Transmission event of SARS-CoV-2 Delta variant reveals multiple vaccine breakthrough

infections

Timothy Farinholt, PhD[1], Harsha Doddapaneni, PhD[2,3], Xiang Qin, PhD[2,3], Vipin Menon, PhD[2,3],

Qinchang Meng, PhD[2,3], Ginger Metcalf[2,3], Hsu Chao, DVM[2,3], Marie-Claude Gingras, PhD[2,3],

Paige Farinholt, MD[4], Charu Agrawal, MD[4], Donna M. Muzny M.Sc.[2,3], Pedro A. Piedra, MD[1],

Richard A. Gibbs, PhD[2,3], Joseph Petrosino, PhD[1]

[1]Alkek Center for Metagenomics and Microbiome Research, Department of Molecular Virology

and Microbiology, Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, TX, USA [2]Department of Molecular and

Human Genetics, Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, TX, USA [3]Human Genome Sequencing

Center, Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, TX, USA [4]Department of Medicine, Baylor College

of Medicine, Houston, TX, USA

Key Points

Question: Which SARS-CoV-2 variant is responsible for 6 cases of vaccine breakthrough, one

interventional monoclonal antibody treatment, and one death?

Findings: Viral sequencing revealed 6 vaccinated patients were infected with the Delta SARS-

CoV-2 variant. With no histories of vaccine breakthrough, this suggests Delta variant may

possess immune evasion in patients that received the Pfizer BNT162b2, Moderna mRNA-1273,

and Covaxin BBV152.

Meaning: Delta variant may pose the highest risk out of any currently circulating SARS-CoV-2

variants, with increased transmissibility over Alpha variant and possible vaccine breakthrough.

Abstract

Importance: Vaccine breakthrough by an emergent SARS-CoV-2 variant poses a great risk to

global public health.

Objective: To determine the SARS-CoV-2 variant responsible for 6 cases of vaccine

breakthrough.

Design: Nasopharyngeal swabs from suspected vaccine breakthrough cases were tested for

SARS-CoV-2 by qPCR for Wuhan-Hu1 and Alpha variant. Positive samples were then

sequenced by Swift Normalase Amplicon Panels to determine the causal variant.

Setting: Transmission event occurred at events surrounding a wedding outside of Houston, TX.

Two patients from India, likely transmitted the Delta variant to other guests.

Participants: Following a positive SARS-CoV-2 qPCR test at a third-party site, six fully

vaccinated patients were investigated. Three males and three females ranged from 53 to 69

years old. One patient suffered from diabetes while three others were classified as overweight.

No significant other comorbidities were identified. None of the patients had a history of failed

vaccination.

Introduction

High numbers of global SARS-CoV-2 infections have led to the emergence of variants, notably

Alpha variant (B.1.1.7 UK), Beta (B.1.351 S. Africa), Gamma (P.1 Brazil), Epsilon (B.1.429

California), Iota (B.1.526 New York) and now, Delta and Kappa (B.1.617.2 and B.1.617.1 India).

Each of these strains gained advantageous mutations to become a dominant strain, e.g., Iota

first discovered November 23, 2020, represented 45% of new cases as of February 7, 2021[1].

Increased transmissibility results from genomic changes such as nonsynonymous mutations in

the receptor-binding domain (RBD) of the S-gene (encodes the spike protein) conferring higher

binding affinity to host angiotensin-converting enzyme 2 (ACE2) receptors or more efficient

cleavage by Transmembrane Serine Protease 2 (TMPRSS2) and subsequently, viral entry[2,3].

Mutations could also lead to vaccine breakthrough[4]. The spike protein's RBD is

immunodominant[5], targeted by convalescent sera and vaccine-elicited antibodies (Pfizer

BNT162b2[6]), though evidence suggest substantial role of the amino-terminal domain (NTD).

Mutations in the RBD therefore pose a risk of allowing immune evasion to one or more of the

current vaccines[4]. The Kappa and Delta variants emerged from the Indian state of Maharashtra

in December 2020, contributing to a resurgence of cases in the country, representing 70% of

daily new cases on May 2, 2021[7]. The B.1.617 lineage is now widely circulating in over 50

countries based on viral sequence data and is classified as a variant of concern by the CDC.

The Kappa and Delta variant lineages are defined by 7 and 8 nonsynonymous mutations in the

S protein respectively (Figure 1).

Emergent data suggests partial immunity to the Kappa variant, as convalescent sera and

vaccine-elicited (Pfizer BNT162b2 and Moderna mRNA-1273) antibodies show a 2.3- and 4-fold

reduction in neutralization in vitro respectively (noting that this study used protein-pseudotyped

lentiviruses lacking the T478K mutation found in Delta variant)[8]. A test negative case control

study estimated the effectiveness of vaccination (two weeks post second vaccination) against

symptomatic disease by Delta variant to be as high as 88% for Pfizer BNT162b2 in the UK

(compared to 93% for Alpha variant)[9].

Here we describe a transmission of a Delta variant containing SARS-CoV-2 strain, between

family members associated with events surrounding a wedding with 92 attendees, near

Houston, Texas. Attendance required guests be fully vaccinated and took place outdoors in a

large, open-air tent. To date, 6 individuals have tested positive for SARS-CoV-2, all patients

were symptomatic, one patient severely enough to receive monoclonal antibody infusion

treatment (Regeneron Pharmaceuticals Inc.) and one patient has died. Encounter timings and

viral sequence similarities suggest the strain containing the Delta variant was transmitted to

wedding guests from two patients travelling from India. With no history of vaccine failure in

these patients, our observations suggest these are true cases of vaccine breakthrough,

mediated by the Delta variant.

Results

In early April, 2021, Patient 0a, a man with no comorbidities, and Patient 0b, a woman with

diabetes, travelled from India to attend a wedding in Texas (designated 0a and 0b due to

difficulty establishing true patient 0). Both tested negative for SARS-CoV-2 by qPCR as part of

the pre-flight criteria. Formal wedding events were held outdoors and in a large open-air tent

and attendance required full vaccination (Patient 0a and 0b travelled to Houston 10 days after

their second doses of Covaxin BBV152, Table 1). Patients 1-5 confirmed having close

encounters with Patient 0a and 0b at the wedding. Events were attended by fewer than 100

guests.

On the evening of the first night of the wedding, Patient 0b complained of fatigue but associated

it with diabetes and jet lag. Patient 0a developed a cough two days after the wedding and both

him and Patient 0b developed a fever three days after. Patient 0a and 0b tested positive for

SARS-CoV-2 by nasal swab qPCR 4 days after the wedding at a third-party site. Patient 0a's

symptoms progressed over the following days and was admitted to the hospital on day 6 post

wedding. He was transferred to Baylor St. Luke's hospital in the Texas Medical Center with

worsening symptoms. A month after the wedding, Patient 0a died from complications of COVID-

19.

Four other guests have tested positive for SARS-CoV-2 following confirmed interactions with

Patient 0a and 0b. All positive patients received Pfizer BNT162b2, Moderna mRNA-1273, or

Covaxin BBV152 (Table 1). Six of these have experienced symptoms of COVID-19 (Table 1).

Patient 1, who received the Pfizer BNT162b2 vaccine developed severe symptoms and was

admitted to Baylor St. Luke's hospital for monoclonal antibody infusion treatment (Regeneron

Pharmaceuticals Inc.) on ten days after the wedding. The density of vaccine breakthrough

resulting in COVID-19 symptoms suggested the patients were carrying a SARS-CoV-2 variant.

To characterize the variant, total RNA was extracted from nasopharyngeal swabs of each of the

6 patients. All positive for SARS-CoV-2 Wuhan-Hu-1 and negative for Alpha variant by qPCR

(Table 1). Human RNase P (RP) gene control values suggested sampling of patients and RNA

isolation were performed optimally. Amplicon libraries were successfully prepared from all 6

qPCR positive samples (N1 Ct value 17 – 29), with 900,754 – 2,381,756 pass-filter reads

generated using Swift Biosciences Sarscov2 analysis pipeline (sTable 1). Median sequence

coverage ranged from 2085x to 12,932x with >99.7% of the genome covered at 40x or greater.

All 6 samples were identified as the SARS-CoV-2 Delta variant based on the presence of the 10

mutations listed by the CDC's 'Selected Characteristics of SARS-CoV-2 Variants of Interest'.

These mutations, located on the S protein were T19R, (G142D), 156del, 157del, R158G,

L452R, T478K, D614G, P681R, D950N. 156del, 157del, R158G are annotated as a single

mutation (S:GAGTTCA22028G:Glu156_Arg158delinsGly) due to their proximity (Figure 1).

Phylogenetic analysis places each patient sample in a subclade of the Delta variant (white box,

Figure 2).

Discussion

Ending the current SARS-CoV-2 pandemic requires limiting the spread through continued

vigilance of masking, social distancing, and vaccination. Variants emerge from areas

experiencing uncontrolled viral spread and display increased transmissibility due to mutations in

the spike protein. These mutations may occur in the antigenic region of the RBD, altering

binding sites for vaccine-elicited antibodies. Mutations such as the ones found in the Kappa

variant, provide partial resistance to antibody neutralization (Pfizer BNT162b2, Moderna mRNA-

1273, Regeneron[8], and Covaxin BBV152[10]), likely due to changes in epitope sequence.

Vaccine breakthrough by highly transmissible variants (Delta variant up to 50% more

transmissible than Alpha variant, SAGE) could lead to significant setbacks in pandemic control

efforts, requiring renewed social distancing and masking efforts. Significant vaccine

breakthrough could necessitate vaccine boosters or targeted lockdowns to reduce spread of

infection. An analysis of spike protein epitopes found several antigenic regions (IDa-IDi, Zhange

et al.). Delta variant spike protein contains mutations in three of these regions (450–469 IDf,

480–499 IDg, and 522–646 IDh, Figure 1) possibly resulting in decreased neutralization by

vaccine-elicited antibodies.

According to the cases presented in this study, antibodies elicited in patients receiving Pfizer

BNT162b2, Moderna mRNA-1273, and Covaxin BBV152 may provide decreased immunity to

the Delta variant. It is possible that some individuals in this study failed to produce an effective

immune response to their immunization, however, none of the patients had a history of vaccine

failure.

Our observations support continued efforts to generate SARS-CoV-2 genomic sequences from

positive patient samples, in order to identify possible vaccine breakthrough mutations. The

continued effectiveness of vaccine-elicited antibodies towards SARS-CoV-2 variants highlights

the importance of vaccination efforts. Partial efficacy of current vaccines (70% at 75% coverage)

is theoretically sufficient to stop a pandemic[11]. Slowing the spread could prevent emergence of

future variants, hastening the end of this pandemic.

Materials and Methods

Specimen collection and ethical considerations

All individuals were initially tested by third party SARS-CoV-2 testing sites. To confirm,

nasopharyngeal swabs were collected by a physician or nurse as close to the first positive test

as possible. Samples were submitted to the Alkek Center for Metagenomics and Microbiome

Research for RNA extraction and the Human Genome Sequencing Center for qPCR

confirmation. Protocols for collection, qPCR testing, and whole genome sequencing were

approved by the Baylor College of Medicine Institutional Review Board (H-47423).

cDNA synthesis and amplicon libraries.

RNA extracted from nasopharyngeal swabs of six individuals that tested positive for SARS-

COV-2 using qPCR was converted to 1st strand cDNA using SuperScript™ IV First-Strand

Synthesis System (Thermo Fisher, Cat. No. 18091050). The 1st strand cDNA reaction was

performed starting with 10 µl of total RNA in 25 µl reaction mix, which was incubated at 23⁰C for

10 minutes followed by 50⁰C for 50 minutes. The resulting 1st strand cDNA was then diluted with

DEPC treated water, where for two samples with Ct<24 cDNA was diluted 20 times and for the

remaining four samples, with Ct>24, cDNA was diluted 2 times, respectively. This diluted 1st

strand cDNA (10 ul) was used as input for amplification of the SARS-CoV-2 viral genome, using

the SARS-CoV-2 Additional Genome Coverage Panel (Cat#COVG1V2-96). This panel was

designed against SARS-CoV-2 Wuhan-Hu-1 strain (NC_045512.2) and has 345 amplicons of

116-255 bp (average 150 bp) that cover 99.7% (29,828 of 29,903 total bases) of the genome.

These amplicons come in a single tube, and the workflow involves two rounds of PCR, a

multiplex PCR (4 + 18 cycles) and the indexing PCR (9 cycles) to generate sequence ready

libraries. The reaction mixes and the thermocycler conditions were performed according to the

Swift Normalase® Amplicon Panels (SNAP) Workflow. Libraries were barcoded with 8bp unique

dual indices at the Indexing PCR. For library normalization, the 2 nM Normalase I protocol was

performed on libraries individually, followed by pooling 5 µl of each post-Normalase I library to

perform Normalase II reaction, which results in sequence ready library pool. Before sequencing,

the normalized library pool concentration was measured using qPCR with KAPA Library

Quantification Kits (Roche, KK4835, 07960204001).

Illumina Sequencing.

The pooled SARS-CoV-2 amplicon libraries were sequenced on Illumina NovaSeq 6000 S4

flowcell to generate 2x150bp reads.

Swift amplicon data analysis.

Swift amplicon data were analyzed using Swift Biosciences Sarscov2 analysis pipeline

(https://github.com/swiftbiosciences/sarscov2analysis_docker) with minimum read coverage

depth of 3. The GATK variants were next filtered with allele fraction >=80, and min read depth

30x[12,13]. Swift analysis pipeline produced variant vcf file, consensus genome, pangolin lineage

and Nextclade assignment (https://clades.nextstrain.org/). Variant vcf from Swift amplicon data

was also annotated using SnpEff[13].

Phylogenetic Analysis.

Sequences for the designated variants of concern and variants of interest by centers for disease

control (CDC), was downloaded from GISAID on 2nd June 2021[15]. All samples downloaded from

GISAID, were analyzed using Pangolin V3.0.3 with pangoLEARN 2021-05-27[16] to ensure that

the variant designation assigned by GISAID is accurate. Global alignment of 334 sequences

including the sequences from the current study was done using MAFFT v7.480[17]. Maximum-

likelihood phylogenetic tree with boot strap (5,000) was generated using IQ-Tree V2.1.2[18,19].

Annotation and visualization of the tree was carried out by using FigTree v1.4.4

(http://tree.bio.ed.ac.uk/software/figtree/). Clades were labeled with the WHO nomenclature.

Acknowledgments.

Part of this work was supported by the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases

(Grant#1U19AI144297). The authors are grateful to the production teams at HGSC for data

generation. We also thank Swift Biosciences for their input for amplicon sequencing. We

gratefully acknowledge the authors and the originating and submitting laboratories of the

sequences from the GISAID hCov-19 Database on which our research was based. See

supplemental acknowledgment for details.

Figure 1. Spike protein mutation prevalence in SARS-CoV-2 variant lineages. Only mutations

found in greater than 50% in at least one lineage are displayed. Green text denotes a mutation

found in all patients in this report. Figure modified from Outbreak.info[5]

Figure 2. Phylogenetic analysis of SARS-CoV-2 variants. All patients (white box) cluster in a

sub clade of the Delta variant (red). Sequences obtained from GISAID.

Supplementary Figure 1. Mutation metrics from sequencing results for all 6 samples. Figure

generated using Coronapp[9]

Figure 1

	L5F	S13I	L18F	T19R	DEL69/70	D80A	T95I	G142D	/DEL144/145	W152C	E154K	DEL157/158	D215G	/DEL241/243	D253G	K417N	L452R	T478K	E484Q	E484K	N501Y	A570D	D614G	P681R	P681H	A701V	T716I	D950N	S982A	Q1071H	H1101D	D1118H
B.1.617.2																																
B.1.617.1																																
B.1.1.7																																
B.1.526																																
B.1.351																																
B.1.429																																

Mutation prevalance in lineage   not detected

0%   100%

receptor binding domain   Furin cleavage site

Figure 2

Table 1. Patient demographics, vaccine history, and symptoms

Sample	Sex	Age	Height (cm)	Weight (kg)	Vaccine received	Symptoms	Comorbidities†	N1 qPCR Ct
Patient 0a	Male	67-69	177.8	81.6	Covaxin BBV152	Fever, cough, body aches, fatigue, loss of taste and/or smell, Shortness of breath at rest, Shortness of breath with activity	None	29
Patient 0b	Female	65-70	152.4	53	Covaxin BBV152	Fever, cough, body aches, fatigue, loss of taste and/or smell, Shortness of breath at rest, Shortness of breath with activity	Diabetes	27
Patient 1	Male	60-66	172	68	Pfizer BNT162b2	Cough, fatigue	None	17
Patient 2	Male	59-64	170.1	77	Pfizer BNT162b2	Fever, cough, fatigue	Hypertension	24
Patient 3	Female	51-56	155	63.5	Moderna mRNA-1273	Fever, cough, body aches, fatigue, loss of taste and/or smell	Overweight	25
Patient 4	Female	51-56	162.6	88.5	Moderna mRNA-1273	Fatigue, loss of taste and/or smell	Overweight	22

† - As defined by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention

Supplementary table 1. Swift Amplicon Normalase Panel sequencing metrics

Sample	Reads passed filter	Yield (Mb)	Mean	Stdev	Median	Maximum	Bases without coverage	0x %	>=5x %	>=10x %	>=20x %	>=40x %
Patient 0a	900,754	272	2941.96	3405.34	2085	216863	46	0.15	99.85	99.84	99.83	99.8
Patient 0b	2,381,756	719	15470.4	11416.18	12932	108010	43	0.14	99.85	99.85	99.84	99.84
Patient 3	1,458,602	440	9711.2	8845.54	7534	81585	42	0.14	99.83	99.81	99.8	99.72
Patient 1	1,424,114	430	8651.92	14635.48	4457	159997	40	0.13	99.84	99.84	99.83	99.72
Patient 4	1,501,130	453	9067.53	8965.74	6690	119267	42	0.14	99.86	99.84	99.83	99.8
Patient 2	1,710,539	517	11420.22	10814.68	8203	91027	41	0.14	99.85	99.84	99.83	99.72

References

1. New York City COVID-19 Cases Caused by SARS-CoV-2 Variants Report (3.23 .2021). 2021;0:2021.

2. Ogawa J, Zhu W, Tonnu N, et al. The D614G mutation in the SARS-CoV2 Spike protein increases infectivity in an ACE2 receptor dependent manner. *bioRxiv*. 2020;90033(4). doi:10.1101/2020.07.21.214932

3. Hatmal MM, Alshaer W, Al-Hatamleh MAI, et al. Comprehensive Structural and Molecular Comparison of Spike Proteins of SARS-CoV-2, SARS-CoV and MERS-CoV, and Their Interactions with ACE2. *Cells*. 2020;9(12). doi:10.3390/cells9122638

4. Harvey WT, Carabelli AM, Jackson B, et al. SARS-CoV-2 variants, spike mutations and immune escape. *Nat Rev Microbiol*. 2021;614. doi:10.1038/s41579-021-00573-0

5. Walls AC, Park YJ, Tortorici MA, Wall A, McGuire AT, Veesler D. Structure, Function, and Antigenicity of the SARS-CoV-2 Spike Glycoprotein. *Cell*. 2020;181(2):281-292.e6. doi:10.1016/j.cell.2020.02.058

6. Sahin U, Muik A, Derhovanessian E, et al. COVID-19 vaccine BNT162b1 elicits human antibody and TH1 T cell responses. *Nature*. 2020;586(7830):594-599. doi:10.1038/s41586-020-2814-7

7. Mullen JL, Tseung G, Latif AA, et al. Center for Viral Systems Biology outbreak.info. Published 2020. https://outbreak.info/

8. Tada T, Zhou H, Dcosta BM, Samanovic MI, Mulligan MJ, Landau NR. The Spike Proteins of SARS-CoV-2 B.1.617 and B.1.618 Variants Identified in India Provide Partial Resistance to Vaccine-elicited and Therapeutic Monoclonal Antibodies. *bioRxiv*. 2016;(212):6-8.

9. Bernal JL, Andrews N, Gower C, et al. Effectiveness of COVID-19 vaccines against the B.1.617.2 variant Background. :0-2.

10. Yadav PD, Sapkal GN, Abraham P, et al. Neutralization of variant under investigation B.1.617 with sera of BBV152 vaccinees. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2021;6(2):106192. doi:10.1093/cid/ciab411

11. Bartsch SM, O'Shea KJ, Ferguson MC, et al. Vaccine Efficacy Needed for a COVID-19 Coronavirus Vaccine to Prevent or Stop an Epidemic as the Sole Intervention. *Am J Prev Med*. 2020;59(4):493-503. doi:10.1016/j.amepre.2020.06.011

12. Paden CR, Tao Y, Queen K, et al. Rapid, Sensitive, Full-Genome Sequencing of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2. *Emerg Infect Dis*. 2020;26(10):2401-2405. doi:10.3201/eid2610.201800

13. Cingolani P, Platts A, Wang LL, et al. A program for annotating and predicting the effects of single nucleotide polymorphisms, SnpEff. *Fly (Austin)*. 2012;6(2):80-92. doi:10.1101/2021.03.09.21252822

14. Mercatelli D, Triboli L, Fornasari E, Ray F, Giorgi FM. Coronapp: A web application to annotate and monitor SARS-CoV-2 mutations. *J Med Virol*. 2021;93(5):3238-3245. doi:10.1002/jmv.26678

15.   Elbe S, Buckland-Merrett G. Data, disease and diplomacy: GISAID's innovative contribution to global health. *Glob Challenges*. 2017;1(1):33-46. doi:10.1002/gch2.1018

16.   Rambaut A, Holmes EC, O'Toole Á, et al. A dynamic nomenclature proposal for SARS-CoV-2 lineages to assist genomic epidemiology. *Nat Microbiol*. 2020;5(11):1403-1407. doi:10.1038/s41564-020-0770-5

17.   Katoh K, Standley DM. MAFFT multiple sequence alignment software version 7: Improvements in performance and usability. *Mol Biol Evol*. 2013;30(4):772-780. doi:10.1093/molbev/mst010

18.   Hoang DT, Chernomor O, von Haeseler A, Minh BQ, Vinh LS. UFBoot2: Improving the Ultrafast Bootstrap Approximation. Molecular biology and evolution. *Mol Biol Evol*. 2018;35(2):518-522. doi:10.5281/zenodo.854445

19.   Minh BQ, Schmidt HA, Chernomor O, et al. IQ-TREE 2: New Models and Efficient Methods for Phylogenetic Inference in the Genomic Era. *Mol Biol Evol*. 2020;37(5):1530-1534. doi:10.1093/molbev/msaa015