Outdoor air pollution and the risk of asthma exacerbations in single

lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns: A systematic review and

meta-analysis

Authors

Junjun Huang¹, Xiaoyu Yang¹, Fangfang Fan², Yan Hu¹, Xi Wang¹, Sainan Zhu³, Guanhua Ren⁴ and Guangfa Wang¹

¹Department of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine, Peking University First Hospital, Beijing 100034, China.

²Department of Cardiology, Peking University First Hospital, Beijing 100034, China.
³Department of Biostatistics, Peking University First Hospital, Beijing 100034, China.

⁴Department of Library, Peking University First Hospital, Beijing 100034, China.

Correspondence should be addressed to Yan Hu, huhu80226@163.com

Word Count

3635 words.

ABSTRACT

Background: Asthma exacerbations accelerate the disease progression, as well as increases the incidence of hospitalizations and deaths. There have been studies on the effects of outdoor air pollution and asthma exacerbations; however, evidence regarding single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns is inconclusive.

Objective To synthesize evidence regarding the relationship between outdoor air pollution and the asthma exacerbation risk in single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns. **Methods** We performed a systematic literature search using PubMed, Embase, Cochrane Library, Web of Science, ClinicalTrials, China National Knowledge Internet, Chinese BioMedical, and Wanfang databases until August 1st, 2020. Additionally, we reviewed the reference lists of the relevant articles. Two authors independently evaluated the eligible articles and performed structured extraction of relevant information. Pooled relative risks (RRs) and 95% confidence intervals (CIs) of lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns were estimated using the random-effect models.

Results: Eighty-four studies met the eligibility criteria and provided sufficient information for meta-analysis. Outdoor air pollutants were associated with significantly increased risks of asthma exacerbations in both single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns [lag0: RR (95%CI) (pollutants), 1.057(1.011, 1.103) (air quality

index; AQI), 1.007(1.005, 1.010) (PM_{2.5}), 1.009(1.005, 1.012) (PM₁₀), 1.010(1.006, 1.014) (NO₂), 1.030(1.011, 1.048) (CO), 1.005(1.002, 1.009) (O₃); lag1: RR (95%CI) (pollutants), 1.064(1.022, 1.106) (AQI), 1.005(1.002, 1.008) (PM_{2.5}), 1.007(1.004, 1.011) (PM₁₀), 1.008(1.004, 1.012) (NO₂), 1.025(1.007, 1.042) (CO), 1.010(1.006, 1.013) (O₃)], except SO₂ [lag0: RR (95%CI), 1.004(1.000, 1.007); lag1: RR (95%CI), 1.003(0.999, 1.006)]. Subgroup analyses revealed stronger effects in children and asthma exacerbations associated with other events (including symptoms, lung function changes, and medication use as required).

Conclusion These findings demonstrate that outdoor air pollution significantly increases the asthma exacerbation risk in single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns.

PROSPERO registration number: CRD42020204097

(https://www.crd.york.ac.uk/PROSPERO).

Keywords: Asthma exacerbations, Outdoor air pollution, Air quality index (AQI)

Strengths and limitations of this study

- We performed a systematic literature search of six databases (with no specified start date or language limitation).
- Secondary references were included.
- Publication bias was assessed by applying Begg's and Egger's tests.
- This study focused on the association between outdoor air pollution and the asthma exacerbation risk in single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns.
- There were few available studies regarding the AQI, other events, and death analyses.

INTRODUCTION

Asthma is a common chronic airway inflammatory disease that affects > 300 million people worldwide.[1] The global prevalence of clinical/treated asthma in adults is 4.5%; moreover, it varies among 70 countries by as much as 21-fold.[2] Epidemiologic studies have revealed an increasing asthma prevalence; moreover, asthma contributes to functional loss, increased healthcare costs, and severe medical complications.[3] Asthma exacerbations accelerate disease progression, as well as increase the incidence of hospitalizations and deaths.[4]

Outdoor air pollution has been made more and more attention to the serious consequences. Evidence has demonstrated that air pollution could cause critical public health problems. A retrospective study of 80, 515 deaths in Beijing during 2004-2008 has found that a reduction in life expectancy was associated with increased air pollution.[5] Several studies have shown that air pollution exposure increases the risk of asthma exacerbations.[6, 7, 8] However, the air pollution

components are complex, including particulate matter diameter $\leq 2.5 \,\mu m \,(PM_{2.5})$,

particulate matter diameter $\leq 10 \,\mu m$ (PM₁₀), sulfur dioxide (SO₂), carbon monoxide

(CO), nitrogen dioxide (NO₂), ozone (O₃), etc. Martinez-Rivera et al. [6] reported that a positive association of the levels of NO₂, but not SO₂ and CO, with the number of accident and emergency room (ER) visits and hospitalizations for asthma exacerbations. However, another study reported a positive association of SO₂, but not NO₂, levels with pediatric asthma exacerbations. [7] Additionally, Ostro et al.[8] reported that new coughing episodes were associated with exposure to PM_{10} , $PM_{2.5}$, and NO₂, but not O₃. There have been inconsistent findings by studies on different pollutants.

A meta-analysis confirmed an association of the aforementioned six air pollutants with significantly increased risks of asthma emergency room visits and hospitalizations.[9] However, there are numerous pollutant types to be monitored; moreover, each pollutant has different effects on asthma exacerbations. Therefore, there is a need for a comprehensive pollution index that can represent the various pollutant effect and facilitate estimation of the air pollution level by the general public. The air quality index (AQI) is a useful comprehensive index that was adopted by the US Environmental Pollution Administration for daily air quality reporting to the general public in 1999.[10] The AQI includes sub-indices for $PM_{2.5}$, PM_{10} , SO_2 , NO₂, CO, and O₃.[11] Pan et al.[12] reported an association of AQI with an increased risk of hospitalizations for childhood asthma. Contrastingly, Letz et al.[13] reported no significant correlation of the AQI with the occurrence of ER visits for asthma in the basic military trainee population. There have been inconsistent findings regarding AQI and the asthma exacerbation risk. Additionally, multiple lag estimates, including single and cumulative lags, were selected in the overall analyses of the aforementioned meta-analysis. Lag exposure sensitivity analyses have employed different single lag patterns for different pollutants.[9] However, there is a need to understand whether pollutants contribute to asthma exacerbations on the same day or have lag effects. Moreover, other asthma exacerbation outcomes (e. g., symptoms) should be considered.

This systematic review and meta-analysis of time-series and case-crossover studies aimed to summarize existing evidence regarding the relationships of various pollutants (AQI, PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀, SO₂, NO₂, CO, and O₃) with the asthma exacerbation risk (exacerbation-associated outpatient visits; ER visits; hospitalizations; deaths, and other events, including symptoms, lung function changes, and medication use as needed) in single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns.

METHODS

We follow the standardized program: Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses guidelines.[14] There is no review protocol.

Eligibility criteria and search strategy

The inclusion criteria were as follows: (1) a time-series or case-crossover study with original data; (2) asthma exacerbations associated with outpatient visits, ER visits, hospitalizations, deaths, or other events (symptoms, lung function changes, and

medication use as needed) as outcomes; (3) inclusion of a study population of children, adults, or both; (4) using AQI, $PM_{2.5}$, PM_{10} , SO_2 , NO_2 , CO, or O_3 as measurements for outdoor air pollution; and (5) reporting on the relationship between outdoor air pollution and asthma exacerbations.

The exclusion criteria were: (1) no single-pollutant model; (2) no data regarding single lag0 or lag1 exposure patterns; (3) having data that could not be recalculated into study-specific relative risks (RRs) and 95% confidence intervals (CIs) to a

100-unit increase in AQI, a 1 mg/m³ increase in CO, and a 10μ g/m³ in the other

pollutants (PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀, SO₂, NO₂, and O₃) by assuming a linear relationship of all pollutants.

We conducted a systematic literature search of PubMed, Embase, Cochrane Library, Web of Science, ClinicalTrials, China National Knowledge Internet, Chinese BioMedica, and Wanfang databases until August 1st, 2020 (no start date specified and no language limitation). We used a combination of keywords associated with the exposure types (e.g., "AQI") and asthma exacerbation outcomes (e.g., "symptom increase") (see supplementary Table S1 Search strategies for more details).

We excluded irrelevant articles by applying title screening. Articles meeting the inclusion criteria were included in the abstract reading. Moreover, we included the references of the articles that met the inclusion criteria. Among them, articles that did not meet the exclusion criteria were included in this systematic review and meta-analysis through full-text reading.

Quality assessment and data extraction

Quality assessment was conducted based on Mustafic's study with a maximum score of 5.[15] One point was assigned if asthma exacerbations were coded by the International Classification of Diseases, American Thoracic Society, National Asthma Education or Prevention Program, or International Classification of Primary Care 2. One point was assigned if pollutant measurements were performed daily with < 25% missing data. One point was assigned if long-term trends, seasonality, and temperature were all adjusted. One point was assigned if the humidity or day-of-week was adjusted. One point was assigned if influenza epidemics or holidays were adjusted.

Data extraction was performed using a standardized form, including the main characteristics (author, publication year, location, subgroup, study population, sample size, period, lag pattern, and quality score), outcome measures (asthma exacerbations related to outpatient visits; ER visits; hospitalizations; deaths; and other events, including symptoms, lung function changes, and medication use as needed), exposure measures (AQI, PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀, SO₂, NO₂, CO, and O₃), and the study-specific RRs (95%CIs) of the single lag0 or lag1 exposure pattern. Eligible studies were examined and their relevant characteristics were independently recorded by two authors (XW and JH) in this standardized form. Any disagreements were resolved by consensus after discussion with an additional author (YH). When

> the same population was used in several publications, we only included the largest and most complete study.

Statistical analysis and data synthesis

Standardized effect estimates were expressed as RRs and 95% CIs. The study-specific RRs were derived from single-pollutant models reporting RRs or percentage changes. We recalculated the study-specific RRs to a 100-unit, 1 mg/m^3 ,

10µg/m³ increase in AQI, CO, and other pollutants (PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀, SO₂, NO₂, and O₃),

respectively, by assuming a linear relationship of all pollutants. We calculated the summary RRs of the single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns. Heterogeneity was evaluated using the Q and I²-statistics through the random-effect model. An I² statistic > 50%, 25%-50%, and < 25% indicates high, moderate, low heterogeneity, respectively.[16] Publication bias was assessed using Begg's and Egger's tests.[17, 18] To explore the heterogeneity in our pooled analysis, we applied sensitivity analyses based on studies with a quality of 4–5 scores. Various outcome analyses were conducted to combine the effects for evaluating differences in outpatient visits, ER visits, hospitalizations, deaths, and other events. Moreover, age-based subgroup analyses were conducted to evaluate differences between children (0–14 years) and adults (> 14 years). Statistical analyses were conducted using Stata/MP 14.0 (Stata, College Station, TX, USA). All tests were two-sided; moreover, statistical significance was defined as P < 0.05.

Patient and public involvement

Given the nature of systematic review and meta-analysis, this study lacked patient or public involvement.

RESULTS

Study selection and eligible study characteristics

We initially identified 1169 articles. After reading the title, abstract, and full text, we included 84 articles. Figure 1 presents the approach to study selection.

Supplementary Table S2 presents the quality scores and main characteristics of the eligible studies.[12, 19-101] The outcomes were asthma exacerbations related to outpatient visits (9 studies), ER visits (44 studies), hospitalizations (29 studies), deaths (2 studies), and other events (7 studies). Additionally, one study did not specify separate data regarding ER visits and hospitalizations[96]; consequently, it was classified as ER visits or hospitalization outcomes. Regarding the single lag exposure pattern, 68 and 63 studies reported on lag0 and lag1, respectively. Regarding the age subgroups, 34 and 21 studies investigated children and adults, respectively.

Overall and quality sensitivity analyses

In overall analyses, air pollutants were associated with significantly increased risks

of asthma exacerbations in both of the single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns [lag0: RR (95% CI) (pollutants), 1.057(1.011, 1.103) (AQI), 1.007(1.005, 1.010) (PM_{2.5}), 1.009(1.005, 1.012) (PM₁₀), 1.010(1.006, 1.014) (NO₂), 1.030(1.011, 1.048) (CO), 1.005(1.002, 1.009) (O₃); lag1: RR (95% CI) (pollutants), 1.064(1.022, 1.106) (AQI), 1.005(1.002, 1.008) (PM_{2.5}), 1.007(1.004, 1.011) (PM₁₀), 1.008(1.004, 1.012) (NO₂), 1.025(1.007, 1.042) (CO), 1.010(1.006, 1.013) (O₃)], except for SO₂ [lag0: RR (95%CI), 1.004(1.000, 1.007); lag1: RR (95%CI), 1.003(0.999, 1.006)] (Table 1). The study-specific RRs presented high heterogeneity for all pollutants except for CO in the single lag1 exposure pattern. Table 1 shows the p values of Begg's and Egger's tests. There was no publication bias for AQI, PM_{2.5}, NO₂, and CO in the lag0 pattern, as well as AQI, PM_{2.5}, SO₂, and NO₂ in the lag1 pattern. Supplementary Figure S1 shows the forest plot for the association between air pollutants and asthma exacerbations while Supplementary Figure S2 shows Begg's funnel plot.

 Table 1. Relationships between air pollutants and asthma exacerbations in overall and quality sensitivity analyses

		-	-				
Characteristics			Air p	ollutants (increr	nental unit)		
	AQI	$PM_{2.5}(10\mu$	PM ₁₀ (10µ	$SO_2 \left(10 \mu \right)$	$NO_2 (10\mu$	со	$O_3 (10 \mu g/m^3)$
	(100units)	g/m ³)	g/m ³)	g/m ³)	g/m ³)	(1mg/m ³)	
Overall							
analyses with							
lag0 exposure ^a							
Number of	4	27	27	31	28	14	33
the studies							
RR (95%CI)	1.057(1.011,	1.007(1.005,	1.009(1.005,	1.004(1.000,	1.010(1.006,	1.030(1.011,	1.005(1.002,
	1.103)	1.010)	1.012)	1.007)	1.014)	1.048)	1.009)
I ² , %	95.8	80.0	85.1	58.6	68.3	64.3	86.1
Begg's test,	0.308	0.687	0.664	0.026	0.631	0.322	0.015
p value							
Egger's test,	0.331	0.061	0.021	0.007	0.519	0.114	0.042
p value							
Quality							
sensitivity							
analyses with							
lag0 exposure ^a							
Number of	3	16	18	19	19	9	23
the studies							
RR (95% CI)	1.018(0.998,	1.007(1.004,	1.006(1.003,	1.006(0.998,	1.009(1.006,	1.017(1.002,	1.006(1.002,1.010)
	1.038)	1.010)	1.009)	1.013)	1.013)	1.031)	
I ² , %	78.5	87.7	65.7	72.3	51.8	46.8	90.4
Begg's test,	1.000	0.940	0.889	0.085	0.496	0.917	0.047
p value							
Egger's test,	0.837	0.156	0.247	0.072	0.595	0.867	0.066

p value							
Overall							
analyses with							
lag1 exposure ^b							
Number of	4	24	27	31	27	17	35
the studies							
RR (95%CI)	1.064(1.022,	1.005(1.002,	1.007(1.004,	1.003(0.999,	1.008(1.004,	1.025(1.007,	1.010(1.006,
	1.106)	1.008)	1.011)	1.006)	1.012)	1.042)	1.013)
I ² , %	96.1	85.6	83.5	56.9	68.2	41.7	86.5
Begg's test,	0.308	0.835	0.253	0.478	0.168	0.124	0.059
p value							
Egger's test,	0.252	0.883	0.002	0.088	0.068	0.006	0.008
p value							
Quality							
sensitivity							
analyses with							
lag1 exposure ^b							
Number of	3	18	19	24	20	13	25
the studies							
RR (95%CI)	1.022(1.000,	1.005(1.003,	1.006(1.003,	1.002(0.998,	1.009(1.005,	1.011(1.002,	1.009(1.005,
	1.043)	1.008)	1.009)	1.006)	1.013)	1.020)	1.013)
I ² , %	86.5	85.4	70.3	58.0	62.4	2.0	87.5
Begg's test,	1.000	0.928	0.778	0.333	0.441	0.202	0.116
p value							
Egger's test,	0.674	0.989	0.042	0.145	0.052	0.055	0.036
n value							

Abbreviations: $PM_{2.5}$, particulate matter diameter $\leq 2.5 \ \mu m$; PM_{10} , particulate matter diameter $\leq 2.5 \ \mu m$; RR, relative risk.

^a lag0 exposure, single lag0 exposure.

^b lag1 exposure, single lag1 exposure.

Moreover, quality sensitivity analyses revealed a significant positive association of $PM_{2.5}$, PM_{10} , NO_2 , CO, and O_3 with asthma exacerbations risks in both single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns (Table 1). The study-specific RRs showed high heterogeneity for all pollutants except for CO. Publication bias was detected with Begg's test for O_3 in the lag0 pattern and Egger's tests for PM_{10} and O_3 in the lag1 pattern (Table 1). Supplementary Figure S3 shows the forest plot for relationships between air pollutants and asthma exacerbations while supplementary Figure S4 shows Begg's funnel plot.

Various outcome and age subgroup analyses

Various outcome analyses revealed more pronounced relationships for other event outcomes [lag0: RR (95% CI) (pollutants), 1.201(1.155, 1.247) (AQI), 1.047(1.024, 1.069) (PM_{2.5}), 1.119(1.018, 1.220) (PM₁₀), 1.033(1.000, 1.066) (NO₂), 1.124(1.051, 1.197) (CO); lag1: RR (95% CI) (pollutants), 1.204(1.158, 1.251) (AQI),

1.080(1.010, 1.150) (PM_{2.5}), 1.122(1.015, 1.230) (PM₁₀), 1.046(1.013, 1.079) (NO₂), 1.155(1.037, 1.274) (CO)], except for SO₂ and O₃. Supplementary Table S3 presents details regarding the relationship between air pollutants and asthma exacerbations in various outcomes analyses. Supplementary Figure S1 shows the forest plot.

Age-based subgroup analyses revealed stronger relations in children than in adults, except for NO_2 in the lag1 pattern and O_3 in both patterns. There was no tendency toward a stronger relation for AQI given the AQI adult subgroup lacked eligible studies. Supplementary Table S3 presents the details regarding the relationship between air pollutants and asthma exacerbations in various outcomes and age subgroup analyses. Figure 2 and 3 shows the forest plot.

DISCUSSION

Summary of evidence

Our study provides novel evidence that air pollution exposure significantly increases the asthma exacerbation risk; specifically, AQI, $PM_{2.5}$, PM_{10} , NO₂, CO, and O₃ contribute to asthma exacerbations with single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns. This suggests that these pollutants cause asthma exacerbations on the day of air pollution onset. Moreover, the AQI may be a good index representing the asthma exacerbation risk during air pollution. Mechanisms underlying the association of air pollution with asthma exacerbations include stimulation of airway epithelium and inflammatory cells, oxidative stress responses, respiratory cells, respiratory reflex responses, and epigenetic modifications.[102] Exposure to PM modulates the airway epithelium and promotes the production of several cytokines, including IL-1, IL-6, IL-8, IL-25,

IL-33, TNF- α , and GM-CSF.[103] In a mouse model, there was an ozone-induced

increase in bronchoalveolar lavage (BAL) levels of IL-23, which is an important cytokine for IL-17A+ cell recruitment and activation, at 24 h after ozone exposure (2

ppm for 3 h).[104] Willart et al.[105] reported an increase in lung IL-1 α levels in

naïve mice at 2 h and 24 h after exposure. Another study reported an increase in IL-1

 α levels within the first 24 h after ozone exposure (1 ppm for 1 h).[106] A study

assessed sensitized mice before (0 h) and 1, 6, 12, 24, and 72 h after exposure and reported that the 12- and 24-h group had the highest cytokine levels and cell counts in BAL fluid.[107] Diesel exhaust particles were found to induce an increase in IL-17A levels in primary bronchial epithelial cells of patients with asthma at 2 post-exposure hours.[108] Moreover, Zhang et al.[109] reported that diesel exhaust particles induced increased *TET1* expression in human bronchial epithelial cells at 1 post-exposure hour. Therefore, in case air pollution exposure cannot be avoided, patients with asthma should employ adequate strategies (including asthma medications) to reduce damage on the same day.

In lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns, we found that the RRs of air pollution and asthma exacerbations related to other events (including symptoms, lung function

> changes, and medication use as needed) were much higher than those of outpatient visits, ER visits, hospitalizations, and deaths. There has been no study on the relationship between outdoor air pollution and other events, as well as outpatient visits, ER visits, hospitalizations, or deaths within the same population. However, a prospective case-control study on children reported an association of AQI, $PM_{2.5}$, NO_2 , and O_3 with increased expression of multiple inflammatory airway epithelial responses, as well as a decline in FEV_1 % predicted in the lead up to clinical asthma exacerbations on the exacerbation-onset day without a viral trigger.[110] Pan et al.[12] reported a positive correlation between AQI and childhood asthma hospitalizations that appeared and peaked on lag3 and lag9 days, respectively. Additionally, there are positive correlations of asthma deaths with $PM_{2.5}[32]$ on lag3 day or SO₂ and NO₂⁷⁹ on lag2 day. This could be attributed to changes in symptoms and lung function being the initial manifestations of airway inflammation caused by air pollution. Subsequently, patients use relief medications for these changes and if they do not improve, they seek medical help and are recorded as outpatient visits, ER visits, or hospitalizations. Therefore, when patients with asthma present with symptoms or lung function changes during air pollution, they should receive active treatment to block asthma exacerbation progression.

> It has been confirmed that children with asthma were more susceptible to outdoor air pollution. This could be attributed to immature lung growth and host-defense capacity in children.[9] Since children spend more time outdoors than adults, they inhale more air pollutants per pound of body weight.[111] Additionally, children may have low symptom tolerance and parents may be more active in taking their children to hospitals.

Validity of results

This study has several strengths, including identification of potential articles based on a systematic literature search of six databases (no start date specified and no language limitation) and inclusion of secondary references. Furthermore, two authors examined the eligible studies based on the inclusion and exclusion criteria followed by independent data extraction using a priori set method in the standardized form. Finally, any disagreements were discussed together with a third author.

Limitations

This study has several limitations. First, there were few available studies for the AQI, other events, and death analyses. Therefore, findings regarding the AQI, deaths, and other events analyses should be cautiously interpreted. Second, there was a high heterogeneity degree in most analyses. This might be associated with varying study outcomes and design qualities. Nonetheless, we reduced the heterogeneity degrees in quality sensitivity and various outcome analyses.

CONCLUSIONS

This systematic review and meta-analysis provides new evidence indicating that air

pollution exposure significantly increases the asthma exacerbation risk. Specifically, AQI, $PM_{2.5}$, PM_{10} , NO_2 , CO, and O_3 contribute to asthma exacerbations with single lag0 and lag1 exposure patterns. In case air pollution exposure cannot be avoided, patients with asthma should employ adequate strategies (including asthma medications) to reduce same-day damage.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors thank Dr. Pengkang He from Peking University First Hospital for his help.

CONTRIBUTORS

JH and XY are joint first authors. JH obtained funding. YH and GW are joint corresponding authors. JH, YH, and GW conceived and designed the study. JH and XY performed a systematic literature search under the supervision of GR and YH. JH, YH, and XW reviewed the articles and performed data extraction. JH and FF analyzed the data under the supervision of SZ, YH, and GW. JH, YH, XY, and FF wrote the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript and were responsible for their contributions.

FUNDING

This work was supported by grant 2018CR02 from the Youth Clinical Research Project of Peking University First Hospital. The funding bodies did not participate in study design or data collection and analysis. Additionally, the funding bodies do not participate in writing the manuscript and decision to publish.

COMPETING INTERESTS

The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest regarding the publication of this paper.

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

Data are available on reasonable request.

REFERENCES

- 1. Global Initiative for Asthma. From the Global Strategy for Asthma Management and Prevention (GINA) 2020 update [OL] [accessed May 2020]. http://ginasthma.org.
- 2. To T, Stanojevic S, Moores G, et al. Global asthma prevalence in adults: findings from the cross-sectional world health survey. *BMC Public Health* 2012;12: 204. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-12-204.
- 3. Ledford R. Adult asthma. Allergy & Asthma 2019; 289–304.
- 4. Rennard SI, Farmer SG. Exacerbations and progression of disease in asthma and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Proc Am Thorac Soc* 2004;1:88–92.
- Guo Y, Li S, Tian Z, et al. The burden of air pollution on years of life lost in Beijing, China, 2004-08: retrospective regression analysis of daily deaths. *BMJ* 2013;347.
- 6. Martinez-Rivera C, Garcia-Olive I, Stojanovic Z, et al. Association between air pollution and asthma exacerbations in Badalona, Barcelona (Spain), 2008-2016. *Med Clin (Barc)* 2019;152:333–8.
- Chew FT, Goh DY, Ooi BC, et al. Association of ambient air-pollution levels with acute asthma exacerbation among children in Singapore. *Allergy* 1999;54:320–9.
- 8. Ostro B, Lipsett M, Mann J, et al. Air pollution and exacerbation of asthma in African-American children in Los Angeles. *Epidemiology* 2001;12:200–8.
- 9. Zhang XY, Ding H, Jiang LN, et al. Association between air pollutants and asthma emergency room visits and hospital admissions in time series studies: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Plos One* 2015;10:e0138146.
- 10. USEPA. Emission Inventory Improvement Program: Getting Started: Emission Inventory Methods for PM 2.5 1999:72.
- Ministry of Environmental Protection of the People's Republic of China. Technical Regulation on Ambient Air Quality Index (on Trial): HJ 633-2012; China Environmental Science Press: Beijing, China, 2012.
- 12. Pan R, Wang X, Yi W, et al. Interactions between climate factors and air quality index for improved childhood asthma self-management. *Sci Total Environ* 2020;723: 137804.
- 13. Letz AG, Quinn JM. Relationship of basic military trainee emergency department visits for asthma and San Antonio air quality. *Allergy Asthma Proc* 2005;26:463–7.
- Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. *PLoS Med* 2009;6:e1000097.
- 15. Mustafic H, Jabre P, Caussin C, et al. Main air pollutants and myocardial infarction: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *JAMA* 2012;307:713–21.
- 16. Higgins JPT, Thompson SG, Deeks JJ, et al. Measuring inconsistency in meta-analyses. *BMJ* 2003;327:557–60.
- 17. Begg CB, Mazumdar M. Operating characteristics of a RANK correlation test for publication bias. *Biometrics* 1994;50:1088–101.
- 18. Egger M, Smith GD, Schneider M, et al. Bia in meta-analysis detected by a simple, graphical test. *BMJ* 1997;315:629–34.
- 19. Kim S, Kim Y, Lee M-R, et al. Winter season temperature drops and sulfur dioxide levels affect on exacerbation of refractory asthma in South Korea: A time-trend controlled case-crossover study using soonchunhyang asthma

cohort data. J Asthma 2012;49:679-87.

- 20. Halonen JI, Lanki T, Yli-Tuomi T, et al. Urban air pollution and asthma and COPD hospital emergency room visits. *Thorax* 2008;63:635–41.
- 21. Hajat S, Haines A, Goubet SA, et al. Association of air pollution with daily GP consultations for asthma and other lower respiratory conditions in London. *Thorax* 1999;54:597–605.
- 22. Galan I, Tobias A, Banegas JR, et al. Short-term effects of air pollution on daily asthma emergency room admissions. *Eur Respir J* 2003;22:802–8.
- 23. Stieb DM, Szyszkowicz M, Row BH, et al. Air pollution and emergency department visits for cardiac and respiratory conditions: a multi-city time-series analysis. *Environ Health* 2009;8:25–38.
- 24. Wilson AM, Wake CP, Kelly T, et al. Air pollution, weather, and respiratory emergency room visits in two northern New England cities: An ecological time-series study. *Environ Res* 2005;97:312–21.
- 25. Szyszkowicz M. Ambient air pollution and daily emergency department visits for asthma in Edmonton, Canada. *Int J Occup Med Environ Health* 2008,21:25–30.
- 26. Norris G, YoungPong SN, Koenig JQ, et al. An association between fine particles and asthma emergency department visits for children in Seattle. *Environ Health Perspec* 1999;107:489–93
- Tenias JM, Ballester F, Rivera ML. Association between hospital emergency visits for asthma and air pollution in Valencia, Spain. *Occup Environ Med* 1998;55:541–7
- 28. Lee SW, Yon DK, James CC, et al. Short-term effects of multiple outdoor environmental factors on risk of asthma exacerbations: Age-stratified time-series analysis. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2019;144:1542–50.
- 29. Mohr LB, Luo S, Mathias E, et al. Influence of season and temperature on the relationship of elemental carbon air pollution to pediatric asthma emergency room visits. *J. Asthma* 2008;45:936–43.
- Castellsague J, Sunyer J, Saez M, et al. Short-term association between air pollution and emergency room visits for asthma in Barcelona. *Thorax* 1995;50:1051–6.
- Jaffe DH, Singer ME, Rimm AA. Air pollution and emergency department visits for asthma among Ohio Medicaid recipients, 1991–1996. *Environ Res* 2003;91:21–8.
- 32. Liu Y, Pan J, Zhang H, et al. Short-term exposure to ambient air pollution and asthma mortality. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2019;200:24–32.
- 33. Cirera L, Garcia-Marcos L, Gimenez J, et al. Daily effects of air pollutants and pollen types on asthma and COPD hospital emergency visits in the industrial and Mediterranean Spanish city of Cartagena. *Allergol Immunopathol* 2012;40:231–7.
- 34. Babin S, Burkom H, Holtry R, et al. Medicaid patient asthma related acute care visits and their associations with ozone and particulates in Washington, DC, from 1994–2005. *Inter J Env Res Pub Heal* 2008;18:209–21
- 35. Cassino C, Ito K, Bader I, et al. Cigarette smoking and ozone-associated emergency department use for asthma by adults in New York City. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1999;159:1773–9.
- 36. Mar TF, Koenig JQ. Relationship between visits to emergency departments for asthma and ozone exposure in greater Seattle, Washington. Ann Allergy Asthma Immunol 2009;103:474–9.

- 37. Cadelis G, Tourres R, Molinie J. Short-term effects of the particulate pollutants contained in Saharan dust on the visits of children to the emergency department due to asthmatic conditions in Guadeloupe (French Archipelago of the Caribbean). *Plos One* 2014;9:e91136.
- 38. Mortimer KM, Neas LM, Dockery DW, et al. The effect of air pollution on inner-city children with asthma. *Eur Respir J* 2002;19:699–705.
- 39. Abe T, Tokuda Y, Ohde S, et al. The relationship of short-term air pollution and weather to ED visits for asthma in Japan. *Am J Emerg Med* 2009;27:153–9.
- 40. Chimonas MAR, Gessner BD. Airborne particulate matter from primarily geologic, non-industrial sources at levels below National Ambient Air Quality Standards is associated with outpatient visits for asthma and quick-relief medication prescriptions among children less than 20 years old enrolled in Medicaid in Anchorage, Alaska. *Environ Res* 2007;103:397–404.
- 41. Pothirat C, Tosukhowong A, Chaiwong W, et al. Effects of seasonal smog on asthma and COPD exacerbations requiring emergency visits in Chiang Mai, Thailand. *Asian Pac J Allergy Immunol* 2016;34:284–9.
- 42. Paulu C, Smith AE. Tracking associations between ambient ozone and asthma-related emergency department visits using case-crossover analysis. J Public Health Manag Pract 2008;14:581–91.
- 43. Jalaludin B, Khalaj B, Sheppeard V, et al. Air pollution and ED visits for asthma in Australian children: a case-crossover analysis. Int Arch Occup Environ Health 2008;81:967–74.
- 44. Rabinovitch N, Strand M, Gelfand EW. Particulate levels are associated with early asthma worsening in children with persistent disease. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med*. 2006;173:1098–1105.
- 45. Lavigne E, Villeneuve PJ, Cakmak S. Air pollution and emergency department visits for asthma in Windsor, Canada. *Can J Public Heal* 2012;103:4–8
- 46. Tolbert PE, Mulholland JA, MacIntosh DL, et al. Air quality and pediatric emergency room visits for asthma in Atlanta, Georgia, USA. *Am J Epidemiol* 2000;151:798–810.
- 47. Boutin-Forzano S, Adel N, Gratecos L, et al. Visits to the emergency room for asthma attacks and short-term variations in air pollution A case-crossover study. *Respiration* 2004;71:134–7.
- 48. Yamazaki S, Shima M, Yoshiko Yoda, et al. Association of ambient air pollution and meteorological factors with primary care visits at night due to asthma attack. *Environ Health Prev Med* 2013;18(5):401–6.
- 49. Santus P, Russo A, Madonini E, et al. How air pollution influences clinical management of respiratory diseases. A case-crossover study in Milan. *Respir Res* 2012;13:95
- 50. Hopke PK, Croft D, Zhang W, et al. Changes in the acute response of respiratory diseases to PM2.5 in New York State from 2005 to 2016. *Sci Total Environ* 2019;677:328–39.
- 51. Mehta AJ, Schindler C, Perez L, et al. Acute respiratory health effects of urban air pollutants in adults with different patterns of underlying respiratory disease. *Swiss Med Wkly* 2012;142:13681
- 52. Laurent O, Pedrono G, Segala C, et al. Air pollution, asthma attacks, and socioeconomic deprivation: A small-area case-crossover study. *Am J Epidemiol* 2008, 168(1): 58–65.
- 53. Pereira G, Cook A, De Vos AJBM, et al. A case-crossover analysis of

traffic-related air pollution and emergency department presentations for asthma in Perth, Western Australia. *Med J Aust* 2010;193:511–4.

- 54. Evans KA, Halterman JS, Hopke PK, et al. Increased ultrafine particles and carbon monoxide concentrations are associated with asthma exacerbation among urban children. *Environ Res* 2014;129:11–9.
- 55. Gleason JA, Bielory L, Fagliano JA. Associations between ozone, PM2.5, and four pollen types on emergency department pediatric asthma events during the warm season in New Jersey: A case-crossover study. *Environ Res* 2014;132:421–9.
- 56. Tian Y, Xiang X, Juan J, et al. Fine particulate air pollution and hospital visits for asthma in Beijing, China. *Environ Pollut* 2017; 230:227–33.
- 57. Raun LH, Ensor KB, Persse D. Using community level strategies to reduce asthma attacks triggered by outdoor air pollution: a case crossover analysis. *Environ Health* 2014;13:58.
- 58. Samoli E, Nastos PT, Paliatsos AG, et al. Acute effects of air pollution on pediatric asthma exacerbation: Evidence of association and effect modification. *Environ Res* 2011;111:418–24.
- 59. Fusco D, Forastiere F, Michelozzi P, et al. Air pollution and hospital admissions for respiratory conditions in Rome, Italy. *Eur Respir J* 2001;17:1143–50.
- 60. Anderson HR, Leon APD, Bland JM, et al. Air pollution, pollens, and daily admissions for asthma in London 1987–92. *Thorax* 1998;53:842–8.
- 61. Lee SL, Wong WHS, Lau YL. Association between air pollution and asthma admission among children in Hong Kong. *Clin Exp Allergy* 2010;36:1138–46.
- 62. Petroeschevsky A, Simpson RW, Thalib L, et al. Associations between outdoor air pollution and hospital admissions in Brisbane, Australia. *Arch Environ Health* 2001;56:37–52.
- 63. Ko FWS, Tam W, Wong TW, et al. Effects of air pollution on asthma hospitalization rates in different age groups in Hong Kong. *Clin Exp Allergy* 2007;37:1312–9.
- 64. Krmpotic D, Luzar-Stiffler V, Rakusic N, et al. Effects of traffic air pollution and hornbeam pollen on adult asthma hospitalizations in Zagreb. *Int Arch Allergy Immunol* 2011;156:62–8.
- 65. Romero-Placeres M, Más-Bermejo P, Lacasaña-Navarro M, et al. Air pollution, bronchial asthma, and acute respiratory infections in minors, Habana City. *Salud Publica Mex* 2004;46:222–33.
- 66. Morgan G, Sheppeard V, Khalaj B, et al. Effects of bushfire smoke on daily mortality and hospital admissions in Sydney, Australia. *Epidemiology* 2010, 21(1):47–55.
- Fletcher T, Gouveia N. Respiratory diseases in children and outdoor air pollution in San Paulo, Brazil a time series analysis. *Occup Environ Med* 2000; 57:477–83
- 68. Thompson AJ, Shields MD, Patterson CC. Acute asthma exacerbations and air pollutants in children living in Belfast, Northern Ireland. *Arch Environ Health* 2001;56(3):234–41.
- 69. Morgan G, Corbett S, Wlodarczyk J. Air pollution and hospital admissions in Sydney, Australia 1990 to 1994. *Am J Public Health* 1998;88:1761–6
- 70. Medina S, Tertre AL, Quénel P, et al. Air pollution and doctors' house calls: Results from the ERPURS System for monitoring the effects of air pollution on public health in greater Paris, France, 1991–1995. *Environ Res*

1997;75:73-84.

- 71. Son JY, Lee JT, Park YH, et al. Short-term effects of air pollution on hospital admissions in Korea. *Epidemiology* 2013;24:545–54.
- 72. Ueda K, Nitta H, Odajima H. The effects of weather, air pollutants, and Asian dust on hospitalization for asthma in Fukuoka. *Environ Health Prev Med* 2010;15:350–7.
- 73. Lee JT, Lee H, Song H, et al. Air pollution and asthma among children in Seoul, Korea. *Epidemiology* 2002;13:481–4.
- 74. Slaughter JC, Lumley T, Sheppard L, et al. Effects of ambient air pollution on symptom severity and medication use in children with asthma. *Ann Allergy Asthma Immunol* 2003;91:346□53.
- 75. Ye F, Piver WT, Ando M, et al. Effects of temperature and air pollutants on cardiovascular and respiratory diseases for males and females older than 65 years of age in Tokyo, July and August 1980-1995. *Environ Health Perspect* 2001;109:355–9.
- 76. Castner J, Guo L, Yin Y. Ambient air pollution and emergency department visits for asthma in Erie County, New York 2007-2012. *Int Arch Occup Environ Health* 2018;91:205–214.
- 77. Mei L, Yue C, Villeneuve PJ, et al. Gaseous air pollutants and asthma hospitalization of children with low household income in Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada. *Am J Epidemiol* 2004,159:294–303.
- 78. Schouten JP, Vonk JM, Graaf AD. Short term effects of air pollution on emergency hospital admissions for respiratory disease: results of the APHEA project in two major cities in The Netherlands, 1977-89. J Epidemiol Community Health 1996;50:S22–S29.
- 79. Yu O, Sheppard L, Lumley T, et al. Effects of ambient air pollution on symptoms of asthma in seattle-area children enrolled in the CAMP study. *Environ Health Perspect* 2000;108:1209–14.
- 80. Amancio CT, Nascimento LFC. Asthma and air pollutants: a time series study. *Rev Assoc Med Bras* 2012;58:302–7.
- 81. Lu P, Zhang Y, Lin J, et al. Multi-city study on air pollution and hospital outpatient visits for asthma in China. *Environ Pollut* 2020;257:113638.
- 82. Glad JA, Brink LL, Talbott EO, et al. The relationship of ambient ozone and PM2.5 levels and asthma emergency department visits: Possible influence of gender and ethnicity. *Arch Environ Occup Health* 2012;67:103–8.
- 83. Hwang SL, Lin YC, Guo SE, et al. Emergency room visits for respiratory diseases associated with ambient fine particulate matter in Taiwan in 2012: A population-based study. *Atmos Pollut Res* 2017;8:465–73.
- 84. Schwartz J, Slater D, Larson TV, et al. Particulate air pollution and hospital emergency room visits for asthma in Seattle. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1993;147:826–31.
- 85. Zuo B, Liu C, Chen R, et al. Associations between short-term exposure to fine particulate matter and acute exacerbation of asthma in Yancheng, China. *Chemosphere* 2019;237:124497.
- 86. Lin M, Chen Y, Burnett RT, et al. The influence of ambient coarse particulate matter on asthma hospitalization in children: Case-crossover and time-series analyses. *Environ Health Perspect* 2002;110:575–81.
- 87. Lin M, Chen Y, Burnett RT, et al. Effect of short-term exposure to gaseous pollution on asthma hospitalisation in children: A bi-directional case-crossover analysis. *J Epidemiol Community Health* 2003;57:50–5.

- Byers N, Ritchey M, Vaidyanathan A, et al. Short-term effects of ambient air pollutants on asthma-related emergency department visits in Indianapolis, Indiana, 2007-2011. J Asthma 2016;53:245–52.
- Chi R, Li H, Wang Q, et al. Association of emergency room visits for respiratory diseases with sources of ambient PM 2.5. *J Environ Sci (China)* 2019;86:154–63.
- 90. Cai J, Zhao A, Zhao J, et al. Acute effects of air pollution on asthma hospitalization in Shanghai, China. *Environ Pollut* 2014;191:139–44.
- 91. Slaughter JC, Kim E, Sheppard L, et al. Association between particulate matter and emergency room visits, hospital admissions and mortality in Spokane, Washington. J Expo Anal Environ Epidemiol 2005;15:153–9.
- 92. Smargiassi A, Kosatsky T, Hicks J, et al. Risk of asthmatic episodes in children exposed to sulfur dioxide stack emissions from a refinery point source in Montreal, Canada. *Environ Health Perspect* 2009;117:653–9.
- 93. Zhang Y, Xiang Q, Yu C, et al. asthma mortality is triggered by short-term exposures to ambient air pollutants: Evidence from a Chinese urban population. *Atmos Environ* 2020;223:117271.
- 94. Zu K, Liu X, Shi L, et al. Concentration-response of short-term ozone exposure and hospital admissions for asthma in Texas. *Environ Int* 2017;104:139–45.
- 95. Sunyer J, Atkinson R, Ballester F, et al. Respiratory effects of sulphur dioxide: a hierarchical multicity analysis in the APHEA 2 study. *Occup Environ Med* 2003;60:e2.
- James KA, Strand M, Hamer MK, et al. Health services utilization in asthma exacerbations and PM10 levels in rural Colorado. *Ann Am Thorac Soc* 2018;15:947–54.
- 97. Kim H, Kim H, Park Yh, et al. Assessment of temporal variation for the risk of particulate matters on asthma hospitalization. *Environ Res.* 2017;156:542–50.
- 98. Zhu L. Time series analysis on association between air pollution and outpatient visits for respiratory diseases of pediatrics in a hospital in Hefei. 2015.doctoral dissertation. http://cdmd.cnki.com.cn/Article/CDMD-10366-1016139520.htm.
- 99. Su JG, Barrett MA, Henderson K, et al. Feasibility of deploying inhaler sensors to identify the impacts of environmental triggers and built environment factors on asthma short-acting bronchodilator use. *Environ Health Perspect* 2017;125:254–61.
- 100. Romieu I, Meneses F, Sienra-Monge JJ, et al. Effects of urban air pollutants on emergency visits for childhood asthma in Mexico City. *Am J Epidemiol* 1995, 141:546–53.
- Zhang H, Liu S, Chen Z, et al. Effects of variations in meteorological factors on daily hospital visits for asthma: A time-series study. *Environ Res* 2020;182: 109115.
- 102. Bontinck A, Maes T, Joos G. Asthma and air pollution: recent insights in pathogenesis and clinical implications. *Curr Opin Pulm Med* 2019;26:10–19.
- 103. De Grove KC, Provoost S, Brusselle GG, et al. Insights in particulate matter-induced allergic airway inflammation: Focus on the epithelium. *Clin Exp Allergy* 2018;48:773–86.
 - 104. Mathews JA, Krishnamoorthy N, Kasahara DI, et al. augmented responses to ozone in obese mice require IL-17A and gastrin-releasing peptide. *Am J Respir Cell Mol* 2017;58:341–51.

- 105. Willart MAM, Deswarte K, Pouliot P, et al. Interleukin-1αIcontrols allergic sensitization to inhaled house dust mite via the epithelial release of GM-CSF and IL-33. J Exp Med 2012;209: 1505–17.
 - 106. Michaudel C, Maillet I, Fauconnier L, et al. Interleukin-1αInterleukin-1aillet I, Fauconnier L, aled house dust mite via the epithelial release of GM-CSF and IL-33. ent Front Immunol 2018;9:916.
- 107. Haczku A, Cao Y, Vass G, et al. IL-4 and IL-13 form a negative feedback circuit with surfactant protein-D in the allergic airway response. *J Immunol* 2006;176:3557:1–15.
- 108. Weng CM, Lee MJ, He JR, et al. Diesel exhaust particles up-regulate interleukin-17A expression via ROS/NF-κB in airway epithelium. *Biochem Pharmacol* 2018;151:1–8.
- 109. Zhang X, Chen X, Weirauch MT, et al. Diesel exhaust and house dust mite allergen lead to common changes in the airway methylome and hydroxymethylome. *Environmental Epigenetics* 2018
- 110. Jackson DJ, Gill MA, Liu AH, et al. Air pollution levels drive inflammatory epithelial responses in the pathogenesis of non-viral asthma exacerbations in urban children. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2020;201:A1036.
- 111. Hashemi A, Shirkani A, Hashemi M, et al. Role of air pollution on pathogenesis of asthma and allergic diseases. *Journal of Air Pollution and Health*, 2017;2:205–10.





Study		%
טו	RR (95% CI)	weight
Children		
Halonen JI20, 2008, (Finland)	1.006 (0.958, 1.056)	0.51
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	1.029 (1.019, 1.038)	8.21
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Spring	0.998 (0.882, 1.129)	0.08
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Summer	0.958 (0.776, 1.182)	0.03
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Fall	0.991 (0.885, 1.109)	0.10
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Winter	◆ 1.039 (0.883, 1.222)	0.04
Gleason JA55, 2014, (USA)	 1.035 (1.023, 1.047) 	6.08
Rabinovitch N44, 2006, (USA), Year1	1.054 (0.991, 1.118)	0.31
Rabinovitch N44, 2006, (USA), Year2	1.042 (1.017, 1.069)	1.71
Slaughter JC74, 2003, (USA)	1.070 (1.010, 1.140)	0.29
Subtotal (I-squared = 0.0%, p = 0.801)	1.032 (1.025, 1.039)	17.37
Adults		
Tian Y56, 2017, (China)	1.006 (1.005, 1.008)	19.19
Hopke PK50, 2019, (USA)	1.009 (1.004, 1.013)	15.07
Tian Y56, 2017, (China)	1.005 (1.004, 1.006)	19.56
Glad JA82, 2012, (USA)	- 0.993 (0.979, 1.034)	1.54
Hopke PK50, 2019, (USA)	1.012 (1.001, 1.021)	7.72
Tian Y56, 2017, (China)	1.001 (1.000, 1.002)	19.56
Subtotal (I-squared = 90.4%, p = 0.000)	1.005 (1.002, 1.008)	82.63
Overall (I-squared = 87.5%, p = 0.000)	1.010 (1.007, 1.014)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
.75 1	1.25	

(B)

itudy		%
ID	RR (95% CI)	Weight
Children		
Cadelis G37, 2014, (France), Dust-affected		10.56
Cadelis G37, 2014, (France), Dust-free	1.011 (0.941, 1.046)	4.99
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	1.018 (1.011, 1.026)	12.61
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Spring	0.988 (0.936, 1.043)	4.87
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Summer	0.968 (0.818, 1.146)	0.78
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Fall	0.971 (0.900, 1.047)	3.13
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Winter	1.022 (0.902, 1.158)	1.23
Samoli E58, 2011, (Greece)	1.025 (1.001, 1.051)	9.54
Morgan G66, 2010, (Australia)	0.994 (0.966, 1.022)	8.93
Slaughter JC74, 2003, (USA)	1.060 (1.000, 1.090)	5.96
Yu O79, 2000, (USA)	1.090 (1.010, 1.180)	2.49
Subtotal (I-squared = 83.1%, p = 0.000)	1.027 (1.002, 1.052)	65.10
Adults		
Pothirat C41, 2016, (Tailand)	1.010 (0.970, 1.040)	7.59
Krmpotic D64, 2011, (Croatia)	0.989 (0.942, 1.044)	5.17
Morgan G66, 2010, (Australia)	0.991 (0.964, 1.018)	9.13
Ye F75, 2001, (Japan)	1.003 (1.001, 1.004)	13.01
Subtotal (I-squared = 0.0%, p = 0.753)	1.003 (1.001, 1.004)	34.90
Overall (I-squared = 86.5%, p = 0.000)	1.018 (1.003, 1.033)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
77	1 05	

(C)

Study		%
ID	RR (95% CI)	Weight
Children		
Mohr LB29, 2008, (USA), Spring	0.997 (0.979, 1.017)	7.63
Mohr LB29, 2008, (USA), Summer	0.997 (0.976, 1.017)	7.26
Mohr LB29, 2008, (USA), Fall	1.003 (0.983, 1.021)	7.63
Mohr LB29, 2008, (USA), Winter	1.010 (0.986, 1.035)	6.33
Abe T39, 2009, (Japan)	0.996 (0.982, 1.010)	8.88
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	1.070 (1.030, 1.104)	4.10
Smargiassi A92, 2009, (Canada)	1.072 (1.012, 1.133)	2.00
Sunyer J95, 2003, (Europa)	1.013 (1.004, 1.022)	10.02
Samoli E58, 2011, (Greece)	1.060 (1.009, 1.113)	2.54
Petroeschevsky A62, 2001, (Australia)	1.028 (0.990, 1.070)	3.70
Smargiassi A92, 2009, (Canada)	1.169 (1.024, 1.349)	0.33
Yu O79, 2000, (USA)	1.024 (0.965, 1.094)	1.80
Subtotal (I-squared = 63.8%, p = 0.001)	1.015 (1.003, 1.027)	62.21
Adults	1 076 (0 936 1 224)	0.41
Castellsague 1300 1995 (Spain) Summer	1 021 (0 992 1 052)	5.22
Castellsague J30 1995 (Spain), Winter	1 008 (0 984, 1 034)	6.22
Cassino C35 1999 (USA)	0 977 (0 938, 1 019)	3.64
Abe T39, 2009, (Japan)	1 008 (0 967 1 049)	3.58
Supver 195, 2003, (Europa)	1 000 (0 991 1 010)	9.92
Petroeschevsky A62 2001 (Australia)	0 979 (0 965, 0 994)	8 75
Kim S19, 2012, (Korea)	1 559 (0.997 2 203)	0.02
Subtotal (L-squared = 53.0% p = 0.034)	0 000 (0 001, 2:200)	37 70
Subiotal (I-squared = 55.5%, p = 0.054)	0.333 (0.304, 1.013)	51.15
Overall (I-squared = 64.1%, p = 0.000)	1.009 (0.999, 1.018)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
.0 1	1.2 1.4	

(D)

Study		%
ID	RR (95% CI)	Weight
Children I		
Halonen JI20, 2008, (Finland)	0.999 (0.968, 1.032) 2.81
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	1.012 (1.007, 1.016) 20.44
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Spring	0.942 (0.802, 1.149) 0.11
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Summer	◆ 1.054 (0.784, 1.592	0.02
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Fall	1.061 (0.895, 1.300	0.08
Yamazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Winter	0.939 (0.808, 1.126	0.13
Thompson AJ68, 2001, (Ireland)) 4.57
Samoli E58, 2011, (Greece)	► 1.011 (0.993, 1.029) 7.06
Petroeschevsky A62, 2001, (Australia)	0.988 (0.974, 1.002	9.74
Morgan G69, 1998, (Australia)	1.009 (0.995, 1.025) 8.97
Subtotal (I-squared = 49.9%, p = 0.036)	1.008 (0.998, 1.018) 53.93
Adults		
Mehta AJ51, 2012, (Switzerland)	1.019 (0.849, 1.223	0.09
Tenias JM27, 1998, (Spain)	1.066 (0.989, 1.149) 0.50
Castellsague J30 1995, (Spain), Summer	 1.018 (1.004, 1.032 	9.74
Castellsague J30 1995, (Spain), Winter	 1.022 (1.004, 1.042 	6.53
Cassino C35, 1999, (USA)	- 0.990 (0.951, 1.029) 1.97
Anderson HR60, 1998, (UK)	1.005 (0.999, 1.011) 18.61
Morgan G69, 1998, (Australia)	1.007 (0.991, 1.022	8.61
Subtotal (I-squared = 23.8%, p = 0.248)	1.010 (1.003, 1.018	46.07
Overall (I-squared = 39.3%, p = 0.049)	1.009 (1.004, 1.015) 100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
75 1	1 25	

(E)

Study		%
ID	RR (95% CI)	Weight
Children		
Halonen JI20, 2008, (Finland)	0.938 (0.836, 1.045)	4.17
Abe T39, 2009, (Japan)	1.019 (0.985, 1.053)	19.13
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	1.025 (1.017, 1.034)	31.76
Fletcher T67, 2000, (Brazil)	1.009 (0.998, 1.022)	30.43
Slaughter JC74, 2003, (USA)	1.112 (1.038, 1.200)	6.41
Yu 079, 2000, (USA)	1.176 (1.024, 1.360)	1.75
Subtotal (I-squared = 67.1%, p = 0.010)	1.022 (1.002, 1.041)	93.65
Adults		
Cassino C35, 1999, (USA)	0.940 (0.760, 1.160)	1.25
Abe T39, 2009, (Japan)	1.151 (1.053, 1.249)	4.67
Krmpotic D64, 2011, (Croatia)	↔ 1.321 (1.013, 1.705)	0.43
Subtotal (I-squared = 58.2%, p = 0.091)	1.111 (0.937, 1.286)	6.35
Overall (I-squared = 68.7%, p = 0.001)	1.030 (1.007, 1.052)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
.6 1	1.4	

(F)

Study D	RR (95% CI)	% Weight
Children		
Hajat S21, 1999, (UK) 🛨 🕴	0.984 (0.975, 0.995)	6.85
Medina S70, 1997, (France)	1.032 (0.982, 1.113)	0.63
Szyszkowicz M25 2008, (Canada)	- 1.028 (1.013, 1.043)	5.28
Mohr LB29, 2008, (USA), Spring	1.033 (1.005, 1.065)	2.36
Nohr LB29, 2008, (USA), Summer	0.981 (0.953, 1.014)	2.31
Mohr LB29, 2008, (USA), Fall	1.005 (0.977, 1.032)	2.68
Nohr LB29, 2008, (USA), Winter	1.023 (0.986, 1.065)	1.53
lalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	1.003 (1.001, 1.006)	8.81
/amazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Spring	1.001 (0.929, 1.087)	0.44
/amazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Summer	1.055 (0.969, 1.157)	0.32
/amazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Fall	0.993 (0.904, 1.103)	0.28
/amazaki S48, 2013, (Japan), Winter	0.955 (0.857, 1.081)	0.22
Bleason JA55, 2014, (USA)	1.015 (1.012, 1.018)	8.74
Thompson AJ68, 2001, (Ireland)	0.977 (0.953, 1.005)	2.89
Samoli E58, 2011, (Greece)	0.969 (0.934, 1.005)	1.82
Anderson HR60, 1998, (UK)	1.001 (0.993, 1.009)	7.49
Zu K94, 2017, (USA)	1.008 (1.001, 1.015)	7.79
Subtotal (I-squared = 81.3%, p = 0.000)	1.004 (0.997, 1.011)	60.46
Adults		
Castellsague J30 1995, (Spain), Summer	0.996 (0.976, 1.018)	3.79
Castellsague J30 1995, (Spain), Winter	- 1.022 (0.999, 1.046)	3.30
Cassino C35, 1999, (USA)	0.957 (0.917, 1.007)	1.23
Mar TF36, 2009, (USA)	0.995 (0.972, 1.019)	3.30
Lee SW28, 2019, (Korea)	1.045 (1.030, 1.060)	5.28
Glad JA82, 2012, (USA)	0.997 (0.987, 1.007)	6.85
Morgan G69, 1998, (Australia)	1.004 (0.996, 1.013)	7.33
Zu K94, 2017, (USA)	1.004 (1.000, 1.009)	8.45
Subtotal (I-squared = 81.5%, p = 0.000)	1.006 (0.996, 1.017)	39.54
Overall (I-squared = 80.7%, p = 0.000)	1.005 (1.000, 1.011)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
.85 1	1.15	

(G)



1	A	`
(А	. 1
١.	4 3	• /

Study ID		RR (95% CI)	% Weight
Children	1		
Halonen JI20, 2008, (Finland)		0.999 (0.953, 1.048)	0.59
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	*	1.017 (1.008, 1.027)	9.77
Evans KA54, 2014, (USA)	•	→ 0.967 (0.450, 1.750)	0.00
Gleason JA55, 2014, (USA)		1.012 (1.000, 1.024)	7.07
Lavigne E45, 2012, (Canada)	1	0.909 (0.697, 1.121)	0.03
Lin M86, 2002, (Canada), Male	_ +	1.000 (0.968, 1.043)	0.94
Lin M86, 2002, (Canada), Female	•	0.989 (0.946, 1.043)	0.57
Slaughter JC74, 2003, (USA)	<u> </u>	1.080 (1.010, 1.150)	0.28
Subtotal (I-squared = 0.0%, p = 0.450)	0	1.014 (1.007, 1.021)	19.26
	i i		
Adults			
Tian Y56, 2017, (China)		1.008 (1.007, 1.009)	26.86
Tian Y56, 2017, (China)	•	1.005 (1.004, 1.006)	26.86
Glad JA82, 2012, (USA)	+ •	1.023 (0.982, 1.064)	0.79
Tian Y56, 2017, (China)	•	1.000 (0.998, 1.001)	26.22
Subtotal (I-squared = 96.1%, p = 0.000)	Ø	1.005 (1.001, 1.009)	80.74
Overall (I-squared = 87.7%, p = 0.000)	Ó	1.006 (1.003, 1.010)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis			
75	1	1 25	

(B)

Study			%
ID		RR (95% CI)	Weight
Children			
Hajat S21, 1999, (UK)	+	1.012 (0.997, 1.029)	14.53
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)		1.014 (1.008, 1.022)	24.82
Morgan G66, 2010, (Australia)	-• 	0.987 (0.961, 1.017)	7.06
Lee JT73⊓ 2002, (Korea)	-	1.017 (1.010, 1.027)	22.99
Lin M86, 2002, (Canada), Male	 ∲ ●	1.020 (0.993, 1.047)	7.46
Lin M86, 2002, (Canada), Female	_	0.993 (0.959, 1.027)	5.18
Slaughter JC74, 2003, (USA)	+ <u>+</u> +-	1.050 (0.990, 1.080)	3.20
Yu O79, 2000, (USA)		1.110 (1.030, 1.200)	0.97
Subtotal (I-squared = 46.5%, p = 0.070)	\diamond	1.014 (1.005, 1.023)	86.20
	i i		
Adults			
Pothirat C41, 2016, (Tailand)	- 	1.010 (0.980, 1.040)	6.34
Morgan G66, 2010, (Australia)		0.989 (0.962, 1.016)	7.46
Subtotal (I-squared = 3.8%, p = 0.308)	\diamond	0.998 (0.978, 1.019)	13.80
Overall (I-squared = 45.3%, p = 0.058)	0	1.012 (1.003, 1.020)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis			
75	1	125	

(C)

Study ID	RR (95% CI)	% Weight
Children		
Hajat S21, 1999, (UK)	1.027 (1.001, 1.054)	12.88
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	► 1.052 (1.017, 1.083)	9.55
Evans KA54, 2014, (USA)	➡ 1.125 (0.875, 1.450)	0.17
Smargiassi A92, 2009, (Canada)	L 1.048 (0.988, 1.120)	3.00
Lavigne E45, 2012, (Canada)	1.089 (0.911, 1.267)	0.45
Ueda K72, 2010, (Japan)	- 0.988 (0.887, 1.131)	0.93
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Male-low	- 1.021 (0.936, 1.106)	1.87
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Male-high	1.032 (0.947, 1.128)	1.66
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Female-low	1.053 (0.947, 1.170)	1.11
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Female-high	 1.074 (0.957, 1.202) 	0.93
Lin M87, 2003, (Canada), Male	1.000 (0.975, 1.025)	13.84
Lin M87, 2003, (Canada), Female	1.021 (0.985, 1.055)	8.76
Smargiassi A92, 2009, (Canada)	0.988 (0.986, 1.133)	2.46
Anderson HR60, 1998, (UK)	1.006 (1.001, 1.011)	33.05
Yu O79, 2000, (USA)	- 1.024 (0.965, 1.098)	2.96
Subtotal (I-squared = 11.9%, p = 0.320)	1.015 (1.005, 1.025)	93.63
Adults		
Cassino C35, 1999, (USA)	0.996 (0.957, 1.043)	6.33
Kim S19, 2012, (Korea)	→ 1.689 (1.115, 2.353)	0.04
Subtotal (I-squared = 79.1%, p = 0.029)	1.271 (0.606, 1.935)	6.37
Overall (I-squared = 23.2%, p = 0.185)	1.017 (1.005, 1.029)	100.00
INUTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
.6 1	1.4 2	

(D)

Study		%
ID	RR (95% CI)	Weight
Children		
Hajat S21, 1999, (UK)	1.012 (1.002, 1.023)	20.11
Halonen JI20, 2008, (Finland)	1.007 (0.991, 1.024)	10.89
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	1.007 (1.003, 1.010)	41.21
Lavigne E45, 2012, (Canada)	+ 1.056 (0.944, 1.178)	0.28
Ueda K72, 2010, (Japan)	- 1.023 (0.966, 1.045)	2.35
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Male-low	▲ 1.098 (1.030, 1.173)	0.74
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Male-high	1.030 (0.962, 1.105)	0.74
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Female-low	1.053 (0.970, 1.143)	0.51
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Female-high	1.008 (0.925, 1.098)	0.51
Lin M87, 2003, (Canada), Male	- 1.018 (0.996, 1.044)	5.86
Lin M87, 2003, (Canada), Female	0.996 (0.965, 1.027)	3.69
Subtotal (I-squared = 7.6%, p = 0.372)	1.009 (1.004, 1.014)	86.90
Adults		
Mehta AJ51, 2012, (Switzerland)	0.953 (0.878, 1.036)	0.61
Cassino C35, 1999, (USA)	1.013 (0.974, 1.058)	2.09
Petroeschevsky A62, 2001, (Australia)	0.992 (0.975, 1.009)	10.40
Subtotal (I-squared = 0.0%, p = 0.393)	0.993 (0.978, 1.009)	13.10
Overall (I-squared = 18.7%, p = 0.250)	1.008 (1.002, 1.014)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
	4.05	

(E)

Study		%
ID	RR (95% CI)	Weight
Children		
Halonen JI20, 2008, (Finland)	1.027 (0.924, 1.132)	6.06
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	1.017 (1.001, 1.025)	27.69
Evans KA54, 2014, (USA)	1.800 (0.155, 4.200)	0.02
Lavigne E45, 2012, (Canada)	1.600 (1.080, 2.240)	0.24
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Male-Iow	1.096 (0.984, 1.224)	4.80
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Male-high	1.096 (0.968, 1.224)	4.30
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Female-low	1.016 (0.872, 1.176)	3.19
Mei L77, 2004, (Canada), Female-high	1.080 (0.904, 1.256)	2.45
Lin M87, 2003, (Canada), Male	1.080 (1.000, 1.176)	7.81
Lin M87, 2003, (Canada), Female	1.000 (0.888, 1.096)	6.06
Slaughter JC74, 2003, (USA)	1.112 (1.038, 1.200)	8.80
Yu O79, 2000, (USA)	→ 1.240 (1.088, 1.416)	2.78
Subtotal (I-squared = 49.0%, p = 0.028)	> 1.067 (1.024, 1.110)	74.19
Adults		
Cassino C35, 1999, (USA)	0.998 (0.981, 1.019)	25.81
Subtotal (I-squared = .%, p = .)	0.998 (0.979, 1.017)	25.81
Overall (I-squared = 54.5%, p = 0.009)	> 1.041 (1.013, 1.070)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
.6 1	1.4	

(F)

Study		%
ID	RR (95% CI)	Weight
Children		
Szyszkowicz M25 2008, (Canada)	1.017 (1.003, 1.032)	5.71
Jalaludin B43, 2008, (Australia)	1.005 (1.003, 1.007)	10.59
Evans KA54, 2014, (USA)	0.911 (0.793, 1.121)	0.09
Gleason JA55, 2014, (USA)	1.012 (1.006, 1.015)	9.92
Lavigne E45, 2012, (Canada)	1.004 (0.946, 1.073)	0.60
Petroeschevsky A62, 2001, (Australia)	1.030 (1.007, 1.054)	3.23
Morgan G69, 1998, (Australia)	0.996 (0.989, 1.003)	8.93
Lee JT73 2002 (Korea)	➡ 1.026 (1.015, 1.034)	7.80
Mei L77, 2004. (Canada). Male-low	0.953 (0.924 0.981)	2.43
Mei L 77, 2004, (Canada), Male-biob	0.978 (0.946, 1.013)	1.88
Mei I 77, 2004 (Canada), Female-low	▲ 1 035 (0 991 1 088)	0.99
Mei L 77, 2004, (Canada), Female-bigh	0.972 (0.931, 1.016)	1 25
Lin M87, 2003, (Canada), Male	0 991 (0 972 1 009)	4 41
Lin M87, 2003, (Canada), Female	0.967 (0.949, 1.009)	2 24
Zu K94 2017 (USA)	1 016 (1 009 1 022)	9 14
Mortimer KM38, 2002 (USA) Decline in FEFR		3.33
Mortimer KM38, 2002, (USA), Symptom		2 50
Subtotal (I-squared = 79.5% p = 0.000)	1 006 (0.999, 1.007)	75.05
	1.000 (0.000, 1.012)	10.00
Adults		
Medina S70, 1997 (France)	1 021 (0 999 1 048)	3.05
Tenias IM27 1998 (Spain)	1 083 (1 024 1 146)	0.64
Cassing C35, 1999, (USA)	▲ 1 023 (0 977 1 080)	0.88
Mar TE36, 2009, (USA)		2.88
	1 000 (0 990 1 010)	2.00
7u K04 2017 (USA)	1.000 (0.990, 1.010)	0.02
Subtotal (I-squared = 48.7%, p = 0.083)	1 000 (1.001, 1.010)	3.3Z
Subidial (1-squared = 40.7% , p = 0.003)	1.009 (1.000, 1.019)	24.90
Overall (I-squared = 74.9%, p = 0.000)	1 007 (1 002 1 012)	100.00
Overall (I-Squareu = 74.3%, p = 0.000)	1.007 (1.002, 1.012)	100.00
NOTE: Weights are from random effects analysis		
1 95	1 15	

(G)