

Malaria Endemicity Influence on COVID -19 Mortality: New Evidence Added to BCG and TB Prevalence

Tareef Fadhil Raham

Consultant pediatrician , MOH ,Iraq

tareeffadhil@yahoo.com

009647901584338

Abstract

Background: Regarding SARS-CoV-2 it is well known that a substantial percentage of adult population cannot get infected if exposed to this novel coronavirus. Several studies give primary indication of the possible role of preexisting immunity whether cross immunity or not. Possible role of latent TB and BCG have been already suggested to create innate cross heterogeneous immunity. Possible role of malaria is suggested in this paper possibly by same mechanism of protection.

Material and methods:80 malarious countries are enrolled in this study. Hierarchical multiple regression type of analyses is used for data analyses. TB prevalence/ 100,000 population standardized to BCG coverage rates is taken as direct factor in the test. Malaria incidence /1000 population is considered as intermediate factor and the outcome is COVID-19 mortality/ 1 million (M) population.

Results: The results show with robust statistical support that standerized TB prevalence to BCG coverage is significantly associated with reduced COVID-19 mortality and malaria incidence have an additional highly significant effect in reducing COVID-19 mortality.

Conclusions: Malaria and standardized TB prevalence are statistical significant factors predicting COVID-19 mortality in negative associations.

Key words: Malaria, BCG, TB Prevalence, latent TB, Covid -19 Mortality, SARS-CoV-2

Introduction

Microorganisms infecting mammalian hosts may modulate long lasting protective heterologous cross-immunological reactions once exposed to heterologous agonists in the future^{1,2,3}. In 2011, Netea *et al* proposed the term “trained immunity” to describe this ability of innate immune cells to nonspecifically adapting, protecting and remembering primary stimulation⁴.

BCG

BCG through attenuated strain of *Mycobacterium bovis* was used to produce heterogeneous immunity against *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, another species within the genus *Mycobacterium*. BCG was blamed to lead to incomplete and often varying degree of protection against TB disease⁵. On the other hand, studies have been done over the past few decades show that certain adaptations connected with innate immune cells (monocyte/macrophages, NK (Natural Killer) cells are responsible for nonspecific effects of vaccination beyond its target^{6,7}. These studies show that Vaccination with BCG induces an improved innate immune response against microorganisms other than *Mycobacterium*, which include bacteria such as *Staphylococcus aureus*, fungi such as *Candida albicans* and viruses such as the yellow fever virus^{6,8,9}.

There are evident roles of BCG in reduction of neonatal sepsis and respiratory infection reduction^{10,11,12}. Its role in childhood mortality reduction is known since 1927^{13,14,15}. Furthermore BCG-vaccination was associated with diminished morbidity and mortality rates associated with malaria, unclassified fever, preventing, sepsis and leprosy^{10,11,13,16,17,18}. In spite of that, many countries discontinue BCG vaccinations or limited its use to high risk groups because great achievements in reduction of TB prevalence rates in these countries.

TB

Tuberculosis (TB) is one of the major causes of illness and death in many countries and constitute a significant public health problem worldwide. TB disease is one of the top 10 causes of death accounted to estimated 10 million people in 2018¹⁹. About one-quarter of the world's population has latent TB which leads 5–15% lifetime risk of falling ill with TB^{19,20}.

Latent tuberculosis infection (LTBI) is the persistence of an immunological response to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* antigen stimulation without any clinically active disease²¹. The lifetime risk of reactivation of TB is estimated to be around 5–10%²².

The WHO recommends tailored latent tuberculosis infection management based on tuberculosis burden and resource availability²³. Treatment of active disease is by

far the major intervention in this regard worldwide, while diagnosis and treatment of LTBI are hindered by the cost implications of testing, lack of a consensus on the tests recommended, and side effects of treatment²⁴.

Treatment of LTBI in low prevalence (high to upper-middle-income) countries like USA²⁵ and many European countries²⁶ is feasible (in spite of prolonged adaptive immunological response to *Mycobacterium* antigen), as elimination of this reservoir of infection will reduce the burden of TB disease. However, the scenario in high prevalence countries like many countries in Asia and Africa is quite the opposite where, reinfection due to contact with active cases rather than reactivation contributes to a high disease burden²⁴. The 1st preliminary study suggesting latent infections creating heterogeneous immune response to COX-COV2 viral infection in different patterns according to different BCG status appeared in June 2020²⁷. Two other papers later on are published (up to my knowledge) till now consolidating the initial finding^{28,29}.

Malaria

Malaria infection can be asymptomatic, or, more accurately, “subclinical,” because subtle symptoms and chronic health effects may occur but not lead to clinical diagnosis and treatment³⁰. In similar way for TB control program, malaria elimination requires (eradicating both clinically symptomatic as well as these “silent” infections³¹ which may serve as a reservoir and contribute to ongoing malaria transmission in the face of interventions targeting clinically apparent infections^{32,33}). Malarial infection cross protection for other microorganisms is well known for *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. For that reason, the prevalence of malaria/TB coinfection is low³⁴. Murine models suggested protective humoral and cellular immune responses against the complications of each disease^{35,36}. Further studies suggest increased production of gamma interferon (IFN- γ), tumor necrosis factor alpha (TNF- α), and humoral factors induced by tuberculosis infection that are protective against malaria infection^{35,36,37}.

Malaria also was found to clear *S. pneumoniae* much more efficiently in co-infected model³⁸. Furthermore, having malaria infection was associated with a reduced likelihood of influenza virus and vice versa^{39,40}. It was also suggested that measles infection repressed parasitemia in addition to influenza A infection⁴¹. Heterogeneous immunological response also exists among different malaria species.

As far as SARS-CoV-2 is known that a substantial percentage of adult population cannot get infected if exposed to this novel coronavirus⁴². Several studies suggest a possible role of preexisting immunity whether cross immunity or not (antibodies/T cells, etc.) as a factor explaining such diversity⁴².

Previous studies on latent TB association with reduction of COVID-19 mortality did not give explanation for high mortality in certain countries like south Africa where COVID-19 mortality/M population is 238 at the study time while TB prevalence/1000 population is very high (520). Furthermore these studies do not explain low COVID-19 mortality /M population in countries like in Togo (36), Benin(56) and Mali (53) which have relatively low TB prevalence while COVID-19 mortality is (3),(3) and (6) respectively.

Our study background hypothesis stands on possible heterogeneous immunity generated by malaria in addition to possible heterogeneous immunity generated by TB. This study will test COVID-19 mortality in malarious countries against malaria incidence and TB prevalence calibrated by BCG coverage to look for statistical associations and significances. Up to our knowledge this is the first work examine the effect of malaria and BCG coverage on COVID-19 mortality .

Material and methods

Data used are publically available as follows:

COVID-19 mortality taken on August,31 – September, 1st 2020:

[https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/?](https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/)

TB prevalence /100,000 : world bank site :
<https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SH.TBS.INCD>

Malaria incidence for 2018 /1000 :1- WHO. World Malaria Report 2019 at site :
<file:///C:/Users/zz/Downloads/9789241565721-eng.pdf>

2- World bank site :<https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SH.MLR.INCD.P3>

3- Max Roser and Hannah Ritchie (2013) - "Malaria". *Published online at OurWorldInData.org*. Retrieved from: '<https://ourworldindata.org/malaria>' [Online Resource]. Publically available at: <https://ourworldindata.org/malaria>

BCG data: WHO. BCG. Immunization coverage estimates by country publically available at: <https://apps.who.int/gho/data/view.main.80500?lang=en>

Data Availability: Datasets generated and/or analyzed during this study are available from the corresponding author upon request.

Patient and public involvement statement:

It was not appropriate or possible to involve patients or the public in this work given that we used general practice level summated data and related publically published morbidity and mortality statistics. Patients were not involved

We did not include CFR because no. of tests /M vary from to making COVID-19 cases/ 1 M is untrusted indicator. And we took Mortality /M as more trusted one.

All countries and territories under 1 million population are excluded to avoid correction to 1 million by multiplication of figures these are : Sao Tome and Principe, Guyana, Djibouti, Suriname, Cabo Verde (Cape Verde), Burkina Faso, Belize, Bhutan, Comoros, Mayotte (France), Western Sahara, Vanuatu, Solomon Islands, Sao Tome and Principe.

Total number of malarious countries and territories enrolled in this study is 80 . All of these countries have current BCG vaccination programs but differ vaccination coverage.

Countries with Zero malaria incidence are included as far as not yet get the malaria elimination certificate by WHO (Certification of malaria elimination is the official recognition by WHO of a country’s malaria-free status. WHO grants this certification when a country has proven, beyond reasonable doubt, that the chain of local transmission of all human malaria parasites has been interrupted nationwide for at least the past 3 consecutive years, and that a fully functional surveillance and response system that can prevent re-establishment of indigenous transmission is in place.)⁴³

The Statistical Hypothesis:

No significant effect due to standardized values of "TB/100000 by BCG Vaccination Coverage 2018 percent" on the Covid-19 Death /1 M. rates as a function factor with the presence of effectiveness an intermediate factor "Malaria incidence for 2018/1000" at the significance level greater than 0.05.

Results and Findings

Hierarchical regression of composite -multiple linear model, is used for data analyses.

The direct factor of reducing the mortality rates with reference to covid-19 is the standardized TB/100,000 population by BCG vaccination coverage percentage in 2018 through dividing the factor of TB/100,000 population rates by the factor of BCG vaccination coverage in 2018, while the indirect effect that reduce the mortality rates, named as intermediate factor which is "The malaria incidence for 2018/1000 population ".

We investigate the validity of the assumptions of studied model that adopts the results of quantitative measurements. Table No. (1) shows the results of the multiple linear model fitness test resulted from the regression analysis of variance.

Table (1): Fitness tests resulted for the regression analysis of variance with and without effectiveness of an intermediate factor

Model	SOV	SS	Df	MSS	F	P-value ^(*)
Without Intermediate Factor	Regression	170266.9	2	85133.45	3.833	0.026 S
	Residuals	1710329.0	77	22212.07		
	Total	1880595.9	79	-		
With Intermediate	Regression	322044.1	3	107348	5.235	0.002 HS
	Residuals	1558551.8	76	20507.26		

Factor	Total	1880595.9	79	-		
--------	-------	-----------	----	---	--	--

(*) HS: Highly Sig. at P<0.01; S: Sig. at P<0.05.

The effectiveness of quality of model fitness is observed in the presence of the intermediate factor, the level of significance is greatly reduced compared to the case of the model quality in the absence of the intermediate factor.

On other hand, table No. (2) shows the results of estimating some descriptive statistics accompanying the analysis of the composite linear model.

Table (2): Results of some descriptive statistics accompanying the analysis of the composited linear model of a studied functions.

Model	R Multiple Corr.	R – Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	0.301	0.091	0.067	149.0371
2	0.414	0.171	0.139	143.2036
(1): Predictors: (Constant), BCG vaccination Coverage 2018 in percent, TB/100,000				
(2): Predictors: (Constant), BCG vaccination Coverage 2018 in percent, TB/100,000 , Malaria Incidence for 2018/1000				

The level of increase in the value of the multiple correlation coefficient is evidenced by the presence of the intermediate factor in the composite regression analysis.

Table No. (3) includes the results of estimating parameters of the regression and composite regression models in the presence of the indirect effect of the intermediate factor.

Table No. (3): Estimating parameters of the regression and composite regression models in the presence of the indirect effect of the intermediate factor

Regression and Composite Regression Models	B	Std. Error	Stand. Beta	t-value	P-value (*)
(Constant)	126.98	25.87	-	4.908	0.000
Standardized of TB/100000 by BCG Vaccination Coverage 2018 percent	-22.11	8.53	-0.282	-2.593	0.011
(Constant)	152.38	26.58	-	5.734	0.000
Standardized of TB/100000 by BCG Vaccination Coverage 2018 percent	-18.00	8.34	-0.229	-2.16	0.034
Malaria Incidence for 2018/1000	-0.331	0.122	-0.289	-2.717	0.008

(*) HS: Highly Sig. at P<0.01; S: Sig. at P<0.05.

In table (3) regarding the model of regression factor estimate (i.e. the standardized TB/100,000 by BCG vaccination coverage 2018), the table shows

meaningful linear regression tested in two tailed alternative statistical hypothesis of studied factor playing effective role for reducing "COVID-19 death /1 M. population" as a function of the previous factor. Slope value estimated indicates that with increasing one unit of the studied factor, a negative influence on unit of the rates function factor occurred, and estimated as (-22.11). This decrement recorded significant influence at $P<0.05$. Other sources of variations are not included in model, i.e. "Constant term in regression equation" shows that non assignable factors which are not included in regression equation, ought to be informative, since estimation about (127) cases of " COVID-19 Mortality / 1 M." expected initially without effectiveness of the restriction of studied factor.

Back to the results of the table No. (3), and regarding to composite regression estimate's factors (i.e. the standardized TB/100000 by BCG vaccination coverage 2018 as direct effect, and malaria incidence for 2018/1000 population as indirect effect) results shows a meaningful composite linear regression tested in two tailed alternative statistical hypothesis of studied factor is playing effective role for reducing "Covid-19 death /1 M." rates as a function of the previous factors. Slope value concerning the that the first factor's estimate indicates that with increasing one unit of the studied first factor, a negative influence on unit of the rates function factor would occur, and estimated as (-18.00). The decrement recorded significant influence at $P<0.05$, while with presence of indirect effect by the second factor, slope value indicates that with increasing one unit of that factor, a negative influence on unit of the rates function factor would occur, and estimated as (-0.331). The decrement recorded has highly significant influence at $P<0.01$. Others source of variations are not included in composite regression model, i.e. "Constant term " ought to be informative, since estimated that about (152) cases of "Covid - 19 Mortality / 1 M." expected initially without effectiveness of the restriction of studied factors.

Discussion

In this study the prevalence of mycobacterium spp. (including BCG vaccine) exposure of the populations is negatively associated with COVID-19 deaths per million populations this supports the three for mentioned studies^{27,28,29}.

TB prevalence standardization for BCG coverage is very important factor regarding studying countries currently implementing BCG programs. Coverage in such studies reflects the degree of benefits added to the factor (latent TB prevalence) the coverage do and that's what we do in this study. Likewise the influence of time duration of cessation of BCG vaccination program is a factor in determining COVID-19 mortality⁴⁴ in countries ceased implementing this vaccine and that's what we did in one of our previous studies.

Malaria which possibly induce immunological response similar to TB as we suggest in one way or another is significantly associated with reduction in COVID-19 mortality in this study. This finding is the first to be reported up to our knowledge. This association although needs confirmatory immunological and clinical control studies to establish causation. Furthermore, this finding can explain the variances in COVID-19 mortality among different countries much deeper than TB and BCG alone. BCG vaccination status for countries being of concern earlier before latent TB becomes of concern but previous early studies were conflicting and were criticized because of possible confounding factors. In our study her all countries are implementing national BCG programs but TB countries' prevalence /100,00 population were standardized by BCG coverage rates.

Recommendations: Malaria, TB prevalence and BCG coverage rates are possible factors in COVID-19 mortality should looked for deeply for possible causation to current pandemic mortalities.

Ethics and dissemination:

Ethical permission is not necessary as this study analyzed publically published data and patients were not involved.

There is no conflict of interest.

Funding: No specific source of funding was utilized for the current study.

Acknowledgment:

I am deeply grateful to Emeritus Professor Abdulkhaleq Abduljabbar Ali Ghalib Al-Naqeeb, Ph.D. in the Philosophy of Statistical Sciences at the Medical & Health Technology college, Baghdad-Iraq, for his assistance and support in data analysis, interpretations of finding results, and revision and displaying the paper.

¹ Haque A, Rachinel N, Quddus MR, *et al.* Co-infection of malaria and gamma-herpesvirus: exacerbated lung inflammation or cross-protection depends on the stage of viral infection. *Clin Exp Immunol.* 2004;138(3):396-404.

doi:10.1111/j.1365-2249.2004.02652.x

² Welsh RM, Selin LK. No one is naive: the significance of heterologous T-cell immunity. *Nat Rev Immunol.* 2002;2(6):417-426. doi:10.1038/nri820

³ Selin KS, Brehm MA, Kim SK, *et al.* Heterologous immunity and the CD8 T cell network

***Springer Seminars in Immunopathology* . (2002); 24 :149–168**

⁴ Netea MG, Quintin J, van der Meer JW. Trained immunity: a memory for innate host defense. *Cell Host Microbe.* 2011; 9(5):355-61.

-
- ⁵ Roy A, Eisenhut M, Harris RJ, et al. Effect of BCG vaccination against Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection in children: systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMJ (Clinical research ed)*. 2014;349
- ⁶ Camila C, Ayleen FF, Angello RD. BCG-Induced Cross-Protection and Development of Trained Immunity: Implication for Vaccine Design. *Frontiers in Immunology*. 2019 ; 10 :2806
- ⁷ Kleinnijenhuis J, Quintin J, Preijers F, , et al. Bacille Calmette-Guerin induces NOD2-dependent nonspecific protection from reinfection via epigenetic reprogramming of monocytes. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*. (2012) 109:17537–42. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1202870109
- ⁸ Arts, R. J. W. et al. BCG vaccination protects against experimental viral infection in humans through the induction of cytokines associated with trained immunity. *Cell Host Microbe*. 2018; 23: 89–100.
- ⁹ Kleinnijenhuis, J. et al. Long-lasting effects of BCG vaccination on both heterologous Th1/T_H17 responses and innate trained immunity. *J. Innate Immun*. 6, 152–158 (2014).
- ¹⁰ Aaby P, Roth A, Ravn H, , et al. Randomized trial of BCG vaccination at birth to low-birth-weight children : beneficial nonspecific effects in the neonatal period? *J Infect Dis*. (2011) 204:245–52. doi: 10.1093/infdis/jir240
- ¹¹ Biering-Sørensen S, Aaby P, Napirna BM, Roth A, et al. Small randomized trial among low-birth-weight children receiving Bacillus Calmette-Guérin vaccination at first health center contact. *Pediatr Infect Dis J*. (2012) 31:306–8. doi: 10.1097/INF.0b013e3182458289
- ¹² Aaby P, Benn CS. Saving lives by training innate immunity with Bacille Calmette-Guérin vaccine. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*. (2012) 109:17317–8. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1215761109
- ¹³ Higgins, J. P. et al. Association of BCG, DTP, and measles containing vaccines with childhood mortality: systematic review. *BMJ* 355, i5170 (2016).
- ¹⁴ Hirve I, Bavdekar A, Juvekar S, et al. Non-specific and sex-differential effects of vaccinations on child survival in rural western India. *Vaccine*. 2012; 30: 7300-7308
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2012.09.035>.
- ¹⁵ Kristensen I, Aaby P, Jensen H. Routine vaccinations and child survival: follow up study in Guinea-Bissau, West Africa. *BMJ*. 2000; 321: 1435-1438
- ¹⁶ Ponnighaus JM, Msosa E, Gruer PJK, et al. Efficacy of BCG vaccine against leprosy and tuberculosis in northern Malawi. *Lancet*. (1992) 339:636–9. doi: 10.1016/0140-6736(92)90794-4
- ¹⁷ Shann F. The non-specific effects of vaccines. *Arch Dis Child*. (2010) 95:662–7. doi: 10.1136/adc.2009.157537

-
- ¹⁸ Shann F. Nonspecific effects of vaccines and the reduction of mortality in children. *Clin Ther.* (2013) 35:109–14. doi: 10.1016/j.clinthera.2013.01.007
- ¹⁹ WHO . Tuberculosis.
://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/tuberculosis
- ²⁰ WHO. Tuberculosis://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/tuberculosis
- ²¹ Mack U, Migliori GB, Sester M, et al. *LTBI: Latent tuberculosis infection or lasting immune responses to M.tuberculosis? A TBNET consensus statement.* Eur Respir J. 2009;33:956-73
- ²² Comstock GW, Livesay VT, Woolpert SF. The prognosis of a positive tuberculin reaction in childhood and adolescence. *Am J Epidemiol.* 1974;99:131-8
- ²³ Getahun H, Matteelli A, Abubakar I ,et al. Advancing global programmatic management of latent tuberculosis infection for at risk populations. *Eur Respir J.* 2016 ;47(5):1327–30.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1183/13993003.00449-2016> pmid: 27132266
- ²⁴ Saha S, Kumar A, Saurabh K , ShankarSH , et al . Current status of treatment of latent tuberculosis infection in India. *Indian Journal of Medical Sciences .* 2019 ; 2
- ²⁵ CDC. Deciding When to Treat Latent TB Infection.
<https://www.cdc.gov/tb/topic/treatment/decideltbi.htm>
accessed: 8/9/2020
- ²⁶ European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control. Management of latent tuberculosis infection.
<https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/tuberculosis/prevention-and-control/management-latent-tuberculosis-infection>
accessed :98/9/2020
- ²⁷ TF,Raham. TB Prevalence Influence on Covid-19 Mortality. *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation.* 24(10) ;2020 : 3679- 3690
doi: <https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.05.05.20092395>
- ²⁸ Singh S, Maurya RP, Singh RK. 'Trained immunity' from Mycobacterium spp. exposure or BCG vaccination and COVID-19 outcomes. medRxiv; 2020. DOI: 10.1101/2020.07.11.20151308.
- ²⁹ Takahashi, H.Role of latent tuberculosis infections in reduced COVID-19 mortality: Evidence from an instrumental variable method analysis. *Medical Hypotheses.* 2020. :144110214,
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mehy.2020.110214.657-8501>, Japan
- ³⁰ Huang F, Takala-Harrison S, Liu H, et al. Prevalence of Clinical and Subclinical *Plasmodium falciparum* and *Plasmodium vivax* Malaria in Two Remote Rural

Communities on the Myanmar-China Border. *Am J Trop Med Hyg.* 2017;97(5):1524-1531. doi:10.4269/ajtmh.17-0167

³¹ malERA Consultative Group on Drugs. A research agenda for malaria eradication: drugs. *PLoS Med.* 2011;8(1):e1000402. Published 2011 Jan 25. doi:10.1371/journal.pmed.1000402

³² Chen I, Clarke SE, Gosling R, *et al.* "Asymptomatic" Malaria: A Chronic and Debilitating Infection That Should Be Treated. *PLoS Med.* 2016; 13(1):e1001942.

³³ Lindblade KA, Steinhart L, Samuels A, Kachur SP, Slutsker L, 2013. The silent threat: asymptomatic parasitemia and malaria transmission. *Expert Rev Anti Infect Ther* 11: 623–639.

³⁴ Baluku JB, Nassozi S, Gyagenda B, *et al.* "Prevalence of Malaria and TB Coinfection at a National Tuberculosis Treatment Centre in Uganda", *Journal of Tropical Medicine.* 2019. ArticleID 3741294, 7 pages, 2019. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2019/3741294>

³⁵ K. R. Page, A. E. Jedlicka, B. Fakheri *et al.*, "Mycobacterium-Induced Potentiation of Type 1 Immune Responses and Protection against Malaria Are Host Specific," *Infection and Immunity.* 2005. (73);12: 8369–8380.

³⁶ J. R. Murphy, "Host defenses in murine malaria: Immunological characteristics of a protracted state of immunity to *Plasmodium yoelii*," *Infection and Immunity.* 1980. (27); 1, : 68–74

³⁷ D. Perez-Mazliah and J. Langhorne, "CD4 T-cell subsets in malaria: Th1/Th2 revisited," *Frontiers in Immunology.* 2014; 5, article 671.

³⁸ Nelson M. Host responses to malaria and bacterial co-infections [Internet] [PhD dissertation]. [Umeå Universitet]: Umeå universitet; 2015. (Umeå University medical dissertations). Available from: <http://urn.kb.se/resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:umu:diva-102795>

³⁹ Waitumbi JN, Kuypers J, Anyona SB, *et al.* Outpatient upper respiratory tract viral infections in children with malaria symptoms in Western Kenya. *Am J Trop Med Hyg.* 2010;83(5):1010-1013. doi:10.4269/ajtmh.2010.10-0174

⁴⁰ Mark G. Thompson, Robert F. Breiman, *et al.* Influenza and Malaria Coinfection Among Young Children in Western Kenya, 2009–2011, *The Journal of Infectious Diseases*, Volume 206, Issue 11, 1 December 2012, Pages 1674–1684, <https://doi.org/10.1093/infdis/jis591>

⁴¹ Rooth IB, Bjorkman A. Suppression of *Plasmodium falciparum* infections during concomitant measles or influenza but not during pertussis. *Am J Trop Med Hyg.* 1992 Nov;47(5):675–681.

⁴² Kucharski A. COVID-19 Data Dives: Preexisting Immunity to SARS-CoV-2 Is a Thing . Commentary. In : Medscape

https://www.medscape.com/viewarticle/936250?nlid=137047_5403&src=wnl_dne_200827_mscpedit&uac=114663BT&impID=2527189&faf=1

⁴³ WHO .Malaria . Certification process. Last update: 13 March 2018

<https://www.who.int/malaria/areas/elimination/certification/en/>
accessed :1/9/2020

⁴⁴ Raham TF . Impact of Duration of Cessation of Mass BCG Vaccination Programs on Covid - 19 Mortality.Medrxive.

doi: <https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.08.20.20178889>