1 Metagenomic analysis of antimicrobial resistance genes in wastewaters in Benin and Burkina Faso indicates a
2 serious health risk from untreated hospital wastewaters in low-income countries
3

4 Melina A. Markkanen[a]#, Kaisa Haukka[a, f], Katariina M. M. Pärnänen[a], Victorien Tamegnon Dougnon[b], Isidore
5 Juste O. Bonkoungou[c], Zakaria Garba[d], Halidou Tinto[d], Anniina Sarekoski[a], Antti Karkman[a], Anu Kantele[e, f]*,
6 Marko P. J. Virta[a]#*
7
[a] Department of Microbiology, University of Helsinki, Finland
[b] Research Unit in Applied Microbiology and Pharmacology of Natural Substances, Polytechnic School of
Abomey-Calavi, University of Abomey-Calavi, Benin
[c] Department of Biochemistry and Microbiology, University Joseph KI-ZERBO, Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso
[d] Clinical Research Unit Nanoro, Institute for Research in Health Sciences, National Center for Scientific and
Technological Research, Burkina Faso
[e] Meilahti Infectious Diseases and Vaccine Research Center, MeiVac, Department of Infectious Diseases,
University of Helsinki and Helsinki University Hospital, Helsinki, Finland
[f] Human Microbiome Research Program, Faculty of Medicine, University of Helsinki, Helsinki, Finland
17
18 Corresponding authors:
19 # Marko P. J. Virta, marko.virta@helsinki.fi
20 # Melina A. Markkanen, melina.markkanen@helsinki.fi
21 * Equal contribution

22
23 Running title
24 HWW resistomes in Benin, Burkina Faso, and Finland
25
26 Abstract
27

Antimicrobial resistance (AMR) is one of the greatest global threats to human health, but substantial gaps in AMR
data exist in West African countries. We explored the presence of antimicrobial resistance genes (ARGs) in the
hospital wastewaters (HWW) of nine hospitals in Benin and Burkina Faso and, for comparison, four hospitals in
Finland using shotgun metagenomic sequencing. The highest relative sum abundance of ARGs in HWWs was
observed in Benin and the lowest in Finland. HWW resistomes were more similar to each other in Benin and
Burkina Faso than in Finland. Different carbapenemases were detected in varying abundances, especially in
HWWs from Burkina Faso and Finland. The most widespread carbapenemase gene in the Beninese hospitals,
blaGES, was also found in water used for handwashing. blaNDM was present in the HWW of one Beninese
hospital and was also detected in the stools of a hospitalized patient. Mobile colistin resistance genes (mcr) were
detected in the HWWs of all the three studied countries, with mcr-5 variants being the most common. These and
other mcr genes were observed in very high abundance in treated wastewater released into rivers in Burkina Faso.
In Benin, only little is done to treat wastewaters, including HWWs. The results provide evidence for public health

decision-makers in Benin and Burkina Faso for the dire need to increase wastewater treatment capacity, with
particular attention to HWWs.
42

Keywords
antimicrobial resistance (AMR)
West Africa
hospital wastewater (HWW)
carbapenemase
colistin resistance
metagenomes

50
51 1. Introduction
52
The AMR crisis is a global issue with multifaceted effects on human, animal, and environmental health, and it
comes with substantial economic losses (1). Resistance to almost all antibiotics, including the last resort regimen
reserved to treat the most severe infections, has tended to emerge only a couple of years after introducing a new
antibiotic to the global market (2, 3). Due to limitations in diagnostic testing in low-resource settings in low-
income countries (LICs), broad-spectrum antibiotics are often prescribed empirically without microbiological
verification of the causative pathogen or its sensitivity to different antibiotics (4). In addition, unregulated access
to antimicrobials allows their wide use in these countries (5–7).
60
Bacterial resistance to antimicrobial compounds may be intrinsic or acquired from other bacteria or the
surrounding environment via horizontal gene transfer of mobile genetic elements (MGE) (8–10). Acquired,
potentially mobile ARGs are considered to have greater clinical relevance and impact the current AMR problem
induced by human activity (10, 11). Class 1 integrons are strongly linked to the dissemination of clinically relevant
acquired ARGs (12, 13). Although integrons are not mobile themselves, integron-carried multidrug-resistance
gene cassettes can be transmitted to new hosts, for example, via plasmids (14). The gene encoding the integron
integrase (*intI*), among other associated genes, is involved in the recombination of incoming genetic material into
the gene cassette, and *intI1* is typically used as a marker for class 1 integrons (13, 15). Over time, quaternary
ammonium compound (QAC) resistance genes, such as *qacEΔ*, have established their position in the structure of
a typical class 1 integron gene cassette whose spread is induced by human activity (15, 16). It has been speculated
that increasing the use of such disinfectant compounds in hospitals and community environments, especially
during the COVID-19 pandemic, would further exacerbate the problem of multidrug resistance mediated by class
1 integrons (17).
74
75 The high-risk ESKAPEEc bacteria (9) (*Enterococcus faecium, Staphylococcus aureus, Klebsiella pneumoniae,*
76 *Acinetobacter baumannii, Pseudomonas aeruginosa, Enterobacter* spp., *and Escherichia coli*) (18) are top
77 priority pathogens for AMR research and the development of new antibiotics (9, 19). They can feature an
78 impressive resistance profile in terms of both intrinsic and acquired ARGs and often exhibit multidrug-resistant
79 phenotypes. However, investigating only bacterial isolates may result in a limited understanding of ARGs

occurring in a particular hospital. In contrast, shotgun metagenomic sequencing enables the analysis of resistomes and mobilomes (all ARGs or MGEs, respectively) as well as the microbial communities present in the studied environment (20). Hence, as opposed to PCR-based methods, there is no requirement for a priori knowledge of the resistome (20).

As a consequence of the increased prevalence of extended-spectrum beta-lactamase-producing Enterobacteriaceae (ESBL-PE), the use of broad-spectrum antibiotics has increased in clinical practice (2, 21, 22). Tracking down the spread of ESBL genes is, in many situations, no longer feasible or relevant, and attention has been directed to plasmid-mediated genes that encode carbapenemases. The carbapenemases *bla*GES, *bla*IMP, *bla*KPC, *bla*NDM, *bla*OXA-48, *bla*OXA-58, and *bla*VIM carried by plasmids have emerged and spread around the world during the past three decades (23–26).

Metronidazole is an example of an empirically widely used first-line treatment in many African countries (27). This antimicrobial drug is effective against various protozoan parasites and anaerobic bacteria (28). Although acquired resistance towards metronidazole (mediated mainly by *nim* genes) is considered to be relatively rare, an increasing trend in its emergence has been reported (28). Colistin is a last-resort antibiotic used for treating infections caused by multidrug and extensively resistant bacteria (29). The rapid emergence of mobile colistin resistance mediated by *mcr* genes threatens the efficacy of colistin in clinical use (30, 31).

Although AMR is of global concern, the crisis affects most dramatically LICs, such as those in West Africa (3, 4, 32–34). Lack of research data is a major factor hindering the development of solutions to tackle the AMR problem in these countries (4, 32, 35, 36). Despite gaps in resistance surveillance data, it is well known that the level of AMR is highest in many LICs, such as in many African countries (21, 33, 37, 38). By contrast, in Northern European countries, such as Finland, AMR occurrence is among the lowest globally, both in the community (38, 39) and healthcare settings (40).

As hospital wastewater (HWW) from healthcare facilities is considered to be at the frontline of AMR emergence and spread (41), we set out to investigate the AMR situation and the characteristics of the resistomes in nine hospitals in two West African countries, Benin and Burkina Faso, where prior data was scarce (21). For comparison, we analyzed samples from four hospitals in Finland, where the level of AMR was expected to be low (40). In this study, we applied shotgun metagenomic sequencing as it allows the analysis of the total catalog of genes present in the studied environment.

2. Results

   2.1. Features of hospital wastewaters in Benin, Burkina Faso, and Finland

We analyzed hospital wastewater-associated resistomes from Benin, Burkina Faso, and Finland. On average, 31 million sequence reads per sample were analyzed. HWWs from Benin showed the highest, and from Burkina Faso the second-highest abundance of all detected ARGs normalized to bacterial 16S rRNA genes, here referred to as

the relative sum abundance of ARGs. The lowest relative sum abundance was detected in HWWs from Finland

(Figure 1A, Table S3A). No significant differences were observed in the relative ARG sums among the different

hospitals in each country or between the hospital sections or wards within the sampled hospitals (Table S3A).

Country-wise differences for the relative abundances of class 1 integron gene (*intI1*) (Figure 1C, Table S3C)

followed the trend observed for relative ARG abundances (Figure 1A). The observed high Pearson correlation of

0.80 (p = 3.2×10^{-16}) between ARGs and intI1 genes across all 67 HWW samples indicated an association between

the genes. For all MGEs, including also other than class 1 integron associated genes, a similar trend was not

observed (Figure 1B, Table S3B).

The resistomes of HWWs from Benin and Burkina Faso resembled each other more than those of the Finnish

HWWs (Figure 2A). The resistomes in Benin and Burkina Faso shared 384 ARGs, while Finland and Benin shared

only 15 ARGs, and Finland and Burkina Faso shared 134 ARGs (Figure S4). The resistome compositions differed

the most between the Beninese and Finnish HWW samples (Figure 2A). The country explained the differences in

the resistomes by 29.5–33.7 % in the Benin-Finland comparison and 24.5–25.6 % in the Burkina Faso-Finland

comparison (Table S1). In addition, while the ARGs found uniquely in HWWs from Burkina Faso made up

approximately 14 % of all the detected ARGs in this study, the corresponding percentage for HWWs from Benin

was only 2.5 % (Figure S4).

As the resistomes of West African countries and Finland were divergent, the drivers for the differences were

subsequently investigated. The country explained less of the variance between taxonomical compositions than

resistomes (Figure 2B, Table S1). A set of samples from a single hospital (Hospital I, Figure S3B) seemed to drive

the distinct clustering seen in the microbial community in HWWs from Burkina Faso.

Figure 1. Relative sum abundance of ARGs, MGEs, and class 1 integrons. A generalized linear model (GLM)

was fitted to 16S rRNA, and gene length normalized A) ARG B) MGE, and C) *intI1* count data to model the

differences in the levels of these genes in the three countries. The vertical line shows the median in boxplots,

while the lower and higher hinges denote the 25 % and 75 % quantiles, respectively. In addition, Wilcoxon signed-

rank test significances are shown for pair-wise comparisons.

Benin • Burkina Faso • Finland

Figure 2. PCoA plots describe the ordinations based on A) resistomes, B) taxonomical compositions, and C) mobilomes in HWWs from Benin, Burkina Faso, and Finland. All 67 HWW samples were included in the plots. However, due to unequal group sizes, groups of random sample sets were applied for testing the significance of the clustering based on the country using adonis. The tests were performed in triplicate with different samples to account for variation caused by sample selection. The R^2 values are shown in Supporting Information, Table S1. Confidence ellipses represent 90 % confidence levels.

2.2. Clinically relevant taxa and associated ARGs

Taxonomical composition present in septic tanks and sumps in Benin and Burkina Faso differed from those found in hospital sewers in Finland. In Benin and Burkina Faso, the 15 most abundant genera present in HWW included *Desulfobulbus, Sulfurospirillum, Thauera,* and *Geobacter*, while in Finnish HWW, *Bifidobacterium* and *Faecalibacterium* were among the most abundant genera (Table S4). Genera known for opportunistically pathogenic species such as *Escherichia* and *Aeromonas* were detected among the 15 most abundant genera in the HWWs of all three countries (Table S4, Figure S5). *Klebsiella pneumoniae* was among the 15 most abundant species in Benin and Burkina Faso in terms of relative abundance (Table S4, Figure S5). In contrast, at the species level, *Escherichia coli, Enterococcus faecium*, and species of *Enterobacter cloacae* and *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* complexes were present but rare in all the countries. *Staphylococcus aureus* was detected exclusively in Burkinabe samples (Figure S5). Other species in the genus *Staphylococcus* were more commonly detected in HWWs from Benin, and Burkina Faso compared to Finland (Tables S5A and S6A). However, knowing the limitations of species-level taxa identification using shotgun metagenomics (42), these results must be evaluated with some caution.

There was no significant difference (adjusted p-value < 0.05) in the abundance of the genus *Acinetobacter* between

the HWWs from the three countries, but the abundances of different species of *Acinetobacter* varied significantly.

A. johnsonii and carbapenemases in the *bla*OXA-211-like group (for example, *bla*OXA-211, -212, -280, and -281)

that are intrinsically carried by this species were significantly more abundant in HWWs from Finland compared

to either Benin or Burkina Faso (Figure 4, Figure S5 and Tables S5A, S6A, S7, and S8). Certain species of

Acinetobacter that are not intrinsically carbapenem-resistant, such as *A. townerii*, were detected at significantly

higher relative abundances in HWWs from Benin and Burkina Faso compared to Finland (Tables S5A, and S6A).

2.3.   Carbapenem resistance

The presence of seven acquired carbapenemases (*bla*GES, *bla*IMP, *bla*KPC, *bla*NDM, *bla*OXA-48, *bla*OXA-58,

and *bla*VIM) was analyzed in detail due to their ability to cause complex infections with minimal treatment options

when in a relevant host. One of the Finnish (hospital K) samples possessed the highest relative abundance of these

carbapenemases (Figure 3A). This hospital is the University Central Hospital of the capital of Finland. In HWWs

from Benin, the carbapenemase genes in the *bla*GES family seemed to dominate over other carbapenemases in

all four hospitals (Figure 3A). Instead, most of the other carbapenemases were present at similar prevalence levels

in HWWs from Burkina Faso and Finland (Figure 3A), in line with the observation of the lower number of

different ARGs in Benin versus Burkina Faso (Figure S4).

*bla*VIM, *bla*IMP, and *bla*NDM were detected in Burkinabe and Finnish HWW samples, but they were more

abundant in HWWs from Burkina Faso (Figure 3A). Among the studied acquired oxacillinases, *bla*OXA-48 was

detected solely in two samples from Burkina Faso (Figure 3A). Instead, *bla*OXA-58 was present in the majority

of Burkinabe and Finnish samples (Figure 3A). Interestingly, most *bla*KPC genes were exclusively detected in

HWWs from Finland (Figure 3A, Table S11).

Figure 3. The abundance of carbapenemase genes in relation to 16S rRNA genes in A) HWWs from Benin, Burkina Faso, and Finland, and B) various other sample types in Benin and Burkina Faso. The hospital code (Figure 3A) and sample names (Figure 3B) are marked on the x-axis. Only the *bla*GES genes that encode carbapenemase production (*bla*GES-2, -4, -5, -6, -14, -16, -20 (25)) according to the Beta-lactamase Database (43) are shown, omitting the *bla*GES genes that encode ESBL. All screened carbapenemase gene variants are listed in Supporting Information, Table S18.

2.4. Putative role of MGEs and class 1 integrons in shaping HWW resistomes

Three methods were used to study whether the abundance of class 1 integrons could explain the differences in the relative sum abundances of ARGs between the HWWs of the three countries (as shown in Figure 1A). First, correlations between the relative abundances of the detected ARGs and the two class 1 integron-associated genes, *intI1* and *qacEΔ*, were studied (Tables S12A and S12B). These correlations were visualized for those ARGs differentially abundant in HWWs from each country in pair-wise comparisons (Figure 4). Second, contigs carrying the *intI1* gene were studied for the putative co-localization of ARG sequences (Table S13). Third, fragments carrying multiple acquired ARGs were screened visually using assembly graphs (Figure S6).

The top 20 ARGs that were more abundant in the Beninese HWWs showed stronger positive correlations with class 1 integron genes compared to the ARGs that were more abundant in Burkina Faso and Finland (Figure 4).

This suggests a stronger class I integron association of ARGs in Beninese HWWs than in the other two countries.
The detection of some of these ARGs in contigs carrying several other acquired ARGs (Figure S6) or class 1
integron-associated genes (Table S13) suggests that the genes are linked to class 1 integrons. For example, the
plasmid-mediated ARGs *qnrVC4* and *qnrVC5* strongly correlated with *intI1* and *qacEΔ*. The genes were located
on contigs with other ARGs such as aminoglycoside ARGs and either carbapenemase (Figure S6) or ESBL genes
in the *bla*GES gene family (Figure S6B). While *qnrVC4* and *qnrVC5* were more abundant in HWWs from Benin
and Burkina Faso than in those from Finland, quinolone ARGs unassociated with integrons, such as *qnrB* variants,
were instead more common in HWWs from Finland (Figure 4, and Tables S7, and S8).

Oxacillinases constituted half of the top 20 most abundant ARGs in HWWs from Finland (Figure 4). Most of
these oxacillinases (*bla*OXA-211, -212, -334, -373, -309, -280, and -281) belong to the group of *bla*OXA-211-
like carbapenemases typically intrinsically carried by certain *Acinetobacter* species and showed no significant
correlation with intiI1 or *qacEΔ* (Figure 4, Tables S12A and S12B). In contrast, certain genes of oxacillinases
from other *bla*OXA gene families, which were significantly more abundant in HWWs from Benin or Burkina
Faso, showed significant correlation with intI1 and *qacEΔ* (Figure 4, Tables S12A and S12B) and were found in
shared contigs with the *intI1* gene and other ARGs (Table S13, Figure S6C).

Differentially abundant ARGs in HWWs from Benin vs. Finland

Differentially abundant ARGs in HWWs from Burkina Faso vs. Finland

Figure 4. Differently abundant ARGs in HWWs from Benin and Burkina Faso and their putative associations with class 1 integrons. 20 significantly more abundant ARGs in HWWs of each country in pair-wise comparisons (Benin-Finland, Burkina Faso-Finland) are shown. Pearson correlations between each ARG and the genes *intI1* and *qacEΔ* associated with class 1 integrons (Supporting Information, Tables S12A, and S12B) are denoted with color-coding. The red color indicates a positive and blue negative correlation. Non-significant (*p* > 0.05) correlations are marked as blank (white) squares.

2.5. Mobile colistin resistance genes

Mobile colistin resistance genes (*mcr* genes) were observed in several HWW samples in Benin, Burkina Faso, and Finland (Table S16). Variants of *mcr-5* (*mcr-5.1* and *mcr-5.2*) were the most common as they were found in HWWs from all except one hospital (hospital F) in the three countries. We were able to confirm the location of *mcr-5* within a Tn3-like transposase element in the metagenome-assembled contigs (Figure S7, Table S14).

In addition to the HWW samples, high relative abundances of *mcr-5* genes were also detected in the immediate and more distant surroundings of the hospitals, such as in the street gutter water 100 m away from hospital B and in the soil between two HWW septic tanks in Benin (Table S15A). For hospital C, the relative abundance of *mcr-5* in a puddle surrounding the surgery room HWW septic tank was greater than the average relative sum abundance of *mcr-5* in the actual HWW septic tanks of that hospital (Figure S2D, Table S15A).

In Burkina Faso, very high relative sum abundances (2.8×10^{-2}) of *mcr-5* were observed in a municipality channel leading out from hospital I after passing through a biological treatment process (Table S15B). Furthermore, the presence of *mcr-5* was also detected in a nearby wetland where the processed wastewater is released (Table S15B). Similarly, in another Burkinabe city, *mcr-5* was found in a sample before wastewater treatment and the river receiving the water after treatment (Table S15B).

The next most prevalent *mcr* genes, namely *mcr-3, mcr-10,* and *mcr-7,* were detected in certain cases at very high relative abundances in the HWW samples (Table S16). The gene *mcr-3* was also present in the water used for handwashing at hospital C (Figure S2E, Table S15A). The gene *mcr-2* was not detected, and the lowest possible average relative sum abundance was detected for the gene *mcr-1* (Table S16).

2.6. Other than hospital wastewater samples

Other sample types within and outside the studied hospitals were investigated to obtain a more comprehensive understanding of ARG prevalence. Metronidazole resistance genes, such as *nimA* and *nimE*, were among the top 15 most abundant ARGs in the fecal samples of the four in-patients at a Beninese hospital B (Table S17). These ARGs were also significantly more abundant in HWWs from Benin, and Burkina Faso compared to Finland (Figure 4, Tables S7 and S8). *bla*NDM was detected in one of the four fecal samples (Figure 3B) and was also present in the HWWs of hospital B (Figure 3A). Other high abundance ARGs in the fecal samples included ESBL and broad-spectrum beta-lactamase genes of the *cfxA* family (Table S17).

As in the HWWs from Benin (Figure 3A), *bla*GES carbapenemases were also prevalent in other sample types
from a hospital environment, such as in the water intended for handwashing (Figure S2E) for hospital C, the soil
between HWW septic tanks in the yard of hospital B, and street gutter water 100 meters away from hospital B
(Figure 3B). *bla*GES carbapenemase genes were also found in various waters used for drinking, including river
waters in a remote countryside village (Figure 3B). However, the relative sum abundance of ARGs was low in
the three rivers in central Benin (Figure 3B). We also detected *bla*NDM in well water used for drinking in Benin
(Figure 3B). Albeit at low relative abundances, *bla*GES, *bla*VIM, and *bla*OXA-58-like carbapenemases were
detected in natural waters receiving treated HWWs from Burkina Faso (Figure 3B). Significantly higher
abundances of these ARGs were found in biologically treated wastewater before releasing into the river (Figure
3B).

3. Discussion

We characterized the bacterial community composition and resistome in 67 HWWs and 16 related samples from
Benin and Burkina Faso and compared them to HWWs from Finland. This is the first study investigating hospital
wastewaters in the two West African countries using a metagenomic approach. Due to the lack of systematic AMR
surveillance in these countries, available data on bacterial resistance are patchy and heterogeneous (1, 4, 31, 34,
37). Thus, the magnitude of the resistance problem and the specific ARG reservoirs in many African countries are
yet to be unraveled. The relative sum abundance of all ARGs detected in HWWs was the highest in Benin, yet the
number of different ARGs detected there was the lowest. The differences in resistomes between the countries
seemed to be only partially explained by variation in taxonomical composition, as the clustering of taxonomical
composition was not as strongly correlated by country compared to clustering of resistomes. This suggests that
despite differences in the HWW collection systems in the studied countries (HWW is relatively stagnant in septic
tanks or sumps in Benin and Burkina Faso and flowing in HWW drains in Finland), the microbial community
compositions appear to be similar. However, among the most abundant taxa, we did find many environmental
bacteria in HWWs from Benin and Burkina Faso but not in Finland. This may be due to the closer contact of water
with environmental surfaces in septic tanks and sumps compared to the more isolated wastewater systems in
Finland. Bacterial genera typically found in soil and aquatic environments (44) have also been previously
described to dominate HWWs from Benin and Burkina Faso (45). In contrast, the 15 most abundant genera in
Finnish HWWs included less environmental bacteria and more bacteria typical for human gut communities, such
as *Bifidobacterium* (46) and *Faecalibacterium* (47). Another factor possibly explaining the differences in the
dominant taxa present in the HWWs from Benin and Burkina Faso in comparison to Finland could arise from the
fact that in Finland, the hospital toilet waters containing human fecal material are directed to HWWs, while for
the majority of the West African HWWs studied here, this was not the case.

The ARGs that were more abundant in Benin's HWWs than in Finland appeared to be more commonly carried by
class 1 integrons. They were strongly correlated with class 1 integron-associated genes (*intI1* and *qacEΔ* (15))
and, in certain cases, detected in shared contigs with these genes. Moreover, we could detect gene cassettes
consisting of several different acquired ARGs linked to each other, likely referring to gene cassettes carried by

class 1 integrons (48). Furthermore, a higher abundance of ARGs intrinsically carried by specific species, such as
*bla*OXA-211 and *bla*OXA-299 genes by *A. johnsonii and A. bouvetii* (49, 50), as well as *cphA* intrinsically carried
by *Aeromonas* spp. (51) were distinctive features of the HWW resistomes from Finland. Intrinsic resistance is
often chromosomally encoded and rarely mobile or related to horizontal gene transfer (52), whereas acquired
resistance is typically carried by MGEs, such as class 1 integrons. As expected, no significant correlations between
these intrinsic *bla*OXA genes and class 1 integron-associated genes were found, supporting the observation that
ARGs putatively carried by class 1 integrons had a smaller impact on resistomes in HWWs from Finland compared
to Benin. Based on these results, we speculate that the high sum abundance of ARGs seen in HWWs from Benin
may, in part, be explained by the mobilome, more specifically, the prevalence of class 1 integrons. However,
correlation does not necessarily indicate causation, and in this study, quantitative inferences cannot be made for
metagenome-assembled contigs and the putative co-localization of ARGs and class 1 integron-associated genes.
MGEs other than class 1 integron-associated genes did not exhibit a significant correlation with ARGs. This is in
line with the current understanding of the role of class 1 integrons, in particular, among all MGEs in spreading
acquired ARGs (13).

Interestingly, the ARGs observed in HWWs from Benin were the highest in number but probably lower in clinical
importance compared to those in the HWWs from Burkina Faso and Finland. While the most significant
carbapenemase genes *bla*KPC, *bla*NDM, *bla*VIM, *bla*IMP, *bla*OXA-48, and *bla*OXA-58 were found in several
HWW samples from Burkina Faso and Finland at varying abundances, the abundance of many of them was low,
or they were not detected at all in HWWs from Benin. The *bla*GES carbapenemase genes were an exception. They
were the most prevalent of the seven carbapenemases in Beninese HWWs and were also found in samples
unrelated to hospitals.

We suspect that as *bla*GES carbapenemases are typically carried by class 1 integrons, as confirmed by previous
studies (53), a co-selection phenomenon (3, 54) might play a role in increasing their spread also in here. In this
scenario, residues of antibiotics other than carbapenems would cause the co-selection of *bla*GES. We also found
a high relative abundance of plasmid-mediated quinolone ARGs in the HWWs from Benin. These *qnrVC* genes
showed strong correlations to class 1 integron-associated genes and were in some cases found to be located in the
same contigs with *bla*GES-5 carbapenemase genes (Figure S6B). Hence, selection targeting quinolone ARGs
could co-select for carbapenem resistance encoded by the gene *bla*GES-5. Altogether our observations of ARGs
putatively carried by class 1 integrons are worrisome as new ARG combinations among integron gene cassettes
enable their selection by a broader set of antimicrobials or biocides such as quaternary ammonium compounds
(QACs) (15, 55, 56).

Despite the lowest relative sum abundance of ARGs detected in HWWs from Finland, some of the seven
carbapenemase genes of particular interest seemed to have even higher abundances in Finland than in the surveyed
West African countries. However, the occurrence of these ARGs was not homogenous among the Finnish samples.
The highest relative abundance seen in especially one sample from the University Central Hospital of the capital
of Finland (hospital K) was likely explained by the high patient turnover compared to other hospitals in Finland
and Benin and Burkina Faso studied here. Furthermore, a high relative abundance *bla*KPC was observed in only

one of the Finnish samples. Furthermore, the overall occurrence of *bla*KPC across all HWWs from Benin, Burkina

Faso, and Finland studied here aligned with many local and global reports and systematic reviews (57–60),

according to which *bla*KPC carbapenemases are spreading more profusely in Europe and North America than in

Africa. Similarly, the relative abundance of *bla*OXA-58 was higher among Finnish than Beninese or Burkinabe

HWW samples.

Disconcertingly, *bla*NDM was found in the fecal sample of an in-patient staying at a Beninese hospital. blaNDM

was also detected in the wastewaters of the hospital, indicating the sensitivity of wastewater-based monitoring of

bacterial resistance carried by hospital in-patients. *bla*NDM carried by *A. baumannii* has recently, in 2021, been

reported in clinical settings in Benin (61).

Our observation of the high prevalence of metronidazole ARGs in Benin and Burkina Faso but not in Finland

most likely reflects differences in the consumption of this drug. In LICs, diarrheal infections caused by pathogens

such as *Clostridioides difficile* and other anaerobic bacteria, as well as protozoa, are common. Therefore, the

consumption of metronidazole commonly used to treat these infections may be high in these countries as these

drugs are being prescribed, for example, both with and without a positive diagnostic test for *C. difficile* (62).

However, multidrug-resistant strains of *C. difficile* seem to already be prevalent in hospitals in certain parts of

Africa as a consequence of the heavy use of antimicrobials among in-patients(62).

Compared to many HMICs such as those in Northern Europe, antimicrobial usage in agricultural (6, 7) and clinical

(4) settings are less controlled – or even entirely unregulated – in many African countries. For example, while

banned in many other countries, the use of colistin as a feed additive is allowed in many LICs (63), such as those

in Africa (7). In contrast to previous reports on the prevalence of mobile colistin resistance globally (30) and in

Africa (31, 64), *mcr-5* was the most commonly detected gene in the HWWs from our study. Instead, our

observations are in line with the results obtained by using both metagenomics and qPCR (65). This discrepancy

may be due to differences between the methodologies used to screen for colistin resistance. Colistin ARGs other

than the best-known genes *mcr-1, -2,* and *-3* are rarely targeted when screening for mobile colistin resistance with

conventional PCR (65). Our study shows that to obtain a more realistic view of mobile colistin resistance genes

in Africa, screening should also be conducted for different *mcr* genes, as was recently done by Ngbede and

colleagues (66).

The *mcr-5* gene detected here was embedded in a Tn3-like transposase similar to previous reports for *Salmonella*

enterica (67, 68) and *Escherichia coli* (69) plasmids and the chromosome of *Cupriavidus gilardii* (67). These

Tn3-like elements are flanked by inverted repeats, which enable translocation and putatively a wide host range

for the *mcr-5.1* harboring element (67–69). Based on our results, the occurrences of *mcr-5* and other mobile

colistin resistance genes in Benin and Burkina Faso were not restricted to HWW septic tanks. For example, at a

Beninese hospital, a water puddle in the hospital yard had a higher relative abundance of *mcr* genes compared to

the actual HWW septic tanks for that hospital. Furthermore, these genes were also detected in water intended for

handwashing of visitors to the hospital. Thus, the transmission of these clinically critical ARGs within hospitals

could be enabled via hands contaminated by this water. Similarly, Jacobs and colleagues have drawn attention to

the potentially inferior microbiological water quality in similar hand washing water tanks, which are very common
in West Africa (4).
399
In Burkina Faso, the relative abundance of *mcr-5* released into natural waters after wastewater treatment was high
(2.36×10^{-4}). For comparison, a similar relative abundance of *mcr-5* genes (3.0×10^{-4}) was reported for untreated
municipal wastewater in Germany (65). Although we cannot confirm the association between the *mcr-5* genes
detected in the natural waters and the hospital-associated wastewater in the Burkinabe hospital, our study suggests
the inability of the currently used wastewater treatment processes in Burkina Faso to remove colistin resistance
genes. Wastewater treatment systems have also earlier been described to be inadequate in Benin and Burkina Faso
(70). This increases the risk of the further spread of colistin and other ARGs as the inadequately treated water is
released into natural waters and used for various purposes by local people. Furthermore, in many African
countries, untreated wastewater is used for irrigation in urban agriculture, possibly enabling the dissemination of
ARGs to fresh produce (71, 72). The situation appears to be especially critical in Cotonou, where the hospitals
involved in the study did not use any kind of wastewater treatment. Groundwater in the city is extracted from the
shallow aquifer, which is polluted due to unauthorized waste deposits, inadequate toilets, pit latrines, and septic
tanks prone to leakage and hydraulic failure (73). Our study shows that untreated hospital wastewaters, which can
leak into groundwater and the environment, carry clinically dangerous antimicrobial-resistant bacteria and
resistance genes.
415
Taken together, based on our results from nine hospitals, we can state that clinically important ARGs are
circulating in West African hospitals and can spread to their surroundings. There was no significant difference in
the relative sum abundances of ARGs based on the hospital section or different hospitals within these countries.
Various carbapenem ARGs were found in HWWs from Burkina Faso and Finland, while among these *bla*GES
seem to dominate in the studied hospitals in Benin. Our results suggest that class 1 integron mediated co-selection
could play an important role in shaping the resistome in the Beninese samples. In addition to HWWs,
carbapenemase genes and mobile colistin resistance genes were detected in the vicinity as well as locations more
distant from the hospitals. Finally, there were differences between the HWW resistomes in Benin and Burkina
Faso concerning the relative sum abundance of ARGs and the prevalence of clinically relevant ARGs. Therefore,
it is important to consider the differences between African countries in AMR surveillance.
426
427 4. Material and Methods
428
429   4.1. Sample description
430
Hospital wastewater (HWW) samples were collected in Benin from four (hospitals A-D) and in Burkina Faso
from five different hospitals (hospitals F-J) in November and December of 2019. In Finland, HWW samples were
collected from four different hospitals (hospitals K-N) in January 2020. In Burkina Faso, the samples were mainly
from septic tanks or sewers in the hospital area. In Benin, none of the hospitals was connected to a sewer system,
and the samples were from septic tanks or sumps (unstructured wastewater wells), which were never emptied to
our knowledge. In most cases, the toilet water was not directed into these sumps. For comparison, some other

types of samples were included: samples from river waters used for drinking in a remote countryside village in the community of Savalou in central Benin (n=3); river or wetland water receiving treated wastewater in Burkina Faso (n=2, hospitals I and J); and fecal samples of in-patients in Benin (n=4, hospital B). In addition, the following samples were analyzed; well water (hospital A), treated tap water (community of Savalou in central Benin), water for handwashing (hospital C), water in a municipality channel receiving biologically treated wastewater (hospital I), water and sediment from a street gutter next to the hospital (hospital B), an empty HWW septic tank (hospital A), and the soil between HWW septic tanks (hospital B). The four fecal samples were obtained from patients staying at hospital B with diagnoses mainly associated with musculoskeletal injuries. No clinical data concerning bacterial infections were reported for these patients, and we have no information on their possible use of antibiotics. Patient age varied from 24 to 50 years old, and at the time of sampling, patients had stayed in the hospital for one to two months. All sample details are provided in the Supporting Information, Table S2A. Selected pictures and a map indicating sample collection regions are shown in Figures S1 and S2. Letters A–N were used to denote the hospitals/sampling locations.

4.2. DNA extraction and metagenomic sequencing

Water samples were collected into 1-liter bottles and transported to a laboratory on ice. They were kept at +4 °C until processed within 24 hours. A volume of 50–100 ml was filtered through a 0.2 μm polycarbonate filter (Whatman™, GE Healthcare Life Sciences) using a portable vacuum pump (Millivac-Mini Vacuum Pump XF54, Millipore, Merck). DNA was extracted from the filters using the Qiagen DNeasy PowerWater DNA Kit for the water samples and Qiagen DNeasy PowerSoil DNA Kit for the soil samples, following manufacturer instructions. The concentration and quality of the extracted DNA were determined with a NanoDrop spectrophotometer. Altogether 93 samples were subjected to shotgun metagenomic sequencing using Illumina Novaseq5000 with Nextera XT library preparation at the Institute of Biotechnology, University of Helsinki.

4.3. Bioinformatic analyses

All samples were analyzed using an in-house Snakemake workflow (74). Briefly, the quality control steps included in the workflow were performed using FastQC (75) and MultiQC (76), with adapter and low-quality read removal using Cutadapt (77). Nucleotide sequence reads were mapped using Bowtie2 (78) against the ResFinder database (version 3.2, downloaded on 2020-06-28) (79). The reads were sorted and filtered using SAMtools (80) such that the reads mapping as pair or alone were calculated as a single count. Mobile genetic elements were identified by mapping the reads against the MobileGeneticElementDatabase (https://github.com/KatariinaParnanen/MobileGeneticElementDatabase, downloaded on 2020-06-28) consisting of 2714 unique MGE sequences including transposases; integrons of classes 1, 2, and 3; the integron associated disinfectant resistance gene *qacEΔ*; and IS and ISCR type insertion sequences (46). Class 1 integrons were studied using mapping results obtained for the *intI* gene, which encodes an integron integrase (*IntI*). Taxonomic profiling was performed using both Metaphlan3 (81) and Metaxa2 (82). The counts for bacterial 16S rRNA from Metaxa2 were used to normalize ARG and MGE counts. The lengths of the functional genes and the 16S rRNA SSU gene were taken into account in the normalization.

The accuracy of the normalization method was validated by comparing two distinct methods using the 16S rRNA

and *rpoB* housekeeping genes. The *rpoB* counts were obtained using the translated sequence reads described above

as input for hmmsearch (83) against a *rpoB* specific HMM profile (pf04563) from the Pfam-A database (84). Hits

for forward reads (R1) were counted. The correlation between the ARGs normalized to both 16S rRNA, and *rpoB*

was significant ($R^2 = 0.61$, $p = 4.8 \times 10^{-8}$), and we proceeded to use 16S rRNA genes for normalization.

To study mobile colistin resistance genes (*mcr* genes) and their genetic environments for their theoretical mobility

potential, a subset of the samples (samples BH02, BH48, BFH19, BFH26, BFH41, FH1, and FH9) was assembled

using MEGAHIT (v1.2.8) (85). The minimum contig length was set to 1,000 bp. Contigs harboring mobile colistin

resistance genes were identified using a BLAST (86) search against *mcr* genes in the ResFinder database (n=54).

Similarly, contigs containing class 1 integrons were identified and screened for putative ARGs located in the same

contig.

Visualizing the genetic environments of contigs harboring *mcr-5.1* colistin ARGs was performed using the anvi'o

(v7) (87) platform tool 'anvi-interactive'. For this, single profiles were formed for the samples BH02, BH48,

BFH26, BFH41, and FH9 with the option '-cluster-contigs'. Then, a BLAST nr search of the contigs against the

ResFinder and MobileGeneticElementDatabase was performed. The resulting annotations were imported into the

individual sample profiles containing the contigs database and open reading frames predicted by Prodigal (v2.6.3)

(88) with the command 'anvi-import-functions'. The other predicted genes, sharing the same genetic environment

with the *mcr-5.1* gene, were identified by inspecting the resulting annotations from the BLAST nr search on the

web BLAST 'Graphics' view.

To simplify the presentation of the relative sum abundance results of the mobile colistin resistance genes, the *mcr*

genes found in ResFinder database (79) were clustered based on 90 % similarity in their sequence identity using

CD-HIT (v4.8.1) (89).

To visualize the co-localization of multiple ARGs with Bandage (90), the assembled contigs were converted into

assembly graphs using the MEGAHIT command 'megahit_toolkit contig2fastg'. The Bandage program was run

with a BLAST (86) query of a custom database consisting of ARGs present in the ResFinder database and the

integron sequence-related genes *qacEΔ* and *intI1*.

4.4.   Statistical analyses

All statistical analyses described below were performed for all 67 HWW samples described in the 'Sample details'

section and Supporting Information Table S2B. The various wards, clinics, and other units typically had their own

septic tanks or sumps in the Beninese and Burkinabe hospitals. The samples were designated accordingly as

'surgery', 'maternity', 'pediatry', or 'other'. In addition, samples from septic tanks or sumps receiving wastewater

from different sources were designated as 'other'.

To model the relative sum abundances of ARGs and MGEs in HWWs from Benin, Burkina Faso, and Finland, a
generalized linear model (GLM) with gamma distribution and logarithmic link was fitted to 16S rRNA normalized
count data. The effects of the country, hospital and hospital section on the abundance of ARGs and MGEs were
studied with the function 'glm' in the package MASS (v7.3-53.1) (91).

The 'ordinate' function in the Phyloseq package (v1.30.0) (92) was used for principal coordinate analysis (PCoA)
of resistomes, mobilomes, and taxonomical compositions. Country-related differences in the prevalence of
specific resistance genes were examined using DESeq2 (v1.26.0) (93).
The significance of the distinct clustering between the HWWs from different countries drawn using Phyloseq
package (v1.30.0) (92) was tested using pair-wise adonis in the package vegan (v2.5-7) (94) with equal sample
groups. For this, eight samples per country were selected randomly among the HWWs. Unique and shared ARGs
were visualized with the function 'draw.triple.venn' in the package VennDiagram (v1.6.20) (95).

Pearson correlation coefficients and adjusted p-values for each ARG for *intI1* and *qacEΔ* genes were obtained
with the function 'corr.test' in the package psych (v2.1.3) (96) and visualized using package ggcorrplot (v0.1.3)
(97). The correlation tests for different normalization methods (*rpoB* and 16S rRNA) were performed similarly.

DESeq2 (v1.26.0) (93) was used to study the differentially abundant ARGs between the HWWs from the three
different countries. ARGs filtered using a variance threshold of 50 were screened for significantly ($p < 0.05$)
different relative abundances represented by log-2-fold changes across the HWWs of the three countries in a pair-
wise manner (Benin-Finland, Burkina Faso-Finland). The DESeq2 algorithm is designed for unnormalized count
data from gene expression studies. Thus, to take into account the amount of bacterial DNA in the samples (counts
of detected 16S rRNA), the relative abundances were multiplied by 10^5, and a pseudo count of one was added to
avoid zero values unsuitable for integer transformation. A similar analysis using DESeq2 was performed to study
differentially abundant taxa found in the HWWs from Benin or Burkina Faso versus Finland. The relative
abundances obtained from Metaphlan3 (81) were multiplied with the corresponding 16S rRNA counts for each
sample from the Metaxa2 (82) output. Analyses for differentially abundant genera and species were conducted
separately.

Statistical analyses were performed in R (v3.6.3), and the results were visualized using ggplot2 (v3.3.3) (98),
pheatmap (v 1.0.12) (99), and patchwork (v1.1.0.9000) (100). Vector maps were drawn using the package
rnaturalearth (v0.1.0) (101). Detailed descriptions for the bioinformatic and statistical analyses can be viewed on
the project's GitHub page.

Supporting Information
The supporting information referred to within the text as Figures S1-S7 and Tables S1-S18 can be found in the
two separate files "Supporting_Information_1" (Figures S1-S7, Table S1) and "Supporting_Information_2"
(Tables S2-S18).

Acknowledgments

We thank the staff in all the participating hospitals for their collaboration in sampling. We also thank the laboratory
personnel of the URMAPha at the University of Abomey-Calavi in Benin and the Clinical Research Unit of
Nanoro (CRUN) in Burkina Faso for sample processing. Finally, we acknowledge CSC, IT Center for Science,
Finland, for providing the computational resources for the study.

Funding Sources
This work was supported by the Academy of Finland (Grant Numbers 318643 and 316708) and University of
Helsinki HiLife Grand Challenges funding.

Ethical permission
The ethical permissions for the project were received from "Comité National d´Ethique pour la Recherche en
Santé" under the Health Ministry in Benin and "Comité d´Ethique pour la Recherche en Santé" under the Health
Ministry in Burkina Faso.

Data availability
The data for this study have been deposited in the European Nucleotide Archive (ENA) at EMBL-EBI under the
accession number PRJEB47975 and will be public upon article publication in a peer-reviewed journal.

Code availability
All custom codes used for the analyses are available from https://github.com/melinamarkkanen/AMRIWA upon
article publication in a peer-reviewed journal.

References

1.   2015. Global Action Plan On Antimicrobial Resistance WHO Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
Global Action Plan on Antimicrobial Resistance https://doi.org/10.13140/RG.2.2.24460.77448.
2.   Ventola CL. 2015. The Antibiotic Resistance Crisis Part 1: Causes and Threats. Physichal Therapy
40:277–83.
3.   Laxminarayan R, Duse A, Wattal C, Zaidi AKM, Wertheim HFL, Sumpradit N, Vlieghe E, Hara GL,
Gould IM, Goossens H, Greko C, So AD, Bigdeli M, Tomson G, Woodhouse W, Ombaka E, Peralta
AQ, Qamar FN, Mir F, Kariuki S, Bhutta ZA, Coates A, Bergstrom R, Wright GD, Brown ED, Cars O.
2013. Antibiotic resistance-the need for global solutions. Lancet Infect Dis 13:1057–1098.
4.   Jacobs J, Hardy L, Semret M, Lunguya O, Phe T, Affolabi D, Yansouni C, Vandenberg O. 2019.
Diagnostic Bacteriology in District Hospitals in Sub-Saharan Africa: At the Forefront of the
Containment of Antimicrobial Resistance. Frontiers in Medicine 6:205.
5.   Belachew SA, Hall L, Selvey LA. 2021. Non-prescription dispensing of antibiotic agents among
community drug retail outlets in Sub-Saharan African countries: a systematic review and meta-analysis.
Antimicrobial Resistance and Infection Control. BioMed Central Ltd.
6.   Butcher A, Cañada JA, Sariola S. 2021. How to make noncoherent problems more productive: Towards
an AMR management plan for low resource livestock sectors. Humanities and Social Sciences
Communications 8:287.
7.   Van TTH, Yidana Z, Smooker PM, Coloe PJ. 2020. Antibiotic use in food animals worldwide, with a
focus on Africa: Pluses and minuses. Journal of Global Antimicrobial Resistance 20:170–177.
8.   Hu Y, Gao GF, Zhu B. 2017. The antibiotic resistome: gene flow in environments, animals and human
beings. Frontiers of Medicine 11:161–168.
9.   Tacconelli E, Carrara E, Savoldi A, Kattula D, Burkert F. 2017. Global Priority List Of Antibiotic-
Resistant Bacteria To Guide Research, Discovery, And Development Of New Antibiotics.
10.   Martínez JL, Coque TM, Baquero F. 2014. What is a resistance gene? Ranking risk in resistomes.
Nature Reviews Microbiology 13:116–123.

11.   Zhang A-N, Gaston JM, Dai CL, Zhao S, Poyet M, Groussin M, Yin X, Li L-G, van Loosdrecht MCM,
Topp E, Gillings MR, Hanage WP, Tiedje JM, Moniz K, Alm EJ, Zhang T. An omics-based framework
for assessing the health risk of antimicrobial resistance genes https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-021-
25096-3.
12.   Karkman A, Berglund F, Flach CF, Kristiansson E, Larsson DGJ. 2020. Predicting clinical resistance
prevalence using sewage metagenomic data. Communications Biology 3:711.
13.   Gillings MR, Gaze WH, Pruden A, Smalla K, Tiedje JM, Zhu Y-G. 2015. Using the class 1 integron-
integrase gene as a proxy for anthropogenic pollution. The ISME Journal 9:1269–1279.
14.   Li Y, Yang X, Zhang J, Yang S, Zhang S, Chen M, Xue L, Ding Y, Zeng H, Gu Q, Zhang Y, Wei X,
Wang J, Wu Q. 2021. Molecular characterisation of antimicrobial resistance determinants and class 1
integrons of Salmonella enterica subsp. enterica serotype Enteritidis strains from retail food in China.
Food Control 128:108191.
15.   Gillings MR. 2014. Integrons: Past, Present, and Future. Microbiology and Molecular Biology Reviews
78:257–77.
16.   Gillings M, Boucher Y, Labbate M, Holmes A, Krishnan S, Holley M, Stokes HW. 2008. The Evolution
of Class 1 Integrons and the Rise of Antibiotic Resistance. JOURNAL OF BACTERIOLOGY
190:5095–5100.
17.   Chen B, Han J, Dai H, Jia P. 2021. Biocide-tolerance and antibiotic-resistance in community
environments and risk of direct transfers to humans: Unintended consequences of community-wide
surface disinfecting during COVID-19? Environmental Pollution 283:117074.
18.   de Angelis G, Fiori B, Menchinelli G, Tiziana D'inzeo &, Flora &, Liotti M, Morandotti GA,
Sanguinetti M, Posteraro B, Spanu T. 2007. Incidence and antimicrobial resistance trends in
bloodstream infections caused by ESKAPE and Escherichia coli at a large teaching hospital in Rome, a
9-year analysis (2007-2015). European Journal of Clinical Microbiology & Infectious Diseases
37:1627–1636.
19.   Alemayehu T, Hailemariam M. 2020. Prevalence of vancomycin-resistant enterococcus in Africa in one
health approach: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Scientific Reports 10:20542.
20.   Karkman A, Do TT, Walsh F, Virta MPJ. 2018. Antibiotic-Resistance Genes in Waste Water. Trends in
Microbiology 26:220–228.
21.   World Health Organization. 2021. Global Antimicrobial Resistance and Use Surveillance System
(GLASS) Report 2021. Geneva.
22.   World Health Organization. 2018. WHO report on surveillance of antibiotic consumption: 2016-2018
early implementation.
23.   Suay-García, Pérez-Gracia. 2019. Present and Future of Carbapenem-resistant Enterobacteriaceae
(CRE) Infections. Antibiotics 8:122.
24.   Poirel L, Marqué S, Héritier C, Segonds C, Chabanon G, Nordmann P. 2005. OXA-58, a novel class D
β-lactamase involved in resistance to carbapenems in Acinetobacter baumannii. Antimicrobial Agents
and Chemotherapy 49:202–208.
25.   Poirel L, Weldhagen GF, Naas T, de Champs C, Dove MG, Nordmann P. 2001. GES-2, a class A β-
lactamase from Pseudomonas aeruginosa with increased hydrolysis of imipenem. Antimicrobial Agents
and Chemotherapy 45:2598–2603.
26.   Nordmann P, Poirel L. 2013. The difficult-to-control spread of carbapenemase producers among
Enterobacteriaceae worldwide. Clinical Microbiology and Infection 20:821–830.
27.   Löfmark S, Edlund C, Erik Nord C. 2010. Metronidazole Is Still the Drug of Choice for Treatment of
Anaerobic Infections. Clinical Infectious Diseases 1:S16–S23.
28.   Alauzet C, Lozniewski A, el Ene Marchandin H. 2018. Metronidazole resistance and nim genes in
anaerobes: A review. Anaerobe 55:40–53.
29.   Falagas ME, Kasiakou Sofia. K. 2005. Colistin: The Revival of Polymyxins for the Management of
Multidrug-Resistant Gram-Negative Bacterial Infections. Clinical Infectious Diseases 40:1333–41.
30.   Ling Z, Yin W, Shen Z, Wang Y, Shen J, Walsh TR. 2020. Epidemiology of mobile colistin resistance
genes mcr-1 to mcr-9. Journal of Antimicrobial Chemotherapy 75:3087–3095.
31.   Anyanwu MU, Odilichukwu C, Okpala R, Chah KF, Shoyinka VS. 2021. Prevalence and Traits of
Mobile Colistin Resistance Gene Harbouring Isolates from Different Ecosystems in Africa. BioMed
Research International 22:6630379.
32.   Collignon P, Beggs JJ, Walsh TR, Gandra S, Laxminarayan R. 2018. Anthropological and
socioeconomic factors contributing to global antimicrobial resistance: a univariate and multivariable
analysis. Lancet Planet Health 2:e398-405.
33.   van Boeckel TP, Pires J, Silvester R, Zhao C, Song J, Criscuolo NG, Gilbert M, Bonhoeffer S,
Laxminarayan R. 2019. Global trends in antimicrobial resistance in animals in low-and middle-income
countries. Science 365:eaaw1944.

34. Iskandar K, Molinier L, Hallit S, Sartelli M, Craig Hardcastle T, Haque M, Lugova H, Dhingra S, Sharma P, Islam S, Mohammed I, Naina Mohamed I, Abi Hanna P, el Hajj S, Adilla Hayat Jamaluddin N, Salameh P, Roques C. 2020. Surveillance of antimicrobial resistance in low- and middle-income countries: a scattered picture. Antimicrob Resist Infect Control 10:63.

35. Ambler RP. 1980. The structure of beta-lactamases. Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London Series B, Biological sciences 289:321–331.

36. Bernabé KJ, Langendorf C, Ford N, Ronat J-B, Murphy RA. 2017. Antimicrobial resistance in West Africa: a systematic review and meta-analysis. International Journal of Antimicrobial Agents 50:629–639.

37. Mahamat OO, Kempf M, Lounnas M, Tidjani A, Hide M, Benavides JA, Carrière C, Bañuls A-L, Jean-Pierre H, Ouedraogo A-S, Dumont Y, Godreuil S. 2021. Epidemiology and prevalence of extended-spectrum β-lactamase-and carbapenemase-producing Enterobacteriaceae in humans, animals and the environment in West and Central Africa. International Journal of Antimicrobial Agents 57:106203.

38. Hendriksen RS, Munk P, Njage P, van Bunnik B, McNally L, Lukjancenko O, Röder T, Nieuwenhuijse D, Pedersen SK, Kjeldgaard J, Kaas RS, Clausen PTLC, Vogt JK, Leekitcharoenphon P, van de Schans MGM, Zuidema T, de Roda Husman AM, Rasmussen S, Petersen B, Amid C, Cochrane G, Sicheritz-Ponten T, Schmitt H, Alvarez JRM, Aidara-Kane A, Pamp SJ, Lund O, Hald T, Woolhouse M, Koopmans MP, Vigre H, Petersen TN, Aarestrup FM. 2019. Global monitoring of antimicrobial resistance based on metagenomics analyses of urban sewage. Nature Communications 10:1124.

39. Pärnänen KMM, Narciso-da-Rocha C, Kneis D, Berendonk TU, Cacace D, Do TT, Elpers C, Fatta-Kassinos D, Henriques I, Jaeger T, Karkman A, Martinez JL, Michael SG, Michael-Kordatou I, O'Sullivan K, Rodriguez-Mozaz S, Schwartz T, Sheng H, Sørum H, Stedtfeld RD, Tiedje JM, Giustina SV della, Walsh F, Vaz-Moreira I, Virta M, Manaia CM. 2019. Antibiotic resistance in European wastewater treatment plants mirrors the pattern of clinical antibiotic resistance prevalence. Science Advances 5:eaau9124.

40. European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control. 2020. Antimicrobial resistance in the EU/EEA (EARS-Net) - Annual Epidemiological Report 2019.

41. Buelow E, Rico A, Gaschet M, Lourenço J, Kennedy SP, Wiest L, Ploy M-C, Dagot C. 2020. Hospital discharges in urban sanitation systems: Long-term monitoring of wastewater resistome and microbiota in relationship to their eco-exposome. Water Research X 7:100045.

42. Thomas AM, Segata N. Multiple levels of the unknown in microbiome research https://doi.org/10.1186/s12915-019-0667-z.

43. Naas T, Oueslati S, Bonnin RA, Laura Dabos M, Zavala A, Dortet L, Retailleau P, Iorga BI, emy Bonnin RA. 2017. Beta-lactamase database (BLDB)-structure and function. Journal of Enzyme Inhibition and Medicinal Chemistry 32:917–919.

44. Thompson L, Sanders JG, McDonald D, Amir A, Ladau J, Locey KJ, Prill robert J, Tripathi A, Gibbons S, Ackermann G, Navas-molina JA, Janssen S, Kopylova E, Vázquez-baeza Y, González A, Morton JT, Mirarab S, Zech Xu Z, Jiang L, Haroon mohamed F, Kanbar J, Zhu Q, Jin Song S, Kosciolek T, Bokulich nicholas A, Lefler J, Brislawn colin J, Humphrey G. 2017. A communal catalogue reveals Earth's multiscale microbial diversity. Nature 551:457–463.

45. Oyem IM, Oyem HH, Atuanya. 2020. Molecular characterisation of bacteria strains of septic tank sewage samples from related sites in Delta and Edo States of Nigeria using 16S rRNA denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis (DGGE) 14:132–138.

46. Pärnänen K, Karkman A, Hultman J, Lyra C, Bengtsson-Palme J, Larsson DGJ, Rautava S, Isolauri E, Salminen S, Kumar H, Satokari R, Virta M. 2018. Maternal gut and breast milk microbiota affect infant gut antibiotic resistome and mobile genetic elements. Nature Communications 9:389.

47. Laursen MF, Laursen RP, Larnkjaer A, Mølgaard C, Michaelsen KF, Frøkiaer H, Bahl MI, Licht TR. 2017. Faecalibacterium Gut Colonization Is Accelerated by Presence of Older Siblings. mSphere 2:e00448-17.

48. Collis CM, Hall RM. 1995. Expression of antibiotic resistance genes in the integrated cassettes of integrons. Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy 39:155–162.

49. Périchon B, Goussard S, Walewski V, Krizova L, Cerqueira G, Murphy C, Feldgarden M, Wortman J, Clermont D, Nemec A, Courvalin P. 2014. Identification of 50 class D β-lactamases and 65 Acinetobacter-derived cephalosporinases in Acinetobacter spp. Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy 58:936–949.

50. Figueiredo S, Bonnin RA, Poirel L, Duranteau J, Nordmann P. 2012. Identification of the naturally occurring genes encoding carbapenem-hydrolysing oxacillinases from Acinetobacter haemolyticus, Acinetobacter johnsonii, and Acinetobacter calcoaceticus. Clin Microbiol Infect 18:907–913.

51. Massidda O, Rossolini GM, Satta G. 1991. The Aeromonas hydrophila cphA gene: Molecular heterogeneity among class B metallo-β-lactamases. Journal of Bacteriology 173:4611–4617.

52. Cox G, Wright GD. 2013. Intrinsic antibiotic resistance: Mechanisms, origins, challenges and solutions.
International Journal of Medical Microbiology 303:287–292.
53. Araújo S, Sousa M, Tacão M, Baraúna RA, Silva A, Ramos R, Alves A, Manaia CM, Henriques I.
2021. Carbapenem-resistant bacteria over a wastewater treatment process: Carbapenem-resistant
Enterobacteriaceae in untreated wastewater and intrinsically-resistant bacteria in final effluent. Science
of the Total Environment 782:146892.
54. Zieliński W, Korzeniewska E, Harnisz M, Drzymała J, Felis E, Bajkacz S. 2021. Wastewater treatment
plants as a reservoir of integrase and antibiotic resistance genes – An epidemiological threat to workers
and environment. Environment International 156:106641.
55. Pal C, Bengtsson-Palme J, Kristiansson E, Larsson DGJ. 2015. Co-occurrence of resistance genes to
antibiotics, biocides and metals reveals novel insights into their co-selection potential. BMC Genomics
16.
56. Gillings MR, Xuejun D, Hardwick SA, Holley MP, Stokes HW. 2009. Gene cassettes encoding
resistance to quaternary ammonium compounds: a role in the origin of clinical class 1 integrons? The
ISME Journal 3:209–215.
57. Olalekan A, Onwugamba F, Iwalokun B, Mellmann A, Becker K, Schaumburg F. 2020. High proportion
of carbapenemase-producing Escherichia coli and Klebsiella pneumoniae among extended-spectrum β-
lactamase-producers in Nigerian hospitals. Journal of Global Antimicrobial Resistance 21:8–12.
58. Manenzhe RI, Zar HJ, Nicol MP, Kaba M. 2015. The spread of carbapenemase-producing bacteria in
Africa: a systematic review. Journal of Antimicrobial Chemotherapy 70:23–40.
59. van Duin D, Doi Y. 2017. The global epidemiology of carbapenemase-producing Enterobacteriaceae.
Virulence 8:460–469.
60. Mushi MF, Mshana SE, Imirzalioglu C, Bwanga F. 2014. Carbapenemase Genes among Multidrug
Resistant Gram Negative Clinical Isolates from a Tertiary Hospital in Mwanza, Tanzania. BioMed
Research International 2014:303104.
61. Yehouenou C, Bogaerts B, Vanneste K, Roosens NHC, de Keersmaecker SCJ, Marchal K, Affolabi D,
Soleimani R, Rodriguez-Villalobos H, van Bambeke F, Dalleur O, Simon A. 2021. First detection of a
plasmid-encoded New-Delhi metallo-beta-lactamase-1 (NDM-1) producing Acinetobacter baumannii
using whole genome sequencing, isolated in a clinical setting in Benin. Annals of Clinical Microbiology
and Antimicrobials 20:5.
62. Mutai WC, Mureithi MW, Anzala O, Revathi G, Kullin B, Burugu M, Kyany'a C, Odoyo E, Otieno P,
Musila L. 2021. High Prevalence of Multidrug-Resistant Clostridioides difficile Following Extensive
Use of Antimicrobials in Hospitalized Patients in Kenya. Frontiers in Cellular and Infection
Microbiology 10:897.
63. Olumuyiwa Olaitan A, Dandachi I, Alexandra Baron S, Daoud Z, Morand S, Rolain J-M. 2021. Banning
colistin in feed additives: a small step in the right direction. The Lancet Infectious Diseases 21:29–30.
64. Olowo-Okere A, Yacouba A. 2020. Review Molecular mechanisms of colistin resistance in Africa: A
systematic review of literature. Germs 10:367–379.
65. Kneis D, Berendonk TU, Heß S. 2019. High prevalence of colistin resistance genes in German
municipal wastewater. Science of the Total Environment 694:133454.
66. Ngbede EO, Poudel A, Kalalah A, Yang Y, Adekanmbi F, Adikwu AA, Adamu AM, Mamfe LM,
Daniel ST, Useh NM, Kwaga JKP, Adah MI, Kelly P, Butaye P, Wang C. 2020. Identification of mobile
colistin resistance genes (mcr-1.1, mcr-5 and mcr-8.1) in Enterobacteriaceae and Alcaligenes faecalis of
human and animal origin, Nigeria. International Journal of Antimicrobial Agents 56:106108.
67. Borowiak M, Fischer J, Hammerl JA, Hendriksen RS, Szabo I, Malorny B. 2017. Identification of a
novel transposon-associated phosphoethanolamine transferase gene, mcr-5, conferring colistin
resistance in d-tartrate fermenting Salmonella enterica subsp. enterica serovar Paratyphi B. Journal of
Antimicrobial Chemotherapy 72:3317–3324.
68. Borowiak M, Hammerl JA, Deneke C, Fischer J, Szabo I, Malorny B. 2019. Characterization of mcr-5-
Harboring Salmonella enterica subsp. enterica Serovar Typhimurium Isolates from Animal and Food
Origin in Germany. Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy 63:e00063-19.
69. Guo S, Tay MYF, Thu AK, Seow KLG, Zhong Y, Ng LC, Schlundt J. 2019. Conjugative IncX1 plasmid
harboring colistin resistance gene mcr-5.1 in Escherichia coli isolated from chicken rice retailed in
Singapore. Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy 63:e01043-19.
70. Peace Hounkpe S, Codjo Adjovi E, Crapper M, Awuah E. 2014. Wastewater Management in Third
World Cities: Case Study of Cotonou. Benin Journal of Environmental Protection 5:387–399.
71. Bougnom BP, Zongo C, McNally A, Ricci V, Etoa FX, Thiele-Bruhn S, Piddock LJV. 2019.
Wastewater used for urban agriculture in West Africa as a reservoir for antibacterial resistance
dissemination. Environmental Research 168:14–24.

72. Bougnom BP, Thiele-Bruhn S, Ricci V, Zongo C, Piddock LJV. 2020. Raw wastewater irrigation for urban agriculture in three African cities increases the abundance of transferable antibiotic resistance genes in soil, including those encoding extended spectrum β-lactamases (ESBLs). Science of the Total Environment 698:134201.

73. Totin HS, Ernest A, Odoulami L, Edorh PA, Boukari M, Boko M. 2013. Groundwater pollution and the safe water supply challenge in Cotonou town, Benin (West Africa). IAHS-AISH Proceedings and Reports 361:191–196.

74. Mölder F, Jablonski KP, Letcher B, Hall MB, Tomkins-Tinch CH, Sochat V, Forster J, Lee S, Twardziok SO, Kanitz A, Wilm A, Holtgrewe M, Rahmann S, Nahnsen S, Köster J. 2021. Sustainable data analysis with Snakemake. F1000Research 10:33.

75. Andrews S. 2010. FastQC A quality control tool for high throughput sequence data https://www.bioinformatics.babraham.ac.uk/projects/fastqc/.

76. Ewels P, Ns Magnusson M, Lundin S, Aller MK. Data and text mining MultiQC: summarize analysis results for multiple tools and samples in a single report. Bioinformatics 32:3047–3048.

77. Marcel M. 2011. Cutadapt removes adapter sequences from high-throughput sequencing reads. EMBnet.journal 17:10–12.

78. Langmead B, Salzberg SL. 2012. Fast gapped-read alignment with Bowtie 2. Nature Methods 9:357–359.

79. Bortolaia V, Kaas RS, Ruppe E, Roberts MC, Schwarz S, Cattoir V, Philippon A, Allesoe RL, Rebelo AR, Florensa AF, Fagelhauer L, Chakraborty T, Neumann B, Werner G, Bender JK, Stingl K, Nguyen M, Coppens J, Xavier BB, Malhotra-Kumar S, Westh H, Pinholt M, Anjum MF, Duggett NA, Kempf I, Nykäsenoja S, Olkkola S, Wieczorek K, Amaro A, Clemente L, Mossong J, Losch S, Ragimbeau C, Lund O, Aarestrup FM. 2020. ResFinder 4.0 for predictions of phenotypes from genotypes. Journal of Antimicrobial Chemotherapy 75:3491–3500.

80. Li H, Handsaker B, Wysoker A, Fennell T, Ruan J, Homer N, Marth G, Abecasis G, Durbin R. 2009. The Sequence Alignment/Map format and SAMtools. Bioinformatics 25:2078–2079.

81. Beghini F, Mciver LJ, Blanco-mı A, Dubois L, Asnicar F, Maharjan S, Mailyan A, Manghi P, Scholz M, Thomas AM, Valles-colomer M, Weingart G, Zhang Y, Zolfo M, Huttenhower C, Franzosa EA, Segata N. 2021. Integrating taxonomic, functional, and strain-level profiling of diverse microbial communities with bioBakery 3. Elife 4:1–42.

82. Bengtsson-Palme J, Hartmann M, Eriksson KM, Pal C, Thorell K, Larsson DGJ, Nilsson RH. 2015. metaxa2: Improved identification and taxonomic classification of small and large subunit rRNA in metagenomic data. Molecular Ecology Resources 15:1403–1414.

83. Eddy SR. 2011. Accelerated Profile HMM Searches. Citation: Eddy SR 7:1002195.

84. El-Gebali S, Mistry J, Bateman A, Eddy SR, Luciani A, Potter SC, Qureshi M, Richardson LJ, Salazar GA, Smart A, Sonnhammer ELL, Hirsh L, Paladin L, Piovesan D, Tosatto SCE, Finn RD. 2018. The Pfam protein families database in 2019. Nucleic Acids Research 47:427–432.

85. Li D, Liu C-M, Luo R, Sadakane K, Lam T-W. 2015. MEGAHIT: an ultra-fast single-node solution for large and complex metagenomics assembly via succinct de Bruijn graph. Bioinformatics 31:1674–1676.

86. Altschup SF, Gish W, Miller W, Myers EW, Lipman DJ. 1990. Basic Local Alignment Search Tool. J Mol Biol 215:403–410.

87. Murat Eren A, Kiefl E, Shaiber A, Veseli I, Miller SE, Schechter MS, Fink I, Pan JN, Yousef M, Fogarty EC, Trigodet F, Watson AR, Esen ÖC, Moore RM, Clayssen Q, Lee MD, Kivenson V, Graham ED, Merrill BD, Karkman A, Blankenberg D, Eppley JM, Sjödin A, Scott JJ, Vázquez-Campos X, McKay LJ, McDaniel EA, R Stevens SL, Anderson RE, Fuessel J, Fernandez-Guerra A, Maignien L, Delmont TO, Willis AD. 2021. Community-led, integrated, reproducible multi-omics with anvi'o. Nature Microbiology 6:3–6.

88. Hyatt D, Chen G-L, Locascio PF, Land ML, Larimer FW, Hauser LJ. 2010. Prodigal: prokaryotic gene recognition and translation initiation site identification. BMC bioinformatics 11.

89. Fu L, Niu B, Zhu Z, Wu S, Li W. 2012. Sequence analysis CD-HIT: accelerated for clustering the next-generation sequencing data 28:3150–3152.

90. Wick RR, Schultz MB, Zobel J, Holt KE. 2015. Bandage: interactive visualization of de novo genome assemblies. Bioinformatics 31:3350–3352.

91. Venables WN, Ripley B. 2002. Modern Applied Statistics with S.

92. McMurdie PJ, Holmes S. 2013. Phyloseq: An R Package for Reproducible Interactive Analysis and Graphics of Microbiome Census Data. PLoS ONE 8.

93. Love MI, Huber W, Anders S. 2014. Moderated estimation of fold change and dispersion for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. Genome Biology 15:550.

843   94.   Oksanen J, Blanchet G, Friendly M, Kindt R, Legendre P, McGlinn D, Minchin PR, O'Hara RB,
844   Simpson GL, Solymos P, Stevens MHM, Szoecs E, Wagner H. 2020. vegan: Community Ecology
845   Package.
846   95.   Chen H. 2018. VennDiagram: Generate High-Resolution Venn and Euler Plots. R package version
847   1.6.20.
96.   Revelle W. 2021. psych: Procedures for Psychological, Psychometric, and Personality Research.
97.   Kassambara A. 2019. ggcorrplot: Visualization of a Correlation Matrix using "ggplot2."
98.   Wickham H. 2016. ggplot2: Elegant graphics for data analysis. Springer-Verlag New York.
99.   Kolde R. 2019. pheatmap: Pretty Heatmaps. R package version 1.0.12.
100.   Pedersen TL. 2020. patchwork: The Composer of Plots. R package version 1.1.1.
101.   South A. rnaturalearth: World Map Data from Natural Earth. R package version 0.1.0.
854