<u>**Original Article**</u>

**Lack of latent tuberculosis screening in HIV patients and delay in Anti-**

**Retroviral Therapy initiation in HIV-TB co-infection: A 11-year study in an**

**intermediate TB-burden country**

Vannesa Yue May Teng[1], Yan Ting Chua[1], Eunice En Ni Lai[1], Shilpa Mukherjee[1],

Jessica Michaels[1], Chen Seong Wong[2,3], Yee Sin Leo[2,3,4], Barnaby Young[2,3,4],

Sophia Archuleta[1,5], Catherine W.M. Ong[1,5,6]

<u>**Affiliations**</u>

[1]Department of Medicine, National University Hospital, National University Health

System Singapore;

[2]National Centre for Infectious Disease, Singapore

[3] Department of Infectious Disease, Tan Tock Seng Hospital, Singapore

[4]Lee Kong Chian school of Medicine, Nanyang Technological University Singapore,

Singapore

[5]Department of Medicine, Yong Loo Lin School of Medicine, National University of

Singapore

[6]Institute for Health Innovation & Technology, National University of Singapore

Corresponding Author:

Vannesa Teng Yue May

10th floor Tower Block, 1E Kent Ridge Road, Singapore 119228

vannesa_teng@nuhs.edu.sg

Telephone number: +65 98164277

Co-Corresponding Author

Catherine W.M. Ong

10th floor Tower Block, 1E Kent Ridge Road, Singapore 119228

Email: catherine_wm_ong@nuhs.edu.sg

Telephone number: +65  6772 7854

Word Count:  2505

Page count: 19

Figures: 3

References: 28

**ABSTRACT (250 words)**

**Objectives**

Tuberculosis (TB) is a common infection in HIV patients. Our study aims to determine

the prevalence and characteristics of HIV-TB co-infected patients in Singapore, a

high-income, intermediate TB-burden country.

**Methods**

Retrospective data of 11-years was obtained from the National University Hospital

(NUH), a quaternary care hospital and the National Centre for Infectious Diseases,

the national HIV centre.

**Results**

From December 2005 to December 2016, 48 out of 819 HIV patients and 272 out of

3,196 HIV patients who were managed in NUH and TTSH respectively, were

diagnosed with TB. 89.1% (n=285) were males and 2 (0.6%) were screened for

latent TB on HIV diagnosis. The median age at TB diagnosis was 47.3 years old

(Interquartile range, IQR 41-57). Mean CD4 count at TB diagnosis was 125.0 ± 153.9

cells/mm$^3$. 124 (38.6%) patients had CD4 < 50 cells/mm$^3$. 41.3% (n=132) of patients

had HIV diagnosed at least 6 weeks before TB diagnosis, indicating an opportunity to

initiate latent TB preventive therapy. 55.0% (n=176) had HIV and TB concomitantly

diagnosed within 6 weeks whilst 2.25% (n=7) had TB diagnosed before HIV. Of those

HIV-TB co-infected patients with CD4 $\leq$ 50 cells/mm$^3$, 18 (14.2%) had anti-retroviral

therapy (ART) started <2 weeks. TB-related mortality was 5.3% (n=17) and 3.75%

(n=12) were lost to follow-up.

**Conclusion**

There is a lack of latent TB screening in HIV patients and a delay in initiation of ART

in HIV-TB patients with low CD4 counts in our study. Clinical practices can be further

improved for the benefit of outcomes in HIV-TB patients.

**Introduction**

In 2019, there was an estimated 10 million new cases of tuberculosis (TB) diagnosed globally, of whom 815,000 of them were among people living with HIV (1). People living with HIV are more susceptible to active TB infection either from reactivation of latent infection or primary infection. HIV infection is estimated to increase the risks of developing TB by 16-27 times compared to those without HIV infection (2). TB remains the leading cause of death in the HIV population worldwide even though TB is both preventable and treatable. Globally, approximately 208,000 people with HIV died from TB in 2019, which may be worsened by the COVID-19 pandemic (1). Reasons for poorer clinical outcomes for HIV-TB co-infected patients include delays in initiation of anti-retroviral therapy (ART) and/or TB treatment, late detection of HIV-associated TB and multi-drug resistance TB (1).

World Health Organization (WHO) promotes preventive action through early systematic screening and treatment for active and latent TB at the time of HIV diagnosis (1). Treatment of latent TB infection (LTBI) is critical to reduce the risk of progression to active TB with an efficacy ranging 60-90% (3). The guidelines currently recommend testing LTBI using either Interferon Gamma Release Assay (IGRA) or Tuberculin skin test (TST) in high-income and upper middle-income countries with estimated TB incidence less than 100 per 100 000 as they are most likely to benefit due to resource availability and TB epidemiology (3). Despite the end TB strategy by WHO that aims to reduce the incidence rate of TB by 90% by 2035 (4), many countries are still not adhering to current guidelines. According to WHO, the percentage of newly diagnosed HIV patients who received preventive LTBI treatment in 2017 in Singapore, Indonesia, India, Philipines, Vietnam, Myanmar, Cambodia was <1%, 16%, 10%, 57%, 31%, 17% and 21% respectively (5).

Singapore is a high-income economy country with an intermediate TB burden (6),

and a healthcare system that is consistently ranked as accessible, equitable and

cost-effective by international surveys (7)(8). In Singapore, HIV is managed mainly

by the National Centre for Infectious Disease (NCID) and is the national HIV referral

center. The HIV programme at the National University Hospital (NUH), a quaternary

care centre, was established in 2010. In 2018, out of the 1,421 TB cases who had a

HIV test performed, 28 cases (2.0%) were found to have HIV-TB co-infection (9).

This study was performed to determine the number of active TB cases in HIV

patients, and determine the clinical characteristics of this cohort of patients.

**Methods**

*Study population*

Clinical data were retrospectively obtained from Communicable Disease Centre at

TTSH (Tan Tock Seng Hospital), predecessor of the NCID (2005 - 2016) and NUH

(2010 - 2016).  We included all HIV-positive patients, confirmed by Western blot, of at

least age 18, who were treated for TB in both hospitals between December 2005 and

December 2016. Data collected were patient demographics including gender, age,

comorbidities, HIV diagnosis (date of diagnosis, date of initiation of ART, CD4 count

at HIV and TB diagnosis, HIV viral load at HIV and TB diagnosis, screening for LTBI

at HIV diagnosis), TB characteristics (date of diagnosis, symptoms and duration of

presentation, site of infection, method of diagnosis, presence of cavitation, chest

radiograph (CXR) findings, physical examination findings), treatment of TB (TB

regime and administration, development of IRIS) and clinical outcome (mortality, lost

to follow up, TB recurrence, cause of death).

*Definitions*

TB was microbiologically diagnosed by positive *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* cultures

or nucleic acid tests. Patients were considered to have clinical TB if they were on TB

treatment despite having negative cultures or nucleic acid test. Acid Fast Bacilli

(AFB) smear was graded from 0-4, HIV diagnosis was confirmed by Western blotting.

CXR were scored 0-10 based on the number of segments involved as previously

described by Lawson et al (10). For patients who received treatment in NUH, CXR

was scored independently by 3 clinical researchers (Teng V.Y.M, Chua Y.T, Ong

C.W.M), and a final score was obtained by the average of 3 scores. For patients

managed in TTSH, CXR was scored by a senior clinical researcher (Young, B). LTBI

was diagnosed using an interferon gamma release assay (IGRA) (Quantiferon-TB

Gold plus;  Qiagen) or T-spot TB test (Oxford Immunotec) and/or tuberculin skin test

using purified protein derivative (PPD) solution with a cut-off of 10mm as per local

practice (9). Multidrug resistant TB was defined as *M.tuberculosis* resistant to both

isoniazid and rifampicin. Patients were considered lost to follow-up if they did not turn

up for follow up visits after starting treatment or if they have left the country without

completion of treatment.

*Data Analysis*

SPSS software (IBM SPSS,  Version 24, USA) and Graphpad Prism (Version 7.0)

was used to perform descriptive statistical analyses.   Correlation analysis was

performed using Spearman's coefficients and a $p<0.05$ was considered statistically

significant.

*Ethics*

Ethics approval was granted by NHG Domain Specific Review Board (reference

number 2015/00945).

**Results**

During the 11-year study period, 4,015 HIV patients received medical treatment at

TTSH and NUH hospital. 48 out of 819 HIV patients and 272 out of 3,196 HIV

patients were diagnosed with TB, in NUH and TTSH respectively. Out of 320 eligible

patients, the majority were male, with a median age of 47.3 years (IQR 41-57) at TB

diagnosis. 93.8% of this cohort of patients were microbiologically-proven TB.

Smokers comprised 45% of the cohort and a small proportion had diabetes-mellitus

(12.5%) (Table 1).

The mean CD4 count at TB diagnosis was $125 \pm 153.9$ cells/mm$^3$ (mean $\pm$ S.D.) with

76% of patients having a CD4 count $\leq$200 cells/mm$^3$ at the point of TB diagnosis,

indicating profound immunosuppression. Only 2 (0.6%) patients were screened for

LTBI upon HIV diagnosis, with equal proportion of unscreened patients above and

below CD4 count of 200 cells/mm$^3$ (Table 1). Both patients were negative for LTBI by

IGRA or TST. Irrespective of CD4 counts, 13%, 23% and 39% of patients had ART

started <2 weeks, 2-8 weeks, >2 months of TB diagnosis respectively. Of those with

CD4 $\leq$ 50 cells/mm$^3$, only 18 (14.2%) had ART started within 2 weeks.

The most common clinical presentation for TB were fever (75.9%), cough (62%) and

weight loss (53.4%). 143 (44.7%) patients had only pulmonary involvement; 39

(12.2%) patients had extrapulmonary TB only and 135 (42.2%) patients had both

pulmonary and extrapulmonary TB. In total, 278 (86.9%) eligible patients had

pulmonary TB out of 320 patients. The lung was the most common site of TB

involvement independent of CD4 count. The most common site of extrapulmonary TB

was lymph node involvement for both cohorts above and below CD4 of 200

cells/mm$^3$. In patients with CD4 $\leq$ 200 cells/mm$^3$, 87% (n=213) had pulmonary TB

whilst 59% (n=144) had extra-pulmonary TB (Figure 1A). However, in those with CD4

> 200 cells/mm$^3$, majority comprising 84% (n=53) had lung involvement whilst 39.6%

(n=25) had extra-pulmonary TB involvement (Figure 1B).

Of those with pulmonary TB, the median CXR score was 4. We found that a total of

84 (30.2%) patients had clear CXR despite the presence of pulmonary TB, most of

whom were patients with lower CD4 counts. For patients with CD4 $\leq$ 200 cells/mm$^3$

with lung involvement, CXR can be normal which was seen in 37.9% (Figure 2A),

and the same is observed in the relative immunocompetent group (Figure 2B). Most

of patients in the CD4 $\leq$ 200 cells/mm$^3$ had positive AFB smear results (Figure 2C)

with 10% (n=21) of patients with diffuse lung involvement, having a CXR score of 10

(Figure 2A). However, in patients with CD4 > 200 cells/mm$^3$ with lung involvement,

only 17% (n=9) patients had clear CXR with a range of AFB smears (Figure 2D),

whereas only 3.7% (n=2) patients had diffuse lung involvement (Figure 2B). In both

groups, a wide range of AFB smear score from 0 to 4 can be present in patients with

a normal CXR (Figure 2E and 2F), indicating that immunocompromised patients can

remain highly infectious despite having a normal CXR.  Similarly, it was possible to

have an AFB smear score of 0 with diffuse TB lung involvement. Interestingly, the

AFB smear was positively associated with the degree of CXR score in patients with

CD4 > 200 cells/mm$^3$ (r = 0.33, p<0.05) but this association was not found in patients

whose CD4 $\leq$ 200 cells/mm$^3$ (Figure 2E and 2F).

41.3% (n=132) of patients had HIV diagnosed at least 6 weeks prior to TB diagnosis

with a median time-frame of 46 months (IQR 12-91 months) (Figure 3). The mean

duration of active TB treatment was 8.2 ± 3.5 months. The majority of patients (83%)

were on directly observed treatment (DOT). A small proportion of patients had TB

recurrence (3.8%) and development of immune reconstitution inflammatory

syndrome (IRIS) (15.6%). Lost to follow-up rate (3.75%) was low, including those

who left the country or defaulted follow-up. All cause-mortality was 10% (n=32), out

of whom 53% consist of TB-related mortality (n=17) (Table 1).

**Discussion**

In our study, there was a significant proportion of patients (41%) who had HIV diagnosed at least 6 weeks before TB diagnosis. As culture is the gold standard for diagnosis of active TB and culture result takes 2 to 6 weeks to process, our study team considered 6 weeks to be a reasonable time frame to exclude concurrent HIV-TB on presentation (11). Our cohort mainly consisted of clinically advanced HIV disease as 76% had CD4 $\leq$ 200 cells/mm$^3$ at TB diagnosis. However, only 0.6% (n=2) of patients in this study had LTBI screened upon HIV diagnosis, which is a considerably low given WHO recommendations. In developed countries with low TB and HIV burden, the compliance of HIV services in implementing LTBI screening was often inadequate; the LTBI screening rates among HIV patients in United Kingdom, United States and New Zealand was 35%, 32% and 55% respectively (12)(13)(14). The local medical community can further improve on this aspect to prevent active TB in the HIV population.

Our study found higher rates of TB-HIV co-infection in males. This is in keeping with a systematic review done in the European Union which reported that the majority of HIV-TB co-infected cases were male and young adults, aged between 25-45 years (15). We also found that the prevalence of diabetes mellitus (DM) in our cohort was 12% which was similar to a study conducted by Bizune et al in the United States, which reported a prevalence of 9% (16). The high proportion can be explained by diabetes predisposing to TB and ART increasing the risk of metabolic syndrome and thus predisposing to DM (17), and also underscores the increase in DM prevalence in developed countries.

Other significant findings in our study included lower than expected proportion (23%) of patients who were already on ART when diagnosed with TB. This is in contrast with studies in India and Africa which found that 58% and 40% of HIV-infected patient

were already receiving ART respectively (18)(19). This difference can be explained

by a significant proportion (55%) of our cohort with TB and HIV diagnosed

concomitantly within 6 weeks, hence many of them were not expected to be on ART

when diagnosed with TB.

Existing studies have reported a variety of chest radiographic appearances of active

TB in HIV-positive patients, depending on their level of immunity. In

immunocompromised patients, clinical manifestations are atypical as AFB smear can

often be positive with normal CXR, or infiltrates are more often present in  the lower

than the upper lobes (20). 33.5% of our cohort with pulmonary TB had normal CXR

which is slightly higher than that reported in other studies which range from 6-21%

(21) and may be due to our cohort being more immunocompromised with a mean

CD4 count of 125 cells/mm$^3$. Therefore, clinicians should exercise  caution when

using CXR to screen for active TB disease in HIV patients. A high index of suspicion

especially in patients presenting with prolonged cough, is required for timely

diagnosis of TB in HIV positive patients.

We found 90% of our HIV-TB cohort to be AFB smear positive with 89% in the group

with CD4 $\leq$ 200 cells/mm$^3$ and 94% in the CD4 > 200 cells/mm$^3$. This is in contrast to

previous studies which reported lower prevalence rates (50-70%) with positive AFB

sputum smears in HIV patients (21). This difference may be contributed by higher

sensitivity used in our laboratory and other studies not reporting trace results from

smear tests, leading to lower rates of smear negative results. The mycobacterial

burden was also significantly associated with the degree of CXR involvement only in

those with CD4 > 200 cells/mm$^3$.

WHO recommends initiation of ART for HIV-TB coinfected patients within the first 2

months of starting TB treatment and within 2 weeks in those severely

immunocompromised patients with CD4 counts <50 cells/mm$^3$. Prompt initiation of

ART to HIV-TB co-infected patients reduces mortality especially in advanced HIV

disease (22). Our study showed that only 14% of patients with CD4 $\leq$ 50 cells/mm$^3$

had ARV initiated within 2 weeks. In addition, there was a significant proportion

(51.7%) of patients who initiated ART more than 2 months of TB diagnosis, out of

which 89% were from patients managed prior to 2011. Majority of delay in ART

initiation were prior to the revised WHO ART initiation guidelines in 2010 (23). A

study by Escada et al in Brazil found that only 5.4% of patients were initiated on ART

within 2 weeks of starting TB treatment, however their cohort had a higher median

CD4 count of 91 cells/mm$^3$ (24).

DOT is recommended by WHO to promote TB treatment adherence as suboptimal

adherence has been associated with unfavourable clinical outcomes (25). Our cohort

was able to achieve 83% on DOT, with the remaining using self-administered

treatment (SAT). There was a wide variability in the success of implementing DOT in

other countries, ranging from 24% in South Africa (26) to 91% in Philippines in HIV-

TB co-infected patients (27). The main challenges faced worldwide included poor

public health infrastructure, poor social support, inadequate funding and lack of

awareness about the strategy among practitioners especially in low income,

developing countries (27). In our study, TB-related mortality rate was 5.3%. This is

much lower than the global rate in 2008 in which TB accounted for about 26% of HIV-

related deaths (28). Overall, there is ample room for improvement to comply with

international guidelines to reduce mortality in our HIV population.

The main strength of this study is the detailed clinical data collected for analysis over

a 11-year period of cohort of 320 patients. Study limitations include missing data

given that this was a retrospective study. In addition, although one of our centres is a

referral centre for HIV in Singapore, our data may not be representative of the

national HIV-TB situation of the country.

**Conclusion**

Early diagnosis of LTBI enables prompt effective treatment to prevent TB-associated

deaths. Further improvements are needed to offer routine LTBI screening and

treatment in all HIV patients, as recommended by the WHO. In our high-income

intermediate TB burden country, there remains a good window of opportunity to

reduce the prevalence of HIV-TB co-infection, together with prompt initiation of ART

to improve treatment outcomes in this population.

**Acknowledgements**

Catherine W. M. Ong is funded by Singapore National Medical Research Council

(NMRC/TA/0042/2015, CSAINV17nov014); National University Health System

Singapore (NUHS/RO/2017/092/SU/01, CFGFY18P11,

NUHSRO/2020/042/RO5+5/ad-hoc/1), iHealthtech in NUS and recipient of the Young

Investigator Award, Institut Merieux, Lyon, France.

**Author contributions**

Ong C.W.M, Archuleta S. conceived the study. Teng V.Y.M., Chua Y.T., Lai E.E.N.,

Mukherjee S., Michaels J. and Young B. obtained the data.  Teng V.Y.M., Chua Y.T.,

Lai E.E.N. analysed the data.  Teng V.W.M, and Ong C.W.M co-wrote the first draft.

All authors edited and approved the final version of the manuscript.

**References**

1. World Health Organization. Global Tuberculosis Report 2020 [Internet]. WHO.
World Health Organization; [cited 2021 Jan 17]. Available from:
https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/336069/9789240013131-
eng.pdf

2. WHO | Tuberculosis and HIV [Internet]. WHO. World Health Organization; [cited
2020 Jul 25]. Available from: http://www.who.int/hiv/topics/tb/about_tb/en/

3. WHO | WHO guidelines on the management of latent tuberculosis infection
launched today [Internet]. WHO. World Health Organization; [cited 2020 Nov
29]. Available from: https://www.who.int/tb/features_archive/LTBI/en/

4. WHO | The End TB Strategy [Internet]. WHO. World Health Organization; [cited
2020 Nov 29]. Available from: http://www.who.int/tb/strategy/end-tb/en/

5. Paton NI, Borand L, Benedicto J, Kyi MM, Mahmud AM, Norazmi MN, et al.
Diagnosis and management of latent tuberculosis infection in Asia: Review of
current status and challenges. International Journal of Infectious Diseases.
2019 Oct 1;87:21–9.

6. Tam G, Lai SW. Is Singapore on track to eliminate tuberculosis by 2030? A policy
case study. SAGE Open Med [Internet]. 2019 May 19 [cited 2020 Jul 25];7.
Available from: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6537069/

7. Bloomberg's Global Health Index For 2020 | Worldhealth.net Anti-Aging News
[Internet]. [cited 2020 Nov 29]. Available from:
https://worldhealth.net/news/bloombergs-global-health-index-2020/

8. Tandon A, Murray CJ, Lauer JA, Evans DB. Measuring Overall Health System
Performance for 191 Countries. :23.

9. Communicable Diseases Surveillance Singapore 2018. [Internet]. Communicable
Diseases Division, Ministry of Health, Singapore; [cited 2020 Nov 29]. Available
from: https://www.moh.gov.sg/docs/librariesprovider5/diseases-
updates/communicable-diseases-surveillance-in-singapore-
2018210c9a3beaa94db49299c2da53322dce.pdf

10. Lawson L, Yassin MA, Thacher TD, Olatunji OO, Lawson JO, Akingbogun TI, et
al. Clinical presentation of adults with pulmonary tuberculosis with and without
HIV infection in Nigeria. Scandinavian Journal of Infectious Diseases. 2008
Jan;40(1):30–5.

11. Kwan CK, Ernst JD. HIV and Tuberculosis: a Deadly Human Syndemic. Clinical
Microbiology Reviews. 2011 Apr 1;24(2):351–76.

12. Latent tuberculosis infection screening and treatment in HIV: insights from
evaluation of UK practice | Thorax [Internet]. [cited 2020 Dec 1]. Available from:
https://thorax.bmj.com/content/72/2/180

13. Adams JW, Howe CJ, Andrews AC, Allen SL, Vinnard C. Tuberculosis screening
among HIV-infected patients: tuberculin skin test vs. interferon-gamma release
assay. AIDS Care. 2017 Dec;29(12):1504–9.

14. Anwara O, Patrick M, Edeogu C, Kelechi O, Moses A, Oka G. The prevalence of
diabetes mellitus in human immunodeficiency virus seropositive subject's co-
infected with mycobacterium tuberculosis. :8.

15. Pimpin L, Drumright LN, Kruijshaar ME, Abubakar I, Rice B, Delpech V, et al.
Tuberculosis and HIV co-infection in European Union and European Economic
Area countries. European Respiratory Journal. 2011 Dec 1;38(6):1382–92.

16. Bizune DJ, Kempker RR, Kagei M, Yamin A, Mohamed O, Holland DP, et al.
Treatment Complexities Among Patients with Tuberculosis in a High HIV
Prevalence Cohort in the United States. AIDS Res Hum Retroviruses. 2018 Dec
1;34(12):1050–7.

17. Brown TT, Tassiopoulos K, Bosch RJ, Shikuma C, McComsey GA. Association
between systemic inflammation and incident diabetes in HIV-infected patients
after initiation of antiretroviral therapy. Diabetes Care. 2010 Oct;33(10):2244–9.

18. Kumar AMV, Singarajipura A, Naik B, Guddemane DK, Patel Y, Shastri S, et al.
HIV-infected presumptive tuberculosis patients without tuberculosis: How many
are eligible for antiretroviral therapy in Karnataka, India? Journal of
Epidemiology and Global Health. 2017 Mar 1;7(1):11–9.

19. Pathmanathan I, Pasipamire M, Pals S, Dokubo EK, Preko P, Ao T, et al. High
uptake of antiretroviral therapy among HIV-positive TB patients receiving co-
located services in Swaziland. PLOS ONE. 2018 May 16;13(5):e0196831.

21. Lee MP, Chan JWM, Ng KKP, Li PCK. Clinical manifestations of tuberculosis in
HIV☐infected patients. Respirology. 2000 Dec;5(4):423–6.

22. WHO | Universal antiretroviral therapy (ART) for all HIV-infected TB patients
[Internet]. WHO. World Health Organization; [cited 2020 Jul 8]. Available from:
https://www.who.int/hiv/topics/tb/art_hivpatients/en/

23. WHO | Antiretroviral therapy for HIV infection in adults and adolescents [Internet].
WHO. World Health Organization; [cited 2021 Feb 7]. Available from:
https://www.who.int/hiv/pub/arv/adult2010/en/

24. da Silva Escada RO, Velasque L, Ribeiro SR, Cardoso SW, Marins LMS,
Grinsztejn E, et al. Mortality in patients with HIV-1 and tuberculosis co-infection
in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil - associated factors and causes of death. BMC Infect
Dis. 2017 May 30;17(1):373.

25. A patient-level pooled analysis of treatment-shortening regimens for drug-
susceptible pulmonary tuberculosis | Nature Medicine [Internet]. [cited 2021 Jan
17]. Available from: https://www.nature.com/articles/s41591-018-0224-2

26. Howell EM, Kigozi NG, Heunis JC. Community-based directly observed treatment
for TB patients to improve HIV services: a cross-sectional study in a South
African province. BMC Health Serv Res [Internet]. 2018 Apr 7 [cited 2020 Dec
2];18. Available from: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5889613/

27. Cai E, Chua S, Tan M, Tambyah P. Tuberculosis care: enhancing directly
observed therapy in a peri-urban, low socioeconomic status neighbourhood.
smedj. 2019 Jul;60(7):334–6.

28. Getahun H, Gunneberg C, Granich R, Nunn P. HIV Infection—Associated
Tuberculosis: The Epidemiology and the Response. Clinical Infectious
Diseases. 2010 May 15;50(Supplement_3):S201–7.

**Table 1: Baseline characterisics of HIV-TB co-infected patients**

| Characteristics | N=320 |
|---|---|
| Gender, n (%) | |
|    Male | 285 (89.1) |
|    Female | 33 (10.3) |
|    Transgender | 2 (0.6) |
| Age at HIV diagnosis, median (IQR) | 43.4 (37-55) |
| Age at TB diagnosis, median (IQR) | 47.3 (41-57) |
| TB diagnosed by, n (%) | |
|    Nucleic acid tests (eg. GeneXpert) | 133 (41.4) |
|    TB cultures | 272 (84.7) |
|    Clinical diagnosis | 20 (6.2) |
| Previous TB history, n (%) | 26 (8.1) |
| Presence of TB contact history, n (%) | 27 (8.4) |
| Smoker, n (%) | 144 (44.9) |
| Alcoholism, n (%) | 76 (23.7) |
| History of cancer, n (%) | 10 (3.1) |
| Diabetes mellitus, n (%) | 40 (12.5) |
| End Stage Kidney Disease, n (%) | 1 (0.3) |
| Hepatitis B, n (%) | 31 (9.7) |
| Hepatitis C, n (%) | 13 (4.0) |
| Receiving ART when diagnosed with TB, n (%) | 74 (23.1) |
| Screened for latent TB upon HIV diagnosis, n (%) ¶ | 2 (0.6) |
| CD4 at TB diagnosis, mean ± s.d. | 125.0 ± 153.9cells/mm$^3$ |
|    CD4 >200cell/mL, n (%) | 63 (19.6) |
|    CD4 50-200 cells/mL, n (%) | 120 (37.4) |
|    CD4 <50 cells/mL, n (%) | 124 (38.6) |
|    Unknown, n (%) | 13 (4.1) |
| HIV viral load at TB diagnosis, mean ± s.d. | 935,142 ± 5,361,346 copies/ml |
| Direct Observed Treatment, n (%) | 267 (83) |
| Multi-drug resistant TB, n (%) | 6 (1.9) |
| Time of starting ART, n (%) | |
|    CD4≤50 cells/mm$^3$ | 127 (39.7) |
|      <2 weeks | 18 (14.2) |
|      2-8 weeks | 27 (21.3) |
|      >8 weeks | 57 (44.9) |
|    CD4>50 cells/mm$^3$ | 179 (55.9) |
|      <2 weeks | 22 (12.3) |
|      2-8 weeks | 44 (24.6) |
|      >8 weeks | 62 (34.6) |
| Recurrence of TB, n (%) | 12 (3.75) |
| Development of paradoxical IRIS, n (%) | 50 (15.6) |
| Duration of TB treatment, mean ± s.d. | 8.2 ± 3.5 months |
| Died, n (%) | 32 (10) |
|    TB-related | 17 (5.3) |
|    Non TB related | 15 (4.7) |
| Lost to follow up, n (%) | 12 (3.75) |
| Time between HIV diagnosis and death, median (IQR) | 530 days (274-2413) |

2    ART, Anti-retroviral therapy; HIV, Human immuno-deficiency virus; IQR, Inter-quartile
3    range; IRIS, Immune reconstitution inflammatory syndrome; SD, standard deviation,
4    TB, Tuberculosis.
5    ¶: Latent TB defined by positive testing by TST (tuberculin skin test) or IGRA
6    (interferon gamma release assay)

(A)

(B)

3  **Figure 1: Sites of TB infection in HIV-TB patients.** (A) Patients with CD4≤200
4  cells/mm$^3$ at TB diagnosis. (B) Patients with CD4>200 cells/mm$^3$ at TB diagnosis

**Figure 2: Characteristics of pulmonary TB in HIV patients.**
(A) Chest radiograph score of patients with CD4≤200 cells/mm³ at TB diagnosis. (B)
Chest radiograph score of patients with CD4>200 cells/mm³ at TB diagnosis. (C)
AFB smear quantity in patients with pulmonary TB, with CD4≤200 cells/mm³ at TB
diagnosis. (D) AFB smear quantity in patients with pulmonary TB, with CD4>200
cells/mm³ at TB diagnosis. (E) Association of AFB smear with chest radiograph in
patients with CD4≤200 cells/mm³ at TB diagnosis. (F) Association of AFB smear with
chest radiograph in patients with CD4>200 cells/mm³ at TB diagnosis.

2
3    3: **Time to TB diagnosis relative to HIV diagnosis**