1	COVID-19 national lockdown in Morocco: impacts on air quality					
2	and public health					
3	Kenza Khomsi ^{1,2*} , Houda Najmi ¹ , Hassan Amghar ¹ , Youssef Chelhaoui ¹ , Zineb Souhaili ²					
4	¹ Air Quality Department, National Climate Center, General Directorate of Meteorology, Boulevard Mohamed					
5	Tayeb Naciri, Hay Hassani B.P. 8106 Oasis-Casablanca, Morocco					
6	² Laboratory of Drugs Science, Biomedical and Biotechnological Research. Faculty of Medicine and Pharmacy.					
7	Hassan II University; Ain Chock. Casablanca; P.B. 5696. Morocco					
8	*Corresponding Author: Kenza KHOMSI, <u>k.khomsi@gmail.com</u> , General Directorate of Meteorology, Boulevard					
9	Mohamed Tayeb Naciri, Hay Hassani B.P. 8106 Oasis-Casablanca, Morocco					
10	Abstract					
11	On the 20 th April 2020, the end date of the first strict lockdown period in Morocco, 2 403 410 cases					
12	of the corona Virus were confirmed globally. The number of Morocco confirmed cases attended					
13	2990, while 12 746 were suspected and 143 deaths were recorded. Due to the pandemic of					
14	coronavirus disease 2019 worldwide and in Morocco, almost all avoidable activities in the country					
15	were prohibited since the kingdom announced activities reduction on March 16, 2020 and then					
16	general lockdown with reduced industrial activities on March 20, 2020.					
17	This study aims at comparing the air quality status in Casablanca and Marrakech, two large cities					
18	from Morocco, before the pandemic and during the lockdown situation to show whether COVID-					
19	19 compelled-anthropogenic activities lockdown may have saved lives by restraining ambient air					
20	pollution than by preventing infection.					
21	We found that, during the quarantine, NO ₂ dropped by -12 μ g/m ³ in Casablanca and -7 μ g/m ³ in					
22	Marrakech. PM _{2.5} dropped by -18 μ g/m ³ in Casablanca and -14 μ g/m ³ in Marrakech. CO dropped					
23	by -0.04 mg/m ³ in Casablanca and -0.12 mg/m ³ in Marrakech. This air pollution reduction had					
24	created human health benefits and had reduced mortality and saved lives mainly from					
25	cardiovascular diseases.					

^{*} E-mail address: k khomsi@gmail.com NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

26 *Keywords*: COVID -19; Air Quality; Lockdown; Morocco; Public Health; Mortality

1. Introduction

Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) is an infectious disease initially identified in the city of 28 Wuhan in China on the 31st December 2019 (Khan and Naushad, 2020). On the 20th April 2020, 29 30 COVID-19 has led to more than 165 000 deaths worldwide with a global mortality rate of 6.8% 31 (WHO, 2020a). Due to the contagious nature of COVID-19, most countries declared the lockdown, 32 hence businesses and industrial activities decreased, global air travel reduced and cars and trucks 33 stayed off the roads (Isaifan, 2020; Martins, 2020; Wang et al., 2020). Morocco reported the first COVID-19 case on the 2nd March 2020, 39 cases, and 1 death 34 35 followed. Then the government announced the obligation of physical distancing and border closures on the 16th March 2020 and gathering places closed. The lockdown followed on the 20th 36 37 March 2020. Since then, the unofficial transit going in and out of Moroccan cities was shut down, 38 most transportation was prohibited and almost all avoidable outdoor human activities stopped all around the country. On the 20th April 2020, the end date of the first strict lockdown period, Morocco 39 40 announced 2990 confirmed cases and 143 deaths, thus a mortality rate of 4.8% (Ministry of Health, 2020). 41

42 Beyond the slowdown in the spread of the COVID-19 virus, the restrictive measures 43 implemented by the authorities around the world have a second, less expected effect: that of 44 reducing ambient air pollution which mortality rate has contributed to 7.6% of all deaths in 2016 45 worldwide (Isaifan, 2020). In China, Nitrogen Dioxide (NO₂) and carbon emissions dropped by 30 46 and 25%, respectively (Isaifan, 2020). In India, the concentrations of Particulate Matter with a 47 diameter of less than 10µm and 2.5µm (PM₁₀ and PM_{2.5}) reduced by 50% and NO₂ has also shown 48 considerable decline (Mahato et al., 2020). In Spain, the concentration levels of NO₂ have declined 49 by 64% in major cities (Universitat Politècnica de València, 2020). In Northern Italy, a drastic 50 reduction in NO₂ emissions was observed too (Martins, 2020). Emissions have also dropped in the

51 USA (Newburger, 2020). In the city of Salé in Morocco, PM₁₀ and NO₂ concentrations dropped 52 respectively by 75% and 96% during the period between the 11th March and the 2nd April 2020 53 (Otmani et al., 2020).

54 According to the World Health Organization (WHO), 4.2 million deaths have been caused by 55 ambient air pollution worldwide in 2016. The latter is estimated to cause about 29% of lung cancer 56 deaths, 24% of stroke deaths, 25% of heart disease deaths, and 43% of other lung diseases. 57 Moreover, air pollution has attributed to 26% of respiratory infection deaths, 25% of chronic 58 obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) deaths, and about 17% of ischemic heart disease and stroke. 59 It is noteworthy that chronic respiratory and cardiovascular diseases may be linked to COVID-19 60 as the death rate caused by the virus is higher among those with these diseases (Isaifan, 2020; 61 WHO, 2020b). As for Morocco, each year more than 13,000 deaths is due to air pollution. This represents about 7% of all deaths thus the 8th largest mortality risk factor. According to the global 62 report "Toxic Air: The Price of Fossil Fuels" of the international NGO Greenpeace MENA, 63 64 annually deaths due to air quality degradation in Morocco is estimated at 5,100 in 2018 (Farrow, 65 A., Miller, K.A. & Myllyvirta, 2020).

Obviously, COVID-19 is a treat for public health, nevertheless, the accompanying lockdown
measures, instigating improved air quality, may have positive effects on human life and well-being.
For instance, Chen et. al estimate that improved air quality in China, during the quarantine period,
avoided a total of 8911 NO₂-related deaths and 3214 PM_{2.5}-related deaths (Chen et al., 2020).

The present study has started in April 2020 to highlight the impacts of COVID-19 lockdown on air pollution levels in Morocco and the potentially avoided cause-specific mortality during population quarantine episode. We have adopted the same approach as (Chen et al., 2020). To the best of our knowledge, it reports on the first case study that links the COVID-19 to positive

3

consequences on health in Morocco and tries to verify whether this infection has saved people thanit has killed so far.

The remainder of this paper starts with presenting the materials and methods including the study area, the used data and, the adopted approach. It then presents the found results and the discussion section.

79 2

2. Materials and Methods

80 **2.1.** The study area

81 Morocco is an African country located in the extreme northwest of the continent (Fig. 1). It is 82 located in the southern part of the Mediterranean basin and is considered among the most 83 vulnerable countries to climate variability and transboundary air pollution (Khomsi et al., 2020). 84 Casablanca and Marrakech are the studied cities. They are, respectively, the first and the fourth 85 populous cities in Morocco with more than 3,000,000 and 900,000 residents, respectively, as 86 reported by the World Population Review webpage (World Population Review, 2020). Casablanca 87 is located in the central-western part of the country on the Atlantic Ocean coast (Fig. 1). In 88 economic and demographic terms, Casablanca is one of the most important cities in Africa and is 89 the largest city in the Maghreb. Marrakech is a large city in the Kingdom of Morocco. It is the chief 90 town of the inland mid-southwestern region of Marrakech-Safi and located to the north of the 91 piedmont of the snow-capped Atlas Mountains (Fig. 1). With the COVID-19 crisis, the cities of 92 Casablanca and Marrakech account together for more than 50% of the people infected. On the 20th 93 April 2020, it has been reported that the region of Casablanca-Settat has reached exactly 840 cases 94 leading the most regions affected by COVID-19, it is followed by the region of Marrakech-Safi 95 which reached 739 cases of Coronavirus. Moreover, Casablanca and Marrakech are often chosen for air pollution researches as they are the urban areas where serious pollution concerns may be 96

- 97 met, especially with the important population rate increase between 2004 and 2014, this rate
- reaches 11% in Casablanca and 12% in Marrakech.

99



Figure 1.: Location of the study area. (a) Africa, (b) Morocco, (c) Casablanca, (d) Marrakech

100 **2.2.** Air quality, health, and population data

101 The number of daily confirmed COVID-19 cases and death in Morocco were collected from the 102 official website set by the ministry of health for that purpose (Ministry of Health, 2020). Air quality 103 data (daily concentrations of NO₂, PM₁₀, and CO) recorded in air quality stations, were gathered 104 from the National Weather Service in charge of air quality management in Morocco. PM₁₀ 105 concentrations were then converted to PM_{2.5} data for each station, using a conversion factor of 0.4 106 (Ait Bouh et al., 2013). We focused on NO₂, PM_{2.5}, and CO because they are traffic-related air

pollutants whose emissions must obviously reduce as a result of the national traffic ban and homequarantine in Morocco during the lockdown.

109 Up to date city-level demographics are obtained from the World Population Review webpage 110 (World Population Review, 2020). Country-level air quality related mortality including that 111 incidental to chronic disease is collected from the Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation 112 (IHME) (IHME, 2017).

113 **2.3.** Methods

To assess air pollution reduction due to the lockdown, we used a difference-in-difference 114 115 approach that we validated through the non-parametric approach proposed by Theil and Sen for 116 univariate time series (Sen, 1968; Theil, 1950). Specifically, we defined the before quarantine period as between the 16th February and the 19th March 2020 and the during quarantine as between 117 the 20th March and 20th April 2020. We assessed changes in air quality during vs. before the 118 119 quarantine period in 2020 and compared these with corresponding changes in the same lunar 120 calendar periods in 2016-2019. We assessed the statistical significance of the obtained trends using 121 the modified Mann-Kendall test proposed by Hamed and Ramachandra Rao for autocorrelated time 122 series (Hamed and Ramachandra Rao, 1998). The test is performed at a significance level of 5%.

123 In order to quantify the impact of the found change in air quality on health, we calculated the 124 avoided cause-specific mortality attributable to the decreases in NO₂ and PM_{2.5} over the study area 125 based on the concentration-response functions from previous studies by (Chen et al., 2018, 2017) 126 and the cause-specific mortality data from the IHME in 2017 (IHME, 2017). In addition to total 127 non-accidental mortality, the cause-specific mortality for cardiovascular disease, hypertensive 128 disease, stroke, chronic respiratory diseases, and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) 129 was also calculated. The attributable fraction (AF) method was used to estimate the daily avoided 130 cause-specific mortality from air pollution reduction as done by (Chen et al., 2020). AF is defined

131 as follows: $AF = 1 - e^{-\beta\Delta c}$ β is the cause-specific coefficient of the CRF, it is expressed as the 132 percentage change in daily mortality associated with a 10 µg/m³ increase in daily NO₂ or PM_{2.5}. β 133 values are available in the study by (Chen et al., 2020). Δc is the air quality changes due to the 134 quarantine. AF is then multiplied by the daily cause-specific number of deaths and the total number 135 of days during the quarantine period (32 days) to estimate the cause-specific avoided deaths.

136

3. Results and discussion

137

3.1. Improvement in air quality

Graphs in figure 2 show the evolution of NO₂, PM_{2.5}, and CO in the cities of Casablanca and Marrakech before and during the quarantine. They also mention related Theil-Sen (TS) slopes and their significance (when in bold, they are significant). TS represents the magnitude of the trend during one day from the study period which counts 65 days. Multiplying this number of days by the TS gives the magnitude of the trend during the whole study period. TS assessment helps to validate the difference-in-difference estimate (DDE) presented in table 1. Overall, TS and DDE have the same order of magnitude.

145 Hence, DDE shows that, because of the quarantine, NO₂ dropped by -12 μ g/m³ in Casablanca

and -7 μ g/m³ in Marrakech. PM_{2.5} dropped by -18 μ g/m³ in Casablanca and -14 μ g/m³ in Marrakech.

147 CO dropped by -0.04 mg/m³ in Casablanca and -0.12 mg/m³ in Marrakech. All TS calculated slopes

148 for the 2020 period are statistically significant and confirm the negative trends and order of

149 magnitude of the DDE. TS slopes for the period 2016-2019 are not statistically significant.

- 150 These results are in complete agreement with the worldwide studies that confirmed the systematic151 link between COVID-19 lockdown and improvement in air quality levels.
- 152
- 153
- 154
- 155



Figure 2.: Air pollution changes due to the quarantine in Casablanca and Marrakech using TS **Bold character:** statitically significant

156

Table 1.: Air pollution changes due to the quarantine in Casablanca and Marrakech using DDE

	During vs before in 2020		During vs before in 2016-2019		Difference in difference	
	Casablanca	Marrakech	Casablanca	Marrakech	Casablanca	Marrakech
NO ₂	-12.5	-7.5	-0.28	-0.74	-12.21	-6.76
PM _{2.5}	-11.63	-16.26	5.87	-2.48	-17.5	-13.78
CO	-0.06	-0.21	-0.02	-0.1	-0.04	-0.12

157

3.2.

COVID-19 vs air quality daily deaths

Figure 3 (a) and (b) show the cumulative number of deaths by COVID-19 in Morocco and the change in the number of daily mortalities, respectively. The results prove that the number of deaths increased between the 23rd March and 4th May and decreased notably since then. The rate of change in daily mortality decreases with time and reached the nil value by the 20th of June.

162 According to the global report "Toxic Air: The Price of Fossil Fuels" of the international NGO 163 Greenpeace MENA, Morocco is within a lengthy list of countries that suffer relatively from high 164 estimated numbers of deaths annually due to air quality degradation. This number is estimated at 165 5,100 in 2018 (Farrow, A., Miller, K.A. & Myllyvirta, 2020). Dividing this value over 365 days 166 helps obtain the daily average deaths due to air pollution and yields 14 deaths every day. This 167 average fixed value was plotted against the daily reported deaths due to COVID-19 in Morocco 168 (Fig. 4). Moreover, it is worth noting that outdoor air pollution by particulate matter death rate in 169 Morocco is estimated at 63,1 per 100000 inhabitants (Ritchie, 2019). That of Covid-19 is of 0.59 170 per 100000 inhabitants as estimated by the Coronavirus resource center of the Johns Hopkins 171 University (https://coronavirus.jhu.edu/data/mortality). All these results show a tremendous 172 difference in deaths caused by COVID-19 and air pollution in Morocco.



Figure 3.: (a) Cumulative number of deaths by COVID-19 in Morocco (b) Change in the number of daily mortalities



Figure 4.: Daily deaths due to COVID-19 vs. averaged daily deaths due to poor air quality

173 **3.3. Did COV**

Did COVID-19 save lives?

174 Table 2 shows the avoided cause-specific deaths due to air pollution reduction because of the 175 COVID-19 home quarantine in Casablanca and Marrakech. We estimate that reduction in NO₂ 176 during the quarantine period avoided a total of 185 NO₂ related deaths (95% CI 145-223) in 177 Casablanca and 30 (95% CI 24-37) in Marrakech. Reduction in PM2.5 avoided a total of 48 PM2.5 178 related deaths (95% CI 70-89) in Casablanca and 15 (95% CI 10-19) in Marrakech. More than 179 60% of the avoidable deaths were from cardiovascular diseases. Cause-specific CRFs from single-180 pollutant models were used (Chen et al., 2020, 2017). Our results should be interpreted carefully 181 because of the potential common impacts NO₂ and PM_{2.5} may have on health. The risk of double 182 counting is minor because, as suggested by the literature, effect estimates for NO₂ and PM_{2.5} were 183 similar between single-pollutant and two-pollutant models (Anenberg et al., 2010; Chen et al., 184 2018).

Our findings imply that interventions to contain the COVID-19 outbreak led to improvements in air quality that brought health benefits in non-COVID-19 deaths, which could potentially have highly exceeded the current confirmed deaths attributable to COVID-19 in Morocco (229 deaths as of July 3, 2020).

Table 2.: Avoided cause-specific deaths (95% confidence interval) due to air pollution reduction because of the home quarantine in Casablanca and Marrakech

	Casablanca		Marrakech	
	NO2	PM2.5	NO2	PM2.5
Total	185(145,223)	48(70,89)	30(24,37)	15(10,19)
Cardiovascular Disease	96(76,126)	45(30,59)	16(12,21)	10(6,13)
Hypertensive heart disease	8(5,11)	4(1,6)	1(1,2)	1(0,1)
Chronic respiratory diseases	8(6,10)	3(2,5)	1(1,2)	1(0,1)
Stroke	23(13,30)	4(2,5)	9(5,13)	2(1,3)
COPD	5(7,9)	2(3,4)	1(1,1)	1(0,1)

Note: Home quarantine is the period between 20th March and 20th April 2020

189

190 **4.** Conclusion

191

In the present article, the effect of the imposed lockdown in Morocco in order to restrict the rapid spread of COVID-19 pandemic, on the air quality has been assessed based on NO₂, PM_{2.5} and CO concentrations. Our estimates suggest that the undertaken lockdown led to improvements in air quality that brought health benefits in non-COVID-19 deaths. Specifically, our findings show the human health benefits related to cardiovascular diseases mortality that can be achieved if control measures are taken to reduce emissions from vehicles. Traffic restrictions or efforts to accelerate the transition to electric vehicles are good examples of these measures.

The results highlighted in the present work are not isolated and are in agreement with many other studies throughout the world. Thus, this paper and similar ones help to raise awareness about our responsibility towards the environment. It may also help to consider whether the COVID-19 lockdown scenario would be an efficient measure for preserving the environment and enhancing life quality in the urban ecosystem. However, cost effectiveness is one of the keys for policymakers to implement any control measure mainly that the lockdown has caused lower mobility and

205 economic activity and shrinking the economy is not a sustainable solution to encounter the 206 environmental challenge.

Moreover, the meteorological forcing is to take into consideration in concluding from such a study as they impact pollutants dispersion and concentration. Overall, the interlinkages between COVID-19, economy and climate are complex and depend on the climatic conditions, the duration of the emergency and reactions to it. Yet, like every crisis, the COVID-19 pandemic offers an important opportunity to draw lessons and to reconsider the way we treat the environment and the

ecosystems.

5. References

- Ait Bouh, H., Benyaich, F., Bounakhla, M., Noack, Y., Tahri, M., Zahry, F., 2013. Seasonal variations of
 the atmospheric particles and its chemical components in Meknes city Morocco. J. Mater. Environ.
 Sci.
- Anenberg, S.C., Horowitz, L.W., Tong, D.Q., West, J.J., 2010. An estimate of the global burden of
 anthropogenic ozone and fine particulate matter on premature human mortality using atmospheric
 modeling. Environ. Health Perspect. 118, 1189–1195. https://doi.org/10.1289/ehp.0901220
- Chen, K., Wang, M., Huang, C., Kinney, P.L., Anastas, P.T., 2020. Air pollution reduction and mortality
 benefit during the COVID-19 outbreak in China. Lancet Planet. Heal. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2542 5196(20)30107-8
- Chen, R., Yin, P., Meng, X., Liu, C., Wang, L., Xu, X., Ross, J.A., Tse, L.A., Zhao, Z., Kan, H., Zhou, M.,
 2017. Fine particulate air pollution and daily mortality: A nationwide analysis in 272 Chinese cities.
 Am. J. Respir. Crit. Care Med. https://doi.org/10.1164/rccm.201609-1862OC
- Chen, R., Yin, P., Meng, X., Wang, L., Liu, C., Niu, Y., Lin, Z., Liu, Y., Liu, J., Qi, J., You, J., Kan, H.,
 Zhou, M., 2018. Associations between ambient nitrogen dioxide and daily cause-specific mortality.
 Epidemiology. https://doi.org/10.1097/EDE.00000000000829
- Farrow, A., Miller, K.A. & Myllyvirta, L., 2020. Toxic Air: The Price of Fossil Fuels. Greenpeace
 Southeast Asia 44.
- Hamed, K.H., Ramachandra Rao, A., 1998. A modified Mann-Kendall trend test for autocorrelated data. J.
 Hydrol. 204, 182–196. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0022-1694(97)00125-X
- 233 IHME, 2017. GBD Compare [WWW Document]. URL https://vizhub.healthdata.org/gbd-compare/

Isaifan, R.J., 2020. The dramatic impact of coronavirus outbreak on air quality: Has it saved as much as it
 has killed so far? Glob. J. Environ. Sci. Manag. https://doi.org/10.22034/gjesm.2020.03.01

- 236 Khan, N., Naushad, M., 2020. Effects of Corona Virus on the World Community. SSRN Electron. J.
- 237 https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3532001

- Khomsi, K., Najmi, H., Chelhaoui, Y., Souhaili, Z., 2020. The contribution of large-scale atmospheric
 patterns to pm10 pollution: The new saharan oscillation index. Aerosol Air Qual. Res.
 https://doi.org/10.4209/aaqr.2019.08.0401
- Mahato, S., Pal, S., Ghosh, K.G., 2020. Effect of lockdown amid COVID-19 pandemic on air quality of
 the megacity Delhi, India. Sci. Total Environ. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.139086
- Martins, D., 2020. Italy air pollution plunges amid national COVID-19 quarantine [WWW Document].
 Weather Netw.
- Ministry of Health, 2020. The Official Coronavirus Portal in Morocco [WWW Document]. URL
 http://www.covidmaroc.ma/pages/Accueil.aspx
- Newburger, E., 2020. Air pollution drops 30% in Northeast US as coronavirus lockdown slows travel:
 NASA [WWW Document]. URL https://www.cnbc.com/2020/04/09/coronavirus-air-pollution plummets-30percent-in-northeast-us-amid-lockdowns.html
- Otmani, A., Benchrif, A., Tahri, M., Bounakhla, M., Chakir, E.M., El Bouch, M., Krombi, M., 2020.
 Impact of Covid-19 lockdown on PM10, SO2 and NO2 concentrations in Salé City (Morocco). Sci.
 Total Environ. 735, 139541. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.139541
- 253 Ritchie, H., 2019. Outdoor Air Pollution.
- Sen, P.K., 1968. Estimates of the Regression Coefficient Based on Kendall's Tau. J. Am. Stat. Assoc. 63,
 1379. https://doi.org/10.2307/2285891
- Theil, H., 1950. A rank-invariant method of linear and polynomial regression analysis. I. Nederl. Akad.
 Wetensch., Proc. 53, 386–392. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-011-2546-8
- Universitat Politècnica de València, 2020. Air pollution declines in Spain after implementation of
 measures to fight [WWW Document]. URL https://phys.org/news/2020-03-air-pollution-declines spain- covid-.html
- Wang, Pengfei, Chen, K., Zhu, S., Wang, Peng, Zhang, H., 2020. Severe air pollution events not avoided
 by reduced anthropogenic activities during COVID-19 outbreak. Resour. Conserv. Recycl.
- 263 https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2020.104814
- WHO, 2020a. WHO Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Dashboard [WWW Document]. URL
 https://covid19.who.int/
- WHO, 2020b. Mortality and burden of disease from ambient air pollution [WWW Document]. URL
 https://www.who.int/gho/phe/outdoor_air_pollution/burden_text/en/
- 268 World Population Review, 2020. World Population Review [WWW Document]. URL
- 269 https://worldpopulationreview.com/
- 270