medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.07.03.21259881; this version posted July 6, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Modeling the COVID-19 Vaccination Dynamics in the United States: An Estimation of Coverage Velocity and Carrying Capacity Based on Socio-demographic Vulnerability Indices in California

Alexander Bruckhaus[1]; Aidin Abedi[2*], MD; Sana Salehi[1], MD; Trevor A. Pickering[3], PhD; Yujia Zhang[1], MS; Aubrey Martinez[1], BS; Matthew Lai[1], MS; Rachael Garner[1], BA; Dominique Duncan[1], PhD*

[1] Laboratory of Neuro Imaging, USC Stevens Neuroimaging and Informatics Institute, Keck School of Medicine of USC, University of Southern California, 2025 Zonal Ave., Los Angeles, CA, 90033, USA

[2] Department of Neurosurgery, Keck School of Medicine, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA, 90033, USA

[3] Department of Population and Public Health Sciences, Keck School of Medicine, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA, 90033, USA

**Contributed equally*

Abstract

Introduction: Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) disparities among vulnerable populations are a paramount concern that extends to COVID-19 vaccine administration. We aim to better characterize the scope of vaccine inequity in California by comparing the Social Vulnerability Index (SVI) of California counties and respective vaccination rates, modeling the growth rate and anticipated maximum proportion of individuals vaccinated by SVI group. **Methods:** Overall SVI, its four themes, and 9228 data points of daily vaccination numbers across all 58 California counties were used to model, overall and by theme, growth velocity of proportion of population

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.07.03.21259881; this version posted July 6, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

vaccinated and the expected maximum proportion of individuals (at least 1 dose of Pfizer-BioNTech, Moderna, or Johnson & Johnson/Janssen) that will be vaccinated for each theme. Results: Overall high vulnerability counties in California have lower vaccine coverage velocity compared to low and moderate vulnerability counties. The largest disparity in coverage velocity between low and highly vulnerable counties was observed in Theme 3 (minority status & language). However, our model showed that highly vulnerable counties based on Theme 3 are expected to eventually achieve a higher proportion of vaccinated individuals compared to low vulnerable counterparts if current trajectories continue. Counties in the overall low vulnerability category are estimated to achieve a higher proportion of vaccinated individuals when compared to high and moderate vulnerable counties, assuming current trajectories. The largest disparity in asymptotic proportion vaccinated between high and low vulnerable counties was observed in Theme 2 (household composition & disability). **Conclusion:** This study provides insight into the problem of COVID-19 vaccine disparity across California which can be used to help promote equity during the current pandemic as well as guide the allocation of future vaccines such as COVID-19 booster shots.

Keywords

COVID-19; SARS-CoV-2; Coronavirus; Pandemics; Vaccination, Resource Allocation; Vulnerable Populations; Health Equity; Health Policy

Background

Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) disparities among vulnerable populations are a paramount concern that extends to COVID-19 vaccine administration. When compared with White populations, Hispanic and Black populations are at an increased risk of becoming hospitalized and dying from COVID-19, where Hispanic or Latinx persons are 3 times more

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.07.03.21259881; this version posted July 6, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

likely to become hospitalized and Black people are 1.9 times more likely to die from COVID-19[1]. Regarding vaccine administration, White people have received at least one dose of the COVID-19 vaccine at a rate 1.5 times higher than Black people and 1.3 times higher than Hispanic people[2]. California has taken measures to address these inequities, such as dedicating an increased allocation of COVID-19 vaccines for the hardest hit communities while also implementing outreach programs to provide resources and information for these communities. However, California reported on May 4, 2021 that 53% of individuals in the lowest quartile of the Healthy Places Index, an indicator developed by the Public Health Alliance in Southern California to assess community conditions, remain unvaccinated while only 28% of individuals in the highest quartile remain unvaccinated[3]. These data highlight the importance of the vaccine disparity in California and likely have implications on a larger scale across the United States. We aim to better characterize the scope of vaccine inequity in California by comparing the Social Vulnerability Index (SVI) of California counties and respective vaccination rates through modeling the growth velocity of vaccination coverage and estimating the anticipated maximum proportion of individuals vaccinated by SVI group.

Methods

SVI was used in our study to describe the levels of vulnerability. The SVI is a measure defined by the CDC to assess social vulnerability among populations and is comprised of four themes:1) socioeconomic status, 2) minority status & language, 3) household composition & disability, and 4) housing type & transportation. California counties were categorized into tertiles for overall SVI and each of its four components: SVI < 0.33 denoting a low vulnerability level, $0.33 \leq$ SVI < 0.66 describing a moderate vulnerability level, and SVI ≥ 0.66 describing a high vulnerability level. These measures have been used in prior reports pertaining to equitable vaccine coverage

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.07.03.21259881; this version posted July 6, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

such as a CDC report published in March 2021[4]. The proportion of vaccinated residents in each county (at least one dose of Pfizer-BioNTech, Moderna, or Johnson & Johnson/Janssen) was used to determine the vaccine coverage across California counties. Together, these two measures were used to model, overall and by theme, the growth velocity of the proportion of population vaccinated, and to estimate the expected maximum proportion of individuals that will be vaccinated. The shape of the longitudinal curves of cumulative vaccination status for each county resembled a logistic growth curve, such as those traditionally used in ecology to describe the growth of a population towards an asymptotic value. Therefore, we used nonlinear ecological growth curves to describe the per capita growth rate ("vaccination velocity", v) and carrying capacity ("asymptotic maximum", K) of populations within each category of the overall and themed SVI.

Results

The nonlinear ecological growth curve approach allowed us to conduct meaningful hypothesis testing of the v and K parameters across counties of differing SVI status. To assess the acceptability of our models, the ecological growth curve models were compared to cubic spline models and the "null" ecological growth models without an effect of SVI status. The R^2 values for the models with the effect of SVI suggested meaningful differences in longitudinal curves among counties of differing SVI status. Overall, high vulnerability counties in California had a lower vaccine coverage velocity compared with low and moderate vulnerability counties. The largest disparity in coverage velocity between low and high vulnerability counties was observed in Theme 3 (minority status & language). However, assuming the continuation of the current trajectory, our model showed that highly vulnerable counties based on Theme 3 are expected to eventually achieve a higher proportion of vaccinated individuals compared with low

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.07.03.21259881; this version posted July 6, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

vulnerability counterparts. Additionally, for the overall SVI category, low vulnerability counties are estimated to achieve a higher proportion of vaccinated individuals when compared with high and moderate vulnerability counties. The largest disparity between the high and low vulnerability counties in the asymptotic proportion of the vaccinated population was observed in Theme 2 (household composition & disability).

Conclusion

Our study suggests that SVI is a useful measure to identify the most vulnerable populations, which can be used as guidance to help mitigate health inequities as recommended by The National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (NASEM)[5]. Furthermore, for the Theme 3 SVI category, although high vulnerability counties yielded the lowest vaccine coverage velocity, this population is expected to ultimately have a higher proportion of vaccinated individuals than low and moderate vulnerability Theme 3 counties. This finding emphasizes the importance of continued intervention by the California government, such as outreach programming and increased allocation of resources to these vulnerable communities. It is also important to recognize that vaccine inequities are rooted in challenges to accessibility and allocation strategies rather than simply a product of vaccine hesitancy. This study provides insight into COVID-19 vaccine disparity across California and can be used to help promote equity during the current pandemic and guide the allocation of future vaccines such as COVID-19 booster shots.

Funding acknowledgment

This study was supported by the National Science Foundation (NSF) under Award Number 2027456 (COVID-ARC). This publication was supported by grants UL1TR001855 and UL1TR000130 from the National Center for Advancing Translational Science (NCATS) of the

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.07.03.21259881; this version posted July 6, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

U.S. National Institutes of Health (NIH). The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily represent the official views of the NIH or other entities.

References

1. Risk for COVID-19 Infection, Hospitalization, and Death by Race/Ethnicity. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). Published February 11, 2020. Accessed July 1, 2021. https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/covid-data/investigations-discovery/hospitalization-death-by-race-ethnicity.html

2. Latest Data on COVID-19 Vaccinations by Race/Ethnicity. KFF. Published 2021. Accessed July 1, 2021. https://www.kff.org/coronavirus-covid-19/issue-brief/latest-data-on-covid-19-vaccinations-race-ethnicity/

3. As California Surpasses 30 Million Vaccines, Governor Newsom Doubles Down on Efforts to Vaccinate Hard-to-Reach Communities. California Governor. Published May 4, 2021. Accessed July 1, 2021. https://www.gov.ca.gov/2021/05/04/as-california-surpasses-30-million-vaccines-governor-newsom-doubles-down-on-efforts-to-vaccinate-hard-to-reach-communities/

4. Hughes MM, Wang A, Grossman MK, et al. County-Level COVID-19 Vaccination Coverage and Social Vulnerability — United States, December 14, 2020–March 1, 2021. *Morb Mortal Wkly Rep*. 2021;70(12):431-436. doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm7012e1

5. National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. In: *Framework for Equitable Allocation of COVID-19 Vaccine*. The National Academies Press; 2020:89-144. Accessed July 1, 2021. https://doi.org/10.17226/25917.