Superspreading in Early Transmissions of COVID-19 in Indonesia

A. Hasan[a], H. Susanto[b,c], M.F. Kasim[d], N. Nuraini[e], D. Triany[f], B.W. Lestari[g]

[a]*Center for Unmanned Aircraft Systems, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark*
[b]*Department of Mathematics, Khalifa University, United Arab Emirates*
[c]*Department of Mathematical Sciences, University of Essex, United Kingdom*
[d]*Department of Physics, University of Oxford, United Kingdom*
[e]*Department of Mathematics, Institut Teknologi Bandung, Indonesia*
[f]*Public Health Office of Batam City, Indonesia*
[g]*Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia*

Abstract

We estimate the basic reproduction number $\mathcal{R}_0$ and the overdispersion parameter K at two COVID-19 clusters in Indonesia: Jakarta-Depok and Batam. Based on the first 397 confirmed cases in both clusters, we find a high degree of individual-level variation in the transmission. The basic reproduction number $\mathcal{R}_0$ is estimated at 6.79 and 2.47, while the overdispersion parameter K of a negative-binomial distribution is estimated at 0.08 and 0.2 for Jakarta-Depok and Batam, respectively. This suggests that superspreading events played a key role in the early stage of the outbreak, i.e., a small number of infected individuals are responsible for large amounts of COVID-19 transmission.

Keywords: COVID-19, Indonesia, $\mathcal{R}_0$, K-number.

1. Introduction

The first two confirmed cases of novel coronavirus (COVID-19) in Indonesia was announced in March 2, 2020 by the president himself [1]. Jakarta and its surrounding cities including Depok have become the epicenter of the outbreak. The virus quickly spread to all 34 provinces, with more than 52,000 confirmed cases and 2,700 deaths by the end of June 2020 [2]. Based on the first 1437 cases

---

*Corresponding author. Email Address: agha@mmmi.sdu.dk (A. Hasan).

in West Java province, the median age of infected individual and deaths were 41 and 56, respectively. Men account for 59.2% of the reported deaths. As a country with the highest death toll in South East Asia and one with the lowest global testing rate, the first government effort to control the disease spread was by establishing a COVID-19 Response Acceleration Task Force led by the head of the National Disaster Management Agency. The government further introduced Large-Scale Social Restrictions, which included measures such as closing public places, restricting public transport, and limiting travel to and from restricted regions. On May 19, the first milestone of 10,000 PCR tests per day was reached. As of June 26, Jakarta has tested more than 136,000 individuals for which 7.8% were positive [3]. Outside Java, Batam has received thousand test kits and protective equipment from Singapore. There were 218 cases from 4092 PCR tests, as of June 26 [4].

We analyze data on the first 397 confirmed cases in two clusters: Jakarta-Depok (population 12.6 million) and Batam (population 1.4 million), to determine early transmission dynamics of COVID-19 in Indonesia. To this end, we estimate the basic reproduction number $\mathcal{R}_0$ and the overdispersion parameter K (also known as the K-number) in the early period of the outbreak from March to April 2020. The two transmissibility parameters have important implications for the effective surveillance and control of COVID-19. While information regarding $\mathcal{R}_0$ is crucial in the early stage of the outbreak to gauge the disease dynamics, the disease may be more challenging to control if the overdispersion K is higher, and targeted control activities become more efficient if the overdispersion K is lower [5]. Information from K is also critical in the late stages of the epidemic when the virus is almost eradicated where small K means that epidemic can quickly rebound, even if locally eradicated [6].

2. Methods

We use a sequential Bayesian method based on the discrete SIR model to estimate the basic reproduction number $\mathcal{R}_0$. Time series of the active cases at

Jakarta-Depok		Batam	
Secondary cases	Frequency	Secondary cases	Frequency
0	251	0	63
1	31	1	12
2	10	2	3
3	5	3	4
4	4	4,7-9,13	1
5,9,15,26,36,45,52	1	5	2

Table 1: Secondary cases data of the two clusters. The data were obtained from contact tracing of infections cases by Jakarta, Depok, and Batam Public Helath Offices.

day n is assumed to follow the model $I_{n+1} = (\gamma (\mathcal{R}_t - 1) + 1) I_n$ [7], where $\mathcal{R}_t$ is the instantaneous reproduction number and $1/\gamma$ is the infectious time taken to be 9 days herein. Assuming a Poisson distribution for the arrival of active cases and using Bayes' theorem, the posterior probability of $\mathcal{R}_t$ given a confirmed case I_{n+1} is computed through

$$P\left((\gamma (\mathcal{R}_t - 1) + 1) I_n | I_{n+1}\right) \propto \prod_{m=1}^{n} P\left(I_{m+1} | (\gamma (\mathcal{R}_t - 1) + 1) I_m\right). \qquad (1)$$

The formula comes from the assumption that the prior distribution of $\mathcal{R}_t$ at day n is taken from the posterior of day $(n-1)$ with a uniform prior at day 1. Estimated $\mathcal{R}_0$ is then the maximum of $\mathcal{R}_t$, see Figure 1.

The parameter K is defined as the overdispersion parameter in the negative binomial distribution, which can be found by fitting the distribution to the secondary cases data, i.e., the number of secondary cases by one person x can be expressed in terms of the overdispersion parameter K and the probability p,

$$P(x|K,p) = \frac{\Gamma(x + K)}{x!\Gamma(K)}(1 - p)^K p^x. \qquad (2)$$

We use a MATLAB® function called *nbinfit* to estimate the overdispersion parameter K and the probability p. The function uses derivative-free method to find the maximum of the likelihood function. The secondary cases data for the two clusters are given in Table 1.

Figure 1: Estimates of the overdispersion parameter K and the basic reproduction number $\mathcal{R}_0$. Lines in the top figures show maximum-likelihood fits for the negative binomial distribution.

3. Results and Discussion

For $\mathcal{R}_0$ at 6.79 and 2.47, the overdispersion parameter K was estimated to be around 0.08 and 0.2 (Figure 1), suggesting that a small number of infected individual are responsible for large amounts of the disease transmission. Indeed, we found that just between 10-15% of all infections were responsible for 80% of onward transmission events. In a particular case, one superspreader infected 52 other in an event in Jakarta. These results are in line with a number of superspreading events observed in other countries [8].

The fact that Indonesia has a moderate number of positive cases, compared to other countries with roughly the same population size such as Russia, USA, and Brazil, can be caused by three reasons: a low number of tests, the success of Large-Scale Social Restrictions, and overdispersion of the COVID-19 transmission. In this paper, we have shown that the transmission is overdispersed. However, our study does not exclude the other possibilities.

Even though superspreading events are difficult to predict and thus difficult to prevent, understanding their environmental and behavioral drivers can inform strategies for prevention and control [9]. Close-interaction activities such as

traditional markets, religious gathering, wedding parties, and classes need to be adapted if not restricted as they can become a transmission hot spot. Effective response factors to reduce the transmission include aggressive implementation of non-pharmaceutical interventions such as rapid identification and isolation of cases. Furthermore, timeliness is critical to prevent or limit their extent since delay of diagnosis is the most common cause of superspreading events [6].

Acknowledgement

We would like to thank Public Health Office of Jakarta Province, Communication, Information and Statistic Office of Jakarta Province, Jakarta Smart City Unit, Human Settlements and Spatial Planning Office of Jakarta Province, Public Health Offices of Batam, and Depok Task Force for COVID-19 Control for providing the data. In particular, we are indebted to Dr. Widyastuti, Yulhendri Mubarak, S.Si, Fairuza Laily, MKT., Dewi Cahaya Rahayu, SKM, Fany Octari, MPH, Muhammad Cholid, SKM, and Ketut Ngurah, M.Epid, for feedback and discussions.

References

[1] M. Gorbiano, Breaking: Jokowi announces indonesia's first two confirmed covid-19 cases, The Jakarta Post, 2 March 2020.

[2] COVID-19 Response Acceleration Task Force, Data covid-19.
URL https://covid19.go.id/peta-sebaran

[3] Jakarta City Government, Data covid-19.
URL https://corona.jakarta.go.id/id/data-pemantauan

[4] Batam City Government, Data covid-19.
URL https://lawancorona.batam.go.id/

[5] J. Hellewell, S. Abbott, A. Gimma, N. Bosse, C. Jarvis, T. Russell, J. Munday, A. Kucharski, W. Edmunds, S. Funk, R. Eggo, Feasibility of control-

ling covid-19 outbreaks by isolation of cases and contacts, The Lancet 8. `doi:10.1016/S2214-109X(20)30074-7`.

[6] J. Lloyd-Smith, S. Schreiber, P. Kopp, W. M. Getz, Superspreading and the effect of individual variation on disease emergence, Nature 438 (2005) 355–359. `doi:10.1038/nature04153`.

[7] H. Susanto, V. Tjahjono, A. Hasan, M. Kasim, N. Nuraini, E. Putri, R. Kusdiantara, H. Kurniawan, How many can you infect? simple (and naive) methods of estimating the reproduction number, Commun. Biomath. Sci. 3 (1) (2020) 28–36.

[8] A. Endo, S. Abbott, A. Kucharski, S. Funk, Estimating the overdispersion in covid-19 transmission using outbreak sizes outside china, Wellcome Open Res 5:67. `doi:10.12688/wellcomeopenres.15842.1`.

[9] T. Frieden, C. Lee, Identifying and interrupting superspreading events–implications for control of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2, Emerg Infect Dis. 26 (2020) 1059–1066. `doi:10.3201/eid2606.200495`.