Brief communication

Non-communicable diseases and inequalities increase risk of death among COVID-19 patients in Mexico

Juan Pablo Gutierrez[1*], Stefano M. Bertozzi[2,3,4]

1Center for Policy, Population & Health Research, School of Medicine, National Autonomous University of Mexico
[2]University of California, Berkeley
[3]University of Washington
[4]National Institute of Public Health, Mexico (INSP)

* jpgutierrez@unam.mx

Abstract

Background

Current SARS-CoV-2 pandemic is confronting Mexico with pre-existing challenges: epidemic of non-communicable diseases (NCD) and high social inequity. Those challenges may worsen burden of COVID-19.

Methods and findings

Using data from national reporting of SARS-CoV-2 tested individuals, we analyzed those with a positive result to estimated odds of hospitalization, intubation and death based on pre-existing non-communicable diseases and socioeconomic indicators. We found that obesity, diabetes and hypertension increase the odds of the 3 outcomes, as well as indicators of social vulnerability.

Conclusions

Mexico's response to COVID-19 is stymied by a synergistic double challenge: raging NCDs and extreme social inequity. The response to the current pandemic must take both of them into account both to be effective and to ensure that the burden of COVID-19 not fall disproportionately on those who are already disadvantaged.

Introduction

Previous studies have reported an increased risk for severity of COVID-19 related to obesity and diabetes [1-3], conditions that are major contributors of the global burden of disease [4].

Prevalence of obesity in Mexico has been reported of 32.4% of individuals of 15 years and older, the second highest worldwide only behind USA in the OECD [5]. Data from the national health and nutrition surveys describe the positive trend on obesity at least since 2000 and also how the growth is faster among younger individuals [6].

Diabetes is a major burden for Mexico, with a prevalence of about 15% of the adult population, as is hypertension, with a prevalence of 30%.

Previous analyses have highlighted the burden of health inequalities, as individuals with lower incomes face a higher probability of complications once diagnosed with an NCD and an increased financial burden that affects their ability to comply with treatment recommendations [7, 8].

The high prevalence of these health conditions in Mexico poses an increased risk for severe and fatal COVID-19 disease. Using data from SARS-CoV-2 positive individuals in Mexico, we report how NCDs and socioeconomic inequalities modify the odds of severity of the infection in the country.

Methods

We analyzed public data reporting all individuals tested for SARS-CoV-2 in Mexico compiled by the Directorate General of Epidemiology (Ministry of Health), that included basic demographics and co-morbidities. The reports also include

place of residence and whether the individual died. We only included adults age 20 and older in our analyses.

Testing for SARS-CoV-2 in Mexico at public facilities is only performed if the individual has clinical symptoms suggestive of COVID-19. Thus, not all individuals who ask for a test are tested.

In order to take into account local epidemic dynamics, estimations assumed that observations are clustered at the municipality level.

Descriptive statistics were produced for all individuals tested that have a result and then separately, comparing those who tested positive and negative for SARS-CoV-2. Data included no detail on how comorbidities were identified, that is, it is not reported whether conditions are self-reported or diagnosed at the time of testing for SARS-CoV-2.

We estimated a multivariate logistic regression to estimate the probability of being hospitalized, intubated and of dying as a function of sex, age, comorbidities, health provider, whether the individual speaks an indigenous language, and whether they live in a municipality (county) with 50% or more of the population living in poverty. In addition to demographic characteristics and comorbidities, we also included state of residence to control for variations related to differences between states.

Results

General characteristics of the 140,886 individuals who were tested for SARS-CoV-2 in Mexico through May 18, 2020 are reported in Table 1, comparing

those with positive and negative results (50,411 & 90,475, respectively). From the pool of individuals tested, those who resulted positive for SARS-CoV-2 were more likely to be male (58% vs. 47%, $p < 0.001$) and older (48 years vs. 43 years, $p < 0.001$). While the percentage of total individuals who speak an indigenous language was low (1.1%), that percentage was higher for those positive (1.5% vs 1.0%). The percentage of individuals from municipalities with 50% or more of the population living in poverty was similar between those who tested positive and negative (14.48% & 13.12%, $p = 0.319$).

In terms of health provider, 58.79% of individuals were treated at Ministry of Health facilities, 37.75% at social security facilities and 3.47% by private providers. Individuals who tested positive to SARS-CoV-2 were more likely to have received care from social security institutions compared to those who tested negative (45.27% vs 33.56%, $p < 0.001$), and there was no significant difference with those cared for by private providers (3.74% vs 3.31%, $p = 0.268$).

Individuals who tested positive to SARS-CoV-2 were more likely to have a diagnosis of obesity (21.26% vs 15.27%, $p < 0.001$), diabetes (18.87% vs 11.63%, $p < 0.001$) and hypertension (22.26% vs 16.37%, $p < 0.001$) compared to those who tested negative. In contrast, they were less likely to report smoking (8.68% vs 10.52%, $p < 0.001$), COPD (2.26% vs 2.46%, $p = 0.118$), or asthma (3.11% vs 4.60%, $p < 0.001$). There was no significant difference by diagnosis of chronic renal disease (2.51 vs 2.44%, $p = 0.557$).

We report the regression analysis in Table 2.

Hospitalization: Being male was associated with an increased probability of being hospitalized (OR 1.74), and that probability increased with age, with an OR

of 1.46 for those 30 to 39 years compared to 20 to 29 years, 2.71 for 40 to 49 years, 4.82 for 50 to 59 years, 8.07 for 60 to 69 years, 11.20 for 70 to 79 years, and 13.20 for those 80 years and older.

The odds of hospitalization were 2.36 for those obese, diabetic, and hypertensive compared to those with none of those conditions, a higher probability that for any of those conditions alone. Those with COPD were more likely to being hospitalized (OR 1.48), while smoking alone was not associated with hospitalization. Chronic renal disease was associated with a higher probability of hospitalization (OR2.62).

Those from social security and private providers were more likely to being hospitalized (OR 2.21 & 1.78, respectively) compared to those from MoH services. Individuals from municipalities with 50% or more population in poverty were also more likely to being hospitalized (OR 1.93).

Intubation: Being male was associated with an increased probability of being intubated (OR 1.36) as was age, with the probability increasing from age 50 to 60 to 69 and again from 70 to 79.

Being obese, diabetic and hypertensive increased the odds of intubation both as individual conditions and as co-morbidities in a synergistic way: the odds ratio for intubation was 2.31 for those who were obese, diabetic & hypertensive compared to individuals with none of those conditions.

Being a patient in a social security institution was associated with a lower probability of intubation (OR 0.13) compared to Ministry of Health facilities and there no significant difference with private providers. There was no significant

difference between those from municipalities with 50% or more of the population living in poverty and those with less than 50% of the population living in poverty.

Mortality: The probability of dying from COVID-19 was higher for males (OR 1.68) compared to females and increased with age: odds of death compared to individuals 20 to 29 were 2.24 for those 30 to 39, 5.36 for those 40 to 49, 8.87 for those 50 to 59, 15.79 for those 60 to 69, 20.23 for those 70 to 79 and 27.16 for those 80 and older. Speaking an indigenous language increased the probability of dying from COVID-19 (OR 1.50).

The odds ratio for dying from COVID-19 was 2.42 for individuals with a diagnosis of obesity, diabetes & hypertension compared to those without any of those conditions. Being only obese (neither diabetic nor hypertensive) had an odds ratio of 1.91, for only diabetic it was 1.95, and for only hypertensive, 1.50.

Individuals with COPD were more likely to die from COVID-19 compared to those that were neither smokers, nor COPD nor asthmatics with an OR of 1.70. Individuals with chronic renal disease had an odds ratio of 2.41.

While compared to individuals from Ministry of Health services, those from private providers were less likely to die, with an OR of 0.62. Individuals from municipalities with 50% of more of the population living in poverty were more likely to die from COVID-19, OR 1.47.

In order to partially control for differential care-seeking behavior across health systems of care related to the probability of death, we included in the regression with death as independent variable whether the individual was hospitalized or not. In this model, the primary change compared to the previous

model is that patients cared for by social security also face a lower probability of dying compared to those from MoH services.

Discussion

Given the high burden of NCD in Mexico, in particular obesity, diabetes and hypertension, the results presented here represent a huge challenge for the county in terms of the current COVID-19 pandemic. Mexico is behind only the USA among OECD member countries in terms of prevalence of obesity among adults and has the highest rate in the OECD for diabetes [5, 9].

As has been previously suggested, there is an urgent need to provide more complete data on the co-morbidities associated with COVID-19 severity [2], in particular those NCDs that evidence already suggests increase the probability of severe disease and death. For example, there are likely to be important differences by the severity of the comorbid conditions and/or by the type of treatment the patient is receiving.

In addition to the weighty burden of NCDs, Mexico faces another enormous challenge: social inequity. Wealth distribution in Mexico is one of the worst worldwide; Mexico is tied with Chile for the most unequal income distribution in the OECD [10]. And, wealth inequity is the major driver of health inequity [11]. Mexicans who speak an indigenous language are five times as likely as those who do not to be living in extreme poverty [12]. Both speaking an indigenous language and living in a municipality (similar to a county in the USA) with 50% or more of the population living in poverty were associated with increased mortality. There are many possible explanations (preexisting health status, delays in accessing care,

and differential quality of care among the most important). Because the poor are also less likely to access the social security or private health systems, this compounds their mortality risk.

This study has an important limitation. It is a study of COVID-19 patients in Mexico and we are not able to correct for the severity of disease. Thus, when differences are observed among institutions or groups, the difference could be due to differential thresholds for seeking any health care, for hospitalization or for intubation. For example, the higher mortality in the Ministry of Health hospitals compared to the private sector could imply that the same patient, depending on where they were hospitalized, would have a higher chance of dying in an MoH hospital. However, it could equally well represent that a patient needs to be more severely ill to be hospitalized in a MoH hospital than in the private sector. Thus, one must be careful not to assume causality. That said, the significantly higher morbidity and mortality associated with co-morbid conditions probably underestimates their true effect, to the extent that physicians are likely to have a lower severity threshold for recommending hospitalizing for a patient with co-morbidities.

Mexico's response to COVID-19 is stymied by a synergistic double challenge: raging NCDs and extreme social inequity. The response to the current pandemic must take both of them into account both to be effective and to ensure that the burden of COVID-19 not fall disproportionately on those who are already disadvantaged.

References

1. Kass DA, Duggal P, Cingolani O. Obesity could shift severe COVID-19 disease to younger ages. The Lancet. 2020;395(10236):1544-5. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31024-2.

2. Stefan N, Birkenfeld AL, Schulze MB, Ludwig DS. Obesity and impaired metabolic health in patients with COVID-19. Nature Reviews Endocrinology. 2020. doi: 10.1038/s41574-020-0364-6.

3. Muniyappa R, Gubbi S. COVID-19 pandemic, coronaviruses, and diabetes mellitus. American Journal of Physiology-Endocrinology and Metabolism. 2020;318(5):E736-E41. doi: 10.1152/ajpendo.00124.2020.

4. Niessen LW, Mohan D, Akuoku JK, Mirelman AJ, Ahmed S, Koehlmoos TP, et al. Tackling socioeconomic inequalities and non-communicable diseases in low-income and middle-income countries under the Sustainable Development agenda. The Lancet. 2018;391(10134):2036-46. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(18)30482-3.

5. OECD. Obesity update. Paris: OECD, 2017.

6. Barquera S, Campos-Nonato I, Hernández-Barrera L. Prevalencia de obesidad en adultos mexicanos, ENSANUT 2012. 2013. 2013;55:10. Epub 2013-03-04. doi: 10.21149/spm.v55s2.5111.

7. Gutierrez JP, Garcia-Saiso S, Aracena BM. Mexico's household health expenditure on diabetes and hypertension: What is the additional financial burden? PLoS One. 2018;13(7):e0201333. Epub 2018/07/28. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0201333. PubMed PMID: 30052668; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC6063432.

8. Gutiérrez JP, García-Saisó S, Espinosa-de la Peña R, Balandrán DA. Desigualdad en indicadores de enfermedades crónicas y su atención en adultos en México: análisis de tres encuestas de salud. Salud Pública de México. 2016;58:666-75.

9. IHME. GBD Compare. https://vizhub.healthdata.org/gbd-compare/: Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation, University of Washington; 2020.

10. OECD. Income inequality (indicator). doi: 10.1787/459aa7f1-en2020.

11. Chokshi DA. Income, Poverty, and Health Inequality. JAMA. 2018;319(13):1312-3. doi: 10.1001/jama.2018.2521.

12. CONEVAL. Informe de evaluación de la política de desarrollo social 2018. CMDX, Mexico: Conejo Nacional de Evaluación de la Políica de Desarrollo Social, México; 2018.

Table 1. Descriptive statistics

Sociodemographic characteristics	All tested	SARS-CoV-2	Non SARS-CoV-2	p difference
Sex (Male)	51.19	57.86	47.47	<0.001
	(50.54 - 51.84)	(57.11 - 58.61)	(46.76 - 48.17)	
Age	44.63	47.51	43.03	<0.001
	(44.22 - 45.04)	(47.13 - 47.88)	(42.67 - 43.40)	
Indigenous	1.17	1.47	1.00	<0.001
	(0.99 - 1.36)	(1.20 - 1.75)	(0.83 - 1.18)	
Non-social security	58.79	51.00	63.13	<0.001
	(56.00 - 61.57)	(48.21 - 53.79)	(60.15 - 66.10)	
Social security	37.75	45.27	33.56	<0.001
	(35.03 - 40.47)	(42.39 - 48.14)	(30.74 - 36.38)	
Private	3.47	3.74	3.31	0.268
	(2.64 - 4.29)	(2.75 - 4.72)	(2.47 - 4.16)	
Municipality > 50% poverty	13.61	14.48	13.12	0.319
	(10.06 - 17.16)	(9.90 - 19.06)	(9.88 - 16.37)	
Health conditions	All tested	SARS-CoV-2	Non SARS-CoV-2	p difference
Obesity	17.41	21.26	15.27	<0.001
	(16.55 - 18.27)	(20.50 - 22.02)	(14.35 - 16.19)	
Diabetes	14.21	18.87	11.63	<0.001
	(13.46 - 14.97)	(18.11 - 19.63)	(10.96 - 12.31)	
Hypertension	18.47	22.26	16.37	<0.001
	(17.61 - 19.34)	(21.24 - 23.27)	(15.55 - 17.20)	
Asthma	4.07	3.11	4.60	<0.001
	(3.77 - 4.36)	(2.85 - 3.37)	(4.23 - 4.97)	
COPD	2.39	2.26	2.46	0.118
	(2.21 - 2.57)	(2.06 - 2.46)	(2.24 - 2.69)	
Chronic renal disease	2.46	2.51	2.44	0.557
	(2.28 - 2.64)	(2.34 - 2.67)	(2.20 - 2.67)	
Smoking	9.87	8.68	10.52	<0.001
	(9.34 - 10.39)	(8.17 - 9.19)	(9.87 - 11.18)	
COVID-19 Outcomes	All tested	SARS-CoV-2	Non SARS-CoV-2	p difference
Hospitalized	25.28	38.90	17.69	<0.001
	(23.07 - 27.49)	(36.29 - 41.51)	(16.13 - 19.26)	
Intubated	8.10	9.90	5.89	<0.001
	(7.46 - 8.74)	(8.96 - 10.85)	(5.41 - 6.37)	

Death	5.11	10.54	2.09	<0.001
	(4.38 - 5.83)	(9.27 - 11.80)	(1.82 - 2.36)	
Obs	140,886	50,411	90,475	

Table 2. Logistic regression

	(1) Hospitalized	(2) Intubated	(3) Death	Death*
Sex (Male = 1)	1.74***	1.32***	1.68***	1.44***
	(0.05)	(0.07)	(0.06)	(0.05)
Age 20 to 29		1.00	1.00	
Age 30 to 39	1.46***	0.89	2.24***	1.92***
	(0.08)	(0.14)	(0.26)	(0.23)
Age 40 to 49	2.71***	1.10	5.36***	3.54***
	(0.16)	(0.19)	(0.57)	(0.38)
Age 50 to 59	4.82***	1.62***	8.87***	4.86***
	(0.30)	(0.26)	(0.94)	(0.51)
Age 60 to 69	8.07***	2.14***	15.79***	7.59***
	(0.58)	(0.36)	(1.85)	(0.89)
Age 70 to 79	11.20***	2.32***	20.23***	8.94***
	(1.01)	(0.40)	(2.46)	(1.07)
Age 80+	13.20***	1.80**	27.16***	11.64***
	(1.50)	(0.41)	(3.89)	(1.70)
Indigenous Speaker = 1	1.49***	0.77	1.50***	1.34**
	(0.16)	(0.15)	(0.17)	(0.16)
Neither obese, diabetic nor hypertensive	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
	(0.00)	(0.00)	(0.00)	(0.00)
Neither obese nor diabetic. Hypertensive	1.43***	1.29***	1.50***	1.34***
	(0.06)	(0.10)	(0.08)	(0.07)
Neither obese nor hypertensive. Diabetic	2.41***	1.21**	1.95***	1.51***
	(0.12)	(0.10)	(0.14)	(0.11)
Not obese. Diabetic & hypertensive	2.39***	1.20*	2.10***	1.64***
	(0.13)	(0.12)	(0.11)	(0.09)
Obese; neither diabetic nor hypertensive	1.68***	1.38***	1.91***	1.62***
	(0.08)	(0.13)	(0.12)	(0.10)
Obese & hypertensive. Not diabetic	1.75***	1.53***	2.04***	1.74***
	(0.11)	(0.20)	(0.14)	(0.13)
Obese & diabetic. Not hypertensive	2.74***	1.65***	2.41***	1.77***
	(0.20)	(0.21)	(0.22)	(0.17)
Obese, diabetic & hypertensive	2.36***	1.89***	2.42***	1.88***
	(0.17)	(0.21)	(0.20)	(0.16)
Neither asthma, COPD, nor smoker	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
	(0.00)	(0.00)	(0.00)	(0.00)

Smoking. Neither asthma nor COPD	0.96	0.97	1.05	1.04
	(0.04)	(0.09)	(0.07)	(0.06)
COPD. Neither asthma nor smoker	1.48***	1.00	1.70***	1.59***
	(0.15)	(0.15)	(0.17)	(0.16)
Smoking & COPD. Not asthma	1.57**	1.39	1.52**	1.41**
	(0.32)	(0.36)	(0.28)	(0.24)
Asthma. Neither COPD nor smoker	0.75***	0.98	0.81**	0.93
	(0.06)	(0.17)	(0.08)	(0.09)
Asthma & smoking. Not COPD	0.75	0.60	1.42	1.58
	(0.19)	(0.45)	(0.47)	(0.55)
Asthma & COPD. Not smoking	1.29	1.07	2.33**	2.37**
	(0.40)	(0.72)	(0.83)	(0.87)
Asthma, COPD & smoking	0.50*	0.57	0.26*	0.29
	(0.21)	(0.65)	(0.20)	(0.23)
Chronic renal disease	2.62***	1.34**	2.41***	2.05***
	(0.22)	(0.16)	(0.19)	(0.16)
Ministry of Health		1.00	1.00	
Social security	2.21***	0.13***	0.99	0.70***
	(0.18)	(0.02)	(0.06)	(0.04)
Private health provider	1.78***	1.11	0.62***	0.41***
	(0.37)	(0.24)	(0.09)	(0.06)
Municipality with 50% or more of population living in poverty	1.93***	1.06	1.47***	1.19***
	(0.18)	(0.09)	(0.09)	(0.08)
N	48,666	18,878	48,666	48,666

Controlling for state of residence and type of facility reporting *Additionally controlled for hospitalization