A multicentre observational study across an integrated care system to understand the effect of living with frailty on access to video consultations

Contents

Abstract 3

Full Title of The Protocol 4
Short Study Title 4
Protocol Authors 4
Protocol Version 4

Key Study Contacts 6

Study Summary 6
Inclusion criteria: 6
Exclusion criteria: 7

Funding and Support in Kind 7

Roles and Responsibilities 7

1 Background 8

2 Research Question 9
2.1 Objectives 9
2.2 Primary aim 9
2.3 Secondary aims 9
3 Study Design and Methods of Data Collection 9
3.1 Study design 9
3.2 Data Collection 9
3.3 Variables 10
3.3 Data Storage 10
3.4 Data Analysis 11

4 Study Setting 11

5 Sample and Recruitment 11

5.1 Inclusion and exclusion 11
5.1.1 Inclusion criteria 11
5.1.2 Exclusion criteria 11
5.2 Sampling 12
5.2.1 Size of sample 12
5.2.2 Sampling technique 12
6.3 Recruitment 12
6.3.1 Sample identification 12
6.3.2 Consent 12

7 Ethical and Regulatory Considerations 12
7.1 Assessment and management of risk 12
7.2 Quality improvement 13
7.3 Amendments 13
7.4 Peer review 13
7.5 Patient Involvement 13
7.6 Access to the Final Study Dataset 13

8 Dissemination Policy 14
8.1 Dissemination policy 14
8.2 Authorship Eligibility Guidelines 14

9 References 14

Abstract

Risks for digital exclusion include older age, disability, and deprivation. No literature exists examining frailty as an additional possible risk factor. Many studies have shown frailty to be a more accurate predictor of adverse outcome in healthcare than age alone. Understanding risk factors for digital exclusion may help healthcare services appropriately tailor interventions. The Healthier Together integrated care system (HTICS) in Bristol is developing video consultations for clinics. The aim of this prospective observational cross-sectional study is to identify whether living with frailty is a risk factor of digital exclusion from video consultation. Data will be collected using a structured survey including patients from three sites across the Heal secondary care services at North Bristol Trust, and then two subsequent sites will be included across HTICS. Data will be collected on known risk factors for digital exclusion, frailty using the Clinical Frailty Scale, and will cover four domains for digital exclusion as defined by NHS Digital: access, skill, motivation, and confidence. Data will be presented with descriptive statistics. The association between frailty and outcomes will be analysed with a multivariable logistic regression.

Full Title of The Protocol

A protocol for a multicentre observational study across an integrated care system to understand the effect of living with frailty on access to video consultations.

Short Study Title

Access-VIGIL: Access to Video In Geriatric Intervention cLinic

Protocol Authors

Name	Job Role/Division	Roles and Responsibilities
Dr Matthew Shorthose	Internal Medical Trainee, North Bristol Trust	Study design, protocol review, analysis, write-up
Dr Nick Watts	Specialist Registrar Geriatric Medicine, North Bristol Trust	Study design, protocol review, analysis, write-up
Dr Ben Carter	Honorary Reader in Biostatistics, North Bristol Trust	Study design, protocol review, analysis, write-up
Bekah Evans	Clinical Commissioning Group, NHS Bristol, North Somerset and South Gloucestershire	Study design, protocol review
Samuel Jeynes	Clinical Commissioning Group, NHS Bristol, North Somerset and South Gloucestershire	Study design, protocol review
Sue Wensley	Geriatrician, North Bristol Trust and University of West of England	Study design, protocol review
Dr Philip Braude	Academic Geriatrician, North Bristol Trust and University of West of England	Chief investigator, study design, protocol review, analysis, write-up

Protocol Version

Version Research Reference Numbers

QI Number: QI45607

Funders Number: Not Applicable

Date: 14th April 2022

Key Study Contacts

Chief Investigator	Philip Braude, philip.braude@nbt.nhs.uk
Study Co-ordinator	Philip Braude, philip.braude@nbt.nhs.uk
Sponsor	North Bristol NHS Trust
Joint-sponsor(s)/co-sponsor(s)	n/a
Funder(s)	Indirect funding: Philip Braude is supported by Research Capability Funding from North Bristol Research and Innovation Department, and has a Bristol Health Research Fellowship
Key Protocol Contributors	Dr Matthew Shorthose, Internal Medical Trainee, North Bristol Trust Dr Nick Watts, Specialist Registrar Geriatric Medicine, North Bristol Trust Dr Ben Carter, Honorary Reader in Biostatistics, North Bristol Trust Susan Wensley, Consultant in Geriatric Medicine, North Bristol Trust Bekah Evans, NHS Bristol, North Somerset and South Gloucestershire Samuel Jeynes, NHS Bristol, North Somerset and South Gloucestershire

Study Summary

Study Title	A multicentre observational study across an integrated care system to understand the effect of living with frailty on access to video consultations.
Short title	Access-VIGIL: Access to Video In Geriatric Intervention cLinic
Study Design	Prospective observational cross sectional study
Study Participants	Inclusion criteria: - Aged 18 years old or over Any population from: 1) Secondary care: - Patients referred to fracture clinic from an emergency department, or minor injury unit, or GP - Patients admitted to hospital with a fracture 2) Hospital at Home - Patients booked in for hospital at home appointment

	3) Primary care: - Patients with a booked appointment in primary care Exclusion criteria: - Under 18 years old - Expected to die during hospital admission or being provided with end-of-life care in the community
Planned Size of Sample (if applicable)	220 patients
Follow up duration (if applicable)	No follow-up is planned
Planned Study Period	February to June 2022
Research Question/Aim(s)	To examine the effect of living with frailty on digital exclusion as defined by: 1) Access to video consultation technology 2) Access measured by the domains: i) motivation, ii) confidence, iii) skills

Funding and Support in Kind

Funders	**Financial and Non-Financial**
Research Capability Funding from North Bristol Research and Innovation Department.	Not directly for this study - financial

Role of Study Sponsor and Funder

The pilot at North Bristol Trust (NBT) is overseen by Neuromusculoskeletal (NMSK) Division governance. NBT NMSK Division takes responsibility for ensuring that the design of the study meets appropriate standards and that arrangements are in place to ensure appropriate conduct and reporting. Governance oversight for Hospital at Home was registered with NBT NMSK, and for primary care with Horfield Health Centre.

Roles and Responsibilities

Key Words: Frailty, geriatric medicine, videoconsultation, information technology, digital inclusion, digital exclusion

Study Flow Chart

	Nov-21	Dec-21	Jan-22	Feb-22	Mar-22	Apr-22	May-22	Jun-22

Study Design								
Research governance								
Research data collection								
Pilot Completed								
Identify sites								
Survey completed								
Transcription of data								
Analysis								
Write-up								
Submission for publication								

1 Background

Since the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic, services have increasingly been held via video or telephone (1). Even prior to the pandemic the NHS Long Term Plan and the Royal College of Physicians were calling for alternatives to face-to-face consultations (2). For this to be a long term successful strategy patients should not be excluded from accessing these resources(3,4). As part of this move towards increased used of digital resources, we should aim to offer the right type of clinic to the right people and to identify the kind of help needed to access video clinics.

Risk factors for digital exclusion include certain ethnic groups, deprivation, and older age. However, many older people have excellent access to digital technology (5). One risk factor that has not been explored is living with frailty. Frailty is a state of reduced physiological and cognitive reserve to cope with a stressor. It is often associated with other geriatric syndromes such as cognitive and physical deterioration. One study set in Finland has identified a link between the 3-point study of osteoporotic fracture (SOF) index and reduced ICT use, independent of age (6), but no studies using other frailty scores have been performed.

The Clinical Frailty Scale (CFS) is a tool which was originally designed as a way of summarizing the overall fitness or frailty of an older adult (7). It gives a score of 1-9 after evaluating specific domains including comorbidity, function, and cognition (8). It can be used at the start of a patient pathway to appropriately stream patients into tailored pathways of care.

This cross-sectional observational study will aim to identify whether living with frailty is a risk factor of digital exclusion from video consultation. The UK government defined exclusion from digital technology using four key domains: 1) access 2) skills 3) motivation, and 4) confidence (3). We will complete a pilot study at North Bristol Trust, and then will be inviting patients to participate in the study from secondary care, interface care, and primary care across an Integrated Care System.

2 Research Question

2.1 Objectives

To examine the effect of living with frailty on digital exclusion as defined by access to video consultation as measured by four domains:

a. Technology access to video consultation

b. Motivation to use video consultation

c. Confidence in video consultation

d. Skills in video consultation

2.2 Primary aim

The primary aim of digital exclusion will be defined as no access to a computer with webcam, smartphone with camera, or tablet with camera.

2.3 Secondary aims

Secondary aims include

- Access to technology through a carer defined as access to another person's computer with webcam, smartphone with camera, or tablet with camera.
- exploration of motivation, confidence, and skills in video consultation

3 Study Design and Methods of Data Collection

3.1 Study design

A cross-sectional observational study will be undertaken. A pilot was run at North Bristol Trust with additional sites identified subsequently across the integrated care system. A structured survey will be used designed by key stakeholders using questions from a question bank on digital technology (9).

3.2 Data Collection

Data will be collected using a semi-structured survey either in person or by telephone.

Basic demographic variables will be taken from patient's notes, if possible, except for Clinical Frailty Score which will be determined by the interviewer at the beginning of the survey. If a variable is not available from a patient's notes, it will be asked at the beginning of the survey. Each interviewer will have completed online training regarding the Clinical Frailty Score prior to conducting interviews.

In testing, survey completion takes four minutes. The survey will be conducted by four methods depending on the population, each using a standardized case reporting form:

1) for patients admitted – data collection in person
2) for patients discharged – in person at clinic or by telephone / video
3) for patients in interface care – in person at clinic or by telephone / video

4) for patients in primary care – in person while at the surgery or by telephone / video

3.3 Variables

Basic demographics to be included: age, sex (male, female), frailty (Clinical Frailty Scale 1-9), ethnicity (using Gov.uk list (9)), index of multiple deprivation (postcode convert to 1-10), co-morbidity (Charlson comorbidity index), living situation (House, flat, assisted living, care home).

Sensory impairment – reading difficulty (considerable, moderate, no); hearing difficulty (considerable, moderate, no); memory impairment (yes, no); cognitive diagnosis.

For access to technology – access to devices: ownership (computer with webcam, smartphone, tablet); access to someone else's (computer with webcam, smartphone, tablet); internet access (yes and use, yes don't use, no access, don't know).

For skills – Able to join a video call (yes, no); set up (patient, friend, relative, carer, other); could they assist again (yes, no). Ability for videocall (Excellent , good, fair, poor, bad, don't know). Other online tools: social communication, social media, entertainment, personal finance, household tasks, apps for health, apps for health tasks (yes, no)

For confidence – Confidence (very, quite, neither confident or unconfident, not very, not at all, don't know)

For motivation – Usage in last 12 months – computer (yes - no difficulty, with difficulty, no); smartphone (yes - no difficulty, with difficulty, no); tablet (yes - no difficulty, with difficulty, no). Internet usage frequency (More than once a day, once a day, almost every day, at least weekly, used within the last 3 months, between 3 months and a year ago, more than a year ago, never used the internet)

Domain	Access	Skills	Confidence	Motivation
Questions	4, 6	9, 10	11	5, 7, 8

3.3 Data Storage

Data will be recorded either directly into a bespoke spreadsheet or a standardized case reporting paper form. Paper case reporting forms will be transcribed to the spreadsheet and then destroyed.

Electronic data will be stored securely on North Bristol Trust servers. Access to the data will be by the study team only through a password protected file. Paper case reporting forms prior to transcription to the electronic database will be stored in a locked filing cabinet in a key card access area of the hospital for staff only.

Data will be kept for 3 years after the study closes in of case external requests to verify published material. Participants' contact details will be stored separately from the data entry spreadsheet. A unique key will be used to identify patients via a study ID number only.

3.4 Data Analysis

We will use a multivariable logistic regression to fit the association between digital inclusion and CFS (1-3, 4-5, 6-8). Our primary analysis will adjust for: enrolment site, age group (under 65 years old, 65-79, 80 or over), Charlson comorbidity index (1-2, 3-4, 5+), index of multiple deprivation (1-3, 4-7, 8-10). We will present the adjusted Odds ratio (aOR) alongside the crude OR, and p-values. All analyses will be carried out within Stata v17 (or later).

4 Study Setting

Three sites across the Healthier Together integrated care system will be included. Healthier Together is a partnership across Bristol, North Somerset and South Gloucestershire with the aim of providing joined up services across the population.

The pilot site for the study will be the secondary care services delivered for acute fractures in North Bristol Trust, which is the largest hospital in South West England. The two subsequent sites will be an interface care setting and a primary care setting. The interface care will be North Bristol Trust Hospital at Home service which delivers acute healthcare to patients in the comfort of their own home as an alternative to hospital admission. Treatments include administration of intravenous antibiotics, blood monitoring, wound care, and welfare calls. The primary care setting will be Horfield Health Centre providing services to 16,500 patients from North Bristol including areas Lockleaze, Horfield and parts of Ashley Down, Henleaze, Filton and Northville.

5 Sample and Recruitment

5.1 Inclusion and exclusion

5.1.1 Inclusion criteria

- Aged 18 years old or over

And any population from:

1) Secondary care:
- Patients referred to fracture clinic from an emergency department, or minor injury unit, or GP
- Patients admitted to hospital with a fracture
2) Hospital at Home
- Patients booked in for Hospital at Home appointment
3) Primary care:
- Patients with a booked appointment in general practice

5.1.2 Exclusion criteria

- Under 18 years old
- Expected to die during hospital admission or being provided with end-of-life care in the community

5.2 Sampling

5.2.1 Size of sample

Liu et al (10) found an ~40% reduction in odds in those living with frailty having digital access. Using Liu we have assumed that 80% of those not living with frailty and 60% of those that are living with frailty will have digital access. Using a Chi-squared test with 90% power and with a 5% significance level to detect this difference 220 patients would need to be enrolled into the study.

5.2.2 Sampling technique

Data will be collected prospectively. Convenience sampling will be used. Patients will be contacted during the study period until the sample size has been reached. A target sample population of 100 patients in each setting will be set.

6.3 Recruitment

6.3.1 Sample identification

Healthier Together ICS:

- North Bristol Trust: Patients will be identified prospectively over one week through referral to fracture clinic from Southmead Emergency Department, Yate Minor Injuries Unit, or their GP. Patients admitted to Southmead Hospital will be identified by the inpatient major trauma team and by the orthogeriatric team as part of their normal referral system and inpatient management. Preliminary data showed around 30 patients would be seen per a day.

- North Bristol Hospital at Home: Patients will be identified retrospectively over 3 months, with data collected prospectively, from those booked into the hospital at home team at North Bristol Trust. Preliminary data showed 30 patients would be seen per month.

- Horfield Health Centre: Patients will be identified prospectively over one week by those booked into an appointment at their local clinic. Preliminary data showed 150 patients would be seen per day.

6.3.2 Consent

Consent will not be required given this study is being conducted as part of a service evaluation in developing a new videoconsultation bone health follow-up clinic and perioperative clinic.

7 Ethical and Regulatory Considerations

7.1 Assessment and management of risk

It is not anticipated that the survey will cause any distress or problems to patients. However, it can be anticipated that certain risks in contacting patients can be mitigated:

1. If patients have questions as to their clinical follow-up they will be advised they will hear from the clinic with a time, or we will be able to give them the time and date if it has already been arranged.

2. If patients have medical questions as to their current management, they will be directed to either contact their GP, return to the emergency department, or to call the number on their appointment letter.

7.2 Quality improvement

Three service evaluations have been brought together under the banner of one cross-sectional study. All three services are using or have aspirations to develop video consultation services. Given the service evaluation nature of the study it has been registered with the Quality and Safety Improvement Team of North Bristol NHS Trust. It was deemed in discussion with the lead for the Quality and Safety Improvement Team that ethical approval was not required given the data collected were to be directly used to evaluate current service delivery and allow further service development. The study has been reviewed by the quality improvement leads for each site and registered locally. Approval registration IDs can be found on the front page of this protocol.

7.3 Amendments

Any study amendments will be submitted for review by the QI governance lead at each of the sites.

7.4 Peer review

The protocol has been reviewed by the Chief Investigator and study management group prior to being sent for assesssment. The QI governance lead for NMSK at North Bristol Trust has reviewed the pilot protocol. Each QI lead will review the protocl at local sites.

7.5 Patient Involvement

Patient involvement

- In development of the pilot work 67 service user's feedback from a telephone survey has been published (11).
- The department of medicine for older people service user group was consulted
- Conversations occurred with ten patients from the user group having used the geriatric medicine clinic

7.6 Access to the Final Study Dataset

The anonymized data will only be available to the Chief Investigator (Philip Braude) and the study management group named in the protocol. Responses will be anonymised. Files will be password protected and stored on the hospital's secure server, only accessible from a local service-maintained computer with employee login. Any transfer of data required will occur only using secure servers and encrypted files.

In line with many peer reviewed journal's policy for data sharing, data sharing may be offered to third parties only on request to the study CI with review by the study sponsor to ensure legitimate academic interest. Data will be shared with anonymous records if deemed appropriate, arranged via data sharing agreement, and transferred using secure systems. If requests originate from outside the EU this will be discussed with the study sponsor.

8 Dissemination Policy

8.1 Dissemination policy

The data will be owned by North Bristol Trust as the sponsor. On completion of the study the data will be analysed and a study report completed.

It will be disseminated locally via the trust operational update and events, as well as more widely through national and international conference presentations. A summary of the work will be submitted for peer-reviewed publications.

8.2 Authorship Eligibility Guidelines

Authorship will take into account all persons involved in the study design, analysis and write up. This will be accurately reflected when any papers are submitted for peer-reviewed publication.

9 References

1. COVID-19 IG advice [Internet]. NHSX. [cited 2022 Jan 5]. Available from: https://www.nhsx.nhs.uk/information-governance/guidance/covid-19-ig-advice/

2. nhs-long-term-plan-version-1.2.pdf [Internet]. [cited 2022 Jan 5]. Available from: https://www.longtermplan.nhs.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/nhs-long-term-plan-version-1.2.pdf

3. Digital inclusion for health and social care [Internet]. NHS Digital. [cited 2022 Jan 4]. Available from: https://digital.nhs.uk/about-nhs-digital/our-work/digital-inclusion

4. Economics J. Digital Inclusion Evaluation Toolkit [Internet]. Just Economics. Just Economics; 2022 [cited 2022 Jan 10]. Available from: https://www.justeconomics.co.uk/digital-inclusion/government-digital-service-outcomes-framework

5. How are older people adapting to digital technology during the COVID-19 pandemic | Centre for Ageing Better [Internet]. [cited 2022 Jan 5]. Available from: https://ageing-better.org.uk/blogs/how-are-older-people-adapting-digital-technology-during-covid-19-pandemic

6. Keränen NS, Kangas M, Immonen M, Similä H, Enwald H, Korpelainen R, et al. Use of Information and Communication Technologies Among Older People With and Without Frailty: A Population-Based Survey. J Med Internet Res. 2017 Feb 14;19(2):e29.

7. Rockwood K, Song X, MacKnight C, Bergman H, Hogan DB, McDowell I, et al. A global clinical measure of fitness and frailty in elderly people. CMAJ. 2005 Aug 30;173(5):489–95.

8. Church S, Rogers E, Rockwood K, Theou O. A scoping review of the Clinical Frailty Scale. BMC Geriatr. 2020 Dec;20(1):393.

9. List of ethnic groups [Internet]. [cited 2022 Jan 5]. Available from: https://www.ethnicity-facts-figures.service.gov.uk/style-guide/ethnic-groups

10. Liu L, Goodarzi Z, Jones A, Posno R, Straus SE, Watt JA. Factors associated with virtual care access in older adults: a cross-sectional study. Age Ageing. 2021 Jun 28;50(4):1412–5.

11. Joughin A, Ibitoye S, Crees A, Shipway D, Braude P. Developing a virtual geriatric perioperative medicine clinic: a mixed methods healthcare improvement study. Age Ageing. 2021 May 15;afab066.