

Dose-Response Effect of Acupuncture for Melasma: A Prospective Cohort Study in a Tertiary Hospital in Thailand

Thanan Supasiri^{1*}, Krit Pongpirul^{1,2*}

¹ Department of Preventive and Social Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, Thailand

² Department of International Health and Department of Health, Behavior and Society, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MD, USA

* Co-Corresponding Authors

Contact

Thanan Supasiri, MD, MPH, MTCM

Email: thanan.s@chula.ac.th

Assist. Prof. Dr. Krit Pongpirul, MD, MPH, PhD.

Email: doctorkrit@gmail.com

Address: Department of Preventive and Social Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn University, 1873 Rama IV Rd., Patumwan, Bangkok 10330, Thailand.

Abstract

Background: Melasma is a common skin pigmentation disorder. Acupuncture shows benefits for patients with melasma, although no standardized method or optimal number of sessions have been determined.

Objective: To comparatively assess clinical outcomes of melasma between five vs ten standard acupuncture sessions.

Methods: We performed a prospective observational cohort study in all melasma patients at the Acupuncture Clinic, King Chulalongkorn Memorial Hospital, Bangkok, Thailand. All patients were treated with standard acupuncture procedure twice a week and were evaluated after the fifth and the tenth sessions of acupuncture, with a follow-up one week after the last session. Participants were divided into two treatment groups: Groups A and B received five and ten acupuncture sessions respectively. Melasma outcomes were assessed by using the Melanin Index (MI), Melasma Area and Severity Index (MASI), patient-reported improvement scores and acupuncture-related adverse events.

Results: Of 113 participants, 67 received five sessions of acupuncture treatment while 39 received ten sessions. 7 participants did not finish treatment. After five sessions of acupuncture in Group A, the mean MI decreased by 28.7 (95%CI -38.5 to -18.8), whereas the median MASI decreased by 3.4 (-6.9, -1.2) points. After ten sessions of acupuncture in Group B, the mean MI decreased by 31.3 (95%CI -45.0 to -17.6), whereas the median MASI decreased by 5.4 (-9.9, -3.0) points. The first five sessions of acupuncture had a higher effect on the change in magnitude than the last five sessions, although there was no statistically significant difference. However, ten-session of acupuncture, had not reached the peak benefit on melasma yet. Further studies

should be done with a higher number of sessions to determine the optimal rounds of treatment. Twenty-nine participants reported minor side effects, mostly consisting of persistent pain and small hematoma. Group B had RR of having adverse events 1.8 times (95% CI 1.0-3.4) compared to group A.

Conclusion: Acupuncture has a potential dose-response effect on clinical and patient-reported melasma outcomes with minor side effects.

Keywords: Acupuncture, Melasma, Dose-response relationship

Introduction

Melasma is an acquired hyperpigmentation characterized by dark brownish maculae and irregular contour, but clear limits that typically affect photo-exposed areas of the face [1, 2]. Its negative impact on appearance can affect the quality of life, emotional wellbeing, and even lead to psychiatric consequences [3, 4].

Preventive measures against melasma include avoiding exposure to UV light and using broad-spectrum sunscreen. Many therapeutic interventions such as hydroquinone, triple-combination cream (hydroquinone, tretinoin, and fluocinolone acetonide), azelaic acid, laser and light-based therapy or the use of tranexamic acid have shown benefits in lightening the melasma area [5-7]; however, due to the heterogeneity of the possible treatments, there is no census on a standard treatment for melasma [6].

Acupuncture has shown benefits for patients with melasma. The effective rate of acupuncture for melasma has been reported around 87-96% [8-10]. In Chinese medicine theory,

acupuncture can promote blood and qi circulation, as well as rebalance and regulate various internal systems in the body to promote metabolism of epidermal cells, thus improving the melasma [11, 12]. This correlates with evidence from an RCT's finding that acupuncture can increase skin blood perfusion [13]. Another RCT found that after acupuncture treatment for melasma, blood estrogen level decreased while progesterone increased, which corresponds to the association of increasing estrogen and decreasing progesterone level in melasma patients [9].

Although acupuncture for melasma has shown to be effective at low cost with minimal side effects, it is difficult to implement in a large scale since it requires multiple treatments, which can be inconvenient for the patients. Additionally, the method of treatment according to TCM syndrome differentiation is doctor-dependent and might be subjective. The standard methods, the acupoints used and the optimal number of treatment sessions have been inconclusive. Previous systematic review of 8 RCTs found the number of acupuncture sessions varied from 21 to 60 over 4–16 weeks (2–7 times weekly) [14]. Traditionally, one course of acupuncture treatment for a chronic disease consists of ten sessions [15], but the actual optimal number of sessions has not been studied. Therefore, this study aims to propose a fixed regimen of acupuncture for melasma, initiate the dose-response relationship study of acupuncture for melasma and find the optimal number of acupuncture sessions needed in the routine practice collecting data process.

Methods

Study design and population

This prospective observational cohort was conducted at the Acupuncture Clinic, King Chulalongkorn Memorial Hospital, Bangkok, Thailand, from September – December 2018. We

recruited all melasma patients who came to the clinic for acupuncture treatment and were willing to participate in this observational study. We excluded participants who were pregnant, had severe underlying disease or psychosis, had a bleeding tendency, or had skin infections in the acupoints area. All participants were directed to maintain their usual behavior, such as using the same frequency and amount of sunscreen protection or continuing to not use sunscreen regularly.

Acupuncture Procedure

All patients were treated with fixed acupoints: encircling the melasma area, Fengchi (GB20), Hegu (LI4), Xuehai (SP10), Jusanli (ST36), Sanyinjiao (SP6) and Taichong (LR3). All acupoints were performed bilaterally except those encircling the melasma area. The acupoints were carefully selected from the literature review of standard teaching materials in China [15] and those frequently used in previous studies [8, 14]. We used sterile disposable needles sized 0.25 x 40 mm. Acupuncture was done twice a week by well-trained acupuncturists, licensed with acupuncture Master's degrees certified from China. "De Qi" sensation in every acupoint was mandatory, and needles were retained 30 minutes each time. Participants were evaluated every fifth session of acupuncture. Since this was an observational study, we used the usual protocol used in our acupuncture clinic. If the first five sessions of acupuncture did not yield satisfactory results and the patients were willing to continue the treatment, we continued the acupuncture treatment for five more sessions. Therefore, participants were divided into 2 groups: Group A received five acupuncture sessions and Group B received ten acupuncture sessions.

Outcome Measurements

Participants were evaluated at the first visit for their baseline characteristics and every five sessions of acupuncture. Participants in both groups were also evaluated one week after their last session.

The primary outcome was the change in Melanin Index (MI) measured by Mexameter[®] MX 18 (Courage+Khazaka electronic GmbH, Köln, Germany) on melasma affected part of the face one week after the last treatment compared to the baseline. MI was calculated as the average of a triplicate measurement in the area where the melasma was darkest.

The secondary outcomes consisted of the change in Melasma Area and Severity Index (MASI), patient-reported improvement scores and related adverse events from acupuncture. The MASI was developed by Kimbrough-Green et al [16] and assesses three factors—area (A) of involvement, darkness (D) and homogeneity (H)—at four locations: the forehead (f), right malar region (rm), left malar region (lm) and chin (c). The MASI score can be calculated using the following formula:

$$\text{MASI score} = 0.3A_f(D_f + H_f) + 0.3A_{rm}(D_{rm} + H_{rm}) + 0.3A_{lm}(D_{lm} + H_{lm}) + 0.1A_c(D_c + H_c)$$

The area of involvement is rated from 0 to 6 while the darkness and homogeneity of pigmentation are rated from 0 to 4; thus, the MASI score ranges from 0 (none) to 48 (severe melasma).

Subjective improvement scores were measured by the six-point Likert Scale, from -1 to +4 (-1, worsening; 0, no improvement; +1, slight improvement; +2, moderate improvement; +3, marked improvement; +4, almost cured or completely cured). Adverse events due to acupuncture were recorded from interviewing participants and physical examinations by physicians each visit.

All participants were also photographed at every evaluation visit. MI, MASI and satisfactory scores were evaluated by the same evaluator who had been trained by a dermatologist.

Statistical analysis

Baseline characteristics and data at each time-point were analyzed by descriptive statistics. Data after treatment compared to baseline in each group was analyzed by using the Student's paired t-test or Wilcoxon signed-rank tests as appropriate. Linear regression was used to compare the results between Group A and Group B after adjusting for unequal baselines. Linear regression was also used to see if any baseline factors affected outcome. For Group B, mixed model with subject as a random effect was used to compare the result of the first five sessions (1st to 5th) and the last five sessions (6th to 10th). Pairwise comparison between the first and last five sessions was made by Scheffe's Test. If the data did not meet the assumptions to use the mixed model or linear regression, the nonparametric test was used. The data were analyzed using the Stata/MP 15.1 (StataCorp LLC, College Station, TX, USA) software package.

Trial Registration

The study was registered on August 19, 2018, before recruiting the first case, with the Thai Clinical Trials Registry, Identification Number TCTR20180824002.

Ethics Approval

The study was approved by the Institutional Review Board (IRB), Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn University (IRB No.544/2559). Each participant provided written informed consent.

Results

One hundred and thirteen melasma patients came for acupuncture treatment during September – December 2018. Baseline characteristics are shown in Table 1. Acupuncturists finished the course of treatment after five sessions for 67 participants due to the significant improvement achieved. The other 39 participants continued until ten sessions. Seven participants did not complete at least five sessions of acupuncture and thus, were not evaluated.

Table 1 Characteristics of the Participants

	Group A: Five sessions of acupuncture treatment (n = 67)	Group B: Ten sessions of acupuncture treatment (n=39)
Female [n (%)]	64 (95.5)	37 (94.9)
Age [mean (SD)] (years)	44.3 (9.7)	52.5 (9.7)
Duration of Melasma [mean (SD)] (years)	7.4 (6.8)	8.3 (6.2)
Prior Acupuncture Experience [n (%)]	18 (26.9)	13 (33.3)
Family History of Melasma [n (%)]	48 (71.6)	22 (56.4)

Melanin Index (MI)

The average baseline MI for all participants at the darkest area was 298.9 (SD 79.7). Table 2 shows baseline MI and measurements at each time-point for Groups A and B.

In Group A, after the 5th session of acupuncture, MI decreased by 25.0 (95%CI -34.0 to -16.1): from 287.4 (SD 64.8) to 262.3 (SD 62.5). After follow-up with participants one week after completing five sessions, the mean MI decreased by 28.7 (95%CI -38.5 to -18.8, $p<0.001$) to 258.7 (SD 61.4). In Group B, after the 5th session of acupuncture, MI decreased by 22.5 (95%CI -35.5 to -9.5, $p=0.001$): from 315.9 (SD 98.5) to 293.4 (SD 90.6). After the 10th session of

acupuncture, MI decreased by 30.3 (95%CI -42.4 to -18.2, $p < 0.001$) to 285.6 (SD 94.7). After follow-up one week after completing ten sessions of acupuncture, the mean MI decreased by 31.3 (95%CI -45.0 to -17.6, $p < 0.001$) to 284.6 (SD 89.2).

Comparing the efficacy of the first five sessions (1st to 5th) to the last five sessions (6th to 10th) in Group B, the MI decreased by 22.5 (95%CI -35.5 to -9.5) and 7.8 (95%CI -20.5 to 4.8) respectively. However, there was no statistically significant difference between these two periods (p-value from Scheffe's Test = 0.44).

From the linear regression analysis of the post-fifth-session treatment outcomes, apart from the different baseline MI between groups, other factors including the duration of melasma, prior acupuncture experience and family history of melasma did not affect the treatment outcome (see appendix 1).

Between the two groups at one-week follow up post-treatment, after adjusting for the unequal baseline, there was no significant difference between the two groups ($p = 0.67$) (see appendix 2).

Table 2 Mean Melanin Index (MI) at each evaluation visit

Melanin Index	Group A (n=67) Mean (SD)	p-value	Group B (n=39) Mean (SD)	p-value
Baseline	287.4 (64.8)	Reference	315.9 (98.5)	Reference
After the 5 th session	262.3 (62.5)	< 0.001*	293.4 (90.6)	0.001*
One week after 5 th session	258.7 (61.4)	< 0.001*		
After the 10 th session			285.6 (94.7)	< 0.001*
One week after 10 th session			284.6 (89.2)	< 0.001*

*p-value calculated using Student's paired t-test

Melasma Area and Severity Index (MASI)

The baseline median MASI scores for overall participants was 6 (2.6, 11.4) scores. Group B had a higher baseline MASI score than Group A throughout the study, as shown in Table 3 with details of the MASI at each time point.

In Group A, after completing five sessions of acupuncture, the median change of MASI score was -2.9 (-5.3, -0.9) scores. However, after following up one week post-fifth session, the median change of MASI score compared to baseline was -3.4 (-6.9, -1.2) scores. In Group B, after completing five sessions of acupuncture, the median change of MASI score was -3.3 (-6.0, -0.7) scores. After completing ten sessions of acupuncture, the median change of MASI score compared to baseline was -5.1 (-8.9, -2.5) scores. The median change of MASI score between the 6th to 10th session was -1.2 (-3.0, -0.6) scores. One week after completing ten sessions of acupuncture, the median change of MASI score was -5.4 (-9.9, -3.0) scores.

Due to the non-normal distribution of the MASI scores, the Wilcoxon rank sum test was used to compare the change of MASI score between the two groups (p-value=0.08).

Table 3: Median Melasma Area and Severity Index (MASI) Changes from Baseline

MASI	Group A (n=67) Median (IQR)	p-value	Group B (n=39) Median (IQR)	p-value
Baseline	5.2 (2.4, 9.0)	Reference	8.1 (4.8, 14.4)	Reference
After the 5 th session	1.5 (1.2, 3.0)	< 0.001	4.8 (1.8, 8.0)	< 0.001
One week after 5 th session	1.2 (0.6, 2.1)	< 0.001		
After the 10 th session			1.8 (1.2, 4.6)	< 0.001
One week after 10 th session			1.4 (1.1, 4.4)	< 0.001

*p-value from Wilcoxon signed-rank test

Patient-Reported Melasma-Improvement

The frequency distribution of patient-reported improvement scores at each time point is shown in Table 4. After full treatment in both groups, 95.5% of Group A and 97.4% of Group B felt markedly improved or cured.

Table 4 Patient-Reported Improvement Scores

<i>Satisfactory score</i>	<i>Group A (n=67)</i>		<i>Group B (n=39)</i>	
	<i>n</i>	<i>%</i>	<i>n</i>	<i>%</i>
<i>After the 5th session</i>				
<i>Worsening</i>	-	-	-	-
<i>No improvement</i>	-	-	-	-
<i>Slight improvement</i>	-	-	2	5.7
<i>Moderate improvement</i>	3	4.5	4	11.4
<i>Marked improvement</i>	23	34.3	9	25.7
<i>Almost or Completely Cured</i>	41	61.2	20	57.1
<i>After the 10th session</i>				
<i>Worsening</i>			-	-
<i>No improvement</i>			-	-
<i>Slight improvement</i>			-	-
<i>Moderate improvement</i>			1	2.6
<i>Marked improvement</i>			7	18.0
<i>Almost or Completely Cured</i>			31	79.5

Related Adverse Events from Acupuncture

There were no major adverse events. Of 106 participants, 29 (27.4%) participants reported minor side effects (Table 5), 14 (20.9%) participants were from group A and 15 (38.5%) participants were from group B. Five patients reported two symptoms: two had hematoma and pain, two had pain and dizziness, and the last had headache and sweating. The other 24 participants had one discomfort symptom. Group B had risk ratio (RR) of having adverse event 1.8 times (95% CI 1.0-3.4, p-value = 0.05) compared to group A. All participants were willing to continue the treatment despite the adverse events.

Table 5 Adverse Events from Acupuncture reported by 29 out of 106 Participants

	<i>Group A (n = 67)</i>		<i>Group B (n = 39)</i>	
	<i>Events</i>	<i>%</i>	<i>Events</i>	<i>%</i>
<i>Pain</i>	7	10.4	8	20.5

<i>Small hematoma</i>	7	10.4	3	7.7
<i>Dizziness</i>	1	1.5	2	5.1
<i>Headache</i>	1	1.5	1	2.6
<i>Sweat</i>	1	1.5	1	2.6
<i>Fatigue</i>	-	-	1	2.6
<i>Hot flush at right arm area</i>	1	1.5	-	-

Discussion

Acupuncture has shown clinical benefit for melasma through MI, MASI and patient-reported improvement. Both groups' MI and MASI scores showed significant improvement after five sessions of acupuncture treatment. More than 95% of all participants subjectively reported marked improvement, which corroborates other previous studies' high effective rate of acupuncture treatment for melasma [8, 9]. Comparing the first five sessions to the last five sessions in Group B and comparing the results between Groups A and B suggests a potential dose-response relationship of acupuncture therapy for melasma, although without statistically significant difference.

This type of 'dosage' study is not common in the field of complementary and alternative medicine, but has many positive clinical and financial implications. White A et al [17] mentioned adequate dosage for acupuncture, and some meta-analysis studies proposed the adequacy criteria of at least six acupuncture sessions for low back pain [18] and chronic knee pain [19]. Sangtin et al applied a survival analysis technique in their retrospective observational data and found that 50% of stroke patients had significant improvement after eight sessions of acupuncture and reached peak improvement by sixteen sessions [20]. We found that for melasma, significantly beneficial effects were observed after five sessions, although peak improvement was not likely achieved within ten sessions.

In our hospital, a tertiary hospital in a big city (Bangkok, Thailand), coming to the hospital multiple times per week for a long period of time is not practical both for the patients

and hospital staffs. Thus, given our setting, our protocol of 5-10 sessions is more practical than other studies' protocol of more than 20 sessions [14].

We realized that from Chinese medicine theory, one of the important basic theories is syndrome differentiation and treatment according to each syndrome. However, we found that our fixed regimen of acupoints also yielded effective result for the majority of patients, also making the treatment easier to train and perform. The treatment was likely effective because our selected acupoint included encircling melasma area, resulting in a local increase of blood flow [13]. Acupoints in the rest of the body acupoint—Fengchi (GB20), Hegu (LI4), Xuehai (SP10), Jusanli (ST36), Sanyinjiao (SP6) and Taichong (LR3)—have already been established to improve commonly seen syndromes of melasma patients: liver-qi stagnation, spleen-deficiency and kidney-yin/yang-deficiency [12, 21].

In our study, the minor yet frequent adverse events of acupuncture were pain and hematoma in the facial area. Therefore, when conducting acupuncture on the facial area, clinicians should apply pressure after taking off the needles for longer period of time. Higher sessions of treatment seemed to have higher rate of adverse events which was seen from the RR of having adverse events in group B compared to group A (RR = 1.8).

The design of this study limited the scope of our conclusions. Collecting data in a pragmatic manner necessitated that the study be observational. Therefore, we had an unequal baseline by nature. However, from the regression result, we found that the duration of melasma, prior acupuncture experience and family history of melasma had no effect on the clinical outcome of the treatment. We also had a low number of treatment sessions with a relatively short follow up time. Further research should be conducted to determine the number of acupuncture

treatment sessions in order to reach peak improvement for melasma, as well as see how long the effects last.

Conclusions

Acupuncture has a potential dose-response effect on clinical and patient-reported melasma outcomes with minor side effects.

Acknowledgement

This study was funded by the Ratchadapiseksompotch Fund, Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn University, grant number RA 060/60 and RA-MF-12/62. The authors would like to thank Dr. Thanapoom Rattananupong, Assoc. Prof. Somrat Lertmaharit and Dr.Yuda Chongpison for statistical analysis advice.

References

1. Kauh YC, Zachian TF. Melasma. *Advances in experimental medicine and biology*. 1999;455:491-9. Epub 1999/12/22. PubMed PMID: 10599387.
2. Miot LD, Miot HA, Silva MG, Marques ME. [Physiopathology of melasma]. *Anais brasileiros de dermatologia*. 2009;84(6):623-35. Epub 2010/03/02. PubMed PMID: 20191174.
3. Deshpande SS, Khatu SS, Pardeshi GS, Gokhale NR. Cross-sectional study of psychiatric morbidity in patients with melasma. *Indian journal of psychiatry*. 2018;60(3):324-8. Epub 2018/11/09. doi: 10.4103/psychiatry.IndianJPsychiatry_115_16. PubMed PMID: 30405259; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC6201670.
4. Handel AC, Miot LD, Miot HA. Melasma: a clinical and epidemiological review. *Anais brasileiros de dermatologia*. 2014;89(5):771-82. Epub 2014/09/04. PubMed PMID: 25184917; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC4155956.

5. Perper M, Eber AE, Fayne R, Verne SH, Magno RJ, Cervantes J, et al. Tranexamic Acid in the Treatment of Melasma: A Review of the Literature. *American journal of clinical dermatology*. 2017;18(3):373-81. Epub 2017/03/12. doi: 10.1007/s40257-017-0263-3. PubMed PMID: 28283893.
6. Jutley GS, Rajaratnam R, Halpern J, Salim A, Emmett C. Systematic review of randomized controlled trials on interventions for melasma: an abridged Cochrane review. *Journal of the American Academy of Dermatology*. 2014;70(2):369-73. Epub 2014/01/21. doi: 10.1016/j.jaad.2013.07.044. PubMed PMID: 24438951.
7. Kong SH, Suh HS, Choi YS. Treatment of Melasma with Pulsed-Dye Laser and 1,064-nm Q-Switched Nd:YAG Laser: A Split-Face Study. *Annals of dermatology*. 2018;30(1):1-7. Epub 2018/02/02. doi: 10.5021/ad.2018.30.1.1. PubMed PMID: 29386825; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC5762458.
8. Rerksuppaphol L, Charoenpong T, Rerksuppaphol S. Randomized clinical trial of facial acupuncture with or without body acupuncture for treatment of melasma. *Complementary therapies in clinical practice*. 2016;22:1-7. Epub 2016/02/07. doi: 10.1016/j.ctcp.2015.10.004. PubMed PMID: 26850796.
9. Wu X, Xiang Y. The Effects of Acupuncture Combined with Auricular Acupressure in the Treatment of Chloasma. *Evidence-based complementary and alternative medicine : eCAM*. 2018;2018:6438458. Epub 2018/06/01. doi: 10.1155/2018/6438458. PubMed PMID: 29849716; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC5937619.
10. Xun J. Clinical observation in 30 cases of chloasma treated by auricular point pressing and pricking. *Journal of traditional Chinese medicine = Chung i tsa chih ying wen pan*. 2003;23(3):207. Epub 2003/10/11. PubMed PMID: 14535192.

11. Chen W. Fifty cases of chloasma treated by acupuncture plus intensive pulse light irradiation. *Journal of traditional Chinese medicine = Chung i tsa chih ying wen pan.* 2007;27(4):265-7. Epub 2008/02/06. PubMed PMID: 18246682.
12. Feng XJ, Fu JY, Liu F. Clinical observation on the combined use of acupuncture and herbal medicine for treatment of chloasma. *Journal of traditional Chinese medicine = Chung i tsa chih ying wen pan.* 2010;30(1):15-7. Epub 2010/04/20. doi: 10.1016/s0254-6272(10)60004-0. PubMed PMID: 20397455.
13. Kim K-W, Hong S, Kim HS, Kim T, Ahn J, Song H-S, et al. Physiological impact of nanoporous acupuncture needles: Laser Doppler perfusion imaging in healthy volunteers. *PLOS ONE.* 2019;14(12):e0226304. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0226304.
14. Chai Q, Fei Y, Cao H, Wang C, Tian J, Liu J. Acupuncture for melasma in women: a systematic review of randomised controlled trials. *Acupuncture in medicine : journal of the British Medical Acupuncture Society.* 2015;33(4):254-61. Epub 2015/04/23. doi: 10.1136/acupmed-2014-010633. PubMed PMID: 25900923.
15. Wang Q. *Zhen Jiu Zhi Liao Xue* (Book in Chinese). 10th ed. Beijing: Zhong Guo Zhong Yi Yao Chu Ban She, 2009.
16. Kimbrough-Green CK, Griffiths CE, Finkel LJ, Hamilton TA, Bulengo-Ransby SM, Ellis CN, et al. Topical retinoic acid (tretinoin) for melasma in black patients. A vehicle-controlled clinical trial. *Archives of dermatology.* 1994;130(6):727-33. Epub 1994/06/01. PubMed PMID: 8002642.
17. White A, Cummings M, Barlas P, Cardini F, Filshie J, Foster NE, et al. Defining an adequate dose of acupuncture using a neurophysiological approach – a narrative review of the literature. *Acupuncture in Medicine.* 2008;26(2):111. doi: 10.1136/aim.26.2.111.

18. Manheimer E, White A, Berman B, Forys K, Ernst E. Meta-analysis: acupuncture for low back pain. *Annals of internal medicine*. 2005;142(8):651-63. Epub 2005/04/20. PubMed PMID: 15838072.
19. White A, Foster NE, Cummings M, Barlas P. Acupuncture treatment for chronic knee pain: a systematic review. *Rheumatology (Oxford, England)*. 2007;46(3):384-90. Epub 2007/01/12. doi: 10.1093/rheumatology/kel413. PubMed PMID: 17215263.
20. Sangtin S, Supasiri T, Tangsathitporn R, Pongpirul K. Application of survival analysis techniques to determine the optimal number of acupuncture therapy sessions for stroke patients. *Acupuncture in medicine : journal of the British Medical Acupuncture Society*. 2020;38(3):194-200. Epub 2020/01/22. doi: 10.1177/0964528419883268. PubMed PMID: 31958974.
21. Hu JS. Acupuncture treatment of chloasma. *Journal of traditional Chinese medicine = Chung i tsa chih ying wen pan*. 2008;28(4):305-7. Epub 2009/02/21. doi: 10.1016/s0254-6272(09)60017-0. PubMed PMID: 19226905.