Switched and unswitched memory B cells detected during SARS-CoV-2 convalescence

correlate with limited symptom duration

Newell, Krista L.[1], Clemmer, Deanna C.[1], Cox, Justin B.[1], Yetunde I. Kayode[1], Zoccoli-

Rodriguez, Victoria[1], Taylor, Harry E. [1], Endy, Timothy P.[1,2], Wilmore, Joel R. [1], and

Gary M. Winslow[1]

[1]Department of Microbiology and Immunology, Upstate Medical University, Syracuse, NY

13210; [2]Institute for Global Health and Translational Sciences, Upstate Medical University,

Syracuse, NY 13210

Address correspondence to Dr. Gary M. Winslow, Upstate Medical University, 766 Irving

Avenue, Syracuse, NY 13210. 1-315-464-7658. winslowg@upstate.edu

Abstract

Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus-2 (SARS-CoV-2), the causative agent of the

pandemic human respiratory illness COVID-19, is a global health emergency. While severe

acute disease has been linked to an expansion of antibody-secreting plasmablasts, we sought

to identify B cell responses that correlated with positive clinical outcomes in convalescent

patients. We characterized the peripheral blood B cell immunophenotype and plasma antibody

responses in 40 recovered non-hospitalized COVID-19 subjects that were enrolled as donors in

a convalescent plasma treatment study. We observed a significant negative correlation between

the frequency of peripheral blood memory B cells and the duration of symptoms for

convalescent subjects. Memory B cell subsets in convalescent subjects were composed of

classical CD24$^+$ class-switched memory B cells, but also activated CD24-negative and natural

unswitched CD27$^+$ IgD$^+$ IgM$^+$ subsets. Memory B cell frequency was significantly correlated with

both IgG1 and IgM responses to the SARS-CoV-2 spike protein receptor binding domain (RBD).

IgM$^+$ memory, but not switched memory, directly correlated with virus-specific antibody

responses, and remained stable over time. Our findings suggest that the frequency of memory

B cells is a critical indicator of disease resolution, and that IgM$^+$ memory B cells play an

important role in SARS-CoV-2 immunity.

Introduction

There have now been over 24 million reported cases of SARS-CoV-2, including at least 830,000

deaths worldwide (1). As the work to develop effective vaccines and therapies to control the

pandemic progresses, it is important to develop reliable approaches for assessing durable

immunological memory. Identification of a correlate of immunity to SARS-CoV-2 has been

challenging, as clinical presentation and serological profiles vary between patients. Rare SARS-

CoV-2-specific antibodies with potent neutralizing capacity have been isolated from recovered

COVID-19 patients (2). Additionally, acute COVID-19 patients have been observed to have

perturbations of immune profiles, and have been grouped into three or more immunotype

clusters (3). On the basis of these findings, we focused on correlates of clinical outcomes in

convalescent plasma donors that could be inferred through cell-based assays. Recent studies

have correlated B cell responses in some individuals with immunity and protection (4).

B cells participate in the antiviral immune response by first rapidly releasing germline or near-

germline antibodies from plasmablasts, via an extrafollicular pathway. Upon T cell-mediated

CD40 ligation and appropriate cytokine stimulation, B cells undergo class switching and/or enter

germinal centers within secondary lymphoid organs to undergo affinity maturation. This

maturation process produces both long-lived plasma cells and memory B cells capable of

responding to secondary challenge with homotypic or heterotypic antigenic challenge.

While many studies of the B cell response to SARS-CoV-2 have focused on plasmablast

expansion, the benefit of this expansion has not been clear (3, 5, 6). Indeed, clinical outcome

correlations suggest that extrafollicular B cell activation and subsequent plasmablast generation

are detrimental to host survival and COVID-19 symptom resolution. Memory B cells are also

generated following SARS-CoV-2 infection (4). B memory cells are found as multiple subsets,

including canonical CD27^{+} class-switched memory B cells, but also activated CD24-negative

and "innate-like" natural $CD27^+$ IgD^+ IgM^+ subsets. Increased memory B cell frequencies can

reveal a successful response to acute viral infection, and can provide information regarding the

quality of T cell help during the acute immune response. In this study, we monitored memory B

cell subsets and their relationship to clinical parameters in convalescent COVID-19 subjects.

We provide evidence of stable B cell memory populations in recovered subjects that correlate

with attenuated symptom duration. We propose that a well-developed memory B cell response

provides a reliable measure of immunity that may also be useful for evaluating SARS-CoV-2

vaccine efficacy.

Results

Longitudinal sampling of plasma donors with previous SARS-CoV-2 infection

To assess clinically-informative phenotypic characteristics of the B cell response in

convalescent plasma donors, we evaluated peripheral blood PBMCs from this cohort and

healthy volunteers by flow cytometry. Forty convalescent donors were recruited through the

State University of New York Upstate Medical University Clinical Research Unit. They were

sampled at an average of 69 days post-symptom onset, were a mean age of 51.6 years, and

were composed of 35% males and 65% females. Donors were predominately white and non-

Hispanic **(Supplemental Figure 1)**. Convalescent donors were recruited following a positive

SARS-CoV-2 PCR and at least 2 weeks following the last symptom, or for asymptomatic

subjects, after a repeat SARS-CoV-2 PCR test that was negative. Seventeen subjects were also

sampled at a 3-month follow-up visit. This latter subset included asymptomatic subjects, as well

as those sampled in early, mid, and late convalescence. Characteristics of the study population

are summarized in **Figure 1**.

B cell profiles varied widely during SARS-CoV-2 convalescence both between and within

individuals

As has been observed in other studies (2, 5), the B cell profiles of convalescent plasma donors

were diverse. Using a well-defined gating strategy described by Sanz et al. (7) **(Supplemental**

Figure 2), we identified convalescent subjects with expanded B cell memory, a robust

plasmablast population, and a B cell phenotype resembling that of many healthy control

samples **(Figure 2a)**. We did not observe a difference in total $CD19^+$ B cell frequency between

convalescent and healthy subjects **(Figure 2b)**, but convalescent naïve, transitional, and

activated B cell frequencies followed the inverse trend of memory frequencies over time **(Figure**

2c-f). Memory B cell frequencies ranged widely, in both convalescent subjects and healthy

controls **(Figure 2d)**. The plasmablast compartment was the only major B cell subset analyzed

that remained significantly skewed in the convalescent phase compared to healthy controls

(Figure 2b-g). Moreover, elevated plasmablast frequencies were only observed in a subset of

subjects.

To further examine memory B cells in convalescent subjects, we visualized the flow cytometry

datasets using an unbiased t-distributed stochastic neighbor embedding (t-SNE) algorithm

(Figure 3a). This approach allowed us to resolve populations within clusters that may not be

discrete using gating strategies alone, and assess marker expression within these clusters. The

majority of convalescent subjects had normal to elevated frequencies of both switched and

unswitched CD38-negative CD24$^+$ memory B cells **(Figure 3b-c)**. These data contrast with

observations of memory B cell loss in COVID-19 patients with acute disease (8). The peripheral

blood of convalescent subjects also contained a modest pool of activated CD38-negative CD24-

negative B cells, which were the primary clusters in which CD11c and T-bet were expressed

(Figure 3a).

Given the demonstrated role of CD11c$^+$ T-bet$^+$ B cells in responses to viral antigens (9, 10), and

their presence during acute SARS-CoV-2 infection (4), we screened convalescent donor

samples for the presence of CD11c$^+$ T-bet$^+$ B cells. The frequency of both CD11c$^+$ and T-bet$^+$ B

cells were only slightly elevated in convalescent subjects compared to healthy controls, likely

reflecting a return to B cell homeostasis **(Figure 3d-e)**. Likewise, significantly elevated

frequencies of double-negative (DN) IgD-negative CD27-negative B cells were not observed in

convalescent subjects **(Figure 3f)** in our cohort. These finding suggests that activated and DN

populations may be preferentially involved in the early phase and/or critical clinical presentation

of SARS-CoV-2 infection, as observed by Woodruff et al. (5) during acute severe COVID-19.

These analyses reveal substantial heterogeneity not just in the B cell immunophenotype

between subjects, but also within the B cell memory compartment itself.

Shorter symptom duration was correlated with increased switched and IgM$^+$ memory B

cell frequencies in convalescent subjects

While we observed diverse B cell subsets in convalescent subjects, it was still unclear which, if

any, of these subsets were correlated with clinical outcomes following symptomatic COVID-19

infection. An association between frequencies of memory B cells and enhanced recovery

following COVID-19 pneumonia was reported (8). We therefore analyzed our B cell

immunophenotyping dataset for its correlation with self-reported symptoms in our convalescent

cohort. Our analysis revealed a significant negative correlation between the duration of COVID-

19 symptoms and the frequency of memory B cells within the B cell compartment, as well as for

the IgM$^+$ memory B cell subset **(Figure 4a-b)**. A similar trend was observed for switched

memory B cell frequency **(Figure 4c)**.

To determine whether these observations were due solely to the time of sampling, we analyzed

the frequency of B cell subsets in convalescent subjects and the number of days between last

symptom and sample collection, as well as the number of days between symptom onset and

sampling. IgM$^+$ and switched memory B cell frequencies were stable or enhanced over time. We

failed to observe a correlation between IgM$^+$ or switched memory B cell frequency with the time

since the last reported symptom **(Figure 4d-e)**, or the time since symptom onset **(Figure 4g-h)**.

As was expected, longer symptom duration correlated with increased frequency of naïve and

transitional B cells, due to contraction of the plasmablast response **(Figure 4g-k)**. Neither age

nor gender were observed to have a statistically significant influence on any of the clinical or

immunophenotypic parameters examined in this dataset (data not shown).

Several studies have reported robust expansion of peripheral blood plasmablasts during SARS-

CoV-2 infection in some patients (5, 6). In agreement with these data, our cohort of

convalescent subjects contained individuals with dramatically elevated frequencies of CD38^{hi}

CD24-negative CD19$^+$ plasmablasts **(Figure 1g)**. Despite this trend, this subset was not

significantly correlated with the duration of COVID-19 symptoms at the time point at which we

sampled **(Figure 4l)**. Plasmablast frequency among convalescent B cells did appear to wane

over the time since last symptom, and symptom onset, confirming the contraction of the acute

response **(Figure 4f, i)**. Collectively, these data suggest that the presence of B cell memory is a

durable clinical correlate of shorter duration of COVID-19 disease.

Memory B cell frequency was correlated with anti-RBD antibody production

We next addressed whether the frequency of B cell memory in convalescent subjects correlated

with the generation of anti-spike receptor-binding domain (RBD) antibodies. The spike RBD is

thought to be required for SARS-CoV-2 binding and entry via the ACE2 receptor, and both

inhibitory and neutralizing anti-RBD antibodies have been identified in infected and recovered

subjects (4, 11). In seropositive convalescent subjects, IgG1 and IgM anti-spike RBD were

significantly correlated with CD24$^+$ CD38-negative memory B cell frequency **(Figure 5a-b, f)**.

This was not observed for IgG2, IgG3, or IgG4 **(Figure 5c-e**; for full cohort, see **Supplemental**

Figure 5).

The positive relationship between IgG1 and memory held for IgM$^+$ memory B cells **(Figure 5g)**,

but not for switched memory **(Figure 5j)**. For almost all anti-RBD IgG1-producing subjects, there

was a nearly dose-dependent correlation between and anti-RBD IgG1 and IgM$^+$ memory B cell

frequency. IgM anti-RBD was significantly correlated with both switched and unswitched

memory, though not as markedly **(Figure 5i & l)**. Memory B cell frequency and total

immunoglobulin levels were largely unrelated, except for a weak positive correlation between

memory and total IgG2 **(Supplemental Figure 5g-l)**.

Memory B cell frequencies were maintained or increased as plasmablasts returned to

baseline.

We next addressed whether the memory B cells were a stable population, or waned, as did the

plasmablast response. We re-sampled a subset of the convalescent cohort at least 3 months

after the initial visit **(Figure 1, Supplemental Figure 1)**. Results from this longitudinal analysis

showed a contraction of the plasmablast response **(Figure 6a)**. We also observed that memory

B cell frequencies and subset distribution were maintained or increased in most subjects

(Figure 6b-d). Naïve B cell frequency remained nearly constant **(Figure 6e)**, and transitional

subset frequencies fluctuated over time, without exhibiting a trend **(Figure 6f)**. Although data

from individual subjects demonstrated temporal variability with regards to the frequency of

activation-associated B cell subsets, the frequency of T-bet$^+$, CD11c$^+$, DN, and activated B cells

did not change significantly over time for the cohort as a whole **(Figure 6g-j)**. These trends were

not obviously impacted by the stage of convalescence when the first sample was obtained.

None of the B cell subsets analyzed exhibited statistically significant changes over the 3-month

period wherein we assessed our convalescent cohort, although the plasmablast compartment

contraction suggests a return to B cell homeostasis. These findings support a role for switched

and unswitched memory B cells in the maintenance of stable, durable SARS-CoV-2 immunity.

Discussion

In this study we identified both unswitched and switched B cell memory as a correlate of shorter

COVID-19 symptom duration. Moreover, IgM$^+$ memory correlated strongly with the anti-RBD

IgG1 antibody response. These data suggest that a protective memory response occurs in at

least some COVID-19 patients, preceded or accompanied by the generation of IgM$^+$ memory B

cells. We envision three possible explanations for these findings. First, it is possible that

memory B cells identified in some individuals were generated in response to a previous

coronavirus infection. Coronaviruses as a group likely generate cross-reactive B and T cells

responses (12). The observation that the anti-RBD IgG1 response was correlated with IgM$^+$

memory cell frequency is paradoxical, however, given that IgM$^+$ memory cells don't produce

switched immunoglobulin. We propose that IgM$^+$ memory cells are generated in abundance

during coronavirus infections, and that some of these enter germinal centers and undergo class

switching following a related coronavirus infection, thereby contributing to enhanced IgG1

production. The capacity of IgM$^+$ memory cells to preferentially enter germinal centers upon

activation has been well-documented in mouse and human studies (13, 14, 15). This

characteristic versatility of IgM$^+$ memory cells could be advantageous for immunity to

pathogens, such as the coronaviruses, where infections with closely related strains often occur.

The lack of correlation between the frequency of resting memory B cells and CD11c$^+$ and/or T-

bet$^+$ B cells in convalescent subjects was unexpected, given the pivotal role these molecules

play in type-1 B cell immunity. We hypothesize that these factors may play a key role during the

acute phase and during chronic viral infections, but are not essential during the convalescent

phase of SARS-CoV-2 infection. Additional prospective studies and kinetic analyses of

previously-exposed and naïve individuals will help to resolve this question.

A second explanation for the enhancement of COVID-19 recovery coincident with memory B

cell expansion, is that naïve subjects whose B cells received more efficient T cell help during

primary infection generated a larger pool of memory B cells. This explanation is consistent with

the close relationship between memory and pathogen-specific antibody production we

observed. This explanation would suggest that T cells contributed to a better germinal center

response in some individuals. In contrast, subjects whose B cells received insufficient or

inappropriate T cell help would generate poor germinal center reactions, fewer antigen-specific

antibodies, and have a longer symptomatic disease period.

T cell help occurs largely within germinal centers, suggesting that the local immune environment

may be critical for an adequate response to SARS-CoV-2. Indeed, severe disruption of

lymphatic tissue organization and germinal center formation have been observed in severe

COVID-19 cases (16). Moreover, studies from our laboratory have shown that follicle

architecture disruption, acute plasmablast expansion, and type-1 cytokine skewing occurs

during murine intracellular bacterial infection (17–19). We observed IgM^+ memory to be

protective during *E. muris* infection, despite severe immunopathology associated with primary

infection. In this way, it is possible that the germinal center disruption caused by SARS-CoV-2

infection also contributes to the generation of protective IgM^+ B cell memory. The data herein

suggests that IgM^+ memory B cells may complement long-lived plasma cells generated via

germinal centers and provide protection against subsequent SARS-CoV infection.

Finally, the benefit of memory B cell expansion may only be an indication that acute

inflammation and excessive cytokine production did not occur in some individuals. Under

inflammatory conditions, such as those occurring in systemic lupus erythematous (SLE), B cell

subsets have been shown to be skewed toward an activated, extrafollicular effector fate (20). It

has been suggested that B cell responses to severe acute COVID-19 disease have similar

characteristics to those observed in SLE (5). The variability in the penetrance of this phenotype

may be explained by the influence of gender and pre-existing autoimmunity. Future work using

animal models of COVID-19 may help to resolve these questions.

Our studies support other work that has reported that germinal center-derived memory B cells

are likely generated following SARS-CoV-2 infection, and that these memory B cells are a

durable correlate of an effective primary response (4, 8). These studies challenge early claims

of waning immunity shortly after SARS-CoV-2 infection. Our data also show that some

individuals can be identified as having better natural immunity. We also propose that both IgM$^+$

and switched memory B cells may provide a good indication of vaccine efficacy, and that

individuals with large numbers of IgM$^+$ memory B cells may be better protected from future re-

infection with homotypic or heterotypic infection. Our findings suggest that IgM$^+$ memory B cells

are central to the COVID-19 adaptive immune response, and highlight the need for prospective

SARS-CoV-2 studies to determine whether large memory B cell populations are a pre-existing

correlate of protection, or a durable measure of the antiviral immune response.

Methods:

Study Design

Study participants were recruited at the SUNY Upstate Medical University Clinical Research Unit starting from March 2020 and is ongoing. Participants meeting eligibility criteria were adults aged 18 or older who have tested positive for SARS-CoV-2 and are at least 14 days past their first symptom. Exclusion criteria included the inability to give informed consent and/or an inability to donate plasma or blood transfusion in the past. Study participants were interviewed by study staff, and presented to the SUNY Upstate Clinical Research Unit for peripheral blood collection. Information regarding symptoms, including dates of first and last symptom, was self-reported. Donors were questioned about acute symptoms such as fever, shortness of breath, sore throat, cough that impacted activity, and fatigue that impacted activity. These indications were used to calculate dates of symptoms retrospectively. Lingering symptoms such as loss of taste and smell, mild cough or tickle in the throat, or lingering fatigue that did not impact their daily activity were not considered part of the acute illness and therefore not included in the length of illness. For donors reporting no symptoms, the date of positive RT-PCR test was used for the start and stop date of symptoms. These subjects were not included in correlative analysis of symptom duration. Healthy control subjects were adults aged 18 or older who denied infection with or known exposure to SARS-CoV-2. Healthy controls were screened by anti-RBD plasma ELISA to confirm negative exposure status. Sample size was determined based on subject availability. All samples were de-identified following collection, and researchers conducting assays were blinded to clinical data until final comparative analysis.

Blood sample processing and storage

PBMCs were obtained following gradient centrifugal separation of peripheral blood using Cell Preparation Tubes (CPT) (BD) for 30 minutes at 1700 x g. Plasma was separated, aliquoted,

and stored at -20°C for antibody assays. The mononuclear layer was washed in PBS prior to

counting on a Coulter particle counter (Becton-Dickinson). PBMCs were either directly stained

for flow cytometry (initial visit samples), or frozen slowly to -80°C in FBS and DMSO for short-

term storage (3-month visit samples). Flow cytometry panel was validated using a sample of

fresh vs. frozen PBMCs to ensure comparability in target detection. Plasma samples were heat-

inactivated (56°C for 30 minutes) prior to use in assays.

Flow Cytometry

The following antibodies used for flow cytometry were obtained from BioLegend: CD21 (Bu32),

T-bet (4B10), CD38 (HIT2), CD11c (Bu15), CD3 (HIT3A), CD14 (HCD14), IgD (IA6-2), CD24

(MC5), IgM (MHM-88), CD27 (O323), and CD19 (HIB19). For flow cytometric analysis, single-

cell suspensions were incubated with 1 microg/ml anti-CD16/CD32 in 2% normal goat

serum/HBSS/0.1% sodium azide (Fc blocking solution). The cells were then stained with aqua

Live/Dead stain (Invitrogen) and washed prior to incubation with mAbs. Cells were fixed,

permeabilized, and stained for intracellular targets using an intracellular staining kit (BD).

Unstained controls were used to set the flow cytometer photomultiplier tube voltages, and

single-color positive controls were used to adjust instrument compensation settings. Data from

stained samples were acquired using a BD Fortessa flow cytometer equipped with DIVA

software (BD Biosciences) and were analyzed using FlowJo software (Tree Star). t-SNE

visualization was generated using FlowJo automatic (opt-SNE) learning configuration, with 1000

iterations, a perplexity of 30, learning rate of 3179, exact KNN algorithm, and Barnes-Hut

gradient algorithm.

ELISA protocol

Plasma samples were first heat-inactivated at 56°C for 30 mins before use in assays.

Recombinant Twin-Strep-tagged RBD protein was purified from 293T cells transfected with

pαH-RBD SD1-3CH25, generously provided by Jason S. McLellan (University of Texas), as

previously described (21). RBD protein was coated on Strep-Tactin® microplates plates (IBA,

Germany) in binding buffer (100mM Tris pH 8, 150mM NaCl, 1mM EDTA) overnight at 4°C.

Plates were washed three times with PBS-T (1x PBS/0.05% Tween-20) and subsequently

blocked with 3% BSA (Sigma) in PBS-T for 1 hour at RT. Diluted plasma was loaded onto plates

and incubated for 2 hours at RT. After incubation, plates were washed three times with PBS-T

and HRP-conjugated secondary anti-human antibodies were used for detection. Total IgG was

detected using goat-anti-human-IgG-HRP (Rockland, #209-1304). IgM was detected using goat-

anti-human-IgM-HRP (Sigma, #A6907), and IgG subclass antibodies were detected with mouse

horseradish peroxidase (HRP)-conjugated anti-human IgG1 (9054-05), IgG2 (9060-05), IgG3

(9210-05), and IgG4 (9200-05) from SouthernBiotech. Wells were washed three times with

PBS-T before the addition of HRP substrate SIGMAFAST OPD (Sigma, #P9187). Reaction was

quenched with 1M hydrochloric acid (Fisher Scientific, #S25856) and read at 490 nM on a

BioTek Synergy LX multi-mode plate reader. Area under the curve (AUC) analysis was

performed using peak identification set to a 10% minimum change from baseline. Plasma

ELISAs for total human immunoglobulin isotype quantitation were performed using the Human

Immunoglobulin Isotyping LEGENDplex 6-plex kit (BioLegend) according to the manufacturer's

instructions. Data were collected using a BD LSR II flow cytometer and analyzed using

LEGENDplex Data Analysis Software.

Statistical Analysis

Statistical analyses were performed using GraphPad Prism software (v8.4.3). Analysis of

correlation between flow cytometry, total serum immunoglobulin ELISA data, and continuous

clinical data was performed using Pearson correlation coefficients for data sets equal to or

larger than 35 values, or nonparametric Spearman's Rank correlation for data sets with fewer

than 35 values. *p*-values are two-tailed and 95% confidence intervals shown where noted in

figure legends. Statistical analysis of cell subset frequency between healthy and the total

convalescent donor cohort from flow cytometry assays was performed using unpaired

nonparametric Mann-Whitney test with two-tailed p-values and 95% confidence intervals.

Multiple comparison analysis between each convalescent subject subgroup was done with

Kruskal-Wallis test with Dunn's correction. Adjusted p value was used to determine family-wise

significance at alpha = 0.05. Statistical analysis of anti-RBD plasma ELISA data was performed

using area under the curve analysis with peak identification set to a 10% minimum change from

baseline. NS indicates a p value > 0.05, *p, < 0.05, **p, < 0.01, ***p, < 0.001, and ****p,

<0.0001. The statistical tests performed are indicated in the figure legends. For column graphs,

the column in each plot indicates the arithmetic mean of the dataset, and upper and lower

bounds indicate SD of the dataset.

Study approval

All participants provided written informed consent prior to participation in the study, which was

performed according to a protocol approved by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) of the

SUNY Upstate Medical University under IRB number 1587400. All clinical investigation was

conducted according to Declaration of Helsinki principles.

Author contributions

K.L.N., H.E.T., J.R.W., and G.M.W. conceived, designed, and analyzed the experiments. T.P.E.

designed clinical protocols. K.L.N. and J.B.C. performed flow cytometry. D.C.C., Y.I.K. and

H.E.T. performed anti-RBD ELISAs, and V.Z.R. carried out total plasma Ig ELISAs. T.P.E.

recruited participants and executed clinical protocols. K.L.N. and J.B.C. processed clinical

samples. K.L.N. authored the manuscript, with editing by J.R.W., H.E.T., T.P.E., and G.M.W. All

authors reviewed and approved the manuscript.

Acknowledgments

We thank all study participants who made this work possible, the SUNY Upstate Medical

University Clinical Research Unit, Michelle Klick for research coordination, the SUNY Upstate

Institute for Global Health and Translational Science for research administration, Dongliang

Wang for assistance with statistical analysis, Mark Abbott and Kristen Baxter for critical

laboratory support, Lisa Phelps and Steven Taffet for support with the SUNY Upstate Medical

University flow cytometry core, and Russell Levack for helpful discussion. This work was

supported by U.S. Department of Health and Human Services Grant R01AI114545 (G.M.W.),

SUNY Office of Research and Economic Development seed grant RFP #20-03-COVID 202077

(J.R.W. and G.M.W.), and internal funding from SUNY Upstate Medical University.

Disclosures

The authors have declared that no conflict of interest exists.

Data Availability

All data generated or analyzed during this study are included in this article and supplementary

data, or available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

References

1. Center for Systems Science and Engineering at Johns Hopkins University. COVID-19

Dashboard Web Site. https://coronavirus.jhu.edu/map.html.

2. Robbiani DF et al. Convergent antibody responses to SARS-CoV-2 in convalescent

individuals. *Nature* 2020;584(7821):437–442.

3. Mathew D et al. Deep immune profiling of COVID-19 patients reveals distinct immunotypes

with therapeutic implications. *Science* 2020;369(6508):eabc8511.

4. Rodda LB et al. Functional SARS-CoV-2-specific immune memory persists after mild COVID-

19. [preprint]. https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.08.11.20171843. Posted on MedRxiv August 15,

2020.

5. Woodruff M et al. Dominant extrafollicular B cell responses in severe COVID-19 disease

correlate with robust viral-specific antibody production but poor clinical outcomes. [preprint].

https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.04.29.20083717. Posted on MedRxiv May 3, 2020, revised June

22, 2020.

6. Kuri-Cervantes L et al. Immunologic perturbations in severe COVID-19/SARS-CoV-2

infection. [preprint]. https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.05.18.101717. Posted on BioRxiv May 18,

2020.

7. Sanz I et al. Challenges and Opportunities for Consistent Classification of Human B Cell and

Plasma Cell Populations. *Front. Immunol.* 2019;10:2458.

8. De Biasi S et al. Expansion of plasmablasts and loss of memory B cells in peripheral blood

from COVID-19 patients with pneumonia. *Eur. J. Immunol.* 2020;eji.202048838.

9. Knox JJ et al. T-bet+ B cells are induced by human viral infections and dominate the HIV

gp140 response. *JCI Insight* 2017;2(8).

10. Rubtsova K, Rubtsov AV, van Dyk LF, Kappler JW, Marrack P. T-box transcription factor T-

bet, a key player in a unique type of B-cell activation essential for effective viral clearance. *Proc*

Natl Acad Sci U A 2013;110(34):E3216-24.

11. Premkumar L et al. The receptor binding domain of the viral spike protein is an

immunodominant and highly specific target of antibodies in SARS-CoV-2 patients. *Sci. Immunol.*

2020;5(48).

12. Mateus J et al. Selective and cross-reactive SARS-CoV-2 T cell epitopes in unexposed

humans. *Science* 2020;eabd3871.

13. Kenderes KJ et al. T-Bet+ IgM Memory Cells Generate Multi-lineage Effector B Cells. *Cell*

Rep. 2018;24(4):824-837.e3.

14. Weill J-C, Reynaud C-A. IgM memory B cells: specific effectors of innate-like and adaptive

responses. *Curr. Opin. Immunol.* 2020;63:1–6.

15. Seifert M et al. Functional capacities of human IgM memory B cells in early inflammatory

responses and secondary germinal center reactions. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.*

2015;112(6):E546-555.

16. Kaneko N et al. Loss of Bcl-6-Expressing T Follicular Helper Cells and Germinal Centers in

COVID-19. *Cell* 2020;S0092867420310679.

17. Popescu M, Cabrera-Martinez B, Winslow GM. TNF-α Contributes to Lymphoid Tissue

Disorganization and Germinal Center B Cell Suppression during Intracellular Bacterial Infection.

J. Immunol. 2019;ji1900484.

18. Racine R, Chatterjee M, Winslow GM. CD11c expression identifies a population of

extrafollicular antigen-specific splenic plasmablasts responsible for CD4 T-independent antibody

responses during intracellular bacterial infection. *J Immunol.* 2008;181(2):1375–85.

19. Levack RC, Newell KL, Popescu M, Cabrera-Martinez B, Winslow GM. CD11c+ T-bet+ B

Cells Require IL-21 and IFN-γ from Type 1 T Follicular Helper Cells and Intrinsic Bcl-6

Expression but Develop Normally in the Absence of T-bet. *J. Immunol.* 2020;205(4):1050–1058.

20. Jenks SA, Cashman KS, Woodruff MC, Lee FE, Sanz I. Extrafollicular responses in humans

and SLE. *Immunol Rev.* 2019;288(1):136–148.

21. Wrapp D et al. Cryo-EM structure of the 2019-nCoV spike in the prefusion conformation.

Science 2020;367(6483):1260–1263.

Figure 1. Study design and clinical data. (a) Graphical representation of convalescent subject

groupings and gender. All grouping and subset designations were done retrospectively. **(b)**

Symptom and sampling timeline for symptomatic subjects ($n = 35$), ordered by length of

convalescence.

Figure 2. The B cell profiles of individual convalescent plasma donors were diverse. (a)

Representative flow plots of live, singlet, CD19$^+$ lymphocytes demonstrating 5 primary B cell

subsets in one healthy and 4 convalescent subjects. **(b-d)** Histograms of healthy vs.

convalescent donor frequencies of **(b)** total CD19$^+$ B cells, and **(c)** naïve, **(d)** memory, **(e)**

transitional 1 and 2, **(f)** activated naïve/memory, and **(g)** plasmablast subsets among viable

CD19$^+$ lymphocytes. Bars represent mean $^+$/- SD. Multiple comparison analysis between each

donor subgroup was done with Kruskal-Wallis test with Dunn's correction. Adjusted p value was

used to determine family-wise significance at alpha = 0.05. Healthy control and total

convalescent groups also compared by Mann-Whitney test with two-tailed p value, alpha = 0.05.

Healthy control $n = 24$, conv. total $n = 40$, asymp. $n = 5$, conv. early $n = 12$, conv. mid $n = 6$,

conv. late $n = 17$.

Figure 3. Convalescent plasma donor B cell compartments were heterogeneous and

enriched for memory B cells. (a) tSNE representation sub-gated to highlight key clusters of

viable CD19$^+$ lymphocytes from a representative convalescent donor with an enriched memory

B cell subset. Heatmap overlay shows median expression for each target. **(b-f)** Healthy and

convalescent donor cell frequencies for **(b)** IgM$^+$ memory, **(c)** switched Memory, **(d)** CD11c$^+$, **(e)**

T-bet$^+$, and **(f)** DN subsets among viable CD19$^+$ lymphocytes. Bars represent mean $^+$/- SD.

Multiple comparison analysis between each donor subgroup was done with Kruskal-Wallis test

with Dunn's correction. Adjusted p value was used to determine family-wise significance at

alpha = 0.05. Healthy control $n = 24$, conv. total $n = 40$, asymp. $n = 5$, conv. early $n = 12$, conv.

mid $n = 6$, conv. late $n = 17$, except for T-bet **(e)**, where $n = 4, 9, 6,$ and 16, respectively.

Figure 4. The frequency of memory B cells in the peripheral blood was correlated with

shorter symptom duration following infection with SARS-CoV-2, and stable over time. (a-

c) Scatterplot correlation of symptom duration in days, vs. the frequency among viable CD19^{+} B

cells of **(a**) total memory, **(b)** IgM^{+} memory, and **(c)** switched memory. **(d-f)** Scatterplot

correlation of days since last symptom vs. **(d)** IgM^{+} memory, **(e)** switched memory, and **(f)**

plasmablast frequency among viable CD19^{+} lymphocytes. **(g-i)** Scatterplot correlation of days

since symptom onset vs. **(g)** IgM^{+} memory, **(h)** switched memory, and **(i)** plasmablast frequency

among viable CD19^{+} B cells. **(j-l)** Scatterplot correlation of symptom duration in days, vs. **(j)**

naïve and transitional type 3, **(k)** transitional type 1 and 2, and **(l)** plasmablast frequency among

viable CD19^{+} B cells. Pearson's correlation r value and 95% confidence intervals shown with

two-tailed *p* values, alpha = 0.05. *n* = 35 (all symptomatic subjects) for all plots.

Figure 5. Anti-spike receptor binding domain antibody levels correlated with memory B

cell frequency in convalescent plasma donors. (a-f) Scatterplot correlation of area under the

curve for anti-RBD plasma absorbance vs. memory B cell frequency from convalescent subjects

seropositive for each isotype (IgG1 & IgG3 *n* = 15, IgM *n* =16). Subjects whose data points are

circled in **(a)** were isolated for statistical analysis of IgG1 in **(b, g, and j**; *n* = 12**). (g-i)** Scatterplot

correlation of area under the curve for anti-RBD plasma absorbance vs. IgM^{+} memory B cell

frequency among viable CD19^{+} lymphocytes. **(j-l)** Scatterplot correlation of area under the curve

for anti-RBD plasma absorbance vs. switched memory B cell frequency among viable CD19^{+}

lymphocytes. Spearman's correlation r_s value and 95% confidence intervals shown with two-

tailed p value, alpha = 0.05 for all analyses. Sample number distribution was the same for total,

IgM[+] and switched memory B cell analyses.

Figure 6. Convalescent SARS-CoV-2 subjects displayed a contraction of plasmablasts

over time, but maintained memory B cells. (a-j) Frequency of **(a)** plasmablasts, **(b)** total

memory, **(c)** switched memory, **(d)** IgM[+] memory, **(e)** naïve + transitional 3, **(f)** transitional 1 + 2,

(g) T-bet$^+$, **(h)** CD11c$^+$, **(i)** DN, and **(j)** activated cells among CD19$^+$ viable lymphocytes from 15

convalescent plasma donors at initial draw and 3-month follow-up visit. Each pair of connected

points (and color) represents an individual subject. Symbol shapes indicate convalescent

subset. Bars represent mean. Two donors (one asymp., one late conv.) were omitted due to B

cell abnormalities likely unrelated to SARS-CoV-2.

Figure 1. Study design and clinical data. (a) Graphical representation of convalescent subject groupings and gender. All grouping and subset designations were done retrospectively. **(b)** Symptom and sampling timeline for symptomatic subjects ($n = 35$), ordered by length of convalescence.

Figure 2. The B cell profiles of individual convalescent plasma donors were diverse. (a) Representative flow plots of live, singlet, CD19+ lymphocytes demonstrating 5 primary B cell subsets in one healthy and 4 convalescent subjects. **(b-d)** Histograms of healthy vs. convalescent donor frequencies of **(b)** total CD19+ B cells, and **(c)** naïve, **(d)** memory, **(e)** transitional 1 and 2, **(f)** activated naïve/memory, and **(g)** plasmablast subsets among viable CD19+ lymphocytes. Bars represent mean +/- SD. Multiple comparison analysis between each donor subgroup was done with Kruskal-Wallis test with Dunn's correction. Adjusted *p* value was used to determine family-wise significance at alpha = 0.05. Healthy control and total convalescent groups also compared by Mann-Whitney test with two-tailed *p* value, alpha = 0.05. Healthy control *n* = 24, conv. total *n* = 40, asymp. *n* = 5, conv. early *n* = 12, conv. mid *n* = 6, conv. late *n* = 17.

Figure 3. Convalescent plasma donor B cell compartments were heterogeneous and enriched for memory B cells. (a) tSNE representation sub-gated to highlight key clusters of viable CD19+ lymphocytes from a representative convalescent donor with an enriched memory B cell subset. Heatmap overlay shows median expression for each target. **(b-f)** Healthy and convalescent donor cell frequencies for **(b)** IgM+ memory, **(c)** switched Memory, **(d)** CD11c+, **(e)** T-bet+, and **(f)** DN subsets among viable CD19+ lymphocytes. Bars represent mean +/- SD. Multiple comparison analysis between each donor subgroup was done with Kruskal-Wallis test with Dunn's correction. Adjusted p value was used to determine family-wise significance at alpha = 0.05. Healthy control n = 24, conv. total n = 40, asymp. n = 5, conv. early n = 12, conv. mid n = 6, conv. late n = 17, except for T-bet **(e)**, where n = 4, 9, 6, and 16, respectively.

Figure 4. The frequency of memory B cells in the peripheral blood was correlated with shorter symptom duration following infection with SARS-CoV-2, and stable over time. (a-c) Scatterplot correlation of symptom duration in days, vs. the frequency among viable CD19+ B cells of **(a)** total memory, **(b)** IgM+ memory, and **(c)** switched memory. **(d-f)** Scatterplot correlation of days since last symptom vs. **(d)** IgM+ memory, **(e)** switched memory, and **(f)** plasmablast frequency among viable CD19+ lymphocytes. **(g-i)** Scatterplot correlation of days since symptom onset vs. **(g)** IgM+ memory, **(h)** switched memory, and **(i)** plasmablast frequency among viable CD19+ B cells. **(j-l)** Scatterplot correlation of symptom duration in days, vs. **(j)** naïve and transitional type 3, **(k)** transitional type 1 and 2, and **(l)** plasmablast frequency among viable CD19+ B cells. Pearson's correlation r value and 95% confidence intervals shown with two-tailed *p* values, alpha = 0.05. *n* = 35 (all symptomatic subjects) for all plots.

Figure 5. Anti-spike receptor binding domain antibody levels correlated with memory B cell frequency in convalescent plasma donors. (a-f) Scatterplot correlation of area under the curve for anti-RBD plasma absorbance vs. memory B cell frequency from convalescent subjects seropositive for each isotype (IgG1 & IgG3 *n* = 15, IgM *n* =16). Subjects whose data points are circled in **(a)** were isolated for statistical analysis of IgG1 in **(b, g, and j**; *n* = 12**). (g-i)** Scatterplot correlation of area under the curve for anti-RBD plasma absorbance vs. IgM$^+$ memory B cell frequency among viable CD19$^+$ lymphocytes. **(j-l)** Scatterplot correlation of area under the curve for anti-RBD plasma absorbance vs. switched memory B cell frequency among viable CD19$^+$ lymphocytes. Spearman's correlation r$_s$ value and 95% confidence intervals shown with two-tailed *p* value, alpha = 0.05 for all analyses. Sample number distribution was the same for total, IgM$^+$ and switched memory B cell analyses.

Figure 6. Convalescent SARS-CoV-2 subjects displayed a contraction of plasmablasts over time, but maintained memory B cells.
(a-j) Frequency of **(a)** plasmablasts, **(b)** total memory, **(c)** switched memory, **(d)** IgM+ memory, **(e)** naïve + transitional 3, **(f)** transitional 1 + 2, **(g)** T-bet+, **(h)** CD11c+, **(i)** DN, and **(j)** activated cells among CD19+ viable lymphocytes from 15 convalescent plasma donors at initial draw and 3-month follow-up visit. Each pair of connected points (and color) represents an individual subject. Symbol shapes indicate convalescent subset. Bars represent mean. Two donors (one asymp., one late conv.) were omitted due to B cell abnormalities likely unrelated to SARS-CoV-2.