

COVID-19 Trends in Florida K-12 Schools, August 10 – November 14, 2020

Rebekah D. Jones^a, MS, GISP (corresponding author)

Affiliations: ^aThe Covid Monitor, Florida

Address correspondence to: Rebekah Jones, The Covid Monitor, PO BOX 13747, Tallahassee, FL 32317, plans@thecovidmonitor.com

Short title: COVID-19 Trends in Florida K-12 Schools, August 10 – November 14, 2020

Conflict of Interest Disclosures (includes financial disclosures): The author has no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Funding/Support: No funding was secured for this study.

Abbreviations: none

Table of Contents Summary:

Using the most comprehensive database of K-12 COVID-19 case data in the country, Florida provides clues for understanding student and staff cases in schools.

What's known on this subject:

Florida schools began reopening to in-person instruction in August have reported more than 18,000 student and staff cases of COVID-19 as of November 14, 2020. Incidence of COVID-19 cases in K-12 students and staff is of urgent public health concern.

What this study adds

COVID-19 cases reported in Florida schools were most influenced by community case rates, district mask policies, and percent of students attending face-to-face. Student case rates were highest in high schools (12.5 per 1,000).

Abstract

Data collected from 38 states from August 3 – November 15, 2020 showed more than 250,000 confirmed student and staff cases of SARS-CoV-2 in K-12 schools¹. Yet, analysis of COVID-19 case data in USA schools has been extremely limited^{2,3}. To date, no large-scale or state-wide analyses by school level and grade has been published, opening a wide gap in understanding COVID-19 in American schools. A large-scale assessment of available data and trends could provide a baseline for understanding the virus in the K-12 learning environment and dispel misconceptions about the prevalence of COVID-19 in schools.

Background

Florida school case data provides an opportunity to examine the extent to which COVID-19 has been detected and reported in schools through reporting of cases by day, by school level, by location, for both students and staff. Student enrollment across Florida's 67 districts totals more than 2.67 million, with five of the ten most populated districts in the country within Florida's public-school system. Schools in Florida's mix of urban, suburban and rural districts, in addition to the variety of policies ranging from availability of virtual instruction to mandatory-mask mandates, make it an ideal case study for examining larger trends in COVID-19's prevalence in American schools. This data could help inform decisions makers evaluating mitigation strategies and access to virtual learning, as well as build upon current knowledge of COVID-19 in American society.

Methods

During August 10 – November 14, 2020, laboratory-confirmed cases of COVID-19 in 10,088 students and 4,507 staff in K-12 schools were confirmed by either the Florida Department of Health, or directly from the 43 independently-reporting school districts in the state (Table 1). School case data, collected daily, and school enrollment data for both in-person (including hybrid) and virtual learning were obtained by public records request to each of Florida’s 67 districts for each week of the study period. Data regarding mask policies were obtained either from each district’s reopening plan, or from public records request. No assessment of school case data or rates with consideration of age groups and mask policies at this scale or with this level of granularity were discovered after an exhaustive search.

The Centers for Disease Control (CDC) provides guidance for safely reopening schools, based primarily on the rate of community spread within a given district or county⁵. County COVID-19 case rates were calculated based on new cases over a 14-day period at a rate per 1,000 people based on data reported by the Florida Department of Health⁶.

Table 1: Florida COVID-19 case totals by school level for students and staff, August 10—November 14, 2020.

Grade Levels	Case totals		
	Student	Staff	Total
Elementary	2728	1811	4539
Middle	1373	600	1973
High	4124	897	5021
K-8	716	300	1016
Jr./Sr. High (6-12)	476	143	619
K-12	166	123	289
<i>Private/spec. ed</i>	1305	633	1938

Results

During August 10 – November 14, 2020, the state-wide incidence rate (cases per 1,000 students enrolled in face-to-face or hybrid instruction) in Florida high school students (12.5) was 70% higher than younger cohorts (7.4). School data by grade level (e.g. elementary, middle, high) shows trends consistent with earlier findings by the CDC regarding case rates between younger and older adolescents⁴. Staff rates are higher than student rates in all school environments except high schools. The proportion of student to staff cases in Florida schools was closest in the elementary setting (60% students – 40% staff) compared to the high school setting (82% students – 18% staff).

Approximately 61% of all students in Florida returned to in-person instruction during the report period, with 39% enrolled in virtual-learning programs or withdrawing from the district by November 1, 2020. Most students (87%) in the state who attended in-person classes were enrolled in districts with mandatory mask mandates, though the percent of students enrolled in face-to-face instruction was highest among districts without mask mandates. The state-wide case incidence rate in districts without mask mandates (12.7 per 1,000 students enrolled face-to-face or hybrid) was 38% higher than those who attended in-person within districts that did have mask mandates (9.2). However, the staff case rate in districts without mask mandates (29.2 per 1,000 on-campus employees) was nearly twice that of staff case rates in districts with mandatory mask policies (14.8) (Table 2).

Case rates nearly tripled in the period October 3 – November 14 for students in Florida compared to the period August 10 – October 3⁷ (4.5 per 1,000 in high school and 2.3 per 1,000 in elementary students to 12.5 and 7.4 per 1,000, respectively). Only two of Florida's 67 counties had school case rates lower than the community case rate (Monroe and Walton), while 19

counties had higher pediatric case rates overall compared to school case rates (Table 2). Seven counties had more school cases reported than pediatric cases reported, which could be due to a number of high school students being over the age of 18 and thus not counted in the pediatric community rate, or do to the school reporting previous cases after-the-fact.

Discussion

Case incidence varies significantly between school grade levels and between students and staff. Staff rates are higher than student rates in all school environments except high schools, and staff benefit most by mandatory-mask mandates. The rate of cases within schools is highly correlated with cases within a community, more than the size of the district by total enrollment. Percent enrollment in face-to-face instruction is a secondary influencer of case incidence rates in schools. In areas with higher pediatric community case rates compared to school case rates, districts may be under-reporting school case totals for students, or “disqualifying” student cases based on when a student tested and whether the case could be directly linked to the school environment. More research is needed to further understand the wealth of data available regarding COVID-19 incidence in Florida, and to develop proper mitigation strategies to confront this unprecedented challenge.

Table 2: Florida COVID-19 school-based case rates (August 10 – November 14, 2020), community and school-age case rates (November 1 – 14, 2020), and mask policies by county

County	School Case Rates (per 1,000 students enrolled)					Community 14-day case data per 1,000			Mandatory Mask Policy
	Elementary Student	High Student	District Rate (all levels – all types)	District student rate (all levels)	District Staff Rate (all levels)	All age groups	School-age children (4-17)	Percent of school-age cases also reported by school district	
Alachua	8.2	26.1	12.1	10.0	23.6	3.6	13.0	48.5	Yes
Baker	6.7	34.6	14.0	11.3	34.2	3.2	3.5	45.5	No
Bay	6.6	16.3	9.6	8.0	20.7	3.4	18.9	75.0	Yes
Bradford	10.4	17.2	11.7	8.0	29.9	2.0	0.2	0.0	No
Brevard	6.8	9.1	6.8	6.6	14.3	2.9	16.6	55.2	Yes
Broward	5.1	3.3	4.7	3.6	10.4	3.6	182.2	36.0	Yes
Calhoun	6.1		12.2	19.2	30.4	4.2	3.9	55.6	No
Charlotte	3.0	7.3	5.3	5.2	5.8	2.8	2.5	66.7	No
Citrus	7.3	15.8	10.2	7.6	25.4	3.8	19.2	100.0	Yes
Clay	4.8	9.0	6.5	6.8	14.7	3.0	21.0	55.0	Yes
Collier	8.5	12.0	7.8	6.5	14.2	3.2	57.5	66.3	Yes
Columbia	7.2	10.6	10.9	11.4	24.7	2.9	11.4	85.7	No
Desoto	8.5	6.7	6.4	4.9	13.7	2.3	1.8	200.0	No
Dixie	1.9	22.8	6.1	4.6	15.0	1.4	0.1	50.0	No
Duval	4.8	9.9	6.8	5.8	14.9	2.7	25.7	35.3	Yes
Escambia	4.2	15.6	6.5	5.2	12.1	4.1	37.0	55.6	Yes
Flagler	6.3	11.6	8.2	7.6	16.9	1.8	3.5	95.7	No
Franklin			32.4	23.7	85.6	2.0	6.0	0.0	No
Gadsden	14.6	12.9	11.5	12.5	11.3	1.1	2.0	9.1	Yes
Gilchrist	3.7		10.0	16.8	29.3	2.0	8.9	170.0	No
Glades	31.4		14.2	13.1	68.8	1.6	0.5	200.0	No
Gulf	4.5		15.1	28.1	21.4	3.6	0.0	100.0	No
Hamilton	2.4		3.2	2.3	19.3	1.8	0.1	50.0	No
Hardee	22.2	50.1	29.5	30.8	53.3	2.2	1.1		No
Hendry	9.9	8.2	8.8	6.7	19.9	2.4	7.3	50.0	Yes
Hernando	3.5	8.4	6.6	5.7	11.7	2.2	14.0	48.5	No
Highlands	8.2	11.1	11.2	10.1	26.8	4.5	6.4	75.0	No
Hillsborough	8.6	14.0	8.5	6.0	20.5	2.7	38.9	75.3	Yes
Holmes	12.3	21.1	14.7	11.7	51.1	4.9	2.1	57.1	No
Indian River	8.4	18.6	12.1	11.5	14.5	3.1	2.6	76.4	Yes

Jackson	12.4	31.0	16.7	16.7	44.1	7.1	2.2	58.3	No
Jefferson	4.7	20.2	24.1	37.6	21.4	2.5	0.1	16.7	Yes
Lafayette	3.7		6.1	6.9	32.1	1.0	0.0		No
Lake	7.6	9.7	7.8	6.1	16.9	2.4	5.6	34.4	Yes
Lee	6.6	11.6	7.9	6.9	13.4	3.0	4.4	75.5	Yes
Leon	9.7	14.2	10.6	9.4	14.6	3.5	1.2	37.5	Yes
Levy	6.6		10.5	17.7	6.3	2.1	0.2	136.8	No
Liberty		22.6	17.7	17.0	21.6	1.7	0.0		No
Madison	5.9	13.3	11.1	9.5	26.6	4.8	1.8	55.6	No
Manatee	7.1	9.4	6.0	5.0	10.6	2.6	15.0	44.5	Yes
Marion	6.0	12.3	7.1	5.8	13.3	2.0	0.3	39.1	No
Martin	3.3	14.1	8.1	8.0	8.7	1.7	1.5	73.9	Yes
Monroe	5.7	8.2	5.0	5.3	6.6	5.4	25.5	83.3	Yes
Nassau	6.0	8.8	8.8	9.8	18.1	2.7	0.6	66.7	Yes
Okaloosa	9.6	45.0	18.1	15.6	38.8	4.8	0.9	77.5	No
Okeechobee	7.6	12.4	8.4	8.4	8.5	2.4	0.4	75.0	Yes
Orange	8.9	11.6	7.9	7.6	8.8	3.1	10.1	45.0	Yes
Osceola	17.1	14.1	13.8	13.3	15.9	4.0	11.4	43.3	Yes
Palm Beach	7.5	15.7	8.9	8.7	10.1	3.3	59.7	56.3	Yes
Pasco	8.6	14.8	9.1	8.5	12.9	2.6	18.1	83.7	Yes
Pinellas	6.4	12.4	9.7	9.0	12.5	2.8	42.2	61.1	Yes
Polk	7.6	8.4	7.0	6.5	11.4	2.5	0.9	42.4	Yes
Putnam	9.1	19.6	14.6	12.3	32.6	1.6	0.4	66.7	Yes
Santa Rosa	7.2	13.7	8.5	6.7	25.9	3.2	0.7	32.8	Yes
Sarasota	7.7	18.2	8.1	7.9	9.2	2.0	0.9	315.2	Yes
Seminole	6.5	29.8	9.9	9.9	9.9	2.9	0.7	151.6	Yes
St. Johns	6.7	13.8	8.7	7.9	14.3	2.9	1.0	115.5	Yes
St. Lucie	2.5	10.2	6.2	6.0	8.1	2.0	11.0	33.3	Yes
Sumter	8.9	14.2	11.5	15.7	20.0	1.5	0.2	100.0	Yes
Suwannee	10.1	16.1	14.1	11.7	28.9	2.1	0.3	76.9	No
Taylor	12.8	32.2	13.7	12.8	18.0	3.1	0.2	72.7	No
Union	12.7	66.0	21.9	19.1	41.2	2.9	0.2	87.5	No
Volusia	5.5	11.4	7.6	6.4	14.6	2.2	3.1	58.1	Yes
Wakulla	11.3	18.9	11.1	10.6	14.0	3.4	2.3	81.8	No
Walton	2.3	7.6	4.6	2.6	23.6	10.2	0.7	15.0	No
Washington	8.3	25.5	13.2	13.7	11.0	4.2	0.3	88.2	No

Acknowledgements

The Covid Monitor provided data related to cases in K-12 school districts in Florida.

References:

1. Jones RD, Glasgow SC, Whaltinez OL. The Covid Monitor. Open data available at <https://github.com/TheCovidMonitor/Data>
2. Leana, WS. Most schools should close and stay closed through winter. The Washington Post. 24 November 2020. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/2020/11/24/close-schools-coronavirus-winter/>
3. Jones RD, Glasgow SC, Whaltinez OL. Shut them down: The surprising data behind COVID-19 and schools. US News and World Report. 1 December 2020
4. Leeb RT, Price S, Sliwa S, et al. COVID-19 Trends Among School-Aged Children — United States, March 1–September 19, 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2020;69:1410–1415. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm6939e2>
5. United States Centers for Disease Control. 2020. Indicators for Dynamic School Decision-Making. <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/community/schools-childcare/indicators.html>
6. Florida Department of Health. School Report for Florida — Summary of COVID-19 Cases Associated with Primary and Secondary Schools. <https://floridahealthcovid19.gov/#latest-stats>
7. Jones, RD, Romer, JE. COVID-19 Trends in Florida – August 10 – November 3, 2020. Pre-print MedRxiv: