1

Environmental indicator for effective control of COVID-19 spreading

Xinbo Lian[1], Jianping Huang[1,2,*], Li Zhang[1], Chuwei Liu[1]

[1] Collaborative Innovation Center for Western Ecological Safety, College of Atmospheric Sciences, Lanzhou University, Lanzhou, 730000, China.

[2] CAS Center for Excellence in Tibetan Plateau Earth Sciences，Beijing 100101,China.

Corresponding Author ：

Dr. Jianping Huang（hjp@lzu.edu.cn）

Abstract

Recently, a novel coronavirus (COVID-19) has caused viral pneumonia worldwide,

spreading to more than 200 countries, posing a major threat to international health. To prevent

the spread of COVID-19, in this study, we report that the city lockdown measure was an

effective way to reduce the number of new cases, and the nitrogen dioxide (NO_2) concentration

can be adopted as an environmental lockdown indicator. In China, after strict city lockdown, the

average NO_2 concentration decreased 55.7% (95% confidence interval (CI): 51.5-59.6%) and

the total number of confirmed new cases decreased significantly. We also determined that the

global airborne NO_2 concentration steeply decreased over the vast majority of COVID-19-hit

areas based on satellite measurements. We found that if NO_2 emissions significantly decreased,

the total number of confirmed new cases reached an inflection point after approximately two

weeks. Italy, Germany and France are good examples. Our results suggest that NO_2 satellite

measurement can help decision makers effectively monitor control regulations to reduce the

spread of COVID-19.

Introduction

Large-scale COVID-19 viral pneumonia through human-to-human transmission poses a severe and acute public health emergency[1,2]. As the epidemic worsened, most countries imposed city lockdown and quarantine measures to reduce transmission to control the epidemic. The Chinese government has gradually implemented a city-wide quarantine of Wuhan and several surrounding cities as of 23 January, flights and trains to and from Wuhan have been suspended, and public transport has been halted[3,4]. The entire northern Italy was quarantined since 9 March 2020, and three days later the government extended it to the whole country[5].The Spanish government declared a 15-day national emergency, starting on 15 March[6]. In the United States, on 19 March, California became the first state to order a lockdown[7]. In Germany, since 18 March, 16 states have closed, public gatherings of more than two people have been banned and most shops except supermarkets and pharmacies have closed[8]. On 23 March, the British government announced a new nationwide restriction allowing residents to only venture outside when absolutely necessary, e.g., to work, buy necessities[9].

The worldwide lockdown, which was imposed to stop the spread of the novel coronavirus, not only caused an economic downturn but also appeared to result in cleaner air in urban areas usually heavily affected by pollution[10]. The most important measure of the lockdown policy was the reduction of traffic and control personnel flow, and traffic pollution is an important factor influencing air quality and public health. Vehicle exhaust and evaporation emissions are the main emission sources of ozone and secondary particle precursors near the ground in cities and regions[11], and the spatial variation of nitrogen dioxide (NO_2), fine particulate matter ($PM_{2.5}$) and black carbon (BC) may also be significant affected by traffic flow density[12]. A study in Los Angeles showed that nitrogen oxides (NO_x) were identified as a source of pollution for light

vehicles, with NO_2, NO_x, carbon dioxide (CO_2), BC, and fine particle number (PN_{fine}) identified

as diesel exhaust sources[13]. In South Korea, source analysis studies have shown that there is a

high correlation between estimated traffic volume and NO_2 concentration[14]. In Britain, road

transport accounts for 80% of the NO_x emissions[15]. NO_2 levels can be used as a proxy for

exposure to traffic-related composite air pollution and to assess the impact of scenarios designed

to reduce traffic-related emissions[16,17].

In this report, we study the parameters of environmental indicators for city lockdown. Using

the automatic ground detection data and satellite data to analyze the trend of lockdown and the

total confirmed new cases in major cities in China, and using satellite data to further study the

impact of lockdown on virus transmission in countries mainly severely affected by the epidemic,

in order to help policymakers to formulate effective control measures to reduce the spread of

COVID-19.

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

The ground observation daily data were provided by the China National Environmental

Monitoring Centre (http://www.cnemc.cn/). The data from January 24, 2020, to February 23,

2020, are selected as the representative data after the lockdown in Hubei, and the data from

December 24, 2019, to January 23, 2020, are selected as the representative data before the

lockdown (Figure 1). The NO_2 ground observation data of China is from 1 January 2020 to 1

March 2020. The average concentration of major cities with severe epidemic diseases was

selected as the representative of NO_2 concentration of China, including Wuhan, Nanchang,

Guangzhou, Hangzhou, Changsha, Beijing, Shanghai, Hefei and Zhengzhou (Fig. 3). All

monitoring instruments of the air quality automatic monitoring system operate automatically 24

h a day. The monitoring items are $PM_{2.5}$, particulate matter (PM_{10}), sulphur dioxide (SO_2), NO_2,

and carbon monoxide (CO). The automatic monitoring of $PM_{2.5}$ and PM_{10} adopts the

micro-oscillating balance method and the β-absorption method, respectively (ambient air quality

standards, GB 3095-2012). SO_2 was determined by the ultraviolet fluorescence method, NO_2 by

the chemiluminescence method, CO by the nondispersion infrared absorption method and gas

filter correlation infrared absorption method.

This paper adopted the level 3 daily global gridded (0.25°×0.25°) nitrogen dioxide product

(OMNO2d) provided by the Ozone Monitoring Instrument (OMI) onboard the Aura satellite as

the   daily NO_2 data,   which   can   be   obtained   from   GES   DISC

(https://disc.gsfc.nasa.gov/datasets/OMNO2d_003). The Aura satellite was launched by NASA

on July 15, 2004, with its overall objective of monitoring the chemistry and dynamics of the

atmosphere from the ground to the mesosphere. The OMI is a nadir-viewing charge-coupled

device (CCD) spectrometer onboard the Aura satellite, whose observation band is

near-UV/visible. We selected the Column Amount NO_2 Trop product to calculate the changes in

the tropospheric NO_2 concentration impacted by the control measures in East Asia, Western

Europe and North America. The lockdown in East Asia, Western Europe and North America

began on 23 January, 10 March, and 16 March, respectively (Figure 2). :

$$VA = \frac{N_2 - N_1}{N_1} \times 100\% \qquad (1)$$

where VA is the relative variation ratio, N1 is the average NO_2 concentration in the

troposphere one month before the lockdown, and N_2 is the average NO_2 concentration in the

troposphere one month after the lockdown.

The data from 1 January 2020,to 3 March 2020, were selected to analyse the variation in

NO_2 over time in China (Figure 3). The NO_2 satellite data of Italy, Germany, France, the United

States, Iran and Switzerland is from the time of the first case in each country to 20 April 2020

(Figure 4). Due to the satellite orbit, default values occur among the daily data that were

determined via piecewise linear interpolation over time. Border data from the US Centers for

Disease   Control   and   Prevention   (CDC)

(https://www.cdc.gov/epiinfo/support/downloads/shapefiles.html) were selected to obtain the

borders of each country. To remove the influence of weather factors, a 7-day moving average

was calculated. To compare the relative changes among the different countries, the data for each

country were standardized.

The daily total number of new confirmed cases in each country and region was obtained

from the Center for Systems Science and Engineering (CSSE) of Johns Hopkins University

(https://github.com/CSSEGISandData/COVID-19). The daily total number of new confirmed

cases in China was retrieved from the Department Earth System Science of the Tsinghua

University shared case database (https://cloud.tsinghua.edu.cn/d/335fd08c06204bc49202/).

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1. The change in pollutant concentration in Hubei Province one month before and after

the closure of major cities severely affected by the epidemic. Compared with before the

lockdown, NO_2, SO_2, PM_{10}, CO and $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations all decreased to a certain extent, while

NO_2 experienced the most notable decrease (Figure 1). Since biomass and coal combustion are

major SO_2 and CO sources, they exhibit the lowest rate of improvement[18,19]. Both the $PM_{2.5}$ and

PM_{10} concentrations decreased to a certain extent (31.2% and 34.3%, respectively) as a result of

the reduction in fugitive dust, particulate matter and important precursors produced by motor

vehicles and factories[20]. The monthly average $PM_{2.5}/PM_{10}$ ratio was 0.81 (95% confidence

interval (CI): 0.76-0.86), so $PM_{2.5}$ was the main particle pollutant after lockdown. Exhaust

emissions contributed only moderately to local levels of the $PM_{2.5}$ total mass, which were mostly

derived from other sources, such as biomass combustion and the remote transmission of

secondary particles. Therefore, the impact of strict traffic control during the lockdown on $PM_{2.5}$

is not notable, and the spatial difference is large, so $PM_{2.5}$ is not suitable as a city lockdown

indicator.

Although the NO_2 emissions per vehicle slightly decreased after the upgrading of the

quality standards of petroleum products, the notable growth of vehicle ownership increased the

proportion of NO_2 traffic source emissions, in addition, after the implementation of emission

standards for coal-fired power plants, multiple technical improvements greatly controlled the

NO_2 emissions from coal-fired sources, which all enhanced the correlation between NO_2 and city

lockdown effect[21]. The effect of city closure on NO_2 was significantly greater than that on the

other pollutants, with an average concentration reduction of approximately 60.3% (95% CI:

56.8-64.0%), which can be applied as an environmental indicator of the lockdown effect.

141
142 **Figure 1.** The improvement rate of the major pollutants NO_2 (red), SO_2 (blue), PM_{10} (blue), CO
143 (blue) and $PM_{2.5}$ (blue),and the distribution of the accumulated epidemic numbers in each city of
144 Hubei Province after the lockdown.
145

3.2. The changes of airborne NO_2 plummets over COVID-19-hit area after lockdown. In

East Asia (Figure 2a), satellite images show that compared to before the blockade, the total

emissions of NO_2 in eastern China have significantly decreased by approximately 56.6%. In

South Korea, the monthly NO_2 emissions have also been reduced by approximately 18.0 %. The

local government has implemented the most expansive testing programme and has isolated

people infected with the virus without locking down entire cities, and the sharp decrease in NO_2

may be linked to the reduction in local emissions and pollutant transport from surrounding

areas[22,23]. Japan has not imposed widespread lockdown policies, and a 4.8% increase in NO_2 may

be linked to emissions from power generation and industrial processes[22]. In western Europe

(Figure 2b), the monthly NO_2 concentrations have decreased sharply in Italy by 47.5%,

particularly in the north (82.4%), where the outbreak is the most severe. This could be due to the

reduction in road traffic and the decrease in economic activities in the industrial heartland as a

result of the widespread lockdown policy[10]. Other countries such as Germany, Denmark, and

Poland also experienced notable reductions. This is consistent with the results of the European

Environment Agency (EEA)[24]. However, in certain areas, such as northern and southern Spain,

the NO_2 concentration has risen, possibly because of lax closure measures and increased

emissions from coal-fired power plants[25]. In the United States (Figure 2c), one month after the

lockdown, the overall decline in NO_2 is relatively small. The worst affected states, such as New

York, Washington and California, still contain areas with increased NO_2 concentrations, and the

NO_2 concentration is increasing significantly in the vast midwestern regions that have not yet

been locked down.

167
Figure 2. The relative variation in the monthly average tropospheric NO_2 concentration
before and after the lockdown. a, Relative variation in East Asia. **b**, Relative variation in
Western Europe. **c**, Relative variation in North America. Source: Analysis of data from the
NASA Ozone Monitoring Instrument (OMI).

3.3. The temporal evolution of the NO$_2$ concentration with the total number of confirmed

new cases in China. After the strict city lockdown, the NO$_2$ concentration in the main

virus-affected cities in China decreased significantly (Figure 3). Consistent with the satellite data,

the ground monitoring results showed that compared to the conditions before the closure, the

monthly average NO$_2$ concentration after the lockdown decreased approximately 55.7% (95% CI:

51.5-59.6%). Since the lockdown, the total number of confirmed new cases reaches an inflection

point after approximately two weeks (the incubation period of the virus is 14 days), and

compared to the period of 1-15 days after the closure, the total number of confirmed new cases in

the 16-30 days after the closure has decreased 73.6% (95% CI: 64.9-81.1%). The most

significant improvement was recorded in Hangzhou, where the NO$_2$ concentration decreased

approximately 68.1%, and the total number of confirmed new cases declined the most. Likewise,

Zhengzhou, Changsha, Guangzhou, and Nanchang are good examples. Wuhan, the worst

virus-affected area in China, also exhibited a downward trend. The total number of confirmed

new cases reached 13,436 on February 12 due to the inclusion of clinically diagnosed cases[26],

resulting in a new delayed peak in the figure.

The national emergency response has delayed the spread of the epidemic and greatly limited

its range. The suspension of intra-city public transport, the closure of entertainment venues and

the banning of public gatherings have been linked to a reduction in the incidence of cases.

Studies have shown that before emergency response initiation, the (basic) case reproduction

number (R_0) is 3.15, and after intervention measures were implemented in 95% of all places, the

average R_0 value has dropped to 0.04, the total number of actual cases has decreased 96%[27].

193
194 **Figure 3. Temporal variation in the NO$_2$ concentration and number of new cases in China.**
195 The dotted line indicates the average value of NO$_2$ before and after the blockade. ** indicates
196 significant difference at the 0.01 level (bilateral), and * indicates significant difference at the
197 0.05 level (bilateral).
198

3.4. The temporal evolution of the NO$_2$ concentration with the total number of confirmed

new cases in the COVID-19-hit areas globally. After the countries severely affected by

COVID-19 implemented strict lockdown measures, satellite data showed a significant decline in

NO$_2$ emissions, and the total confirmed new cases decreased after two weeks in most areas

(Figure 4). As a result, the strict lockdown of COVID-19-hit areas other than those in China is

also effective and easy to implement to prevent the spread of the virus. The lockdown measures

might have already prevented tens of thousands of deaths in Europe[28]. In Italy, where the

epidemic is widespread, after the lockdown the NO$_2$ emissions significantly decreased by an

average of 36.6%, and the total confirmed new cases reached an inflection point 12 days later,

thus verifying that the spread of the virus was effectively controlled. Studies have shown that

38,000 deaths have been averted in this country due to the implemented intervention measures[28].

The occurrence time of the inflection point is mainly related to the magnitude of NO_2 decline. In

France, NO_2 declined less (27.1%), and the time for the total number of confirmed new cases to

reach an inflection point was delayed. In Germany, the NO_2 emissions decreased the most, by

54.7%, and the total number of confirmed new cases reached an inflection point within 8 days

after lockdown, which occurred earlier than in other countries. For Iran and Switzerland, due to

the relatively low number of confirmed cases, with the decline of NO_2 after the strict control,

confirmed new cases also reached the inflection point earlier. In the the worst-affected states,

United States, NO_2 emissions decreased by an average of 43.1% in New York, Washington and

California, and the total confirmed new cases dropped significantly, showing signs of easing.

219
220 **Figure 4. Temporal variation in the NO_2 concentration and number of new cases in the**
221 **COVID-19-hit areas.** The dotted line indicates the average value of NO_2 before and after the
222 blockade. ** indicates significant difference at the 0.01 level (bilateral), and * indicates
223 significant difference at the 0.05 level (bilateral).
224
225

Urbanization and rapid transportation system development accelerate the spread of

COVID-19, and only strict containment measures can effectively prevent the spread of the virus.

The NO_2 concentration can be considered an inexpensive indicator of virus transmission control.

As a result of strict control measures and the rapid implementation of first-level emergency

measures, the NO_2 emissions and total number confirmed new cases significantly decreased in

China, especially in the strictly controlled cities. In many European countries, a strict lockdown

is also effective and easy to do to prevent the spread of the virus. But there are also areas such as

southern and northern Spain and parts of the United States where the NO_2 level has increased.

Studies have shown that the likelihood of fewer cases in the gradual multi-stage policy is

zero, and that such a policy decision implies that the government is willing to risk an increase in

COVID19 cases and deaths in exchange for decreased economic and isolation impacts, which

may not be desirable from an objective point of view[29]. Although the immediate adoption of a

lockdown policy may lead to many people being adversely affected financially, in the short term,

the number of new confirmed cases will decline approximately 15 days after policy

implementation, and an earlier decline can occur with stricter lockdown measures. International

guidance supports a range of mandatory social isolation measures, extensive case detection, and

isolation and contact tracing[9]. Compliance with quarantine directives is absolutely critical to

saving lives, protecting the most vulnerable in society, and ensuring that the national security

system can cope and care for the sick. In such cases, an immediate lockdown policy may be

preferred, and NO_2, as an environmental indicator of virus control, can help managers implement

effective control measured to curb the spread of COVID-19.

Reference

(1) Huang C, et al. Clinical features of patients infected with 2019 novel coronavirus in Wuhan, China. Lancet. (2020).

(2) Qun Li, et al. Early Transmission Dynamics in Wuhan, China, of Novel Coronavirus–Infected Pneumonia. New Engl J Med. (2020).

(3) Silver DCA. Wuhan scientists: What it's like to be on lockdown. Nature. (2020).

(4) Wu JT, Leung K, Leung GM. Nowcasting and forecasting the potential domestic and international spread of the 2019-nCoV outbreak originating in Wuhan, China: a modelling study. Lancet. (2020).

(5) Paterlini M. Lockdown in Italy: personal stories of doing science during the COVID-19 quarantine. Nature. (2020).

(6) Legido-Quigley H, Mateos-Garcia JT, Campos VR, Gea-Sanchez M, Muntaner C, McKee M. The resilience of the Spanish health system against the COVID-19 pandemic. Lancet Public heal. (2020).

(7) United Kingdom implements stringent lockdown. Nature. (2020).

(8) Lu Z. Berlin, Germany: lockdown for the first day of the global war. Chinanewscom. (2020).

(9) Iacobucci G. Covid-19: UK lockdown is "crucial" to saving lives, say doctors and scientists. Bmj-Brit Med J. 368, (2020).

(10) Schiermeier Q. Why pollution is plummeting in some cities — but not others. Nature. 580, 313 (2020).

(11) Zhou Z, et al. Emission characteristics and high-resolution spatial and temporal distribution of pollutants from motor vehicles in Chengdu, China. Atmos Pollut Res. 10, 749-758 (2019).

(12) Clougherty JE, et al. Intra-urban spatial variability in wintertime street-level concentrations of multiple combustion-related air pollutants: The New York City Community Air Survey (NYCCAS). J Expo Sci Env Epid. 23, 232-240 (2013).

(13) Tessum M, W. Mobile and Fixed-Site Measurements To Identify Spatial Distributions of Traffic-Related Pollution Sources in Los Angeles. Environ Sci Tech. 52, 2844-2853 (2018).

(14) Kim Y, Guldmann J-M. Land-use regression panel models of NO_2 concentrations in Seoul, Korea. Atmos Environ. 107, 364-373 (2015).

291 (15) Qin L. The coronavirus pandemic resulted in a significant reduction in air pollution. Environ
292 rev. (2020).
293
294 (16) Brnnum-Hansen H, et al. Assessment of impact of traffic-related air pollution on morbidity
295 and mortality in Copenhagen Municipality and the health gain of reduced exposure. Environ Int.
296 121, 973-980 (2018).
297
298 (17) Johansson C, et al. Impacts on air pollution and health by changing commuting from car to
299 bicycle. Sci Total Environ. 584, 55-63 (2017).
300
301 (18) Khalil MAK, Rasmussen RA. Carbon Monoxide in an Urban Environment: Application of
302 a Receptor Model for Source Apportionment. Japca. 38, 901-906 (1988).
303
304 (19) Huang Q, Cheng S, Perozzi RE. Use of a MM5–CAMx–PSAT Modeling System to Study
305 SO2Source Apportionment in the Beijing Metropolitan Region. Environ Model Assess. 17,
306 527-538 (2012).
307
308 (20) Huang F, Zhou J, Chen N, Li Y, Wu S. Chemical characteristics and source apportionment
309 of $PM_{2.5}$ in Wuhan, China. J Atmos Chem. 76, 245-262 (2019).
310
311 (21) Liu D, et al. Variation trends and principal component analysis of nitrogen oxide emissions
312 from motor vehicles in Wuhan City from 2012 to 2017. Sci Total Environ. 704, 134987 (2020).
313
314 (22) Han KM. Temporal Analysis of OMI-Observed Tropospheric NO_2 Columns over East Asia
315 during 2006-2015. Atomos. 10, (2019).
316
317 (23) Normile D. Coronavirus cases have dropped sharply in South Korea. What's the secret to its
318 success? Science. (2020).
319
320 (24) Air pollution goes down as Europe takes hard measures to combat coronavirus. The
321 European Environment Agency. (2020).
322
323 (25) Curier RL, Kranenburg R, Segers AJS, Timmermans RMA, Schaap M. Synergistic use of
324 OMI NO_2 tropospheric columns and LOTOS–EUROS to evaluate the NO_x emission trends
325 across Europe. Remote Sens Environ. 149, 58-69 (2014).
326
327 (26) Commission. WMH. Press statement related to novel coronavirus infection (in Chinese).
328 (2020).
329
330 (27) Tian H. An investigation of transmission control measures during the first 50 days of the
331 COVID-19 epidemic in China. Science. (2020).
332
333 (28) Seth Flaxman SM, Axel Gandy. Estimating the number of infections and the impact of
334 nonpharmaceutical interventions on COVID-19 in 11 European countries. Imperial College
335 COVID-19 Response Team. (2020).
336

(29) Karnon J. A Simple Decision Analysis of a Mandatory Lockdown Response to the
COVID-19 Pandemic. Appl health econ hea. (2020).

Corresponding Author

Dr. Jianping Huang（hjp@lzu.edu.cn）

Acknowledgements

This work was jointly supported by the National Science Foundation of China (41305009
and 41405010). The authors acknowledge the China National Environmental Monitoring Centre
for providing the datasets. http://www.cnemc.cn/.

Author Contributions

X. L . and J. H. are first co-author. J. H. designed the study and contributed to the ideas,
interpretation and manuscript writing. X. L. L.Z. and W.L. contributed to the data analysis,
interpretation and manuscript writing. All of the authors contributed to the data analysis,
discussion and interpretation of the manuscript. All of the authors reviewed the manuscript.

Additional information
Competing financial interests: The authors declare no competing financial interests.

Graphics software
All maps and plots were produced using license.