

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

Research Article

Long-term Coexistence of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) with Antibody Response in Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Patients

Bin Wang ^{#,1}, Li Wang^{#,1}, Xianggen Kong¹, Jin Geng¹, Di Xiao¹, Chunhong Ma²,
Xue-Mei Jiang^{1,*} & Pei-Hui Wang^{2,*}

¹Jinan Infectious Diseases Hospital of Shandong University, Jinan, Shandong 250021, China

²Advanced Medical Research Institute, Shandong University, Jinan, Shandong 250012, China

11

12 [#]These authors contributed equally to this work

13 ^{*}To whom correspondence should be addressed: Xue-Mei Jiang, shdjxm@163.com; Pei-Hui Wang,
14 wphlab@163.com

15

16

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

17 Abstract

18 Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 infection causing coronavirus
19 disease 2019 has spread worldwide. Whether antibodies are important for the adaptive
20 immune responses against SARS-CoV-2 infection needs to be determined. Here, 26
21 cases of COVID-19 in Jinan, China, were examined and shown to be mild or with
22 common clinical symptoms and no cases of severe symptoms were found among
23 these patients. A striking feature of some patients is that SARS-CoV-2 could exist in
24 patients who have virus-specific IgG antibodies for a very long period, with two cases
25 for up to 50 days. One COVID-19 patient who did not produce any
26 SARS-CoV-2-bound IgG successfully cleared SARS-CoV-2 after 46 days of illness,
27 revealing that without antibody-mediated adaptive immunity, innate immunity may
28 still be powerful enough to eliminate SARS-CoV-2. Overall, this report may provide a
29 basis for further analysis of both innate and adaptive immunity in SARS-CoV-2
30 clearance, especially in non-severe cases. This study also has implications for
31 understanding the pathogenesis and treatment of SARS-CoV-2.

32

33 **Keywords:** SARS-CoV-2, COVID-19, adaptive immunity, innate immunity, IgG
34 antibody

35

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

36 The first severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2)
37 outbreak was reported in December 2019, and the virus has rapidly spread worldwide
38 within 3 months (Wu et al., 2020; Zhou et al., 2020; Zhu et al., 2020). The importance
39 of innate and adaptive immunity in the defense against SARS-CoV-1 needs to be
40 urgently determined (Thevarajan et al., 2020). To fulfill the pressing need, we
41 examined antibody generation and virus clearance in 26 patients with
42 SARS-CoV-2-induced coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in Jinan, China.

43

44 A total of 26 patients from 5 to 72 years old were determined to be SARS-CoV-2
45 RNA positive by sputum, stool, or nasopharyngeal swabs. The clinical characteristics
46 of the patients and chest CT scans were also examined. According to the “Fifth
47 Revised Trial Version of the Novel Coronavirus Pneumonia Diagnosis and Treatment
48 Guidance”

49 (<http://www.nhc.gov.cn/yzygj/s7652m/202002/41c3142b38b84ec4a748e60773cf9d4f.shtml>), all of them are non-severe COVID-19 patients (**Table 1**).

51

52 Immunoglobulin G (IgG) antibodies act as an indicator of recent and past
53 infection, while IgM antibodies indicate current infection. SARS-CoV-2-bound IgG
54 antibodies were detected in the serum of patients. For patients 3, 7, 22 and 24 (**Table**
55 **1**), SARS-CoV-2 nucleic acid measurements became negative before antibodies were
56 detected. Although IgG antibody testing was positive for the first trial in all 4 patients,
57 we could not determine the exact role of IgG antibodies in SARS-CoV-2 clearance

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

58 because innate immunity is also sufficient to eliminate this virus (refer to the case of
59 patient 26). However, the results did reveal that the antibodies are produced early and
60 SARS-CoV-2 is cleared up, indicating that the immediate production of antibodies
61 may contribute to virus clearance.

62

63 Interestingly, we observed that specimens from patients 2, 8, 13, and 16 who had
64 been confirmed to be IgG positive still tested positive for SARS-CoV-2 nucleic acid
65 for more than 35 days (**Table 1**), indicating that SARS-CoV-2 can coexist with its
66 specific antibodies in the human body for an unexpectedly long time (36-50 days).

67 According to the data collected from patient 2, IgG antibodies can be produced at
68 least as early as the 7th day post illness. (**Table 1**). The average number of days for
69 SARS-CoV-2-bound IgG antibodies to be first detected in the 4 patients was 15; thus,
70 the early production of antibodies does not mean early elimination of this virus. The
71 production of specific antibodies is believed to be effective for virus clearance (Jiang,
72 2020; Lu, 2020), but we could not reach such a conclusion from these cases. We did
73 not observe a correlation between early adaptive immune responses and better clinical
74 outcomes. Perhaps the specificity and titer of antibodies are more important. To our
75 knowledge, to date, this is the longest period (36-50 days) to observe the coexistence
76 of SARS-CoV-2 with its specific antibodies in COVID-19 patients. How this virus
77 can circulate in the presence of specific antibodies for such a long time is an
78 interesting question. Whether SARS-CoV-2 can act as HCV that have developed
79 strategies to subvert humoral immunity and persists in the body is worth further

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

80 investigation (Elsner et al., 2015; Fafi-Kremer et al., 2012; Takaya et al., 2019). These
81 3 patients were all 23-39-year-old adults, which may suggest that young adult
82 individuals do not have obvious advantages in the early production of antibodies and
83 the clearance of SARS-CoV-2 compared to older persons (patients 10 and 21).

84

85 We observed that patient 26, a 5-10-year-old female, was SARS-CoV-2 nucleic
86 acid positive in a stool sample after 46 days of illness but became nucleic acid testing
87 negative in specimens of sputum, stool, and nasopharyngeal swabs on day 47 post
88 illness (**Table 1**). No SARS-CoV-2-specific antibodies were detected in the patient's
89 serum until the last sample collection day, which was the 66th day post illness.
90 Although we did not collect data about virus-specific cellular immunity, it is known
91 that cellular immunity is generated concomitantly with humoral immunity, so we
92 could preliminarily exclude the potential role of cellular immunity in SARS-CoV-2
93 elimination in this case. Thus, from the data on patient 26, we may conclude that
94 innate immunity, the first line of host defense, can play an essential role in
95 SARS-CoV-2 clearance; moreover, innate immunity alone might be enough to clear
96 the virus. This case may also indicate that some individuals may not generate specific
97 antibodies after infection with SARS-CoV-2; thus, only testing SARS-CoV-2-specific
98 antibodies is not a good standard to determine infection, but combination with the
99 nucleic acid testing method may improve the accuracy of SARS-CoV-2 detection.

100

101 Patient 25, another 5-10 year-old female, was found to be IgG antibody positive

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

102 on the 10th day post illness, and the patient turned SARS-CoV-2 nucleic acid negative
103 on 23rd day post illness (**Table 1**). We also observed that a 5-10 year-old female
104 patient (patient 7) produced IgG antibodies on the 14th day post illness, and this
105 patient turned SARS-CoV-2 nucleic acid negative on the 28th day post illness (**Table**
106 **1**). These 2 cases may reveal that children do not show any defects in antibody
107 production and SARS-CoV-2 elimination compared with adults.

108

109 Although a vaccine is believed to be the ultimate preventive measure against
110 SARS-CoV-2 spread, generating a broadly protective and universal vaccine can take a
111 long time (Lu, 2020). In this study, in the case of patient 26 (**Table 1**), we observed
112 that innate immunity alone may be enough to completely clear SARS-CoV-2 infection.
113 This is the first report that innate immunity plays such an essential role in the host
114 defense against SARS-CoV-2, which highlights the importance of innate immunity in
115 SARS-CoV-2 clearance. Further studies are required to determine which factors or
116 signaling pathways of innate immunity contribute to this process. Whether individuals
117 with such responses are still at risk for reinfection needs further exploration. Similar
118 to other RNA viruses, SARS-CoV-2 RNA should be detected by endosomal Toll-like
119 receptors (TLRs) and cytosolic RIG-I-like receptors or other RNA sensors that
120 activate NLRP3 signaling, leading to the production of IFNs, ISGs, and
121 proinflammatory cytokines (Kasumba and Grandvaux, 2019). Boosting innate
122 immune signaling pathways, such as the TLR3 and RIG-I pathways, by drugs that
123 mimic viral RNA may contribute to SARS-CoV-2 clearance (Kasumba and

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

124 Grandvaux, 2019). However, these immune stimulators also induce an inflammatory
125 response that may be harmful to patients; thus, antiviral immunity should be
126 maximized, and inflammatory responses must be minimized. The inflammatory
127 response that is responsible for the accumulation of cells and fluids contributes to
128 SARS-CoV-2 induced lung injury (Huang et al., 2020; Wang et al., 2020). As immune
129 stimulators, viral RNA mimics also induce an inflammatory response that may be
130 harmful to patients; thus, a strategy, in which antiviral immunity should be maximized
131 and inflammatory responses must be minimized, is challenging. Vaccine combined
132 with innate immune stimulators may be more effective for fast SARS-CoV-2
133 clearance. We propose that the importance of innate immunity should be investigated
134 further and that the titer and specificity of SARS-CoV-2-specific antibodies are
135 important and should be seriously considered in vaccine development.

136

137 Our study is limited by the current reagents used in this study, which cannot be
138 used to determine the titer and specificity of human antibodies against SARS-CoV-2.
139 The titer of specific antibodies correlated with clinical outcomes remains to be
140 investigated. The long-term coexistence of IgG antibody with SARS-CoV-2 in the
141 human body raises the question of whether patients with antibodies are still at risk for
142 reinfection. Our follow-up studies may answer this question and would, therefore, be
143 beneficial to vaccine development. Second, we did not collect the earliest serum of
144 patients, and we could not determine on which day the SARS-CoV-2 bound IgG
145 antibodies were generated. Thus, we could not observe the dynamic changes in IgG

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

146 antibodies during illness and recovery. Third, we lack severe patients as controls;
147 therefore, we do not know whether the adaptive immunity of severe patients can
148 respond earlier because of their strong immune response and whether they can clear
149 the virus faster after antibodies are produced. Despite that, our study provided several
150 novel pieces of information about the innate and adaptive immune response against
151 SARS-CoV-2: SARS-CoV-2 bound IgG antibodies can be generated as early as 7 days
152 post illness but can coexist with SARS-CoV-2 in patients long-term (up to 50 days);
153 without SARS-CoV-2 bound IgG antibodies, innate immunity can also successfully
154 clear this virus.

155

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

156 Materials and Methods

157 Specimens from sputum, stool, and nasopharyngeal swabs were collected
158 throughout the illness from January 30, 2020, to April 5, 2020. Viral RNA was
159 extracted from clinical specimens and real-time reverse transcription-PCR (rRT-PCR)
160 was performed to test the presence of SARS-CoV-2 using “Novel coronavirus
161 2019-nCoV nucleic acid detection kit” (Shanghai BioGerm Medical Biotechnology
162 Co.,Ltd, China). The serum was collected at distinctive time points, and
163 SARS-CoV-2-specific antibodies were detected using “New Coronavirus
164 (2019-nCoV) Antibody Detection Kit” (INNOVITA, China). This study was approved
165 by the ethics commissions of Jinan infectious disease hospital, Shandong, China.
166

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

167 Acknowledgement

168 This work was supported by grants from COVID-19 emergency tackling research

169 project of Shandong University (Grant No. 2020XGB03 to P.-H.W).

170

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

171 References

- 172 Elsner, R.A., Hastey, C.J., Olsen, K.J., and Baumgarth, N. (2015). Suppression of
173 Long-Lived Humoral Immunity Following *Borrelia burgdorferi* Infection. *PLoS*
174 *Pathog* *11*, e1004976.
- 175 Fafi-Kremer, S., Fauville, C., Felmlee, D.J., Zeisel, M.B., Lepiller, Q., Fofana, I.,
176 Heydmann, L., Stoll-Keller, F., and Baumert, T.F. (2012). Neutralizing antibodies
177 and pathogenesis of hepatitis C virus infection. *Viruses* *4*, 2016-2030.
- 178 Huang, C., Wang, Y., Li, X., Ren, L., Zhao, J., Hu, Y., Zhang, L., Fan, G., Xu, J., Gu,
179 X., *et al.* (2020). Clinical features of patients infected with 2019 novel
180 coronavirus in Wuhan, China. *Lancet* *395*, 497-506.
- 181 Jiang, S. (2020). Don't rush to deploy COVID-19 vaccines and drugs without
182 sufficient safety guarantees. *Nature* *579*, 321.
- 183 Kasumba, D.M., and Grandvaux, N. (2019). Therapeutic Targeting of RIG-I and
184 MDA5 Might Not Lead to the Same Rome. *Trends Pharmacol Sci* *40*, 116-127.
- 185 Lu, S. (2020). Timely development of vaccines against SARS-CoV-2. *Emerg*
186 *Microbes Infect* *9*, 542-544.
- 187 Takaya, A., Yamamoto, T., and Tokoyoda, K. (2019). Humoral Immunity vs.
188 *Salmonella*. *Front Immunol* *10*, 3155.
- 189 Thevarajan, I., Nguyen, T.H.O., Koutsakos, M., Druce, J., Caly, L., van de Sandt, C.E.,
190 Jia, X., Nicholson, S., Catton, M., Cowie, B., *et al.* (2020). Breadth of
191 concomitant immune responses prior to patient recovery: a case report of
192 non-severe COVID-19. *Nature Medicine*.

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

- 193 Wang, D., Hu, B., Hu, C., Zhu, F., Liu, X., Zhang, J., Wang, B., Xiang, H., Cheng, Z.,
194 Xiong, Y., *et al.* (2020). Clinical Characteristics of 138 Hospitalized Patients
195 With 2019 Novel Coronavirus-Infected Pneumonia in Wuhan, China. JAMA.
196 Wu, F., Zhao, S., Yu, B., Chen, Y.M., Wang, W., Song, Z.G., Hu, Y., Tao, Z.W., Tian,
197 J.H., Pei, Y.Y., *et al.* (2020). A new coronavirus associated with human
198 respiratory disease in China. Nature.
199 Zhou, P., Yang, X.L., Wang, X.G., Hu, B., Zhang, L., Zhang, W., Si, H.R., Zhu, Y., Li,
200 B., Huang, C.L., *et al.* (2020). A pneumonia outbreak associated with a new
201 coronavirus of probable bat origin. Nature.
202 Zhu, N., Zhang, D., Wang, W., Li, X., Yang, B., Song, J., Zhao, X., Huang, B., Shi, W.,
203 Lu, R., *et al.* (2020). A Novel Coronavirus from Patients with Pneumonia in
204 China, 2019. N Engl J Med 382, 727-733.
205
206

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

207 **Table 1 Clinical characteristics of the 26 hospitalized SARS-CoV-2 patients and**
208 **corresponding timelines of IgG antibody production.**

Patients	Gender/Age (Y.)	Type	IgG P. (D.)	LDVP/specimens	Co-existence (D.)
1	F/18-60	C	22	22/NP	0
2	M/18-60	C	7	57/St	50
3	F/18-60	C	23	18/NP	NA
4	F/18-60	C	16	32/St	16
5	F/18-60	C	23	29/NP	6
6	F/18-60	C	21	21/St	0
7	F/18-60	M	9	8/NP	NA
8	M/18-60	C	23	73/NP	50
9	M/18-60	C	10	23/NP	13
10	M/>60	C	9	19/Sp&NP	10
11	M/18-60	C	17	20/NP	3
12	F/<18	M	14	28/St	14
13	M/18-60	C	15	51/St	36
14	F/18-60	C	10	25/SP	24
15	M/18-60	C	24	36/NP	12
16	F/18-60	C	15	60/NP	45
17	M/18-60	C	20	36/SP	16
18	M/18-60	M	17	24/NP	7
19	M/18-60	C	12	21/SP	9
20	F/18-60	C	18	20/NP	2
21	F/>60	C	14	20/NP	6
22	M/18-60	M	10	7/NP	NA
23	F/18-60	C	15	18/NP	3
24	F/18-60	C	18	17/NP	NA
25	F/<18	C	10	23/St	13
26	F/<18	M	ND* (66 th)	46/St	NA

209
210 **Y:** year; **IgG P:** IgG positive; **D:** Day; **LDP:** Last day post-illness when SARS-CoV-2
211 nucleic acid testing shows positive; **NP:** nasopharyngeal; **Sp:** sputum; **St:** stool. The
212 severity of COVID-19 was judged according to the “Fifth Revised Trial Version of the
213 Novel Coronavirus Pneumonia Diagnosis and Treatment Guidance”
214 (<http://www.nhc.gov.cn/yzygj/s7652m/202002/41c3142b38b84ec4a748e60773cf9d4f.shtml>). **M:** mild type, the clinical symptoms were mild and no pneumonia was found
216 in imaging. **C:** common type, with fever, respiratory tract and other symptoms, the
217 manifestations of pneumonia can be seen on imaging. **NA:** not applicable; **ND:** not
218 detectable. * IgG antibodies keep undetectable till 66th day post-illness for patient 26.
219