Productivity loss associated with physical impairment in a contemporary small-scale subsistence population

Jonathan Stieglitz[a,b*], Paul L. Hooper[c], Benjamin C. Trumble[d,e], Hillard Kaplan[c], Michael D. Gurven[f]

*Corresponding author, at the following postal address:
Institute for Advanced Study in Toulouse
1 esplanade de l'Université
T.470
31080 Toulouse Cedex 06, France
Phone: +33 6 24 54 30 57
E-mail: jonathan.stieglitz@iast.fr

Author affiliations:
[a]Université Toulouse 1 Capitole, 1 esplanade de l'Université, 31080 Toulouse Cedex 06, France
[b]Institute for Advanced Study in Toulouse, 1 esplanade de l'Université, 31080 Toulouse Cedex 06, France
[c]Economic Science Institute, Chapman University, 1 University Drive, Orange, CA, 92866, USA
[d]Center for Evolution and Medicine, Life Sciences C, 427 East Tyler Mall, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, 85281, USA
[e]School of Human Evolution and Social Change, 900 South Cady Mall, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, 85281, USA
[f]Department of Anthropology, University of California, Santa Barbara, CA, 93106, USA

Acknowledgements
We thank the Tsimane for participating and THLHP personnel for collecting and coding data.
We also thank the HORUS Study Team for assistance with CT data collection. Amélie Beaudet,
Susan Pfeiffer, George Perry and an anonymous reviewer provided useful comments that
improved the quality of the manuscript. Bone strength estimates used in this study were
generated under the supervision of Matthew Budoff. Funding was provided by the National
Institutes of Health/National Institute on Aging (R01AG024119), National Science Foundation
(1748282), the Center for Evolutionary Medicine at Arizona State University, and the University
of California-Santa Barbara Academic Senate. JS acknowledges IAST funding from the French
National Research Agency (ANR) under the Investments for the Future (Investissements
d'Avenir) program, grant ANR-17-EURE-0010. Funding sources had no role in research
conduct, study design or article preparation.

Abstract

Humans experience unique physical impairments with potentially severe economic consequences. Quantifying the burden of impairment in subsistence populations is critical for understanding selection pressures underlying strategies that minimize risk of production deficits. We examine among forager-horticulturalists whether compromised bone strength (indicated by vertebral fracture and lower bone mineral density, BMD) is associated with diminished subsistence involvement. We estimate the magnitude of productivity losses associated with compromised bone strength. Fracture is associated with cessation of hunting, tree chopping and walking long distances, but not tool manufacture. Age-specific productivity losses from hunting cessation related to fracture and lower BMD are substantial: ~397 lost kcals/day, with expected future losses of up to 1.88 million kcals (22% of expected production). Productivity loss is thus substantial for high strength and endurance tasks. Determining the extent to which impairment obstructs productivity in contemporary subsistence populations improves the ability to infer consequences of impairment over human evolution.

Keywords: Physical impairment, skeletal gracility, life history theory, vertebral fracture, bone mineral density, Tsimane

1. Introduction

As the longest living and slowest growing primate, humans experience unique physical impairments with potentially severe economic and social consequences. Human hunter-gatherers have lower adult mortality than chimpanzees and a significant post-reproductive lifespan (Gurven and Kaplan 2007; Hill et al. 2007; Kaplan et al. 2010; Kaplan et al. 2000; Wood et al. 2017), which generates ample opportunity for incident degenerative disease and dysfunction (Finch 2010). Evidence at least 2 mya of greater dietary reliance by hominins on difficult-to-acquire resources including hunted game (Aiello and Wheeler 1995; Antón et al. 2014; Thompson et al. 2019; Ungar 2012) suggests delayed peak skill acquisition in adulthood (Gurven et al. 2006; Kaplan et al. 2000; Koster et al. 2019; Walker et al. 2002), possibly when physical senescence is already underway. Adult physical impairment (hereafter API) of degenerative origin thus has the potential to hinder hominin foraging in costly ways. These costs amplify if API hinders resource transfers or provisioning of other assistance, given their potential fitness impacts (Gurven et al. 2012; Hawkes 2003; Hill and Hurtado 2009; Hooper et al. 2015; Marlowe 2003; Schniter et al. 2018; Wood and Marlowe 2013). The ubiquity among hunter-gatherers to form social groups of clusters of multi-generational resource-pooling units (Kaplan et al. 2009; Migliano et al. 2017), and in base camps at least ~400 kya (Kuhn and Stiner 2019), may reflect a species-typical strategy of complex cooperation to minimize daily risks, including production shortfalls. Quantifying the burden of API in terms of productivity loss in extant small-scale subsistence populations is thus critical for understanding the strength of selection pressures for cooperative strategies that minimize risks associated with disability.

Skeletal evidence indicates that API of degenerative origin was not uncommon throughout hominin evolution, and that API likely interfered with activities essential for survival

and reproduction (e.g. bipedal locomotion, food acquisition, load carrying). For example, marked

thoracic kyphosis and vertebral disc degeneration are evident in *Australopithecus afarensis* (AL-

288) from ~3.2 mya (Cook et al. 1983), as is spondylolisthesis in middle Pleistocene humans

(SH-1) from ~430 kya ((Bonmatí et al. 2010); also see (Trinkaus 2018)). These ailments

regularly cause lower back pain, difficulty walking, and carrying or lifting objects among

modern clinical patients, who may provide indirect insight into API-related consequences in past

hominin populations. Given the variability across hominin species in terms of environmental

exposures, diet, life history traits (e.g. lifespan), morphology (e.g. body and brain size) and

locomotion from ~4 mya until 40 kya (Wood and K. Boyle 2016), whether and how these

ailments hindered survival and reproduction is unclear, and not readily discernable from any

single hominin species.

Joint behavioral and epidemiological study of contemporary small-scale subsistence

populations suggests that diverse ailments of degenerative or other etiology hinder resource

production and transfers. Among Yora forager-horticulturalists of Peru, men are unable to forage

due to illness or injury on 11% of all days (Sugiyama and Chacon 2000). Among Shiwiar

forager-horticulturalists of Ecuador, ~90% of individuals experience an ailment (e.g. chronic

pain, fracture, laceration, infection, animal bite or sting, burn) severe enough to interfere with

subsistence work for ≥2 weeks, and >60% experience API for ≥1 month; suspected bone

fractures – a focus of the current study – are more likely than other ailments to cause prolonged

disability (Sugiyama 2004). Among Tsimane forager-horticulturalists of Bolivia, the population

studied here, 75% of adults report being bedridden due to illness or injury at least once in the

three months prior to survey, and Tsimane are incapacitated on about 10% of all days (Gurven et

al. 2012). The fact that these studies include both younger and older adults (aged 20+ years)

indicates that prolonged API is not conditional on reaching advanced ages.

Despite diverse sources of evidence suggesting that API may be widespread and carry

important consequence, studies of contemporary small-scale subsistence populations are limited:

they rely mainly on self-reports and thus cannot identify objective, specific somatic impairments

associated with diminished subsistence effort; they utilize crude measures of subsistence

involvement (e.g. able to work or not) and thus cannot quantify the magnitude of productivity

loss or ascertain the range of subsistence behaviors associated with API; and they often rely on

small sample sizes of adults, including adults in their peak productive years. Precise assessment

of the economic burden of API and compensatory strategies to mitigate API-related productivity

loss is important in light of the comparatively low mortality rates characteristic of human life

histories (Gurven and Kaplan 2007). Studies of contemporary small-scale subsistence

populations can thus complement bio-archaeological and paleoanthropological studies for

understanding factors affecting foraging behavior and social organization in past hominin

populations.

Hominin social organization in multi-generational, multi-layered cooperative units are

believed to be a necessary precursor for lowering mortality rates (Bird et al. 2019; Hawkes et al.

1998; Hill et al. 2007; Isaac 1978; Kaplan et al. 2000; Washburn and Lancaster 1968b). The fact

that many subsistence skills require cumulative knowledge that is often transmitted from older to

younger generations implies that physically impaired adults can maintain "fitness value," despite

compromised ability to produce and transfer resources. How API may have influenced behavior

of impaired adults themselves and co-resident individuals is unclear. Some anthropologists have

interpreted human skeletal remains showing API as evidence of compassion and morality of

group members, who presumably would have had to support the impaired (see (Dettwyler 1991)

and references therein; (Tilley 2015)). This interpretation is contentious but supported by

observations of modern hunter-gatherers frequently sharing food with impaired adults (e.g.

Gurven et al. 2000). Ethnographic reports of death-hastening behaviors among frail elders (e.g.

abandonment), who themselves may advocate such behaviors (e.g. (Balikci 1970)), suggests that

decisions to support the impaired may be complex and influenced in part by their expected future

productivity. Quantifying the economic costs of API is therefore critical for understanding the

extent of cooperation that must have co-evolved with hominin life history traits.

Here we examine among Tsimane adults whether a specific morphological characteristic

which may indicate physical impairment, i.e. compromised bone strength, is indeed associated

with diminished participation in routine subsistence tasks. We utilize thoracic computed

tomography (CT) to measure two primary indicators of bone strength in thoracic vertebral

bodies: bone mineral density (BMD), which accounts for ~70% of the variance in bone strength

(NIH Consensus Development Panel on Osteoporosis Prevention 2001), and fracture presence

and severity. We focus on thoracic vertebrae for several reasons. Thoracic vertebral deformity is

regularly observed in diverse hominin skeletal samples (Chapman 1972; Cook et al. 1983;

Dequeker et al. 1997; Foldes et al. 1995; Gresky et al. 2016; Lieverse et al. 2007; Mays 1996;

Trinkaus 1985). Thoracic vertebral fractures are also among the most common fragility fractures

in modern humans (Sambrook and Cooper 2006), and are more common among Tsimane than

matched US (Los Angeles) controls (Stieglitz et al. 2019). While other great apes experience

degenerative disease (Jurmain 2000; Lovell 1990), spontaneous vertebral fractures have not been

observed in other apes, even in individuals with severe osteopenia (Gunji et al. 2003). Bipedal

hominins are thus especially susceptible to fragility fractures of the spine (Cotter et al. 2011) and

perhaps other anatomical regions. For bipedal hominins thoracic vertebrae track mechanics of

both lower and upper limbs. Vertebral deformities are reliably associated with chronic pain and

can have serious long-lasting lifetime economic consequences. Thus, determining whether and

how compromised thoracic vertebral strength is associated with diminished productivity in an

extant small-scale subsistence population whose behavior can be directly studied improves the

ability to infer more generally the economic and potential social consequences of API for an

obligate biped reliant on extractive foraging and food sharing.

In this paper we identify economic correlates of compromised bone strength (i.e. thoracic

vertebral body fracture and lower thoracic vertebral BMD) by examining involvement in four

common tasks in foraging economies: hunting, tree chopping, tool manufacture (i.e. weaving),

and walking long distances. These four tasks were selected because of their importance in daily

subsistence and variation in strength and skill requirements. Hunting has likely been an

important source of hominin protein and fat production since early *Homo* (Aiello and Wheeler

1995; Antón et al. 2014; Wrangham and Carmody 2010), and perhaps earlier, although the

dietary availability of meat and other animal products (e.g. marrow) in the Plio-Pleistocene was

variable across space and time. Tree chopping is essential for constructing shelters and

footbridges for water crossings, hunting arboreal or burrowing prey that hide in tree trunks,

manufacturing certain tools, gathering firewood and horticultural production. Tool manufacture

and repair has long improved extractive foraging efficiency for omnivorous, manually dexterous

hominins, as suggested by the fact that Oldowan tool-using hominins absorbed energetic costs of

transporting stones for processing carcasses over long distances (>10 km) (Braun et al. 2008).

Weaving of items used for carrying diverse objects (e.g. woven bags that store hunted game) and

for resting (e.g. ground mats) is routinely performed by women in various small-scale

subsistence populations including the Tsimane (see Figure 1). Lastly, the ability to efficiently

travel long distances is evident for bipedal hominins relative to quadrupedal apes by at least the

mid-Pliocene (Pontzer et al. 2009); long-distance travel is crucial for participating in diverse

hominin foraging tasks (e.g. hunting, fishing) and in social activities (e.g. visiting) within and

across residential settlements.

Figure 1. Tsimane women weaving bags used for carrying diverse objects (left panel; photo

credit: Jonathan Stieglitz) and ground mats used for resting (right panel; photo credit: Arnulfo

Cary). Finished woven products are also shown in each panel.

We first test whether probability of completely ceasing to perform a given task increases

with compromised bone strength. For a bipedal hominin one might expect considerable

productivity loss associated with compromised thoracic vertebral body strength, as most

activities of daily living (e.g. sitting, walking, running, lifting and even breathing) generate loads

on human vertebrae (Myers and Wilson 1997; Polga et al. 2004; Rohlmann et al. 2001; Stewart

and Hall 2006). For many common activities (e.g. neutral standing, standing with weight, mild

trunk flexion and extension, lifting objects above the head) the greatest compressive loads along

the spine are generated in the thoracolumbar region (Bruno et al. 2017). Compromised thoracic

vertebral body strength may especially curtail participation in high-strength and/or high-

endurance tasks involving greater vertebral loads, such as hunting and tree chopping;

participation in less physically demanding tasks involving reduced vertebral loads, such as

weaving, may not be strongly curtailed. To the extent that tasks requiring high levels of strength

and/or endurance are divided by sex within a population, compromised thoracic vertebral body

strength could disproportionately hinder male subsistence activities.

We next estimate the magnitude of productivity losses (i.e. lost kcals/day) from hunting

cessation associated with compromised bone strength. Productivity losses are estimated in two

ways: i) daily losses at age x; and 2) expected cumulative future losses from age x onward,

discounting future losses by mortality. Substantial cumulative future productivity losses may be

expected from vertebral body fracture because trabecular bone losses during adulthood are not

fully regained (Mosekilde 1989; Mosekilde et al. 1987). Once spinal fracture occurs it can

impede in varying degrees daily subsistence activities for the remainder of life. We focus on

hunting productivity loss given the centrality of animal-based, large-package foods to theoretical

models of hominin behavioral and life history evolution (Bird et al. 2001; Hawkes et al. 2001;

Hill and Hurtado 2009; Isaac 1978; Kaplan et al. 2000; Marlowe 2000; Washburn and Lancaster

1968a). Nevertheless, since hominins as a taxonomic group show high plasticity in life history

traits (e.g. expected adult lifespan) and diet (e.g. reliance on meat), it is possible that our

estimates of productivity loss associated with compromised bone strength better approximate

those for hominins with relatively modern life histories. In the present context, hunting

productivity losses refer to lost hunting calories from hunting cessation associated with thoracic

vertebral body fracture and/or lower thoracic vertebral BMD.

We do not assume that compromised bone strength is itself a proxy for functional

impairment or reduced productivity. Instead we posit that individuals with compromised bone

strength who are no longer able to perform specific subsistence tasks facultatively adjust their

time allocation based on various factors (e.g. phenotypic condition, household demand) to

maximize productivity. To gain insight into compensatory behavioral strategies of adults with

compromised bone strength who can no longer hunt, we compare expected productivity losses

from hunting to observed fishing production rates, as a means of ascertaining the degree of

foraging modification required to offset potential API-related energetic deficits. This exercise

provides insight into whether adults with compromised bone strength who cease hunting,

through their own behavioral modifications, can easily retain their ability to provision

themselves and kin with critical animal products in the diet, or whether provisioning by group

members or other behavioral modifications may be needed. Lastly, utilizing data on

anthropometrics and self-reported reasons for ceasing to perform specific subsistence tasks, we

examine whether compromised bone strength precedes task cessation, rather than the reverse.

2. Methods

2.1 Study population

Tsimane are semi-sedentary forager-horticulturalists inhabiting >90 villages in lowland

Bolivia. Villages are usually located along rivers or other water sources (e.g. lagoons), and are

composed of dispersed clusters of kin-related households. The household is the basic economic

unit for production and consumption, and most daily coordination is confined to the nuclear and

extended family. Tsimane hunt with a diverse toolkit that can include any/all of the following:

rifle or shotgun (but guns and ammunition are often unavailable), bow and arrow, machete,

slingshot and trap, and sometimes assistance from tracking dogs (Gurven et al. 2006). On

average men hunt about once every week or two; hunting is more common during the wet season

and in interior forest villages. Fishing typically occurs in rivers, streams or lagoons and involves

use of hook-and-line, bow and arrow, machete, plant poison and/or net. Single-day fishing and

hunting activities are mostly solitary or in pairs with siblings, sons, in-laws or age-mates. Entire

families sometimes go on multi-day fishing and hunting trips that can last from two days to

several months. Food sharing is widespread within extended families, but also limited in scope

across families. Kinship and relative need largely determine the magnitude and direction of food

transfers (Gurven et al. 2012; Hooper et al. 2015).

Much of the protein and fat consumed by Tsimane come from hunting and fishing (Kraft

et al. 2018). Most (62%) of the total calories in the diet come from cultigens grown in small

swiddens. Women's physical activity level (PAL; defined as the ratio of total daily energy

expenditure to daily basal metabolism) is in the 'moderate to active' range (PAL=1.7–1.9) and is

constant throughout adulthood. Men's PAL is 'vigorously active' (PAL=2.0–2.2), and declines

by 10–20% from the peak (in the late 20s) to older adulthood (age 60+ years) (Gurven et al.

2013).

Physical strength peaks in the mid to late 20s, then declines continuously thereafter,

reaching ~60% of maximum adult capacity by age 70 (Gurven et al. 2006). Impaired

musculoskeletal function is not uncommon among Tsimane adults. BMD estimates from the

axial and appendicular skeleton – particularly sites rich in trabecular bone (i.e. thoracic

vertebrae, calcaneus and distal radius) – suggest that osteoporosis is not uncommon, especially

for post-menopausal women (Stieglitz et al. 2015a; Stieglitz et al. 2016; Stieglitz et al. 2017;

Stieglitz et al. 2019). Early and rapid reproduction may contribute to female skeletal fragility

later in life. Compared to more sedentary Los Angeles matched controls, age-standardized

prevalence of thoracic vertebral fracture is two times higher for Tsimane women and 3.3 times

higher for men using directly comparable CT methods (Stieglitz et al. 2019). For adults age 50+,

38% experience some movement restriction (e.g. during flexion or extension), most commonly

in the dorsolumbar, hip, knee or shoulder regions. Sixty-eight percent of adults age 50+ are also

clinically diagnosed with some disease of the musculoskeletal system and connective tissue (i.e.

codes M00-M99 using the International Classification of Diseases version 10) by Tsimane

Health and Life History Project (THLHP) physicians. By age 70 most adults report at least some

physical discomfort during activities of daily living (e.g. bathing).

2.2. Study design and participants

The Tsimane thoracic CT sample used to measure thoracic vertebral BMD and fracture

presence and severity includes all individuals who met the inclusion criteria of self-identifying as

Tsimane and who were age 40+ at study enrollment (mean±SD age=55.9±9.9, age range: 41-91

years, 48% female, n=493) (see Appendix for additional details and Appendix 1-Table S1 for

descriptives of study variables). Younger adults (<40 years old) were excluded because CT scans

were performed as part of a broader project on atherosclerosis, including arterial plaque

formation, which is usually negligible at younger ages for physically active adults. No Tsimane

was excluded based on any health condition that can affect BMD or fracture risk.

290   Institutional IRB approval was granted by UNM (HRRC # 07–157) and UCSB (# 3-16-

291   0766), as was informed consent at three levels: (1) Tsimane government that oversees research

292   projects, (2) village leadership, and (3) study participants.

294   *2.3. Thoracic computed tomography (CT)*

295   Thoracic CT scans were performed at the Hospital Presidente German Busch in Trinidad,

Bolivia using a 16-detector row scanner (GE Brightspeed, Milwaukee, WI, USA). A licensed

radiology technician acquired a single non-contrast thoracic scan, which was supervised and

reviewed by at least one of the HORUS study team cardiologists and radiologists with whom we

collaborate to study cardiovascular functioning (Kaplan et al. 2017). Breath-hold instructions

were given in the Tsimane language to minimize respiratory motion artifact and misregistration.

CT settings were: 250 ms exposure, 2.5 mm slice thickness, 0.5 s rotation speed, 120 kVp, and

40 mA (see (Kaplan et al. 2017; Stieglitz et al. 2019) for additional details).

2.4. Thoracic vertebral bone mineral density (BMD)

305   CT-derived vertebral BMD estimates are highly accurate and strongly positively

correlated (Pearson r's >0.9) with ash weight of dry bone (Ho et al. 1990; Reinbold et al. 1991).

Thoracic vertebral BMD was measured manually in each of three consecutive vertebrae (T7-T10

range) by a radiologist with 20+ years of experience (see Appendix for additional details).

Lumbar vertebrae were not assessed as they did not appear in the CT image field of view. BMD

measurement started at the level of the section that contained the left main coronary artery

(LMCA) caudally (beginning at either T7 or T8, depending on the origin of the LMCA). The

LMCA was set as the reference site to allow reproducible detection of a spinal level; because the

LMCA is covered in 100% of images and the field of view can be completely reconstructed, it is

an optimal reference point to locate the starting measurement level. The LMCA has previously

been found to originate at T7 about as frequently as T8 (Budoff et al. 2010).

The center of the region of interest was located at the center of each vertebrae, with a 2–3

mm distance from the vertebral shell. This distance ensured that BMD measurements within the

vertebral body excluded the cortical bone of the vertebral shell. For each vertebra, the radiologist

manually positioned a circular region of interest while demarcating cortical from trabecular bone

based on visual inspection. Any area with large vessels, bone island fractures and calcified

herniated disks were excluded as much as possible from the region of interest with use of the

manual free tracing protocol. Mean BMD for the three consecutive thoracic vertebrae was then

calculated. This CT-derived thoracic BMD measure is strongly positively correlated (Pearson r's

>0.9) with CT-derived lumbar BMD measures (Budoff et al. 2012). CT-derived BMD estimates

can be obtained with and without calibration phantoms. Phantomless BMD estimates correlate

strongly (Pearson r=0.99) with standard phantom-based CT BMD estimates (Budoff et al. 2013).

Hounsfield units were converted to BMD (mg/cm^3) using a calibration phantom of known

density or a scanner-specific mean calibration factor for the T7-T10 vertebrae from scans

performed without the phantom.

2.5. Thoracic vertebral fracture

For the same sample the radiologist also classified seven vertebrae (T6-T12) according to

Genant's semi-quantitative technique (GST) (Genant et al. 1993). While there is no consensus

regarding the radiologic definition of vertebral fracture, the GST provides highly reproducible

diagnosis of fractures, and is currently the most widely used clinical technique for identifying

and diagnosing fracture (Shepherd et al. 2015). Based on visual inspection, each vertebra is rated

according to severity of loss of vertebral height and other qualitative features, including

alterations in shape and configuration of the vertebra relative to adjacent vertebrae and expected

normal appearances. Each vertebra is classified into one of five categories: normal (grade 0);

mild fracture (grade 1; approximately 20–25% reduction in anterior, middle, and/or posterior

vertebral height, and a 10–20% reduction in projected vertebral area); moderate fracture (grade

2; 25–40% reduction in any height and a 20–40% reduction in area); and severe fracture (grade

3; >40% reduction in any height and area). A grade 0.5 indicates borderline deformed vertebra

(<20% reduction in any height) that is not considered to be a definitive fracture (see Appendix

for additional details). Each subject is assigned one summary grade measure of all seven

vertebrae. Subjects with >1 vertebral deformity are classified according to their most severe

deformity. Subjects are considered to present vertebral fracture if any vertebral body is graded at

least mildly deformed (i.e. grade $\geq$1), and subjects are considered to present no fracture if graded

0 or 0.5. Nevertheless, given lower observer agreement for mild fractures (the most common)

relative to moderate and severe fractures (Lentle et al. 2018), we repeated some analyses using a

more conservative fracture definition (i.e. grade $\geq$2). Unless otherwise noted we report results

using the former definition.

2.6. Subsistence involvement and hunting productivity losses

A few days or weeks before traveling from their home villages to Trinidad for CT

scanning, participants received in their villages a medical exam from a Bolivian physician and

bilingual (Spanish-Tsimane) physician assistant from the THLHP. During the medical exam,

participants were asked whether they continued or completely ceased involvement in routine

subsistence tasks (e.g. "Do you still hunt? Have you hunted in the past few months, or have you

stopped hunting altogether?"). Participants were queried about the following four tasks: hunting

(men only), tree chopping (men only), weaving (women only), and ability to walk an entire day

(both sexes) (also see (Stieglitz et al. 2015b)). Other subsistence tasks (e.g. fishing, collecting

fruit) were omitted due to time constraints during data collection. Women were not queried about

hunting or tree chopping (nor were men about weaving) because they rarely participate in these

tasks (Gurven et al. 2009). We were able to minimize assignment of "false negatives" (i.e.

coding capable participant i as ceasing task j due to a temporary illness which only inhibited i's

involvement in j in the shorter but not longer term) by cross-checking participant response

stability over time using repeated measures from medical exams performed in other project years

(before and in a few cases after CT scanning; 98% of CT study participants received at least one

medical exam in other [i.e. non-CT scanning] project years [mean±SD number of medical

exams/participant=4±2, min=1, max=8]). Responses were generally stable within individuals

over time, resulting in very few false negatives for a given task. If a participant reported ceasing

a given task in a given year, the physician then asked whether cessation resulted from specific

functional limitations related to sensory perception (e.g. difficulty seeing or hearing), endurance

(e.g. feeling tired or weak), and mobility limitations (e.g. hip problems).

Population-level estimates of age-specific daily caloric production (total and task-specific

[e.g. hunting, fishing]) and time allocation have been published elsewhere (Gurven et al. 2012;

Gurven et al. 2009; Hooper 2011; Hooper et al. 2014; Hooper et al. 2015; Kaplan et al. 2010;

Schniter et al. 2015; Stieglitz et al. 2014). Tsimane production was estimated by interviewing

adults once or twice per week from January 2005-December 2009 about time allocation and

production for each co-resident individual over age six during the previous two days (n=1,245

individuals from 11 villages). Each family was interviewed an average of 46 times (SD=20),

yielding an average of 93 sample days per individual. Each co-resident individual contributes

production data, regardless of their BMD or fracture status (which was unknown at the time of

economic data collection); thus, from individual-level production data we cannot determine

whether adults with fracture or lower BMD have lower production efficiency (e.g. kcals/hour)

than adults without fracture or higher BMD.

To estimate men's hunting productivity losses associated with fracture and lower BMD,

we multiply men's average age-specific daily hunting production by the probability that men still

hunt at a given age. This probability that men still hunt is modeled using binary logistic

regression with the following covariates: age (years), fracture status (yes/no) and BMD (mg/cm^3;

also see Appendix). This probability thus serves as a multiplier adjusting men's average daily

hunting production for impairment associated with fracture and lower BMD. To determine

productivity loss we take the difference in estimated hunting kcals/day at each age for a given

fracture and/or BMD value. For example, if a 40 year-old produces 2,000 hunting kcals/day, and

if the probability that a 40 year-old without fracture still hunts is 0.99 (vs. 0.85 for a 40 year-old

with fracture), then the predicted hunting production is 1,980 kcals/day for a 40 year-old without

fracture (i.e. 2,000*0.99), and 1,700 kcals/day for a 40 year-old with fracture (i.e. 2,000*0.85;

productivity loss=280 hunting kcals/day). Similarly, if a 50 year-old produces 1,800 hunting

kcals/day, and if the probability that a 50 year-old without fracture still hunts is 0.9 (vs. 0.75 for

a 50 year-old with fracture), then the predicted hunting production is 1,620 kcals/day for a 50

year-old without fracture and 1,350 kcals/day for a 50 year-old with fracture (productivity

loss=270 hunting kcals/day; and 10 fewer daily lost kcals compared to age 40). We assume that

men do not resume hunting once they report ceasing (even if/when a fracture heals), and that

hunting return rates (i.e. kcals/hour hunting) are identical for men regardless of fracture status or

BMD. Since we do not assume reduced hunting efficiency for men with fracture or lower BMD,

the productivity losses reported here are probably conservative, resulting entirely from complete

hunting cessation. This hunting productivity loss is our estimate of the economic cost associated

with fracture and lower BMD. We estimate this cost in two ways: 1) daily loss at age x, as in the

prior example of a 40 and 50 year-old; and 2) expected cumulative future losses from age x

onward, discounting future losses by mortality. Conceptually, this latter value is similar to

Fisher's reproductive value (expected future reproduction at each age) but substitutes age-

specific fertility with age-specific caloric production from hunting, given Tsimane population

age structure and men's mortality rates (Gurven et al. 2012).

2.7. Socio-demographics and anthropometrics

Birth years were assigned based on a combination of methods described elsewhere (see

Appendix for additional details). Height and weight were measured during THLHP medical

exams using a Seca portable stadiometer and Tanita scale. The scale uses bioelectrical

impedance to estimate body fat percentage using proprietary estimation equations. Using weight

and percent body fat we calculated fat mass (weight*percent body fat) and fat-free mass (weight

– fat mass).

2.8. Data analysis

In descriptive analyses (section 3.1) we report fracture prevalence for each sex and test for effects of age and BMD on fracture risk using log-binomial generalized linear models. Chi-squared tests are used to compare differences in subsistence participation (e.g. whether continuing or completely ceasing hunting or tree chopping) by fracture status (sections 3.2 and 3.4-3.6). Binary logistic regression is used to model the probability of subsistence task cessation as a function of fracture status and BMD after adjusting for age. We use stepwise regression with fracture status included first, and then BMD, and we compare models based on AIC. False discovery rate (FDR) q-values were computed using the R package 'qvalue' to account for the multiple testing burden across different subsistence tasks. Parameter estimates are reported as odds ratios (ORs) or predicted probabilities.

We apply several indirect methods for assessing reverse causality, whereby ceasing task performance compromises bone strength[1] (section 3.7). First, we use chi-squared tests to compare differences by fracture status in self-reported reasons for subsistence task cessation, including deficits in sensory perception, strength, endurance and mobility. If fractures cause task cessation, then those with fractures should be more likely to report mobility limitations as a main reason for task cessation, rather than other reasons. Second, we use general linear models to compare BMD of adults who continue vs. cease task participation (adjusting for age and fat-free mass). This comparison helps determine whether adults who cease participation experience greater risk of skeletal fragility overall; one might expect no difference in risk if fracture precedes task cessation (and conversely, a difference in risk if task cessation precedes fracture). Lastly, for reasons described below, we test for a mediating effect of anthropometric status in

---

[1]We cannot determine from the CT scan or any other data when fracture occurred.

logistic regressions of task cessation on fracture status and BMD. For all analyses we use $\alpha=0.05$

as the cutoff for statistical significance (we report both p-values and FDR q-values where

relevant). Participants with any missing values are removed from analyses. Data that support the

findings of this study are available on Dryad.

3. Results

3.1. Descriptives: thoracic vertebral fracture prevalence and covariation with age and thoracic

vertebral BMD

<u>3.1.1. Men.</u> Prevalence of any thoracic vertebral fracture (i.e. grade ≥ 1; including mild, moderate

or severe) for men aged 40+ years is 36% (95% CI: 30-42) (Figure 2). Using a more conservative

fracture definition (i.e. grade ≥ 2; including only moderate or severe), men's prevalence is 11%

(95% CI: 7-15). Neither men's age nor thoracic vertebral BMD is significantly associated with

fracture risk (Figure 2), regardless of fracture grade.

Figure 2. Top: Proportion of Tsimane men with thoracic vertebral fracture (grade ≥ 1) by age,

estimated using the loess function. The shaded region shows ±1 SE, and jittered data points

represent fracture status. Bottom: scatterplot of thoracic vertebral BMD by age and fracture

status, including linear regression lines for each fracture status. N=256 men.

<u>3.1.2. Women.</u> Prevalence of any grade 1 fracture for women aged 40+ years is 19% (95% CI:

14-24) (Figure 3). Women's grade 2 fracture prevalence is 7% (95% CI: 4-10). Women's age

does not significantly predict fracture risk in univariate models, regardless of fracture grade.

BMD is inversely associated with women's fracture risk after adjusting for age (grade 1: adjusted

relative risk$_{\text{BMD per SD increase}}$=0.49, 95% CI: 0.34-0.72, p<0.001; grade 2: adjusted relative risk$_{\text{BMD}}$

$_{\text{per SD increase}}$=0.25, 95% CI: 0.11-0.57, p=0.001; also see Figure 3); in both of these models that

include BMD as a covariate, age is inversely and significantly associated with fracture risk.

Figure 3. Top: Proportion of Tsimane women with thoracic vertebral fracture (grade ≥1) by age,

estimated using the loess function. The shaded region shows ±1 SE, and jittered data points

represent fracture status. Bottom: scatterplot of thoracic vertebral BMD by age and fracture

status, including linear regression lines for each fracture status. N=237 women.

3.2. Hunting cessation is associated with thoracic vertebral fracture and, albeit weakly, with

lower BMD

Thirty-eight percent of men with fracture (grade$\geq$1[2]) ceased hunting, compared to 13%

with no fracture (Table 1). After adjusting for age, odds of hunting cessation are 7.3 times

greater (95% CI: 3.3-17.6, p<0.001, FDR q<0.001, n=256) for men with vs. without fracture

(Appendix 1-Table S3: Model 1). The association between odds of hunting cessation and fracture

increases slightly (adjusted $OR_{Fracture}$=7.4) after also including thoracic vertebral BMD as a

covariate (adjusted $OR_{BMD\ per\ SD}$=0.62, 95% CI: 0.38-0.99, p=0.054, FDR q=0.161, Appendix 1-

Table S3: Model 2).

Table 1. Percentage of men (95% CI) who completely ceased hunting by age and thoracic

vertebral fracture status.

Age category (years)	% ceased hunting with fracture	N	% ceased hunting without fracture	N
40-49	8[^] (<1-19)	26	0 (-----)	55
50-59	33[***] (17-50)	36	4 (<1-9)	56
60-69	50[^] (24-76)	18	27 (12-42)	37
70+	100[*] (-----)	12[a]	63 (36-89)	16[b]
Total	38[***] (28-48)	92	13 (8-19)	164

492 [^]p$\leq$0.1   [*]p$\leq$0.05   [**]p$\leq$0.01   [***]p$\leq$0.001 (χ^2 or Fisher's Exact Test [vs. no fracture])

493 [a]Max age=83 years (Mean$\pm$SD=75$\pm$4)

494 [b]Max age=81 years (Mean$\pm$SD=74$\pm$3)

[2]Results are similar using a more conservative fracture definition (i.e. grade$\geq$2; see Appendix 1-Table S2). Subsequently we only present results where fracture grade$\geq$1.

3.3. Hunting cessation associated with thoracic vertebral fracture and lower BMD generates substantial productivity losses

3.3.1. Fracture. Figure 4 shows men's age-specific hunting productivity by fracture status (see Appendix 1-Table S4 for raw production values and additional details). Men with fracture under-produce to a lesser extent at younger vs. older ages because of high hunting participation rates by younger men regardless of fracture status (Table 1, Appendix 1-Table S2). As hunting cessation becomes increasingly likely with age, particularly for men with fracture, daily productivity losses associated with fracture (i.e. the hunting productivity differential for men with vs. without fracture) increase until age 61, when men with fracture produce 481 fewer hunting kcals/day than men without fracture (1,007 vs. 526 kcals/day, respectively). This loss of 481 kcals/day – the equivalent of 120 grams of protein (or 53 grams of fat) – represents 19% of the mean daily per-capita energy intake for a Tsimane man that age (2,592 kcals), and 52% of the mean intake from protein and fat (919 kcals). By comparison, this loss of 481 hunting kcals/day at age 61 exceeds daily fishing production at that age by 171 kcals[3] (Figure 4). Daily hunting productivity losses associated with fracture exceed fishing productivity for 14 years, from ages 55-68 (by 29-171 kcals/day). In this same age range, based on observed age-specific return rates and time allocation, to wholly offset hunting productivity losses a Tsimane man would have to fish an additional 51-76 mins/day (e.g. from an observed 49 to an expected 125 fishing mins/day at age 61[4]; an increase of 155%). As men's hunting participation rates decline with age regardless of fracture status, hunting productivity losses associated with fracture also decline, reaching zero by age 75 (when hunting returns reach zero; Figure 4).

---

[3]Based on men's observed age-specific daily fishing production (see Methods).

[4]Assuming identical fishing return rates regardless of fracture status and BMD (see Methods).

Figure 4 also shows expected cumulative future productivity over the rest of life from a

specific age, discounting future losses by mortality. Future productivity losses associated with

fracture (i.e. the hunting productivity differential for men with vs. without fracture) peak at age

40, when men with fracture can expect to lose 1.15 million kcals over their remaining life; at that

age, this loss represents 14% of men's total future hunting production (8.49 million kcals).

Future hunting productivity losses associated with fracture exceed future fishing productivity for

16 years, from ages 49-64 (by 2-32% [or 4,772-96,419 expected cumulative future kcals]; Figure

4). In this same age range, based on the maximum observed fishing return rate[5] (420 kcals/hr at

age 49) and observed age-specific time allocation (e.g. 53 fishing mins/day at age 49), to wholly

offset future hunting productivity losses associated with fracture a Tsimane man would have to

fish an additional 258-1,780 hours (i.e. 324-2,012 additional future fishing days).

Figure 4. Top: Age-specific productivity (kcals/day) for hunting by men's fracture status, and for

fishing (all men). Bottom: expected cumulative future productivity (millions of kcals) from age x

onward, discounted by mortality, for hunting by men's fracture status, and for fishing (all men).

---

[5]We apply the maximum observed return rate to derive a conservative estimate. If instead we apply the minimum

return rate (360 kcals/hr at age 64), then to wholly offset future hunting productivity losses associated with fracture a

man would have to fish an additional 302-2,076 hours (i.e. 378-2,347 additional future fishing days).

3.3.2. Lower BMD. We now estimate additional productivity losses (again expressed as the

hunting productivity differential) associated with having lower BMD. Losses are greatest for

men with fracture and lower BMD vs. men without fracture and higher BMD (Figure 5; see

Appendix 1-Table S5 for raw production values and additional details). In this case, peak losses

at a given age (age 60: 650 kcals/day – the equivalent of 163 grams of protein [or 72 grams of

fat]) represent 25% of the mean daily per-capita energy intake for a Tsimane man that age and

70% of the mean intake from protein and fat. By comparison, this loss of 650 hunting kcals/day

at age 60 exceeds daily fishing production at that age by 333 kcals[3]. Hunting productivity losses

for men with fracture and lower BMD (vs. men without fracture and higher BMD) exceed

fishing productivity for 21 years, from ages 50-70 (by 33-335 kcals/day). In this same age range,

based on observed age-specific return rates and time allocation, to wholly offset hunting

productivity losses a Tsimane man would have to fish an additional 54-102 mins/day (e.g. from

an observed 49 to an expected 151 fishing mins/day at age 60[4]; an increase of 205%). Hunting

productivity losses are smallest for men without fracture and higher vs. lower BMD (max=136

kcals/day at age 65; see Figure 5).

Expected cumulative future losses are also greatest for men with fracture and lower BMD

vs. men without fracture and higher BMD (Figure 5). At the peak (age 40) the former are

expected to produce 1.88 million fewer future hunting kcals than the latter. At that age this loss

represents 22% of men's total future hunting production. Future hunting productivity losses for

men with fracture and lower BMD vs. men without fracture and higher BMD exceed future

fishing productivity for 28 years, from ages 40-67 (by 0.1-81% [or 1,193-383,902 expected

cumulative future kcals]). In this same age range, based on the maximum observed fishing return

rate[6] and observed age-specific time allocation, to wholly offset future hunting productivity

losses a Tsimane man would have to fish an additional 160-4,443 hours (i.e. 207-4,849

additional future fishing days).

---

[6]We apply the maximum observed return rate to derive a conservative estimate. If instead we apply the minimum

return rate, then to wholly offset future hunting productivity losses a man would have to fish an additional 202-5,594

hours (i.e. 261-6,105 additional future fishing days).

Figure 5. Top: Age-specific productivity (kcals/day) for hunting by men's fracture status and

bone mineral density (BMD), and for fishing (all men). For illustrative purposes we show daily

hunting production for men with +1 SD and -1 SD of the BMD mean. Bottom: expected

cumulative future productivity (millions of kcals) from age *x* onward, discounted by mortality,

for hunting by men's fracture status and BMD, and for fishing (all men).

3.4. Tree chopping cessation is associated with thoracic vertebral fracture but not lower BMD

Forty-six percent of men with fracture ceased chopping trees, compared to 21% with no

fracture (Table 2). After adjusting for age, odds of tree chopping cessation are 6.9 times greater

(95% CI: 3.1-16.6, p<0.001, FDR q<0.001, n=256) for men with vs. without fracture (Appendix

1-Table S6: Model 1). The association between odds of tree chopping cessation and fracture

weakens slightly (adjusted $OR_{Fracture}$=6.8) after also including thoracic vertebral BMD as a

covariate, which is not associated with tree chopping cessation (adjusted $OR_{BMD\ per\ SD}$=0.75, 95%

CI: 0.47-1.16, p=0.204, FDR q=0.306, Appendix 1-Table S6: Model 2).

Table 2. Percentage of men (95% CI) who completely ceased tree chopping by age and thoracic

vertebral fracture status.

Age category (years)	% ceased tree chopping with fracture	N	% ceased tree chopping without fracture	N
40-49	15[**] (1-30)	26	0 (-----)	55
50-59	39[***] (22-56)	36	4 (<1-9)	56
60-69	67 (43-91)	18	54 (37-71)	37
70+	100 (-----)	12[a]	81 (60-100)	16[b]
Total	46[***] (35-56)	92	21 (15-28)	164

^{p}≤0.1　*p≤0.05　**p≤0.01　***p≤0.001 (χ^2 or Fisher's Exact Test [vs. no fracture])

[a]Max age=83 years (Mean±SD=75±4)

[b]Max age=81 years (Mean±SD=74±3)

3.5. Weaving cessation is not associated with thoracic vertebral fracture but is associated, albeit

weakly, with lower BMD

Twenty percent of women with fracture ceased weaving, compared to 13% with no

fracture (Table 3). After adjusting for age, odds of weaving cessation are not significantly

associated with fracture (adjusted $OR_{Fracture}$=2.2, 95% CI: 0.8-6.4, p=0.129, FDR q=0.172,

n=237, Appendix 1-Table S7: Model 1). Weaving is the only task examined for which fracture is

not associated with compromised participation. Adding BMD as a covariate further weakens the

association between fracture and weaving cessation (adjusted $OR_{Fracture}$=1.8; adjusted $OR_{BMD\ per}$

$_{SD}$=0.51, 95% CI: 0.23-1.05, p=0.079, FDR q=0.158, Appendix 1-Table S7: Model 2).

Regardless of fracture status or BMD, all women who stopped weaving reported

experiencing problems in all bodily regions (i.e. hip, back and hands) mentioned by the

physician during medical exams, and nearly all of these women also reported visual impairment

(Appendix 1-Table S8).

Table 3. Percentage of women (95% CI) who completely ceased weaving by age and thoracic

vertebral fracture status.

Age category (years)	% ceased weaving with fracture	N	% ceased weaving without fracture	N
40-49	0 (-----)	11	0 (-----)	72
50-59	14 (<1-29)	22	5 (<1-11)	60
60-69	33 (<1-72)	9	24 (10-39)	37
70+	75 (<1-100)	4[a]	55 (32-77)	22[b]
Total	20 (8-31)	46	13 (8-17)	191

^p≤0.1   *p≤0.05   **p≤0.01   ***p≤0.001 (χ^2 or Fisher's Exact Test [vs. no fracture])

[a]Max age=91 years (Mean±SD=80±9)

[b]Max age=91 years (Mean±SD=77±6)

3.6. Restricted day range is associated with thoracic vertebral fracture and, albeit weakly, with

lower BMD

Sixty-nine percent of adults with fracture are unable to walk a full day, compared to 38%

with no fracture (Table 4). After adjusting for age and sex, odds of inability to walk all day are

8.2 times greater (95% CI: 4.8-14.5, p<0.001, FDR q<0.001, n=493) for adults with vs. without

fracture (Appendix 1-Table S9: Model 1). The association between odds of inability to walk all

day and fracture weakens slightly (adjusted $OR_{Fracture}$=7.8) after also including thoracic vertebral

BMD as a covariate (adjusted $OR_{BMD\ per\ SD}$=0.77, 95% CI: 0.57-1.03, p=0.082, FDR q=0.109,

Appendix 1-Table S9: Model 2).

Table 4. Percentage of adults (95% CI) who are unable to walk a full day by age and thoracic

vertebral fracture status.

Age category (years)	% unable to walk all day with fracture	N	% unable to walk all day without fracture	N
40-49	49[***] (32-66)	37	19 (12-26)	127
50-59	64[***] (51-77)	58	27 (19-35)	116
60-69	89[**] (76-100)	27	64 (52-75)	74
70+	100[^] (-----)	16[a]	84 (72-96)	38[b]
Total	69[***] (61-77)	138	38 (33-43)	355

[^]p≤0.1   [*]p≤0.05   [**]p≤0.01   [***]p≤0.001 (χ^2 or Fisher's Exact Test [vs. no fracture])

[a]Max age=91 years (Mean±SD=76±6)

[b]Max age=91 years (Mean±SD=76±5)

3.7. Suggestive evidence of fracture preceding task cessation, rather than the reverse

Men with fracture are more likely than men without fracture to report mobility limitations

due to hip problems as a reason for hunting and tree chopping cessation (Appendix 1-Tables

S10-11). This is noteworthy because among men who ceased hunting and tree chopping, men

with fracture are younger, on average, than men without fracture, and all else equal one expects

younger men to be *less* likely than older men to report hip problems (for men ceasing hunting:

mean age by fracture status=63 vs. 68; for men ceasing tree chopping: mean age=62 vs. 68).

Consistent with their younger age, men with fracture are less likely than men without fracture,

albeit not significantly, to report problems with endurance (i.e. feeling weak, tiring easily) or

sensory processing (i.e. auditory, visual) as reasons for hunting cessation (Appendix 1-Table

S10). It is thus less likely that men with fractures are in poorer condition more generally, and

more likely that fractures contributed to the mobility complaints that led men to stop hunting and

tree chopping. As with hunting and tree chopping, among adults who are unable to walk all day,

those with fracture are younger than those without fracture[7] (mean age=59 vs. 62).

After adjusting for age and fat-free mass, men who are no longer able to hunt, chop trees,

and walk all day do not differ in their BMD vs. men who still hunt (95% CI: -18.1 - 4.4 mg/cm^3),

chop trees (95% CI: -15.0 - 7.1 mg/cm^3) and can walk all day[8] (95% CI: -10.2 - 7.9 mg/cm^3).

This suggests that men who cease these activities do not experience greater risk of overall

skeletal fragility, which is contrary to expectation if task cessation preceded fracture. Lastly, if

---

[7]There are no differences by fracture status in self-reported reasons for inability to walk all day (see Appendix 1-Table S12).

[8]For women, inability to walk all day is associated with reduced BMD (95% CI: -25.3 - -6.1 mg/cm^3) after adjusting for age and fat-free mass.

hunting or tree chopping cessation preceded fracture (e.g. because reduced meat consumption

weakened bone structural integrity, or because muscle degeneration from task cessation reduced

bone loading and structural integrity), then one might expect anthropometric status to mediate

the association between hunting or tree chopping cessation and fracture. Yet these associations

strengthen after adjusting for anthropometrics (i.e. weight, fat-free mass and fat mass).

Anthropometric status also does not mediate the association between inability to walk all day and

fracture. Taken together, these results suggest that fracture preceded task cessation, rather than

the reverse.

4. Discussion and Conclusions

We find among adult Tsimane forager-horticulturalists that compromised bone strength --

as indicated by thoracic vertebral body fracture and lower thoracic vertebral BMD -- is

associated with diminished subsistence involvement, particularly for men. We find suggestive

evidence that fracture precedes subsistence task cessation, rather than the reverse. Compromised

bone strength is associated with diminished participation in diverse habitual subsistence tasks,

particularly those requiring high levels of strength or endurance (i.e. hunting, tree chopping,

walking long distances). In contrast, participation in less physically demanding but skill-

intensive tasks (i.e. tool manufacture/repair) is only modestly associated with bone strength.

Since strength and endurance are required to exploit the suite of resources upon which

omnivorous hominins rely, API can hinder resource production in costly ways for a

comparatively long-living, extractive foraging primate. This inference is supported by prior

studies in other contemporary small-scale populations that highlight impairments of shorter

duration (e.g. acute infection, laceration, animal bite) as constraints on productivity (Bailey

1991; Sugiyama and Chacon 2000; Sugiyama 2004). Adult skeletal fractures can entail longer-

term productivity constraints as they provoke systemic bone losses, incomplete recovery of bone

quality (especially for older adults), increased risk of future fractures and longer-term disability

(Osipov et al. 2018). As most activities of daily living generate loads on human vertebrae (Myers

and Wilson 1997; Rohlmann et al. 2001; Stewart and Hall 2006), and since for many activities

the greatest compressive loads along the spine are in the thoracolumbar region (Bruno et al.

2017), thoracic vertebral body fracture can be rather debilitating for an obligate biped even after

behavioral modifications that minimize its burden.

Ample bioarchaeological evidence of partially or fully healed fractures (e.g. (Lovejoy

and Heiple 1981; Pfeiffer 2012)), usually from excessive trauma, and developmental

abnormalities (Cowgill et al. 2015; Trinkaus 2018) suggest in past populations longer-term

survival with varying levels of disability. Fragility fractures resulting from reduced bone strength

are relatively rare in bioarchaeological studies (Agarwal 2008; Agarwal and Grynpas 1996),

even among the elderly, leading some to conclude that osteoporosis was rare or absent in past

populations (but see (Curate et al. 2010; Dequeker et al. 1997)). This and the fact that age-

specific osteoporotic fracture incidence rates appear to be increasing over time in Western

populations (Cooper et al. 2011) lends support to the notion that osteoporosis is a modern disease

(Kralick and Zemel 2020; Lieberman 2013). On the other hand, few if any bioarchaeologists

systematically study thoracic vertebral compression fractures. Accelerated bone loss with age

appears to be a basic feature of human aging in past and present populations (Aspray et al. 1996;

Kneissel et al. 1997; Mays et al. 1998; Mays 1996; Wallace et al. 2014) and has also been

documented among free-ranging chimpanzees (Gunji et al. 2003; Morbeck et al. 2002; Sumner et

al. 1989). Biased preservation of skeletal remains also contributes to the paucity of observed

fragility fractures in the archaeological record.

Tsimane thoracic vertebral fractures appear to result from both trauma and senescence

(Stieglitz et al. 2019) and are not just prevalent among the oldest adults (Figures 2-3). Tsimane

can thus experience a significant portion of adult life with fracture. We recently reported that

Tsimane women's vertebral BMD is inversely associated with vertebral fracture risk, suggesting

a major role of compromised bone strength in precipitating fracture. For men, we suspect that

work-related trauma plays a major role in precipitating fracture due to a weak association

between BMD and fracture risk (Stieglitz et al. 2019), and our anecdotal observations of high

levels of mechanical stress on men's vertebrae from frequent heavy load carrying (e.g. of hunted

game, timber for constructing houses). This of course does not preclude a contributing role of

compromised bone strength (e.g. from micro-architectural deficiencies) in precipitating men's

fracture. Likewise, for women, trauma may also precipitate fracture; some of the greatest

compressive vertebral loads occur when weights are carried in front of the body (Bruno et al.

2017; Rohlmann et al. 2001), which is how Tsimane women routinely carry infants and toddlers.

High reproductive effort (i.e. early onset of reproduction, short interbirth intervals and high

parity) is associated with reduced bone strength for Tsimane women (Stieglitz et al. 2015a;

Stieglitz et al. 2019) and may thus constrain the ability of bone tissue to respond to mechanical

loading from a physically active lifestyle. Interpersonal violence likely does not precipitate much

fracture among men because male violence is relatively rare and generally does not result in

severe injuries when it does occur. However, intimate partner violence against women is quite

prevalent (Stieglitz et al. 2018), particularly among younger women, and may precipitate

traumatic fracture among women at diverse skeletal sites.

To more precisely identify economic costs associated with API, we estimated age-

specific energetic deficits from hunting cessation by men with compromised bone strength. An

advantage of our approach to estimating productivity loss is that it is not subject to recall

inaccuracy or subjectivity regarding the meaning of foregone production. Energetic deficits are

substantial, averaging from ages 40-74 years 261 lost hunting kcals/day for men with vs. without

fracture (Figure 4, Appendix 1-Table S4). Average production deficits are even greater for men

with both fracture and lower BMD (vs. men without fracture and higher BMD): 397 lost hunting

kcals/day, equivalent to 15% of the mean daily per-capita energy intake, and 44% of the mean

intake from protein and fat (Kraft et al. 2018) (Figure 5, Appendix 1-Table S5). By crude

comparison, adults in Western industrialized settings with musculoskeletal problems show

productivity losses of 10-15% for frequent computer users across various industries (Hagberg et

al. 2002) and up to 28% for construction workers with more physically demanding jobs

(Meerding et al. 2005). For osteoporotic adults aged 50+ years in the Netherlands, the cost of

clinical spine fracture in terms of work absenteeism exceeds 25% of the mean annual income

(Eekman et al. 2014). Tsimane age-specific energetic deficits peak in the early 60s (Figures 4-5,

Appendix 1-Tables 4-5), which is near the age at which adults achieve peak numbers of

dependent offspring and grand offspring (Gurven and Kaplan 2007). The magnitude of these

API-related costs and their timing in the life cycle can thus pose significant challenges to

meeting adult survival needs and/or providing assistance (material or other) to descendant kin.

Our results suggest that the scope of behavioral responses to compensate for productivity loss are

limited to activities with lower strength and endurance requirements (sections 3.4-3.6). Given the

ubiquity across subsistence populations of the sexual division of labor, with men typically

focusing on high strength tasks, aging women may maintain peak or near-peak subsistence

involvement with relatively minimal API-related productivity losses, despite increasing frailty

and disability.

Faced with protein and fat deficits from hunting cessation, one might expect adults with

compromised bone strength to increase time spent in other, less physically demanding food

acquisition tasks that reliably yield substitutable macronutrients. Fishing is the other major

source of protein and fat in small-scale Amazonian subsistence populations, most of whom

acquire protein more efficiently from animal- rather than plant-based foods (Hames 1989). Prior

behavioral studies of other contemporary Amazonian populations (Gurven and Kaplan 2006)

indicate a shift with age in men's time allocation away from hunting and instead towards fishing;

for both sexes fishing time allocation increases monotonically throughout adulthood. Fishing is

also an important source of protein and fat for Tsimane (Gurven et al. 2013; Hooper 2011). To

wholly offset their own hunting productivity losses, men with fracture and lower BMD would

have to considerably increase their time spent fishing (section 3.3). A perceived need by adults to

offset their own current and/or future energetic deficits (Figures 4-5) could influence residential

decisions by increasing the value of maintaining proximity to fishing locations (e.g. rivers,

lakes), particularly during periods of greater fishing efficiency (e.g. dry season). API-related

production deficits can influence economic decision-making beyond residential decisions alone

(e.g. by influencing decisions on where to forage on a given day, or where to farm). Minimizing

travel costs during food acquisition is critical in light of restricted day ranges among adults with

compromised bone strength (section 3.6), particularly women. These economic decisions also

depend on local demographics and social networks, as productivity losses can be mitigated with

the availability of substitute workers. If, for instance, able-bodied adults within the multi-

generational sharing unit can substitute for impaired adults in hunting and meat sharing, then

impaired adults may take fewer risks to acquire protein and fat compared to impaired adults who

do not reside with substitute hunters.

Our estimates of the ways in which Tsimane with compromised bone strength may

compensate for hunting productivity loss are crude for several reasons. They do not, for example,

consider the possibility of adults being provisioned by others, or pursuing other means of protein

and fat acquisition beyond fishing. Tsimane can pursue other low-intensity subsistence tasks

such as horticulture (e.g. harvesting, planting), thereby offering additional opportunities for

adults to produce and transfer resources outside of a strict hunting and gathering economy. Our

crude estimates nevertheless imply that productivity losses require behavioral modifications and

affect social organization more broadly. The multi-generational production and sharing units that

structure human sociality (Bird et al. 2019; Isaac 1978; Migliano et al. 2017; Washburn and

Lancaster 1968b) incorporate divisions of labor whereby impaired adults can still make valuable

contributions beyond food acquisition (e.g. through conflict mediation, pedagogy, leadership).

Older adults play an important fitness-enhancing role not just by providing caloric surpluses and

transfers, but also by providing childcare, skills and knowledge, and other resources. Tsimane

cognitive function is generally well preserved throughout adulthood among both schooled and

non-schooled adults (Gurven et al. 2017), consistent with a late-life service niche emphasizing

vertical information transmission of accumulated wisdom, experience and judgment. Aging

Tsimane adults, despite their declining physical abilities, are regularly consulted and respected

for their knowledge of the natural and spiritual world (e.g. profitable hunting locations, proper

ethics), family lineage histories and past events, healing sick group members, making household

crafts, and traditional stories and music (Schniter et al. 2015; Schniter et al. 2018). Aging adults

accommodate their changing roles within the family and society and gradually compensate for

their increasing physical frailty by providing valuable expertise across diverse skill- and

knowledge-intensive domains that facilitate achieving the childrearing and subsistence goals of

the residential group (cf. (Levitin 2020)).

The extent to which our results generalize across time and space depends on various

considerations including rates of mortality and senescence, subsistence ecology (e.g. reliance on

hunted versus other foods), age profiles of production, and API prevalence and its economic

burden. Extensive longevity may be a novel life history feature of modern *H. sapiens* that was

absent among prior hominin species; extant hunter-gatherers with relatively minimal

acculturation exhibit a modal adult lifespan of 68–78 years (Gurven and Kaplan 2007). It is thus

possible that our estimates of API-related productivity loss are more relevant for understanding

lifeways of past hominin populations with more similar life histories as modern *H. sapiens* and

perhaps some archaic humans (e.g. *H. heidelbergensis*), but less applicable to Lower Paleolithic

and earlier hominins with shorter adult lifespans. Whether lifespans were too short for some

fossil hominins to expect significant post-reproductive longevity is vigorously debated (see

(Gurven and Kaplan 2007; Hawkes 2003; Hill et al. 2007) and references therein). One study

using dental-wear seriation and relative macro-age categories (ratio of old to young)

demonstrated an increase in the relative presence of older adults from Australopithecines to early

Homo and Early Upper Paleolithic humans ((Caspari and Lee 2004); but see (Minichillo 2005)).

Re-estimation of several paleo-mortality curves based on hazard analysis and maximum

likelihood methods shows a life course pattern more similar to that of modern human hunter-

gatherers than previous methods (Konigsberg and Herrmann 2006). Development of reliable

paleo-demographic reconstructions of hominin life histories (e.g. see (DeWitte and Stojanowski

2015) are critical for determining generalizability of the results presented here. Moreover, API-

related productivity losses could vary given variation in ancestral hominin vertebral morphology

that can affect interpretation of results based on Genant's semi-quantitative technique (cf.

(Trinkaus 2018)).

To conclude, in comparative cross-species perspective, modern human life histories are

characterized by delayed peak hunting efficiency (e.g. (Kaplan 1994; Kaplan 1997; Koster et al.

2019; Walker et al. 2002)), complex cooperative strategies to produce and rear altricial, slow-

growing offspring (e.g. (Hawkes 2003; Kaplan and Hill 1985; Richerson and Boyd 2008; Wood

and Marlowe 2013)), low adult mortality rate (e.g. (Hill et al. 2001; Wood et al. 2017)) and long

post-reproductive lifespan (e.g. (Emery Thompson et al. 2007; Gurven and Kaplan 2007;

Hawkes et al. 1998; Kaplan et al. 2010)). Energetic transfers from older to younger generations

help mitigate risk of production deficits in a skill- and strength-based extractive foraging niche

(Gurven et al. 2012; Hawkes et al. 1998; Hooper et al. 2015; Kaplan et al. 2010). In this paper

we considered energetic deficits associated with skeletal fracture and lower BMD, which may

have constrained economic productivity and resource transfers for extended periods throughout

much of human history (Bailey 1991; Gurven et al. 2000; Lambert and Welker 2017; Sugiyama

2004). Perhaps not surprisingly, Ache hunters cite the fear of disability as an important reason

why they willingly conform to band-wide conventions of need-based food sharing (Hill and

Hurtado 2009). It has been proposed that individuals may have survived periods of prolonged

disability only via costly provisioning and care by others (Gurven et al. 2000; Sugiyama and

Chacon 2000), although the extent to which others adjust their time allocation, food production

and sharing to compensate for API-related productivity loss is beyond the scope of the present

study. Nevertheless, our findings suggest that API can obstruct habitual subsistence efforts in

important ways. Our findings also suggest that older adults can maintain "reproductive value"

(sensu (Fisher 1930)) by pursuing skill-intensive, less physically demanding tasks (e.g. tool

manufacture and repair, fishing, pedagogy, conflict mediation, childcare, storytelling) in which

they have a comparative advantage relative to younger adults (Gurven and Kaplan 2006;

Schniter et al. 2018). In small-scale subsistence societies many older adults serve as "walking

libraries" of accumulated knowledge, which might reflect a history of selection against

significant post-reproductive cognitive decline given the fitness value of such knowledge.

Vertebral deformities are regularly observed in diverse hominin skeletal samples yet the

social and behavioral implications of these deformities remain obscure. In the absence of direct

evidence of API-related productivity loss in the fossil record, bone properties may represent a

potential proxy for inferring behavioral consequences of skeletal deformity in prior hominin

populations. Quantification of microstructural variation in the appendicular and axial skeleton of

fossil hominins may indeed provide evidence for inferring foraging behavior, as detailed in the

present study. While our ability to make inferences about the past using data collected in

contemporary populations is limited, studies of contemporary small-scale subsistence

populations like the Tsimane can offer a unique opportunity to examine consequences of skeletal

deformity in a population-representative adult sample. The present study provides a framework

for interpreting potential signals identified in the fossil record; while this study is narrowly

focused on specific morphological characteristics, it can nonetheless be an exemplar for future

ethno-archaeological inquiry into the economic and social consequences of disability in past

human populations.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

References

Agarwal S. 2008. Light and Broken Bones: Examining and Interpreting Bone Loss and

Osteoporosis in Past Populations. In: Katzenberg M, and Saunders S, editors. Biological

Anthropology of the Human Skeleton. Hoboken, New Jersey: Wiley. p 387-410.

Agarwal SC, and Grynpas MD. 1996. Bone quantity and quality in past populations. Anat Rec

246(4):423-432.

Aiello LC, and Wheeler P. 1995. The Expensive-Tissue Hypothesis: The Brain and the Digestive

System in Human and Primate Evolution. Current Anthropology 36(2):199-221.

Antón SC, Potts R, and Aiello LC. 2014. Evolution of early Homo: An integrated

biological perspective. Science 345(6192):1236828.

Aspray TJ, Prentice A, Cole TJ, Sawo Y, Reeve J, and Francis RM. 1996. Low bone mineral

content is common but osteoporotic fractures are rare in elderly rural Gambian women. J

Bone Miner Res 11(7):1019-1025.

Bailey R. 1991. The Behavioral Ecology of Efe Pygmy Men in the Ituri Forest, Zaire. Ann

Arbor: Museum of Anthropology, University of Michigan.

Balikci A. 1970. The Netsilik Eskimo. New York: Natural History Press.

Bird DW, Bird RB, Codding BF, and Zeanah DW. 2019. Variability in the organization and size

of hunter-gatherer groups: Foragers do not live in small-scale societies. Journal of Human

Evolution 131:96-108.

Bird RB, Smith E, and Bird DW. 2001. The hunting handicap: costly signaling in human

foraging strategies. Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology 50(1):9-19.

Bonmatí A, Gómez-Olivencia A, Arsuaga J-L, Carretero JM, Gracia A, Martínez I, Lorenzo C,

Bérmudez de Castro JM, and Carbonell E. 2010. Middle Pleistocene lower back and

pelvis from an aged human individual from the Sima de los Huesos site, Spain.

Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 107(43):18386-18391.

Braun DR, Plummer T, Ditchfield P, Ferraro JV, Maina D, Bishop LC, and Potts R. 2008.

Oldowan behavior and raw material transport: perspectives from the Kanjera Formation.

Journal of Archaeological Science 35(8):2329-2345.

Bruno AG, Burkhart K, Allaire B, Anderson DE, and Bouxsein ML. 2017. Spinal Loading

Patterns From Biomechanical Modeling Explain the High Incidence of Vertebral

Fractures in the Thoracolumbar Region. J Bone Miner Res 32(6):1282-1290.

Budoff MJ, Hamirani YS, Gao YL, Ismaeel H, Flores FR, Child J, Carson S, Nee JN, and Mao

S. 2010. Measurement of thoracic bone mineral density with quantitative CT. Radiology

257(2):434-440.

Budoff MJ, Khairallah W, Li D, Gao YL, Ismaeel H, Flores F, Child J, Carson S, and Mao SS.

2012. Trabecular bone mineral density measurement using thoracic and lumbar

quantitative computed tomography. Academic radiology 19(2):179-183.

Budoff MJ, Malpeso JM, Zeb I, Gao YL, Li D, Choi TY, Dailing CA, and Mao SS. 2013.

Measurement of phantomless thoracic bone mineral density on coronary artery calcium

CT scans acquired with various CT scanner models. Radiology 267(3):830-836.

Caspari R, and Lee S-H. 2004. Older age becomes common late in human evolution.

Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America

101(30):10895-10900.

Chapman FH. 1972. Vertebral osteophytosis in prehistoric populations of central and southern

Mexico. Am J Phys Anthropol 36(1):31-38.

Cook DC, Buikstra JE, DeRousseau CJ, and Johanson DC. 1983. Vertebral pathology in the afar

australopithecines. Am J Phys Anthropol 60(1):83-101.

Cooper C, Cole ZA, Holroyd CR, Earl SC, Harvey NC, Dennison EM, Melton LJ, Cummings

SR, and Kanis JA. 2011. Secular trends in the incidence of hip and other osteoporotic

fractures. Osteoporos Int 22(5):1277-1288.

Cotter MM, Loomis DA, Simpson SW, Latimer B, and Hernandez CJ. 2011. Human Evolution

and Osteoporosis-Related Spinal Fractures. PLoS ONE 6(10):e26658.

Cowgill LW, Mednikova MB, Buzhilova AP, and Trinkaus E. 2015. The Sunghir 3 Upper

Paleolithic Juvenile: Pathology versus Persistence in the Paleolithic. International Journal

of Osteoarchaeology 25(2):176-187.

Curate F, Lopes C, and Cunha E. 2010. A 14th–17th century osteoporotic hip fracture from the

Santa Clara-a-Velha Convent in Coimbra (Portugal). International Journal of

Osteoarchaeology 20(5):591-596.

Dequeker J, Ortner DJ, Stix AI, Cheng XG, Brys P, and Boonen S. 1997. Hip fracture and

osteoporosis in a XIIth Dynasty female skeleton from Lisht, upper Egypt. J Bone Miner

Res 12(6):881-888.

Dettwyler KA. 1991. Can paleopathology provide evidence for "compassion"? American Journal

of Physical Anthropology 84(4):375-384.

DeWitte SN, and Stojanowski CM. 2015. The Osteological Paradox 20 Years Later: Past

Perspectives, Future Directions. Journal of Archaeological Research 23(4):397-450.

Eekman DA, ter Wee MM, Coupé VM, Erisek-Demirtas S, Kramer MH, and Lems WF. 2014.

Indirect costs account for half of the total costs of an osteoporotic fracture: a prospective

evaluation. Osteoporos Int 25(1):195-204.

Emery Thompson M, Jones JH, Pusey AE, Brewer-Marsden S, Goodall J, Marsden D,

Matsuzawa T, Nishida T, Reynolds V, and Sugiyama Y. 2007. Aging and fertility

patterns in wild chimpanzees provide insights into the evolution of menopause. Current

Biology 17(24):2150-2156.

Finch CE. 2010. Evolution of the human lifespan and diseases of aging: Roles of infection,

inflammation, and nutrition. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 107(suppl

1):1718-1724.

Fisher R. 1930. The Genetical Theory of Natural Selection. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Foldes AJ, Moscovici A, Popovtzer MM, Mogle P, Urman D, and Zias J. 1995. Extreme

osteoporosis in a sixth century skeleton from the Negev desert. International Journal of

Osteoarchaeology 5(2):157-162.

Genant HK, Wu CY, van Kuijk C, and Nevitt MC. 1993. Vertebral fracture assessment using a

semiquantitative technique. Journal of Bone and Mineral Research 8(9):1137-1148.

Gresky J, Wagner M, Schmidt-Schultz TH, Schwarz L, Wu X, Aisha A, Tarasov PE, and Schultz

M. 2016. 'You must keep going' – Musculoskeletal system stress indicators of prehistoric

mobile pastoralists in Western China. Quaternary International 405:186-199.

Gunji H, Hosaka K, Huffman MA, Kawanaka K, Matsumoto-Oda A, Hamada Y, and Nishida T.

2003. Extraordinarily low bone mineral density in an old female chimpanzee (Pan

troglodytes schweinfurthii) from the Mahale Mountains National Park. Primates

44(2):145-149.

Gurven M, Allen-Arave W, Hill K, and Hurtado M. 2000. "It's a Wonderful Life": signaling

generosity among the Ache of Paraguay. Evolution and Human Behavior 21(4):263-282.

Gurven M, Fuerstenberg E, Trumble B, Stieglitz J, Davis H, and Kaplan H. 2017. Cognitive

performance across the life course among Bolivian forager-farmers with limited

schooling. Developmental Psychology.

Gurven M, Jaeggi AV, Kaplan H, and Cummings D. 2013. Physical Activity and Modernization

among Bolivian Amerindians. Plos One 8(1):e55679.

Gurven M, and Kaplan H. 2006. Determinants of time allocation across the lifespan: A

theoretical model and an application to the Machiguenga and Piro of Peru. Human Nature

17:1 - 49.

Gurven M, and Kaplan H. 2007. Longevity Among Hunter-Gatherers: A Cross-Cultural

Examination. Population and Development Review 33(2):321-365.

Gurven M, Kaplan H, and Gutierrez M. 2006. How long does it take to become a proficient

hunter? Implications for the evolution of extended development and long life span.

Journal of Human Evolution 51:454 - 470.

Gurven M, Stieglitz J, Hooper PL, Gomes C, and Kaplan H. 2012. From the womb to the tomb:

The role of transfers in shaping the evolved human life history. Experimental

Gerontology 47:807-813.

Gurven M, Winking J, Kaplan H, Von Rueden C, and McAllister L. 2009. A bioeconomic

approach to marriage and the sexual division of labor. Human Nature 20(2):151-183.

Hagberg M, Tornqvist EW, and Toomingas A. 2002. Self-reported reduced productivity due to

musculoskeletal symptoms: associations with workplace and individual factors among

white-collar computer users. Journal of occupational rehabilitation 12(3):151-162.

Hames R. 1989. Time, efficiency, and fitness in the Amazonian protein quest. Research in

Economic Anthropology 11:43-85.

Hawkes K. 2003. Grandmothers and the evolution of human longevity. American Journal of

Human Biology 15:380 - 400.

Hawkes K, O'Connell J, and Blurton Jones N. 2001. Hunting and nuclear families: Some lessons

from the Hadza about men's work. Current Anthropology 42:681 - 709.

Hawkes K, O'Connell J, Blurton Jones N, Alvarez H, and Charnov E. 1998. Grandmothering,

menopause, and the evolution of human life histories. Proceedings of the National

Academy of Sciences 95:1336 - 1339.

Hill K, Boesch C, Goodall J, Pusey A, Williams J, and Wrangham R. 2001. Mortality rates

among wild chimpanzees. J Hum Evol 40(5):437-450.

Hill K, and Hurtado AM. 2009. Cooperative breeding in South American hunter–gatherers.

Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 276(1674):3863-3870.

Hill K, Hurtado AM, and Walker RS. 2007. High adult mortality among Hiwi hunter-gatherers:

implications for human evolution. J Hum Evol 52(4):443-454.

Ho C, Kim R, Schaffler M, and Sartoris D. 1990. Accuracy of dual-energy radiographic

absorptiometry of the lumbar spine: cadaver study. Radiology 176(1):171-173.

Hooper P. 2011. The structure of energy production and redistribution among Tsimane' forager-

horticulturalists. [Ph.D. dissertation]. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico.

Hooper P, Gurven M, and Kaplan H. 2014. Social Underpinnings of Human Biodemography.

Advances in Biodemography: Cross-Species Comparisons of Social Environments and

Social Behaviors, and their Effects on Health and Longevity. Washington, D.C.: National

Academy Press.

Hooper PL, Gurven M, Winking J, and Kaplan HS. 2015. Inclusive fitness and differential

productivity across the life course determine intergenerational transfers in a small-scale

human society. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences

282(1803):20142808.

Isaac G. 1978. The food-sharing behavior of protohuman hominids. Scientific American 238:90-

108.

Jurmain R. 2000. Degenerative joint disease in African great apes: an evolutionary perspective. J

Hum Evol 39(2):185-203.

Kaplan H. 1994. Evolutionary and wealth flows theories of fertility: Empirical tests and new

models. Population and Development Review 20:753 - 791.

Kaplan H. 1997. The evolution of the human life course. In: Wachter K, and Finch C, editors.

Between Zeus and the Salmon: The Biodemography of Aging. Washington, D.C.:

National Academy of Sciences. p 175 - 211.

Kaplan H, Gurven M, Winking J, Hooper P, and Stieglitz J. 2010. Learning, menopause, and the

human adaptive complex. Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences 1204:30-42.

Kaplan H, and Hill K. 1985. Food Sharing Among Ache Foragers: Tests of Explanatory

Hypotheses [and Comments and Reply]. Current Anthropology 26(2):223-246.

Kaplan H, Hill K, Lancaster J, and Hurtado A. 2000. A theory of human life history evolution:

diet, intelligence, and longevity. Evolutionary Anthropology 9:156 - 185.

Kaplan H, Thompson RC, Trumble BC, Wann LS, Allam AH, Beheim B, Frohlich B, Sutherland

ML, Sutherland JD, Stieglitz J et al. . 2017. Coronary atherosclerosis in indigenous South

American Tsimane: a cross-sectional cohort study. Lancet 389(10080):1730-1739.

Kaplan HS, Hooper PL, and Gurven M. 2009. The evolutionary and ecological roots of human

social organization. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological

Sciences 364(1533):3289-3299.

Kneissel M, Roschger P, Steiner W, Schamall D, Kalchhauser G, Boyde A, and Teschler-Nicola

M. 1997. Cancellous bone structure in the growing and aging lumbar spine in a historic

Nubian population. Calcif Tissue Int 61(2):95-100.

Konigsberg L, and Herrmann N. 2006. The osteological evidence for human longevity in the

recent past. In: Hawkes K, and Paine R, editors. The Evolution of Human Life History.

Santa Fe: School of American Research Press. p 267-306.

Koster J, Mcelreath R, Hill K, Yu D, Shepard G, Vliet NV, Gurven M, Kaplan H, Trumble B,

Bird RB et al. . 2019. The Life History Of Human Foraging: Cross-Cultural And

Individual Variation. bioRxiv:574483.

Kraft TS, Stieglitz J, Trumble BC, Martin M, Kaplan H, and Gurven M. 2018. Nutrition

transition in 2 lowland Bolivian subsistence populations. Am J Clin Nutr 108(6):1183-

1195.

Kralick AE, and Zemel BS. 2020. Evolutionary Perspectives on the Developing Skeleton and

Implications for Lifelong Health. Frontiers in Endocrinology 11(99).

Kuhn SL, and Stiner MC. 2019. Hearth and Home in the Middle Pleistocene. Journal of

Anthropological Research 75(3):305-327.

Lambert PM, and Welker MH. 2017. Traumatic injury risk and agricultural transitions: A view

from the American Southeast and beyond. American Journal of Physical Anthropology

162(1):120-142.

Lentle BC, Berger C, Probyn L, Brown JP, Langsetmo L, Fine B, Lian K, Shergill AK, Trollip J,

Jackson S et al. . 2018. Comparative Analysis of the Radiology of Osteoporotic Vertebral

Fractures in Women and Men: Cross-Sectional and Longitudinal Observations from the

Canadian Multicentre Osteoporosis Study (CaMos). J Bone Miner Res 33(4):569-579.

Levitin D. 2020. Successful Aging: A Neuroscientist Explores the Power and Potential of Our

Lives. New York: Dutton.

Lieberman D. 2013. The story of the human body: evolution, health, and disease. New York:

Vintage.

Lieverse AR, Weber AW, Bazaliiskiy VI, Goriunova OI, and Savel'ev NA. 2007. Osteoarthritis

in Siberia's Cis-Baikal: Skeletal indicators of hunter-gatherer adaptation and cultural

change. Am J Phys Anthropol 132(1):1-16.

Lovejoy CO, and Heiple KG. 1981. The analysis of fractures in skeletal populations with an

example from the Libben site, Ottowa County, Ohio. American Journal of Physical

Anthropology 55(4):529-541.

Lovell NC. 1990. Skeletal and dental pathology of free-ranging mountain gorillas. Am J Phys

Anthropol 81(3):399-412.

Marlowe F. 2000. The patriarch hypothesis. Human Nature 11(1):27-42.

Marlowe F. 2003. A critical period for provisioning by Hadza men. Evolution and Human

Behavior 24(3):217-229.

Mays S, Lees B, and Stevenson JC. 1998. Age-dependent bone loss in the femur in a medieval

population. International Journal of Osteoarchaeology 8(2):97-106.

Mays SA. 1996. Age-dependent cortical bone loss in a medieval population. International

Journal of Osteoarchaeology 6(2):144-154.

Meerding WJ, W IJ, Koopmanschap MA, Severens JL, and Burdorf A. 2005. Health problems

lead to considerable productivity loss at work among workers with high physical load

jobs. J Clin Epidemiol 58(5):517-523.

Migliano AB, Page AE, Gómez-Gardeñes J, Salali GD, Viguier S, Dyble M, Thompson J,

Chaudhary N, Smith D, Strods J et al. . 2017. Characterization of hunter-gatherer

networks and implications for cumulative culture. Nature Human Behaviour 1(2):0043.

Minichillo T. 2005. Paleodemography, grandmothering, and modern human evolution: a

comment on Caspari and Lee (2004). Journal of Human Evolution 49(5):643-645.

Morbeck M, Galloway A, and Richman Sumner D. 2002. Getting old at Gombe: skeletal aging

in wild-ranging chimpanzees. In: Erwin J, and Hof P, editors. Interdisciplinary Topics in

Gerontology: Aging in Nonhuman Primates. Basel: Karger. p 48-62.

Mosekilde L. 1989. Sex differences in age-related loss of vertebral trabecular bone mass and

structure—biomechanical consequences. Bone 10(6):425-432.

Mosekilde L, Mosekilde L, and Danielsen CC. 1987. Biomechanical competence of vertebral

trabecular bone in relation to ash density and age in normal individuals. Bone 8(2):79-85.

Myers ER, and Wilson SE. 1997. Biomechanics of osteoporosis and vertebral fracture. Spine

22(24 Suppl):25s-31s.

NIH Consensus Development Panel on Osteoporosis Prevention D, and Therapy. 2001.

Osteoporosis prevention, diagnosis, and therapy. Jama 285(6):785-795.

Osipov B, Emami AJ, and Christiansen BA. 2018. Systemic Bone Loss After Fracture. Clin Rev

Bone Miner Metab 16(4):116-130.

Pfeiffer S. 2012. Two disparate instances of healed cranial trauma from the later stone age of

South Africa. South African Archaeological Bulletin 67:256-261.

Polga DJ, Beaubien BP, Kallemeier PM, Schellhas KP, Lew WD, Buttermann GR, and Wood

KB. 2004. Measurement of in vivo intradiscal pressure in healthy thoracic intervertebral

discs. Spine 29(12):1320-1324.

Pontzer H, Raichlen DA, and Sockol MD. 2009. The metabolic cost of walking in humans,

chimpanzees, and early hominins. Journal of Human Evolution 56(1):43-54.

Reinbold WD, Adler CP, Kalender WA, and Lente R. 1991. Accuracy of vertebral mineral

determination by dual-energy quantitative computed tomography. Skeletal radiology

20(1):25-29.

Richerson PJ, and Boyd R. 2008. Not by genes alone: How culture transformed human

evolution: University of Chicago Press.

Rohlmann A, Claes LE, Bergmannt G, Graichen F, Neef P, and Wilke HJ. 2001. Comparison of

intradiscal pressures and spinal fixator loads for different body positions and exercises.

Ergonomics 44(8):781-794.

Sambrook P, and Cooper C. 2006. Osteoporosis. Lancet 367:2010-2018.

Schniter E, Gurven M, Kaplan HS, Wilcox NT, and Hooper PL. 2015. Skill ontogeny among

Tsimane forager-horticulturalists. American Journal of Physical Anthropology 158(1):3-

18.

Schniter E, Wilcox NT, Beheim BA, Kaplan HS, and Gurven M. 2018. Information transmission

and the oral tradition: Evidence of a late-life service niche for Tsimane Amerindians.

Evolution and Human Behavior 39(1):94-105.

Shepherd JA, Schousboe JT, Broy SB, Engelke K, and Leslie WD. 2015. Executive Summary of

the 2015 ISCD Position Development Conference on Advanced Measures From DXA

and QCT: Fracture Prediction Beyond BMD. Journal of clinical densitometry : the

official journal of the International Society for Clinical Densitometry 18(3):274-286.

Stewart TD, and Hall RM. 2006. (iv) Basic biomechanics of human joints: Hips, knees and the

spine. Current Orthopaedics 20(1):23-31.

Stieglitz J, Beheim BA, Trumble BC, Madimenos FC, Kaplan H, and Gurven M. 2015a. Low

mineral density of a weight-bearing bone among adult women in a high fertility

population. American Journal of Physical Anthropology 156:637–648.

Stieglitz J, Jaeggi A, Blackwell A, Trumble B, Gurven M, and Kaplan H. 2014. Work to live and

live to work: Productivity, transfers, and psychological well-being in adulthood and old

age. In: Weinstein M, and Lane M, editors. Sociality, Hierarchy, and Health: comparative

biodemography. Washington DC: Committee on Population of the National Research

Council, National Academies Press. p 197-221.

Stieglitz J, Madimenos F, Kaplan H, and Gurven M. 2016. Calcaneal Quantitative Ultrasound

Indicates Reduced Bone Status Among Physically Active Adult Forager-Horticulturalists.

Journal of Bone and Mineral Research 31(3):663-671.

Stieglitz J, Schniter E, von Rueden C, Kaplan H, and Gurven M. 2015b. Functional Disability

and Social Conflict Increase Risk of Depression in Older Adulthood Among Bolivian

Forager-Farmers. The Journals of Gerontology Series B: Psychological Sciences and

Social Sciences 70(6):948-956.

Stieglitz J, Trumble B, Kaplan H, and Gurven M. 2017. Horticultural activity predicts later

localized limb status in a contemporary pre-industrial population. American Journal of

Physical Anthropology 163(3):425-436.

Stieglitz J, Trumble BC, Kaplan H, and Gurven M. 2018. Marital violence and fertility in a

relatively egalitarian high-fertility population. Nature Human Behaviour 2(8):565-572.

Stieglitz J, Trumble BC, Team HS, Finch CE, Li D, Budoff MJ, Kaplan H, and Gurven MD.

2019. Computed tomography shows high fracture prevalence among physically active

forager-horticulturalists with high fertility. eLife 8:e48607.

Sugiyama L, and Chacon R. 2000. Effects of Illness and Injury on Foraging Among the Yora and

Shiwiar: Pathology Risk as Adaptive Problem. In: Cronk L, Chagnon N, and Irons W,

editors. Human Behavior and Adaptation: An Anthropological Perspective. New York:

Aldine. p 371-395.

Sugiyama LS. 2004. Illness, injury, and disability among Shiwiar forager-horticulturalists:

Implications of health-risk buffering for the evolution of human life history. American

Journal of Physical Anthropology 123(4):371-389.

Sumner DR, Morbeck ME, and Lobick JJ. 1989. Apparent age-related bone loss among adult

female Gombe chimpanzees. Am J Phys Anthropol 79(2):225-234.

Thompson JC, Carvalho S, Marean CW, and Alemseged Z. 2019. Origins of the Human

Predatory Pattern: The Transition to Large-Animal Exploitation by Early Hominins.

Current Anthropology 60(1):1-23.

Tilley L. 2015. Theory and Practice in the Bioarchaeology of Care: Springer International

Publishing.

Trinkaus E. 1985. Pathology and the posture of the La Chapelle-aux-Saints Neandertal. Am J

Phys Anthropol 67(1):19-41.

Trinkaus E. 2018. An abundance of developmental anomalies and abnormalities in Pleistocene

people. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 115(47):11941-11946.

Ungar PS. 2012. Dental Evidence for the Reconstruction of Diet in African Early

Homo. Current Anthropology 53(S6):S318-S329.

Walker R, Hill K, Kaplan H, and McMillan G. 2002. Age-dependency in hunting ability among

the Ache of eastern Paraguay. Journal of Human Evolution 42:639 - 657.

Wallace IJ, Nesbitt A, Mongle C, Gould ES, and Grine FE. 2014. Age-related variation in limb

bone diaphyseal structure among Inuit foragers from Point Hope, northern Alaska. Arch

Osteoporos 9(1):202.

Washburn S, and Lancaster C. 1968a. The evolution of hunting. In: Lee R, and DeVore I,

editors. Man the hunter. Chicago: Aldine. p 293-303.

Washburn S, and Lancaster C. 1968b. The evolution of hunting. In: Lee R, and Devore I, editors.

Man the Hunter. Chicago: Aldine. p 293-303.

Wood B, and K. Boyle E. 2016. Hominin taxic diversity: Fact or fantasy? American Journal of

Physical Anthropology 159(S61):37-78.

Wood BM, and Marlowe FW. 2013. Household and kin provisioning by Hadza men. Human

Nature 24(3):280-317.

Wood BM, Watts DP, Mitani JC, and Langergraber KE. 2017. Favorable ecological

circumstances promote life expectancy in chimpanzees similar to that of human hunter-

gatherers. J Hum Evol 105:41-56.

Wrangham R, and Carmody R. 2010. Human adaptation to the control of fire. Evolutionary

Anthropology: Issues, News, and Reviews 19(5):187-199.

1152

1153

1154

1155

1156

1157

1158

Appendix

2. Methods
2.2. Study design and participants

Since 2002 the Tsimane (pop. ~16,000) have participated in the ongoing Tsimane Health and Life History Project (THLHP; see Gurven et al 2017 for an overview). All Tsimane residing in study villages are eligible to participate and most participate at least once. THLHP physicians have conducted annual medical exams on Tsimane of all ages since 2002. A mobile team of physicians and Tsimane research assistants collects data in villages on medical histories, functional ability, and aspects of lifestyle (e.g. food production and sharing).

Between July 2014 and September 2015, men and women age 40+ from 59 Tsimane villages were invited to participate in the CT scanning project. At the time, there were 1,214 eligible adults living in these villages (the only eligibility criteria were being 40+ years old, self-identifying as Tsimane and willing to participate). 731 adults were present in their villages at the time and subsequently received a CT scan. Transporting participants from their village to the nearby market town of San Borja was logistically complicated (requiring trekking through the forest, dug-out canoes, rafts propelled by poles pushed off the river bottom, trucks, and cars) and can require up to two days of travel each way. From San Borja to the Beni department capital of Trinidad (where the hospital containing the CT scanner is located) is an additional 6-hour car ride. Due to these logistical complications, participants not in their village at the time we arrived were not sampled. The Tsimane are semi-mobile and often build secondary houses deep in the forest near their horticultural plots, not returning to their village for extended periods of time. Hunting and fishing trips can last days or weeks, and some men engage in wage labor in San Borja or elsewhere (e.g. rural cattle ranches). In an average village, approximately one-third of individuals are away hunting, fishing, working in their horticultural plots, or in San Borja at any given time. Additionally, a major flood in February 2014 resulted in mass migration from some villages, and the creation of several new villages that were not sampled as part of this study, further reducing the number individuals that could be sampled in this study. To address potential sources of sample bias, analyses comparing Tsimane who received CTs and those who did not but who participated in the THLHP's medical exams in Tsimane villages were conducted. There were no significant differences in sex, blood pressure or body fat (see Kaplan et al 2017 for these and additional participant details) and thus the CT sample analyzed here is thought to be representative of all Tsimane age 40+ years.

Of the 731 Tsimane who received a CT scan, CT data from 506 (69%) were selected with no particular criteria to estimate thoracic vertebral bone mineral density (BMD) and fracture prevalence and severity (radiologist time constraints precluded analysis of all 731 adults). Of the 506 Tsimane contributing BMD and fracture data, 14 (3%) were missing data on subsistence involvement (e.g. whether still able to hunt or walk all day) because of absent or sick THLHP personnel who were unable to collect data, resulting in a final sample of 493 adults. Among these 493 adults, some anthropometric data were missing because of missing or broken equipment (see Appendix 1-Table S1 for sample sizes and descriptives for study variables).

Appendix 1-Table S1. Descriptives for study variables[a].

Variable	N	Mean	SD	Min	Max
Thoracic vertebral BMD (mg/cm^3)	493	165.5	41.3	68.9	315.0
Any thoracic vertebral (T6-T12) fracture (proportion grade≥1)	493	0.28	0.45	0	1
Any thoracic vertebral (T6-T12) fracture (proportion grade≥2)	493	0.09	0.29	0	1
Age (years)	493	55.9	9.9	41.2	91.0
Sex (proportion male)	493	0.52	0.5	0	1
Height (cm)	489	156.1	7.6	136.0	176.3
Weight (kg)	489	58.7	9.8	34.6	96.9
Body fat (%)	445	21.5	8.0	5.0	46.7
Fat mass (kg)	445	12.9	6.1	1.9	42.1
Fat-free mass (kg)	445	45.8	7.9	27.8	73.1

[a]Data were missing for various reasons (see Appendix for details).

2.4. Thoracic vertebral bone mineral density (BMD)

CT-measured vertebral BMD is increasingly used for osteoporosis screening in vivo because of its ability to provide three-dimensional information compared to traditional dual x-ray absorptiometry two-dimensional images.

Intra-observer variability in BMD measurements using the same measurement technique in a different sample (see Budoff et al 2010) was tested on 120 scans by one radiologist, with 1-week intervals between the two readings. To measure inter-observer variability on 67 randomly selected scans, the results obtained by two radiologists who were blinded to all clinical information were compared using this other sample. Intra- and inter-observer variations in BMD measurements were 2.5% and 2.6%, respectively.

2.5. Thoracic vertebral fracture

Genant's semi-quantitative technique does not distinguish between wedge (i.e. reduced anterior height), biconcave (i.e. reduced central height) or crush (i.e. reduced posterior height) fractures; most fractures contain a combination of these features and are influenced by the local biomechanics of the spinal level involved. Vertebral fractures are differentiated from other, non-fracture deformities (e.g. osteoarthritis), although these other deformities were not systematically coded.

2.7. Socio-demographics and anthropometrics

Birth years were assigned based on a combination of methods described in detail elsewhere (Gurven et al 2007), including using known ages from written records, relative age lists, dated events, photo comparisons of people with known ages, and cross-validation of information from independent interviews of kin. Each method provides an independent estimate of age, and when estimates yielded a date of birth within a three-year range, the average was generally used.

3. Results

3.2. Hunting cessation is associated with thoracic vertebral fracture and, albeit weakly, with lower BMD

Appendix 1-Table S2. Percentage of men (95% CI) who completely ceased hunting by age and thoracic vertebral fracture status (fracture grade≥2).

Age category (years)	% ceased hunting with fracture	N	% ceased hunting without fracture	N
40-49	0 (-----)	4	3 (<1-6)	77
50-59	21 (<1-46)	14	14 (6-22)	78
60-69	60 (<1-1)	5	32 (19-45)	50
70+	100 (-----)	6[a]	73 (53-93)	22[b]
Total	41** (22-60)	29	20 (15-25)	227

^p≤0.1   *p≤0.05   **p≤0.01   ***p≤0.001 (χ^2 or Fisher's Exact Test [vs. no fracture]).
[a]Max age=83 years (Mean±SD=74±4).
[b]Max age=83 years (Mean±SD=74±3).

Appendix 1-Table S3. Binary logistic regression: effect of thoracic vertebral fracture on the probability of hunting cessation after adjusting for age (model 1; n=256 men). Model 2 additionally includes as a covariate thoracic vertebral BMD. Shown are odds ratios (95% CIs); continuous variables are z-scored.

Parameter	Model 1	Model 2 (+ BMD)
Any thoracic vertebral fracture (grade≥1; vs. none)	7.3*** (3.3-17.6)	7.4*** (3.3-18.2)
Age (years)	5.2*** (3.4-8.5)	4.1*** (2.5-7.0)
Thoracic vertebral BMD (mg/cm^3)	-----	0.62* (0.38-0.99)
AIC	178.55	176.61

^p≤0.1   *p≤0.05   **p≤0.01   ***p≤0.001   (refer to main text for FDR q-values)

1266 *3.3. Hunting cessation associated with thoracic vertebral fracture and lower BMD generates*
1267 *substantial productivity losses*
1268 3.3.1. Fracture.
1269
1270 Appendix 1-Table S4. Tsimane men's age-specific daily hunting production by thoracic vertebral
1271 fracture status.

Age (years)	A) Hunt cals/day[a]	B) Probability still hunting: no fracture[b]	C) Probability still hunting: fracture[b]	D) Hunt cals/day: no fracture[c]	E) Hunt cals/day: fracture[d]
40	1872	0.995	0.968	1864	1812
41	1884	0.995	0.962	1874	1813
42	1888	0.994	0.955	1875	1803
43	1882	0.992	0.947	1868	1783
44	1870	0.991	0.938	1853	1754
45	1855	0.989	0.927	1835	1720
46	1836	0.987	0.915	1813	1680
47	1815	0.985	0.900	1787	1634
48	1790	0.982	0.884	1758	1582
49	1762	0.979	0.865	1725	1524
50	1731	0.975	0.843	1687	1459
51	1697	0.970	0.819	1646	1389
52	1659	0.965	0.792	1601	1314
53	1619	0.958	0.762	1551	1233
54	1575	0.951	0.729	1498	1148
55	1528	0.942	0.694	1440	1060
56	1478	0.932	0.656	1378	969
57	1425	0.920	0.616	1311	878
58	1369	0.906	0.574	1241	786
59	1310	0.891	0.531	1166	696
60	1247	0.873	0.488	1088	609
61	1181	0.852	0.445	1007	526
62	1113	0.829	0.403	923	449
63	1041	0.803	0.362	836	377
64	966	0.775	0.323	748	313
65	888	0.743	0.287	660	255
66	807	0.709	0.253	572	204
67	723	0.672	0.222	486	160
68	636	0.633	0.193	402	123
69	546	0.592	0.168	323	92
70	452	0.549	0.145	249	66
71	356	0.506	0.125	180	44
72	257	0.463	0.107	119	28
73	154	0.421	0.092	65	14
74	49	0.379	0.078	19	4
75	0	0.339	0.067	0	0
76	0	0.302	0.057	0	0
77	0	0.267	0.048	0	0
78	0	0.234	0.041	0	0
79	0	0.205	0.035	0	0
80	0	0.178	0.029	0	0

[a]Predicted values (loess fit). From Jan 2005-Dec 2009 adults were interviewed once or twice per week about time allocation and
production for each co-resident individual over age six during the previous two days (n=1,245 individuals from 11 villages).
[b]Predicted from binary logistic regression of whether one still hunts on thoracic vertebral fracture status (i.e. grade≥1; vs. none) and
age.
[c]Derived by multiplying value in column A by value in column B.
[d]Derived by multiplying value in column A by value in column C.

3.3.2. Lower BMD.

1279

1280 Appendix 1-Table S5. Tsimane men's age-specific daily hunting production by thoracic vertebral fracture
1281 status and thoracic vertebral bone mineral density (BMD). For illustrative purposes we report estimates
1282 holding BMD at +1 SD and -1 SD of the mean.

Age (years)	A) Hunt cals/day[a]	B) Probability still hunting: no fracture and +1 SD BMD[b]	C) Probability still hunting: no fracture and -1 SD BMD[b]	D) Probability still hunting: fracture and +1 SD BMD[b]	E) Probability still hunting: fracture and -1 SD BMD[b]	F) Hunt cals/day: no fracture and +1 SD BMD[c]	G) Hunt cals/day: no fracture and -1 SD BMD[d]	H) Hunt cals/day: fracture and +1 SD BMD[e]	I) Hunt cals/day: fracture and -1 SD BMD[f]
40	1872	0.996	0.990	0.971	0.930	1865	1853	1819	1741
41	1884	0.995	0.988	0.967	0.920	1875	1862	1822	1732
42	1888	0.995	0.987	0.962	0.908	1878	1863	1816	1714
43	1882	0.994	0.984	0.956	0.895	1870	1853	1800	1684
44	1870	0.993	0.982	0.950	0.880	1857	1836	1776	1646
45	1855	0.992	0.979	0.942	0.864	1840	1816	1747	1602
46	1836	0.990	0.976	0.933	0.845	1819	1792	1714	1552
47	1815	0.989	0.972	0.924	0.825	1795	1764	1676	1497
48	1790	0.987	0.968	0.913	0.802	1767	1732	1633	1436
49	1762	0.985	0.963	0.900	0.778	1736	1697	1586	1371
50	1731	0.983	0.957	0.886	0.751	1701	1657	1533	1301
51	1697	0.980	0.951	0.870	0.723	1664	1614	1476	1226
52	1659	0.977	0.943	0.852	0.692	1621	1565	1414	1148
53	1619	0.974	0.935	0.833	0.660	1576	1514	1348	1068
54	1575	0.970	0.925	0.811	0.626	1527	1458	1278	986
55	1528	0.965	0.915	0.788	0.591	1474	1397	1203	902
56	1478	0.960	0.902	0.762	0.554	1418	1334	1126	819
57	1425	0.953	0.888	0.734	0.518	1359	1266	1046	738
58	1369	0.946	0.873	0.704	0.481	1296	1195	964	658
59	1310	0.938	0.856	0.672	0.444	1229	1121	881	582
60	1247	0.929	0.836	0.639	0.408	1159	1043	797	509
61	1181	0.919	0.815	0.604	0.373	1085	963	714	440
62	1113	0.907	0.792	0.568	0.339	1010	881	633	377
63	1041	0.894	0.766	0.532	0.307	931	798	554	319
64	966	0.879	0.739	0.495	0.276	849	714	478	267
65	888	0.862	0.709	0.458	0.248	766	630	407	220
66	807	0.844	0.678	0.422	0.221	681	547	340	178
67	723	0.823	0.645	0.386	0.197	595	466	279	142
68	636	0.801	0.610	0.352	0.174	509	388	224	111
69	546	0.776	0.575	0.319	0.154	424	314	174	84
70	452	0.750	0.538	0.288	0.136	339	243	130	61
71	356	0.721	0.501	0.258	0.119	257	178	92	42
72	257	0.690	0.464	0.231	0.105	177	119	59	27
73	154	0.658	0.428	0.206	0.092	101	66	32	14
74	49	0.624	0.392	0.183	0.080	31	19	9	4
75	0	0.588	0.358	0.162	0.070	0	0	0	0
76	0	0.552	0.324	0.143	0.061	0	0	0	0
77	0	0.515	0.293	0.125	0.053	0	0	0	0
78	0	0.479	0.263	0.110	0.046	0	0	0	0
79	0	0.442	0.236	0.096	0.040	0	0	0	0
80	0	0.406	0.210	0.084	0.035	0	0	0	0

[a]Predicted values (loess fit). From Jan 2005-Dec 2009 adults were interviewed once or twice per week about time allocation and production for
each co-resident individual over age six during the previous two days (n=1,245 individuals from 11 villages).
[b]Predicted from binary logistic regression of whether one still hunts on thoracic vertebral fracture status (i.e. grade≥1; vs. none), BMD
(mg/cm^3) and age (years).
[c]Derived by multiplying value in column A by value in column B.
[d]Derived by multiplying value in column A by value in column C.
[e]Derived by multiplying value in column A by value in column D.
[f]Derived by multiplying value in column A by value in column E.

1291

 3.4. Tree chopping cessation is associated with thoracic vertebral fracture but not lower BMD

1293 Appendix 1-Table S6. Binary logistic regression: effect of thoracic vertebral fracture on the
1294 probability of tree chopping cessation after adjusting for age (model 1; n=256 men). Model 2
1295 additionally includes as a covariate thoracic vertebral BMD. Shown are odds ratios (95% CIs);
1296 continuous variables are z-scored.

Parameter	Model 1	Model 2 (+ BMD)
Any thoracic vertebral fracture (grade≥1; vs. none)	6.9*** (3.1-16.6)	6.8*** (3.1-16.6)
Age (years)	8.0*** (4.9-13.9)	6.8*** (4.0-12.4)
Thoracic vertebral BMD (mg/cm^3)	-----	0.75 (0.47-1.16)
AIC	183.41	183.75

1297 ^p≤0.1 *p≤0.05 **p≤0.01 ***p≤0.001 (refer to main text for FDR q-values)
1298
1299

1300 *3.5. Weaving cessation is not associated with thoracic vertebral fracture but is associated, albeit*
1301 *weakly, with lower BMD*
1302
1303 Appendix 1-Table S7. Binary logistic regression: effect of thoracic vertebral fracture on the
1304 probability of weaving cessation after adjusting for age (model 1; n=237 women). Model 2
1305 additionally includes as a covariate thoracic vertebral BMD. Shown are odds ratios (95% CIs);
1306 continuous variables are z-scored.

Parameter	Model 1	Model 2 (+ BMD)
Any thoracic vertebral fracture (grade≥1; vs. none)	2.2 (0.8-6.4)	1.8 (0.6-5.4)
Age (years)	4.9*** (3.1-8.6)	3.3*** (1.8-6.6)
Thoracic vertebral BMD (mg/cm^3)	-----	0.51^ (0.23-1.05)
AIC	134.52	133.18

1307 ^p≤0.1 *p≤0.05 **p≤0.01 ***p≤0.001 (refer to main text for FDR q-values)
1308
1309
1310

1311 Appendix 1-Table S8. Self-reported reasons for weaving cessation by thoracic vertebral fracture
1312 status. Shown are percentages of women reporting a given reason.

Reason for weaving cessation	Fracture (n=9)	No fracture (n=24)	Total (n=33)
Problem with hips	100	100	100
Problem with back	100	100	100
Problem with fingers	100	100	100
Problem with hands (other than fingers)	100	100	100
Any problem with hips, back or hands	100	100	100
Difficulty sitting	100	100	100
Difficulty seeing	89	88	88

1313 ^p≤0.1 *p≤0.05 **p≤0.01 ***p≤0.001 (χ^2 or Fisher's Exact test [vs. no fracture])
1314

1315 *3.6. Restricted day range is associated with thoracic vertebral fracture and, albeit weakly, with*
1316 *lower BMD*

1317

1318

1319 Appendix 1-Table S9. Binary logistic regression: effect of thoracic vertebral fracture on the
1320 probability of not being able to walk a full day after adjusting for age and sex (model 1; n=493
1321 adults). Model 2 additionally includes as a covariate thoracic vertebral BMD. Shown are odds
1322 ratios (95% CIs); continuous variables are z-scored. Interaction terms between sex and either
1323 fracture, age or BMD do not yield significant parameter estimates and are not shown.

Parameter	Model 1	Model 2 (+ BMD)
Any thoracic vertebral fracture (grade≥1; vs. none)	8.2*** (4.8-14.5)	7.8*** (4.5-13.8)
Age (years)	4.0*** (3.1-5.4)	3.4*** (2.4-4.8)
Sex=male	0.19*** (0.11-0.31)	0.21*** (0.12-0.34)
Thoracic vertebral BMD (mg/cm^3)	-----	0.77^ (0.57-1.03)
AIC	479.60	478.52

1324 ^p≤0.1　*p≤0.05　**p≤0.01　***p≤0.001　(refer to main text for FDR q-values)

1325
1326
1327

1328

1329 *3.7. Suggestive evidence of fracture preceding task cessation, rather than the reverse*

1330

1331 Appendix 1-Table S10. Self-reported reasons for hunting cessation by thoracic vertebral fracture
1332 status. Shown are percentages of men reporting a given reason.

Reason for hunting cessation	Fracture (n=34)	No fracture (n=22)	Total (n=56[a])
Problem with hips	29**[b]	0	18
Problem with back	53	59	55
Problem with arms	12	23	16
Problem with legs	56	55	55
Any problem with hips, back or limbs	77	86	80
Feels weak	29^	50	38
Tires easily	59	64	61
Tires easily or feels weak	65	77	70
Difficulty hearing	38	50	43
Difficulty seeing	62	77	68
Difficulty hearing or seeing	65	82	71

1333 ^p≤0.1　*p≤0.05　**p≤0.01　***p≤0.001 (χ^2 or Fisher's Exact test [vs. no fracture]).
1334 [a]Fracture data are missing for one man. For another man self-reported data are missing.
1335 [b]FDR q=0.012.
1336 Note: only q-values ≤0.05 are reported.

1343 Appendix 1-Table S11. Self-reported reasons for tree chopping cessation by thoracic vertebral
1344 fracture status. Shown are percentages of men reporting a given reason.

Reason for tree chopping cessation	Fracture (n=41)	No fracture (n=35)	Total (n=76[a])
Problem with hips	29*[b]	9	20
Problem with back	59	71	64
Problem with arms	66^	83	74
Problem with legs	29	26	28
Any problem with hips, back or limbs	83	94	88
Feels weak	54	54	54
Tires easily	63	71	67
Tires easily or feels weak	80	83	82

1345 ^p≤0.1 *p≤0.05 **p≤0.01 ***p≤0.001 (χ^2 or Fisher's Exact test [vs. no fracture]).
1346 [a]Fracture data are missing for one man. For another man self-reported data are missing.
1347 [b]FDR q=0.036.
1348 Note: only q-values ≤0.05 are reported.
1349
1350
1351 Appendix 1-Table S12. Self-reported reasons for inability to walk all day by thoracic vertebral
1352 fracture status. Shown are percentages of adults (pooled sexes) reporting a given reason.

Reason for inability to walk all day	Fracture (n=95)	No fracture (n=134)	Total (n=229[a])
Problem with hips	39	39	39
Problem with back	61	69	66
Problem with arms	8	8	8
Problem with legs	81	86	84
Any problem with hips, back or limbs	88	93	91
Feels weak	29	31	31
Tires easily	71	60	65
Tires easily or feels weak	76	69	72

1353 ^p≤0.1 *p≤0.05 **p≤0.01 ***p≤0.001 (χ^2 or Fisher's Exact test [vs. no fracture]).
1354 [a]Fracture data are missing for one adult.
1355
1356
1357
References

Budoff MJ, Hamirani YS, Gao YL, Ismaeel H, Flores FR, Child J, Carson S, Nee JN, and Mao
S. 2010. Measurement of thoracic bone mineral density with quantitative CT. Radiology
257(2):434-440.
Gurven M, Kaplan H, and Zelada Supa A. 2007. Mortality experience of Tsimane Amerindians
of Bolivia: Regional variation and temporal trends. American Journal of Human Biology
19:376 - 398.
Gurven M, Stieglitz J, Trumble B, Blackwell AD, Beheim B, Davis H, Hooper P, and Kaplan H.
2017. The Tsimane Health and Life History Project: Integrating anthropology and
biomedicine. Evolutionary Anthropology 26(2):54-73.
Kaplan H, Thompson RC, Trumble BC, Wann LS, Allam AH, Beheim B, Frohlich B, Sutherland
ML, Sutherland JD, Stieglitz J et al. . 2017. Coronary atherosclerosis in indigenous South
American Tsimane: a cross-sectional cohort study. Lancet 389(10080):1730-1739.

1371