Association between comorbidities and death from COVID-19 in different age groups

Pedro Emanuel Fleitas\textsuperscript{a,b*}, María Cristina Almazán\textsuperscript{a,b}, Sabrina Daniela Cortez\textsuperscript{b}, Jorge Augusto Paz\textsuperscript{c}, Rubén Oscar Cimino\textsuperscript{a,b}, Alejandro Javier Krolewiecki\textsuperscript{a}

\textbf{a.} Instituto de Investigaciones de Enfermedades Tropicales (IIET-CONICET), Universidad Nacional de Salta. Alvarado 751. San Ramón de la Nueva Orán, Salta, Argentina. ZC: 4530.


\textbf{* Corresponding author:} PhD. Pedro E. Fleitas

Mail: pedro.fleittas@gmail.com

Tel: +5493424408448

Abstract

Background: This new COVID-19 pandemic challenges health systems around the world; therefore, it is extremely important to determine which patients with COVID-19 can evolve to more severe outcomes. Accordingly, we decided to assess the role that comorbidities play in death from COVID-19.

Methods: Two age groups (<60 and ≥ 60 years) were defined for analysis. Decision trees were made to identify which comorbidities had the highest fatality rate (FR). Multiple logistic regressions were performed to measure the association between comorbidities and death.

Results: A significant difference was found between the FR of <60 group and ≥ 60 group. The most frequent comorbidity were cardiac diseases and diabetes. The combination of comorbidities with the highest FR was diabetes with kidney disease. Combinations of more than two comorbidities presented higher FR. The comorbidities had higher Odd ratios in the younger group than in the older group.

Conclusions: Comorbidities seem to play a greater role in death from COVID-19 in the younger group, while in the > 60 group; age seems to be the most important factor. We assigned a score to the comorbidities and their combinations for both age groups to help the health personnel make decisions.

Keywords

COVID-19; Comorbidities; Fatality rate; Score
Introduction

From the first case of COVID-19 that was reported in the city of Wuhan, China in December 2019 until the beginning of November 2020, 46 million infected people have been reported worldwide.¹ Of these 46 million, 2.6% have died.¹ This new pandemic challenges health systems around the world and carries important ethical questions, especially under the need of rationing health care in the context of scarce resources and crisis capacity.² For this reason, it is extremely important to determine which patients with COVID-19 can evolve to more severe outcomes, including death. Age, male gender, and ethnicity have all been reported to be associated with severe COVID-19 outcomes.³,⁴ Also, comorbidities such as diabetes, kidney, respiratory, and cardiovascular diseases have been reported as risk factors for severe outcomes by COVID-19.³,⁵ Based on this, we decided to assess the role that comorbidities play in death from COVID-19 in a large database from Brazil that includes recovered and deceased patients, to provide valuable information for designing strategies for case management.

Material and methods

Data source

The data file was downloaded from the website of the Brazilian Ministry of Health on August 1, 2020.⁶ The data comes from the e-SUS NOTIFICA system, which was developed to register suspected cases of COVID-19 in Brazil, and contains patient information such as place of residence, clinical, demographic, and epidemiological characteristics. An ad-hoc database was built for this project with all laboratory confirmed positive cases (RT-PCR or serology) or clinical-epidemiological survey containing information on date of onset of symptoms, date of the
diagnostic test, age, sex, and disease evolution. Patients with missing data were excluded from
the database. We did not impose any further exclusion criteria to limit selection bias.

**Study design**

Two age groups were defined for the analysis with those <60 or ≥ 60 years-old. Decision trees
were built to order the comorbidities according to their frequency and the proportion of deaths
from COVID-19 reported. Then, the correlation of the absence/presence of the following
comorbidities: diabetes, immunosuppression, kidney, respiratory, and cardiovascular disease with
death from COVID-19 was analyzed. For this, a multiple logistic regression was performed to
identify which variables were associated with death from COVID-19. Also, the probability
obtained from logistic regressions (probability of dying when infected by COVID-19 if the
comorbidities were present) was used to calculate the area under the receiver-operator
characteristic curve (AUC). The AUC was used as a measure of the ability of the comorbidities
model to predict death from COVID-19. Finally, the values of probability obtained from logistic
regressions were used to assign a score to the comorbidities and the combinations of them. All
statistical analyses were carried with RStudio version 1.3.1093 (RStudio: Integrated
Development for R. RStudio, PBC, Boston, MA). Analyses with p-values <0.05 for a level of
significance of 95% were considered statistically significant. Figures were done with GraphPad
Prime 9 Trial version (GraphPad Software Inc., San Diego, CA).

**Results**

**Data description**

The whole database includes over 8 million cases recorded in the 27 states of Brazil from January
1 to August 1, 2020, 549733 were included in the analysis (Fig. 1). A summary of the
comorbidities registered in all the patients can be observed in Table S1 of supplementary material. In our database, median age was 38 years old (IQR: 30-51); 46% were males and 54% females. It was found that 2.1% of patients died while 97.9% were recovered. A statistically significant difference was found between the fatality rate of <60 group (0.7%, n= 457557) and ≥ 60 group (11.3% n= 74176) (p<0.01) (Fig. 2). Also, the median time between the onset of symptoms and death was 20 days (IQR: 12-33), and no differences were found between age groups.

Five comorbidities were recorded in the data file: cardiovascular disease, immunosuppression, kidney disease, respiratory disease, and diabetes. Among 87.6% of the cases, no comorbidities were registered; meanwhile, the most frequent comorbidity registered in the database was cardiovascular disease (7.2% (39542/549733)), followed by diabetes (4.3% (23966/549733)), respiratory disease (2.0% (11035/549733)), immunosuppression (0.9% (4934/549733)) and kidney disease (0.5% (2684/549733)). In addition, It was observed that in the <60 group, cardiac disease (Frequency= 4.3%) and diabetes (Frequency= 2.6%) presented a fatality rate of 1.6% and 0.5% (Fig. 3a). In addition, the highest fatality rate (19%) was found in individuals with diabetes and kidney disease (Fig. 3a). In the ≥60 group the most frequent comorbidities were also diabetes (Frequency =15%, fatality rate =19%) and cardiovascular disease, without diabetes, (Frequency =12.4%, fatality rate =13%). At the same time, the combination of comorbidities with the highest fatality rate was diabetes with kidney disease (fatality rate= 35%) and diabetes with kidney and respiratory diseases (fatality rate= 47%) (Fig. 3b).
Figure 1: Flowchart of data used in this study. *According to Guidelines for Case Notification of Influenza Syndrome suspected of COVID-19.  

Figure 2: Frequency of recovery and death from COVID-19, according to the patient’s age.

Figure 3: Tree diagrams representing the frequency of the comorbidities and the fatality rate. a. <60 group (n=457557). b. ≥ 60 group (n=74176). In each node, its number is represented in the top, and inside the fatality rate (MR) and the percentage frequency (F). DBT= Diabetes, IS = immunosuppression, KD = kidney disease, RD = respiratory disease, CD= Cardiovascular disease, P= comorbidity present and A= comorbidity absent.

Correlation among comorbidities and death from COVID-19

For the <60 group and ≥ 60 groups, the values of AUC=0.66 and AUC=0.61 were obtained, respectively. As Fig. 4 shows, the comorbidities had higher ORs in the <60 group than in the ≥ 60 group. In this first group, diabetes, kidney disease, and immunosuppression had the highest ORs; whereas in the ≥60 group, the comorbidities with the highest ORs were kidney and respiratory diseases (Fig. 4).

The logistic regression allowed us to assign a score to the comorbidities and their combinations, from one (lower probability of a severe outcome) to eight (high probability of a severe outcome) for both age groups. These scores were ordered into three categories of low, medium, and high risk, based on the incidence of death from COVID-19. It can be observed that the highest score is
found with the combination of diabetes and kidney disease or the combination of 3 or more comorbidities.

**Figure 4:** Odds ratios for comorbidities in the <60 group and ≥60 age group.

**Table 1:** Score assigned to the different comorbidities based on the probability of death when infected by COVID-19 (multivariate logistic regression) and the fatality rate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>&lt;60 group</th>
<th>Comorbidities</th>
<th>Assigned score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Low Score</strong></td>
<td>Probability &lt;0.02</td>
<td>Cardiovascular disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fatality rate =0.5</td>
<td>Respiratory disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n=458076</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Medium Score</strong></td>
<td>Probability =0.02-0.04</td>
<td>Cardiovascular disease + Respiratory disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fatality rate =4.0</td>
<td>Immunosuppression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n=12352</td>
<td>Kidney disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Diabetes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>High Score</strong></td>
<td>Probability ≥0.05</td>
<td>Immunosuppression + Respiratory disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fatality rate =7.0</td>
<td>Kidney disease + Respiratory disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n=5129</td>
<td>Diabetes + Respiratory disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Immunosuppression + Cardiovascular disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comorbidities</td>
<td>Assigned score</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardiovascular disease + Renal disease</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diabetes + cardiovascular disease</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immunosuppression + Kidney disease</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diabetes + Kidney disease or ≥ 3 comorbidities</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ≥ 60 group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score range</th>
<th>Comorbidities</th>
<th>Assigned score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low Score</td>
<td>Cardiovascular disease</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Immunosuppression</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diabetes</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium Score</td>
<td>Respiratory disease</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Immunosuppression + Cardiovascular disease</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kidney disease</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cardiovascular disease + diabetes</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diabetes + Immunosuppression</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cardiovascular disease + Respiratory disease</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Immunosuppression + Respiratory disease</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cardiovascular disease + Kidney disease</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diabetes + Respiratory disease</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Immunosuppression + Kidney</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Discussion**

Since the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic in December 2019, the reported case fatality rate has varied. Early estimates from small cohorts of hospitalized patients indicated a fatality rate of 15%; later and with more data, the percentage of deaths fell from 11% to 4.3% and finally to 3.4%.\(^8\) In addition, 81% of patients with COVID-19 have a mild illness and never require hospitalization.\(^9\) Therefore, for a better understanding of the causes that lead to severe results of COVID-19, in this retrospective cohort study, we analyzed risk factors for death in individuals with COVID-19 in a large database from Brazil with a fatality rate of 2.1%.

Older age has been reported by several authors as an important factor associated with the severity of the disease or fatality in patients with COVID-19.\(^4,5,10\) In accordance with this, we found a higher fatality rate in patients older than 60 years of age.

It is important to highlight the relevance of age-stratified analyses when examining the association between comorbidities and fatality with COVID-19.\(^5\) In our study, the odd ratio (OR) values for comorbidities varied depending on age group. In the <60 group, both higher ORs and a higher AUC value were observed compared to those obtained for the \(\geq 60\) group. This suggests
that the comorbidities considered are able to better explain the fatality from COVID-19 in the
<60 group than in the ≥ 60 group. Therefore, the comorbidities seem to have an important impact
on death in the <60 group, while in the ≥ 60 group the comorbidities might play a minor role in
death from COVID-19. This suggests that the main risk factor in the older group is age itself,
which is consistent with previous findings for Brazilians patients.³

Diabetes was the most frequent comorbidity and had the highest OR value in the <60. Patients
who presented diabetes as comorbidity, reached a fatality rate of 0.5% and 19% in the <60 group
and ≥ 60 group, respectively (Fig. 2). Worth mentioning, Brazil is one of the countries with more
diabetes cases in the world, being the estimated prevalence of 11.9 % (95 % CI 7.7–17.8).¹¹ The
evolution of COVID-19 has shown to be more severe in patients with diabetes and metabolic
dysfunction.¹² Recent data suggests that COVID-19 could precipitate acute metabolic
complications of diabetes, such as diabetic ketoacidosis and hyperglycemia. The potential
mechanisms that may increase susceptibility to severe COVID-19 in patients with diabetes
include: 1) higher affinity cell binding and effective entry of the virus, 2) decreased viral
clearance, 3) decreased T cell function, 4) increased susceptibility to hyperinflammation and
cytokine storm syndrome, and 5) presence of cardiovascular diseases.¹³ This becomes more
relevant when considering that the most frequent combination of comorbidities included diabetes
and cardiovascular disease, with a fatality rate of 6% and 20% in the <60 group and ≥ 60 group,
respectively.

Another important risk factor is kidney disease. In the ≥ 60 group, this comorbidity together with
respiratory disease presented the highest ORs. Moreover, the combination of diabetes with
kidney disease caused the highest fatality rates. Since diabetes is the main cause of chronic
kidney disease,¹⁴ patients with these two comorbidities can represent diabetic patients in a more
severe stage of the disease or without adequate medical care. Interestingly, the human kidney has
been reported to be a target for SARS-CoV-2\textsuperscript{15}; however, it remains controversial whether
SARS-CoV-2 causes acute kidney injury.\textsuperscript{16}

There is a wide spectrum of immunosuppressed patients, including patients with cancer, solid
organ transplant recipients, those taking antirheumatic drugs, primary immunodeficiency, and
HIV infection. We found that in both age groups, immunosuppression was a risk factor
associated with death from COVID-19. However, this should be interpreted with caution since
the database did not allow to determine precisely the underlying cause of the immunosuppression
and because there is controversy about the role immunosuppression in COVID-19. Previous
research indicates that patients with cancer and solid organ transplant recipients may have a
higher risk of developing more severe COVID-19.\textsuperscript{17,18} Nonetheless, immunosuppressed adults
with no further comorbidities might not be likely to have a severe clinical outcome.\textsuperscript{18} This
contradiction may be because the host’s immune response is an important factor contributing to
the severity of COVID-19, through a dysregulation of innate immunity or an excessive
inflammatory response.\textsuperscript{19} Thus, immunosuppression, as a sole comorbidity, probably does not
determine a severe outcome.

As has been shown in this study, there are comorbidities that increase the probability of severe
COVID-19. Therefore, they should be considered in case management. Concerning this, we
assigned a score to each comorbidity to provide a possible order of priority. Based on the analysis
of this large database, there are small subgroups of cases that carry an exceedingly high risk of
death due to COVID-19.
It is important to understand the limitations of this study when interpreting these results. First, possible selection biases cannot be ruled out due to the reduction of the data file. Second, the data come from all the states of Brazil, but might not be representative of the entire population, and the generalizability of the results beyond this cohort is unclear. However, it is worth noting the high number of cases analyzed and that the proportion of the comorbidities in the database (n=549733) is similar to in the original data file (n=8056794).

In conclusion, we demonstrate that diabetes, kidney disease, respiratory disease, cardiovascular disease, and immunosuppression are risk factors related to death from COVID-19, where age seems to be a determining factor. The combination of comorbidities increases the risk, which must be considered and analyzed for clinical decisions.

**Competing interests:** The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

**Funding:** This article did not have any kind of funding.

**Ethics approval:** The material used was freely available on the website of the Brazilian Ministry of Public Health, so it was not necessary to have ethical approval.

**Supplementary materials:** Supplementary material associated with this article can be found in the online version.

**References**


doi:10.1101/2020.04.03.20051722.


8 056 794 patients recorded in the website of the Brazilian Ministry of Health

2 351 259
Patients with full data

5 705 535
Influenza diagnosis and missing information on Age and COVID-19 Case Evolution

267 907
Inconsistent information on COVID-19 diagnosis*

2 083 259
Patients tested for SARS-CoV-2

549 733
Patients positive for SARS-CoV-2