Age-Specific Changes in Virulence Associated with SARS-CoV-2 Variants of Concern

David N. Fisman¹ MD MPH and Ashleigh R. Tuite¹,² PhD MPH

¹Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada
²Centre for Immunization Readiness, Public Health Agency of Canada, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

Address reprint requests and correspondence to:

David Fisman, MD MPH FRCP(C)
Room 686, 155 College Street, Toronto, Ontario, M5T 3M7
Email: david.fisman@utoronto.ca

Funding statement: The research was supported by a grant to DNF from the Canadians Institutes for Health Research (2019 COVID-19 rapid researching funding OV4-170360).

Declaration of competing interests: DNF has served on advisory boards related to influenza and SARS-CoV-2 vaccines for Seqirus, Pfizer, Astrazeneca and Sanofi-Pasteur Vaccines, and has served as a legal expert on issues related to COVID-19 epidemiology for the Elementary Teachers Federation of Ontario and the Registered Nurses Association of Ontario. ART was employed by the Public Health Agency of Canada when the research was conducted. The work does not represent the views of the Public Health Agency of Canada.
Abstract

Background: Novel variants of concern (VOCs) have been associated with both increased infectivity and virulence of SARS-CoV-2. The virulence of SARS-CoV-2 is closely linked to age. Whether relative increases in virulence of novel VOCs is similar across the age spectrum, or is limited to some age groups, is unknown.

Methods: We created a retrospective cohort of people in Ontario, Canada testing positive for SARS-CoV-2 and screened for VOCs, with dates of test report between February 7 and August 30, 2021 (n=233,799). Cases were classified as N501Y-positive VOC, probable Delta VOC, or VOC undetected. We constructed age-specific logistic regression models to evaluate the effects of N501Y-positive or Delta VOC infections on infection severity, using hospitalization, intensive care unit (ICU) admission, and death as outcome variables. Models were adjusted for sex, time, health unit, vaccination status, comorbidities, immune compromise, long-term care residence, healthcare worker status, and pregnancy.

Results: Infection with either N501Y-positive or Delta VOCs was associated with significant elevations in risk of hospitalization, ICU admission, and death in younger and older adults, compared to infections where a VOC was not detected. Delta VOC increased hospitalization risk in children under 10 by a factor of 2.5 (adjusted odds ratio, 95% confidence interval: 1.2 to 5.1) compared to non-VOC. For most VOC-outcome combinations there was no heterogeneity in adverse outcomes by age. However, there was an inverse relationship between age and relative increase in risk of death with delta VOC, with younger age groups showing a greater relative increase in risk of death than older individuals.
Interpretation: SARS-CoV-2 VOCs appear to be associated with increased relative virulence of infection in all age groups, though low absolute numbers of outcomes in younger individuals make estimates in these groups imprecise.
Introduction

Emerging SARS-CoV-2 variants of concern (VOC) have displayed increased infectivity as well as increased virulence relative to strains circulating early in the pandemic (1-7). In particular, the emergence of the highly infectious and virulent Delta variant has led to revised expectations of the pandemic’s severity and duration (8-11). Notwithstanding the severe health and economic toll the SARS-CoV-2 pandemic has taken worldwide, one relatively assuasive aspect of its epidemiology had been decreased virulence of infection in children, with nearly 50% of infected children experiencing asymptomatic infection (12, 13). However, in the summer of 2021, both the United Kingdom and the United States have reported an extraordinary surge in pediatric hospitalizations related to SARS-CoV-2 infection (14-17). The coincidence of this surge with Delta variant emergence in both countries has led some to suggest that this surge was driven by Delta variant emergence. However, surging admissions could simply reflect the increased infectivity of Delta variant, resulting in larger numbers of infected children without any change in per-infection virulence. As such, it has been challenging to determine with certainty whether infection with Delta VOC is more virulent in children than non-VOC SARS-CoV-2, or other VOCs, such as those with the N501Y mutation (18).

Indeed, heterogeneity in the effects of VOC by age, more generally, would be of importance for understanding the likely impacts of future pandemic waves, as well as the epidemiology of SARS-CoV-2 in the post-pandemic era. In the Canadian province of Ontario, VOC carrying the N501Y mutation (including the Alpha/B.1.1.7, Beta/B.1.351 and Gamma /P.1 VOC) replaced earlier SARS-CoV-2 lineages by April 2021, but were, in turn, replaced by the Delta (B.1.617.2) variant, which has been the dominant variant in the province since July 2021 (19, 20).
availability of a single master line list of all COVID-19 cases in the Canadian province of Ontario, which includes patient outcomes (hospitalization, intensive care admission, and/or death), important covariates including underlying medical conditions, and virological typing data from February 2021 forward, provides an opportunity to evaluate age-specific risk associated with VOC infection, and to determine whether there is heterogeneity in virulence across age groups. Our objectives were to: (i) estimate age-specific risks of severe illness in individuals infected with Delta or N501Y-positive VOC, relative to non-VOC SARS-CoV-2 infection; (ii) to evaluate whether there is heterogeneity in differential risk by age group; and (iii) to explore the sources of any such heterogeneity.
Methods

Data Sources

We used Ontario’s Case and Contact Management (CCM) database to create a retrospective cohort of SARS-CoV-2 cases who underwent screening for variants of concern, and had test report dates between February 7 and September 13, 2021 (as routine screening for N501Y and E484K mutations began on February 7, 2021). Case information, including long term care residence, demographics, underlying medical conditions, and outcomes including hospitalization, ICU admission and death, is available in CCM (21). Case vaccination status, including dates of first and second doses of SARS-CoV-2 vaccines were obtained from COVaxON, Ontario’s centralized COVID-19 vaccine database. Individuals were considered partially vaccinated if 14 or more days had elapsed between the first vaccine dose and test date; and considered fully vaccinated if the case episode date occurred 7 or more days after receipt of the second dose, and otherwise were considered unvaccinated (22, 23).

There has been an evolution in VOC screening and viral sequencing in Ontario over the course of the pandemic. VOC cases were initially identified in Ontario in December 2020, with subsequent targeted screening of isolates from individuals with a history suggestive of possible VOC infection (e.g., travel). Systematic screening for VOCs with low cycle threshold (≤35) began in February 2021. Initial screening focussed on the N501Y mutation, with screening for both N501Y and E484K initiated in March 2020. At that time a 5% sampling of specimens was subjected to all specimens, regardless of screen results, was initiated, with the fraction increased to 50% by late May 2021. As of June 2021, routine WGS was discontinued on N501Y-POSITIVE/E484- specimens, which were presumed to be alpha lineage. Over 90% of infections...
were positive for the N501Y mutation as of April 2021, but that fraction decreased subsequently with emergence of Delta variant, which represented over 60% of all infections by July 2021 (19, 20).

We excluded cases if VOC screening information was unavailable or screening had not been performed (N = 50,508). The dataset was extracted on September 14, 2021, with the most recent test report date of September 13, 2021. However, we limited our analysis to cases with a test report date at least 14 days prior (August 30, 2021) to account for delays between testing and occurrence of hospitalization, ICU admission, and death.

**Analysis**

We constructed age-group-specific logistic regression models for the effects of N501Y-positive or Delta VOC infection, on infection severity, defined as hospitalization, ICU admission, or death. Models were adjusted for male sex, time (modeled as a week-on-week linear trend), vaccination status (in age groups 10 years and older), documented major comorbidity (including asthma, COPD, hematological disease, liver disease, cardiac disease, diabetes, renal disease, neurological disease, malignancy, or obesity), and immune compromise. In relevant age groups we also adjusted for pregnancy, long-term care residence and healthcare worker status. Due to geographic variation in timing of emergence of variants, we also adjusted for health unit region, with health units classified as “Greater Toronto-Hamilton Area”, “Ottawa”, and “other”. All of these covariates were expected *a priori* to confound the association between VOC exposure and disease severity. We considered odds ratios to approximate relative risks under the “rare disease assumption” (24).
Adjusted odds ratios and confidence intervals for relative severity of VOC from age-group-specific models were incorporated into random effects meta-analyses to generate summary estimates of effect, and to evaluate heterogeneity in effects by variant and age. Heterogeneity by age was assessed by constructing meta-regression models in which age group was treated as an ordinal variable in order to identify linear trends in effect across age groups.

We conducted regression analyses in R version 4.1.0; meta-analyses and meta-regression were performed using the meta package in R (25, 26). The study was conducted in accordance with the STROBE guidelines for observational research (27), and received ethics approval from the Research Ethics Board at the University of Toronto.
Results

We included 233,799 cases in our analysis, with episode dates between February 7 and August 30, 2021. Among all reported cases, 71.7% were infections with N501Y-positive VOC; 7.6% were classified as probable Delta infections. There were significant differences in hospitalization and ICU admission according to VOC status (Table 1). Individuals with VOC were significantly younger, less likely to have comorbidities, and less likely to have reported immune compromise than individuals without VOC. Significant differences were also seen in healthcare worker status, long-term care residence, and geographic location by VOC status. Cases infected with Delta were more likely to be fully vaccinated, reflecting the fact that Delta became established in the population in the spring of 2020, once vaccination programs were underway.

Adjusted odds ratios for hospitalization, intensive care admission, and death, by age category and VOC, are presented in Figure 1. N501Y-positive VOC infection was associated with a significant increase in hospitalization among people aged 20 and over, relative to infection with non-VOC SARS-CoV-2 strains. ICU admission risk was increased in all groups aged 40 and over. Risk of death was significantly elevated in the 20-39 year age group and people aged 60 and over. For N501Y-positive VOC, odds ratios could not be estimated for ICU admission in children under 10, or for death in those aged less than 20, due to the rarity of these outcomes.

For Delta VOC infections, significantly elevated hospitalization risk was seen in all age groups except 10-to-19 year-olds. In children, the risk of hospitalization with Delta VOC was 2.5-fold higher than that seen with non-VOC SARS-CoV-2. ICU admission risk could not be estimated.
for Delta VOC in children, and elevations in risk among people under 40 years of age were not
statistically significant. For people aged 40 and over, marked increases in risk were observed.
Odds ratios for death with Delta could not be estimated for those aged less than 30 years; in
adults aged greater than 30 years the risk of death was elevated with Delta VOC infection though
confidence intervals for estimates in the 50-to-59 year and 80-and-over age groups overlapped.
In random effects meta-analyses, we found no significant heterogeneity in odds ratios across age
groups for death and ICU risk with N501Y-positive VOC, or for hospitalization and ICU risk
with Delta VOC. By contrast, significant heterogeneity in risk estimates was seen for
hospitalization risk across age groups with N501Y-positive VOC, and for death risk with Delta
VOC (Figure 1). Across all outcomes, infection with Delta VOC was associated with elevated
risk, compared to N501Y-positive infections.
We evaluated the contribution of age to heterogeneity in estimates by constructing meta-
regression models with age group treated as a 9-level ordinal variable. For hospitalization risk
and N501Y-positive VOC, we found no relationship between age and odds ratio (relative OR per
10-year increase in age 1.01, 95% CI 0.97 to 1.05). For mortality risk and Delta VOC, there was
an inverse association between age group and relative OR (0.69, 95% CI 0.50 to 0.94).
Discussion

The landscape of SARS-CoV-2 infection continues to change rapidly, with novel variants of concern impacting both transmissibility and virulence of infection. In this analysis, we evaluated the relative impact of earlier N501Y-positive VOC, and subsequent Delta VOC infections on severity of infection by age group. We find that, as reported previously, Delta VOC infection is more virulent than infection with both N501Y-positive VOC and non-VOC SARS-CoV-2 strains (7, 10, 28). We find no statistical evidence that the increase in virulence of Delta VOC in the population as a whole is diminished in younger people. The absence of significant elevations of risk in younger age groups for some outcomes is likely to reflect lower absolute risk (and numbers of events) in these groups, with consequent lack of precision in estimates. Notably, the risk of hospitalization with Delta VOC appears significantly increased in children. The relative rarity of ICU admissions and deaths in younger age groups makes us unable to generate relative risk estimates for these outcomes with Delta in children, but an increase in virulence as well as transmissibility with Delta VOC in children would be consistent with recent observed surges in pediatric hospitalizations reported in the United States and United Kingdom (14-17).

For most combinations of VOC and outcomes, we found no evidence of variation in increased risk by age, but for Delta VOC, we also found an inverse, age-related gradient in relative risk of death with Delta infection with VOC, in contrast to non-VOC infection. This does not indicate that there is no excess risk associated with VOC in older individuals; indeed, we find significant increases in risk of severe outcomes with both N501Y-positive and Delta VOC in older individuals. Rather, this signifies that relative increase in mortality risk with Delta increases as
age diminishes for Delta VOC, though our analysis was limited to age groups 40 and older. If this effect proves generalizable, it suggests that the Delta variant will enhance mortality of SARS-CoV-2 infection in younger age groups, which have been (and remain) less likely to experience critical illness than older age groups.

Our analysis is subject to important limitations: first, the relative rarity of severe outcomes in younger age groups means that our estimates for these groups are imprecise. Furthermore, our failure to identify heterogeneity in severity by age, when evaluating effects in children and teens, may simply be related to the imprecision of estimates in these age groups, rather than true lack of heterogeneity. A second limitation is the degree to which frequency of testing, particularly in younger age groups, has been dynamic in Ontario during the COVID-19 pandemic (21). Increasing frequency of testing in under-tested younger age groups over time, as VOC emerged in the population, could increase the fraction of mild cases identified, and may have served to mask increases in severity.

In summary, however, we find no evidence to suggest that the apparent increase in virulence of SARS-CoV-2 VOC is limited to a particular age group; indeed, we present evidence that the relative virulence of Delta VOC, as represented by mortality risk, may be inversely related to age. The relative rarity of severe outcomes in children and teens means that more study is needed to assess the robustness and generalizability of these findings.

Acknowledgements
We thank the staff at Public Health Ontario and Ontario’s public health units, and Ontario Health, for collecting, sequencing, analyzing, and providing access to the data used for this analysis.
Table 1. Characteristics of study cohort with test date between 7 February and 30 August 2021, by variant of concern (VOC) status.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptor</th>
<th>All</th>
<th>VOC Not Detected</th>
<th>N501Y-positive VOC</th>
<th>Probable Delta VOC</th>
<th>P-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>233,799</td>
<td>48,441</td>
<td>167,575</td>
<td>17,783</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospitalized (%)</td>
<td>12,284 (5.3)</td>
<td>2,182 (4.5)</td>
<td>9,093 (5.4)</td>
<td>1,009 (5.7)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admitted to ICU</td>
<td>2627 (1.1)</td>
<td>386 (0.8)</td>
<td>1,974 (1.2)</td>
<td>267 (1.5)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Died</td>
<td>2,148 (0.9)</td>
<td>449 (0.9)</td>
<td>1,552 (0.9)</td>
<td>147 (0.8)</td>
<td>0.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male (%)</td>
<td>118,385 (50.6)</td>
<td>24,452 (50.5)</td>
<td>84,849 (50.6)</td>
<td>9,084 (51.1)</td>
<td>0.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age (years)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 10</td>
<td>17,397 (7.4)</td>
<td>3,550 (7.3)</td>
<td>12,155 (7.3)</td>
<td>1,692 (9.5)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-19</td>
<td>28,081 (12)</td>
<td>5,842 (12.1)</td>
<td>19,979 (11.9)</td>
<td>2,260 (12.7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-29</td>
<td>49,134 (21)</td>
<td>9,813 (20.3)</td>
<td>34,738 (20.7)</td>
<td>4,583 (25.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>40,152 (17.2)</td>
<td>8,089 (16.7)</td>
<td>28,731 (17.1)</td>
<td>3,332 (18.7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>34,382 (14.7)</td>
<td>6,772 (14)</td>
<td>25,381 (15.1)</td>
<td>2,229 (12.5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-59</td>
<td>31,958 (13.7)</td>
<td>6,752 (13.9)</td>
<td>23,363 (13.9)</td>
<td>1,843 (10.4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-69</td>
<td>19,356 (8.3)</td>
<td>4,288 (8.9)</td>
<td>13,954 (8.3)</td>
<td>1,114 (6.3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-79</td>
<td>8,561 (3.7)</td>
<td>2,043 (4.2)</td>
<td>6,083 (3.6)</td>
<td>435 (2.4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>≥80</td>
<td>4,778 (2)</td>
<td>1,292 (2.7)</td>
<td>3,191 (1.9)</td>
<td>295 (1.7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vaccination status*</td>
<td>&lt; 0.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unvaccinated</td>
<td>94,468 (40.4)</td>
<td>18,377 (37.9)</td>
<td>65,191 (38.9)</td>
<td>10,900 (61.3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partially vaccinated</td>
<td>135,578 (58)</td>
<td>29,187 (60.3)</td>
<td>101,452 (60.5)</td>
<td>4,939 (27.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fully vaccinated</td>
<td>3,753 (1.6)</td>
<td>877 (1.8)</td>
<td>932 (0.6)</td>
<td>1,944 (10.9)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comorbidity†</td>
<td>11,448 (4.9)</td>
<td>3,037 (6.3)</td>
<td>7,508 (4.5)</td>
<td>903 (5.1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immune compromise</td>
<td>1,816 (0.8)</td>
<td>436 (0.9)</td>
<td>1,235 (0.7)</td>
<td>145 (0.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-term care resident</td>
<td>424 (0.2)</td>
<td>142 (0.3)</td>
<td>205 (0.1)</td>
<td>77 (0.4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare worker</td>
<td>3,991 (1.7)</td>
<td>1,081 (2.2)</td>
<td>2,592 (1.5)</td>
<td>318 (1.8)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pregnancy</td>
<td>646 (0.3)</td>
<td>141 (0.3)</td>
<td>435 (0.3)</td>
<td>70 (0.4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GTHA‡</td>
<td>167,088 (71.5)</td>
<td>30,198 (62.3)</td>
<td>126,118 (75.3)</td>
<td>10,772 (60.6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>9,783 (4.2)</td>
<td>2,006 (4.1)</td>
<td>7,423 (4.4)</td>
<td>354 (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NOTE:** ICU, intensive care unit; VOC, variant of concern; P-values based on chi-squared test.

*Vaccination status is defined as in methods.

†Comorbidities include one or more of asthma, COPD, hematological disease, liver disease, cardiac disease, diabetes, renal disease, neurological disease, malignancy, or obesity. Immune compromise was included as a separate covariate in models.

‡GTHA, Greater Toronto Area and Hamilton, large conurbation in Central Ontario consisting of 6 health units (Toronto, Peel, Durham, Halton, York and Hamilton).
Table 2. Meta-regression derived age-related relative change in odds ratio associated with N501Y-positive and probable Delta variants of concern.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variant</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Relative Odds Ratio</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
<th>( \tau^2 )*</th>
<th>( R^2 )** (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Probable Delta</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hospitalization</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>0.93-1.07</td>
<td>0.0178</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICU admission</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>0.93-1.22</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Death</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>0.50-0.94</td>
<td>0.1647</td>
<td>45.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N501Y-positive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hospitalization</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>0.97-1.05</td>
<td>0.0115</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICU admission</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>0.94-1.09</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Death</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>0.83-1.06</td>
<td>0.0166</td>
<td>12.68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NOTE:** Linear trend estimated by treating age category as a 9-level ordinal variable.  
*Estimated amount of residual heterogeneity due to between-age group variation.  
*Fraction of heterogeneity accounted for by including age in meta-regression models.
Models were adjusted for sex, health unit region, age group, vaccination status, comorbidity, immune compromise, and (in relevant age groups) long-term care residence, healthcare worker status, and pregnancy.
References


