

## Comparing Interventions Aimed at Improving Influenza Vaccination Coverage Among Vulnerable Populations: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis Protocol

Pei Chen Wu BSc<sup>1,2</sup>

Lyn McPherson GradDipHlthSc<sup>2,3</sup>

Stephen B Lambert PhD<sup>4,5</sup>

Peter Wnukowski-Mtonga MClInEpi<sup>4,5</sup>

Nicholas G Lennox PhD<sup>2</sup>

Robert S Ware PhD<sup>2,3</sup>

1. School of Public Health and Health Systems. University of Waterloo, ON N2L3G1, Canada.
2. Queensland Centre for Intellectual and Developmental Disability, MRI-UQ, The University of Queensland, South Brisbane QLD 4101, Australia.
3. Menzies Health Institute Queensland, Griffith University, Nathan QLD 4111, Australia.
4. UQ Centre for Child Health Research, The University of Queensland, Herston QLD 4006, Australia.
5. National Centre for Immunisation Research & Surveillance, The Children's Hospital at Westmead, Westmead, NSW 2145, Australia.

**Corresponding Author:** Robert Ware

**Postal Address:** Menzies Health Institute Queensland, Griffith University, 170 Kessels Road, Nathan QLD 4111, Australia

**Email Address:** R.Ware@griffith.edu.au

**Telephone Number:** +61 7 334 64836

## **ABSTRACT**

### **Background**

Influenza is a major contributor to global disease burden. Vaccination recommendations specifically target populations at increased risk of serious influenza sequelae. The aim of this study is to conduct a systematic review and meta-analysis to evaluate the effectiveness of different quality improvement interventions to increase vaccination rates in high-risk populations.

### **Methods**

Randomized and nonrandomized studies with concurrent control groups will be identified. Interventions to increase vaccination rates will be categorized by strategy type. Overall intervention effects will be calculated using random effects models. Study quality will be assessed using a modified Cochrane Risk of Bias tool.

## BACKGROUND

Influenza is a vaccine-preventable acute respiratory infection directly responsible for three to five million cases of severe illness annually, resulting in 250,000 to 500,000 deaths.<sup>1</sup> The financial burden of influenza and its sequelae are substantial: estimates from the United States are of annual direct losses of US\$10.4 billion as a direct consequence of influenza, with an additional US\$16.3 billion lost in sick days and productivity.<sup>2</sup> Influenza disproportionately affects infants, young children, adults aged 65 years or older, pregnant women, immunocompromised individuals, First Nations peoples, and those suffering from chronic disease; all of whom are at risk of experiencing increased morbidity and mortality due to influenza.<sup>3,4</sup> Current health care guidelines in most developed nations recommend annual vaccination for the aforementioned high-risk groups. In order to maximize the benefits these populations derive from immunization, the US Department of Health and Human Services has launched the Healthy People 2020 initiative in order to improve preventive health care.<sup>5</sup> The initiative aims to increase influenza vaccination rates for various high-risk groups to targets ranging from 70 to 90 percent. Vaccination coverage rates for vulnerable populations have been rising substantially over the past two decades in most developed countries. In Australia, between 1 March and 19 April 2020, over 2.1 million influenza vaccinations were administered and recorded in the Australian Immunisation Register compared to 624,000 at the same time in 2019 and 235,000 in 2018<sup>6</sup>, as government, GPs and other vaccine providers encouraged people to get vaccinated to avoid the combination of COVID-19 and influenza which could be life threatening, but inconsistent and even decreasing trends in coverage have been recently reported in the U.S,<sup>7</sup> Europe<sup>8</sup> and Canada,<sup>9</sup> indicating that coverage rates still fall short of the goals proposed by the Healthy People 2020 initiative.

In developed nations, the majority of influenza vaccinations take place in community settings. community-based primary care centers remain the most effective way to promote health to the public, and various outreach initiatives have been trialled in the community with the aim to increase influenza vaccination coverage in vulnerable populations. Ompad et al.<sup>10</sup> previously reviewed over 50 studies examining interventions directed towards high-risk populations, and found the majority of interventions did not result in vaccination rates that met the Healthy People 2010 goals. Moreover, the study did not perform statistical analyses to evaluate the effectiveness of each intervention, and did not focus on community-settings. A previous systematic review and meta-analysis by Lau et al.<sup>11</sup> found that various quality improvement

interventions were effective in increasing influenza and pneumococcal vaccination coverage in elderly adults, but did not examine intervention effects on other vulnerable populations, and did not focus exclusively on primary care interventions.

The aim of this study is to systematically evaluate, compare, and analyze the effectiveness of different intervention strategies for improving influenza vaccination coverage, with the goal of identifying the most effective strategies to improve vaccination coverage among vulnerable populations in the community.

This review protocol will follow the guidelines for the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Metanalysis (PRISMA)<sup>12</sup> and is reported here using the Guidance notes for registering a systematic review protocol with PROSPERO provided by the Centre for Reviews and Dissemination.<sup>13</sup>

## **PROSPERO ITEMS**

### **1. Review title**

Comparing Interventions Aimed at Improving Influenza Vaccination Coverage Among Vulnerable Populations: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

### **2. Original language title**

As above

### **3. Anticipated or actual start date**

15 March 2021

### **4. Anticipated completion date**

30 September 2021

### **5. Stage of review at time of this submission**

This review topic was first explored in December 2016/January 2017 and then again in December 2017/January 2018 as part of a University of Queensland Summer Scholarship Program. During this time the search strategy was developed and the publications appearing prior to December 2017 were identified, the study characteristics were recorded, and data was

extracted. After this Protocol is submitted the search will be re-run and eligible publications will be identified for inclusion in meta-analyses.

## **6. Named contact**

Prof Robert Ware

## **7. Named contact email**

[R.Ware@griffith.edu.au](mailto:R.Ware@griffith.edu.au); <https://experts.griffith.edu.au/18978-robert-ware>

## **8. Named contact address**

Centre for Applied Health Economics, Griffith University, 170 Kessels Road, Nathan QLD 4111, AUSTRALIA

## **9. Named contact phone number**

+61 7 3735 9117

## **10. Organisational affiliation**

Menzies Health Institute Queensland, Griffith University

## **11. Review team members and their organisation affiliations**

Pei Chen Wu; Faculty of Medicine, The University of Queensland; Queensland Centre for Intellectual and Developmental Disability, The University of Queensland

Lyn McPherson; Menzies Health Institute Queensland, Griffith University; Queensland Centre for Intellectual and Developmental Disability, The University of Queensland

Stephen B Lambert, Faculty of Medicine, The University of Queensland

Peter Wnukowski-Mtonga; National Centre for Immunisation Research & Surveillance, The Children's Hospital at Westmead

Nicholas G Lennox; Queensland Centre for Intellectual and Developmental Disability, MRI-UQ, The University of Queensland

Robert S. Ware; Menzies Health Institute Queensland, Griffith University; Queensland Centre for Intellectual and Developmental Disability, The University of Queensland

## **12. Funding sources**

This work was supported by a University of Queensland Summer Scholarship (PW).

### **13. Conflicts of interest**

All authors declare they have no known conflicts of interest.

### **14. Collaborators**

Nil

### **15. Review question**

Which vaccination strategies are the most effective for improving influenza vaccination coverage among vulnerable populations in the community?

### **16. Searches**

We will identify relevant studies for synthesis using four databases (Cochrane Library via John Wiley & Sons Inc., MEDLINE via EBSCOHost, EMBASE via Elsevier, and CINAHL via EBSCOHost). Search strategies for each database were prepared by PW in consultation with other team members and a university library Information specialist. Preliminary searches were conducted using the various suggested terms to pilot the study selection process. After screening search results against eligibility criteria, modifications were made as considered necessary.

### **17. URL to search strategy**

The final search strategies as used in the first version of this systematic review are detailed in Appendix I.

### **18. Condition or domain being studied**

Influenza vaccination

### **19. Participants/population**

Studies will be included if they compared the effectiveness of a quality improvement intervention against a contemporaneous comparison group in a community setting. For inclusion, studies will need to report vaccination rates, be published in an English language peer-reviewed journal and involve a high-risk population living in the community. A population is defined as being high risk if it was included in the guidelines provided by the

relevant health authorities in the USA, Australia, Canada, or the United Kingdom (See Appendix 2).

## **20. Interventions/exposures**

Strategies will be categorized based on the classification system proposed by Shojania et al.<sup>14</sup> and subsequently adapted by Lau et al.<sup>11</sup>. Categories will be audit and feedback, case management, clinician education, clinician reminders, community engagement, continuous quality improvement, delivery site change, financial incentives for clinicians, financial incentives for patients, patient outreach, changes in care team personnel (team change), and changes to patient visit routine (visit structure change). Where appropriate, quality improvement strategies with a sufficient number of comparisons will be organized into sub-categories, and meta-analyses will be conducted within each sub-category.

## **21. Comparator/control**

Comparator group will be either usual care, non-vaccination intervention, or, when intervention group received additional strategy, whatever strategy the control group received.

## **22. Types of study to be included**

Randomised Controlled Trials (RCTs) and quasi RCTs,

## **23. Context**

Studies need to be conducted among groups living in the community.

## **24. Main outcomes**

Vaccination rate

## **25. Additional outcomes**

Nil

## **26. Data extraction (selection and coding)**

The bibliographic software, EndNote, will be employed to organize, store, and manage all the citations. References retrieved from the four databases will be imported into Endnote. After removal of duplicate references, reviewers (PW and RW) will select studies for inclusion in the meta-analyses, first by screening of the titles and abstracts, and secondly, using full texts.

We will attempt to obtain any references not available on-line or locally with the assistance of the University Library. Any differences in the selection of studies for inclusion will be resolved by discussion between reviewers and the other members of the research team if necessary. PW will extract data from each selected study.

### **27. Risk of bias (quality) assessment**

Study quality will be measured using a modified version of the Cochrane Risk of Bias (ROB) tool,<sup>15</sup> a 6-item questionnaire assessing the appropriateness of random sequence generation, allocation concealment, blinding of participants, personnel, and outcome assessors, data completeness, and other sources of biases. For quality assessment we summed individual scores.

### **28. Strategy for data synthesis**

All studies reporting sufficient data to derive odds ratios and standard errors will be included in meta-analyses. Comparisons will be eligible to be included in the meta-analysis if the control group received usual care, or if the control intervention was focused towards non-vaccination behaviour, or if the intervention group received an additional strategy as well as whatever strategy was applied to both the intervention and control groups. When a given intervention can be classified into multiple quality improvement strategies, the number of subjects in the intervention group will be divided between the strategies to avoid double-counting participants. Results from individual studies will be synthesized using random-effects models. Results will be reported overall, and by quality improvement strategy. Heterogeneity will be measured using the  $I^2$  statistic. The number needed to target for vaccination will be calculated. Sensitivity analyses will be conducted to investigate any association between study quality (assessed by ROB scores) and reported effect sizes using meta-regression. Publication bias will be tested by generating funnel plots and applying Harbord's test.<sup>16</sup> Analyses will be performed using Stata v14.0 (StataCorp LP, College Station, TX, USA).

### **29. Analysis of subgroups or subsets**

Nil

### **30. Type and method of review**

Type of review - Systematic review and meta-analysis

Health area of review – Public Health

### **31. Language**

English

### **32. Country**

Australia

### **33. Other registration details**

Nil

### **34. References**

See below

### **35. Dissemination plans**

It is intended to publish the results of this study in a peer-reviewed journal. Any amendments to this proposal will be documented and communicated in the final published manuscript.

### **36. Keywords**

Influenza, Vaccination, Immunization, Vulnerable Populations, Risk Factors

### **37. Details of any existing review of the same topic by the same authors**

Nil

### **38. Current review status**

Ongoing

### **39. Any additional information**

Nil

## **REFERENCES**

1. Troeger C, Forouzanfar M, Rao PC, Khalil I, Brown A, Swartz S, et al. Estimates of the global, regional, and national morbidity, mortality, and aetiologies of lower

- respiratory tract infections in 195 countries: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2015. *Lancet Infect Dis*. 2017;17(11):1133-1161.
2. Molinari NAM, Ortega-Sanchez IR, Messonnier ML, Thompson WW, Wortley PM, Weintraub E, et al. The annual impact of seasonal influenza in the US: measuring disease burden and costs. *Vaccine*. 2007;25(27):5086-5096.
  3. Thompson WW, Shay DK, Weintraub E, Brammer L, Cox N, Anderson LJ, et al. Mortality associated with influenza and respiratory syncytial virus in the United States. *J Amer Med Assoc*. 2003;289(2):179-186.
  4. Harper SA, Fukuda K, Uketi TM, Cox NJ, Bridges CB. Prevention and control of influenza: recommendations of the Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices (ACIP). *MMWR Recomm Rep*. 2005;54(8):1-41.
  5. Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion. Immunization and Infectious Diseases. Healthy People 2020. Rockville, MD: ODPHP. <https://www.healthypeople.gov/2020/topics-objectives/topic/immunization-and-infectious-diseases/objectives>. Accessed Oct 20, 2020.
  6. Hunt G. Record 16.5 million flu vaccines to protect Australians (media release). Canberra, Australia: Department of Health; 19 April 2020. <https://www.health.gov.au/ministers/the-hon-greg-hunt-mp/media/record-165-million-flu-vaccines-to-protect-australians#:~:text=Since%201%20March%202020%20over,2019%20and%20235%2C000%20in%202018>. Accessed Oct 20, 2020.
  7. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Flu Vaccination Trends. Atlanta,GA: CDC. <https://www.cdc.gov/flu/fluview/trends.htm>. Accessed Oct 20, 2020.
  8. European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control. Seasonal Influenza Vaccination in Europe: Vaccination Recommendations and Coverage Rates in the EU Member States for Eight Influenza Seasons, 2007-2008 to 2014-2015. Stockholm, Sweden: ECDC; 2017. <https://ecdc.europa.eu/sites/portal/files/documents/influenza-vaccination-2007-2008-to-2014-2015.pdf>. Accessed Oct 20, 2020.
  9. Buchan SA, Kwong JC. Trends in influenza vaccine coverage and vaccine hesitancy in Canada, 2006/07 to 2013/14: results from cross-sectional survey data. *Can Med Assoc J Open*. 2016;4(3):E455-462.
  10. Ompad DC, Galea S, Vlahov D. Distribution of influenza vaccine to high-risk groups. *Epidemiol Rev*. 2006;29(1):54-70.

11. Lau D, Hu J, Majumdar SR, Storie DA, Rees SE, Johnson JA. Interventions to improve influenza and pneumococcal vaccination rates among community-dwelling adults: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Ann Fam Med*. 2012;10(6):538-546.
12. Moher D, Shamseer L, Clarke M, Ghersi D, Liberati A, Petticrew M, et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015 statement. *Systematic reviews*. 2015 Dec 1;4(1):1.
13. Centre for Reviews and Dissemination. Guidance notes for registering a systematic review protocol with PROSPERO. York, UK: University of York; 2016. <https://www.crd.york.ac.uk/prospéro/documents/Registering%20a%20review%20on%20PROSPERO.pdf>. Accessed Oct 20, 2020
14. Shojania KG, Ranji SR, McDonald KM, Grimshaw JM, Sundaram V, Rushakoff RJ, et al. Effects of quality improvement strategies for type 2 diabetes on glycemic control: a meta-regression analysis. *J Amer Med Assoc*. 2006;296(4):427-440.
15. Higgins JP, Altman DG, Gøtzsche PC, Jüni P, Moher D, Oxman AD, et al. The Cochrane Collaboration's tool for assessing risk of bias in randomized trials. *BMJ Brit Med J*. 2011;343:d5928.
16. Harbord RM, Egger M, Sterne JA. A modified test for small-study effects in meta-analyses of controlled trials with binary endpoints. *Stat Med*. 2006;25(20):3443-345

## Appendix I: Database Search Strategies

### MedLine:

Search performed on November 18th, 2016; returning 1090 articles.

#	Query
1	(MH "Influenza Vaccines")
2	MH vaccines
3	MH immunization
4	vaccin*
5	"immuni*"
6	"inoculat*"
7	"prevent*"
8	1 OR 2 OR 3 OR 4 OR 5 OR 6 OR 7
9	(MH "Influenza, Human")
10	(MH "Influenza B virus") OR (MH "Influenza A virus") OR (MH "Influenza C virus")
11	(MH "Influenzavirus A") OR (MH "Influenzavirus B") OR (MH "Influenzavirus C")
12	AB influenza OR TI influenza
13	AB flu OR TI flu
14	9 OR 10 OR 11 OR 12 OR 13
15	AB primary care OR TI primary care
16	AB General practi* OR TI General practi*
17	AB Primary health* OR TI Primary health*
18	AB Community mental health* OR TI Community mental health*
19	AB Family practice OR TI Family practice
20	AB Family medicine OR TI Family medicine
21	AB Family physician* OR TI Family physician*
22	TI Home care OR AB Home care
23	AB Home based OR TI Home based
24	AB Home health* OR TI Home health*
25	AB Community health* OR TI Community health*
26	AB Community nurs* OR TI Community nurs*
27	AB health visit* OR TI health visit*
28	AB Community pharmac* OR TI Community pharmac*
29	AB Preventive care OR TI Preventive care
30	AB Prevention program* OR TI Prevention program*
31	AB Preventive OR TI Preventive
32	15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20 OR 21 OR 22 OR 23 OR 24 OR 25 OR 26 OR 27 OR 28 OR 29 OR 30 OR 31
33	PT randomized controlled trial
34	"random*"

35 "control\*"  
36 "intervention\*"  
37 "evaluat\*"  
38 "compar\*"  
39 "impact"  
40 33 OR 34 OR 35 OR 36 OR 37 OR 38 OR 39  
41 "rates"  
42 "rate"  
43 "distribution"  
44 "coverage"  
45 "status"  
46 "delivery"  
47 "program"  
48 "intervention"  
49 "promotion"  
50 "initiative"  
51 "strategy"  
52 "uptake"  
53 41 OR 42 OR 43 OR 44 OR 45 OR 46 OR 47 OR 48 OR 49 OR 50 OR 51 OR 52  
54 MH humans  
55 8 AND 14 AND 32 AND 40 AND 53 AND 54

Limiters - English Language; Age Related: Infant, Newborn: birth-1 month, Infant: 1-23 months, All Infant: birth-23 months, Child, Preschool: 2-5 years, Young Adult: 19-24 years, Adult: 19-44 years, Middle Aged: 45-64 years, Middle Aged + Aged: 45 + years, Aged: 65+ years, Aged, 80 and over, All Adult: 19+ years

**Update: Search performed on Nov 27th, 2017; returning 1,189 results. Filter for papers published between 2016-2017 yielded an additional 109 results.**

#### **Embase:**

**Search performed on November 18th, 2016; returning 1149 articles.**

#	Query
1	('influenza' OR influenza OR flu) AND 'influenza' OR influenza OR flu
2	'influenza vaccines'/exp OR 'vaccine'/exp OR 'immunization'/exp OR vaccin* OR immuni* OR inoculat* OR prevent*
3	rates OR rate OR uptake OR determinant* OR tool* OR distribution OR coverage OR status OR delivery OR program* OR interven* OR promot* OR initiat* OR strateg*
4	'primary care'/exp OR 'primary health care'/exp OR 'primary health*':ab,ti OR 'general practise' OR 'general practi*':ab,ti OR 'family practice':ab,ti OR 'family physician*' OR 'family medicine':ab,ti OR 'community mental health':ab,ti OR 'community mental health services':ab,ti OR 'home care services'/exp OR 'home

- care':ab,ti OR 'home based':ab,ti OR 'home health\*':ab,ti OR 'health visit\*':ab,ti OR 'health workers' OR 'community nurs\*':ab,ti OR 'community pharmac\*':ab,ti OR 'community health\*':ab,ti OR 'community health services'/exp OR 'preventive health services'/exp OR 'preventive care':ab,ti OR 'prevention program\*':ab,ti
- 5 randomized:it AND controlled:it AND trial:it OR random\* OR control\* OR intervention\* OR compar\* OR impact OR evaluat\*
- 6 'influenza'/exp OR 'influenza b virus'/exp OR 'influenzavirus a'/exp OR 'influenzavirus c'/exp OR influenza:ab,ti OR flu:ab,ti
- 7 [english]/lim AND [humans]/lim
- 8 #1 AND #2 AND #3 AND #4 AND #5 AND #6 AND #7
- 9 [adult]/lim OR [aged]/lim OR [infant]/lim OR [middle aged]/lim OR [newborn]/lim OR [preschool]/lim OR [very elderly]/lim OR [young adult]/lim
- 10 #8 AND #9

**Update: Search performed on Nov 27th, 2017; returning 1,215 results. Filter for papers published between 2016-2017 yielded an additional 136 results.**

### **Cochrane:**

**Search performed on November 18th, 2016; returning 1283 articles.**

- | # | Query   |
|---|---|
| 1 | (immuniz* or immunis* or inoculat* or vaccin*):ti,ab,kw and (influenza):ti,ab,kw (Word variations have been searched)   |
| 2 | rate or rates or uptake or delivery or distribution or coverage or status:ti,ab,kw or "quality improvement" or qi or "quality management" or "case management" or "patient care" or interdisciplinary:ti,ab,kw or registr* or audit or education or reminder* or "self care" or "self management" or "medical record" or program* or intervention*:ti,ab,kw or "primary care":ti,ab,kw (Word variations have been searched) |
| 3 | #1 and #2   |

**Update: Search performed on Nov 27th, 2017; returning 1,453 results. Filter for papers published between 2016-2017 yielded an additional 216 results.**

### **CINAHL:**

**Search performed on November 18th, 2016; returning 140 articles.**

- | # | Query                        |
|---|------------------------------|
| 1 | MH immunization              |
| 2 | TI vaccin* OR AB vaccin*     |
| 3 | TI immunis* OR AB immunis*   |
| 4 | TI immuniz* OR AB immuniz*   |
| 5 | TI inoculat* OR AB inoculat* |

- 6 MH Influenza
- 7 TI influenza OR AB influenza
- 8 MH Influenza Vaccine
- 9 S1 OR S2 OR S3 OR S4 OR S5
- 10 S6 OR S7
- 11 S9 AND S10
- 12 S8 OR S11
- 13 S8 OR S11

Limiters - English Language; Exclude MEDLINE records; Human; Age Groups:  
Infant, Newborn: birth-1 month, Infant: 1-23 months, Child, Preschool: 2-5 years,  
Adult: 19-44 years, Middle Aged: 45-64 years, Aged: 65+ years, Aged, 80 and over,  
All Infant, All Adult

**Update: Search performed on Nov 27th, 2017; returning 209 results. Filter for papers published between 2016-2017 yielded an additional 92 results.**