

Intensive COVID-19 testing associated with reduced mortality - an ecological analysis of 108 countries

Chris Kenyon^{1,2*}

¹*HIV/STI Unit, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium;* ²*Division of Infectious Diseases and HIV Medicine, University of Cape Town, Anzio Road, Observatory 7700, South Africa;*

*Corresponding author. HIV/STI Unit, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, 2000, Belgium. Tel: +32 3 2480796; Fax: +32 3 2480831; E-mail: ckenyon@itg.be

Keywords: SARS CoV-2; COVID-19 mortality rate; testing intensity; epidemiology

34 **Abstract**

35

36 **Background**

37 Intensive screening and testing for COVID-19 could facilitate early detection and
38 isolation of infected persons and thereby control the size of the epidemic. It could
39 also facilitate earlier and more targeted therapy. These factors could plausibly
40 reduce attributable mortality which was the hypothesis tested in this study.

41

42 **Methods**

43 Linear regression was used to assess the country-level association between COVID-
44 19 attributable mortality per 100 000 inhabitants (mortality/capita) and COVID-19
45 tests/capita (number of tests/100 000 inhabitants) controlling for the cumulative
46 number of COVID-19 infections/100 000 inhabitants (cases/capita), the age of the
47 epidemic (number of days between first case reported and 8 April), national health
48 expenditure per capita and WHO world region.

49

50 **Results**

51 The COVID-19 mortality rate varied between 0.3 and 3110 deaths/100 000
52 inhabitants (median 30, IQR 8-105). The intensity of testing per 100 000 also varied
53 considerably (median 21,970, IQR 2,735-89,095) as did the number of COVID-19
54 cases per 100 000 (median 1,600, IQR 340-4,760 cases/100 000). In the multivariate
55 model, the COVID-19 mortality rate was negatively associated with tests/capita
56 (Coef. -0.036, 95% CI -0.047- -0.025) and positively associated with cases/capita
57 (Coef. 0.093, 95% CI 0.819- 1.034).

58

59

60

61 **Conclusions**

62 The results are compatible with the hypothesis that intensive testing and isolation
63 could play a role in reducing COVID-10 mortality rates.

64

65 **Background**

66
67 It is important to understand the determinants of national variations in COVID-19-
68 related mortality [1-4]. We aimed to evaluate if testing intensity plays a role. An
69 obvious determinant of COVID-19 attributable mortality is the size of the national
70 epidemic [2, 5, 6]. The measured extent of spread is however heavily dependent on
71 the age of the epidemic and national testing policies [5, 6]. Because a majority of
72 infections are pauci- or a-symptomatic a country that tests less intensively will tend
73 to have a falsely low measured incidence and a correspondingly higher case fatality
74 rate as fewer pauci-symptomatic infections are included in the denominator [5, 7].
75 Intensive screening and testing could however facilitate early detection and isolation
76 of infected persons and thereby control the size of the epidemic [6, 8]. It could also
77 facilitate earlier and more targeted therapy [8]. These factors could plausibly reduce
78 attributable mortality [6].

79
80 We tested this hypothesis by using linear regression to assess the country-level
81 association between COVID-19 attributable mortality per 100 000 inhabitants
82 (mortality/capita) and COVID-19 tests/capita (number of tests/100 000 inhabitants)
83 controlling for the cumulative number of COVID-19 infections/100 000 inhabitants
84 (cases/capita), the age of the epidemic (number of days between first case reported
85 and 8 April), national health expenditure per capita and WHO world region.

87 **Methods**

88 ***Dependent variable:***

89 Mortality/capita. The COVID-19 attributable mortality per 100 000 inhabitants. This
90 data was obtained from the World of Meters data repository on 8 April 2020:
91 <https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/>

92

93 ***Independent variables:***

94 *Cases/capita*. The cumulative number of cases of COVID-19 infection per 100 000
95 inhabitants on 8 April 2020 per country. This data was obtained from the World of
96 Meters data repository on 8 April 2020: <https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/>
97

98 *Tests/capita*. Cumulative number of nucleic acid amplification SARS CoV-2 tests
99 conducted per country per 100 000 inhabitants up till 8 April 2020. This data was
100 obtained from the World of Meters data repository on 8 April 2020:
101 <https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/>
102

103 *Age of epidemic*. The date the first case of COVID-19 was diagnosed in each
104 country. This was measured in days after the first COVID-19 case was officially
105 reported in China (10 January 2020). This data was obtained from the ECDC data
106 repository on 8 April 2020: [https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/geographical-distribution-](https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/geographical-distribution-2019-ncov-cases)
107 [2019-ncov-cases](https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/geographical-distribution-2019-ncov-cases)

108

109 *Health expenditure per capita*. Current expenditures on health per capita in current
110 US dollars for the year 2016. Estimates of current health expenditures include
111 healthcare goods and services consumed during each year. This data was taken
112 from the World Bank's Data Catalogue: [https://datacatalog.worldbank.org/current-](https://datacatalog.worldbank.org/current-health-expenditure-capita-current-us)
113 [health-expenditure-capita-current-us](https://datacatalog.worldbank.org/current-health-expenditure-capita-current-us)

114

115 *WHO regions.* Countries were categorized according to WHO region:

116 https://www.who.int/choice/demography/by_country/en/

117

118 ***Data analysis***

119 A correlation matrix was performed to investigate the relationships between case
120 fatality rate and the independent variables (Table 1). Linear regression was then
121 used to analyze the association between the COVID-19 mortality rate/100 000
122 inhabitants and COVID-19 tests/capita (number of tests/100 000 inhabitants)
123 controlling for the cumulative number of COVID-19 infections/100 000 inhabitants
124 (cases/capita), the age of the epidemic (number of days between first case reported
125 and 8 April), national health expenditure per capita and WHO world region. The most
126 recent data available as of 8 April 2020 was used for all variables. Sensitivity
127 analyses were conducted limiting the analysis to countries whose epidemics were
128 older than 15 March 2020. A p-value of < 0.01 was considered statistically
129 significant. The analyses were performed in STATA version 16 (Stata Corp, College
130 Station, Tx).

131

132 **Results**

133 Complete data was available for 108 countries. The COVID-19 mortality rate varied
134 between 0.3 and 3110 deaths/100 000 inhabitants (median 30, IQR 8-105; Table 3).
135 The intensity of testing per 100 000 also varied considerably (median 21,970, IQR
136 2,735-89,095) as did the number of COVID-19 cases per 100 000 (median 1,600,
137 IQR 340-4,760 cases/100 000)

138

Pearson's correlation revealed deaths/capita to be positively correlated with cases/capita ($r=0.80$, $P<0.001$), which was in turn positively correlated with tests/capita ($r=0.55$, $P<0.001$), and health care expenditure ($r=0.51$, $P<0.001$; Table 1). Tests/capita was positively correlated with health care expenditure ($r=0.45$, $P<0.001$).

In the multivariate model, the COVID-19 mortality rate was negatively associated with tests/capita (Coef. -0.036 , 95% CI -0.047 - -0.025) and positively associated with cases/capita (Coef. 0.093 , 95% CI 0.819 - 1.034 ; Table 2). Sensitivity analyses limited to countries with epidemics older than 15 March 2020 made little difference to the findings (Table 4).

Conclusion

Our analysis confirms the logical association between increased testing intensity and increased detection of cases/capita as well the association between cases/capita and deaths/capita. The key finding was that on multivariate analysis, testing intensity was negatively associated with mortality/capita. This is compatible with the theory that intensive testing is associated with reduced mortality via reducing the spread of SARS-CoV-2 and/or facilitating earlier more appropriate treatment of infected persons [6, 8]. Our study design does not allow us to exclude the possibility that this association is due to residual confounding. Possible confounders include other components of a successful national COVID-19 containment strategy such as contact tracing or social distancing [2, 5]. These may be associated with both increased testing intensity and reduced transmission/deaths. In addition, we did not

control for other variables such as national age structure and prevalence of
comorbidities which may have influenced mortality [9].

These limitations notwithstanding, our analysis provides additional evidence to
promote calls to intensify national COVID-19 testing to not only control the spread of
this disease but also to reduce associated mortality.

175 **Authors' contributions**

176 CK conceptualized the study, was responsible for the acquisition, analysis and
177 interpretation of data and wrote the analysis up as a manuscript.

178

179 **Funding**

180 Nil

181

182 **Conflict of interest**

183 The author declares that he/she has no competing interests.

184

185 **Ethical approval**

186 The analysis involved a secondary analysis of public access ecological level data. As
187 a result, no ethics approval was necessary.

188

189 **Informed consent**

190 Not applicable

191 **Acknowledgements**

192 Nil

193

Table 1. Correlation coefficients (r-values) for relations between COVID-19 mortality rate/100 000 inhabitants, cumulative number of cases of COVID-19/100 000, testing rate/100 000, age of the COVID-19 epidemic and health expenditure per capita (* P<0.001)

	Mortality	Cumulative Cases	Testing Intensity	Age of Epidemic	Health Expenditure
Mortality Rate	1				
Cumulative Cases	0.80*	1			
Testing Intensity	0.17	0.55*	1		
Age of Epidemic	-0.14	-0.13	-0.16	1	
Health Expenditure	0.27	0.51*	0.45*	-0.43*	1

Table 2. Country level, multivariate linear regression of factors associated with COVID-19 mortality rate per 100 000 inhabitants

	Coef. (95% Confidence Interval)	P-Value
N	108	
Tests/capita	-0.036 (-0.005- -0.002)	<0.001
Cases/capita	0.093 (0.082- 0.103)	<0.001
Age of Epidemic	-0.092 (-0.172- -0.011)	0.026
Health Expenditure	-0.0009 (-0.0016- -0.0002)	0.011
Region		
Europe	Ref	
Africa	0.154 (-3.725-4.034)	0.937
Americas	0.047 (-2.849-2.944)	0.974
Eastern Mediterranean	0.986 (-2.720-4.692)	0.599
South East Asia	-2.072 (-7.047-2.903)	0.411
Western Pacific	0.094 (-4.461-4.651)	0.967

Table 3. COVID-19 mortality rate/100 000 inhabitants, cumulative number of cases of COVID-19/100 000 (Cases/capita), number tested for COVID-19/100 000 (Tests/capita), date first COVID-19 case reported (Age Epi.) and health expenditure (Health Exp – in US\$) in 108 countries.

Country	Mortality	Cases/capita	Tests/Capita	Age Epi.	Health Exp.
Albania	0.8	13.9	103.9	07-Mar-20	272
Algeria	0.4	3.3	7.7	24-Feb-20	260
Andorra	29.8	730	2165.3	01-Mar-20	3835
Antigua and Barbuda	2	19.4	40.8	12-Mar-20	623
Argentina	0.1	3.8	26.1	02-Mar-20	955
Armenia	0.3	29.7	184	29-Feb-20	359
Australia	0.2	23.6	1252.4	24-Jan-20	5002
Austria	3	143.2	1340.8	24-Feb-20	4688
Azerbaijan	0.08	8.1	525.7	27-Feb-20	268
Bahrain	0.3	48.2	3076.6	23-Feb-20	1099
Bangladesh	0.01	0.1	2.6	07-Mar-20	34
Barbados	1	21.9	193.8	16-Mar-20	1164
Belarus	0.1	11.3	486.8	27-Feb-20	318
Belgium	19.3	201.9	726.9	03-Feb-20	4149
Belize	0.3	2	67.4	22-Mar-20	304
Bolivia	0.1	1.8	5.1	09-Mar-20	213
Bosnia and Herzegovina	1	24.5	210.6	04-Mar-20	444
Brazil	0.3	6.7	25.8	24-Feb-20	1016
Brunei	0.2	30.9	2021.8	08-Mar-20	630
Bulgaria	0.3	8.5	228.8	06-Mar-20	612
Canada	1	48.9	922.3	24-Jan-20	4458
Chile	0.3	29	315.9	02-Mar-20	1191
Colombia	0.1	3.5	59.8	05-Mar-20	340
Costa Rica	0.04	9.5	108.5	04-Mar-20	889
Croatia	0.5	32.7	319.7	24-Feb-20	884
Cuba	0.1	3.5	62.3	10-Mar-20	971
Cyprus	0.7	43.6	1182.2	08-Mar-20	1634
Czechia	0.8	47	921.5	29-Feb-20	1321
Denmark	3.8	93	1008.6	26-Feb-20	5566
Dominican Republic	1	19.5	41.9	29-Feb-20	414
Ecuador	1.2	22.6	81.7	28-Feb-20	505
Egypt	0.09	1.4	24.4	13-Feb-20	131
Estonia	1.8	89.3	1870.5	26-Feb-20	1185
Ethiopia	0.002	0.05	2.2	12-Mar-20	28
Finland	0.7	44.9	658.8	28-Jan-20	4117
France	15.8	167.1	343.6	23-Jan-20	4263
Georgia	0.08	5.2	69.2	25-Feb-20	308

Germany	2.5	130.5	1096.2	26-Jan-20	4714
Greece	0.8	18.1	274.2	25-Feb-20	1511
Guatemala	0.02	0.5	6.3	12-Mar-20	241
Guyana	0.6	4.2	16.8	11-Mar-20	192
Haiti	0.009	0.2	2.3	19-Mar-20	38
Hungary	0.6	9.3	266.5	03-Mar-20	943
Iceland	1.8	473.6	9068.9	27-Feb-20	5064
India	0.01	0.4	10.2	29-Jan-20	63
Indonesia	0.09	1.1	5.2	01-Mar-20	112
Iran	4.8	76.9	251.4	18-Feb-20	415
Iraq	0.2	3	70.6	21-Feb-20	153
Ireland	4.3	115.6	860.4	28-Feb-20	4759
Israel	0.8	108.6	1355.7	20-Feb-20	2837
Italy	28.3	224.3	1249.5	29-Jan-20	2739
Jamaica	0.1	2.1	18.2	09-Mar-20	296
Japan	0.07	3.4	43.7	14-Jan-20	4233
Jordan	0.06	3.5	166.6	01-Mar-20	224
Kazakhstan	0.04	3.8	302.4	12-Mar-20	262
Kenya	0.01	0.3	9.2	12-Mar-20	66
Kyrgyzstan	0.06	4.1	147.4	17-Mar-20	73
Latvia	0.1	30.6	1274.3	01-Mar-20	874
Lebanon	0.3	8.4	158.3	20-Feb-20	662
Lithuania	0.6	33.5	1106	27-Feb-20	988
Luxembourg	7	474.5	4105.9	28-Feb-20	6271
Malaysia	0.2	12.7	179.9	24-Jan-20	362
Mauritania	0.02	0.1	1.4	12-Mar-20	47
Mauritius	0.6	21.5	386.3	17-Mar-20	553
Mexico	0.1	2.2	19.7	27-Feb-20	462
Moldova	0.7	29.1	126.6	06-Mar-20	171
Montenegro	0.3	39.5	320.7	16-Mar-20	532
Morocco	0.2	3.4	15.2	01-Mar-20	171
Myanmar	0.006	0.04	2.3	22-Mar-20	62
Netherlands	13.1	119.9	505.3	26-Feb-20	4742
New Zealand	0.02	25.1	972.1	27-Feb-20	3745
Niger	0.05	1.1	17.3	18-Mar-20	23
Nigeria	0.003	0.1	2.4	27-Feb-20	79
North Macedonia	1.4	29.6	299	25-Feb-20	328
Norway	1.7	112.3	2100.9	25-Feb-20	7478
Pakistan	0.03	1.9	19.1	25-Feb-20	40
Panama	1.4	52.1	238.6	09-Mar-20	1041
Paraguay	0.07	1.7	28.6	06-Mar-20	327
Peru	0.3	9	65.4	05-Mar-20	316
Philippines	0.2	3.5	22.4	29-Jan-20	129
Poland	0.4	13.2	262.3	03-Mar-20	809

Portugal	3.7	128.9	1263	01-Mar-20	1801
Qatar	0.2	76.7	1451.5	28-Feb-20	1827
Romania	1.1	24.7	245.4	25-Feb-20	476
Russia	0.04	5.9	623.7	30-Jan-20	469
San Marino	100.2	822.3	1727	26-Feb-20	3013
Serbia	0.7	30.5	123.2	05-Mar-20	494
Singapore	0.1	27.7	1111	22-Jan-20	2462
Slovakia	0.04	12.5	360.5	05-Mar-20	1178
Slovenia	1.9	52.5	1475.2	03-Mar-20	1834
South Africa	0.02	2.9	98	04-Mar-20	428
South Korea	0.4	20.3	931	19-Jan-20	2043
Spain	31.1	313.7	759.3	30-Jan-20	2390
Sri Lanka	0.03	0.9	15.2	26-Jan-20	153
Sweden	6.8	83.4	541.6	30-Jan-20	5711
Switzerland	9.9	263.3	1986.7	24-Feb-20	9836
Thailand	0.04	3.4	103	12-Jan-20	222
Togo	0.04	0.8	21.1	05-Mar-20	39
Trinidad and Tobago	0.6	7.6	62.7	11-Mar-20	1064
Tunisia	0.2	5.3	70	01-Mar-20	257
Turkey	0.9	40.4	264.3	09-Mar-20	469
Ukraine	0.1	3.8	16.5	02-Mar-20	141
United Arab Emirates	0.1	26.9	5451.7	28-Jan-20	1323
United Kingdom	9.1	81.4	392.9	30-Jan-20	3958
United States	3.9	122.1	636.7	20-Jan-20	9870
Uruguay	0.2	12.2	164.9	12-Mar-20	1379
Zambia	0.005	0.2	3.4	17-Mar-20	57
Zimbabwe	0.01	0.07	2.5	19-Mar-20	94

212
213
214
215
216
217
218

Table 4. Country level, multivariate linear regression of factors associated with COVID-19 mortality rate per 100 000 inhabitants. Sensitivity analysis limited to countries with epidemics starting prior to 15 March 2020.

	Coef. (95% Confidence Interval)	P-Value
N	98	
Tests/capita	-0.036 (-0.005- -0.002)	<0.001
Cases/capita	0.093 (0.081- 0.104)	<0.001
Age of Epidemic	-0.107 (-0.200- -0.014)	0.024
Health Expenditure	-0.0010 (-0.0017- -0.0002)	0.012
Region		
Europe	Ref	
Africa	-0.163 (-4.992-4.664)	0.946
Americas	0.046 (-3.249-3.149)	0.977
Eastern Mediterranean	0.906 (-3.0188-4.830)	0.648
South East Asia	-3.037(-8.874-2.799)	0.304
Western Pacific	0.240 (-5.091-4.651)	0.922

References

1. Rubino S, Kelvin N, Bermejo-Martin JF, Kelvin D. As COVID-19 cases, deaths and fatality rates surge in Italy, underlying causes require investigation. *The Journal of Infection in Developing Countries*. 2020;14(03):265-7.
2. Anderson RM, Heesterbeek H, Klinkenberg D, Hollingsworth TD. How will country-based mitigation measures influence the course of the COVID-19 epidemic? *The Lancet*. 2020;395(10228):931-4.
3. Porcheddu R, Serra C, Kelvin D, Kelvin N, Rubino S. Similarity in Case Fatality Rates (CFR) of COVID-19/SARS-COV-2 in Italy and China. *J Infect Dev Ctries*. 2020;14(2):125-8. Epub 2020/03/09. doi: 10.3855/jidc.12600. PubMed PMID: 32146445.
4. Wu JT, Leung K, Bushman M, Kishore N, Niehus R, de Salazar PM, et al. Estimating clinical severity of COVID-19 from the transmission dynamics in Wuhan, China. *Nature Medicine*. 2020:1-5.
5. Lipsitch M, Swerdlow DL, Finelli L. Defining the Epidemiology of Covid-19 - Studies Needed. *N Engl J Med*. 2020;382(13):1194-6. Epub 2020/02/20. doi: 10.1056/NEJMp2002125. PubMed PMID: 32074416.
6. Ferguson N, Laydon D, Nedjati Gilani G, Imai N, Ainslie K, Baguelin M, et al. Report 9: Impact of non-pharmaceutical interventions (NPIs) to reduce COVID19 mortality and healthcare demand. 2020.
7. Mizumoto K, Kagaya K, Zarebski A, Chowell G. Estimating the asymptomatic proportion of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) cases on board the Diamond Princess cruise ship, Yokohama, Japan, 2020. *Euro Surveill*. 2020;25(10). Epub 2020/03/19. doi: 10.2807/1560-7917.ES.2020.25.10.2000180. PubMed PMID: 32183930; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC7078829.
8. Zhang Z, Yao W, Wang Y, Long C, Fu X. Wuhan and Hubei COVID-19 mortality analysis reveals the critical role of timely supply of medical resources. *J Infect*. 2020. Epub 2020/03/27. doi: 10.1016/j.jinf.2020.03.018. PubMed PMID: 32209384.
9. Russell TW, Hellewell J, Jarvis CI, van Zandvoort K, Abbott S, Ratnayake R, et al. Estimating the infection and case fatality ratio for coronavirus disease (COVID-19) using age-adjusted data from the outbreak on the Diamond Princess cruise ship, February 2020. *Eurosurveillance*. 2020;25(12):2000256.