

1 **Vaccination for some childhood diseases may impact the outcome of covid-19 infections**

2 Irene Gobe¹, Garesego F Koto¹, Margaret Mokomane¹, Kesaobaka Molebatsi², Ishmael Kasvosve¹,

3 Modisa S Motswaledi^{1*}

4 ¹Block 246 School of Allied Health Professions, University of Botswana, , Gaborone.

5 ²Block 244I, Department of Statistics, University of Botswana, Gaborone.

6

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

7 **Abstract:**

8 **Background:** COVID-19 found the world in a state of unpreparedness. While research efforts to
9 develop a vaccine are on-going, others have suggested the use of available vaccines to boost innate
10 immunity.

11 **Objective:** We analysed three databases: UNICEF Immunization Coverage, Worldometer Corona
12 Virus Updates and World Bank List of Economies to establish the association, if any, between
13 vaccination for various diseases and COVID-19 death rates and recoveries across world economies.

14 **Results:** Mean percentage death rates were lower in countries that vaccinated for Hepatitis-B birth
15 dose (2.53% vs 3.79%, $p = 0.001$), Bacille Calmette-Guérin Vaccine (2.93% vs 5.10%, $p = 0.025$) and
16 Inactivated Polio Vaccine 1st dose (2.8% vs 4.01%, $p = 0.022$) than those which did not report
17 vaccination. In high income countries, a significant negative correlation with death rates was
18 observed with vaccination for Measles-containing vaccine 2nd dose ($r = -0.290$, $p = 0.032$), Rubella-
19 containing vaccine 1st dose ($r = -0.325$, $p = 0.015$), Hepatitis B 3rd dose ($r = -0.562$, $p = 3.3 \times 10^{-5}$),
20 Inactivated Polio vaccine 1st dose ($r = -0.720$, $p = 0.008$). Inactivated Polio Vaccine 1st dose and
21 Measles-containing vaccine 2nd dose also correlated with better recoveries. In Low Income countries,
22 only Rubella-containing vaccine correlated with lower deaths while Yellow fever vaccine was
23 associated with poorer recoveries.

24 **Conclusion:** Our analysis corroborates the potential benefit of vaccination and warrant further
25 research to explore the rationale for repurposing other vaccines to fight COVID-19.

26

27 **Key Words:** COVID-19, Percent death rate, percent recovery, vaccine coverage,

28

29

30 Introduction

31 A number of recent publications have raised conversations regarding the potential benefits of BCG
32 vaccine in mitigating the adverse effects of SARS COV-2 infection(1, 2). Such hypotheses were inspired
33 by past reports where BCG vaccination was observed to have benefits beyond prevention of
34 tuberculosis alone. These included protection against some viral infections(3) as well as overall
35 reduction in childhood mortality occasioned by other infectious agents(4). A recent publication based
36 on country policies reported that countries with a long history of BCG vaccination experienced lower
37 numbers of SARS COV-2 infections and fewer deaths(1). Another study found a strong correlation
38 between the BCG index and reduced COVID-19 mortalities in European countries (5).

39 While most vaccines confer immunity through antigen-specific immune responses, some reports
40 suggest that vaccination against one disease may confer protection against another, as evidenced in
41 the upregulation of a wide range of innate immune responses to BCG vaccine(6). This phenomenon is
42 attributed to the development of “trained” immunity, in which BCG-activated monocytes are primed
43 to produce more cytokines such as IL-1 β , IL-6, IFN- γ and TNF(2).

44 In fact, other investigators have reported increased expression of pathogen-associated molecular
45 patterns on cells of monocytic origin up to one year after exposure to BCG, enabling a more robust
46 induction of TH1/Th17 responses(7). BCG vaccination was also noted to enhance production of such
47 cytokines as IFN- γ , IL-2 and IL-12, which are important for potentiation of cell mediated immunity(8).
48 The above notwithstanding, other investigators have cast doubt on the potential benefits of BCG
49 vaccination in the fight against COVID-19(9).

50 The afore-mentioned discussions have inevitably culminated on the debate to consider the potential
51 prophylactic use of BCG against COVID-19(10), with some data corroborating the anti-COVID-19
52 effect(11). In the current report, we analysed global vaccination coverage and global COVID-19 data
53 to determine if any association existed between the degree of vaccine coverage and the death rates
54 attributed to COVID-19, as well as recovery rates.

55 **Methods:**

56 We studied global vaccination coverages as reported by UNICEF(12) and compared them to COVID-19
57 deaths and recoveries across the world as reported on the Worldometer(13). These vaccines included
58 the measles-containing-vaccine first dose (MCV1), measles-containing vaccine second dose (MCV2),
59 Pneumococcal Conjugate Vaccine – 3rd Dose (PCV3), Rubella-containing vaccine first dose (RCV1),
60 Rotavirus-containing vaccine, (RotaCV), Diphtheria and tetanus toxoid and pertussis-containing
61 vaccine (DTP3), Hepatitis B vaccine – Birth dose (HepB_BD), Hepatitis B third dose (HepB3),
62 *Haemophilus influenzae* type b-containing vaccine (HibV), Bacille Calmette-Guérin Vaccine (BCG),
63 inactivated Polio virus vaccine (IPV) and Yellow fever vaccine (YFV).

64 The death rate for each country was computed as the total number of deaths per million divided by
65 the total number of confirmed cases per million, expressed as a percentage. The independent samples
66 t-test was used to compare the mean percentage of COVID-19 deaths between countries that
67 reported vaccinations and those which did not, using data extracted on the 3rd August 2020 from the
68 COVID-19 Worldometer. Death and recovery data were available for 168 and 175 countries,
69 respectively. However, some vaccination data was missing for some countries and this resulted in
70 different sample sizes as reflected in the analyses. Mean vaccination coverages were correlated with
71 recovery and death rates where such vaccination data was available. Otherwise we compared country
72 death rates and recoveries according to categories of whether vaccine data was reported or not. Data
73 was also disaggregated according to the World Bank economic classification (June 2020)(14).

74 **Results**

75 The mean death rate (\pm sd) from COVID-19 for 168 countries was $3.2\pm 3.5\%$ with a range of 0.06-29.3%,
76 while the mean recovery rate for 175 countries was $68.2\pm 22.3\%$. Recoveries ranged from 8-100%. The
77 results showing a comparison of mean COVID-19 death rates between vaccinating and non-
78 vaccinating countries is shown in Table 1. Only Hepatitis B-BD, BCG and IPV ($p= 0.01$, $p=0.025$ and
79 $p=0.022$, respectively) showed significant differences in mean COVID-19 death rates across vaccinating

80 and non-vaccinating countries, with vaccinating countries showing significantly lower death rates.
81 Other vaccines did not yield significant differences between vaccinating and non-vaccinating
82 countries.

83 **Table 1:** Comparison of Covid-19 death rates in countries vaccinating or not vaccinating for certain
84 diseases

Vaccine name*	Vaccinating Countries		Non-Vaccinating Countries		Two-tailed significance
	N	COVID-19 Death Rate (%±SD)	N	COVID-19 Death Rate (%)	
MCV2	144	3.38±3.66	24	2.40±2.11	0.217
PCV3	130	3.43±3.82	38	2.60±1.87	0.191
RCV1	143	3.34±3.67	25	2.67±2.17	0.360
RotaCV	92	3.29±3.95	76	3.20±2.87	0.857
HepB_BDV	72	2.53±1.81	96	3.79±4.28	0.010
HepB3V	160	3.11±3.34	8	6.09±5.22	0.153
BCG	143	2.93±3.23	25	5.10±4.4	0.025
YFV	36	2.88±2.06	132	3.35±3.35	0.478
IPV1	113	2.81±3.38	55	4.1±3.56	0.022

85 * MCV2: Measles containing vaccine 2nd dose, PCV3: Pneumococcal Conjugate vaccine 3rd dose, RCV1:
86 Rubella-containing vaccine 1st dose, RotaCV: Rotavirus-containing vaccine, HepB-BD: Hepatitis B birth
87 dose, HepB3V: Hepatitis B 3rd dose, BCG: Bacille Calmette-Guérin Vaccine, YFV: Yellow fever vaccine,
88 IPV1: Inactivated Polio vaccine 1st dose.

89 Correlation of the aggregated data showed that the following vaccines were weakly associated with
90 lower COVID-19 death rates: Rubella-containing virus (R= -0.191, p=0.022), Hepatitis B3 (r= -0.201,
91 p=0.011) and BCG (r= -0.221, p= 0.008). None of the vaccines were associated with increased COVID-
92 19-related death. The correlation between the number of years that any country was vaccinating for

93 the diseases and death rates was only significant for IPV1 in high-income countries ($r = -0.620$, $p =$
94 0.042).

95 We observed that the percentage of recoveries was higher in non-vaccinating countries for the
96 diseases shown in Table 2.

97 Table 2: Vaccines that show significant differences in mean percent Covid-19 recoveries.

Vaccine*	No. countries	Recovery	No. countries not	Recovery	Two-tailed
Name	Vaccinating	%±SD	Vaccinating	%±SD	significance
PCV3	131	65.6±22.7	44	76.0±18.9	0.007
RotaC	93	63.8±23	82	73.1±18.9	0.005
HepB3	168	67.4±22.3	7	86.1±9.7	0.001
YFV	36	61.7±20.4	139	69.9±22.5	0.050

98 *PCV3: Pneumococcal Conjugate vaccine, RotaC: Rotavirus-containing vaccine, HepB3: Hepatitis B 3rd
99 dose, YFV: Yellow Fever vaccine

100 We also compared percent death and recovery rates according to income level of the countries. The
101 results, summarized in Table 3, show a clear correlation of some vaccines coverages with lower death
102 rates. Only Pol-3 correlated with a significant unfavourable outcome in high income countries. RCV-1
103 showed similar favourable outcomes in both high- and medium-income countries. IPV strongly
104 correlated with lower death rates in high income countries and higher recoveries in upper middle-
105 income countries, while YFV showed negative correlation with percent recovery.

106

107 Table 3: Correlation of average vaccine coverages with death and recovery rates according to World
 108 Bank Income-based classification
 109

World Bank		% Death Rate			Recovery (%)		
Income							
Level							
High	Vaccine	No of Countries	Coefficient (r)	P-value	No of countries	Coefficient (r)	P-value
	MCV2	55	-0.290	0.032	53	0.271	0.050
	Pol3	56	+0.287	0.032	-	-	-
	RCV1	56	-0.325	0.015	-	-	-
	HepB3	48	-0.562	0.000033	-	-	-
	IPV1	12	-0.720	0.008	14	0.747	0.002
Upper	IPV1	-	-	-	41	0.358	0.021
Middle							
Lower	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Middle							
Low	RCV1	13	-0.567	0.043			
	YFV	-	-	-	12	-0.578	0.049

110 MCV2: Measles containing vaccine 2nd dose, Pol3: Polio vaccine 3rd dose, HepB3V: Hepatitis B 3rd dose,
 111 IPV1: Inactivated Polio vaccine 1st dose, RCV1: Rubella-containing vaccine 1st dose, YFV: Yellow fever
 112 vaccine.

113
 114
 115

116 Discussion

117 We undertook an analysis of COVID-19 deaths and recoveries in light of immunization with various
118 vaccines to determine the association, if any, of vaccination in mitigating the adverse outcomes of
119 infection with the SARS CoV-2 virus. Vaccination with Hepatitis B birth dose, BCG and inactivated Polio
120 vaccine were associated with lower Covid-19 deaths. This is consistent with other reports where BCG
121 vaccination was associated with lower mortalities and severity of the disease(1, 5). We also observed
122 a weak but significant correlation suggesting that COVID-19 deaths are generally lower in countries
123 where vaccination for BCG, Rubella-containing vaccines and Hepatitis B 3rd dose are given. Moreover,
124 we observed that vaccine coverage, rather than the longevity of use, has a better correlation with
125 percent deaths attributed to COVID-19.

126 We note that death or recovery is also a function of the effectiveness of the health care system in any
127 country. We presumed that higher income countries would generally afford better health care
128 systems and therefore better recoveries and lower deaths.

129
130 Paradoxically, percent recoveries were significantly higher in non-vaccinating countries for
131 Pneumococcal Conjugate vaccine (PCV), RotaCV and Hepatitis B-3 vaccines. We hypothesize that if
132 vaccines, as has been established, promote innate immunity (4, 7, 15, 16), then both death rates and
133 recoveries should be expected to be favourable in vaccinated individuals. However, since recovery
134 includes individuals who must have been hospitalized for symptomatic presentation or those who
135 tested positive but never needed to recover since they were asymptomatic, those with competent
136 immune systems would not be expected to be hospitalized, and would therefore be under-
137 represented among documented recoveries. We propose that this under-representation may account
138 for the higher recoveries in non-vaccinating countries for the specified vaccines.

139
140 There is evidence suggesting that vaccination against tuberculosis, and other vaccinations presented
141 in this work, could provide protection or ameliorate the severity of COVID-19 deaths. Given the gravity

142 of the current COVID-19 threat and the relative unpreparedness of most developing countries, we
143 strongly recommend coordinated clinical trials on vaccination or revaccination as an additional
144 strategy to mitigate the effects of COVID-19. This may imply carrying out clinical trials in designated
145 areas, especially in countries such as Botswana, where the pandemic is still evolving.

146

147 **Study limitations**

148

149 Our study has several limitations. There could be confounding factors in our data that affect both
150 vaccination coverage and COVID-19 deaths such as genetic diversity, age of population, prevalence of
151 comorbidities, global traveling, population density and quality of health care services. While we did
152 not test for causal effects of vaccination coverage on COVID-19 death rates, we observe that our
153 findings corroborate earlier reports on the potential of other vaccines in mitigating the deleterious
154 effects of COVID-19.

155 Another potential limitation is the fact that the disease is still developing in many countries, so the
156 true resilience of many countries is still to be tested. It is also not clear how to interpret lower
157 recoveries especially in view of the different definitions of recovery. In Botswana, for example,
158 recovery was initially defined in the context of two successive nucleic acid tests at least twenty four
159 hours apart. The current definition now relies on the clinical manifestations and age of the infection.
160 Nevertheless, the data seems to corroborate reports alluding to potential benefit of BCG of some
161 vaccines against COVID-19.

162

163 **Competing Interests**

164 The authors declare that there are no competing interests in this study.

165 **Funding:**

166 The authors confirm that the study did not require any funds.

167 Data availability

168 The data used in this analysis is available as a public resource from UNICEF, World Bank and
169 Worldometer databases.

170 **References:**

- 171 1. Miller A, Reandelar MJ, Fasciglione K, Roumenova V, Li Y, Otazu GH. Correlation between
172 universal BCG vaccination policy and reduced morbidity and mortality for COVID-19: an
173 epidemiological study. MedRxiv. 2020.
- 174 2. Redelman-Sidi G. Could BCG be used to protect against COVID-19? Nature Reviews Urology.
175 2020;17(6):316-7.
- 176 3. Moorlag S, Arts RJ, van Crevel R, Netea MG. Non-specific effects of BCG vaccine on viral
177 infections. Clinical Microbiology and Infection. 2019;25(12):1473-8.
- 178 4. Shann F. The non-specific effects of vaccines. Archives of disease in childhood. 2010;95(9):662-
179 7.
- 180 5. Escobar LE, Molina-Cruz A, Barillas-Mury C. BCG vaccine protection from severe coronavirus
181 disease 2019 (COVID-19). Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences.
182 2020;117(30):17720-6.
- 183 6. Arts RJW, Moorlag S, Novakovic B, Li Y, Wang SY, Oosting M, et al. BCG Vaccination Protects
184 against Experimental Viral Infection in Humans through the Induction of Cytokines Associated
185 with Trained Immunity. Cell Host Microbe. 2018;23(1):89-100.e5.
- 186 7. Kleinnijenhuis J, Quintin J, Preijers F, Benn CS, Joosten LA, Jacobs C, et al. Long-lasting effects of
187 BCG vaccination on both heterologous Th1/Th17 responses and innate trained immunity.
188 Journal of innate immunity. 2014;6(2):152-8.
- 189 8. Griffin DE. The Immune Response in Measles: Virus Control, Clearance and Protective Immunity.
190 Viruses. 2016;8(10):282.
- 191 9. Singh S. BCG vaccines may not reduce COVID-19 mortality rates. medRxiv.
192 2020:2020.04.11.20062232.
- 193 10. Curtis N, Sparrow A, Ghebreyesus TA, Netea MG. Considering BCG vaccination to reduce the
194 impact of COVID-19. The Lancet. 2020;395(10236):1545-6.
- 195 11. Hegarty PK, Kamat AM, Zafirakis H, Dinardo A. BCG vaccination may be protective against Covid-
196 19. preprint. 2020.
- 197 12. World Health Organization. Immunization-coverage-by-antigen-country-regional-and-global-
198 trends-WUENIC-2019revision [Internet]. 20219 [cited 03 August 2020]. Available from:
199 <https://data.unicef.org/topic/child-health/immunization/>.
- 200 13. Worldometer: Corona Virus updates [Internet]. 2020 [cited 03 August 2020]. Available from:
201 <https://www.worldometers.info/>.
- 202 14. World Bank. World Bank list of economies (June 2020). 2020.
- 203 15. Stensballe LG, Nante E, Jensen IP, Kofoed P-E, Poulsen A, Jensen H, et al. Acute lower
204 respiratory tract infections and respiratory syncytial virus in infants in Guinea-Bissau: a
205 beneficial effect of BCG vaccination for girls: community based case-control study. Vaccine.
206 2005;23(10):1251-7.
- 207 16. Higgins JP, Soares-Weiser K, López-López JA, Kakourou A, Chaplin K, Christensen H, et al.
208 Association of BCG, DTP, and measles containing vaccines with childhood mortality: systematic
209 review. bmj. 2016;355.

210