Onset, duration, and persistence of taste and smell changes

and other COVID-19 symptoms: longitudinal study in Israeli

patients

Hadar Klein[1]#, Kim Asseo[1]#, Noam Karni[2]#, Yuval Benjamini[3], Ran Nir-Paz[4], Mordechai

Muszkat[2], Sarah Israel[2§], Masha Y. Niv[1§]*

#equal contributions as first authors

§equal contributions as senior authors

*corresponding author

[1]The Institute of Biochemistry, Food and Nutrition, The Hebrew University, Rehovot, Israel

[2]Department of Medicine, Hadassah University Hospital, Mt. Scopus Campus, Jerusalem, Israel

[3]Department of Statistics, The Hebrew University, Mt. Scopus Campus, Jerusalem, Israel

[4]Department of Clinical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases, Hadassah-Hebrew University medical

center

KEYWORDS:

COVID-19; smell change; taste change; symptoms duration; disease course; recovery;

symptoms persistence

CORRESPONDING AUTHOR:

Prof. Masha Y Niv, PhD

Chemical Senses and Molecular Recognition Lab

24 Robert H. Smith Faculty of Agriculture, Food and Environment, Rehovot, Israel

25 The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel

26 E-mail: masha.niv@mail.huji.ac.il, Tel: +972-89489664

ABSTRACT

Objectives: The multifaceted disease manifestation of COVID-19 requires longitudinal characterization of symptoms, to aid with screening and disease management.

Methods: Phone interviews and follow-ups were completed with 112 mild COVID-19 RT-PCR-positive adult patients, over a six weeks period.

Results: More than one symptom at disease onset was experienced by ~70 of the patients. Over one third of the patients experienced fever, dry cough, headache, or muscle ache as the first symptom. If fatigue was reported, it was usually the first symptom to appear. Smell and taste changes had occurred 3.9 ± 5.4 and 4.6 ± 5.7 days (mean $\pm$ SD) since disease onset and emerged as first symptoms in 15% and 18% of patients, respectively. Fever was the shortest lasting symptom (5.8 ± 8.6 days (mean $\pm$ SD), and smell and taste changes were the longest-lasting symptoms (24.3 ± 22.9 days and 19.4 ± 19.1 (mean $\pm$ SD), respectively), with longer smell recovery correlated with smell change severity. In one third of patients who reported cough, smell and taste changes, these symptoms persisted after negative RT-PCR tests.

Conclusions: Each symptom can occur as first or later, some are more likely to appear as firsts, and typically more than one symptom occurs at disease onset. The severity of olfactory change is associated with its recovery time. Lack of chemosensory recuperation in recovered patients is common. These findings can aid patients through their illness and provide expected recovery patterns.

BACKGROUND

The coronavirus disease (COVID-19) has become a global pandemic, with more than 31 million globally reported cases as of September 24th, 2020 including 972,221 deaths (World Health Organization, 2020). This pandemic resulted in multiple socio-economic implications on a worldwide scale[1]. COVID-19 symptoms and severity vary widely[2,3]. It has been established that COVID-19 can result in prolonged illness even among milder patients[4]. Symptoms may persist post patient recovery, which is usually defined as symptoms improvement along with negative real time polymerase chain reaction (RT-PCR) test results for COVID-19[5].

COVID-19 initially targets the human respiratory system, with the most common symptoms according to the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) being fever, cough, shortness of breath, fatigue, muscle aches, headache, new loss of smell or taste, sore throat, congestion, nausea/vomiting and diarrhea. Other commonly reported symptoms also include sputum production, hemoptysis and lack of appetite[6,7]. These symptoms' order of appearance, severity, durations and persistence after recovery, is only partly studied[5,8,9].

In this study, we address gaps in knowledge regarding the order of symptoms appearance and their durations in RT-PCR positive patients. Establishing COVID-19 course of illness in terms of symptoms severity, order of appearance, duration, and persistence after recovery, is of key importance for patients' ability to cope with the mental, social, and financial challenges that accompany the disease.

METHODS

Aim and setting

This is a follow-up study of patients that participated in our previous study, see Karni and Klein et al.[10], performed in Israel, from April 2020 to May 2020. The study comprised of Israeli residents aged ≥18 years with positive COVID-19 RT-PCR results, who were recruited via social media (Twitter and Facebook) and word of mouth for phone interviews. We excluded severely ill patients, and non-Israeli residents. Participants were not screened or targeted for experiencing chemosensory changes. Informed consent was obtained from all participants. The study was approved by the Hadassah Medical Center Helsinki Committee (permit number 0236-20-HMO). Upon agreement to participate, the explanation of the interview, including questions on taste and smell, were read to the participants.

General design

The questionnaire was developed in parallel with the Global Consortium for Chemosensory Research, GCCR[11]. The questionnaire[10] had five parts: 1) General information (e.g., age, gender); 2) Medical history (e.g., medical conditions, chronic medications use); 3) Current illness (e.g., 23 physical signs and symptoms, RT-PCR swab test results and dates, subjective recovery feeling); 4 and 5) Smell and taste: Participants were instructed to rate their sense of smell/taste before, during and after their illness, on a scale from 1-10 (1 corresponding to "no sense of smell" and 10 to excellent sense of smell). Data was kept in Compusense Cloud on-line software (Compusense Inc., Guelph, ON, Canada).

Patients follow-up

Covid-19 positive patients from our previous Karni and Klein et al. study[10], were followed here to monitor the progress of their illness and recovery. Out of 144 RT-PCR-positive patients, 114 had answered the phone, of which two had missing information regarding rating of chemosensory symptoms, resulting in 112 patients answering the first questionnaire.

Recovered patients' category refers to those who received two consecutive negative RT-PCR test results. Patients who either did not recover from their symptoms in the first questionnaire, or did not get two consecutive negative RT-PCR results at the time of answering the first questionnaire, were contacted 3 weeks after the initial interview, for their 3-week follow-up (n=101). If they had not fully recovered at their first follow-up, they were contacted again 3 weeks after their second interview, for their 6-week follow-up (n=46).

Data analysis

The participants were asked about 27 symptoms (see web-only Supplementary Figure S1). 7 of these occurred in more than 50% of the patients (Taste change, smell change, fever, dry cough, muscle aches, headache, lack of appetite) and were included in the final analysis. All these symptoms, except lack of appetite, are current official CDC symptoms. Additional 7 symptoms of the less prevalent (<50%) symptoms are the remaining official CDC symptoms (productive cough, shortness of breath, fatigue, sore throat, congestion, nausea/vomiting, and diarrhea), and were therefore also included in the final analysis. "Fatigue" was not explicitly included in the original questionnaire because it was not a known symptom at the time of its drafting, but was nevertheless

self-reported in 18% of patients under "any other symptoms" and was therefore

included in the final analysis.

Disease onset is defined as the first appearance of any of the COVID-19 symptoms

described above. Persistent symptoms are defined as symptoms that progress post

patient's recovery.

Order of appearance and duration were calculated from the dates reported by the

participants for each symptom.

Severity of smell (taste) change was calculated as the delta between the reported

ability to smell before the illness and its reported ability during the illness, rated on a

1-10 scale.

Statistical analysis

Analyses were conducted using the statistical software R (https://www.r-

project.org/). Descriptive statistics are presented as the mean and standard deviation.

Pearson correlation coefficient was used for testing of correlations. A level of $P<0.05$

was used to determine statistical significance.

RESULTS:

Patients' characteristics

Completed questionnaires were obtained from 112 COVID-19 positive patients. The

median age of the respondents was 35 ± 12 years (mean ± SD) and included (64%)

men. 6 patients were classified as hospitalized (received respiratory support during

their hospitalization and / or were hospitalized in the intensive care unit) and the

remaining 106 were classified as ambulatory patients.

Order of symptoms' appearance

Symptoms appearance were usually concomitant: The first and second symptoms to

appear were accompanied by additional symptoms in 69% and 45% of the patients,

respectively. Headache, fever, dry cough, and muscle aches were the first symptoms

to appear in more than one third of the patients (Figure 1A).

Smell and taste changes were the first symptoms to appear (either solely or along with

other symptoms) in only 15% and 18% of patients, respectively. Fatigue was as a first

symptom in majority of patients who reported it(Figure 1A).

Headache, fever, dry cough, and muscle aches appeared 1.99 ± 5, 1.79 ± 4.64, 1.35 ±

3.44 and 2.09 ± 5.07 days (mean ± SD), respectively, after illness onset. Smell and taste

changes appeared later, at 3.94 ± 5.45 and 4.58 ± 5.72 days (mean ± SD), respectively,

after illness onset (Figure 1B). Each of the 14 symptoms analyzed here could occur as

first or co-first, with vomiting, breathing difficulty and diarrhea being the most spread

out in the order in which they appear (see web-only Supplementary Figure S2). Indeed,

vomiting and diarrhea appeared after the highest number of days since illness onset

(5.57 ± 8.26 and 5.85 ± 9.97, respectively) (Figure 1B).

Figure 1. Symptoms order. A. Prevalence of patients for which symptoms appeared as 1st and ≥2nd symptoms. Symptoms that appeared as 1st in more the third of the patients are presented with dark background, lower prevalence is presented in light blue background. **B.** Y axis lists symptoms and X axis shows number of days since illness started. the mean ± SD number of days for symptom onset is presented for each symptom. Coloring is according to prevalence, with darkest color indicating most prevalent symptoms.

Distribution of symptoms durations and persistence

Figure 2A depicts the durations of the most prevalent symptoms (>50%) among 112

COVID-19 patients. Fever, lack of appetite, headache and muscle ache had shorter

durations than those of dry cough and changes of taste and smell. In this sample of

patients, the most prolonged symptoms lasted up to 78 days.

36% of patients with smell change, 32% of patients with taste change, and 27% with

dry or productive cough, still had these symptoms post recovery (defined as two

consecutive negative RT-PCR-test results) (Figure 2A). Similar results were found also

when recovery is defined as 13 days after symptoms onset, as currently accepted in

Israel (see web-only Supplementary Figure S3). Smell and taste changes duration

present bimodal distributions, with patients who experienced these symptoms as

persistent, comprising the second peak (Figure 2A (6-7)). As seen in Figure 2B,

persistent taste change was usually accompanied by persistent smell change in the

same patient, and in some cases also accompanied by a persistent cough (either

productive or dry). Persistent cough could persist also in patients without persistent

chemosensory change.

Figure 2. Symptoms durations and persistence. A. (1-7) Duration pattern graphs are presented for each symptom and colored according to symptom's persistence post recovery. Y axis shows number of patients (n) and X axis shows duration of symptoms (days). Persistent symptoms are colored purple and symptoms that did not persist are colored pink. Number of patients and the mean ± SD duration (days) of symptoms is presented for each graph. **B.** Euler-diagram of the most persistent symptoms after recovery. persistent smell and taste changes are marked green and blue, respectively. Cough is marked in seashell color. The number of patients experiencing a symptom as persistent is marked in each circle.

Chemosensory recovery patterns

We quantified the level smell and taste recovery during 6 weeks of follow-ups. We found three groups of patients: The 1st group recovered already at the time of the initial interview (their taste and smell ability ratings shown on Figures 3A and 3D). The 2nd group of patients were not recovered during initial interview and had one follow-up interview. Figures 3B and 3E show three smell and taste ratings before their illness, at the worst state during their illness and at the time of their second interview. The last group of patients did not recover during the follow-up interview and had a second follow-up. Figures 3C and 3F present four ratings for smell and taste: the score before their illness, at the worst state during their illness, and at the time of second and third interviews. The results indicate full recovery in patients from group 1 and 2, and a slower and gradual recovery of the senses in the last group.

Smell   **Taste**

Figure 3. Smell and taste ratings over 6-weeks follow-ups. A-C. Smell scores of patients recovered at the initial **(A)**, second **(B)**, and third **(C)** interviews. **D-F.** Taste scores of patients recovered at the initial **(D)**, second **(E)**, and third **(F)** interviews. Y axis shows rating of smell/taste ability and X axis depicts 5 time points ratings: before, during and after their illness, rated at initial questionnaire (blue), and at two following questionnaires (3-weeks (light blue) and 6-weeks (turquoise) follow-ups).

Smell change severity and recovery

We found that the durations of smell and taste were correlated (0.82, p<0.001) (Figure

4A), with many patients reporting identical durations for these symptoms.

As seen in Figure 4B, a small yet significant correlation was found also between smell

change severity and its duration (correlation 0.34, p=0.003). The same was not

repeated for taste change severity and its duration (see web-only Supplementary

Figure S4).

Moreover, it is apparent that some patients' smell change had recovered

independently of how severe it was, while for another group of patients, it was closely

dependent on its severity (Figure 4B). We did not find any particular characteristics for

either of these subgroups.

Figure 4. Correlations of smell and taste change characteristics. A. Correlation of

smell and taste change durations (n=67). X axis shows smell change duration and Y

axis shows taste change duration (days). **B.** Correlations between smell change

severity and its duration (n=76). X axis shows smell change severity and Y axis shows

smell change duration (days).

DISCUSSION

Smell and taste changes had emerged as distinctive COVID-19 symptoms[10,12]. Considering the importance of chemosensory disorders in COVID-19, it is essential to further study these symptoms in terms of order of appearance in relation to other COVID-19 symptoms, duration, and persistence post recovery.

Spinato et al.[13] had found that the time of onset of smell or taste changes was prior to other symptoms in 11.9% of cases and concomitant with other symptoms in 22.8% of cases. In terms of symptoms durations, different reports found that the time for chemosensory recovery is ranging from 8.02 ± 6.41 to 11.6 ± 6.2 days (mean ± SD)[14,15], others found their persistence post recovery in the range of 20% to 78% of patients[5,16].

Our study reveals that smell and taste were the first symptoms to appear, in 15% and 18% of cases, respectively, either with or without other symptoms. We found duration of smell change to be 24.3 ± 22.9 days and of taste change to be 19.4 ± 19.1 days (mean ± SD), and their post-recovery persistence to be prevalent in 36% and 32% of patients, respectively.

Concerning other COVID-19 symptoms, we found that even though their order of appearance is varied, headache, fever, dry cough, and muscle aches were often (38% -43%) the first symptoms to appear. Additionally, out of the 18% patients who experienced fatigue, 80% had experienced it as a first symptom (14% of all patients). Of note, the prevalence of fatigue in our study was lower than previously reported 36%-46%[17,18], probably because here it was not explicitly part of the questionnaire, but rather self-reported under the "any other symptom" question.

Furthermore, we found COVID-19 illness to have a prolonged phase, in which

symptoms such as fever, lack of appetite, headache and muscle aches are recovered,

but dry cough, taste change and smell change persist, with the latter having the

longest duration of 24.3 ± 22.9 days (mean ± SD). The prolonged phase can persist

post-recovery: chemosensory changes were found to persist post recovery in about

one third of patients experiencing them (usually by the same patient). Additionally,

cough, either dry or productive, was also found to persist in approximately 27% of

patients who reported experiencing this symptom. However, patients experiencing

cough as persistent can be the same or different than those experiencing persistent

chemosensory changes.

We found slightly lower prevalence of patients who experienced chemosensory

changes as first symptoms than those previously reported[13], which could be due to

recall bias caused by retrospective data collection. We also report a lower percentage

of persistence post recovery prevalence of smell and taste changes compared to

another study [16], which could be sue to our larger sample size or other differences.

Longer duration of chemosensory changes that those reported by others[14,15,19] is

due to the longer follow-ups we conducted. Moreover, our detailed phone interviews

did not rely on online surveys, increasing the reliability of the data.

Importantly, some surveys did not use scales to determine smell and taste changes

and recovery, but rather counted them as binary symptoms[19]. Here we monitored

quantitative recovery back to normal levels, possibly accounting for the longer

recovery rate we found for the chemosensory changes and higher persistence post-

recovery than when binary classification was used[5].

We found smell (but not taste) change severity to be correlated with its time to

recover. However, while for a group of the patients, the time necessary for their smell

change recovery correlated with magnitude of the change they had experienced, for

another group, the severity of their smell change was unrelated to the time it took to

recover. Such grouping was also reported by Gerkin et al.[12], but characteristics that

might account for the differences between these two groups could not yet be

unraveled and require future study.

Study limitations

Our sample did not include severely ill patients, and therefore is relevant for light to

moderately ill patients only. No objective testing was performed, and the information

was self-reported by the participants. Additionally, the retrospective data collection

method used in this study may have caused recall bias.

Our study focuses on a relatively short period (6 weeks) of post-acute illness stage,

and future studies of large groups of long lasting and persistent symptoms of COVID-

19 during longer periods of time are likely to reveal additional manifestations of "long

COVID"[20].

Conclusions

We have carefully mapped the start and end dates of various COVID-19 symptoms of

112 mild patients in Israel. The results indicate that despite large variability in

symptoms onset and duration, some symptoms (headache, fever, dry cough, and

muscle aches) are common as first or co-first symptoms. Fatigue, if occurs, usually

appears as first. Taste and smell changes are not typically first, and appear on average,

3.9 ± 5.4 and 4.6 ± 5.7 days (mean ± SD), respectively, since illness onset. Their

recovery can be either fast, or longer and gradual, sometimes accompanied by cough.

Interestingly, while dry cough appears early (1.35 ± 3.44 days (mean ± SD)) and

productive cough later (4.54 ± 7.09 days (mean ± SD)), both types of cough may persist

post recovery. This information regarding their symptoms' durations and persistence

post recovery, can potentially reduce anxiety and promote better management of

patients financial, social, and mental wellbeing during the disease.

Authors' contributions

NK and MYN initiated the research, SI, NK and MM wrote the IRB proposal, NK

recruited patients, NK, MYN, YB, SI and MM designed the research, SI, MM, RNP and

MYN supervised the research, HK carried out the interviews, HK and MYN drafted the

manuscript, KA and YB preformed the statistical analysis, KA and HK created figures

and tables. All authors contributed to writing and approved the final manuscript.

References

[1] Nicola M, Alsafi Z, Sohrabi C, et al. The socio-economic implications of the

coronavirus pandemic (COVID-19): A review. Int J Surg. 2020;78:185-193.

doi:10.1016/j.ijsu.2020.04.018

[2] Guan WJ, Ni ZY, Hu Y, et al. Clinical Characteristics of Coronavirus Disease

2019 in China. N Engl J Med. 2020;382(18):1708-1720.

doi:10.1056/NEJMoa2002032

[3] Jiang F, Deng L, Zhang L, Cai Y, Cheung CW, Xia Z. Review of the Clinical

Characteristics of Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19). J Gen Intern Med.

2020;35(5):1545-1549. doi:10.1007/s11606-020-05762-w

[4] Tenforde MW, Kim SS, Lindsell CJ, et al. Symptom Duration and Risk Factors

for Delayed Return to Usual Health Among Outpatients with COVID-19 in a

Multistate Health Care Systems Network - United States, March-June

2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2020;69(30):993-998. Published 2020

Jul 31. doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm6930e1

[5] Carfì A, Bernabei R, Landi F; Gemelli Against COVID-19 Post-Acute Care Study

Group. Persistent Symptoms in Patients After Acute COVID-19. JAMA.

2020;324(6):603-605. doi:10.1001/jama.2020.12603

[6] Rothan HA, Byrareddy SN. The epidemiology and pathogenesis of coronavirus

disease (COVID-19) outbreak. J Autoimmun. 2020;109:102433.

doi:10.1016/j.jaut.2020.102433

[7] Pan L, Mu M, Yang P, et al. Clinical Characteristics of COVID-19 Patients With

Digestive Symptoms in Hubei, China: A Descriptive, Cross-Sectional,

Multicenter Study. Am J Gastroenterol. 2020;115(5):766-773.

doi:10.14309/ajg.0000000000000620

[8] Larsen JR, Martin MR, Martin JD, Kuhn P, Hicks JB. Modeling the Onset of

Symptoms of COVID-19. Front Public Health. 2020;8:473. Published 2020 Aug

13. doi:10.3389/fpubh.2020.00473

[9] Speth MM, Singer-Cornelius T, Oberle M, Gengler I, Brockmeier SJ, Sedaghat

AR. Olfactory Dysfunction and Sinonasal Symptomatology in COVID-19:

Prevalence, Severity, Timing, and Associated Characteristics. Otolaryngol Head

Neck Surg. 2020;163(1):114-120. doi:10.1177/0194599820929185

[10] Karni N, Klein H, Asseo K, et al. Self-rated smell ability enables highly specific

predictors of COVID-19 status: a case control study in Israel. Preprint.

medRxiv. 2020;2020.07.30.20164327. Published 2020 Aug 01.

doi:10.1101/2020.07.30.20164327

[11] Parma V, Ohla K, Veldhuizen MG, et al. More than smell - COVID-19 is

associated with severe impairment of smell, taste, and chemesthesis

[published online ahead of print, 2020 Jun 20]. Chem Senses. 2020;bjaa041.

doi:10.1093/chemse/bjaa041

[12] Gerkin RC, Ohla K, Veldhuizen MG, et al. Recent smell loss is the best predictor

of COVID-19: a preregistered, cross-sectional study. Preprint. medRxiv.

2020;2020.07.22.20157263. Published 2020 Jul 26.

doi:10.1101/2020.07.22.20157263

[13] Spinato G, Fabbris C, Polesel J, et al. Alterations in Smell or Taste in Mildly

Symptomatic Outpatients With SARS-CoV-2 Infection. JAMA.

2020;323(20):2089-2090. doi:10.1001/jama.2020.6771

[14] Sakalli E, Temirbekov D, Bayri E, Alis EE, Erdurak SC, Bayraktaroglu M. Ear nose

370   throat-related symptoms with a focus on loss of smell and/or taste in COVID-

371   19 patients [published online ahead of print, 2020 Jun 23]. Am J Otolaryngol.

372   2020;41(6):102622. doi:10.1016/j.amjoto.2020.102622

373   [15] Gorzkowski V, Bevilacqua S, Charmillon A, et al. Evolution of Olfactory

374   Disorders in COVID-19 Patients [published online ahead of print, 2020 Jul

375   2]. Laryngoscope. 2020;10.1002/lary.28957. doi:10.1002/lary.28957

376   [16] Yan CH, Prajapati DP, Ritter ML, DeConde AS. Persistent Smell Loss Following

377   Undetectable SARS-CoV-2 [published online ahead of print, 2020 Jun

378   9]. Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg. 2020;194599820934769.

379   doi:10.1177/0194599820934769

380   [17] Li LQ, Huang T, Wang YQ, et al. COVID-19 patients' clinical characteristics,

381   discharge rate, and fatality rate of meta-analysis. J Med Virol. 2020;92(6):577-

382   583. doi:10.1002/jmv.25757

383   [18] Zhu J, Ji P, Pang J, et al. Clinical characteristics of 3062 COVID-19 patients: A

384   meta-analysis [published online ahead of print, 2020 Apr 15]. J Med Virol.

385   2020;10.1002/jmv.25884. doi:10.1002/jmv.25884

386   [19] Lee Y, Min P, Lee S, Kim SW. Prevalence and Duration of Acute Loss of Smell or

387   Taste in COVID-19 Patients. J Korean Med Sci. 2020;35(18):e174. Published

388   2020 May 11. doi:10.3346/jkms.2020.35.e174

389   [20] Greenhalgh T, Knight M, A'Court C, Buxton M, Husain L. Management of post-

390   acute covid-19 in primary care. BMJ. 2020;370:m3026. Published 2020 Aug 11.

391   doi:10.1136/bmj.m3026

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CDC - Centers for Disease Control and Prevention

SARS-CoV-2 - Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2

SD - Standard Deviation

GCCR - Global Consortium for Chemosensory Research

RT-PCR – Real Time Polymerase Chain Reaction

URI -Upper Respiratory tract Infections

Ethics approval

402   The study was conducted in accordance with Helsinki committee and the required

403   ethics approval was granted (reference number HMO-0236-20).

Ethics, consent, and permissions

406   Written informed consents for publication of patients' clinical details were obtained

407   from the patients

TRANSPARECY DECLARATION

Competing interests

411   The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Funding

MYN is supported by Israel Science Foundation (ISF) grant #1129/19. HK is a recipient

of the Uri Zehavi Scholarship.

Acknowledgements

We thank the Global Consortium for Chemosensory Research (GCCR) team for

inspiring the questionnaire used in this research. We thank Yehuda Tarnovsky for help

with patient's recruitment.