

1 **Live virus neutralisation testing in convalescent patients and subjects vaccinated**
2 **against 19A, 20B, 20I/501Y.V1 and 20H/501Y.V2 isolates of SARS-CoV-2**

3

4 Claudia Gonzalez^{a *}, Carla Saade^{a *}, Antonin Bal^{a,b}, Martine Valette^{a,b}, Kahina Saker^a, Bruno
5 Lina^{a,b}, Laurence Josset^{a,b}, Mary-Anne Trabaud^a, Guillaume Thierry^c, Elisabeth Botelho-
6 Nevers^{d,e}, Stéphane Paul^{d,f}, Paul Verhoeven^{d,g}, Thomas Bourlet^{d,g}, Sylvie Pillet^{d,g}, Florence
7 Morfin^{a,b}, Sophie Trouillet-Assant^{a,b **}, Bruno Pozzetto^{d,g **} on behalf of COVID-SER study
8 group

9

10 ^a*Laboratoire de Virologie, Institut des Agents Infectieux, Laboratoire associé au Centre*
11 *National de Référence des virus des infections respiratoires, Hospices Civils de Lyon, Lyon,*
12 *France;* ^b*Virpath, CIRI, INSERM U1111, CNRS UMR5308, ENS Lyon, Université Claude*
13 *Bernard Lyon 1, Villeurbanne, France;* ^c*Centre Hospitalier Universitaire de Saint-Etienne,*
14 *Unité des soins intensifs, Saint-Etienne, France ;* ^d*CIRI, équipe GIMAP, Université de Lyon,*
15 *Université de Saint-Etienne, INSERM U1111, CNRS UMR5308, ENS de Lyon, UCBL1, Saint-*
16 *Etienne, France;* ^f*Département d'immunologie, Centre Hospitalier Universitaire de Saint-*
17 *Etienne, Saint-Etienne, France*

18 ^e*Département des agents infectieux et d'hygiène, Centre Hospitalier Universitaire de Saint-*
19 *Etienne, Saint-Etienne, France.*

20

21 ^e*Département des maladies infectieuses, Centre Hospitalier Universitaire de Saint-Etienne,*
22 *Saint-Etienne, France ;* ^f*Département d'immunologie, Centre Hospitalier Universitaire de*
23 *Saint-Etienne, Saint-Etienne, France*

24

25

26 * These authors contributed equally to the manuscript.

27 ** These authors contributed equally to the manuscript.

28

29 Corresponding author: Bruno Pozzetto, MD, PhD

30 Address: CIRI, équipe GIMAP, Université de Lyon, Université de Saint-Etienne, INSERM

31 U1111, CNRS UMR5308, ENS de Lyon, UCBL1, 42023 Saint-Etienne, France.

32 E-mail address: bruno.pozzetto@univ-st-etienne.fr

33 Keywords: SARS-CoV-2; humoral response; variant; live virus neutralisation test.

34 **Abstract**

35 *Background:* SARS-CoV-2 mutations appeared recently and can lead to conformational
36 changes in the spike protein and probably induce modifications in antigenicity. In this study,
37 we wanted to assess the neutralizing capacity of antibodies to prevent cell infection, using a
38 live virus neutralisation test.

39 *Methods:* Sera samples were collected from different populations: two-dose vaccinated
40 COVID-19-naïve healthcare workers (HCWs; Pfizer-BioNTech BNT161b2), 6-months post
41 mild COVID-19 HCWs, and critical COVID-19 patients. We tested various clades such as
42 19A (initial one), 20B (B.1.1.241 lineage), 20I/501Y.V1 (B.1.1.7 lineage), and 20H/501Y.V2
43 (B.1.351 lineage).

44 *Results:* No significant difference was observed between the 20B and 19A isolates for HCWs
45 with mild COVID-19 and critical patients. However, a significant decrease in neutralisation
46 ability was found for 20I/501Y.V1 in comparison with 19A isolate for critical patients and
47 HCWs 6-months post infection. Concerning 20H/501Y.V2, all populations had a significant
48 reduction in neutralising antibody titres in comparison with the 19A isolate. Interestingly, a
49 significant difference in neutralisation capacity was observed for vaccinated HCWs between
50 the two variants whereas it was not significant for the convalescent groups.

51 *Conclusion:* Neutralisation capacity was slightly reduced for critical patients and HCWs 6-
52 months post infection. No neutralisation escape could be feared concerning the two variants
53 of concern in both populations. The reduced neutralising response observed towards the
54 20H/501Y.V2 in comparison with the 19A and 20I/501Y.V1 isolates in fully immunized
55 subjects with the BNT162b2 vaccine is a striking finding of the study.

56 Several SARS-CoV-2 variants of concern (VOC) with mutations impacting notably
57 the spike (S) protein have been detected recently [1]. These mutations can lead to
58 conformational changes and probably induce modifications in antigenicity. Serological
59 studies based on SARS-CoV-2 pseudotyped or chimeric viruses have been performed to
60 measure the neutralisation activity of serum specimens of convalescent patients or subjects
61 immunized by SARS-CoV-2 vaccines. Although these tests are easier to conduct, their ability
62 to predict neutralising activity against authentic clinical viral isolates needs to be evaluated
63 [2].

64 Herein we compared the ability of neutralising antibodies (NAb) directed against
65 SARS-CoV-2 to prevent cell infection in different populations, using a live Virus
66 Neutralisation Test (VNT) against SARS-CoV-2 isolates belonging to various clades: 19A,
67 20B (B.1.1.241 lineage), 20I/501Y.V1 (B.1.1.7 lineage) and 20H/501Y.V2 (B.1.351 lineage).
68 VNT was performed as previously reported using an observed viral load of 100 to 500 50%
69 Tissue Culture Infectious Doses (TCID₅₀) for each isolate [3,4].

70 Serum specimens were collected from two-dose vaccinated COVID-19 naïve healthcare
71 workers (HCWs; n=30) between two and four weeks after the administration of the Pfizer-
72 BioNTech BNT162b2 vaccine (group 1), a subgroup of HCWs exhibiting significant NAb
73 against 19A (50% plaque reduction neutralisation test (PRNT₅₀) ranging from 20 to 240) 6-
74 months after mild COVID-19 (n=29; group 2) [5], and critical COVID-19 patients sampled
75 within one month after symptom onset (median [IQR]: 28 [22.5-33.5] days; n=25; group 3).
76 All COVID-19 patients from groups 2 and 3 had been infected during the first wave of
77 COVID-19 that occurred in France in March-April of 2020. Written informed consent was
78 obtained from all HCWs; ethics approval was obtained from the national review board for
79 biomedical research in April 2020 (Comité de Protection des Personnes Sud Méditerranée I,
80 Marseille, France; ID RCB 2020-A00932-37), and the study was registered on

81 ClinicalTrials.gov (NCT04341142). Concerning critical patients, this study was approved by
82 the ethics committee of the university hospital of Saint-Etienne (reference number
83 IRBN512020/CHUSTE).

84 No significant difference in median NAb titres was observed between the 19A isolate
85 taken as reference and the 20B isolate that circulated during the second pandemic wave at the
86 end of 2020 in Europe (Figure 1A). As previously reported between mild and severe patients
87 [3], the three populations exhibited significantly different median levels of NAb for 19A
88 isolate (Figure 1B); the same picture was observed for the two VOC (data not shown).

89 By comparison to the 19A isolate, the median [IQR] fold reduction in NAb titres was
90 1.5 [1.2-1.7] and 3.5 [2.7-4.3] in group 1, 1.6 [1.3-1.8] and 1.9 [1.5-2.3] in group 2, and 2.3
91 [1.8-2.8] and 2.2 [1.5-2.8] in group 3, for the 20I/501Y.V1 and 20H/501Y.V2 VOC
92 respectively (Figure 1C). Interestingly, the difference in median NAb titres was highly
93 significant between the two variants ($p < 0.001$) for vaccinated subjects (group 1) whereas it
94 was not significant for the two other groups corresponding to naturally infected patients
95 (Figure 1D).

96 As a whole, critical patients exhibited a strong neutralising response against all the
97 tested strains; despite a slight reduction in NAb titres for both variants by comparison to the
98 wild-type strain, no neutralisation escape could be feared against the two VOC due to the high
99 titres of NAb.

100 The 6-months neutralising response of HCWs with mild COVID-19 was slightly
101 reduced towards both variants by comparison to the wild type strain. By contrast to that
102 reported herein, a study performed with pseudotype viruses on the same category of patients
103 (6-months mild COVID-19 HCWs) found that the neutralising response was much lower
104 against the 20H/501Y.V2 variant than against the 20I/501Y.V1 one [6], which would suggest
105 an increased risk of neutralisation escape with the former strain.

106 Another striking finding of the present study is the reduced neutralising response
107 observed towards the 20H/501Y.V2 variant in fully-immunised subjects with the BNT162b2
108 vaccine by comparison to the wild type and 20I/501Y.V1 variant. These results are in
109 accordance with that observed for the same vaccine in numerous studies using pseudotype
110 viruses [6-9] or authentic variant strains [10]. The neutralisation escape of the 20H/501Y.V2
111 variant in subjects having received either the BNT162b2 vaccine (mean fold reduction in
112 NAb titre of 7.8) or the Oxford-AstraZeneca AZD1222 vaccine (mean fold reduction in NAb
113 titres of 9) was shown to be mainly mediated by the synergistic effect of mutations K417N,
114 E484K, and N501Y in the receptor binding domain [11].

115 *[Figure 1 near here]*

116 Although the present study was performed using a live VNT, it focused only on the
117 humoral response and other experiments are needed to assess the overall immune process
118 including T-cell immune response. Another limitation of the study regards the huge
119 differences between the three tested populations in terms of time post-infection or
120 immunisation, which restrains the interpretation of the differences in results between the three
121 groups.

122 In conclusion, the relative good conservation of the neutralising activity of sera from the
123 three populations tested in this study against the two variants 20I/501Y.V1 and 20H/501Y.V2
124 is encouraging towards a putative reinfection by these strains. Long-term monitoring of the
125 NAb response together with that of the specific cellular response will be needed to confirm
126 these favourable findings.

127 **Data availability statement**

128 GISAID accession numbers:

129 EPI_ISL_1707038

130 EPI_ISL_1707039

131 EPI_ISL_1707040

132 EPI_ISL_768828

133

134 **Acknowledgements**

135 We are indebted to all the personnel of the occupational health and medicine department of
136 Hospices Civils de Lyon who contributed to the collection of samples, especially Virginie Pitiot,
137 Fanny Joubert and PMO team. Human biological samples and associated data were obtained from
138 NeuroBioTec (CRB HCL, Lyon France, Biobank BB-0033-00046). We thank Karima Brahami and all
139 members of the clinical research and innovation department for their reactivity (DRS, Hospices Civils
140 de Lyon). All members of Saint-Etienne Hospital who contributed to the collection of samples are
141 acknowledged.

142

143 **Disclosure statement**

144 Antonin Bal received a grant from bioMerieux and served as consultant for bioMerieux for work
145 and research not related to this manuscript. Sophie Trouillet-Assant received a research grant from
146 bioMerieux concerning previous works not related to this manuscript. The other authors have no
147 relevant affiliations or financial involvement with any organisation or entity with a financial interest in
148 or financial conflict with the subject matter or materials discussed in the manuscript.

149

150 **Funding**

151 This research is being supported by Hospices Civils de Lyon and by Fondation des Hospices
152 Civils de Lyon. The GIMAP team of the University Hospital of Saint-Etienne is supported by a
153 donation from the “ASSE coeur-vert” association (grant ref. no. COVID-19).

- 154 1. Plante JA, Mitchell BM, Plante KS, Debbink K, Weaver SC, Menachery VD. The variant
155 gambit: COVID-19's next move. *Cell Host Microbe*. 2021;29:508-515.
- 156 2. Schmidt F, Weisblum Y, Muecksch F, et al. Measuring SARS-CoV-2 neutralizing
157 antibody activity using pseudotyped and chimeric viruses. *J Exp Med*.
158 2020;217:e20201181.
- 159 3. Legros V, Denolly S, Vogrig M, et al. A longitudinal study of SARS-CoV-2-infected
160 patients reveals a high correlation between neutralizing antibodies and COVID-19
161 severity. *Cell Mol Immunol*. 2021;18:318-327.
- 162 4. Bal A, Pozzetto B, Traubad MA, et al. Evaluation of high-throughput SARS-CoV-2
163 serological assays in a longitudinal cohort of patients with mild COVID-19: clinical
164 sensitivity, specificity and association with virus neutralization test. *Clin Chem*.
165 2021;hvaa336. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1093/clinchem/hvaa336>.
- 166 5. Bal A, Traubad MA, Fassier JB, et al. Six-month antibody response to SARS-CoV-2 in
167 healthcare workers assessed by virus neutralization and commercial assays. *Clin*
168 *Microbiol Infect*. 2021:S1198-743X(21)00005-7.
- 169 6. Kuzmina A, Khalaila Y, Voloshin O, et al. SARS-CoV-2 spike variants exhibit
170 differential infectivity and neutralization resistance to convalescent or post-vaccination
171 sera. *Cell Host Microbe*. 2021;29:522-528.e2.
- 172 7. Garcia-Beltran WF, Lam EC, St Denis K, et al. Multiple SARS-CoV-2 variants escape
173 neutralization by vaccine-induced humoral immunity. *Cell*. 2021;S0092-8674(21)00298-
174 1.

- 175 8. Xie X, Liu Y, Liu J, et al. Neutralization of SARS-CoV-2 spike 69/70 deletion, E484K
176 and N501Y variants by BNT162b2 vaccine-elicited sera. *Nat Med.* 2021;27:620-621.
- 177 9. Abdool Karim SS, de Oliveira T. New SARS-CoV-2 variants - Clinical, public health,
178 and vaccine implications. *N Engl J Med.* 2021;NEJMc2100362.
- 179 10. Planas D, Bruel T, Grzelak L, et al. Sensitivity of infectious SARS-CoV-2 B.1.1.7 and
180 B.1.351 variants to neutralizing antibodies. *Nat Med.* 2021;doi:10.1038/s41591-021-
181 01318-5. Epub ahead of print.
- 182 11. Zhou D, Dejnirattisai W, Supasa P. et al. Evidence of escape of SARS-CoV-2 variant
183 B.1.351 from natural and vaccine-induced sera. *Cell.* 2021;S0092-8674(21)00226-9.
184 Epub ahead of print.

185 **Figure 1.** Neutralisation of living isolates of SARS-CoV-2 by convalescent sera from critical
186 or mild patients with COVID-19 and by vaccine-elicited sera from subjects having received
187 two doses of the BNT162b2 vaccine.

188 *: p-value <0.05; **: p-value <0.01; ***: p-value <0.001; ****: p-value <0.0001; ns: non-
189 significant.

190 Each serum was tested in duplicate and the mean NAb was used for the analysis. Titres were
191 transformed into \log_2 values for the calculation of mean NAb titres (a value of 0.5 was
192 attributed by convention to negative samples). In panels A, B and C: dotted lines represent the
193 detection threshold of 50% plaque reduction neutralisation test (PRNT_{50}) ≥ 20 for neutralising
194 antibody (NAb) titres; full lines represent median NAb titres and dash-dotted lines represent
195 the 25% and 75% quartiles.

196 (A) Violin plot presenting the neutralisation of 2 SARS-CoV-2 isolates belonging to the 19A
197 and 20B clades by serum specimens obtained from subjects tested 6-months post mild
198 COVID-19 (n=19) and critical patients (n=15); the Wilcoxon matched-pair signed rank test
199 was used for comparisons.

200 (B) Violin plot presenting the neutralisation of a SARS-CoV-2 isolate belonging to the 19A
201 clade by serum specimens obtained from vaccinated subjects (n=30), 6-months post mild
202 COVID-19 subjects (n=29) and critical patients (n=25); the Kruskal-Wallis test followed by
203 Dunn's multiple comparison test was used for comparisons.

204 (C) Violin plots presenting the neutralisation of 3 SARS-CoV-2 isolates belonging to the 19A,
205 20I/501Y.V1 and 20H/501Y.V2 clades by the same serum specimens than in (B); the
206 Friedman test followed by Dunn's multiple comparison test was used for comparisons.

207 (D) Capacity of neutralisation of the two tested VOC (20I/501Y.V1 and 20H/501Y.V2
208 clades) by the same serum specimens as that in (B) and (C) in comparison to a 19A isolate
209 taken as reference; the Wilcoxon matched-pair signed rank test was used for comparisons.

