mRNA-1273 vaccine (Moderna): a better option than BNT162b2 (Pfizer) in kidney transplant recipients and dialysis patients?

Veerle P. W. M. Wijtvliet[1,2], Kevin K. Ariën[3,4], Steven Abrams[5,6], Marie M. Couttenye[1,2], Fabienne Mestrez[7], Joachim Mariën[3,8], Benedicte Y. De Winter[1], Pierre Van Damme[9], Lissa Pipeleers[10], Karl Martin Wissing[10], Daniel Abramowicz[1,2], Kristien J. Ledeganck[1]

[1] Laboratory of Experimental Medicine and Pediatrics and member of the Infla-Med Centre of Excellence, University of Antwerp, Antwerp, Belgium

[2] Department of Nephrology and Hypertension, Antwerp University Hospital, Edegem, Belgium

[3] Department of Biomedical Sciences, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium

[4] Department of Biomedical Sciences, University of Antwerp, Antwerp, Belgium

[5] Department of Epidemiology and Social Medicine, Global Health Institute, University of Antwerp, Antwerp, Belgium

[6] I-BioStat, Data Science Institute, Hasselt University, Diepenbeek, Belgium

[7] Department of Nephrology-Dialysis, University Hospital (CHU) Ambroise Paré, Mons, Belgium

[8] Evolutionary Ecology Group, Department of Biology, University of Antwerp, Antwerp, Belgium

[9] Centre for the Evaluation of Vaccination, Vaccine and Infectious Disease Institute, University of Antwerp, Antwerp, Belgium

[10] Department of Nephrology, Universitair Ziekenhuis Brussel, Vrije Universiteit Brussel, Brussels, Belgium

Corresponding author: Veerle Wijtvliet, MD. Antwerp University Hospital, Department of Nephrology and Hypertension. Drie Eikenstraat 655, 2650 Edegem, Belgium.

Electronic address: veerle.wijtvliet@uantwerpen.be

Phone number: +32 3 265 2591.

Abstract

In this study of the humoral immune response after the SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccination, low seroconversion rates were noted in both kidney transplant recipients and dialysis patients after first dose administration. While in DP the seroconversion rate levelled up to 92.8% after a second dose of SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccination, KTR stayed behind with a seroconversion rate of 62.4%. Futhermore, vaccination with the mRNA-1273 vaccine (Moderna) resulted in both higher seroconversion rates and mean log-transformed antibody titer concentrations compared to BNT162b2 (Pfizer).

Main text

With the roll-out of COVID-19 vaccines, it has become clear that vaccinating the majority of the population worldwide will be the most important element to control and manage the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic. Several reports have shown diminished immunogenicity of SARS-CoV-2 vaccines in both kidney transplant recipients (KTR) and dialysis patients (DP), as evidenced in a recent narrative review [1]. Furthermore, two recent articles have included comparisons between the immunogenicity of the mRNA-1273 (Moderna) versus the BNT162b2 (Pfizer) vaccine in these populations [2, 3]. Boyarsky et al. studied a cohort of solid organ transplant recipients, including KTR, and reported lower seroconversion rates after receiving the Pfizer vaccine [3]. Stumpf et al. also described lower seroconversion rates in KTR and DP receiving the Pfizer vaccine [2]. However, none of these articles reported the titers of anti-SARS-CoV-2 antibodies. Therefore, we here compared the immunogenicity of

the two available mRNA vaccines BNT162b2 (Pfizer-BioNTech) versus mRNA-1273 (Moderna) in both KTR and DP regarding both seroconversion rates and, among responding patients, antibody titers.

KTR and DP receiving a first dose of a SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine between February and May 2021 were consecutively included. Blood was prospectively sampled at day 1 (before vaccination), 16 to 21 days after the first dose of the vaccine, and 21 to 35 days after the second vaccine dose. Samples were stored at "Biobank Antwerp", Antwerp, Belgium; ID: BE 71030031000 [4]. Immunoglobulin G (IgG) antibodies against the receptor-binding domain (RBD) of the SARS-CoV-2 spike protein were measured using an in-house Luminex assay [5]. These measurements were performed by staff unaware of the identity of the samples. In order to investigate only patients without prior SARS-CoV-2 infection, 1) patients with a PCR-proven history of SARS-CoV-2 infection and 2) patients who tested positive for anti-RBD IgG antibodies (> 1) at the day of vaccination without a PCR-proven history of SARS-CoV-2 infection, as a surrogate of previous SARS-CoV-2 infection, were excluded. Response to first and second vaccination was defined as anti-RBD IgG positivity (signal-to-noise ratio > 1) at 16 to 21 days after dose 1, and 21 to 35 days after dose 2, respectively. The study was performed in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki and approved by the ethical committee of the Antwerp University Hospital and University of Antwerp (no. EC 21/05/076).

Multiple logistic regression modelling was used to identify variables associated with a positive antibody response after dose 1 and dose 2. A multiple linear mixed model was used to study factors influencing the mean log-transformed anti-RBD IgG levels in responding patients. Potentially important factors were first identified using a bivariate analysis (with

effect sizes expressed as crude Odds Ratios (ORs) or additive effects, respectively). Next to that, a stepwise model building exercise based on Akaike's Information Criterion (AIC) was used to select all important explanatory variables in the final models. Depending on the selected covariates, all pairwise interaction effects were checked for significance adjusting for multiplicity. All statistical tests were two-sided. A p-value < 0.05 was considered statistically significant.

In total, 155 KTR and 182 DP were included, of whom 268 patients without prior SARS-CoV-2 infection (80%) were sampled after both vaccine dose 1 and dose 2. To evaluate the antibody response after dose 1, 138 KTR and 141 DP were included after exclusion of patients with evidence of prior SARS-CoV-2 exposure (n = 55) or loss to follow up (n = 3) (**Table 1**). Identical exclusion criteria were used to study antibody response after dose 2, resulting in the inclusion of 133 KTR and 138 DP (**Table 2**).

When zooming in on patients included to study antibody response after dose 1 (n = 279), the median age was 62 years (interquartile range (IQR), 51-71 years) and 62% were men. Sixty-two percent received the BNT162b2 vaccine (Pfizer-BioNTech), 38% received the mRNA-1273 vaccine (Moderna). At a median of 21 days (IQR, 20-23 days) anti-RBD IgG antibodies were detected in 81 out of 279 participants (29%, Clopper-Pearson 95% CI, 24-35%). Both haemodialysis patients (adjusted OR, 6.403 (95% CI, 2.970-13.804); p < 0.001) and peritoneal dialysis patients (adjusted OR, 10.379 (95% CI, 4.143-26.000; p < 0.001) were more likely to develop antibody responses compared to KTR (**Table 3A**). Furthermore, the odds of having an antibody response decreased with a factor 0.972 (95% CI, 0.950-0.994) with a one-year increase in age. Patients receiving the mRNA-1273 vaccine (Moderna) showed significantly different seroconversion rates 21 days after dose 1 compared to patients receiving the

BNT162b2 vaccine (Pfizer-BioNTech) (49.5% versus 16.7%; adjusted OR, 4.941 (95% CI, 2.698-9.047); p < 0.001) (**Table 1 and Table 3A**). All pairwise interaction terms included in both models were found to be non-significant at a 5% significance level.

Performing a similar analysis regarding antibody responses after second vaccine dose, anti-RBD IgG antibodies were detected in 211 out of 271 participants (78%, Clopper-Pearson 95% CI, 72-83%) at a median of 28 days (IQR, 25-31 days) after second vaccine administration. Again, both haemodialysis patients (adjusted OR, 6.181 (95% CI, 2.828-13.511); p < 0.001) and peritoneal dialysis patients (adjusted OR, 18.870 (95% CI, 2.483-143.380; p = 0.005) were more likely to develop antibody responses compared to KTR (**Table 3A**). Patients receiving the mRNA-1273 vaccine (Moderna) showed significantly different seroconversion rates compared to those receiving the BNT162b2 vaccine (Pfizer-BioNTech) (90.0% versus 70.8%; adjusted OR, 3.428 (95% CI, 1.587-7.406); p < 0.005) (**Table 2 and Table 3A**). After selecting patients with an antibody response after first (n = 81) or second (n = 211) vaccine dose, antibody levels appeared to be associated with type of patient, age and vaccine type. Mean log-transformed antibody titer concentrations were 0.289 units higher for Moderna vs. Pfizer vaccination, irrespective of the dose (first or second) considered (p = 0.005 in multiple linear mixed model; **Table 3B**).

In this study of the humoral immune response after SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccination, low seroconversion rates were noted in both KTR and DP after first dose administration. While in DP the seroconversion rate levelled up to 92.8% after a second dose of SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccination, KTR stayed behind with a seroconversion rate of 62.4%. Furthermore, vaccination with the mRNA-1273 vaccine (Moderna) resulted in both higher seroconversion rates and mean log-transformed antibody titer concentrations.

Several limitations of our study, must be acknowledged. First, although an interesting difference in serological response was observed following administration of mRNA-1273 vs. BNT162b2, no further investigation was performed on potential differences in T-cell responses. It is well described in literature that patients without antibody responses can mount T-cell responses, which could provide some protection against SARS-CoV-2 infection in seronegative patients [6]. Second, no information concerning possible side effects of both SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccines, was collected.

While writing this discussion, three very recently articles were published, which support our above-mentioned findings [7-9]. First, seroconversion rates in adults with hematologic malignant disease, whom in majority received B-cell-depleting monoclonal antibodies, were higher in patients vaccinated with mRNA-1273 (Moderna) compared to BNT162b2 (Pfizer) (50% vs. 33%, p = 0.013) [7]. Second, a study of individuals in the multi-state Mayo Clinic Health System revealed that the mRNA-1273 vaccine was associated with a lower incidence of SARS-CoV-2 infection (p = 0.0034) as well as with a significant two-fold risk reduction against breakthrough infection compared to BNT162b2 [8]. Third, Kaiser et al. compared antibody titers between both mRNA vaccines after full vaccination in haemodialysis patients [9]. They reported 2.39-fold (P < 0.005) higher anti-S-antibody titers in patients vaccinated with mRNA-1273.

Whether observed differences between these two mRNA-vaccines relate to a different mRNA sequence, a difference in dosage (100 µg mRNA in Moderna vs. 30 µg mRNA in Pfizer) or a difference in vaccine composition, remains to be investigated. Furthermore, future studies are needed to assess whether our observed differences are associated with a

better clinical protection. Meanwhile, mRNA-1273 (Moderna) might be the preferred vaccine in kidney transplant and dialysis patients.

Acknowledgements:

The authors would like to thank study nurses E. Meersman, S. Verhofstede, N. Marmitte and T. Bogaerts for their excellent and efficient help. We also thank E. Snelders, S. Van Hees and J. Michiels for their logistical support, the lab technicians of the Lab of Experimental Medicine and Pediatrics for the sample processing and P. Moons from Biobank Antwerp for his technical support. Special thanks to all the kidney transplant recipients and dialysis patients who made this study possible.

Conflict of interest statement: none declared. Furthermore, this paper has not been published previously in whole or part.

Funding

The authors received no specific funding for this work.

Data availability statement

Requests for original and additional data should be directed to the corresponding author.

References

1.   Carr EJ, Kronbichler A, Graham-Brown M, *et al.* Systematic Review of Early Immune Response to SARS-CoV-2 Vaccination Among Patients with Chronic Kidney Disease. Kidney Int Rep 2021
2.   Stumpf J, Siepmann T, Lindner T, *et al.* Humoral and cellular immunity to SARS-CoV-2 vaccination in renal transplant versus dialysis patients: A prospective, multicenter observational study using mRNA-1273 or BNT162b2 mRNA vaccine. Lancet Reg Health Eur 2021:100178
3.   Boyarsky BJ, Werbel WA, Avery RK, *et al.* Antibody Response to 2-Dose SARS-CoV-2 mRNA Vaccine Series in Solid Organ Transplant Recipients. Jama 2021;325(21):2204-2206
4.   BE 71030031000; Biobank Antwerp [BB190007], BBMR-ERIC, Belgian [BIORESOURCE].
5.   Mariën J, Ceulemans A, Michiels J, *et al.* Evaluating SARS-CoV-2 spike and nucleocapsid proteins as targets for antibody detection in severe and mild COVID-19 cases using a Luminex bead-based assay. J Virol Methods 2021;288:114025
6.   Bertrand D, Hamzaoui M, Lemée V, *et al.* Antibody and T Cell Response to SARS-CoV-2 Messenger RNA BNT162b2 Vaccine in Kidney Transplant Recipients and Hemodialysis Patients. J Am Soc Nephrol 2021;32(9):2147-2152
7.   Ollila TA, Lu S, Masel R, *et al.* Antibody Response to COVID-19 Vaccination in Adults With Hematologic Malignant Disease. JAMA Oncol 2021
8.   Puranik A, Lenehan PJ, Silvert E, *et al.* Comparison of two highly-effective mRNA vaccines for COVID-19 during periods of Alpha and Delta variant prevalence. medRxiv 2021
9.   Kaiser RA, Haller MC, Apfalter P, *et al.* Comparison of BNT162b2 (Pfizer-BioNtech) and mRNA-1273 (Moderna) SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine immunogenicity in dialysis patients. Kidney Int 2021;100(3):697-698

Table 1: Patient characteristics (first dose response) (univariate analysis)

	mRNA-1273 (Moderna)	BNT162b2 vaccine (Pfizer-BioNTech)	*p*-Value
Kidney transplant recipients (n = 138)			
Number of subjects	44	94	
Male (n (%))	26 (59.0)	54 (57.4)	0.855*
Median age, years (IQR)	54.0 (48.8-61.0)	56.5 (46.0-66.8)	0.293**
Diabetes mellitus (n (%))	3 (6.8)	11 (11.7)	0.548*

Immunosuppressive therapy (n (%))
    CNI
    CNI + MMF/AZA/mTOR inhibitor
	6 (14.6)
	34 (77.3)
		23 (24.4)
		58 (61.7)
			0.146*
			0.071*

Positive antibody response (n (%))	11 (25.0)	8 (8.5)	**0.009***
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (median (IQR))	3.13 (1.93-7.83)	5.03 (3.03-6.71)	0.386**
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (geometric mean (GSD))	3.77 (2.36)	4.80 (2.06)	0.529***
Dialysis patients (n = 141)			
Number of subjects	61	80	
Male (n (%))	39 (63.9)	53 (66.3)	0.775*
Median age, years (IQR)	70 (60.0-78.0)	70 (62.0-75.0)	0.975**
Haemodialysis (n (%))	40 (65.6)	63 (78.8)	0.081*
Diabetes mellitus (n (%))	29 (47.5)	28 (35.0)	0.133*
Positive antibody response (n (%))	41 (67.2)	21 (26.3)	**< 0.001***
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (median (IQR))	6.43 (3.28-10.54)	3.03 (1.96-5.03)	**0.011***
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (geometric mean (GSD))	5.27 (2.26)	3.17 (1.91)	**0.016***
Total (n = 279)			
Number of subjects	105	174	
Male (n (%))	65 (61.9)	107 (61.4)	0.946*
Median age, years (IQR)	61.0 (50.0-72.0)	63.0 (51.5-71.0)	0.881**
Diabetes mellitus (n (%))	32 (30.4)	39 (22.4)	0.134*
Positive antibody response (n (%))	52 (49.5)	29 (16.7)	**< 0.001***
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (median (IQR))	5.70 (2.37-10.52)	3.34 (2.05-5.96)	0.054**
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (geometric mean (GSD))	4.91 (2.29)	3.55 (1.98)	0.077***

†   In responding patients
*   Based on Pearson's Chi-square test (or Fisher exact test in case of small cell counts)
**   Based on Mann-Whitney U test
*** Based on an unpaired Student's t-test comparing two mean log-GMTs
Abbreviations: AZA = azathioprine; CS = corticosteroids ; CNI = calcineurin inhibitors ; GSD = geometric standard deviation; IgG = immunoglobulins G ; IQR = interquartile range ; MMF = mycophenolate mofetil; mTOR = mechanistic target of rapamycin; n = number ; RBD = receptor binding domain ; SD = standard deviation

Table 2: Patient characteristics (second dose response) (univariate analysis)

	mRNA-1273 (Moderna)	BNT162b2 vaccine (Pfizer-BioNTech)	*p*-Value
Kidney transplant recipients (n = 133)			
Number of subjects	42	91	
Male (n (%))	25 (59.5)	52 (57.1)	0.796*
Median age, years (IQR)	55.5 (50.0-61.0)	57.0 (46.5-66.5)	0.365**
Diabetes mellitus (n (%))	3 (7.1)	10 (11.0)	0.754*

Immunosuppressive therapy (n (%))
    CNI
    CNI + MMF/AZA/mTOR inhibitor
	
	6 (14.3)
	33 (78.6)
		
		22 (24.2)
		56 (61.5)
			
			0.193*
			0.052*

Positive antibody response (n (%))	32 (76.2)	51 (56.0)	**0.026***
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (median (IQR))	12.39 (3.51-16.18)	5.62 (2.13-14.25)	0.159**
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (geometric mean (GSD))	7.27 (2.63)	5.37 (2.73)	NA***
Dialysis patients (n = 138)			
Number of subjects	58	80	
Male (n (%))	35 (60.3)	53 (66.3)	0.476*
Median age, years (IQR)	69.5 (60.0-77.8)	70.0 (61.8-75.0)	0.941**
Haemodialysis (n (%))	37 (63.8)	63 (78.8)	0.052*
Diabetes mellitus (n (%))	25 (43.1)	29 (36.3)	0.416*
Positive antibody response (n (%))	58 (100)	70 (87.5)	**0.005***
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (median (IQR))	16.16 (15.69-16.41)	16.58 (10.22-17.36)	0.194**
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (geometric mean (GSD))	15.22 (1.23)	11.86 (1.98)	NA***
Total (n = 271)			
Number of subjects	100	171	
Male (n (%))	60 (60.0)	105 (61.4)	0.819*
Median age, years (IQR)	61.0 (50.8-72.0)	63.0 (53.0-71.0)	0.831**
Diabetes mellitus (n (%))	28 (28.0)	39 (22.8)	0.339*
Positive antibody response (n (%))	90 (90.0)	121 (70.8)	**< 0.001***
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (median (IQR))	16.02 (13.42-16.39)	14.08 (4.89-17.14)	0.449**
Anti-RBD IgG antibody levels† (geometric mean (GSD))	11.70 (2.00)	8.49 (2.51)	NA***

† In all responding patients after second vaccine dose

* Based on Pearson's Chi-square test (or Fisher exact test)

** Based on Mann-Whitney U test

*** No p-values were determined for geometric mean anti-RBD IgG antibody levels, given deviations from normality

Abbreviations: AZA = azathioprine ; CS = corticosteroids ; CNI = calcineurin inhibitors ; GSD = geometric standard deviation; IgG = immunoglobulins G ; IQR = interquartile range ; MMF = mycophenolate mofetil; mTOR = mechanistic target of rapamycin; n = number ; NA = not applicable; RBD = receptor binding domain ; SD = standard deviation

Table 3.

A: Multiple logistic regression model for factors associated with antibody response to the first and second dose of SARS-CoV-2 Messenger RNA vaccine

Covariates	No Antibody Response	Antibody response	Crude OR (95% CI)	*p*-Value	Adjusted OR (95% CI)	*p*-Value
First dose response	n = 198	n = 81				
Type of patient Kidney transplant Haemodialysis Peritoneal dialysis	119 (60.1%) 63 (31.8%) 16 (8.1%)	19 (23.5%) 40 (49.3%) 22 (27.2%)	Ref 3.977 (2.127-7.434) 8.612 (3.847-19.276)	Ref <0.001 <0.001 Overall* <0.001	Ref 6.403 (2.970-13.804) 10.379 (4.143-26.000)	Ref **<0.001** **<0.001** Overall* **<0.001**
Gender Male Female	117 (59.1%) 81 (40.9%)	55 (67.9%) 26 (32.1%)	Ref 0.682 (0.396-1.179)	Ref 0.171	NA	NA
Age: median (IQR) (years)	62.5 (52.0-71.0)	62.0 (50.0-72.0)	1.000 (0.982-1.017)	0.977	0.972 (0.950-0.994)	**0.013**
Diabetes mellitus No Yes	150 (75.8%) 48 (24.2%)	58 (71.6%) 23 (28.4%)	Ref 1.239 (0.692-2.218)	Ref 0.470	NA	NA
Vaccine Type Pfizer Moderna	145 (73.2%) 53 (26.8%)	29 (35.8%) 52 (64.2%)	Ref 4.906 (2.823-8.525)	Ref <0.001	Ref 4.941 (2.698-9.047)	Ref **<0.001**
Second dose response	n = 60	n = 211				
Type of patient Kidney transplant Haemodialysis Peritoneal dialysis	50 (83.3%) 9 (15.0%) 1 (1.7%)	83 (39.3%) 91 (43.1%) 37 (17.5%)	Ref 6.091 (2.822-13.149) 22.289 (2.966-167.528)	Ref <0.001 0.003 Overall* <0.001	Ref 6.181 (2.828-13.511) 18.870 (2.483-143.380)	Ref **<0.001** 0.005 Overall* **<0.001**
Gender Male	32 (53.3%)	133 (63.0%)	Ref	Ref	NA	NA

Female	28 (46.7%)	78 (37.0%)	0.670 (0.376-1.196)	0.176		
Age: median (IQR) (years)	58.5 (50.0-68.0)	64.0 (52.5-72.0)	1.021 (1.002-1.041)	0.031	NA	NA
Diabetes mellitus No Yes	51 (85.0%) 9 (15.0%)	153 (72.5%) 58 (27.5%)	Ref 2.148 (0.994-4.641)	Ref 0.052	NA	NA
Vaccine Type Pfizer Moderna	50 (83.3%) 10 (16.7%)	121 (57.3%) 90 (42.7%)	Ref 3.719 (1.789-7.730)	Ref <0.001	Ref 3.428 (1.587-7.406)	Ref **0.002**

* Based on an overall likelihood ratio test

Abbreviations: CI = confidence interval; IQR = interquartile range; n = number; NA = not applicable; OR = odds ratio; Ref = reference

B: Multiple linear mixed model for factors associated with mean (log-transformed) antibody levels after first and second dose of SARS-CoV-2 Messenger RNA vaccine

Covariates	Multivariable analysis			
	Regression parameter	Standard error	t-statistic	*p*-Value
Intercept	1.715	0.355	4.828	< 0.001
Type of patient Kidney transplant Haemodialysis Peritoneal dialysis	Ref 0.730 0.822	Ref 0.122 0.148	Ref 5.972 5.549	Ref < 0.001 < 0.001 Overall* < 0.001
Age	-0.019	0.006	-3.358	< 0.001
Vaccine Type Pfizer Moderna	Ref 0.289	Ref 0.102	Ref 2.828	Ref 0.005
Second Dose No Yes	Ref 0.092	Ref 0.332	Ref 0.276	0.783
Age*Second Dose	0.018	0.005	3.351	< 0.001

* Based on an overall partial F-test

Abbreviations: CI = confidence interval; IQR = interquartile range; n = number; NA = not applicable; OR = odds ratio; Ref = reference

First, a multiple linear mixed was considered to establish factors associated with mean (log-transformed) antibody levels after first and second dose of SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine. Both haemodialysis patients (+ 0.730 units) and peritoneal dialysis patients (+ 0.822 units) showed higher mean log-transformed antibody levels compared to kidney transplant recipients (p < 0.001). Mean log-transformed antibody (Ab) levels were 0.289 units higher for Moderna vs. Pfizer vaccination (p = 0.005) and the vaccine effect was found to be not significantly different across vaccination moments. The age-effect vanished after the second vaccine dose (decrease of 0.002 units (s.e. = 0.004) in mean log-transformed Ab concentration for an increase of one year in age, p-value = 0.668). The mean log-transformed Ab concentration increased with 1.149 units (s.e. = 0.082; p < 0.001) after a second vaccination, as compared to the mean Ab concentration after the first dose, for an individual of age 60 (irrespective of the vaccine used and the type of patient). Note that since the second dose effect is age-dependent, the effect should be interpreted conditional on age.