medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.02.19.21251936; this version posted February 26, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Title: Beliefs associated with Intentions of Non-Physician Healthcare Workers to Receive the COVID-19 Vaccine in Ontario, Canada

Laura Desveaux PhD, PT[1]
Rachel D. Savage PhD[1]
Mina Tadrous PhD, MS, PharmD[1]
Natasha Kithulegoda MPH[1]
Kelly Thai BSc[1]
Nathan M. Stall MD[1]
Noah M. Ivers MD, PhD[1]

[1]Women's College Research Institute, Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Corresponding Author:
Laura Desveaux
Women's College Research Institute, Women's College Hospital
76 Grenville Ave, Toronto, ON, Canada M5S 1B2
Office: 416-323-6400 x4302
Fax: 416-323-6255
laura.desveaux@wchospital.ca

Word Count: 600

Abstract: Achieving herd immunity of SARS-CoV-2 through vaccines will require a concerted effort to understand and address barriers to vaccine uptake. We conducted a web-based survey of non-physician HCWs, informed by the Theoretical Domains Framework, measuring intention to vaccinate, beliefs and sources of influence relating to the COVID-19 vaccines, and sociodemographic characteristics. Vaccination non-intent was associated with beliefs that vaccination was not required because of good health, lower confidence that the COVID-19 vaccine would protect their family and patients, and that getting vaccinated was a professional responsibility. Vaccination non-intent was strongly associated with mistrust about how fast the vaccines were developed and vaccine safety concerns. Communication directed at non-physician HCWs should be tailored by ethnic subgroups and settings to increase salience. Messaging should leverage emotions (e.g., pride, hope, fear) to capture interest, while addressing safety concerns and confirming the low risk of side effects in contrast to the substantial morbidity and mortality of COVID-19. Emergent data about reduced transmission post-vaccination will be helpful.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.02.19.21251936; this version posted February 26, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Background

Achieving herd immunity of SARS-CoV-2 through vaccines will require a concerted effort to understand and address barriers to vaccine uptake. Initial vaccination of healthcare workers (HCWs) is essential because of their high risk of SARS-CoV-2 exposure, close contact with vulnerable populations, and potential to act as role models and influencers[1]. Unfortunately, 1/6 of HCWs are reluctant to receive the COVID-19 vaccine, citing concerns around vaccine safety and effectiveness, data transparency, and coercion.[2]

Methods

We conducted a web-based survey of non-physician HCWs, informed by the Theoretical Domains Framework,[3] measuring intention to vaccinate, beliefs and sources of influence relating to the COVID-19 vaccines, and sociodemographic characteristics. Vaccination intention was measured with the question "How likely is it that you would get a COVID-19 vaccine?". Sociodemographic characteristics collected included: age, gender, ethnicity, education, healthcare worker role and setting. Group comparisons were made using χ^2 tests and corresponding adjusted associations were made using multivariable logistic regression. The survey was distributed electronically via a large Canadian healthcare union in Ontario, Canada from January 4-12, 2021. The study was approved by the Women's College Hospital Research Ethics Board and reporting followed the Checklist for Reporting Results of Internet E-Surveys.

Results

The participation rate was 85% (8,634 completed/10,193 accessed). Participants were mostly female (89.2%), healthcare aid/personal support workers (42.8%), employed full-time (67.2%), and working in the continuing care setting (64.6%), which includes home care, supportive living, and nursing homes. Overall, 80.4% of HCWs reported that they were likely to get a COVID-19 vaccine (Table 1).

After adjustment (Table 2), sociodemographic factors independently associated with unwillingness to vaccinate included younger age (<40 years) and attainment of less than a high school diploma. The effect of healthcare setting varied by ethnicity, with HCWs of Filipino ethnicity working in continuing care and HCWs of Caribbean ethnicity working in acute care having a greater likelihood of non-intent. Vaccination non-intent was associated with beliefs that i) vaccination was not required because of one's own good health, ii) lower confidence that the COVID-19 vaccine would protect their family and patients, and iii) that getting vaccinated was not a professional responsibility. Vaccination non-intent was strongly associated with mistrust about how fast the vaccines were developed and vaccine safety concerns. Public health websites and healthcare providers were trusted sources of COVID-19 information. HCWs with vaccination intent were more likely to get vaccinated if direct financial supports (e.g. paid sick days) were provided (74% vs 25%, P<0.001).

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.02.19.21251936; this version posted February 26, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Discussion

This survey of 8,634 non-physician HCWs in Ontario, Canada indicated that the majority (80.4%) intend to take a COVID-19 vaccine. The 19.6% of non-physician HCWs expressing initial unwillingness to vaccinate are a key target for communication efforts and behaviorally informed strategies,[4] and may be underestimated due to social desirability bias. History of flu shot refusal may be a useful proxy for needing special outreach regarding COVID-19 vaccinations. Communication directed at non-physician HCWs[5] should be tailored by ethnic subgroups and settings to increase salience. Messaging should leverage emotions (e.g., pride, hope, fear) to capture interest, while addressing safety concerns and confirming the low risk of side effects in contrast to the substantial morbidity and mortality of COVID-19. Emergent data about reduced transmission post-vaccination will be helpful. Communication channels should leverage credible sources including public health organizations, employers (i.e., healthcare institutions), and trusted healthcare providers.

In addition to targeted communication, financial and logistical supports (e.g., paid time off to get vaccinated, guaranteed sick leave in case of vaccine side effects, providing transportation to vaccine clinics or administering the vaccine on-site at workplaces) could further increase vaccine uptake, especially for this population who are often poorly paid without full-time work and benefits.[6]

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to acknowledge the Service Employees International Union (SEIU), a union which represents over 2-million members across North America, and specifically SEIU Healthcare in Ontario for their partnership in designing and administering the survey.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.02.19.21251936; this version posted February 26, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

References

1. Gharpure R, Guo A, Bishnoi C, et al. *Early COVID-19 First-Dose Vaccination Coverage Among Residents and Staff Members of Skilled Nursing Facilities Participating in the Pharmacy Partnership for Long-Term Care Program — United States, December 2020–January 2021.* 2021.
2. Roy B, Kumar V, Venktesh A. Health Care Workers' Reluctance to Take the Covid-19 Vaccine: A Consumer-Marketing Approach to Identifying and Overcoming Hesitancy. *NEJM Catalyst.* 2020:1-10.
3. Michie S, Johnston M, Abraham C, et al. Making psychological theory useful for implementing evidence based practice: a consensus approach. *Qual Saf Health Care.* 2005;14(1):26-33.
4. Fisher KA, Bloomstone SJ, Walder J, Crawford S, Fouayzi H, Mazor KM. Attitudes Toward a Potential SARS-CoV-2 Vaccine : A Survey of U.S. Adults. *Ann Intern Med.* 2020;173(12):964-973.
5. Unroe KT, Evans R, Weaver L, Rusyniak D, Blackburn J. Willingness of Long-Term Care Staff to Receive a COVID-19 Vaccine: A Single State Survey. *J Am Geriatr Soc.* 2020.
6. Volpp KG, Loewenstein G, Buttenheim AM. Behaviorally Informed Strategies for a National COVID-19 Vaccine Promotion Program. *JAMA.* 2021;325(2):125-126.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.02.19.21251936; this version posted February 26, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Table 1. Characteristics of participants, overall and by initial willingness to get a COVID-19 vaccine.

Characteristic	Overall (N=8634) No. (%)	Intent to vaccinate (n=8298) Likely No. (%)	Unlikely No. (%)	P-value
Age group, years (n=7262)				
18-29	692 (9.5)	530 (9.0)	162 (11.9)	<0.001
30-39	1514 (20.9)	1136 (19.2)	378 (27.9)	
40-49	1970 (27.1)	1589 (26.9)	381 (28.1)	
50+	3086 (42.5)	2650 (44.89)	436 (32.2)	
Gender (n=7226)				
Female	6446 (89.2)	5206 (88.4)	1240 (92.8)	<0.001
Male	780 (10.8)	684 (11.6)	96 (7.2)	
Country of birth (n=7176)				
Outside Canada	2651 (36.9)	2287 (39.0)	364 (27.7)	<0.001
Canada	4525 (63.1)	3575 (61.0)	950 (72.3)	
Ethnicity (n=5619)				
Filipino	861 (15.3)	781 (16.7)	80 (8.5)	<0.001
Caribbean	507 (9.0)	364 (7.8)	143 (15.2)	
Other[a]	2555 (45.5)	2105 (45.0)	450 (47.7)	
European	1696 (30.2)	1426 (30.5)	270 (28.6)	
Highest education level (n=7016)				
No certificate, diploma or degree	60 (0.9)	45 (0.8)	15 (1.2)	<0.001
High school diploma	858 (12.2)	727 (12.7)	131 (10.2)	
College diploma	4753 (67.8)	3791 (66.2)	962 (74.8)	
University degree	1345 (19.2)	1167 (20.4)	178 (13.8)	
Healthcare role (n=7211)				
Support workers	3085 (42.8)	2459 (41.9)	626 (46.8)	0.003
Staff	1872 (26.0)	1547 (26.3)	325 (24.3)	
Other	698 (9.7)	563 (9.6)	135 (10.1)	
Nurse	1556 (21.6)	1305 (22.2)	251 (18.8)	
Setting of employment (n=7124)				
Continuing care	4605 (64.6)	3727 (64.2)	878 (66.4)	0.140
Clinic/acute care facility	2519 (35.4)	2075 (35.8)	444 (33.6)	
Position (n=7199)				
Part-time/casual	2358 (32.8)	1880 (32.0)	478 (36.3)	0.003
Full-time	4841 (67.2)	4001 (68.0)	840 (63.7)	

[a] Grouped into the 'Other' category were the following ethnicity categories: First Nations, Indigenous, Inuit, or Metis; Latin, Central and South American (e.g. Mexican, Argentinian, Guatemalan); African (e.g. South African, Ethiopian, Nigerian); Arab/West Asian (e.g. Lebanese, Moroccan, Iranian, Turkish); South Asian (e.g. East Indian, Pakistani, Sri Lankan, Bangladeshi); Other East and South East Asian (e.g. Vietnamese, Korean, Japanese); or Other

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.02.19.21251936; this version posted February 26, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Table 2. Factors associated with non-intent to take a COVID-19 vaccine.

Characteristic	Odds ratio (95% CI) Non-Intent to vaccinate ("unlikely" vs. "likely" to take the COVID-19 vaccine)	
	Unadjusted	Adjusted (N=4571)[a]
Demographics		
Age group, years		
18-29	1.86 (1.52-2.28)	1.94 (1.29-2.92)
30-39	2.02 (1.73-2.36)	1.94 (1.40-2.69)
40-49	1.46 (1.25-1.69)	1.15 (0.85-1.55)
50+	1 [Reference]	1 [Reference]
Gender		
Female	1.70 (1.36-2.12)	0.88 (0.57-1.36)
Male	1 [Reference]	1 [Reference]
Country of birth		
Outside Canada	0.60 (0.53-0.68)	0.66 (0.48-0.90)
Canada	1 [Reference]	1 [Reference]
Ethnicity[b]		
Filipino	0.54 (0.42-0.70)	1.07 (0.41-2.76)
Caribbean	2.07 (1.64-2.62)	3.20 (1.52-6.75)
Other	1.13 (0.96-1.33)	1.44 (0.93-2.22)
European	1 [Reference]	1 [Reference]
Highest education level		
No certificate, diploma or degree	2.19 (1.19-4.00)	3.46 (1.06-11.31)
High school diploma	1.18 (0.93-1.51)	0.93 (0.56-1.53)
College diploma	1.66 (1.40-1.98)	1.29 (0.92-1.81)
University degree	1 [Reference]	1 [Reference]
Healthcare role		
Support workers	1.32 (1.13-1.55)	0.84 (0.60-1.17)
Staff	1.09 (0.91-1.31)	0.82 (0.58-1.18)
Other	1.25 (0.99-1.57)	0.75 (0.46-1.21)
Nurse	1 [Reference]	1 [Reference]
Setting of employment[b]		
Continuing care	1.10 (0.97-1.25)	1.31 (0.83-2.06)
Clinic/acute care facility	1 [Reference]	1 [Reference]
Position		
Part-time/casual	1.21 (1.07-1.37)	1.10 (0.85-1.43)
Full-time	1 [Reference]	1 [Reference]
Beliefs		
Concerned about becoming ill with COVID-19	0.23 (0.19-0.26)	0.55 (0.37-0.81)
Concerned about patient becoming ill with COVID-19	0.33 (0.27-0.41)	0.97 (0.57-1.65)
Perceive COVID-19 infection as severe	0.70 (0.62-0.79)	0.76 (0.59-0.98)
Getting vaccinated will help protect my family	0.03 (0.03-0.04)	0.21 (0.15-0.30)

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.02.19.21251936; this version posted February 26, 2021. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 International license .

Getting vaccinated will protect my patients	0.04 (0.04-0.05)	0.44 (0.31-0.62)
Worried by lost wages to recover from vaccine	0.81 (0.72-0.91)	0.57 (0.43-0.74)
Finding time to get vaccinated is overwhelming	0.46 (0.40-0.52)	0.56 (0.42-0.75)
Getting vaccinated is part of my job	0.07 (0.06-0.09)	0.31 (0.23-0.40)
I get the flu shot in a normal year	0.16 (0.14-0.18)	0.52 (0.41-0.68)
Not necessary because I am in good health	8.09 (6.88-9.51)	2.12 (1.51-2.97)
Do not trust vaccine because of fast development	14.99 (12.83-17.50)	5.10 (3.75-6.94)
Scared of vaccine's potential side effects	7.15 (6.12-8.37)	2.44 (1.71-3.48)

[a]Adjusted for all factors listed in Table 2.

[b]Interaction term included between ethnicity and setting of employment (P<0.001).

Adjusted ORs for ethnicity in Table 2 represent the association between ethnicity and vaccination non-intent in the **clinic/acute care setting**. The corresponding ORs for ethnicity and vaccination non-intent in the continuing care setting include: Filipino [OR 2.45 (95% CI 1.40-4.29)], Caribbean [OR 0.65 (95% CI 0.37-1.14)], Other [OR 1.38 (95% CI 0.96-1.98)] compared to a reference of European ethnicity.

Adjusted ORs for setting of employment in Table 2 represent the association between setting and vaccination non-intent in those of **European ethnicity**. The corresponding ORs for continuing care and vaccination non-intent in other ethnicities include: OR 2.29 (95% CI 0.80-6.50) in HCWs of Filipino ethnicity, OR 0.20 (95% CI 0.08-0.50) in HCWs of Caribbean ethnicity, and OR 0.96 (95% CI 0.54-1.68) in HCWs of other ethnicities compared to a reference of acute care setting.