparisons of CRF changes
9 following exercise training between females and males are warranted by pooling sex-specific
10 data during meta-analyses (35).

11 Exercise training has also been shown to improve AF symptoms (10,36) and QoL
12 (8,10,12,14,36) in patients with AF. The CopenHeartRFA trial reported significant increases
13 in AF-specific QoL as measured by the atrial fibrillation effect on quality-of-life (AFEQT)
14 scale in females (global score: +34.4±16.9 points; treatment concern score: +17.0±23.5
15 points) but not males, when compared to usual care (23). Exercise may narrow pre-existing
16 differences in QoL between sexes.

17 There are sex-based differences in additional modifiable risk factors for AF. The prevalence
18 of hypertension (27,28,37), obesity (24) and depression (24) is higher in females than males
19 with AF. Females also experience faster heart rates during AF (38), which may accelerate the
20 electrical and structural remodeling in the atria (39). Such risk factors contribute to AF
21 pathogenesis (39), but irrefutable evidence has shown the benefits of exercise training in
22 improving physical and mental health (40,41). In patients with AF, whilst exercise alone may
23 not improve blood pressure (6,12,16,42,43), it has been shown to reduce body mass (10) and
24 fat mass (11,12), anxiety and depressive symptoms (8,42), and resting heart rate
25 (7,10,12,13,16). Less is known about the sex-based differences in these outcomes following

1 exercise training in patients with AF (23). In other cardiovascular disease populations,
2 findings have been inconsistent (32–34,44,45). A recent meta-analysis in patients with
3 coronary artery disease revealed no sex-based differences in blood pressure reductions (n=6
4 studies, systolic: between sexes mean difference [MD] -2.51, 95% CI -6.57 to 1.55 mmHg,
5 p=0.23; diastolic: MD -0.91, 95% CI -4.98 to 3.15 mmHg, p=0.66) and lower improvements
6 in body mass index (BMI) (n=10 studies, MD -0.25, 95% CI -0.03 to -0.47 kg/m², p=0.02) in
7 females than males following high-intensity interval training (45).

8 Exercise training is now part of AF care (4,46,47), yet research gaps remain regarding sex-
9 based differences in the response to exercise training in the AF population (48). A systematic
10 evaluation and synthesis using a sex lens is needed as a first step to provide evidence-based
11 exercise recommendations for patients with AF applicable to both sexes.

12

13 **Objective**

14 The primary purpose of this systematic review is to compare changes in CRF following
15 exercise training between females and males with AF. We hypothesize that across available
16 studies, smaller improvements in CRF will be reported following exercise training for
17 females with AF than males. The secondary aim is to examine the impact of sex on changes
18 in AF symptoms, general and AF-specific QoL, and additional physical and mental health
19 outcomes (e.g. resting blood pressure and heart rate, BMI, body composition, functional
20 capacity, physical activity levels, anxiety and depressive symptoms) following exercise
21 training.

22

23 **METHODS**

24 **Study design**

1 This systematic review protocol was designed in accordance with the Preferred Reporting
2 Items for Systematic Review and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA)-P checklist (49) (see Additional
3 File 1). The systematic review will adhere to the most updated reporting guidelines of the
4 PRISMA statement (50) and will follow the criteria outlined in the checklist A Measurement
5 Tool to Assess Systematic Reviews ([AMSTAR](#)) (51).

6 **Study registration**

7 This systematic review protocol was registered with the International Prospective Register of
8 Systematic Reviews (PROSPERO) in February 2022 (registration # CRD42022302310). In
9 the event of important protocol amendments, the date of each amendment accompanied by a
10 description of the change and the rationale will be reported in PROSPERO.

11 **Eligibility criteria**

12 *Participants*

13 Studies will be included if the sample is comprised of adults (≥ 18 years old) with an AF
14 diagnosis and where data from adults with AF can be extracted (i.e. $\geq 10\%$ of the sample has
15 AF). There will be no restrictions in co-morbidities.

16 *Study designs*

17 Prospective experimental designs (randomized controlled trials [RCTs], quasi-experimental,
18 pre-post, and case-control studies) will be eligible.

19 *Interventions*

20 Eligible studies must contain an intervention component incorporating exercise training of
21 any form with a duration of at least 4 weeks (52). We will use the well-established definition
22 by Caspersen et al, where exercise is defined as a structured, planned and repetitive subset of
23 physical activity with the aim to maintain or improve physical fitness and health (53). The
24 exercise interventions may include, but are not limited to, aerobic training (e.g. moderate-

1 intensity continuous training, high-intensity interval training, circuit training), strength
2 training (e.g. body-weight or machine-based resistance training, isometric exercises) and
3 Yoga. The interventions may be multi-component, but they must include exercise. There will
4 be no restrictions on the mode of delivery (e.g. in person, virtual, hybrid) or setting (e.g. in
5 hospital, in the community, individual or as a group) of the intervention.

6 ***Outcomes***

7 The primary outcome of interest will be CRF. In clinical populations, CRF is often measured
8 as the highest value of oxygen consumption (VO_{2peak}) attained during an exercise test
9 designed to bring the participant to volitional fatigue (54), or estimated from a submaximal
10 exercise test (55). Thus, CRF will be considered as directly measured or estimated VO_{2peak}
11 (in $mL \cdot min^{-1} \cdot kg^{-1}$, $L \cdot min^{-1}$ or METs). Self-reported measures of VO_{2peak} using a
12 questionnaire (e.g. Duke Activity Status Index) will be excluded.

13 Eligible studies must report a baseline and follow-up measure of at least one primary or
14 secondary outcome. Secondary outcomes will consist of:

15 AF symptom frequency and/or severity (patient-reported outcome) measured with self-report
16 questionnaires which may include, but are not limited to, the University of Toronto Atrial
17 Fibrillation Severity Scale (AFSS), European Heart Rhythm Association (EHRA) AF
18 symptom scale, Arrhythmia Symptom Checklist Frequency and Severity (SCL), Canadian
19 Cardiovascular Society Severity in Atrial Fibrillation Scale (CCS-SAF), Mayo Atrial
20 Fibrillation Symptom Inventory (MAFSI), and Arrhythmia-Specific Questionnaire in
21 Tachycardia and Arrhythmia (ASTA) (56,57).

22 General QoL (patient-reported outcome) measured with self-report questionnaires which may
23 include the Medical Outcome Study Short-form Health Survey (SF-12 or SF-36) and
24 EuroQoL (EQ-5D) (56).

1 AF-specific QoL measured with self-report questionnaires such as the AFEQT, Atrial
2 Fibrillation Quality of Life (AF-QoL), Quality of Life in Atrial Fibrillation (QLAF) and
3 Atrial Fibrillation Quality of Life Questionnaire (AFQLQ) (56).

4 Additional physical health outcomes (i.e. resting blood pressure and heart rate, BMI, and
5 body composition) measured by research or clinical staff. Functional capacity measured with
6 a 6-minute walking test. Physical activity levels measured by a self-report questionnaire or a
7 device such as an accelerometer.

8 Mental health outcomes (patient-reported outcome) including anxiety and depression levels,
9 measured with self-report questionnaires which may include, but are not limited to, Hospital
10 Anxiety and Depression Scale (HADS), Generalized Anxiety Disorder (GAD-7), Beck
11 Anxiety Inventory (BAI), State-Trait Anxiety Inventory (STAI), Patient Health
12 Questionnaire-9 (PHQ-9), Beck Depression Inventory (BDI), and Cardiac Depression Scale
13 (CDS).

14 Additional outcomes will be compared between sexes including: (a) adherence as defined by
15 the mean number of sessions attended by participants, (b) number of dropouts and loss-to-
16 follow-up; and (c) number of adverse events during the study period.

17 ***Publication status and language***

18 Published peer-reviewed journal articles and non-peer reviewed grey literature including
19 published theses and dissertations (e.g. [ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global](#), [GreyLit.org](#),
20 [Open Grey](#)), conference abstracts, presentations and proceedings; and unpublished data will
21 be examined. No language restrictions will be imposed on the search, but only papers written
22 in English, French, Japanese, Portuguese or Spanish will be included.

23 **Search strategy**

1 A comprehensive search strategy from an existing systematic review by the authors (58) was
2 re-used to identify relevant studies. This search was previously designed and translated
3 according to the indexing systems of several databases in collaboration with a medical
4 research librarian. The search was previously peer reviewed by a second research librarian.
5 Medical subject headings (MeSH) and key words related to “atrial fibrillation”, “exercise
6 training” and “cardiac rehabilitation” were used. A draft of the search strategy used for
7 MEDLINE is provided in Table 1. No date restrictions were imposed. Five electronic
8 bibliographic databases were searched: MEDLINE (OvidSP); CINAHL (EBSCOhost);
9 Embase (OvidSP); PycINFO (Ovid) and Cochrane Library (Wiley). The reference lists of
10 studies selected for the review and those of previous reviews will be examined. Registries
11 such as [Clinical Trials](#) and [PROSPERO](#) will be searched for recently completed trials and
12 systematic reviews, respectively; and conference proceedings of the two previous years
13 related to the AF and exercise field will be hand searched to identify further studies.

14 **Data management and selection of eligible studies**

15 The results from the search strategy have been uploaded into Covidence Systematic Review
16 Software (Veritas Health Innovation, Melbourne, Australia), an electronic program
17 that facilitates collaboration among reviewers during the study selection process. Duplicate
18 articles were removed using the “duplicate” function and remaining duplicates will be
19 excluded manually by two reviewers during the screening process (SVA, IRM). If several
20 articles are published using the same data source, the articles with the largest sample size for
21 CRF, with additional secondary outcomes, or reporting sex-specific results may be retained.
22 Labels with specific reasons for exclusion have been created in Covidence to facilitate the
23 screening process and the creation of a flow chart. Two independent reviewers (SVA, IRM)
24 are screening the titles and abstracts of all articles yielded by the search against the inclusion
25 criteria. Prior to formally beginning screening, a calibration exercise was conducted. Full

1 texts of each potentially relevant article will be uploaded on Covidence and screened by two
2 independent reviewers (SVA, IRM) to determine eligibility. Any disagreements between the
3 reviewers or any uncertainty will be resolved by discussion with a third reviewer (JLR). The
4 review authors will not be blinded to the study authors or journal titles when screening.

5 **Data extraction**

6 A data extraction form has been created using Microsoft Excel (Microsoft Canada Inc.
7 Mississauga, ON, Canada) (see Additional File 2) and will be adapted following feedback
8 from co-authors to improve its usability. Data extracted from each eligible study, when
9 available, will include: publication details (authors, country and year of publication),
10 participant characteristics by sex (sample size, AF type, mean age, sociodemographic and
11 gender-related variables [e.g. gender identity, ethnicity, marital status, educational level,
12 employment status, income], prescribed medications, medical conditions and procedures),
13 study design, characteristics of the assessment of VO₂peak (test protocol, modality, method
14 of measurement), details of exercise interventions (frequency, intensity, time, type, [FITT],
15 volume and progression), participant adherence with the exercise intervention (number of
16 sessions attended), number of adverse events during the study period, dropout and loss to
17 follow-up, and description of the control group, if any. In addition, primary and secondary
18 outcomes measured at baseline and following the exercise intervention will be extracted
19 (mean and a measure of variance such as standard deviation [SD], standard error, 95% CI)
20 including CRF, AF symptom frequency and severity, general and AF-specific QoL, resting
21 blood pressure and heart rate, BMI, body composition, functional capacity, physical activity
22 levels and anxiety and depression severity. Whenever possible, results from an intention to
23 treat analysis will be used. Data will be extracted by a reviewer and verified by a second
24 reviewer. Any disagreements between the reviewers will be resolved by consensus and/or
25 discussion with a third reviewer (JLR). Study authors will be contacted to resolve any

1 uncertainties and for missing information. If studies include both sexes but fail to report
2 outcomes by sex, the corresponding authors will be contacted to obtain sex-specific data. The
3 approach to contact authors will involve up to 3 emails or 3 phone calls (59). Receptive
4 authors will be provided a pre-specified data extraction form and will receive up to 3 follow-
5 up emails or phone calls as reminders, after which they will be considered unwilling or
6 unable to share their data. Authors of studies which report on collecting a measure of interest
7 but do not report the outcome on the manuscript will be contacted to solicit the unpublished
8 data using the same approach.

9 **Methodological quality and risk of bias within studies**

10 For the assessment of study quality and risk of bias, standardized data forms will be
11 completed by a reviewer (SVA or IRM) and verified by a second (SVA or IRM). Any
12 disagreements will be resolved by consensus and/or discussion with a third reviewer (JLR).
13 Reviewers will not be blinded to the authors or journals.
14 The TESTEX scale will be used to examine the quality and risk of bias of each individual
15 study as it is a valid and reliable tool to assess the quality and reporting of exercise training
16 trials (60). The TESTEX scale uses 12 criteria (some of which can score more than one point)
17 for a maximum score of 15 points, 5 pertain to *study quality*: (1) eligibility criteria specified,
18 (2) randomization specified, (3) allocation concealment, (4) groups similar at baseline and (5)
19 blinding of assessor for the primary outcome; and 10 pertain to *study reporting*: (1) outcome
20 measures assessed in 85% of patients, (2) intention-to-treat analysis, (3) between-group
21 statistical comparisons reported, (4) point measures and measures of variability for all
22 reported outcome measures, (5) activity monitoring in control groups, (6) relative exercise
23 intensity remained constant and (7) exercise volume and energy expenditure.

24 **Assessment of overall quality of the evidence**

1 The quality of the evidence for the included studies will be evaluated using the Grading of
2 Recommendations Assessment, Development and Evaluation (GRADE) (61) approach.
3 GRADE classifies the evidence as high, moderate, low or very low depending on: (1) risk of
4 bias within individual studies, (2) inconsistency of results between studies, (3) indirectness of
5 evidence, (4) imprecision and (5) publication bias. RCT evidence represents the highest
6 quality rating.

7 **Quantitative data synthesis and planned analyses**

8 *Measures of treatment effect*

9 If studies are sufficiently homogeneous regarding population, interventions, outcomes and
10 study design, and contain a number of samples that would provide meaningful summary
11 measures, meta-analyses will be performed. Continuous outcomes will be analysed using
12 MDs, or standardized mean differences (SMD) if the measurement methods (e.g. scales) for
13 the same outcome vary between studies. Categorical data will be presented descriptively. The
14 MD will be determined by calculating the difference in the mean outcome between sexes and
15 dividing by the SD of the outcome among participants.

16 Pooled estimates of the effect of exercise training on CRF for females when compared to
17 males (i.e. the MD or SMD between the CRF changes in females vs. males following
18 exercise training) will be obtained using a random-effects model, since effect sizes are not
19 expected to be identical across all studies. The same approach will be followed for the
20 secondary outcomes. Where possible, pooled estimates will be calculated for the effect of
21 exercise training vs. usual care on CRF in each sex separately. A quantitative synthesis of the
22 measures of effect and 95% CI will be presented in the form of forest plots, which will be
23 created using the Cochrane RevMan 5.4.1 or Comprehensive Meta-Analysis software. If
24 quantitative synthesis is not appropriate, a narrative synthesis will be presented following the
25 Synthesis Without Meta-analysis (SWiM) guidelines (62).

1 ***Pre-specified additional analyses***

2 Several sub-analyses including sensitivity and meta-regression approaches will be performed,
3 if sufficient data are available, to elicit whether specific driving forces could influence
4 different effect sizes. Such sub-analyses may elucidate factors and mechanisms influencing
5 sex-based differences in the response to exercise and whether a specific exercise prescription
6 maximizes the health benefits in females or males with AF. For instance, we plan to examine
7 whether the:

- 8 (1) Exercise program characteristics (FITT) influence the change in CRF in females or
9 males with AF;
- 10 (2) Participant baseline characteristics (e.g. sociodemographic and gender-related factors,
11 physical- and mental-health) influence the change in CRF in females or males with AF;
- 12 (3) Method of CRF measurement (estimated vs. measured) influences the difference in
13 change in CRF between females and males with AF;
- 14 (4) Sex-based differences in adherence influence sex differences in the change in CRF.

15 ***Assessment of heterogeneity and publication bias***

16 The degree of inconsistency across studies will be quantified using the I^2 statistic, which
17 describes the percentage of total variation across studies that is due to heterogeneity rather
18 than chance. I^2 values of 25%, 50% and 75% have been classified as low, moderate and high
19 heterogeneity (63). Where meta-analyses are performed, funnel plots will be prepared to
20 assess the effect of publication bias on our systematic review. Visual inspection will be used
21 to determine whether bias is absent (plots resemble a symmetrical inverted funnel) or present
22 (skewed and asymmetrical shape). Further, an Egger's test $p < 0.10$ will indicate the presence
23 of a significant publication bias (64).

24 We will take into consideration the methodological quality, risk of bias, heterogeneity and
25 overall quality of the evidence when interpreting the treatment effect reported in our

1 systematic review as they can influence the true effect of the exercise intervention and the
2 clinical relevance of our findings.

3

4 **CLINICAL RELEVANCE**

5 The lack of outcome reporting by sex in exercise studies may lead to suboptimal exercise
6 volumes and health benefits in females and males with AF. This systematic review will
7 address the lack of sex-based analyses in previously conducted exercise studies; and, provide
8 evidence applicable to both sexes of the physical and mental health effects of exercise
9 training in the AF population. Whether females and males with AF respond differently to
10 exercise is unknown, but the notable clinical sex-based differences in AF warrant sex
11 consideration when developing exercise recommendations. Our findings will be of value to
12 patients with AF, health researchers and healthcare providers involved in AF management.

13

14 **DISSEMINATION**

15 The findings from this systematic review will be disseminated through peer-reviewed
16 publications and conference presentations/proceedings. Further, the authors will invite health
17 researchers, patients with AF and healthcare providers involved in AF management to
18 educational webinars focused on our findings. These webinars are expected to have global
19 reach and equip patients and exercise specialists with information on exercise participation
20 and prescription.

21

22 **LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS**

23 AF: Atrial Fibrillation

24 AFEQT: Atrial Fibrillation Effect on Quality-of-Life Scale

25 AFQLQ: Atrial Fibrillation Quality of Life Questionnaire

- 1 AF-QoL: Atrial Fibrillation Quality of Life
- 2 AFSS: University of Toronto Atrial Fibrillation Severity Scale
- 3 AMSTASR: Measurement Tool to Assess Systematic Reviews
- 4 ASTA: Arrhythmia-Specific Questionnaire in Tachycardia and Arrhythmia
- 5 BAI: Beck anxiety inventory
- 6 BDI: Beck Depression Inventory
- 7 BMI: Body Mass Index
- 8 CCS-SAF: Canadian Cardiovascular Society Severity in Atrial Fibrillation Scale
- 9 CDS: Cardiac Depression Scale
- 10 CRF: Cardiorespiratory Fitness
- 11 EHRA: European Heart Rhythm Association
- 12 EQ-5D: EuroQoL
- 13 FITT: Exercise program characteristics (frequency, intensity, time, type)
- 14 GAD-7: Generalized Anxiety Disorder
- 15 GRADE: Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development and Evaluation
- 16 HADS: Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale
- 17 MAFSI: Mayo Atrial Fibrillation Symptom Inventory
- 18 MD: Mean Difference
- 19 METs: Metabolic Equivalent
- 20 PHQ-9: Patient Health Questionnaire-9
- 21 PRISMA: Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Review and Meta-Analyses
- 22 PROSPERO: International Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews
- 23 QLAF: Quality of Life in Atrial Fibrillation
- 24 QoL: Quality of Life
- 25 RCT: Randomized Controlled Trial
- 26 SCL: Arrhythmia Symptom Checklist Frequency and Severity
- 27 SD: Standard Deviation
- 28 SF-12/36: Medical Outcome Study Short-form Health Survey
- 29 SMD: Standardized Mean Difference

1 STAI: State-trait anxiety inventory

2 VO2peak: Peak Oxygen Consumption

3

4 **DECLARATIONS**

5 **Availability of data and materials**

6 Upon completion of this systematic review, the datasets used and/or analysed will be made

7 available from the corresponding author on reasonable request.

8 **Competing interests**

9 The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

10 **Funding**

11 This systematic review will be partly sponsored by the Health and Behavior International

12 Collaborative Research Award and the International Behavioural Trials Network organization

13 (IRM). SVA received a University of Ottawa Heart Institute Research Scholarship.

14 **Authors' contributions**

15 SVA and JLR were responsible for the design of the systematic review protocol. SVA drafted

16 the manuscript. IRM drafted the abstract. All authors critically revised the manuscript and

17 gave final approval.

18

19

1 **References**

- 2 1. Dai H, Zhang Q, Much AA, Maor E, Segev A, Beinart R, et al. Global, regional, and
3 national prevalence, incidence, mortality, and risk factors for atrial fibrillation, 1990–
4 2017: results from the Global Burden of Disease Study 2017. *Eur Heart J Qual Care
5 Clin Outcomes*. 2021;7(6):574-582. doi: 10.1093/ehjqcco/qcaa061.
- 6 2. Lippi G, Sanchis-Gomar F, Cervellin G. Global epidemiology of atrial fibrillation: An
7 increasing epidemic and public health challenge. *International Journal of Stroke*.
8 2021;16(2):217–21.
- 9 3. Padfield GJ, Steinberg C, Swampillai J, Qian H, Connolly SJ, Dorian P, et al.
10 Progression of paroxysmal to persistent atrial fibrillation: 10-year follow-up in the
11 Canadian Registry of Atrial Fibrillation. *Heart Rhythm*. 2017;14(6):801–7.
- 12 4. Andrade JG, Aguilar M, Atzema C, Bell A, Cairns JA, Cheung CC, et al. The 2020
13 Canadian Cardiovascular Society/Canadian Heart Rhythm Society Comprehensive
14 Guidelines for the Management of Atrial Fibrillation. *Canadian Journal of Cardiology*.
15 2020.36(12):1847–948.
- 16 5. Buckley BJR, Harrison SL, Fazio-Eynullayeva E, Underhill P, Lane DA, Thijssen DHJ,
17 et al. Association of Exercise-Based Cardiac Rehabilitation with Progression of
18 Paroxysmal to Sustained Atrial Fibrillation. *JCM*. 2021;10(3):435.
- 19 6. Borland M, Bergfeldt L, Nordeman L, Bollano E, Andersson L, Rosenkvist A, et al.
20 Exercise-based cardiac rehabilitation improves physical fitness in patients with
21 permanent atrial fibrillation – a randomised controlled study. *Translational Sports
22 Medicine*. 2020;3:415-425. doi: 10.1002/tsm2.166.

- 1 7. Hegbom F, Sire S, Heldal M, Orning OM, Stavem K, Gjesdal K. Short-term exercise
2 training in patients with chronic atrial fibrillation: effects on exercise capacity, AV
3 conduction, and quality of life. *J Cardiopulm Rehabil.* 2006;26(1):24–9.
- 4 8. Joensen AM, Dinesen PT, Svendsen LT, Hoejbjerg TK, Fjerbaek A, Andreasen J, et al.
5 Effect of patient education and physical training on quality of life and physical exercise
6 capacity in patients with paroxysmal or persistent atrial fibrillation: A randomized
7 study. *J Rehabil Med.* 2019;51(6):442-450. doi: 10.2340/16501977-2551.
- 8 9. Kato M, Ogano M, Mori Y, Kochi K, Morimoto D, Kito K, et al. Exercise-based cardiac
9 rehabilitation for patients with catheter ablation for persistent atrial fibrillation: A
10 randomized controlled clinical trial. *Eur J Prev Cardiol.* 2019;2047487319859974.
- 11 10. Malmo V, Nes BM, Amundsen BH, Tjonna A-E, Stoylen A, Rossvoll O, et al. Aerobic
12 Interval Training Reduces the Burden of Atrial Fibrillation in the Short Term: A
13 Randomized Trial. *Circulation.* 2016;133(5):466–73.
- 14 11. Mertens DJ, Kavanagh T. Exercise Training for Patients With Chronic Atrial
15 Fibrillation. *Journal of Cardiopulmonary Rehabilitation and Prevention.* 1996;16(3):193.
- 16 12. Osbak PS, Mourier M, Kjaer A, Henriksen JH, Kofoed KF, Jensen GB. A randomized
17 study of the effects of exercise training on patients with atrial fibrillation. *American*
18 *Heart Journal.* 2011;162(6):1080–7.
- 19 13. Plisiene J, Blumberg A, Haager G, Knackstedt C, Latsch J, Norra C, et al. Moderate
20 physical exercise: a simplified approach for ventricular rate control in older patients
21 with atrial fibrillation. *Clin Res Cardiol.* 2008;97(11):820.

- 1 14. Risom SS, Zwisler A-D, Rasmussen TB, Sibilitz KL, Madsen TLS, Svendsen JH, et al.
2 Cardiac rehabilitation versus usual care for patients treated with catheter ablation for
3 atrial fibrillation: Results of the randomized CopenHeartRFA trial. *American Heart*
4 *Journal*. 2016;181:120–9.
- 5 15. Skielboe AK, Bandholm TQ, Hakmann S, Mourier M, Kallemose T, Dixen U.
6 Cardiovascular exercise and burden of arrhythmia in patients with atrial fibrillation - A
7 randomized controlled trial. *PLoS One*. 2017;12(2).
- 8 16. Vanhees L, Schepers D, Defoor J, Brusselle S, Tchursh N, Fagard R. Exercise
9 performance and training in cardiac patients with atrial fibrillation. *J Cardiopulm*
10 *Rehabil*. 2000;20(6):346–52.
- 11 17. Pathak RK, Elliott A, Middeldorp ME, Meredith M, Mehta AB, Mahajan R, et al.
12 Impact of CARDIOrespiratory FITness on Arrhythmia Recurrence in Obese Individuals
13 With Atrial Fibrillation: The CARDIO-FIT Study. *Journal of the American College of*
14 *Cardiology*. 2015;66(9):985–96.
- 15 18. Keteyian SJ, Brawner CA, Savage PD, Ehrman JK, Schairer J, Divine G, et al. Peak
16 aerobic capacity predicts prognosis in patients with coronary heart disease. *American*
17 *Heart Journal*. 2008;156(2):292–300.
- 18 19. Tsuneoka H, Koike A, Nagayama O, Sakurada K, Kato J, Sato A, et al. Prognostic
19 Value of Cardiopulmonary Exercise Testing in Cardiac Patients With Atrial Fibrillation.
20 *Int Heart J*. 2012;53(2):102–7.
- 21 20. Ariansen I, Gjesdala K, Abdelnoorb M, Edvardsenc E, Engerd S, Tveitd A. Quality of
22 Life, Exercise Capacity and Comorbidity in Old Patients with Permanent Atrial
23 Fibrillation. *J Atr Fibrillation*. 2008;1(4).

- 1 21. Elliott AD, Verdicchio CV, Gallagher C, Linz D, Mahajan R, Mishima R, et al. Factors
2 Contributing to Exercise Intolerance in Patients With Atrial Fibrillation. *Heart, Lung*
3 *and Circulation*. 2021;30(7):947–54.
- 4 22. Younis A, Shaviv E, Nof E, Israel A, Berkovitch A, Goldenberg I, et al. The role and
5 outcome of cardiac rehabilitation program in patients with atrial fibrillation. *Clin*
6 *Cardiol*. 2018;41(9):1170–6.
- 7 23. Wagner MK, Zwisler A-DO, Risom SS, Svendsen JH, Christensen AV, Berg SK. Sex
8 differences in health status and rehabilitation outcomes in patients with atrial fibrillation
9 treated with ablation: Results from the CopenHeartRFA trial. *Eur J Cardiovasc Nurs*.
10 2018;17(2):123–35.
- 11 24. Ball J, Carrington MJ, Wood KA, Stewart S, Investigators the S. Women Versus Men
12 with Chronic Atrial Fibrillation: Insights from the Standard Versus Atrial Fibrillation
13 spEcific managemenT studY (SAFETY). *PLOS ONE*. 2013;8(5):e65795.
- 14 25. Schnabel RB, Pecun L, Ojeda FM, Lucerna M, Rzayeva N, Blankenberg S, et al. Gender
15 differences in clinical presentation and 1-year outcomes in atrial fibrillation. *Heart*.
16 2017;103(13):1024–30.
- 17 26. Blum S, Muff C, Aeschbacher S, Ammann P, Erne P, Moschovitis G, et al. Prospective
18 Assessment of Sex-Related Differences in Symptom Status and Health Perception
19 Among Patients With Atrial Fibrillation. *J Am Heart Assoc*. 2017;6(7).
- 20 27. Lip GYH, Laroche C, Boriani G, Cimaglia P, Dan G-A, Santini M, et al. Sex-related
21 differences in presentation, treatment, and outcome of patients with atrial fibrillation in
22 Europe: a report from the Euro Observational Research Programme Pilot survey on
23 Atrial Fibrillation. *Europace*. 2015;17(1):24–31.

- 1 28. Piccini JP, Simon DN, Steinberg BA, Thomas L, Allen LA, Fonarow GC, et al.
2 Differences in Clinical and Functional Outcomes of Atrial Fibrillation in Women and
3 Men: Two-Year Results From the ORBIT-AF Registry. *JAMA Cardiol.* 2016;1(3):282–
4 91.
- 5 29. Strømnes LA, Ree H, Gjesdal K, Ariansen I. Sex Differences in Quality of Life in
6 Patients With Atrial Fibrillation: A Systematic Review. *J Am Heart Assoc.*
7 2019;8(8):e010992.
- 8 30. Diaz-Canestro C, Montero D. Sex Dimorphism of VO₂max Trainability: A Systematic
9 Review and Meta-analysis. *Sports Med.* 2019;49, 1949–1956.
10 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40279-019-01180-z>
- 11 31. Parker BA, Kalasky MJ, Proctor DN. Evidence for sex differences in cardiovascular
12 aging and adaptive responses to physical activity. *Eur J Appl Physiol.* 2010;110(2):235–
13 46.
- 14 32. Witvrouwen I, Van Craenenbroeck EM, Abreu A, Moholdt T, Kränkel N. Exercise
15 training in women with cardiovascular disease: Differential response and barriers –
16 review and perspective. *Eur J Prev Cardiol.* 2019;2047487319838221.
- 17 33. Sandercock G, Hurtado V, Cardoso F. Changes in cardiorespiratory fitness in cardiac
18 rehabilitation patients: A meta-analysis. *International Journal of Cardiology.*
19 2013;167(3):894–902.
- 20 34. Rengo JL, Khadanga S, Savage PD, Ades PA. Response to Exercise Training During
21 Cardiac Rehabilitation Differs by Sex. *J Cardiopulm Rehabil Prev.* 2020;40(5):319-324.
22 doi: 10.1097/HCR.0000000000000536.

- 1 35. Tannenbaum C, Norris CM, McMurtry MS. Sex-Specific Considerations in Guidelines
2 Generation and Application. *Canadian Journal of Cardiology*. 2019;35(5):598–605.
- 3 36. Hegbom F, Stavem K, Sire S, Heldal M, Orning OM, Gjesdal K. Effects of short-term
4 exercise training on symptoms and quality of life in patients with chronic atrial
5 fibrillation. *International Journal of Cardiology*. 2007;116(1):86–92.
- 6 37. Rienstra M, Van Veldhuisen DJ, Hagens VE, Ranchor AV, Veeger NJGM, Crijns
7 HJGM, et al. Gender-Related Differences in Rhythm Control Treatment in Persistent
8 Atrial Fibrillation: Data of the Rate Control Versus Electrical Cardioversion (RACE)
9 Study. *Journal of the American College of Cardiology*. 2005;46(7):1298–306.
- 10 38. Humphries Karin H., Kerr Charles R., Connolly Stuart J., Klein George, Boone John A.,
11 Green Martin, et al. New-Onset Atrial Fibrillation. *Circulation*. 2001;103(19):2365–70.
- 12 39. Lau Dennis H., Nattel Stanley, Kalman Jonathan M, Sanders Prashanthan. Modifiable
13 Risk Factors and Atrial Fibrillation. *Circulation*. 2017;136(6):583–96.
- 14 40. Penedo FJ, Dahn JR. Exercise and well-being: a review of mental and physical health
15 benefits associated with physical activity. *Current Opinion in Psychiatry*.
16 2005;18(2):189.
- 17 41. Risom SS, Zwisler A-D, Johansen PP, Sibilitz KL, Lindschou J, Gluud C, et al.
18 Exercise-based cardiac rehabilitation for adults with atrial fibrillation. *Cochrane*
19 *Database of Systematic Reviews*. 2017;2(2):CD011197. doi:
20 10.1002/14651858.CD011197.pub2

- 1 42. Mills M, Johnson E, Zafar H, Horwood A, Lax N, Charlesworth S, et al. An exercise-
2 based cardiac rehabilitation programme for AF patients in the NHS: a feasibility study.
3 The British Journal of Cardiology. 2020;27:67–70. doi:10.5837/bjc.2020.020.
- 4 43. Reed JL, Clarke AE, Faraz AM, Birnie DH, Tulloch HE, Reid RD, et al. The Impact of
5 Cardiac Rehabilitation on Mental and Physical Health in Patients With Atrial
6 Fibrillation: A Matched Case-Control Study. Canadian Journal of Cardiology.
7 2018;34(11):1512–21.
- 8 44. Trachsel LD, Boidin M, Henri C, Fortier A, Lalongé J, Juneau M, et al. Women and
9 men with coronary heart disease respond similarly to different aerobic exercise training
10 modalities: a pooled analysis of prospective randomized trials. Appl Physiol Nutr
11 Metab. 2021;46(5):417-425. doi: 10.1139/apnm-2020-0650.
- 12 45. Way KL, Vidal-Almela S, Moholdt T, Currie KD, Aksetøy I-LA, Boidin M, et al. Sex
13 Differences in Cardiometabolic Health Indicators after HIIT in Patients with Coronary
14 Artery Disease. Medicine & Science in Sports & Exercise. 2021;53(7):1345–55.
- 15 46. Hindricks G, Potpara T, Dagres N, Arbelo E, Bax JJ, Blomström-Lundqvist C, et al.
16 2020 ESC Guidelines for the diagnosis and management of atrial fibrillation developed
17 in collaboration with the European Association of Cardio-Thoracic Surgery
18 (EACTS)The Task Force for the diagnosis and management of atrial fibrillation of the
19 European Society of Cardiology (ESC) Developed with the special contribution of the
20 European Heart Rhythm Association (EHRA) of the ESC. Eur Heart J. 2021;42(5):373-
21 498. doi: 10.1093/eurheartj/ehaa612.

- 1 47. Chung MK, Eckhardt LL, Chen LY, Ahmed HM, Gopinathannair R, Joglar JA, et al.
2 Lifestyle and Risk Factor Modification for Reduction of Atrial Fibrillation: A Scientific
3 Statement From the American Heart Association. *Circulation*. 2020;141(16).
- 4 48. Reed JL, Terada T, Way KL, Vidal-Almela S, Pipe AL, Risom SS. Exercise Targets in
5 the 2020 CCS Guidelines for the Management of Patients with Atrial Fibrillation.
6 *Canadian Journal of Cardiology*. 2021;37(10):1678-1679. doi:
7 10.1016/j.cjca.2021.04.019
- 8 49. Shamseer L, Moher D, Clarke M, Ghersi D, Liberati A, Petticrew M, et al. Preferred
9 reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015:
10 elaboration and explanation. *BMJ*. 2015;349:g7647.
- 11 50. Page MJ, McKenzie JE, Bossuyt PM, Boutron I, Hoffmann TC, Mulrow CD, et al. The
12 PRISMA 2020 statement: an updated guideline for reporting systematic reviews. *BMJ*.
13 2021;372:n71.
- 14 51. Shea BJ, Reeves BC, Wells G, Thuku M, Hamel C, Moran J, et al. AMSTAR 2: a
15 critical appraisal tool for systematic reviews that include randomised or non-randomised
16 studies of healthcare interventions, or both. *BMJ*. 2017;j4008.
- 17 52. Hannan AL, Hing W, Simas V, Climstein M, Coombes JS, Jayasinghe R, et al. High-
18 intensity interval training versus moderate-intensity continuous training within cardiac
19 rehabilitation: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Open Access J Sports Med*.
20 2018;9:1–17.
- 21 53. Caspersen CJ, Powell KE, Christenson GM. Physical activity, exercise, and physical
22 fitness: definitions and distinctions for health-related research. *Public Health Rep*.
23 1985;100(2):126–31.

- 1 54. American College of Sports Medicine. ACSM's Guidelines for Exercise Testing and
2 Prescription, 11th ed. Lippincott Williams & Wilkins; 2020.
- 3 55. Reed JL, Cotie LM, Cole CA, Harris J, Moran B, Scott K, et al. Submaximal Exercise
4 Testing in Cardiovascular Rehabilitation Settings (BEST Study). *Front Physiol.*
5 2020;10:1517.
- 6 56. Aliot E, Botto GL, Crijns HJ, Kirchhof P. Quality of life in patients with atrial
7 fibrillation: how to assess it and how to improve it. *Europace.* 2014;16(6):787–96.
- 8 57. Steinberg BA, Dorian P, Anstrom KJ, Hess R, Mark DB, Noseworthy PA, et al. Patient-
9 Reported Outcomes in Atrial Fibrillation Research: Results of a Clinicaltrials.gov
10 Analysis. *JACC: Clinical Electrophysiology.* 2019;5(5):599–605.
- 11 58. Reed JL, Terada T, Chirico D, Prince SA, Pipe AL. The Effects of Cardiac
12 Rehabilitation in Patients with Atrial Fibrillation: A Systematic Review. *Canadian*
13 *Journal of Cardiology* 2018;34(10 Suppl 2):S284-S295. doi: 10.1016/j.cjca.2018.07.014.
- 14 59. Young T, Hopewell S. Methods for obtaining unpublished data. *Cochrane Database of*
15 *Systematic Reviews.* 2011(11):MR000027. doi: 10.1002/14651858.MR000027.pub2.
- 16 60. Smart NA, Waldron M, Ismail H, Giallauria F, Vigorito C, Cornelissen V, et al.
17 Validation of a new tool for the assessment of study quality and reporting in exercise
18 training studies: TESTEX. *Int J Evid Based Healthc.* 2015;13(1):9–18.
- 19 61. Guyatt GH, Oxman AD, Vist GE, Kunz R, Falck-Ytter Y, Alonso-Coello P, et al.
20 GRADE: an emerging consensus on rating quality of evidence and strength of
21 recommendations. *BMJ.* 2008;336(7650):924–6.

- 1 62. Campbell M, McKenzie JE, Sowden A, Katikireddi SV, Brennan SE, Ellis S, et al.
2 Synthesis without meta-analysis (SWiM) in systematic reviews: reporting guideline.
3 BMJ. 2020;l6890.

- 4 63. Higgins JPT, Thompson SG, Deeks JJ, Altman DG. Measuring inconsistency in meta-
5 analyses. BMJ. 2003;327(7414):557–60.

- 6 64. Egger M, Smith GD, Schneider M, Minder C. Bias in meta-analysis detected by a
7 simple, graphical test. BMJ. 1997;315(7109):629–34.

- 8

- 9

Table 1. Example of the search strategy for MEDLINE.

Atrial Fibrillation/ ((atrial or auricular or atrium) adj3 fibril*).tw,kf. (afib or a-fib).tw,kf. ((atrial or AF) adj3 burden).tw,kf. or/1-4 Cardiac Rehabilitation/ Rehabilitation/ rh.fs. exp Exercise Therapy/ movement/ exp exercise/ physical fitness/ sport/ Martial Arts/ Bicycling/ Weight Lifting/ exp Exercise Movement Techniques/ dancing/ ((cardiac or cardiopulmonary or cardiovascular or heart or infarct or coronary) adj3 (rehab* or conditioning)).tw,kf. rehab*.ti. ((fitness or aerobic? or exercis*) adj3 (therap* or rehab* or class* or course? or program* or training? or treatment?)).tw,kf. continuous passive motion.tw,kf. ((movement or motion) adj (therap* or technique? or technic?)).tw,kf.
--

((active or ballistic or dynamic or isometric or passive or relaxed or static) adj2 stretch*).tw,kf.
muscle stretching*.tw,kf.
proprioceptive neuromuscular facilitation.tw,kf.
(PNF adj (stretch* or exercise? or therap* or technique?)).tw,kf.
((stretch or plyometric or isokinetic or isometric or isotonic) adj3 (drill? or exercise? or train* or activit*)).tw,kf.
exercis*.ti.
(physical* adj (activ* or fit* or exercis* or training? or conditioning)).tw,kf.
(calisthenics or callisthenics).tw,kf.
((interval or circuit) adj training?).tw,kf.
(jogging or running or bike? or biking or bicycl* or cycling or swimming or dancing).tw,kf.
(sport? or athletic?).tw,kf.
(martial arts or aikido or gong fu or gongfu or hap ki do or judo or jujitsu or karate or kung fu or tae kwon do or wushu).tw,kf.
(walk or ambulate? or ambulation).tw,kf.
(stair? adj2 climb*).tw,kf.
((Strength* or resistance or weight?) adj3 (training? or program*)).tw,kf.
(muscle adj2 (training? or strengthening)).tw,kf.
(pilates or yoga or ch'i kung or qi gong or qigong or tai chi or t'ai chi or ji quan or tai ji or taiji or taijiquan).tw,kw.
or/6-40
5 and 41
exp animals/
exp animal experimentation/
exp models animal/
exp vertebrates/
or/43-46

exp humans/ or exp human experimentation/
47 not 48
42 not 49
(exp infant/ or exp child/ or adolescent/) not exp adult/
50 not 51

1

2 **Additional File 1.** PRISMA-P checklist.

3 **Additional File 2.** Draft of the data extraction form.